Intervention Logics and Indicator Systems for ESI Funds

REGIO Evaluation and European Semester Unit
Twitter: @RegioEvaluation
Objective

EU Intervention Logic
EC Better Regulation

- How have the ESI Funds DGs translated the EU intervention logic into their programmes?
Structure of the analysis

... for all the four ESIF DGs:

• Logic of intervention

• Indicators
  • Policy results/impacts
  • Direct results
  • Outputs (and performance frameworks)

• Financial data
Logic of intervention

EAFRD

- CAP context Indicators
- CAP Impact Indicators

- Rural Development Programme
  Priorities (6 RD priorities)

- Focus Areas (17 FAs)

- Measures (20 measures)
  Actions

- Result/Target Indicators
  Output indicators

- Expenditure
ERDF/CF

Example:

**Investment Priority:** *Promote business investments in R&I*

**Specific Objective:** *Stimulate innovation in SMEs*

**Output indicator:** *Number of SMEs supported*

**Result indicator:** *SMEs with R&I activities (as % of all SMEs in the region)*
Logic of intervention

ESF/YEI

Intervention logic and Programme organization in ESF (Support for individuals Gibraltar, UK)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intervention logic</th>
<th>Programme organization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EU 2020 Targets Employment rate At risk of poverty, etc</td>
<td>National Strategic Reference Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Partnership agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thematic Objective TO8 (employment)</td>
<td>Operational Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Priority Axis PO1</td>
<td>Action/Operation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investment priority 8.i Access to employment for job seekers</td>
<td>Specific Objective Increase of youth accessing the labour market.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specific Below 25yo in employment</td>
<td>Result indicators Common for participants Qualification, Employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common Participants and their characteristics</td>
<td>Output indicators Specific Below 25 yo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget allocation</td>
<td>Personal data</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Category of Expenditure:
- Traineeships for individuals
- Employment incentives for employers

Financial data
Summary of Intervention Logics ESIFs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Logic of intervention</th>
<th>Common EU Objectives</th>
<th>Common EU Sub-Objectives</th>
<th>Operational Objectives</th>
<th>Operations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EAFRD</td>
<td>Union Priority</td>
<td>Focus Area</td>
<td>Measures</td>
<td>Operations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMFF</td>
<td>Union Priority</td>
<td>Specific Objective</td>
<td>Measures</td>
<td>Operations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERDF/CF</td>
<td>Thematic Objective</td>
<td>Investment Priority</td>
<td>Specific Objectives</td>
<td>Operations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESF/YEI</td>
<td>Thematic Objective</td>
<td>Investment Priority</td>
<td>Specific Objectives</td>
<td>Operations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Mapping of Union Priorities into Thematic Objectives directly possible for EAFRD, and inferred for EMFF

- Measures pre-defined for EAFRD and EMFF; operational objectives specific for ERDF/CF and ESF/YEI

- Operations as projects for EAFRD and EMFF; operations covering several projects for ERDF/CF and ESF/YEI
Three main types of indicators:

**Policy Result Indicators**

**Direct Result Indicators**

**Output indicators**
Policy Result / Impact Indicators

- Measures of economic, social, and environmental dimensions of well-being at national, sub-national or target group level

- Used to evaluate and communicate the impacts of policy interventions

- Currently used by EAFRD and ERDF/CF (not meaningful for ESF)

- EAFRD: 16 common impact indicators

- ERDF/CF: programme specific result indicators
Policy Result / Impact Indicators

- General concept similar for EAFRD and ERDF/CF
- ... and some differences:
  - *Common for EAFRD; specific for ERDF/CF*
  - *Set at OP level for EAFRD; operational objective for ERDF/CF*
  - *No targets for EAFRD; with 2023 targets for ERDF/CF*
  - *Reported when needed for EAFRD; annually for ERDF/CF*
  - *Communication and evaluation for EAFRD; evaluation for ERDF/CF*
Direct Result Indicators

- Measures of direct effects of the interventions for end-beneficiaries
- Used to evaluate and communicate the results of policy interventions
- Currently used by EAFRD, EMFF and ESF/YEI

- EAFRD: 25 common result/target indicators
- EMFF: 28 common result indicators (+ specific)
- ESF/YEI: 12 common result indicators (+ specific)
Direct Result Indicators

- General concept similar for EAFRD, EMFF, ESF/YEI

- ... and some differences:
  - Stronger emphasis on common indicators for EAFRD and EMFF
  - Targets for all indicators for EAFRD and EMFF; for indicators in the OP for ESF/YEI
  - Immediate results for EAFRD and EMFF; immediate and longer-term results for ESF/YEI
  - Reporting on relevant indicators for EAFRD and EMFF; on all common indicators for ESF/YEI
Output Indicators

- Measures of direct deliverables of policy interventions
- Used for monitoring, evaluation and communication
- All ESIFs have common and specific indicators, with 2023 targets
- Common output indicators are reported (by Fund) on the Open Data Platform of ESI Funds
- Currently, there are no comparable common indicators across the Funds
Output Indicators

- General concept similar for all ESI Funds

- ... and some differences in implementation:
  - Similar common indicators defined differently (ex: broadband for EAFRD and ERDF/CF)
  - Higher frequency of specific indicators for ERDF/CF and ESF/YEI (policy coverage)
  - Achieved values for fully or partially implemented operations
  - Varying levels of reporting (from operations to priority axis)
Financial Data

- Planned investments established in operational programmes

- Planned investments can be aggregated for all ESI Funds by programme, country, Fund, Thematic Objective, and at EU level

- Planned investments are reported in EU and National contributions

- Planned investments are reported in real time with programme modifications on Open Data Platform
Financial Data

- Cycle of financial realization: project selection, declared expenditure, certified expenditure, and EU payments

- Finances implemented can be aggregated for all ESI Funds at programme, country, Fund and EU levels, but not by Thematic Objective

- Programmes report regularly (at least once a year) on financial implementation

- Project selection, declared expenditure and EU payments are reported on the Open Data Platform
Financial Data

- General concepts of financial planning are similar
- ... and some differences in implementation:

  - Finances implemented are reported in EU and National terms for EAFRD and EMFF, and in total cost (EU + National) for ERDF/CF and ESF/YEI

  - Finances implemented are reported at different levels across Funds (measure for EAFRD, operations for EMFF, and priority axis for ERDF/CF and ESF/YEI)

  - Finances implemented cannot be aggregated at level of Thematic Objective across Funds due to multi-TO axes

  - Varying links between finances and achievements

  - Varying reporting cycles within the year
Summary of findings

- Logics of intervention are Fund specific, with a common underlying general structure.
- ESI Funds use similar concepts for indicators, when included in their monitoring and evaluation systems.
- The use of indicators in the programmes varies in terms of policy coverage by common indicators, target setting, and type of reporting.
- ESI Funds differ in terms of level and frequency of reporting on financial implementation.
- Data collection for monitoring, evaluation and communication varies across the Funds.

Conclusions