Migrants to Work

Innovative approaches towards successful integration of third country migrants into the labour market

Final Report

This study has been financed by European Commission (DG Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities)
B. Frouws MSc
Drs. B.J. Buiskool
Projectnumber: B3551
Zoetermeer, March 4, 2010
This publication is supported by the European Community Programme for Employment and Social Solidarity (2007-2013) - PROGRESS. This programme is managed by the Directorate-General for Employment, social affairs and equal opportunities of the European Commission. This programme was established to financially support the implementation of the objectives of the European Union in the employment and social affairs area, as set out in the Social Agenda, and thereby contribute to the achievement of the Lisbon Strategy goals in these fields. The seven-year Programme targets all stakeholders who can help shape the development of appropriate and effective employment and social legislation and policies, across the EU-27, EFTA-EEA and EU candidate and pre-candidate countries.

The information contained in this publication does not necessarily reflect the position or opinion of the European Commission.

The responsibility for the contents of this report lies with Research voor Beleid. Quoting of numbers and/or text as an explanation or support in papers, essays and books is permitted only when the source is clearly mentioned. No part of this publication may be copied and/or published in any form or by any means, or stored in a retrieval system, without the prior written permission of Research voor Beleid. Research voor Beleid does not accept responsibility for printing errors and/or other imperfections.
Foreword

"European societies are ageing and labour market needs are growing". With this notion we started the study on innovative approaches towards successful integration of third country migrants into the labour market. Indeed, not long ago many countries were looking to labour migration as one way to address labour shortages and the expected declines in the working-age population as a result of ageing. The economic crisis, however, has put a break on these recent trends. Unemployment is rising, and as third country migrants’ labour market position is especially vulnerable for the drop in economic activity, the labour market integration of third country migrants remains an essential topic for Europe, now because of the importance of avoiding that migrants will be hit hardest by the economic downturn.

Immigration and in particular the integration of third country migrants into the labour market is thus increasingly gaining political importance on the European and Member States’ agendas. Notwithstanding the economic crisis, demographic development continue and against the background of ageing European societies and of growing labour market needs in the near future, Europe looks likely to rely more on immigration and consequently integration of migrants into the labour market to balance supply and demand in labour markets, and more generally to fuel economic growth. However, statistics show that third country migrants’ labour market situation is worse than that of non migrants in many Member States - they tend to have much lower employment rates than the EU nationals and are often more exposed to being employed in jobs for which they are over-qualified. Labour market participation is very important for the integration of third country migrants in a host society. Active participation in the labour market entails contact with nationals and a more independent position for the third country migrant. However, to access the labour market, third country migrants have to overcome certain barriers that put them at a disadvantage compared to natives.

In order to gain more insight in the labour market situation of third country migrants in Europe and the most important barriers they face, the European Commission, contracted Research voor Beleid and it’s network of experts (from the IMISCOE network) to carry out a European wide study. The purpose of this study is to identify barriers that third country migrants may face in gaining access to employment and to examine innovative and practical ways to improve the integration of third country migrants into the labour market.

Research voor Beleid is pleased to submit the final report. This final report elaborates on the following topics. Part A of the report contains a short overview of the policy background, the aims and methodology followed in the study. Subsequently, Part B provides a description of the research outcomes. Finally, Part C provides the conclusions and recommendations.

This report contains 8 appendixes. Appendix 1 presents the research team and the country experts. Appendix 2 presents the Management Summary in German and French. Appendix 3 includes all the case study reports and Appendix 4 contains an extended methodology chapter. Appendix 5 and 6 include the formats used for the country studies and the in-depth case studies respectively, while Appendix 7 presents an overview and long list of all the approaches identified. Finally, Appendix 8 includes an overview of all the literature used in this study.
Finally, the research team would like to thank IMISCOE, all the national experts around Europe who cooperated with us in this study and all the respondents of interviews. Moreover, the research team would like to thank the steering committee for their support and their valuable remarks during the study.

Bert-Jan Buiskool
Bram Frouws
Douwe Grijpstra
# Contents

**Management Summary** 9

**PART A: INTRODUCTION** 19

1 Policy background, research questions and methodology 21  
1.1 Changing economic context 21  
1.2 Policy context 22  
1.2.1 Lisbon and EU2020 strategies 22  
1.2.2 European Employment Strategy 23  
1.2.3 Migration, integration and immigration policies 24  
1.2.4 Funds and programmes promoting integration 25  
1.3 Aim of the study and research questions 26  
1.4 Exploration of some key concepts leading to the research design 27  
1.5 Methodology 29  
1.6 A model to structure the research findings 30

**PART B: RESEARCH FINDINGS** 31

2 The Labour Market and Third Country Migrants 33  
2.1 Introduction 33  
2.2 Labour market situation and demographic developments 34  
2.2.1 The global economic crisis 34  
2.2.2 Demographic developments 36  
2.2.3 Future needs of European labour markets 38  
2.3 Third country migrants in Europe 41  
2.3.1 Number of third country migrants 41  
2.3.2 Region of origin and reasons for migration 43  
2.3.3 Gender and age 46  
2.3.4 Education 47  
2.4 Labour market situation of third country migrants 50  
2.4.1 Sectoral and occupational structure 55  
2.4.2 Over qualification 56  
2.4.3 Working conditions 57  
2.5 Target groups among third country migrants 58  
2.6 Challenges for third country migrants summed up 60  
2.6.1 Main findings labour market situation 60  
2.6.2 Conclusions 60
Management Summary\textsuperscript{1}

Background of the study

“European societies are ageing and labour market needs are growing”. With this notion we started the study on innovative approaches towards successful integration of third country migrants into the labour market. Indeed, not long ago many countries were looking to labour migration as one way to address labour shortages and expected declines in the working-age population resulting from ageing. The economic crisis, however, has put a break on these recent trends and unemployment is rising. Third country migrants’ labour market position is especially vulnerable for drops in economic activity, therefore the labour market integration of third country migrants remains an essential topic for Europe, in particular in avoiding that migrants will be hit hardest by the economic downturn.

Statistics show that third country migrants’ labour market situation is worse than that of non migrants in many Member States - they tend to have much lower employment rates than the EU nationals and are more often exposed to being employed in jobs for which they are over-qualified. Labour market participation is very important for the integration of third country migrants in a host society. Active participation in the labour market entails contact with nationals and a more independent position in society. However, to access the labour market, third country migrants have to overcome certain barriers that put them in a disadvantaged position as compared to natives.

Immigration and integration of third country migrants are thus part of an important debate across the enlarged European Union. Member States are experiencing increased immigration and are confronted with integration challenges. Promotion of fundamental rights, non-discrimination and equal opportunities are key integration issues. An effective integration of third country migrants in the labour market is furthermore important to reach the targets of the Lisbon Strategy. Moreover, one of the key priorities for EU2020, being designed as the successor of the current Lisbon strategy, is ‘empowering people in inclusive societies’.

As outlined in this strategy and as a clear ‘leitmotiv’ throughout this study the rationale behind the importance of getting migrants to work is twofold: despite its substantial contribution to growth, the potential of migration is not fully factored into policy making at EU or national level and employment rates of immigrants can be improved, particularly for specific categories such as immigrants with low levels of education, women and those recently arrived.

In order to establish effective integration of third country migrants, European and national policy makers, other public organisations, enterprises, and non-governmental originations, need to draw on research on what can be considered as effective approaches towards integration. Therefore the European Commission decided to contract a study on innovative approaches towards successful labour market integration of third country migrants.

\textsuperscript{1} German and French translations of this Management Summary are included in annex 2.
**Aim of the study and research questions**

The aim of the study was to:

- Identify the barriers that third country migrants may face when finding employment
- Examine innovative and practical ways to improve the integration of third country migrants into the labour market, from an economic and social point of view.

The main research questions were:

- What are the characteristics of third country migrants in the different EU countries in terms of their demographic background, socio-economical status, qualifications, occupational status, etc?
- What barriers do third country migrants encounter in gaining access to employment and to what extent do these barriers cause unemployment and inactivity?
- What innovative and practical ways to improve the integration of third country migrants into the labour market, socially and economically, are known and how do they tackle the identified barriers?
- How and under what conditions can these approaches be extended to other groups of third country migrants, other situations and contexts?

The results of the study led to clear understanding of how to improve the position of third country migrants on the labour market and how to make better use of third country migrants as a labour market resource. Based on this knowledge, policy makers should be able to develop projects to improve the integration of third country migrants into the labour market.

Before continuing, the definition of third country migrants as used in this study is provided in the textbox below.

**Third country migrants**

The total population resident in the EU can be divided into three basic groups based on place of birth.

- Native-born – those born in the Member State of residence;
- Other EU-born – those born in another EU Member State but living in another;
- Non-EU-born – those born outside of the EU (third countries).

The latter two groups – although both ‘foreign-born’ – may have different residence and labour market rights, and differ in terms of labour market outcomes. In this study we focus on immigrants from non EU countries (hereafter referred to as ‘non-EU born’ or ‘third country migrants’).

---

2. The ‘foreign-born’ concept provides a more complete picture by including naturalised third country nationals. In addition, it is in line with most of the more recent migration literature and research which favours an approach based on foreign-born over foreign-nationals when analysing migrant populations.
Research methods

The aims of this study can be linked to the three successive steps undertaken between January and November 2009. In each step, we focused in more detail on individual approaches that attempt to improve the integration of third country migrants in the labour market. In carrying out the study we worked together with a team of national thematic experts around Europe from the IMISCOE network, who were responsible for carrying out the country and in-depth case studies and attended the expert meeting.

- In the inception phase we started the research by providing an overview of third country migrants in Europe, their background characteristics and the main barriers they face in relation to their integration on the labour market, based on extensive literature research.
- In the interim phase we focused on 15 countries in which country experts collected more information on the specific situation of third country migrants, on the barriers they face as well as made an inventory of practical and innovative approaches. The findings were discussed during an expert meeting in the Netherlands.
- In the final in-depth phase we focused our study on 15 innovative approaches as to identify the best practices towards successful integration of migrants into the labour market.

Outcomes of the study

Main conclusions on the labour market situation of third country migrants

- The economic crisis deeply impacts the European labour markets. Most country reports point in the same direction with regard to the impact that the crisis will have on third country migrants: As they are on average younger, more often working in temporary employment and in sectors that are especially sensitive for the effects of the current crisis, the labour market position of third country migrants will worsen in the near future.
- However, notwithstanding these labour market effects of the economic crisis, the demographic developments will cause labour market shortages in the long run.
- These developments, although from a different perspective, call for labour market integration of third country migrants.

Main conclusions on the barriers third country migrants face

- Barriers are strongly interrelated, cross-cutting and often reinforcing each other. Often there is an interplay of several barriers and no individual barrier could be identified as the most important barrier. Thus, approaches should always focus on multiple barriers. Below, the individual barriers are discussed.
- The lack of language skills is an important barrier in most countries, however it is clearly not the only barrier. Language training is widespread across the countries, although in some countries capacity is lacking or procedures are too complex.
- The lack of professional and educational skills is clearly identified as a barrier in most countries. However, having qualifications is not a guarantee to get a qualified and sustainable job. Many educated migrants face difficulties entering the labour market at their skills level as a result of the failure to recognize diplomas.
- The failure to recognize qualifications was recognized as a barrier in almost all countries. Across the countries, measures are in place to assist migrants in getting their
qualifications recognized, but this barrier remains to hamper successful labour market integration of third country migrants.

- In all countries the **limited knowledge of the labour market** was recognized as an important barrier. This knowledge (or skills) pertains to three different stages in the labour market integration process. The first two, searching for a job and applying for a job deal with entry or access to the labour market. The third one, performing on the job and knowledge of the working culture, deal with advancement or upwards mobility within the labour market.

- A **limited social and professional network** is identified in a few countries as a barrier to labour market integration. Successful networks can contribute to finding employment. However, ethnic homogenous networks could also hamper labour market integration.

- In most countries, **discrimination** is identified as an important barrier, which prevents third country migrants from entering or moving upwards in the labour market. Discrimination could be prevented by not only focusing on instances of real behaviour but also by focusing on the attitudes towards and images of immigrants, thus starting from a positive point of view.

- **Bad working conditions** are identified as one of the main barriers towards successful labour market integration in some countries, where migrants are prone to exploitative working conditions.

- The fact that in most countries asylum seekers are **not allowed to work** before they are granted a status was identified as a barrier in several countries. Other identified contextual barriers are complicated legislation, the lack of capacity for the provision of language training and the lack of coordination between stakeholders.

- **Extensive social security** could function as barrier to labour market integration, because of a lack of incentives. During times of economic crisis however, low social security and low flexibility (low flexicurity) could function as a barrier towards labour market integration. In countries with high flexicurity unemployment rates have raised far less substantial than in countries with low flexicurity, as flexicurity keeps the labour market flexible, makes employees less risk averse. Moreover, companies will hire new employees at a much faster rate when the economy recovers than they would do otherwise.

- Moreover, matters related to the **social environment** (neighbourhood, health care) might also be a barrier towards labour market integration.

**Main conclusions on the approaches that fight these barriers**

This study identified a high number of approaches and instruments that could be used to overcome the above described barriers.

- **Education and training** should be focused on different skills, such as language skills, professional skills, intercultural skills and knowledge about the labour market and working culture. Moreover, before focusing on the required job skills and sector skills, first of all basic skills (communication, computer competences, work ethics, etc.) should be appropriate as these basic skills are pre-requisites for further updating of skills, which could partly be done by ‘learning on the job’. The approach studied in Italy aimed to make employment of third country migrants more stable and qualified through training and education. The approach successfully combines this with other aspects such as an internship, cooperation with various stakeholders (including leading figures within the migrant community and enterprises) and awareness raising actions, acknowledging that raising educational skills alone will not solve the problems.

- **Counselling and advice** should also be focused both on labour market aspects as well as on other aspects (legal, health care, housing), of which spin-off to labour market in-
Integration could be assumed. Also, it should be developed in such a way that migrants are eventually empowered to take over their own labour market situation and become independent (‘help for self-help’). Counselling and advice is set up this way in Austria for example. Participants receive advice and are empowered to take over their own employment situation. At the Jobcentre, migrants are self responsible for their own career steps, but they get advice and all the information they need to make this happen.

- **Mentoring and coaching** is a good instrument during the job-search phase, but should be continued for migrants who are already in employment to increase the possibility of sustainable labour market integration. The approach studied in Spain involves mentoring and coaching in an effective way. Mediators are educated at the school for intercultural and social mediation. Moreover, personal and direct coaching is not only provided during the job searching phase, but there is also a mentoring program for participants who found a job to prevent job abandonment.

- **Diversity Management** is another way to ensure that continued attention is given to migrants once they are in employment. However, this will not work if solely driven by social responsibility. Therefore, there should be a business case for diversity management as well. Diversity management should be integrated in top-level management and not just in human resource management. In Sweden, IKEA did just that. The company adopted diversity management policies for ethic, legislative but also economic reasons. Diversity is seen as a matter of creating a more challenging business atmosphere, gaining a competitive advantage and expanding the recruitment base.

- **Recognition of qualifications and diplomas** is important as many migrant come to Europe with qualifications and professional experience which are sufficient, but nevertheless not valued as such in the European labour market context. The best way to achieve recognition is to establish partnerships with the private sector in the recognition process and to connect the recognition of qualifications to the provision of supplementary training. Switzerland provides a good example of this. The comprehensive skills and competences validation program Qualification+ incorporates supplementary training. Moreover, as the private sector trusts this skills validation system, many sectoral employers’ organisations participate in this system.

- **Internships and networking** are good instruments to provide migrants with a stimulating and labour market oriented environment. Concerning internships in order to be effective and keep participants motivated, there should be a realistic possibility to be hired afterwards. Moreover, networking increases the possibility of finding employment (because of informal recruitment processes) but it should be assured that these networks are ethnically heterogeneous and also include employers. A good example of networking and internships comes from Germany. By connecting internships to language training and practical job training and establishing and fostering contacts with the right stakeholders, such as employers, school directors and members of migrants organisations, the approach succeeded to lead many migrants into employment and to notably raise the number of migrants employed in the public sector in Bremen.

- A **contextual approach** (e.g. targeted at a whole area or neighbourhood) should be developed with a whole integrated package of accompanying measures. Moreover, possible side effects should be taken into account, as an approach targeted on a whole neighbourhood might stigmatize the citizens of the neighbourhood and lead to discrimination towards them. In France, the government employs a global strategy to improve the situation in the ‘banlieues’ that includes not only employment, but also tax exemptions for attracting companies, education, health, the environment and access to public transport.
For many barriers there are multiple appropriate instruments. Moreover, there is always an interplay of multiple barriers. What follows is that an effective approach should be an integrated approach, including several of the instruments just highlighted and giving attention to multiple barriers. Moreover, approaches should be implemented working along the effective mechanisms identified in the study.

Effective mechanisms

In this study six basic tools or effective mechanisms were identified which can, and should be, used to develop a comprehensive and effective approach for labour market integration of third country migrants.

Integrated approach

Barriers often come together. Therefore, an approach should always be focused on several barriers and consequently include several instruments and elements. Too often this is not the case as became clear from the identified approaches in 15 European countries. Reasons for the relative absence of actual integrated approaches are first of all that these are costly. Moreover, it also requires high effort and dedication on behalf of the staff involved in carrying out the approach. And finally, political and administrative arrangements might be such that different governmental departments (for example work and income and civic integration) are working in a compartmentalized manner, while they instead should work together towards an integrated approach.

A best practice of an integrated approach comes from the Netherlands. The approach combines many of the successful elements in an integrated and interactive way. The approach consists of family, individual and group coaching, the use of successful role models, mediation, education, a personal approach, an internship and actively involves employers. See the case descriptions throughout the report and annex 3.

- As these integrated approaches are costly and might need some time to organize and develop, the EU should seek to provide financial support to start up pilot projects in Member States for further dissemination of the good practices identified in this study, to ensure that Member States learn from these practices and these are finally taken up in mainstream policy.
- At the same time national governments should provide resources and develop overarching policy framework for local services such that it permits the development of long-term integrated approaches, as this ensures that successful time-limited project based initiatives are continued as long-term sustainable approaches.
- Public Employment Services should combine different essential elements or approaches instead of focussing more on a one sided approach (investing in training programmes, while neglecting bringing learning into real life situation by providing a work place)

Tailored approach

Being not specifically focused towards third country migrants was identified as a fail factor in some projects or labour market policies. A tailored approach, specifically focused towards the specific needs of the target group (migrants), but also distinguishing between the needs of different individuals within this target group and taking into account the needs of employers, is more successful than mainstream approaches that are also carried out for, for example the native unemployed. Moreover, for the success of a project it is also essen-
tial to actively involve project beneficiaries in a project and in the development of their own ‘tailor-made’ approach and not let them be just passive recipients of the actions undertaken. In short, ‘one-size fits all approaches’ are not effective for labour market integration of third country migrants.

Best practices of a tailored approach come from Austria and Italy. In Austria, the courses offered are custom-tailored. The approach provides intense individual coaching and recognizes the target group as such with its special problems and needs. This leads to the empowerment of migrants to take over their own labour market situation. In Italy, as many migrants in Italy are working in seasonal (agricultural) employment and as a result are unemployed during certain times of the year, the approach aimed to make employment more stable by training migrants as experts who could be employed along the whole life cycle of the product, in this case tobacco. The approach started with extensive research into the tobacco supply chain sector in which migrants had to be placed and hence was able to tailor the approach towards the needs of the sector. Specialized professionals provided tutoring and trained migrants. See the case descriptions throughout the report and annex 3.

- The EU and national governments should give specific attention to the labour market integration of third country migrants and consider whether policy changes are needed to promote more tailored approaches. Countries that currently employ a generic, non-targeted labour market policy, should consider revisiting a targeted policy that allows for labour market integration policy and approaches that are especially targeted at migrants.
- At implementation level, it is recommended to arrange approaches as such to provide intensive, tailored, one-to-one case working during the full duration of the approach and involve migrant organisations in the whole life cycle of an approach: development, implementation and evaluation. Moreover, Public Employment Services should engage more effectively with and better tailor their services to meet the specific needs of migrants in accessing the labour market.

**Partnerships and involvement of stakeholders**

One player alone in the field of labour market integration is less effective than the joint effort of multiple parties (especially for establishing integrated and tailored approaches and a better outreach of target groups). Cooperation between different stakeholders (the EU, national and local governments, employers, trade unions, NGO’s, schools and universities, public employments services and migrant organisations) is thus highly recommended. They should learn from each other, work together and form partnerships. Reason for the absence of a multi-stakeholders approach might be that funding although available for such activities, is often short term. Moreover, the results are all too often neither evaluated nor communicated, as a result of which learning from each other about successful and efficient partnerships does not occur. Finally, such partnerships are time-consuming and require strong collaboration and commitment, especially with respect to financial, human and institutional resources. However, working in partnerships enriches the approaches employed to integrate migrant into the labour market.

A best practice of partnership and involvement of stakeholders comes from Denmark. In the approach, the national government, employers (both local government and private sector), regional government and labour unions are working together. The social partners played an important role because they have a good sight on the supply and demand side of the labour market and the problems employers and employees face. See the case descriptions throughout the report and annex 3.
The EU should use funding programs such as ESF and/or the European Reintegration funds to support cooperation and promote partnership working and in line with EU2020 promote interdependence between different levels of government (EU, Member States, regions, social partners, etc.).

National and local governments should bring actors (government departments) together at state level to ensure that policies and administration systems are integrated and not in conflict or working in a compartmentalized manner. Moreover, cooperation between institutions and organisations at the local, operation level should be stimulated.

**Employer involvement**

The involvement of employers is indispensible for the success of an approach. Involving employers in the development and execution of an approach, enables project staff to better tailor the content of an approach towards the needs of employers and increases the possibility that migrants are invited for an internship or obtain an appointment. However, employers often lack the necessary expertise and resources to implement integration strategies in-house. Moreover, developing diversity strategies can often be expensive in terms of providing the necessary infrastructure and administrative support, and this may discourage smaller businesses from going down this route, for example because of a shortage of time or financial resources. Finally, with regard to the situation of migrants, compared to other groups of (unemployed) people, it might even require more effort to motivate employers, due to a negative or at least indifferent attitude or discrimination towards migrants. To increase employers involvement, research should be done on the actual needs of employers, coaching should be continued after a job placement, attention should be given to employers attitude towards migrants (awareness raising) and companies should be called to Corporate Social Responsibility in terms of human resource management.

Best practices of employers’ involvement come from Sweden and Hungary. In the Diversity Management Program of IKEA in Sweden, diversity has been integrated with Human Resource Management and aligned closely with the business plan. Diversity is regarded by IKEA as a way of gaining competitive advantage, as the capacity to understand and internally mirror the diversity of its current and potential customers is regarded a key factor in business success. Awareness raising is another good way to stimulate employer involvement. The approach in Hungary focused on different groups of the majority society and included in its intercultural competences training for those groups topics such as sensitivity raising, conflict management and intercultural negotiation techniques. Moreover, a campaign was launched emphasizing the value of multiculturalism and the advantage of integration for the host society. See the case descriptions throughout the report and annex 3.

The European Union should work with the ETUC and BUSINESS EUROPE to promote the involvement of employers’ organisations and trade unions at the national level. Moreover, the EU and national governments should stimulate Corporate Social Responsibility in terms of human resource management.

National governments should initiate and provide support for employers’ involvement from above, keeping in mind that through local initiation and local ownership progress can be best made. Thus, it should be ensured that there is a balance between ‘top-down’ and ‘bottom-up’ approaches.
Staff skills
Staff (e.g. job coaches, trainers, mentors) plays a key role in helping third country migrants in the process of seeking, finding and keeping a job, as indicated by several case studies. Therefore the professional development of staff is a vital determinant of the quality of the approach. Helping third country migrants finding or keeping a job requires a high number of specific competences, especially considering the need for an integrated and targeted approach (as discussed in the previous sections). Staff needs to be labour market experts, able to deploy a wide number of approaches, able to deal with heterogeneity and to assess the needs and prior experiences of the specific group they are dealing with and finally select and combine the right measures or instruments. Moreover, empowering and motivating third country migrants is relevant. Finally, it is recommended that (at least part of) the staff has an immigrant background themselves (role models). In short, extensive attention should be given to the profile of staff members.

Best practices of staff skills come from the Netherlands and Austria. In the approach studied in the Netherlands, this was done by providing extensive attention to the recruitment of staff. Staff has to be higher educated, experienced in working with women, educated in welfare work and match the cultural background of participants. Another example is Austria, where money from the Austrian Integration Fund is used to constantly provide advanced training to employees in the job centres. Thus, funds designed for integration could also be used to implement training for staff dealing with labour market integration of third country migrants. See the case descriptions throughout the report and annex 3.

- The EU and national governments should define the set of competences needed to work in approaches for labour market integration of migrants and stimulate the development of qualification structures for staff working with specific target groups getting them into a job.
- National, regional governments, sectoral organisations but also providers of employment services themselves should ensure that those responsible for implementing and carrying out the approaches are well-trained, committed and professional (by developing quality certificates, standards or implementing HR policies like recruitment policies and continuous professional development activities). For recruiting staff, cooperation should be sought with migrant organisations to recruit staff with a migrant background. Also staff themselves are responsible for their own development and a set of key competences could be used for self assessment and evaluation, selection of training courses and peer learning activities.

Outreach strategy
Certain groups of migrants, such as women or refugees, might be difficult to reach. Reasons for this are a lack of motivation, background characteristics that impede them to search for employment (such as the family background) or the absence of the structural arrangement needed to reach hard-to-reach target groups (such as cooperation with the migrant community organisations).

For a sustainable and exhaustive improvement of the labour market integration of third country migrants, recruitment of hard-to-reach groups of migrants for labour market activation measures is essential but carries a great challenge. To reach all groups of third country migrants, there should be cooperation with (voluntary) migrant or refugee organisations, participation in social networks, or for example mosques to recruit potential hard-to-reach participants.
A best practice of outreach strategy comes from the UK. The Jobcentre network has sought to establish strong partnerships with refugee and community organisations and sometimes worked through outreach workers with an ethnic minority background. This increases the level of communication, interaction and engagement between Jobcentres and the voluntary sector at the local level, which improves reaching the hard-to-reach target groups. See the case descriptions throughout the report and annex 3.

- The EU should disseminate knowledge on good practices of partnerships with migrant organisations in the process of reaching migrants to recruit them for labour market integration approaches.
- National and regional governments should provide funding to and work together with voluntary and community migrant organisations to actively involve them in the process of recruiting migrants for labour market integration approaches.
- NGO’s should play an important role in the process of recruiting migrants for labour market integration measures, as they can play an intermediary role between employers and public employment services on the one hand and migrant organisations on the other hand. Therefore, NGO’s should also be stimulated to do so, for example by including this in government policy on subsidies for NGO’s.
PART A: INTRODUCTION
1 Policy background, research questions and methodology

1.1 Changing economic context

"European societies are ageing and labour market needs are growing". With this notion we started the study on innovative approaches towards successful integration of third country migrants into the labour market. Indeed, not long ago many OECD countries were looking to labour migration as one way to address labour shortages and the expected declines in the working-age population as a result of ageing. This was to be the new age of labour migration. The economic crisis, however, has put a break on these recent trends. OECD countries now find themselves in the deepest economic downturn since the Great Depression. Unemployment rates in many countries could reach double-digit levels for the first time since the early 1990’s. The drop of economic activity is affecting local and migrant workers, but the latter are more vulnerable. Employers are often more reluctant to hire immigrants and more ready to fire them.¹

Does this affect the context of the study? The answer is twofold. The perspective from which successful labour market integration of migrants is important might temporarily have changed to what could be called a social perspective instead of a needs perspective. That is, the labour market integration of third country migrants remains an essential topic for Europe, but now not because of the increasing labour market shortages, i.e. the need for labour, but because of the importance of avoiding that migrants will be hit hardest by the economic downturn.

Moreover, not all labour shortages disappear during an economic downturn², even on the short term, but the more so shortages will return on the long term. That is, demographic developments will continue, irrespective of the economic situation.

While each of the European countries and regions face different demographic challenges, recent projections suggest that there will be a natural decline of the EU population between 2010 and 2050. One major challenge is the decreasing size of the working-age population (15-64 years), which according to current trends, will decrease by 59 million by 2050³. As a result of these developments, job vacancies, both vacancies for occupations requiring higher-skill and low-skill levels, will be increasingly difficult to fill. Against the background of demographic developments, the demand for immigration in the EU is bound to increase again. Europe is likely to rely more on third country migrants in the near future in order to balance supply and demand on the labour market. Immigration can help to increase the overall size of the labour force and alleviate labour shortages.⁴ From this perspective, successful integration – and participation in the labour market – of third country migrants is and especially will be essential for Europe’s future.

² Idem.
³ Employment in Europe 2008
⁴ COM(2007) 780
In the light of the current economic crisis, the labour market effects, caused by demographic developments as said are temporarily countered by the economic downturn. Latest data for August/September 2009 confirm that EU labour markets continue to weaken in reaction to the economic downturn, although the pace of deterioration has clearly moderated. Employment continues to decline and unemployment to rise, job vacancies remain significantly lower than a year ago and companies continue to announce more job reductions than creation. Moreover, the labour market outlook for the coming months remains unfavourable. However, labour markets are showing tentative signs of stabilising in some Member States and a relative improvement in confidence among businesses and consumers, including their employment and unemployment expectations, although still pessimistic, adds support to the view that the pace of economic and labour market deterioration is easing. Employment continued to contract across almost all Member States over the second quarter: among the larger Member States most notably in Spain and the UK, but also particularly strongly in the Baltic States (Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania), Ireland and Slovenia. Overall unemployment in the EU rose by 236 000 (or 1.1 percent) in August to reach 21.9 million, an increase of 5 million (or almost 30 percent) compared to a year earlier. While hard data have so far remained depressed, survey data indicate positive signs that the downturn is bottoming out. For the euro area the unemployment rate is projected to approach 10 percent in 2009 and to reach almost 12 percent by 2011.

In this light, it appears problematic that the current labour market developments, caused by the economic crisis, seem to hit third country migrants’ labour market position extra hard. Third country migrants in Europe are on average younger, are more often temporary employed, and often work in sectors in which the outlook for employment and unemployment is decidedly negative. This makes their position more vulnerable. We will discuss this matter in more detail in Chapter 2. Because of the long term need for third country migrants in most European countries, it appears important to look further than the crisis and focus on a successful integration of third country migrants on the European labour market.

1.2 Policy context

1.2.1 Lisbon and EU2020 strategies

Today, immigration and integration of third country migrants are part of an important debate across the enlarged European Union. Member States are experiencing increased immigration and are confronted with integration challenges. Promotion of fundamental rights, non-discrimination and equal opportunities are key integration issues. Also, an effective integration of third country migrants in the labour market is important to reach the targets of the Lisbon Strategy. The integration of these particular social groups in the labour market is seen as increasingly important not only from an economic and competitiveness perspective in the context of the Lisbon agenda, but also in terms of the promotion of social inclusion, reflecting the objectives laid out in the European Social Agenda, which was renewed

---

1 European Commission. Employment, Social Affairs & Equal Opportunities. EU employment situation and social outlook. Monthly monitoring report October 2009
2 COM(2005) 389. A Common Agenda for Integration. In the period 2007-2013 PROGRESS will finance analysis, mutual learning, awareness-raising and dissemination activities, as well as assistance for the main players. The programme consists of five components, namely employment, social protection and inclusion, working conditions, diversity and combating discrimination, and equality between women and men.
in 2008. The integration of migrants and those with an immigrant background can also be
seen against the backdrop of demographic ageing within the European Union and the need
for additional labour market supply in particular member states, and in particular skills ar-
teras and sectors. The Lisbon strategy aimed to achieve full employment and to strengthen
social cohesion within the European Union by 2010. Within the framework of the Lisbon
agenda, the European Council set targets for raising overall EU employment rates to 70%
(60% for women and 50% for older workers). This implied an increase in the employment
rates of groups at risk of disadvantage in the labour market, including third country mi-
grants with EU financial instruments such as the European Social Fund playing an important
role in contributing towards the attainment of these employment objectives.

Now, EU2020 is designed as the successor of the current Lisbon Strategy. EU2020 builds on
the achievements of the Lisbon Strategy as a partnership for growth and job creation and
should allow the EU and national levels to work together to move beyond the current crisis
and to mobilise new sources of growth, ensuring social and territorial cohesion, in line with
the basic principles of the new Lisbon Treaty. One of the key priorities for EU2020 is ‘em-
powering people in inclusive societies’. As outlined in this strategy, and as a clear leitmotiv
throughout this study, despite its substantial contribution to growth, the potential of migra-
tion is not fully factored into policy making at EU or national level. Moreover, employment
rates of immigrants can be improved, particularly for specific categories such as immigrants
with low levels of education, women and those recently arrived1.

1.2.2 European Employment Strategy

The European Employment Strategy (EES) is a key element of Lisbon. Among its objectives
are to achieve a high level of employment among all groups in the labour market, including
those considered to be at relative disadvantage such as migrants, as well as specific groups
such as women, refugees, undocumented migrants and second generation migrants. The EU
plays an important role in co-ordinating the employment policy priorities of the member
states through the framework of the EES and through the Employment Open Method of Co-
for the 2008-2010 period provide a framework for the coordination of member states’ em-
ployment policies. The Integrated Guidelines call for the Member States to give further con-
sideration to the integration of immigrants in EU labour markets. Guideline 19 seeks to
promote inclusive labour markets, and to make work pay for job-seekers, including disad-
vantaged people. The CouncilDecision on the Employment Guidelines stresses that actions
to promote access to employment for people with disabilities and the labour market (and
social) integration of immigrants and minorities are particularly essential. It also encour-
aged the Member States to make enhancing access to the labour market for disadvantaged
groups a more explicit dimension in their employment policies, as set out in National Re-
form Programmes. The Open Method of Coordination in the field of Employment (employ-
ment OMC) plays an important role in helping to facilitate coordination between the mem-
ber states and the Commission on EU employment policies, and also has strong potential to
promote the labour market integration of migrants and minorities.

1.2.3 Migration, integration and immigration policies

Migration, integration and immigration policies under the responsibility of DG Justice, Liberty and Security (DG JLS) form another important element in the wider EU policy framework of relevance to the labour market and social integration of migrants and minorities.

The Amsterdam Treaty of May 1997 for the first time established immigration and asylum as areas of Community competence. Following the Amsterdam treaty, the European Council meeting in Tampere (Finland) in 1999 represents the beginning of an active advocacy for a common integration policy. During the Tampere meeting in 1999, the Council agreed that the aim of the integration policy should be to grant third country migrants the same rights and obligations as EU citizens\(^1\). The subsequent Tampere programme for the period 2000-2005 led to the adoption of a number of EU directives, concerning the right to family reunification\(^2\), the admission of third country migrants for the purposes of studies, pupil exchange, unremunerated training or voluntary service\(^3\) and the admission of researchers into the EU\(^4\). The Commission had also proposed for the first time to create a common legal framework proposing conditions for entry and residence for all types of economic third country migrants\(^5\). This proposal was the only one not adopted, yet since its launch the issue of economic migration has become a central theme in the EU debate on immigration policy. The Tampere approach was confirmed with the adoption of The Hague programme for the period 2005-2010.

The Hague Programme emphasised the need for the further development of integration policies and greater coordination at EU level of national integration policies based on common basic principles, supported by specific activities and initiatives from the Commission\(^6\). Following the Hague Action Plan, 10 Common Basic Principles were adopted, two of which are especially relevant to migrants from third countries (CBP 3 relating to migration management and CBP 6, integration: the positive impact of migration on our society and economy). In September 2005, the Commission Communication A Common Agenda for Integration provides a framework for the integration of third-country migrants in the EU. This was followed by a further Commission Communication: A Common Immigration Policy for Europe: Principles, actions and tools\(^7\). These various policy developments are supportive of efforts to promote the labour market integration of migrants. Other relevant developments in the area of migration, integration and immigration include the production of a “Handbook on Integration for policy-makers and practitioners”, due to be updated for a third time in 2009. This has recently focused on developing appropriate indicators to ‘measure’ the integration of migrants and minorities. Other EU policies of relevance to the promotion of the labour market integration of migrants and minorities include the European Commission’s work in the area of non-discrimination, with important developments in respect of the legal framework on equal treatment in employment stemming from the adoption of Article 13 of the EC Treaty. Key policy communications include the Framework Strategy for tackling discrimination and promoting equal opportunities (June 2005). This emphasised the need to promote active la-


\(^5\) COM(2001) 386

\(^6\) Council Document 16054/04 3 COM/2008/359

\(^7\) COM/2008/359
bour market measures and innovative approaches so as to overcome some of the systemic obstacles faced by some disadvantaged groups in the labour market including third country migrants. The European Strategy for Social Protection and Social Inclusion set out a framework for defining common policy objectives in the field of SPSI. In relation to migrants, the strategy notes that these social groups face considerable disparities in employment outcomes, as well as in respect of related areas such as levels of educational attainment, access to housing and healthcare and poverty rates. Member states are then responsible for translating common priorities in the area of SPSI into national policies through the preparation of National Reports on Strategies for Social Protection and Social Inclusion. The Commission monitors the impact of their implementation through the annual Joint Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion. The Social Inclusion Open Method of Coordination (social OMC) provides a common framework through which the Commission and the member states work together on SPSI issues.

1.2.4 Funds and programmes promoting integration

To financially support the implementation of EU policies on the integration of third country migrants, a number of EU programmes and funds are available. While the ESF is the key financial instrument to promote their integration into the labour market, wider EU programmes should also contribute towards the achievement of these aims. These include, in summary:

- European Social Funds (2007-2013) (DG EMPL)
- The EQUAL Community Initiative Programme 2000-06 (DG EMPL)
- The Community Action Programme to Combat Discrimination 2000-06 and the Progress Programme 2007-13 (DG EMPL)
- The European Regional Development Fund 2000-06 and 2007-13 (DG REGIO)
- The URBAN Community Initiative Programme 2000-06 (DG REGIO)
- The INTI Preparatory Action and the European Fund for the Integration of third-country nationals (DG JLS)
- European Integration Fund (2007-2013) (DG JLS)
- Life Long Learning Programme 2007-2013, more specifically the Grundtvig and Leonardo programmes (DG EAC)

The EU set up a number of supportive mechanisms to facilitate co-operation and the exchange of good practices such as the network of National Contact Points (NCP’s) on integration and the European Network Cities for Local Integration Policy (CLIP) was set up in 2007 as a part of the Integrating Cities process. Moreover, during the Thessaloniki Meeting in 2003, the Council also invited the Commission to publish annual reports on integration and launched the idea of a handbook on integration for practitioners and policymakers. The Handbooks are funded by INTI and compiled in cooperation with the NCP’s. The first annual report was published by the Commission in 2004, the second in 2006 and the third in 2007. The first edition of the Handbook was published in 2004, the second edition in 2007, a third edition is expected in 2009.

2 In Chapter 5 we will look at the handbooks in more detail.
1.3 Aim of the study and research questions

As became clear in the previous sections, immigration and integration of third country migrants are part of an important debate across the enlarged European Union. Member States are experiencing increased immigration and are confronted with integration challenges. Promotion of fundamental rights, non-discrimination and equal opportunities are key integration issues. Also, an effective integration of third country migrants in the labour market is important to reach the targets of the Lisbon Strategy. In order to establish effective integration of third country migrants, European and national policy makers, other public organisations, enterprises, and non-governmental organisations, need to draw on research what can be considered as effective approaches. Therefore the European Commission decided to contract a study on innovative approaches towards successful labour market integration of third country migrants.

The aims of this study are:

1. Identify the barriers that third country migrants may face finding employment.
2. Examine innovative and practical ways to improve the integration of third country migrants into the labour market, from an economic and social point of view.

The results lead to clear understanding of how to improve the position of third country migrants on the labour market and how to make better use of third country migrants as a labour market resource. Based on this knowledge, policy makers should be able to develop projects to improve the integration of third country migrants into the labour market.

Based on the Terms of Reference the following research questions can be identified:
1. What are the characteristics of third country migrants in the different EU countries in terms of their demographic background, socio-economical status, qualifications, occupational status, etc?
2. What barriers do third country migrants encounter in gaining access to employment and to what extent do these barriers cause unemployment and inactivity?
3. What innovative and practical ways to improve the integration of third country migrants into the labour market, socially and economically, are known and how do they tackle the identified barriers?
4. How and under what conditions can these approaches be extended to other groups of third country migrants, other situations and contexts?

These four research questions formed the basis for this study. The questions are made operational and specified in further detail in the discussion of the methodological approach in annex 4. Moreover, the specific research questions can be found in the formats used for the country studies and the case studies, which are attached to this report as annex 5 and 6.

---

1 The aim of the study and the research questions are derived from the Terms of Reference NO VT/2008/008.
2 COM(2005) 389. A Common Agenda for Integration. In the period 2007-2013 PROGRESS will finance analysis, mutual learning, awareness-raising and dissemination activities, as well as assistance for the main players. The programme consists of five components, namely employment, social protection and inclusion, working conditions, diversity and combating discrimination, and equality between women and men.
3 Tender No VT/2008/008. Specifications Study Contract Innovative approaches towards successful Integration of Migrants in the Labour Market
1.4 Exploration of some key concepts leading to the research design

In the box below we discuss some definitions that were used in this study and which are important to keep in mind while reading the report.

---

**Third country migrants**

The total population resident in the EU can be divided into three basic groups based on place of birth.1
- Native-born – those born in the Member State of residence;
- Other EU-born – those born in another EU Member State;
- Non-EU-born – those born outside of the EU (third countries).

The latter two groups – although both ‘foreign-born’ – may have different residence and labour market rights, and differ in terms of labour market outcomes.2 In this study we focus on immigrants from non EU countries (hereafter referred to as 'non-EU born' or 'third country migrants').

**Integration into the labour market**

By integration into the labour market we mean 'achieving a situation whereby labour force outcomes for third country migrants are similar to those of corresponding non-migrants'. This definition is in line with the definition of the European Commission in its communication on ‘Migration and development’. Here it is stated that the position that a third country migrant occupies when entering a national labour market should reflect their qualifications, skills level, and experience.3 As a consequence, successful labour market integration should entail the following:
- high employment rates and low unemployment rates for third country migrants;
- retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
- putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
- the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
- the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market.

**Barriers to integration on the labour market**

For the purpose of this study, barriers will be defined as ‘intrinsic or external bottlenecks that hamper in this case third country migrants from seeking, finding, or keeping a suitable job in a given legal context’. Such bottlenecks may take different features, occur in different phases of the employment cycle, and play out differently for different individuals. What they all have in common is that they prevent the third country migrant from achieving an employment position equivalent to that of a corresponding non-migrant / native born’. However, it is important to mention that these barriers could also be applicable for other groups.

**Innovative approaches**

Barriers can be overcome or even prevented by innovative and practical approaches and projects. One of the goals of this study is to make an inventory of practical and innovative approaches throughout the European Union that aim at ways to overcome these barriers and that have proven to be successful.

---

2 The ‘foreign-born’ concept provides a more complete picture by including naturalised third country nationals. In addition, it is in line with most of the more recent migration literature and research which favours an approach based on foreign-born over foreign-nationals when analysing migrant populations
3 European Commission, ‘Migration and development’.
4 Idem
The approaches to be selected need to meet a number of criteria:
- They aim specifically at third country migrants or a target group third country migrants are part of;
- They contribute to surmounting third country migrants’ barriers in seeking, finding and keeping a job;
- They carry out a clear or renewing vision on the topic;
- The conditions under which they operate are specified;
- The processes and procedures that are followed are carefully registered;

**Identifying good practices**

If an innovative approach indeed results in successful labour market integration for third country migrants, we may have a good practice on our hands. In determining whether this is the case, we additionally will investigate the extent to which the approaches meet the following requirements

- **Its success is proven** - Success can be defined in terms of measurable outcome such as the measurable numbers of third country migrants that found a job, employers reached and courses launched. Approaches can also be successful in the sense that new methods or instruments have been developed and which are better than or supporting regular methods of working or tools.
  Both types of success are taken into account.

- **Specificity of the approach** - The good practice needs to concentrate on a specific group of third country migrants and/or specific barriers to the labour market. In short, the project needs to make an explicit connection between a *problem* and a certain solution.

- **Applicability and transferability of the approach** - Finding a successful innovative approach is one thing, but making sure that the successful practice is distributed and mainstreamed into regular practice by other (relevant) organisations is another. The successful practice should be easily copied and implemented in another context. The process of the approach must be clear, practical, and reproducible.

- **The approach is applicable in times of economic crisis** - When selecting good practices, the context of the economic crisis shall be taken into account. During a period of economic hardship the current stock of third country migrants becomes particularly vulnerable, besides the group newcomers. High shares of third country migrants have temporary contracts and are working in the services sector, both of which are hit hard by the crisis. In addition, in selecting the approach we keep its cost-effectiveness in mind so that it is applicable in times when organisations’ financial resources are limited.

A positive answer to these requirements might indicate that an approach is potentially useful as a good practice for policy makers in other places and situations. Almost synonymous with good practice is the concept of *best practice*. Management literature provides the following distinction: a best practice is a good practice which, after a systematic analysis (benchmarking), proved to be the best.

---

1 As stated in the Tender Specifications, selective employment related policies are not subject to this study.
2 The European Union defined these factors on behalf of the LIFE-program for the European environmental policy. [http://europa.eu.int/comm/environment/life/infoproducts/bestpracticeleaflet_en.pdf](http://europa.eu.int/comm/environment/life/infoproducts/bestpracticeleaflet_en.pdf)
1.5 Methodology

The aims of this study can be linked to the three different steps we followed in the research process between January and November 2009. With every step we focused in more detail on individual approaches that attempt to improve the integration of third country migrants in the labour market. A detailed overview of the methodology used can be found in annex 4.

- An inception phase in which we started by providing an overview of third country migrants in Europe, their background characteristics and the main barriers they face when integrating in the labour market;
- An interim phase in which we focused on 15 countries in which country experts collected more information on the specific situation of third country migrants, barriers they face, and made an inventory of practical and innovative approaches;
- An in-depth phase in which we focused our study on 15 innovative approaches in order to identify the best practices.

The selection of 15 countries consisted of:

- Austria
- Bulgaria
- Denmark
- Estonia
- France
- Germany
- Hungary
- Italy
- The Netherlands
- Poland
- Portugal
- Spain
- Sweden
- Switzerland
- United Kingdom

A word in advance on representativeness

Although we explicitly challenged country experts to provide as much information as possible on barriers and (innovative) approaches in their countries, it should never be assumed that with these country reports, the picture is complete. If certain barriers are not mentioned in a country report, this does not automatically mean that this barrier is not existent in this country and the same holds true for the measures towards labour market integration that were not mentioned, although it might indicate that these barriers or approaches are less relevant in the context of that particular country. In short, although the reports provide a very comprehensive view, the representativeness and completeness cannot be guaranteed. However, it can be assumed that we grasped the most important findings, the more so because the findings of the individual country studies do for a very large extent correspond to the results of an extensive literature study we carried out.

The same holds true for the 47 approaches that were described in the country reports, an average of 3 per country. We present an overview of these in annex 7. It should be noted that while summing up the most occurring target groups, barriers or elements of approaches, it might be the case that the expert did not describe each target group, barrier or element of the approaches when providing an overall description. However, it could be assumed that for each topic, those aspects on which the focus lies most, are highlighted.
1.6 A model to structure the research findings

The presentation of the research findings in the following chapters is structured along the following model:

Figure 1.1 Research model

As a result this report includes the following elements:

- A thorough analysis of the actual problem is essential when developing a project. Thus, in the chapter 2 we first discuss the scope of the problem by presenting the labour situation (of third country migrants) in Europe and the target groups.

- In chapter 3 we go into more detail on the problem analysis: Which barriers do migrants encounter?

- Chapter 4 discusses the actual approaches (instruments and effective implementation of these instruments), the results of the approaches studied, the contextual factors that hamper or stimulate the success of the approaches and the innovativeness and transferability of the approaches.

- Finally, in chapter 5 the important lessons follow from the conclusions and recommendations.
PART B: RESEARCH FINDINGS
2 The Labour Market and Third Country Migrants

2.1 Introduction

This chapter provides an overview of the labour market situation (of third country migrants) in Europe. This chapter starts with an outline of the current labour market situation and future labour market developments in Europe. Attention will be given to the ongoing demographic developments and its influence on Europe's labour market needs, as well as to the global economic crisis and its impact on EU labour markets. Next, we turn attention to the target group of the study, third country migrants in Europe and their background characteristics and labour market situation. The chapter ends with initial conclusions regarding the labour market situation of third country migrants. Thereby we draw general conclusions on the scope of the problems regarding labour market integration of third country migrants, a first step in the phase of problem definition, after which we go into more detail on the problem analysis when discussing the barriers.

In short, to provide a comparable overview in this chapter, we made use of the following sources.

Sources

The findings, statistics and conclusions in this chapter are mainly based on ‘Employment in Europe 2008’ by the European Commission. This annual report provides a thorough and detailed overview of the labour market situation of third country migrants. The report combines various data sources such as Eurostat, the EU Labour Force Survey, OECD and national accounts and thereby served as an all-embracing guide that provided us with the information needed to draw up this chapter. For a description of the current labour market situation, and especially the impact of the financial crisis, we also made use of ‘Global Employment Trends January 2009’ by the International Labour Organisation (ILO) and the EU ‘Monthly monitoring reports employment situation and social outlook of September and October 2009. For the description of the working conditions of third country migrants, we also drew from ‘Employment and working conditions of migrant workers’ by the European Foundation for the Improvement of Working and Living Conditions (EWCO). In order to collect more in-depth and recent data on the labour market situation of third country migrants in a certain country we asked our country experts to provide statistical information on certain topics.

Many experts provided much more statistical information, mostly collected on a national level. As many countries use different concepts, different methods of collecting information, different time series etc., it is difficult to bring this data together on an European level and compare individual countries. Also, not in all countries the concept of ‘third country migrant’ seems relevant 1.

---

1 In some countries the concept of third country migrants, using the foreign born definition is not meaningful. This is for example the case in Poland where many older people are foreign born as a result of agreements on post war boundaries. Another example is Italy where many foreign born people are returning former emigrants of Italian descent. And in the Netherlands the focus in literature, research and statistics is mainly on so called ‘allochtonen’, people with at least one of their parents born abroad.
Finally, for understanding current figures of the employment situation of third country migrants, it should be noted that the current recession’s impact on migration and the labour market situation of third country migrants, is a moving target. Thus, the summaries and analyses that follow here are rather tentative.

2.2 Labour market situation and demographic developments

2.2.1 The global economic crisis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How will current labour market and demographic developments influence reliance of European Member States on third country migrants?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For years, Europe showed sound economic growth and very strong employment expansion. Generally speaking, the main concern seemed to be the demographic developments which suggest a declining supply of labour in Europe while at the same time labour market needs were growing. The past year however, things were turned upside down. In 2008, global financial markets experienced their worst crisis since the 1930s. It is beyond the scope of this study to discuss the causes of the crisis, but its impact becomes more and more visible. Investment, production and consumption all declined through diminishing investor and consumer confidence as credit markets froze and millions of people lost their jobs. Overall, the outlook for economic activity weakened through 2008 and continued to do so through 2009, which became evident through declines in GDP for many advanced economies and official recession announcements.

Latest data for August/September 2009 confirm that EU labour markets continue to weaken in reaction to the economic downturn, although the pace of deterioration has clearly moderated. Employment continues to decline and unemployment to rise, job vacancies remain significantly lower than a year ago and companies continue to announce more job reductions than creation. Moreover, the labour market outlook for the coming months remains unfavourable. However, labour markets are showing tentative signs of stabilising in some Member States and a relative improvement in confidence among businesses and consumers, including their employment and unemployment expectations, although still pessimistic, adds support to the view that the pace of economic and labour market deterioration is easing.

Employment continued to contract across almost all Member States over the second quarter: among the larger Member States most notably in Spain and the UK, but also particularly strongly in the Baltic States (Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania), Ireland and Slovenia. Overall unemployment in the EU rose by 236 000 (or 1.1 %) in August to reach 21.9 million, an increase of 5 million (or almost 30 %) compared to a year earlier.

While hard data have so far remained depressed, survey data indicate positive signs that the downturn is bottoming out. For the euro area the unemployment rate is projected to

---

approach 10% in 2009 and to reach almost 12% by 2011. Nevertheless, the labour market outlook for the coming months remains unfavourable, indicating that the full impact of the economic crisis on labour markets is, at least partly, still to be faced.

**The situation for younger workers**

Moreover, given the current labour market situation, the situation of younger workers is all the more worrisome in view of the lack of progress in addressing youth labour market issues during more prosperous years. Young people still suffer disproportionately from a deficit of work opportunities. Improvements achieved since early 2005 in reducing the unemployment rate for youth have been more than reversed, with the rate still at the highest level since Eurostat data for the EU27 became available. The marked increase in the youth unemployment rate has been driven mainly by the very sharp rise recorded in the rate for young men.

We will discuss the implications of this observation in section 2.4, as we discuss the labour market situation of third country migrants.

Temporary agency work has been hit hard by the downturn. Recent data from Eurostat generally covering June to September show a substantial year-on-year contraction in the number of hours invoiced by private employment agencies, ranging from just below 25 percent in the Netherlands and Belgium to around 30 percent in France and around 40 percent in Italy and Spain according to the respective reference periods.

In September, public administration and manufacturing accounted for nearly 85 percent of total announced job losses (50,434 out of 59,926). Following public administration (34,214 jobs) and manufacturing (16,220), the other significantly affected sectors were transport and communication (4,441 jobs) and financial services (2,665 jobs).

Research shows that immigrants "serve as a buffer on the labour market and are therefore more sensitive to economic fluctuations than the native population". Since autumn the rise in the unemployment rate has been steepest for non-EU nationals. The gap between the unemployment rates for non-EU27 nationals and nationals, which had stayed fairly stable at around 7 pps over recent years, has now reached an alarming 11 pps, while it is only around 3 pps higher for other EU-nationals.

**Country reports on the economic crisis**

In most countries the effects of the economic crisis are becoming visible. Unemployment rates are increasing and job vacancy rates are decreasing. As becomes clear from the country reports, labour market effects of the economic crisis are already apparent. In Portugal, the crisis starts to impact the construction sector, in which immigrants are overrepresented. In Bulgaria, the economic crisis has already been pushing up the growth of short-term temporary contracts. Anecdotal evidence suggests that ethnic minority workers and immigrants are hit hardest, forcing greater numbers of them into the informal labour market sector. In the Netherlands, the expectation is the same. Previous periods of low economic activity learned that the labour market position of immigrants is more cyclically sensitive, partly explained by the fact that immigrants more often work in temporary employment. In Austria, where migrants are on average younger than the native population, it is most of all young people who are affected by the increasing unemployment due to the economic crisis.

---


The economic crisis deeply impacts the European labour markets and most country reports point in the same direction with regard to the impact the crisis will have on third country migrants: As they are on average younger, more often working in temporary employment and are working in sectors that are especially sensitive for the effects of the current crisis, the labour market position of third country migrants will worsen in the near future.

2.2.2 Demographic developments

Despite the uncertainty caused by the global economic crisis, it is important not to lose sight of the overall long term developments, especially the demographic developments, which suggest a gradually declining supply of labour in Europe due to an ageing population. In the short run these developments are countered by the negative labour markets effects of the economic downturn, but in the long run these ongoing demographic developments will again cause labour market shortages.

Figure 2.1 Projected working-age population (aged 15-64) in the EU-27, 2008 to 2050

According to the baseline scenario of Eurostat’s 2008 population projection, the EU-27 population and the working-age population in particular, is expected to decline over the first half of the century. The working age population is foreseen to start falling from 2013 and decrease to 294 million by 2050, representing a decrease of around 39 million (or 12 percent) by 2050 compared to 2009 levels (333 million). This overall decline already reflects a substantial offset of around 53 million through continued immigration. Otherwise the working age population would be expected to drop to 242 million.
It is projected that by 2050 continued migration would contribute to raising the share of the working-age population in the total population by 2.6 percentage points, and to reduce the share of those aged 65 and over by 3.5 percentage points. However, although migration may play a crucial role in solving specific future labour market shortages, its impact on population ageing is likely to be small. Truly massive and increasing flows of young third country migrants would be required to halt population ageing. But, from a social cohesion perspective, this would also increase the challenge of integration to a much larger extent.

**Positive effects of immigration on labour market**

Thus, increased immigration cannot prevent demographic ageing, but it can help alleviate labour market bottlenecks. Immigration may have positive effects on the labour market for various reasons:

1. migration can help to relieve labour market shortages in specific areas;
2. migration can contribute to entrepreneurship, diversity and innovation;
3. labour market efficiency may also increase with immigration.

Below, each of these reasons is exemplified.

Firstly, migration can help to relieve labour market shortages in specific areas, especially where jobs are increasingly avoided by native-born. There are growing needs in the services sector, especially in households, hotels and restaurants, construction and in sectors characterised by strong seasonality such as agriculture, although it has to be noted that the impact of the economic downturn on some of these sectors reduces these growing needs. As mentioned before, employment expectations for construction and services sectors are rather pessimistic. Nevertheless, in these sectors, there may be some jobs that few native born would be interested in, even at a reasonable wage. These sectors are highly dependent on the labour supply of third country migrants.

Secondly, migration can contribute to entrepreneurship, diversity and innovation. Highly skilled third country migrants may bring innovative abilities that expand the production capabilities of the economy. The economic crisis Europe is facing calls for creative solutions and probably makes way for more sustainable and innovative production.

Thirdly, labour market efficiency may also increase with immigration, since third country migrants are very responsive to regional differences in economic opportunities and have greater occupational mobility compared to the native born. Both regional mobility as well as job mobility are higher for recent non-EU migrants than for the native born. This might contribute to balancing labour market supply and demand across Europe in a more flexible way. Immigrant labour can also add considerable flexibility to labour markets because newly arrived third country migrants tend to have lower reservation wages, are more willing to accept precarious employment, and have higher potential occupational and geographical mobility.

Finally, there is little evidence that immigration leads to higher unemployment among the native born. The skills of third country migrants are usually complementary to those of native-born workers.
Country reports on ageing societies

Countries such as the Netherlands and Germany are very well aware of the need of third country migrants and many policy makers agree, to certain extent, that immigration is beneficial in order to sustain the public pension systems, which are based on transfers from the active population to the pensioners. In the Netherlands, a recent advice highlighted the possibility of temporary migration in order to deal with the expected labour market shortages.

In countries such as the Netherlands, Portugal, the UK, Denmark and Italy, although societies are obviously ageing, the population is still growing. In some Eastern European countries on the other hand, the population is already declining. In Bulgaria the population declined by more than a million compared to 1990 and in Poland and Hungary the population declined as well.

The explanation for this seems to be migration. The aforementioned countries have higher migration levels compared to the Eastern European countries, which contribute to the population growth, which in some countries otherwise, would already have been changed in population declines.

Notwithstanding the labour market effects of the economic crisis, the demographic developments will cause labour market shortages in the long run.

2.2.3 Future needs of European labour markets

Question
What are the future needs of the European labour markets in terms of skills and jobs?

Against this background of ageing European societies and, in the near future, growing labour markets needs, demand for immigration in the EU is set to increase over the coming decades. Especially when the economy starts to improve again, labour market shortages will be become noticeable. Furthermore, it is likely that Europe will increasingly rely on immigration from third (i.e. non-EU) countries to help balance supply and demand in labour markets and more generally to fuel economic growth. Well managed immigration can play a role in alleviating the effects of population ageing and help European societies deal with labour and skill shortages.

Needs are clear

Apart from these quantitative needs of European labour markets, the needs in terms of skills are clear. There is special urgency with regard to highly qualified workers, but also a need for unskilled and seasonal workers in certain sectors of the economy.

Member States and regions differ significantly with regard to the skills profile of their populations or the sector distribution of employment. Therefore it is important to monitor these, both to address the short-term impact of the economic crisis and the long-term job-prospects of the EU workforce. One of the conclusions of the Commission’s assessment, as outlined in Commission Communication "New Skills for New Jobs"

1 COM (2008) 868/3
Many Member States have been experiencing labor market shortages in selected sectors, including ICT, financial services, household services, agriculture, transportation, construction and tourism-related services such as the hotel and restaurant industries. The best prospects of job creation up to 2015 are expected in business services (such as IT, insurance or consultancy), health care and social work, distribution, personal services, hotels and catering, and to a lesser extent education. However, the prospects for business services and other sectors may need adjustment in the light of the financial crisis.

**Looking ahead: shift in sector distribution**

Looking further ahead, there will be a slow but steady shift in the sector distribution of the EU from agriculture and traditional manufacturing industries towards services (see Figure 2.2). This shift is likely to continue notwithstanding the recent downturn.

**Figure 2.2** Employment trends by broad sector, in %, EU-25

![Employment trends by broad sector, in %, EU-25](image)

*Source: CEDEFOP (IER, ROA, EC estimates)*

In 2020, almost three quarters of jobs will be in services (see Table 2.1). Job creation in services is likely to be substantial up to 2020, especially in business services. The primary sector could lose 2.9 million jobs while construction should tend to stabilize. Manufacturing would experience a net loss of 800,000 jobs despite an increase in engineering. Moreover, it is projected that there will be fewer jobs for agricultural skilled workers, clerks and craft and related trade workers.

---

Table 2.1  Demand by occupation, broad groups, projected change 2006-2020 in millions, EU-25

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>2006-2020</th>
<th>Expansion demand</th>
<th>Replacement demand</th>
<th>Total job openings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Legislators, senior officials, and managers</td>
<td>4,245</td>
<td>6,992</td>
<td>11,237</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professionals</td>
<td>5,475</td>
<td>8,799</td>
<td>14,274</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technicians and associate professionals</td>
<td>7,251</td>
<td>10,443</td>
<td>17,694</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clerks</td>
<td>-1,771</td>
<td>9,055</td>
<td>7,284</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service workers and shop and market sales workers</td>
<td>3,066</td>
<td>12,677</td>
<td>15,743</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skilled agricultural and fishery workers</td>
<td>-2,153</td>
<td>3,529</td>
<td>1,376</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Craft and related trades workers</td>
<td>-2,408</td>
<td>11,901</td>
<td>9,493</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plant and machine operators and assemblers</td>
<td>0,909</td>
<td>6,468</td>
<td>7,377</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary occupations</td>
<td>5,092</td>
<td>10,091</td>
<td>15,183</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All occupations</td>
<td>19,626</td>
<td>80,435</td>
<td>100,061</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CEDEFOP (IER, ROA, EC estimates)

These projected sectoral changes taking place will have significant implications for future occupational needs. Especially, demand for workers in high-skilled non-manual jobs such as management, professional work or technical support of those activities is expected to increase in the coming decade.

Moreover, there will be significant expansion in the numbers of jobs for many service workers, especially in retail and distribution but also for some elementary occupations requiring little of no formal skills.

Country reports on the national labour markets

In the country report it became clear that when the economy starts to rise again, labour market shortages will become noticeable, and in some sectors such as ICT, financial services, household services, agriculture, transportation, construction and tourism-related services shortages are already noticeable.

Most country reports point to pronounced labour market shortages, is it not now then there will be in the near future. In Bulgaria, for example, in some sectors the shortage of labour has become so severe that the Bulgarian Chamber of Commerce took the initiative of collecting information from different enterprises and sectors on what kind of workers they needed, in order to ‘import’ them from the Far East.

Specific labour market demands differ between countries, but one common ground is the need for high skilled workers, such as scientists, IT specialists and engineers. Several European countries such as Germany and the Netherlands oriented part of their immigration policy towards obtaining high-skilled workers, for example by easing visa or working permit procedures for high skilled workers.

Labour market shortages will become noticeable on the European labour markets in the near future. Many countries are in need of high skilled workers and try to attract them.
2.3 Third country migrants in Europe

2.3.1 Number of third country migrants

**Question**
How many third country migrants are registered in the various countries?

As shown in Table 2.2, Member States differ substantially in number of third country migrants. Shares are relatively high in Latvia, Estonia, Cyprus, Austria and The Netherlands and rather low in the Czech Republic, Finland, Hungary, Malta, Poland and especially Slovakia. In recent years migration to countries in Southern Europe has accelerated, becoming as important as migration to the more ‘traditional’ immigration countries of France, Germany and the UK.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Foreign Born</th>
<th>Non-EU-27 born (third country migrants)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In thousands</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>1.186</td>
<td>11.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech Republic</td>
<td>453</td>
<td>4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>389</td>
<td>7.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>10.144</td>
<td>12.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>15.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>585</td>
<td>14.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>974</td>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>4.790</td>
<td>11.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>6.471</td>
<td>10.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>2.519</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>13.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>449</td>
<td>19.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lithuania</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luxembourg</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>37.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>316</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malta</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Netherlands</td>
<td>1.736</td>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>1.234</td>
<td>15.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>703</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>765</td>
<td>7.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovakia</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>1.117</td>
<td>12.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>5.408</td>
<td>9.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2.2: Third country migrants in Europe

**EU-27**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>In thousands</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>In thousands</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>40.501</strong></td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td><strong>27.279</strong></td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Member States are characterised by a diversity of past and recent immigration histories and include longstanding destination countries, new destination countries, new gateway or transit countries and emigration countries. At the same time third country migrants to the EU display a wide heterogeneity as regards region of origin, cultural background, education and skill level, socio-economic and age characteristics, family status etc, and have varying reasons for migrating to the EU. Below, we will discuss some of these background characteristics of third country migrants in Europe.
Country reports on the number of third country migrants

Overlooking data on national level as provided in the country reports, some remarks on the concept of 'third country migrant' and the use of statistics have to be made. In several countries this concept in not relevant or not used in statistics. In the box below some examples are provided of the difficulties the national experts had with collecting the statistical information as asked for in the format for data collection.

- In Portugal, the volume of immigrants is calculated on the basis of nationality. This is the national approach to immigration and the statistical basis that informs national debates about immigration both in academia and policy making circles.
- Statistics in Denmark do not distinguish between "Native-born, "other EU-born” and "Non-EU-born” but instead between "immigrants from western and non-western countries". The same is true for the Netherlands, with many statistics focusing on people with an immigrant background (western or non-western, also born in the Netherlands with at least one foreign-born parent).
- In Austria and Italy, the emphasis is on nationality or country of citizenship, as labour market data do not include the place of birth.
- The concept of foreign born is inappropriate for any analysis on the immigrant stock in Poland too, as most foreign born people are older people who moved to Poland from former Polish lands annexed by the Soviet Union as a result of agreements on post-war boundaries.

For comparable statistics we therefore prefer to use the data provided in the report "Employment in Europe, 2008". The data presented in the country reports reflect this data with low percentages of third country migrants for the new Member States (e.g. just 1.2 percent in Bulgaria and 1.8 percent in Poland, with the exception of Estonia, which does have a very low migration level, but large numbers of Russian born people) and high percentages in the selected North-Western Member States, such as Austria, the Netherlands and Sweden.

Overall, shares of third country migrants in the Eastern European countries are small, while the shares are relatively large in the North Western European countries. Factors such as the colonial history or a history with guest workers determine the composition of the groups of migrants to a large extent.

2.3.2 Region of origin and reasons for migration

Question
What is known about the background of third country migrants: region of origin and reasons for migration?

Region of origin

In the EU as whole more than two-thirds of all non-EU-born working age third country migrants originate from just four main source regions: Central and South America (20 percent), North Africa (19 percent), Sub-Sahara Africa (15 percent) and South and South East Asia (14 percent). Other sizeable shares of third country migrants originate from Balkan non-Member States, Eastern Europe, the Near and Middle East and Turkey.
As shown in Figure 2.4 the composition of the non-EU-born population differs between Member States. For example, almost two-thirds of North Africans reside in France and almost half of Central and South Americans in Spain. Third country migrants born in Turkey represent relatively large shares of the non-EU-born population in The Netherlands, Austria, Belgium and Denmark (and Germany¹). Recent patterns of immigration, however, indicate that inflows have become more diversified. For example, Eastern European migrants as well as recent arrivals from North Africa have increasingly switched to Italy and Spain as main destination countries.

**Figure 2.4** Composition of non-EU-born population by main region of origin in selected Member States, 2007

Source: Reproduced from Employment in Europe 2008, European Commission

**Reasons for immigration**

The main reasons for immigration into EU Member States in 2005 were family- and work-related. However, there are wide variations across Member States. As shown in Figure 2.5, family related reasons accounted around 60 percent of new arrivals in France, while labour migration accounted for over 40 percent in the UK, Denmark, Portugal and Belgium, but only around 25 percent in The Netherlands and Sweden. In these two countries and in the UK, humanitarian migration accounted for substantial parts of third country national inflow.

¹ Data from Eurostat for Germany does not include information on specific country of birth.
Country reports on the region of origin of third country migrants

It goes beyond the scope of this section to name all the migrants groups by their country or region of origin as there exists a great diversity between European countries. Obviously, in the European countries with a colonial past, these former colonial ties to a large degree impact the composition of the migrant groups. To mention a few examples, in Portugal the largest proportion of foreign-born are from Cape-Verde, Angola, Guinea-Bissau, Mozambique and São Tomé e Príncipe, in the Netherlands substantial numbers of third country migrants are from Suriname and the Netherlands Antilles and in France large numbers come from Morocco, Algeria and Tunisia.

Another common factor for the origin of the third country migrant groups in some European countries is a history with guest workers. In countries such as Germany, Austria and the Netherlands, this resulted in large numbers of third country migrants from for example Turkey and Morocco. As will be noted a few times in this report, this ‘guest worker history’ resulted in another vulnerable group in terms of labour market integration, the second generation of migrants, or migrant youth.
2.3.3 Gender and age

**Question**
What is known about the background of third country migrants: gender and age?

At EU and at Member State level, there are broadly equal numbers of male and female third country migrants. Women are slightly overrepresented in migrant populations from Eastern Europe, Central and South America and East Asia and men are in the migrant populations from the Near and Middle East.

**Figure 2.6** Age structure in the EU of EU-born and non-EU born migrants, 2007

Source: Reproduced from Employment in Europe 2008, European Commission

In the EU, third country migrants of working age are on average younger than those who are EU-born, with the age distribution being relatively more skewed to the younger adult ages. This difference is even more pronounced for recent third country migrants, among who two thirds of the adult population is younger than the age of 35.
### 2.3.4 Education

**Question**

What is known about the background of third country migrants: education?

Overall, the EU tends to attract mainly lower-skilled third country migrants. Third country working age migrants are more concentrated in the lower levels of the skill distribution, while the EU-born are more concentrated in the medium levels.

**Figure 2.7** Skill level in the EU of EU-born and non-EU-born, 2007

In the new Member States the shares of people with higher education are greater among non-EU born than among EU-born. Thus, in these Member States in particular, immigration acts as an important source for meeting demands for high-skilled labour (partly being a solution for the higher educated work force migrating to the EU15). On the contrary, in many of the older Member States the share of tertiary educated people among non-EU migrants is well below that for the EU-born, indicating a contrasting demand for migrant labour that is relatively less-well educated than the resident EU population. As a consequence, the overall share of high-skilled third country migrants in the EU remains low.

*Source: Reproduced from Employment in Europe 2008, European Commission*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Low</th>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>High</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>49.5</td>
<td>28.3</td>
<td>22.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech Republic</td>
<td>15.9</td>
<td>60.6</td>
<td>23.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>40.6</td>
<td>37.7</td>
<td>21.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>58.7</td>
<td>33.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>51.1</td>
<td>36.5</td>
<td>12.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>46.4</td>
<td>33.5</td>
<td>20.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>46.0</td>
<td>30.1</td>
<td>23.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>53.9</td>
<td>35.6</td>
<td>10.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>29.8</td>
<td>39.5</td>
<td>30.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>65.6</td>
<td>22.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lithuania</td>
<td>(7.9)</td>
<td>67.3</td>
<td>24.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luxembourg</td>
<td>31.5</td>
<td>38.0</td>
<td>30.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>45.7</td>
<td>35.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malta</td>
<td>51.3</td>
<td>(27.0)</td>
<td>(21.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>39.3</td>
<td>41.1</td>
<td>19.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>48.3</td>
<td>40.6</td>
<td>11.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>(17.7)</td>
<td>45.5</td>
<td>36.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>56.1</td>
<td>25.2</td>
<td>18.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>:</td>
<td>:</td>
<td>:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>33.6</td>
<td>56.0</td>
<td>10.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovakia</td>
<td>:</td>
<td>(59.6)</td>
<td>:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>37.2</td>
<td>38.1</td>
<td>24.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>27.8</td>
<td>44.9</td>
<td>27.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>:</td>
<td>:</td>
<td>:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EU</strong></td>
<td><strong>45.2</strong></td>
<td><strong>35.3</strong></td>
<td><strong>19.5</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source:* Reproduced from Employment in Europe 2008, European Commission. Source: DG EMPL calculations based on Eurostat, EU LFS annual data. ‘::’ Data not reliable. Data in brackets are uncertain due to small sample size. Data for Bulgaria, Germany and Ireland not available.
As outlined in the Commission Communication "New Skills for New Jobs" the next decade will see an increasing demand for a high-qualified and adaptable workforce and more skills-dependent jobs. In the EU-25 between 2006 and 2020 the proportion of jobs requiring high levels of education attainment should rise from 25.1 percent to 31.3 percent of the total, while at the same time the jobs requiring low levels of education attainment would decline from 26.2 percent to 18.5 percent. As the overall share of high-skilled third country migrants in the EU remains low, this encompasses one of the challenges for third country migrants in Europe.

To summarize, recent third country immigration has seen a large influx of people from Central and South America, together with the other main ‘traditional’ sources of North and Sub Saharan Africa and South and South East Asia. These groups consist to a large degree of young adults, comprise more women than men and include a high share of low skilled working age third country migrants.

1 (COM(2008) 868/3)
Country reports on the education level

The country studies show that the educational attainment level of third country migrants differs between the selected member states. In some countries, mainly the North-Western Member States (for example the Netherlands, Austria and the UK), the educational level of third country migrants is on average below the educational level of the native population. In other countries, mainly the new and Southern Member States (for example Spain, Portugal and Poland) this is the other way around. This pattern more or less coincides with the pattern observed with regard to the employment and unemployment rates, as will be described in the next section.

Being well educated is one thing, but having a job that suits the qualification level is another. In many countries migrants are overqualified for the position they hold. An over-qualified individual is one who holds a job that requires lesser qualifications than would theoretically be available to him at his education level. Often this is the result of one of the barriers we will discuss in the next section, the failure to recognize qualifications and acquired competences. In the reports on Spain, Sweden, Bulgaria, Portugal, the Netherlands, Austria and Italy over-qualification was clearly identified. For example in Spain, the education level of the immigrant population remarkably improved between 2003 and 2008. Nonetheless, most of the better educated migrants continue to be hired at low level positions and are thus clearly overqualified for their job. In Portugal, more than a third of the highly qualified foreign born is employed in low and medium skilled jobs.

Generally speaking, migrants in the North Western Member States are on average less educated than natives while in the new and Southern Member States this is the other way around. In many countries migrants are overqualified for the job they are in, mainly as result of the failure to recognize qualifications.

2.4 Labour market situation of third country migrants

Question
What percentage of third country migrants is employed?

Employment rates
Since the employment situation of European citizens and third country migrants is a moving target, due to the impact of the economic crisis, the figures presented in this section are more or less outdated. However, considering the fact that survey data indicate positive signs that the downturn is bottoming up, this figures have relevance in addressing the barriers third country migrants face, beyond the crisis. At the EU-level the average employment rate is almost similar for the EU born and non-EU-born. For recent third country migrants the gap is wider. Moreover, while employment rates for male and young third country migrants are comparable with their EU-born counterparts and those for older workers noticeably higher, rates for migrant women and people of prime working age are considerably lower.
## Table 2.4  Third country migrants’ employment and unemployment rates, 2007

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Non-EU-27 born (%)</th>
<th>Employment rates</th>
<th>Unemployment rates</th>
<th>EU born</th>
<th>Non-EU-born</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Resident &gt; 7 years</td>
<td>Resident &lt; 7 years</td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>63.2</td>
<td>45.5</td>
<td>48.1</td>
<td>38.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech Republic</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>66.1</td>
<td>71.4</td>
<td>69.4</td>
<td>74.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>78.8</td>
<td>59.6</td>
<td>(62.1)</td>
<td>(55.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>14.4</td>
<td>:</td>
<td>74.4</td>
<td>74.8</td>
<td>:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>61.0</td>
<td>67.5</td>
<td>68.4</td>
<td>65.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>64.7</td>
<td>70.4</td>
<td>71.3</td>
<td>69.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>65.2</td>
<td>56.9</td>
<td>61.8</td>
<td>40.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>:</td>
<td>58.2</td>
<td>66.2</td>
<td>70.2</td>
<td>60.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>70.4</td>
<td>75.2</td>
<td>69.9</td>
<td>77.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>17.6</td>
<td>67.7</td>
<td>73.1</td>
<td>72.8</td>
<td>80.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lithuania</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>64.7</td>
<td>70.9</td>
<td>71.8</td>
<td>:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luxembourg</td>
<td>:</td>
<td>64.4</td>
<td>60.0</td>
<td>65.8</td>
<td>49.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>57.3</td>
<td>62.6</td>
<td>63.0</td>
<td>61.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malta</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>55.5</td>
<td>60.2</td>
<td>62.2</td>
<td>:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>76.9</td>
<td>59.8</td>
<td>61.5</td>
<td>47.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>72.5</td>
<td>63.0</td>
<td>67.4</td>
<td>50.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>57.1</td>
<td>38.7</td>
<td>34.1</td>
<td>(54.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>67.4</td>
<td>73.7</td>
<td>73.7</td>
<td>73.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>:</td>
<td>58.8</td>
<td>(62.4)</td>
<td>:</td>
<td>:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>67.7</td>
<td>68.2</td>
<td>68.8</td>
<td>(56.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovakia</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>60.7</td>
<td>(60.9)</td>
<td>(59.6)</td>
<td>:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>70.5</td>
<td>55.6</td>
<td>59.6</td>
<td>46.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>76.0</td>
<td>58.9</td>
<td>63.2</td>
<td>44.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>71.9</td>
<td>62.6</td>
<td>63.9</td>
<td>60.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EU</strong></td>
<td><strong>5.6</strong></td>
<td><strong>64.6</strong></td>
<td><strong>63.3</strong></td>
<td><strong>65.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>59.9</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: DG EMPL calculations, based on Eurostat, EU LFS annual data. Bulgaria, Germany and Ireland are not available. Data not reliable. Data in brackets uncertain due to small sample size.
As shown in table 2.4, two groups of member states can be identified. Positive differences in third country migrants’ employment rates relative to those of the EU-born are observed in the ‘new’ (southern) immigration countries and the new Member States. The second group consists of the remaining old Member States, where the employment rates of the non-EU-born are significantly below those of the EU-born. These lower employment rates probably reflect the impact of factors such as high shares of migration that are unrelated to employment, tougher restrictions on access to employment and different welfare systems (less generous systems may put greater pressure on third country migrants to work). For some of these countries it might be interesting to compare the absolute employment figures.

If the employment rate of both third country migrants and EU-born is low, but at the same time third country migrants’ employment rate is higher than EU-born employment rate, there are three possible explanations:
1. Third country migrants are middle-aged (youngsters and elderly people have a low employment rate)
2. Displacement of EU-born by third country migrants (lower wages)
3. Third country migrants are working in jobs which are not popular with the EU-born
This distinction between the southern and new Member States and the remaining old Member States is also relevant when comparing recent third country migrants with EU-born. In very few countries do recent non-EU-born migrants have better or similar employment rates compared to the EU-born. In most Member States, employment rates for recent non-EU migrants are significantly lower, the difference again being most marked in the old Member States. In many Member States, the integration of recent female third country migrants appears particularly problematic.

**Employment rates by region of origin**

Zooming in on immigrant employment rates by region of origin, data suggests that third country migrants from East Asia, the Near and Middle East, North Africa and Turkey have worse labour market outcomes that third country migrants from other regions (see Figure 2.10). In addition, third country migrants from these regions who came to Europe in recent years seem to face particular difficulties integrating into the labour market; their employment rates are lower than those of established third country migrants. In contrast, employment rates of groups from other regions show little difference between recent and established third country migrants.

**Figure 2.10** Employment rates for third country migrants by region of origin

In comparison with other regions, the worse labour market outcomes between third country migrants from East Asia, North Africa, the Near and Middle East seems on the one hand to be due to lower employment rates of men and on the other of extremely low employment rates of women. Cultural and gender background possibly is a determining factor for the labour market integration of immigrant women, especially for women from Turkey and North Africa.
The type of European host country seems to have a role in employment rates of third country migrants as well: compared to EU nationals, some migrant groups tend to do better in certain Member States. Overall, it can be concluded that countries with the highest employment rates for nationals show worse employment rates for all groups of third country migrants.\(^1\)

**Unemployment rates**

In most Member States third country migrants are much more likely to be unemployed than the EU-born. In the traditional immigration countries of northern Europe, the unemployment rates for non-EU-born migrants are around three times higher than those for the EU-born. However, in other Member States, unemployment rates are broadly similar. This distinction between Member States largely follows the above described distinction with regard to employment rates.

**Country reports on the labour market situation of third country migrants**

Positive differences in third country migrants’ employment rates relative to those of the EU-born were observed in the ‘new’ (southern) immigration countries and the new Member States. The second group consisted of the remaining old Member States, where the employment rates of the non-EU-born were significantly below those of the EU-born. Within the selection of 15 countries in this study, the first group consists of Bulgaria, Poland, Hungary and Portugal while the second groups consists of the UK, Denmark, the Netherlands, Austria, Sweden, Germany, France, Switzerland, Estonia, Spain and Italy.

Reviewing these groups, and with regard to the first conclusion, the position of Estonia, Spain and Italy is remarkable. However, when we look at the magnitude of the employment rate (and unemployment rate) gaps between the native born and third country migrants, these gaps are especially pronounced in the Netherlands, Austria, UK, Denmark, Sweden, Germany, thus the North-Western Member States, while the gaps are far less substantial in Italy, Spain and Estonia. However, with the recession’s impact as a moving target, even this conclusion might be difficult to maintain for long. The most striking example comes from Spain. Fuelled by low interest rates that encouraged a building boom, so that construction and real estate combined were 20 percent of Spanish GDP in 2007, the unemployment rate in Spain fell to 8 percent in 2007. However, in summer 2008 Spain went into recession and the unemployment rate doubled to 17 percent by summer 2009 and the unemployment rate for foreigners topped 20 percent in fall 2009.\(^2\)

Generally speaking though, the migration orientation plays an important role in the distinction. In Portugal for example, the employment rates of immigrants are above those of the native born (although this observation might have to be adjusted due to the economic crisis). This is the result of the strong labour market orientation of migration flows to Portugal. The case of Sweden points to the same direction. In the 1960s and 1970s, Sweden received many young men looking for work and as a consequence the country had a period of high employment rates among the immigrant population. Since then, however, Sweden had shifted from receiving mainly labour migration to getting mostly refugee and asylum-seekers and as a result the country shifted from high to low employment rates of immigrants, particularly among the non-EU migrants.

---

\(^1\) Except for third country migrants from Oceania and North America.

2.4.1 Sectoral and occupational structure

**Question**
What information is available about the type of jobs: economic sectors?

Compared to the EU-born, third country migrants’ employment is relatively more concentrated in the hotels and restaurants, private household and construction sectors (see Figure 2.11). Recent third country migrants are underrepresented in the public administration and education sectors. Of particular note is the high share of recent non-EU-migrants in the private household sector. This feature is likely to continue in the future as demographic ageing and greater labour market participation of women continue to create demand for childcare and elderly care services, which might be a favourable development for the labour market integration of recent third country migrants.

With regard to the occupational structure of employment, compared to the EU-born, a notably higher share of third country migrants hold jobs in elementary occupations. This emphasizes once again that recent third country migrants help to address in particular labour market shortages at the ‘low end’ of the jobs spectrum. In contrast, non-EU-born migrants are strongly underrepresented in the more skilled occupations, but also in the medium-skilled occupations. Comparing the situation of recent and established third country migrants there is an adjustment over time in third country migrants’ occupational employment structure towards that of the EU-born population, moving from elementary occupations into the higher-skilled professions.

**Figure 2.11** Sectors of employment in the EU of non-EU and EU-born

Source: Reproduced from Employment in Europe 2008, European Commission
2.4.2 Over qualification

Question
What information is available about the type of jobs: level of education?

Evidence suggests that the skills of third country migrants are underutilized and that they suffer from large mismatches between the level of jobs they hold and their qualifications. Two-thirds of employed high-skilled recent third country migrants are in jobs for which they are over-qualified. Reasons for this are that third country migrants may have skills that are not immediately applicable to the host country labour market and that they often lack complementary skills such as language fluency. Mismatches may also be due to the problems they experience in getting their qualifications appropriately recognized.

Figure 2.12 Over qualification rates for EU-born and non-EU-born across Member States, 2007

As Figure 2.12 shows, considerable differences exist across countries. Overall, some countries, mainly the Southern Member States, are more successful at getting third country migrants into employment but leave them at greater risk of being over-qualified, while others reveal a lower rate of immigrant over-qualification but have a high rate of immigrant unemployment.
2.4.3 Working conditions

**Question**
What are the working conditions of third country migrants?

Overall, at the EU-level, third country migrants tend to be employed in jobs of lower quality, defined in terms of their job security and general working conditions. More often than in the case of EU-born workers, working conditions of third country migrants can be characterised by:
- temporary contracts and longer working hours;
- lower incomes;
- hazardous and unhealthy working environment, and;
- weak trade union representation.

**Temporary contracts and longer working hours**
Almost a quarter of non-EU-born employees are in temporary contracts, as opposed to 14 percent of the EU-born.

**Figure 2.13** Incidence of temporary employment for EU-born and non-EU-born employees across Member States, 2007

Additionally, 90 percent of migrant employees with temporary contracts hold them involuntarily, as opposed to 85 percent of the EU-born. As clearly shown in the figure above, the incidence of temporary employment is, in all Member States, even more marked among recent third country migrants. This partly reflects the fact that the activities in which many third country migrants work (agriculture, construction and hotels and restaurants) are very seasonal industries with a high incidence of temporary jobs.
Working in temporary jobs, even involuntarily, is not necessarily unfavourable because temporary employment may act as a stepping stone towards more permanent employment. For more established non-EU-migrants, the share of employees in temporary employment subsequently drops from 34 percent to around 17 percent. However, a major drawback given the current recession is that temporary employment is the most cyclical component of total employment.

On average, there are no significant differences in average working hours in the main job between EU-born and non-EU born. However, significantly more third country migrants than EU-born express a desire to work more hours than they usually do. This points to a potentially large, already present, supply of labour.

**Lower incomes**
The relatively high unemployment rates, the overrepresentation in sectors with lower wages and the young age of recent third country migrants result in lower incomes, the European Foundation or the Improvement of Working and Living Conditions (EWCO) concludes from national reports on the labour market situation for third country migrants in EU-countries.

**Working conditions of migrant women**
Migrant women are overrepresented in temporary jobs, EWCO found, as well as in part time work. In some EU countries such as Greece, migrant women are more segregated in lower paid jobs than men (cleaning and household sector). The overrepresentation of migrant women in part time jobs may be partly due to legislation that favours part time work. Also, public services, where women are overrepresented, more often offer part time contracts.

**More hazardous and unhealthy working environment**
In addition, third country migrants often take on the more hazardous and unhealthy of the low paid, unskilled jobs, such as construction or mining. EU-born workers are less willing to take on these types of jobs.

**Weak trade union representation**
Finally, though data is lacking in a lot of EU-countries, in some EU-countries third country migrants seem to be more weakly represented by trade unions than EU-born workers. Weak representation is in part due to the fact that third country migrants are concentrated in sectors with a lower presence of labour unions such as the household sector.

### 2.5 Target groups among third country migrants

Migrant women come out on top as a particular vulnerable group across Europe. In the reports on Spain, the UK, Denmark, the Netherlands, Portugal, Austria, Sweden, France, Switzerland and Italy migrant women are mentioned as (one of) the most vulnerable group(s) of third country migrants. In some country reports this group is even further exemplified, such as in the UK (Bengali women), Denmark (Somali or Middle East women) or Portugal (Brazilian women). In the reports on Italy and Austria it was explicitly mentioned.
that immigrant women face double discrimination, because of them being women and having a migrant background.

Mainly in the North-Western European countries, the phenomenon of marriage migration is one of the explaining factors which makes it that women are among the most vulnerable groups. Males from certain countries and backgrounds tend to marry women from a similar cultural background who subsequently come to live in the country of their husbands. In countries such as Germany, Netherlands and Denmark, governments took actions to restrict this kind of migration, for example by demanding a certain income in order to be given admission or to increase minimum age for marriage migration.

In Austria the case of Turkish women is striking. Of them, 90 percent only obtained primary education and their labour force participation rate is clearly lower in all age groups, compared to all other migrant groups. They are more often housewives and rarely economically active. This correlates with higher numbers of children and a stronger orientation towards the family. One important differentiation, as was made in the Netherlands, is that not all migrant women want to work. However, it is not always clear if they don’t want to work or if they are restricted to do so because of their cultural background.

Other groups at risk are refugees or asylum seekers. In the Netherlands, Austria and Bulgaria this group was mentioned as one of the most vulnerable groups. In the Netherlands, limited language skills and traumas are the most important factors that hamper the labour market integration of refugees. In Austria, the labour market is still more or less closed for asylum seekers. Many of them have to wait for years until the decision whether they can stay in Austria or have to leave is made. During this period their reintegration into the labour market is getting more and more problematic and they frequently lose motivation. This results in de-qualification and sometimes in illegal work.

Undocumented or illegal migrants were named as the most vulnerable group in Hungary and as one of the most vulnerable groups (next to refugees) in Bulgaria. However, in both country reports, although this group is not included in this study, it was stated that the Roma population might constitute an even more vulnerable group.

Another group, explicitly mentioned as a vulnerable group in Germany, Austria, France and Switzerland, is the second generation of migrants. However, also in other Member States such as the Netherlands, the UK and Denmark much attention is given and concern has been devoted to second generation migrants. In Germany for example, data demonstrate that the tendency to occupy low-qualified posts manifests itself even stronger in the case of the second generation of immigrants.

Finally, some groups of migrants were just mentioned once, such as migrants living in remote areas or Russian speaking migrants (both in Estonia) or non-Portuguese speaking migrants.

_Vulnerable groups in terms of labour market integration are women, refugees, undocumented migrants and second generation migrants._

Obviously, during the phase of project development, part of a good problem analysis is also identifying the exact target group, as different target group within the larger group of third country migrants experience different barriers and might ask for a different approach.
2.6 Challenges for third country migrants summed up

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What challenges do third country migrants face regarding the future needs of European labour markets?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.6.1 Main findings labour market situation

In section 2.2.1 we described some main findings on the impact of the worsening labour market situation. Among other findings, we saw that the unemployment rate for youth has increased more strongly than the overall rate, with young people already suffering from a deficit of work opportunities during the more prosperous years. Secondly, the outlook for employment and unemployment is decidedly negative for the industry, construction and services sectors. Thirdly, weakening of the labour markets is most evident in contraction of temporary employment.

Generally speaking, as shown in the previous sections, third country migrants are younger than the EU-born population, are overrepresented in the above mentioned sectors and work relatively often in temporary employment. This indicates that at the moment, the labour market position of third country migrants is even more vulnerable, more so because the overall share of high-skilled third country migrants in the EU remains low, while the proportion of jobs requiring high levels of education attainment will rise and at the same time the proportion of jobs requiring low levels of education attainment would decline. All the more reason why it is important to identify the barriers to successful integration into the labour market and to identify the innovative approaches to overcome these barriers.

Moreover, recent non-EU migrants face the highest risks of dropping out of employment, a disturbing finding given current economic developments. Interestingly however, recent third country migrants also have higher rates of movement from unemployment and inactivity into employment. Reasons for this might be the economic necessity or the fact that third country migrants are more often middle aged. This highlights their role in increasing flexibility of EU labour markets, which comes in useful at the moment. Third country migrants’ transition rates between economic statuses differ between member states. In certain countries, especially Belgium and France, the labour market is not very accommodating or dynamic for third country migrants in that they are retained less in employment and find it harder to get into employment when out of work.

2.6.2 Conclusions

Here we summarize some conclusions on current labour market developments in Europe and the labour market situation of third country migrants.

- On the one hand, demographic developments do not come to a standstill, resulting in increasing labour market shortages in the near future. Therefore, Europe is likely to rely on third country migrants, who can contribute significantly to solving future labour market shortages.
- On the other hand, the economic crisis will continue to impact European labour markets in 2010 and there will be a drastic increase in the unemployment rate. Especially youth,

---

people working in temporary employment and people working in industry, services and construction will be hit hard. Among these groups third country migrants are relatively overrepresented.

- These developments, although from a different perspective, call for labour market integration of third country migrants.
- Considering the labour market situation of third country migrants, two groups of member states can be identified. Positive differences in third country migrants' employment rates relative to those of the EU-born are observed in the 'new' (southern) immigration countries and the new Member States. The second group consists of the remaining old Member States, where the employment rates of the non-EU-born are significantly below those of the EU-born. These differences in labour market situation of third country migrants between Member States call for specific and focused approaches.
- Recent third country immigration consists to a large degree of young adults, comprises more women than men and includes a high share of low skilled working age third country migrants.
- At the same time, the employment rate gap between EU-born and non-EU-born is larger for recent third country migrants and employment rates of migrant women and people of prime working age (25-54) are considerably lower compared to their EU-born counterparts.
- It follows that third country migrants’ integration into the labour market may be particularly challenging in the older Member States and for recent third country migrants, migrant women and third country migrants of prime working age. These groups should be among the main target groups.
3 Barriers for labour market integration

3.1 Introduction

In this chapter we discuss the barriers for labour market integration that third country migrants encounter. Barriers are defined as ‘intrinsic or external bottlenecks that hamper, in this case, third country migrants from seeking, finding, keeping or moving upwards to a suitable job in a given legal context’. Such bottlenecks may take different features, occur in different phases of the employment cycle, and play out differently for different individuals. What they all have in common is that they prevent third country migrants from achieving an employment position equivalent to that of a corresponding non-migrant / native born. However, it is important to mention that these barriers could also be applicable for other groups. This definition above implies that the removal of such bottlenecks should result in ‘a situation in which labour force outcomes for third country migrants are similar to those of corresponding non-migrants / native born’.

When developing a project or approach towards labour market integration, identifying the barriers is an essential and integral element of the first phase, the problem definition. That is, projects are generally initiated because of a problem that needs to be resolved. In this chapter we discuss these barriers, or the problem definition, as it is a logical step towards the approaches themselves and the results of these approaches, which will be discussed in the next chapter.

The information provided in the chapter is based on desk research and on the 15 country studies. For each barrier examples are given of approaches that deal with this barrier. These examples come from the 47 approaches identified in the country studies. Only examples of the 15 approaches explored in the case studies are provided within textboxes.

Before this in-depth analysis of the individual barriers, first we shortly discuss the extent to which the 47 approaches deal with the identified barriers. As said earlier, it might be the case that the experts did not describe each barrier a certain approach is focused on. Therefore, representativeness could not be ensured. However, it could be assumed that for each approach, those aspects on which the focus lies most were highlighted.

3.2 An overview of barriers

Before turning to the individual barriers, we first present a model with the wide variety of barriers that that were identified in the country reports and partly in a number of overview studies (on European, national, or group level) by OECD, ILO, EWCO, and the European Commission (see figure 3.1).
Figure 3.1 shows a number of barriers that third country migrants may face in the process of seeking, finding, keeping or moving upwards in a suitable job. The intrinsic and external barriers identified in the model are strongly interrelated and often appear as a result of a mis-match between the qualifications, capabilities and expectations of the third country migrants, on the one hand, and the requirements and expectations of the society or the employer towards the work-seeker or employee, on the other hand. It is important to note that most barriers are cross-cutting and are often reinforcing one another. They may also take different features in different countries and in different phases of the employment cycle. Furthermore, the way a certain barrier influence the labour market integration of the third country migrant is depending on a number of intrinsic characteristics such as gender, country of origin, and level of education.

Barriers identified in the country reports
The lack of language skills and the lack of educational or professional skills were identified as important barriers in almost all country reports. Of the 47 approaches described in the country reports fourteen respectively seven focus on these two barriers. Often these are combined within a package of courses provided. Seven of the approaches aim to improve and assist migrants with recognition of qualifications and five approaches focus on the limited social and professional networks of migrants.

Many approaches focus on the limited knowledge of the labour market and hence try to improve this. This barrier can refer to different stages in the labour market process: searching for a job, applying for a job (both access to the labour market) or performing within a job (advancement on the labour

---

1 In the literature, culture is mentioned as an important factor influencing the behaviour of both employers and employees (see for instance COM 2007:512). Behavioural differences can constitute barriers in all phases of the employment cycle. However, in this context, it is important to emphasize that culture as such does not constitute a barrier. Rather, it is in the mis-match between expectations (that can be culturally influenced) that a bottleneck can appear.
Of the 19 approaches that aim at improving labour market knowledge, most (14) focus on improving the knowledge (and skills) needed to search for a job or to apply for a job (e.g. writing a CV, job interview techniques), and thus focus on the barriers for access to the labour market. Of the 19 approaches only 3 focus explicitly on improving the knowledge and skills needed to perform within a job, such as knowledge on the working and business culture and code of conduct. Two approaches combine these stages and focus both on knowledge needed for labour market entry and labour market advancement. As the limited knowledge of the labour market, although pertaining to different stages was recognized as a barrier in all the country reports, the fact that this barrier comes out on top in terms of the barriers the described approaches aim at, indicates that these approaches are working on the right barrier.

Six of the approaches focus on preventing discrimination. Although two of these (in Denmark and the Netherlands) are not directly focused on discrimination, but more on improving the impression employers have of immigrants. However, the basic principle for this might be the negative impression employers have.

The category ‘legislation, policy and other contextual barriers’ here mainly refers to the lack of coordination between several stakeholders, a barrier towards which five of the described approaches are targeted at. The lack of coordination between stakeholders was identified as a barrier in some of the country reports. Different approaches include elements that try to deal with this barrier by bringing together different stakeholders involved in the process of labour market integration of third country migrants, including associations or organisations of migrants themselves.

For a full overview of the 47 approaches in terms of barriers addressed (and target groups aimed at and elements used) we refer to annex 7.

In the following sections we will discuss the barriers mentioned in more detail.

### 3.2.1 Lack of language skills

Desk research showed that in studies on the integration of third country migrants, proficiency of the host country’s language is always listed as one of the most important conditions for integration. In all country reports the lack of language skills is mentioned as an important barrier. The only exception is France. Most migrants come from the former colonial territories of France and language selection contributes to the choice for France as immigration country. Even if lack of language skills was identified in all other countries, there might be differences between groups of migrants or countries.

In the UK for example, labour migrants entering the UK through the tier-point system do not generally have language problems because the language selection criteria of the tier-point system are very stringent. Their spouses on the other hand often face language barriers, just like workers coming from other EU countries, this latter category because they enter the UK labour market as part of their right of free movement without having to meet the language criteria which third country migrants have to meet.

---

1 COM (2003) 336
In the Netherlands, an interesting finding is that even for high skilled migrants, who are able to speak Dutch, language remains the most important barrier. The jobs they are qualified for in terms of diplomas demand a very well developed mastery of (formal) Dutch to be able to perform in these high-skilled jobs. For many of them it takes a while before they reach this level of Dutch.

In most countries measures such as language training exist to deal with this barrier. Whereas all country reports explicitly mention the language barrier, not all country reports described language training measures. However, the fact that language training was not described in the country reports of Denmark and Poland probably does not indicate that these measures are non-existent in these countries (see section 0).

Moreover, the issue of language training is tied to another barrier. Reports from the UK, Bulgaria, and Germany point out that another significant barrier is the lack of access to language training, which is more of a contextual barrier.

In the UK there has been considerable investment in ESOL (English for Speakers of Other Languages). Nevertheless, there is not enough capacity for face-to-face language training. The government is currently considering various pre-arrival language programs. In effect, it is contemplating a hybrid model between the Dutch model (pre-arrival language test only – no course) and the French model (pre-arrival language course in country of origin), whereby immigrants are asked to commit themselves to take part in a course as soon as they arrive in the UK. However, public consultation seems to show some resistance to the idea, and questions about enforcement remain. Apart from the capacity problems with language training, another barrier closely linked to this are complex language training procedures. This is for example the case in the Netherlands, where the civic integration system, of which language training is a part of, is rather complex.

In some countries, for example Bulgaria, language training is combined with providing background or cultural information about the country. In Germany and the Netherlands language classes are offered within the framework of integration courses and in Italy as well, learning Italian and the main rules of the country is increasingly becoming important within the Italian integration policies.

Finally, it has to be stressed that lack of knowledge of the host language, although it might be (one of) the most important barrier(s), is not the only barrier. A good example to illustrate this is provided in the country report of Germany. The language problem only affects the first generation of migrants. However, despite the fact that the second generation of immigrants possesses very good language skills, they perform worse on the labour market than the first generation, probably explained by socio-economic variables.

The lack of language skills is an important barrier in most countries, however it is clearly not the only barrier. Language training is widespread across the countries, although in some countries capacity is lacking or procedures are too complex.

An interesting case that acknowledges that fact that the language barrier is not the only barrier comes from Bulgaria.
Integration Centre of the State Agency for Refugees - Bulgaria

In Bulgaria the majority of the asylum seekers who were granted refugee status lack any knowledge of the Bulgarian language. They are often unemployed and unable to pay for accommodation and as a result they try to migrate further again, join the ‘shadow economy’ or take on any manual job available. Other barriers they face are a lack of previous professional experience in Bulgaria and the lack of recognition of diplomas.

The approach adopted by the Integration Centre of the State Agency for Refugees tries to tackle these barriers, by recognizing that lack of language skills is, although the most important, not the only barrier, and focusing on providing Bulgarian language training in particular, but also on other important aspects, thereby creating a coherent approach. This includes providing financial assistance, assistance with labour market registration, and enrolment in training courses on cultural differences and the Bulgarian labour market mechanisms. In combining these elements, of which language training is an important part, the approach focuses on both labour market entry as well as advancement within the labour market.

For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.2.1 and annex 3

3.2.2 Lack of professional and educational skills

Low skill and education levels are factors often resulting in less favourable labour market outcomes for third country migrants. However, it also the case that many third country migrants entering the EU labour market today, do not have low education levels and have years of relevant professional skills. In these cases, there are other barriers that prevent them from gaining access to the labour market. Indeed, in the Netherlands it was found that a significant gap in the employment rates between native and migrants would still remain, even if migrants had the same educational attainment as the native born. And in Austria also, immigrants displaying a higher education don’t have a guarantee to get a job corresponding with their qualifications (see also the next section). There are many immigrant university graduates who have to work in cleaning jobs or supermarkets, at least at the beginning of their stay, until they have all the permits to get their qualifications recognized and are able to find a proper job in Austria.

The country reports endorse this finding. The lack of educational or professional skills barrier was identified in most country reports but not necessarily as the most important barrier. But being an important prerequisite for labour market success, education and training are central elements of labour market measures targeted at third country migrants in most countries.

In the UK, for example, the network of Job Centres, overseen by the Department for Work and Pensions, provides migrants from third countries with access to educational training programs. Most migrants are able to access mainstream education and training provision, with further education colleges and Learning and Skills Councils playing an especially important role in providing adult education. For refugees and asylum seekers, who are some-

---


times unwilling or unable to access mainstream education and training provision, many RCO’s (Refugee and Community Organisations) are active in providing training. Another example comes from the ‘Legitimation.nu’ approach in Sweden. This project recognizes both a lack of educational and professional skills as well as the failure to recognize qualifications as barriers. The project provides practical training and vocational courses for doctors and nurses with foreign diplomas, while at the same time significantly shortening the road to a Swedish professional certification. The Spanish approach explored in the case study also focused, among other things, on the lack of professional and educational skills.

**‘Analogias’ - Spain**

In Spain one of the reasons why socially vulnerable groups are experiencing difficulties in finding stable and quality employment is the lack of specific training (or work experience). To deal with this the social mediators in the ‘Analogias’ project assist them in finding appropriate occupational and job skills training. Professional training will be primarily offered in those job sectors in greatest demand of employment in Valencia’s labour market, so as to increase the possibility of finding employment.

*For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.2.3 and annex 3*

---

The lack of professional and educational skills is clearly identified as a barrier in most country reports. However, having qualifications is not a guarantee to get a qualified and sustainable job. Many educated migrants face difficulties entering the labour market at their skills level as a result of the failure to recognize diplomas.

### 3.2.3 Recognition of qualification and diplomas

To be able to make advantage of third country migrants’ previously acquired experience and qualifications, recognition and proper assessment of formal and informal qualifications (including diplomas) is required. High-skilled third country migrants with tertiary education often face difficulties getting their credentials recognized by employers in the host country. Due to the undervaluation of the educational level and labour market experience, third country migrants that do find a job often have to settle for a lower position than they were accustomed to in their country of origin: over-qualification amongst third country migrants is widespread¹.

Failure to recognize qualifications was identified as a barrier in many, but not all country reports. In many countries, the example of refugee doctors, for example from Iran or Afghanistan, having to work far below their skills level, was given. Often the difficulties have to do with bureaucratic and procedural inflexibility. In Austria for example the procedures are expensive, long and complicated. Another problem, as mentioned in the country report of Austria, is the fact that if somebody has a high qualification but has once accepted a job below his/her qualification, the Public Employment Service argues that the de-qualifying job is reasonable for the unemployed person and continues to place the person in this kind of jobs. Upward mobility is thus hampered dramatically.

---

¹ Jean, S., Causa, O., Jimenez, M., Wanner, I., MIGRATION IN OECD COUNTRIES: LABOUR MARKET IMPACT AND INTEGRATION ISSUES ECONOMICS DEPARTMENT WORKING PAPERS No. 562 (OECD, 2007)
Exceptions are the country reports on Poland and Hungary, in which the failure to recognize qualifications was neither mentioned as a barrier, nor was any measure to improve the recognition of qualifications described. Another example is Estonia. Educational skills and contracts are recognized from 2004 on the basis of the Lisbon convention. Recognizing educational skills has not been a problem, since Estonia has a shortage of skilled workers and engineers and employers thus are eager to hire high skilled people from abroad, even if they don’t possess officially recognized qualifications.

As the limited recognition of qualifications is identified as a key issue in most countries, there are several measures aimed at resolving or at least improving this issue. In the Netherlands for example, the Central Agency for Asylum seekers (COA) conducts skills assessments for each accepted asylum seeker with a detailed description of his/her professional experience, and a so-called personal development plan to assess his/her possibilities on the Dutch labour market. In addition the Ministry of Health offers specific training programs for highly qualified refugees who wish to pursue their career as a doctor or a dentist. There have been similar projects for other regulated professions such as technicians and teachers. In the UK as well, there are a number of schemes (across industries and within industries) that help address the difficulty of gaining qualification recognition. UK NARIC is a national agency, which on behalf of the UK Government provides the only official source of information on international qualifications to organisations recruiting from overseas and to individuals wishing to work or study in the UK. And in Austria, the ‘Competence Centre for New Immigrants’ provides help, advice and consulting to migrants to get the proper recognition of their qualification and further training, in order to prevent them from jobs they are over-qualified for. Also, an evaluation of the chances on the Vienna labour market is made.

The approach that most specifically focused on recognition of qualification is the Qualification+ approach from Switzerland.

**Qualification+ - Switzerland**

In Switzerland, as in many other European countries, it is the case that those who have no formal qualification certifying their professional competences encounter significant difficulties with promotion and career progression, salary levels and job security. These problems are indicative of the emphasis placed by employers on formal certification, in other words the possession of a recognized qualification that ‘matches’ professional experience. As a result, many adults are, although they have a high degree of experience in a particular profession, formally unqualified or under-qualified because they have never obtained a qualification certifying their level of competence. What is more, economic downturns in Switzerland, such as currently experiencing, have a greater effect on less-qualified workers who are as a consequence more likely to lose their jobs. The approach Qualification+ (see aims to solve this barrier by helping adults possessing significant professional experience to achieve the Federal Vocational Education and Training Diploma.

*For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.2.5 and annex 3.*

In some countries however, governmental arrangements make the recognition of qualifications even more complicated, such as in Germany. This issue remains within the responsibility of the federal states. Therefore, the pace of legislative reforms depends on the willingness of the local governments to improve immigrants’ situation.
The failure to recognize qualifications was recognized as a barrier in almost all country reports. Across the countries, measures are in place to assist migrants in getting their qualifications recognized, but this barrier remains to hamper successful labour market integration of third country migrants.

3.2.4 Limited of knowledge of the labour market

Under the heading of this barrier fall several barriers, corresponding to different stages in the labour market integration process: limited knowledge (or skills) needed for job seeking, lack of job application skills and knowledge on application procedures and limited knowledge of the ‘working culture’ needed to perform within a job. The limited knowledge of the labour market, although sometimes pertaining to different stages, was recognized in all the country reports.

Firstly, a lack of knowledge of the labour market and official canals and procedures puts third country migrants in a worse starting position compared to nationals when looking for jobs. Because of a limited knowledge of channels to enter the labour market third country migrants may have a job-seeking behaviour which is different from the national population. Many country reports point this lack of job seeking skills as an important barrier and hence provide job seeking training. In Portugal for example, migrants have access to job-seeking training that provides them with the necessary skills to look for employment through formal channels (for example through newspaper ads). Most immigrants tend to use informal networks to find employment and are met with substantial challenges when faced with more formal, institutionalized, forms of recruitment, particularly when their educational level is low. In Bulgaria, one of the main barriers migrants face is the difficulty they experience in accessing information. In Estonia, this barrier is dealt with by translating all the necessary legislation into English and Russian to help job seekers get acquainted with necessary juridical documents.

Searching for a job is one thing, applying for a job is another. Again certain knowledge and corresponding skills related to the host countries labour market customs are needed to successfully apply for a job. Several country reports identified a lack of application skills, as an important barrier. In Poland for example, limited knowledge of job application procedures is one of the most important barriers.

Finally, the third barrier under this heading has not so much to do with access to the labour market, but with staying within the labour market or with upward mobility. To be able to perform in a job, understanding of the working culture or the codes of conduct is needed. A limited understanding of a certain working culture can prevent migrants from bonding with employers or colleagues or might make them come across as unsuitable for a particular job. Working codes and traditions differ between countries. The EQUAL funded project ‘Artemisszió’ in Hungary (see also the textbox in section 4.2.1 and annex 3) focuses partly on this third barrier. Labour market aspects such as communication, hierarchic relations, cooperation, introducing oneself and the use of time are culturally determined. Behaving the wrong way in certain situations, as a result of cultural ignorance, could lead to conflict.

---

situations. Therefore, the project provides intercultural training that motivates participants to perceive cultural patterns more consciously and to acquire the skills that assist them to cooperate with local employers, colleagues and clients in a culturally appropriate manner.

The case study from Austria in the textbox below also focuses on the limited knowledge of the labour market.

**ÖIF Jobcentre – Austria**

Recognized refugees and persons having been granted subsidiary protection in Austria often seemed to be confused and disoriented concerning their possibilities and chances on the Austrian labour market as well as their personal perspective. Though the members of this target group do not face any legal barriers on the labour market, as they have the same rights as Austrian nationals, they are thus confronted with other migration related barriers, such as little knowledge about the Austrian labour market, lacking skills how to apply for a job and lacking know-how concerning the social competencies one needs in Austria. The ÖIF Jobcentre was established to help these people with their access to the labour market in various ways, such as individual counselling and 'help for self-help', thereby empowering them to take over their labour market situation.

*For more information on this approach see textbox in section 4.2.2 and annex 3*

Obviously, the different stages in the labour market integration process are connected with each other. Interestingly, as pointed out in the UK report, this is not always recognized by the way different measures are developed to improve the labour market knowledge and skills. In the UK, the government makes use of two EU funds to help third country migrants in obtaining soft job-searching skills. The European Integration Fund (EIF) is used mainly for external projects (UK language and preparatory for entry into the labour market, whereby language courses are designed around particular themes related to employment, such as writing CV’s and interview skills). The European Social Fund (ESF), on the other hand, is used to help migrants develop certain on-the-job skills (see also section 4.4 on political and institutional arrangements).

---

In all countries the limited knowledge of the labour market was recognized as an important barrier. This knowledge (or skills) pertains to three different stages in the labour market integration process. The first two, searching for a job and applying for a job deal with entry or access to the labour market. The third one, performing on the job and knowledge of the working culture deal with advancement or upward mobility within the labour market.

### 3.2.5 Limited social and professional network

An aspect contributing to the lack of knowledge of the labour market in the host country, is the limited social network of many third country migrants. In the country reports on Denmark, the Netherlands, Estonia, Portugal and Italy, this barrier is explicitly mentioned, and in many countries active measures towards improving the social and professional networks of migrants were described.

---

Indeed, in Italy ethnic networks, especially in some quite ‘closed’ communities with great language difficulties, limit or zero the possibility to construct ‘social capital’ outside one’s community, generating a very small integration with the non-ethnic labour market thus contributing to generating ethnic-based employment segregation phenomena.

In the Netherlands, statistics show that in about 40 percent of all fillings of vacancies, personal contacts (both of the employee and the employer) played a role. Migrants tend to have fewer of these contacts than the native born. To deal with this barrier, in the Netherlands there are ‘measures’ in place like company fairs, special traineeships programs or mentoring.

In Denmark, a study among immigrants from Turkey and Iran found that networks had substantial influence on the possibilities to enter the labour market. Other studies pointed out that immigrant women have more narrow networks as they are primarily in contact with native born people – often in the same situation outside the labour market. This is likely to have an effect on their employment opportunities. The conclusion is that networks are very important for employment chances, not networks in general, but in particular employment-relevant networks.

In several countries there are approaches aiming to increase the social and professional networks of third country migrants. An example is the ESF/EQUAL funded project ‘Showing what you can’ in the Netherlands which organizes meetings between migrants and employers and consists of a mentor system in which mentors from businesses provide individual guidance. Participants are expected to create their own network to improve their career opportunities. Hence, network training is an important element of this approach. Another approach that acknowledges the importance of networks is the 4-part labour agreement approach from Denmark.

4-part labour agreement - Denmark

In Denmark third country migrants suffer from far higher unemployment rates than native Danes. There are several barriers that caused this, of which one is the lack of employment relevant networks among migrants. The recruitment process in Denmark, and in other countries, is often informal and based on contacts and recommendations. Part of the 4-part labour agreement are therefore creating contacts between companies and unemployed migrants to compensate for a lack of employment relevant networks and the establishment of a network for migrant women.

For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.3.4 and annex 3.

Though social networks can have positive effects, personal contacts with other third country migrants, particularly with those from the same country of origin, tend to channel third country migrants towards unskilled and low-paid jobs. Therefore, mixed networks are of importance. But, as for example, noted in the Estonian country report, this is often hampered by segregation. To deal with this, one of the described cases in Estonia tries to bring segregated non-Estonian risk groups back into active society and the labour market.

A limited social and professional network is identified in a few countries as a barrier to labour market integration. Successful networks can contribute to finding employment. However, ethnic homogenous networks could also hamper labour market integration.

3.2.6 Discrimination

Discrimination is a cross-cutting, additional obstacle to all other barriers encountered by third country migrants. Discrimination takes many features and can be both institutionalized and social. Discrimination on the basis of ethnic origin, cultural differences, qualifications, and language prevents third country migrants from getting invited for job interviews and moving forward on the career path.

In most country reports, discrimination is identified as an important barrier, which prevents third country migrants from entering or moving upwards in the labour market. However, one problem in assessing the impact of this barrier, is that it is difficult to measure. In only two country reports, the UK and Estonia, discrimination is not mentioned as one of the barriers faced by migrants.

In Hungary, xenophobia is even mentioned as one of the main barriers, as the Hungarian society is one of the most xenophobic (intolerant, closed, etc.) societies in contemporary Europe. Since 2007, the EU Integration Fund started to fund several multicultural awareness raising and anti-xenophobic projects. However, according to the Hungarian expert, a major drawback is that antidiscrimination actions are only experimental and project financed and consequently are fragmented, temporary and do not have long lasting effects.

In some countries, such as Denmark and Germany, young, second generation migrants encounter discrimination when seeking an internship as part of their education. Desk research showed that migrants from Islamic countries especially encounter suspicion and prejudice which impact their employment prospects. Indeed, in the Netherlands, Moroccans are in the least favourable position.

As pointed out in the reports on Denmark and the Netherlands, the factor discrimination is strongest when unemployment is high. During times of labour market shortages, employers cannot afford the ‘luxury’ of discrimination. Therefore, discrimination, although very difficult to measure, might have been less widespread in recent years. However, this implicates that, as a result of the economic crisis and rising unemployment, discrimination could be on the rise again, making third country migrants an even more vulnerable group.

In most countries active measures are undertaken to prevent and fight discrimination. In Spain educational programs exist that teach against the dangers of xenophobia and racism, while favouring tolerance and multicultural coexistence, there is a ‘code of ethics’ regarding the treatment of information on migrants by the media and there are information and social sensitivity campaigns on prejudices and stereotypes associated with immigrant groups. In Denmark, Austria, the Netherlands, Italy and Sweden several diversity manage-

---


2 Based on the country report of Hungary which referred to the European Social Value surveys and recent Eurobarometers.
ment projects are in place and in the Netherlands there is a project that promotes discussions on the work floor between employees from different ethnic minority groups and native Dutch employers about cultural differences and the influences it has on the mutual relations on the work floor. Moreover, in the Netherlands as well, there are still some affirmative action programs in place, for example in the municipality of Amsterdam, which has a target to increase the share of persons with a migration background in the public service. In Italy, an interesting example is that the National Office against Racial Discrimination (UNAR) launched in 2007 the ‘first national award for good business practices’, relating to social inclusion and inter-ethnic co-existence.

Also in the countries with a much shorter migration history, the issue of discrimination against migrants (or minorities, such as Roma) is recognized and put on the agenda. The example of Hungary was already mentioned above and in Bulgaria, the Commission for Protection against Discrimination is the first institution to take up the issue of discrimination against migrants.

Preventing discrimination can also be done by not directly focusing on those instances in which discrimination is happening but by improving the image of immigrants. Thereby, the approach is more focused on attitudes (impression, image) instead of real behaviour (discrimination). Moreover, in this way the focus moves away from a negative point of view towards a positive point of view: the added value of employing migrants. An example of this is the ESF-EQUAL funded approach ‘Kroon op het werk’ in the Netherlands, which also focuses on the employer, as many of them hesitate to take migrants and employees into employment. By means of interculturalisation courses for employers the projects aims to create a sustainable change in the behaviour of employers. The emphasis is on the added value of diversity at work.

Another example comes from the UK. The London Refugee Economic Action Body developed a Business Case for Employing London’s Refugees. Real life illustrations have been gathered from a variety of public and private employers with regard to ways in which they have benefited from employing refugees in order to address labour market supply shortages. An interesting example of targeting the majority society as well to prevent discrimination comes from Poland.
In Poland, there was a widespread perception among policymakers and experts of an inadequate responsiveness of Poland to the needs of immigrants entering the labour market. This was reflected in diverse difficulties encountered by the foreigners in job searching and functioning in employment, as well as in the lack of experience and deficient knowledge on the part of employers and social workers with regard to the instruments and procedures facilitating the adaptation of immigrants to the labour market in Poland.

Some of the barriers in particular are the observed or perceived cases of migrant’s discrimination regarding social and economic adaptation in Poland and insufficient awareness among the Polish society concerning the functioning of various categories of migrants in Poland.

The project developed by the International Centre of Occupational Adaptation aims to cope with those barriers, addressing besides migrants as a target group also intermediary beneficiaries, i.e. people belonging to the majority society such as representatives of social organisations or agencies of social workers and other employees of respective regional and local administration, employer’s associations, women rights associations, organisations specializing in vocational training or retraining (through, especially, extramural courses), labour offices, teachers as well as educationists and psychologists working with children and their parents coming from different cultures. In short, the approach offers activities that improve the intercultural competences of representatives of the social services who deal with foreigners’ entry and functioning in the labour market.

For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.3.4 and annex 3

---

In most country reports, discrimination is identified as an important barrier, which prevents third country migrants from entering or moving upwards in the labour market. Discrimination could be prevented by not only focusing on instances of real behaviour but also by focusing on the attitudes towards and images of immigrants, thus starting from a positive point of view.

### 3.2.7 Working conditions

The working conditions migrants face is another barrier for successful integration. Indeed, in Portugal for example, the main barriers immigrants face that prevent successful labour market integration are not as much in accessing the labour market (immigrant employment rates were, at the time of research, higher than native-born rates) but in the working conditions they face. Precarious employment, including informal labour relations, as well as patterns of incorporation in low skilled occupations and low status activities, regardless of immigrants’ qualifications, have characterised the labour market insertion of immigrants in Portugal. In Hungary exploitation because of the weak labour market position (especially in the informal sector) is identified as one of the main challenges. And in Italy, a few qualitative studies have brought to light a sort of “positive discrimination” on behalf of enterprises in favour of immigrants due to their ‘willingness to work’, their being ready to accept bad working conditions and work overtime, their low rates of absence from work and their availability to accept at least part of the payment ‘under the table’.

In a rather innovative way the ‘Insieme si può’ approach in Italy tried to improve the working conditions of family care workers, mainly migrant women. Before, this type of work was not legally recognised. By recognising family care work as a legal qualification and hence providing training, topics such as the working conditions could be dealt with. For example, support was given to participants on the issue of sexual harassment. The other example of an approach taking working conditions into account comes from Italy as well.
In Italy only 8% of the immigrants working in the agriculture sector had a permanent employment contract. Immigrants were only employed in marginal roles and profiles, having no opportunities for negotiation, professional growth or qualification. In other words, they were seen as mere 'farm-arms' to be used in the harvest of agricultural production. This situation is partly due to the lack of a well-structured view of the supply chain on the part of enterprises with regard to employment issues.

Companies working in the tobacco supply chain are in need of labour and professional skills of companies, but such needs are mainly met by third country migrants who, however, enter this sector in a type of activity (hired farm hands) which do not make employment qualification and stability possible. Moreover, there is great seasonality and precariousness of the work and scarce or no stabilisation of employment, both on the territory and within the company (frequent changes of the place and the company of employment). This entails a number of hindrances, for example in terms of protection of health. Finally, immigrant labour is controlled and exploited by illegal organisations operating on the territory, e.g. gangmaster systems.

The Modello di occupazione a filiera approach aimed to stimulate the demand (of the enterprises) of a new professional profile that covers all the different phases of productive cycle and to train the third country migrants to cover this role. The crucial phases of the project were that of education and training and placement in companies of third country migrants.

For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.2.1 and annex 3.

Bad working conditions are identified as one of the main barriers towards successful labour market integration in some countries, where migrants are prone to exploitative working conditions.

3.2.8 Legislation, policy and other contextual barriers

Contextual factors such as legislations concerning working permits and social rights, immigration and integration policies, and citizenship procedures play an essential role in the labour market integration process of third country migrants and will to a large extent influence how certain barriers play out in certain national contexts. Such factors are apparent both on an EU wide level, but also vary between the different member states.

It is beyond the scope of this section to deal with country specific policies. Here some common grounds are summed up, together with some examples of country reports in which the policies are explicitly mentioned as a contextual barrier towards successful integration of migrants into the labour market.

One important barrier, as noted in the reports of the UK, the Netherlands and Austria, is that asylum seekers are often only partly allowed to work. In the UK, asylum seekers that have not yet been granted refugee status face legal barriers as they cannot legally enter into paid employment. And in Austria, as noted earlier (see the section on ‘vulnerable groups’ in the previous chapter) many of the asylum seekers have to wait for years until the decision whether they can stay in Austria or have to leave again is made. Meanwhile, legal conditions only allow for a limited access (e.g. in seasonal jobs) and as a result, their reintegration into the labour market is getting more and more problematic and they frequently loose motivation. This results in de-qualification and sometimes in illegal work.

More or less linked to this barrier, is complicated legislation, identified as a barrier in Poland, as this leaves much room for lengthy procedures. According to several scholars and
operators in Italy the present legislation is, actually, the first barrier towards a progressive and steady integration of immigrants into the Italian labour market. This has to do with the legislation regarding authorizations to entry and stay in the country, as well as the renewal of the permit to stay and, when necessary, the shift from one type of permit to another.

In the report on Bulgaria, the difficulties acquiring a legal status, as a result of restrictive immigration policies, was identified as a barrier, which makes that many third country migrants have an unsettled legal status (undocumented migrants). This makes them become a vulnerable group, as explained in the previous chapter. One of the approaches in Bulgaria aims to deal with such barriers and established a Legal Clinic at the University of Sofia that provides free legal assistance to migrants and refugees, to deal with the barrier of complicated legislation and procedures. This clinic also provides assistance to unsettled and undocumented migrants, as these groups are prone to bad housing conditions and labour exploitation.

Also identified as a policy barrier in the report on Hungary, is the lack of migration as a central issue for political parties. Policy discourses about migration in Hungary remain isolated and short term and elicit only ad-hoc attention, usually related to some local event.

In terms of labour market policy, Sweden and the Netherlands employ a mainstream policy rather than a targeting labour policy. Thus, labour market policy is not especially targeted towards certain groups, such as third country migrants. Based on this research it is not possible to judge the effectiveness of this policy in terms of labour market integration of third country migrants, but the gaps between the (un)employment rates of the native born and the third country migrants are rather substantial in Sweden and the Netherlands. However, of course there are many other factors of influence, such as migration history, the structure of the labour market or the particular groups of migrants within these countries. Somewhat connected to this, is the French republican orientation, identified as a barrier by the French expert. This orientation creates an integration policy which is ‘difference blind’. “Although this republican idea of equality of chances is noble, it prevents the development of specific measures for people in vulnerable situations”.

Another contextual barrier has to do with the capacity for the provision of language training, as was already described under the heading ‘lack of language skills’. In the UK, Germany and Estonia for example, there is currently not enough capacity for face-to-face language learning, although in the UK, the government is presently considering options for pre-arrival language programs. Moreover, in Estonia, the difficult bureaucratic procedures make it that a lot of people give up on their chance to learn Estonian. In Switzerland, on the other hand, there are many possibilities, notably in the urban context, to access free or subsidized language training courses.

Finally, as another striking barrier, the lack of coordination between different stakeholders in the field of migration and the labour market was mentioned. For example, in Hungary there is no institutionalized dialogue or exchange of views among stakeholders in labour migration such as employers, trade unions, social partners, political parties, local communities and NGOs representing migrants, social workers, integration programs and human

rights. Recognizing this barrier, there are several initiatives focusing on improving the co-
ordination between stakeholders. One of the examples is the Operational Framework ap-
proach in the UK.

**Operational Framework for Refugees – United Kingdom**

The UK is a recipient of high numbers of asylum seekers and refugees. There are considerable labour market disparities between the employment rates and unemployment rates of refugees and those of the average UK population. To tackle this, a new framework, the Operational Framework for Refugees was put in place. At the same time, they realised that “no single agency can achieve results alone. We will continue to depend on the strong partnerships that we have built across Government and with the voluntary sector”. This empha-

sises the importance of partnership working. The strategy thus requires co-ordination across government and relevant support agencies.

There has been considerable progress in strengthening partnerships between the Department for Work and Pensions and the national network of Jobcentres, other government departments and partnerships at local and national levels with voluntary and statutory organisations.

For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.3.3 and annex 3

The section above focused mainly on the policy and contextual barriers and, compared to the previous sections on barriers, not so much on the measures taken up to deal with this barriers. Obviously, in most countries, this is an integral part of policy making. But as said, it is beyond the scope of this section to deal with all the country specific policies. One in-

teresting legislative measure in place in some countries such as the Netherlands, the UK and Germany is easing visa procedures for certain categories of migrants. Usually these are the categories of which the national labour market is in need of, such as high-skilled knowledge workers or, in the case of Poland, workers from Belarus, the Ukraine and Russia, who have to replace the many Polish workers who are currently residing in the Western European countries.

The fact that in most countries asylum seekers are not allowed to work before they are granted a status, was identified as a barrier in several countries. Other identified contextual barriers are compli-
cated legislation, the lack of capacity for the provision of language training and the lack of coordina-
tion between stakeholders.

### 3.2.9 The labour market situation

The current labour market situation might be a barrier in itself, especially now with the economic crisis and, as a result, rising unemployment figures. In the reports on Bulgaria, the Netherlands, the UK and Poland, the current labour market situation was explicitly mentioned as a barrier towards successful integration into the labour market. Moreover, the current economic situation was mentioned in almost all case studies as a contextual factor that currently impedes the success of an approach (see section 4.4).

In the Netherlands for example, it is well known that migrants are more vulnerable during a recession, as they work more often in temporary employment and are overrepresented in lower skilled jobs and sectors on which the economic crisis has a deep impact. Moreover discrimination might play a role in the outflow of migrant employees as well. In Poland, the main barrier in gaining access to employment that migrants face is the insufficient demand for foreign labour, although this demand is steadily growing. Finally, in the UK, at times of
rising unemployment, the UK government tends to look less towards foreign labour and it uses a tier-point system to manage inflows of foreign labour as part of its overall managed migration policy. Thereby, the current labour market situation in the UK makes it more difficult for migrants to enter the country.

### 3.2.10 State of flexicurity

Closely connected to the labour market situation is the state of flexicurity. Different countries balance flexibility and security in employment differently. When considering the labour market position of third country migrants, it is impossible to exclude the local situation of flexicurity from the study. Flexicurity policies shape the labour market and will therefore influence the relative position of third country migrants. Two recent studies examined the extent to which clusters of countries with similar forms of flexicurity could be constructed. Both studies compared a selection of Member States based on a number of indicators such as legislations for hiring and firing, flexible forms of work and the social security system. These clusters range from low income protection and poor labour market adaptability, such as in the southern countries Spain and Portugal, to a fairly liberal and flexible labour market with low unemployment, such as in the UK and the Netherlands and to the top scorers when it comes to flexicurity, such as Denmark and Sweden.

It is interesting to see if and how the state of flexicurity functions as a barrier during the current economic crisis.

Social welfare state arrangements were mentioned as a barrier, most explicitly in the country reports on Denmark and Sweden, well-known for its ‘Scandinavian model’. The issue whether labour market and welfare state arrangements shape the opportunities for third country migrants to enter the labour market has been much debated in Denmark. Characteristics as relatively high social protection, high minimum wages, cultural homogeneity among the inhabitants, and universalistic welfare state arrangements, which are based on citizenship rather than contributions, are pointed out as problematic.

The critics of the Scandinavian Welfare Model have stressed that the disincentives embedded in the social security system prevent third country migrants from entering the labour market and that the relatively low level of qualifications among third country migrants do not correspond to a labour market system characterised by high minimum wages and a generous social security system.

Another barrier connected to this was mentioned in the Danish country report. In Denmark many explanations of third country migrants’ poor employment performance emphasise lack of economic or non-economic motivation as being among the main factors preventing third country migrants from working. In the economic variant, the crucial point is whether economic incentives are large enough (which connects to social welfare state arrangements as described above). The literature on non-economic factors has emphasised values, norms, life forms, and needs as factors which affect labour market participation. In relation

---

to immigrant women, traditional values, religion, and patriarchal family views are some of the factors which have been stressed as preventing immigrant women from working.

Arguing the other way around, some country reports on the Eastern European Member States point out that, as a result of limited social security systems, migrants are forced to work. A very concrete example comes from Bulgaria. The social benefit given to asylum seekers is about 27 EUR per person per month, which is absolutely insufficient for subsistence in the capital city of Sofia. This makes it very important for refugees to have access to the labour market.

However, things might be different during times of economic crisis. Generally speaking, what we see at the moment, is that countries with poor labour market adaptability and low income protection, such as Spain and Portugal are hit hardest by the economic crisis. As already described, unemployment in Spain doubled from 8 percent to 17 percent and even 20 percent among foreigners. This even prompted the Spanish government to offer unemployed foreigners a lump sum if they return to their country of origin. Moreover, we see that the unemployment rate has risen most substantially over the year in the Baltic states, especially in Latvia (18.3 percent) and Lithuania and Estonia (exceeding 13 percent).

These countries belong to the flexicurity cluster of fast-growing economies with high flexibility but a social and income protection at the EU low point. Ireland, another country with an unemployment rate rising to almost 15 percent next year, also belongs to this cluster.

In contrast, unemployment remained relatively low in Austria (4.7 percent), a country that belongs to the continental model with relatively high social protection and a labour market with low mobility and in the Netherlands (3.8 percent).

Flexicurity could help the labour market remain flexible. Employees are more willing to move to jobs where there is a greater need for their skills. This helped companies to stay competitive and move into new markets. Moreover, a reasonable level of unemployment benefit makes households and working families less risk-averse keep and more open to new possibilities. Finally, a system of flexicurity will make it more likely that, when demand rises again, companies will hire new employees at a much faster rate than they would do otherwise. Thus, a state of flexicurity will also contribute to faster recovery after the economic crisis.

In short, it might be argued that a low state of flexicurity, thus low flexibility and low security, is a barrier for labour market integration during these times of economic crisis. However, it should be noted that based on our study, it is not assumed that causal relationships could be identified between this clustering of countries and the labour market effects of economic crisis for migrants.

---

Extensive social security could function as barrier to labour market integration, because of a lack of incentives. During times of economic crisis however, low social security and low flexibility (low flexicurity) could function as a barrier towards labour market integration. In countries with high flexicurity unemployment rates have raised far less substantial than in countries with low flexicurity, as flexicurity keeps the labour market flexible, makes employees less risk averse. Moreover, companies will hire new employees at a much faster rate when the economy recovers than they would do otherwise.

3.2.11 Multiple barriers

The barriers identified are strongly interrelated and often appear as a result of a mismatch between for example qualifications, capabilities and expectations of the third country migrants on the one hand, and the requirements and expectations of the society or the employers on the other hand. It is important to note that most barriers are cross-cutting and are often reinforcing one another. The EQUAL funded project ‘Working in the Netherlands’ acknowledges this and simultaneously combines language training, vocational education and training in job searching capabilities. Thereby, this approach aims to effectively deal with three of the barriers identified above: lack of language skills, lack of professional and educational skills and limited knowledge of the labour market.

Of course most of the approaches focus on multiple barriers, as in most cases the problems migrants face cannot be simply attributed to a single isolated barrier. Therefore, most of the 15 approaches explored in the case studies could be used here as an example, but the following case, also from the Netherlands, provides the best example.

'Samen Werken in Kleur' - the Netherlands

In the Netherlands, black, migrant and refugee women, who are not entitled to social benefits are an isolated group in society, are often unemployed and economically dependent. The barriers these women face are:

- Generally a lack of work experience
- A limited mastery of the Dutch language
- Generally a low education level
- Legislation
- Job interviews go off with difficulty and they don't have a CV
- The home environment might impede their participation
- Employers are careful in hiring migrant women

The project ‘Samen Werken in Kleur’ aims to solve these barriers by using an integrated approach with elements such as family coaches, temporary placements in jobs, having employers to sign an intention agreement, coaches with an immigrant background, role models, a very personal approach and working together with migrant organisations.

For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.3.1 and annex 3.

The barriers that prevent migrants from successfully integrating into the labour market are not always directly employment related. Matters such as housing conditions, health and access to health care, educational facilities and safety could, if not at an appropriate level, also act as
a barrier towards labour market integration. One approach that also targets such multiple factors connected to the social environment, is the Sensitive Urban Zones approach in France.

### Sensitive Urban Zones - France

Another barrier might be the mere (urban) area people are living in. An example of this barrier and the way to tackle it comes from France. There are deep socioeconomic inequalities among French urban areas. Some of these areas are characterised by low levels of income, cheap housing conditions, low qualification of the population, high unemployment levels and lack of economic development. These areas cumulate poverty and marginality. Relatively many migrants live in these areas, which are called sensitive urban zones. These are defined by the French government as a priority of urban policies. The principal aim of the sensitive urban zones project is to revitalise the local economies with measures such as tax exemptions for employers, businesses and inhabitants and programs for helping the unemployed back into employment.

*For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.2.7 and annex 3.*

---

*Barriers are strongly interrelated, cross-cutting and often reinforcing each other. Thus, approaches should focus on multiple barriers. Moreover, matters related to the social environment (neighbourhood, health care) might also be a barrier towards labour market integration.*
4 Approaches towards successful labour market integration

4.1 Introduction

The barriers as described in the previous chapter can be overcome or even prevented by innovative and practical approaches and projects. This chapter provides an inventory of practical and innovative approaches throughout the European Union that aim at ways to overcome these barriers and that have proven to be successful. The country studies show a wide set of approaches towards successful labour market integration implemented on country level. This wide variety was also presented in the long list of 47 potential cases for in-depth study, which were reduced to 15 interesting cases. An important consideration in selecting the cases was to get an overview of the variety of manifestations of approaches in Europe. This means that the cases from an individual country will not be representative for the development of approaches in the country.

We start with a discussion on the instruments of the studied approaches, each highlighted with a telling case example. Next in section 4.3 we discuss the effective mechanisms for implementing such an approach, again each time illustrated with a case example. The following instruments and the ways these could be effectively implemented are discussed in this chapter:

- Education & Training (4.2.1)
- Counselling and advice (4.2.2)
- Mentoring an coaching (4.2.3)
- Diversity management (4.2.4)
- Recognition of qualifications and professional experience (4.2.5)
- Internships (4.2.6)
- Contextual approach (4.2.7)
- Networking (4.2.8)
- Staff skills and a personal approach (4.3.1)
- Employer involvement (4.3.2)
- Cooperation between stakeholders (4.3.3)
- Integrated approach (4.3.4)
- Transparent approach (4.3.5)
- Role models (4.3.6)
- Recruitment of participants (4.3.7)
- Organisation, publicity, evaluation and dissemination (4.3.8)

To conclude this chapter, the contextual factors that could stimulate or hamper the success of an approach and the innovativeness and potential transferability of approaches are discussed.

4.2 Instruments of the approaches

In this section we describe the elements of approaches that, based on the case studies, worked and should be part of a successful approach, preferably in a ‘combined package’. In each subsection, we provide examples from case studies that actually employed this kind of instrument in a successful way.
4.2.1 Education & training

There are different positive effects of education and training on the labour market situation of (unemployed) third country migrants. In the first place education offers the (un)employed person access to other segments of the labour market, other functions and other professions. With this it increases the chance of a job and thereby the income position, not only on the short term but in particular the long term. In all aspects the goal of education is to increase the competences of third country migrants. Sometimes education is important to convince employers of the motivation and skills of the job seeker. In that case the signal function is more important than the learning outcomes of education and training activities. Other positive effects of education and training, apart from labour market effects, are improved health situation and more social participation. Educating and training could also help employers to fulfil difficult to fill vacancies. To conclude, to increase one's chances on the labour market, good education and training is essential. Therefore, 'integration policies' try to reduce these supply-side disadvantages by encouraging immigrants to take language courses, improve their education and attend vocational training courses, as well as courses in the host country's culture and institutions.

The country studies show that education and training activities for third country migrants takes place in a wide range of settings and levels. It deals with VET-oriented education, including in-service training aiming at providing qualifications for the labour market; education aiming at providing basic skills (second chance) not directly related to the labour market; education aiming at increasing the social cohesion and citizenship; and finally education aiming to increase knowledge in culture and art, while the latest one is less employment related. This makes the supply of training activities very diverse.

Educational activities were part of almost approaches under investigation in the case studies. An example of a case in Bulgaria in which education plays a major role is provided in the box below.

Integration Centre of the State Agency for Refugees - Bulgaria

One of the approaches which, quite 'traditionally' employs education and language training as its core elements, is the approach from Bulgaria, carried out by the Integration Centre of the State Agency for Refugees. First of all, Bulgarian language training constituted the core element of this approach, embedded in the premise that knowledge of Bulgarian was essential to refugees' participation in every sphere of life in the host country. Next, after successfully completing the language training programme, refugees were awarded certificates that allowed them to continue with professional training and re-training. Training was offered on professions such as tailoring, hairdressing, cosmetics, IT and cooking. The vocational training program took into consideration both the specific needs of the foreigners who had received asylum on the one hand, and the current state of the labour market in Bulgaria on the other hand.

Unfortunately, no data exists as to how many of those completing the programme have actually found jobs, what these jobs were and how sustainable they proved to be.

1 Spence (1973) found out that employees signal their respective skills to employers by acquiring a certain degree of education, which is costly to them. Employers will pay higher wages to more educated employees, because they know that the proportion of employees with high abilities is higher among the educated ones, as it is less costly for them to acquire education than it is for employees with low abilities.

But what became clear is that the overall motivation of participants was low. This was partly explained by their perception of Bulgaria as a transit country. Moreover, some migrants thought that the language preparation was not enough to sufficiently equip them for independent access to the labour market. To a certain degree, the content of the programme might account for it, placing a primary focus on pronunciation and structure rather than on communication. There might be little connection between the Bulgarian that refugees studied and the Bulgarian that they used outside the classrooms. Especially for migrants who view Bulgaria as a transit country, such kind of language training might not be very useful. Participants might benefit more from a programme adopting a more competence based approach with the focus on the language that is needed for real-life, labour market oriented tasks (e.g. how to apply for a job, how to write a CV and how to handle a job interview). Another recommendation sometimes heard to counterbalance the low motivation, is to introduce compulsory Bulgarian language training for a certain period following the granting of the refugee or humanitarian status to a foreigner. Finally, the following two other recommendations were made:

- Such integration programs need continuity. There should be post-program measures to assist with refugees’ initial employment.
- Integration programs like these might benefit from the involvement of employers’ organisations in the design and implementation of the vocational training courses.

*For more information on this approach see annex 3.*

Another and highly innovative example of educating migrants to be better suited for the labour market comes from Italy.

**Modello di occupazione a filiera (MOAF) – Italy**

The Modello di occupazione a filiera (MOAF) approach from Italy originates from the analysis of the peculiar need of labour and professional skills of companies working in the tobacco supply chain and from the fact that such needs are mainly met by third country migrants who, however, enter this sector in a type of activity (hired farm hands) which do not make employment qualification and stability possible.

This situation is partly due to the lack of a well-structured view of the supply chain on the part of enterprises with regard to employment issues. That is, it has been remarked that in the agrifood sector tobacco is the area (division) which has the best chain-like structure thanks to the interactions existing between the enterprises involved in the various stages of the production process. But while the economic and production aspects are managed within a supply-chain structure, no such system has been put in place for the management of labour.

Therefore, the objective of the approach was to stimulate the demand (of the enterprises) of a new professional profile that covers all the different phases of the productive cycle and to train the third country immigrants to cover this role.

The crucial phases of the project were that of education and training and placement in companies. Thus, the approach did not provide education and training alone, but combined it with, among other things, placement in a company, i.e. an internship. Through this training the beneficiaries were trained as "experts" following a supply chain approach which envisaged, above all, the development of the necessary skills to process the product and then to harvest it. The following placement in the industrial company (first processing) and in the agricultural undertakings included tutoring and working with specialised professionals, short-term employment and increased qualifications and competences of the employees.

The most innovative aspect probably lays in the idea of identifying a new professional figure whereby to make employment of third country migrant workers stable and qualified while guaranteeing the enterprises involved in the supply chain the quality and traceability of the end product. The result is the "migrant tobacco supply chain expert" who can be employed along the whole life cycle of a product.
The goal of placing 100 immigrant workers into permanent jobs as chain experts went far beyond expectations. Indeed, as many as 173 unemployed third country immigrants were trained and placed. Moreover, notwithstanding the crisis in the sector of tobacco in Italy, the beneficiaries of the project kept their jobs in the enterprises (100%) after the end of the project.

The success factors of this project include many of the elements that will be discussed in the sections that follow:

- involving local institutions, the partners concerned in the project, the relevant national and local entities working with immigration (trade-unions, NGOs, immigrant associations and so on). In short, interconnections between and among the various stakeholders
- the positive action of the companies’ trade unions
- the active involvement of the top Italian enterprises
- the interdisciplinary make-up of the coordinating technical staff
- the adoption of awareness actions concerning the project targeted to both the immigrant communities and the enterprises operating in the sector
- identification of a network of contacts including leading figures within each immigrant community in order to overcome the mistrust of the immigrants involved in the project

For more information on this approach see annex 3.

Notwithstanding the importance of these educational aspects, it should be kept in mind that by raising the educational or language skills of migrants, i.e. giving attention to supply-side aspects, smooth labour market integration is not what will follow automatically without also shaping other prerequisites for labour market integration, as also became clear from the two case examples from Bulgaria and Italy above. Indeed, there has been an increasingly vocalised concern throughout the EU that the emphasis on education is flawed. Certainly an education and training approach can be necessary for newly-arrived immigrants and refugees or in cases where economic restructuring and organisational changes have put new demands on longer-established immigrant workers, but this tactic is often irrelevant for many long settled migrants and their children. The problems faced by these groups are less easily explained by supply-side arguments. Even with language fluency and comparable education, members of minority ethnic groups are shown to suffer labour market exclusion and marginalisation when compared to their autochthonous peers. Here, demand-side factors are more important in constraining the employment opportunities of ethnic minorities in Europe, regardless of how well qualified these individuals might be. One of these demand-side factors is ‘racial’ or ethnic discrimination, as discussed in the chapter on barriers.

Although very important, raising educational and language skills alone, without integrating other aspects or instruments within an approach, for example focused on preventing discrimination or involving employers and ensuring continuity will not solve problems of an insufficient labour market integration of third country migrants.

Apart from education, which in the definition used here focuses on formal (vocational) education and language education, migrants need other skills to increase their chances to successfully integrate in the labour market. Examples of these, which were already passed in review in previous sections of this report, are job application skills, the skills needed to write a CV or, just as important, the skills needed to behave in a culturally appropriated

---

manner on the work floor. If these are accompanying more formal education, together education and training prepare migrants for the labour market and deal with supply-side aspects (as explained in the previous section).

Indeed, many of the 47 approaches identified in the country studies combine these. A specific category of training which directly focuses on one of the important identified barriers (i.e. limited knowledge of the labour market) is the training in labour market knowledge and skills. This category could be divided in two: knowledge and skills needed for access to the labour and knowledge and skills needed for advancement on the labour market. An example of this last one is intercultural training to learn and understand the working culture. This latter type of training could also be focused on employers, by training them to understand the added value of diversity at work and making them aware of the competences of migrants. An example of such an approach, which has training as its core element comes from Hungary.

**Artemisszió’s - Hungary**

Training is a core element of the Artemisszió’s labour market integration project in Hungary. The approach is focused on two major groups:

- Different groups of migrants, often uneducated and originating from the lower social strata of various developing countries
- Different social groups of the majority society, with influence on labour market integration processes such as journalists, teachers, trainers, social workers and employees of organisations working with migrants.

The approach makes use of various methods of empowerment and consisted, among others, of the following parts:

- Professional training
- Entrepreneurial training
- Intercultural training
- Workshops

A similar situation as described in the Bulgarian approach in the previous section, applies to migrants in Hungary: they are often intending to move on towards more developed EU countries in the shortest possible time. Contrary to the Bulgarian approach, which provided language training which was not focused towards communication skills needed to start working in Bulgaria, the project developers of the Artemisszió’s project acknowledged this and decided to offer highly convertible labour market skills in general (such as curriculum vitae writing, business plan development, etc.) with some Hungarian specific extras for those who might decide to stay. The empowerment included a flexible mix of general human capital assets, basic information on the Hungarian labour market, psychological advice, etc. The training courses were tailor-made for the culturally and language-wise heterogeneous group of asylum seekers.

The intercultural aspect of the project was based on the assumption that labour as any other human activity acquires a cultural determination independent from occupation or vocation. Communication, hierarchic relations, cooperation and the use of space and time reflect our culturally determined representations. Breaching expected scenarios – either due to ignorance or difficulty of adaptation – could lead to a conflict situation. Talking about ourselves and introducing ourselves also reflect cultural patterns, which could create a communication obstacle between the two parties and hinder the admission to a job. The intercultural training motivated the participants to perceive the cultural patterns more consciously and to acquire such skills that assist them to cooperate with the local employers, colleagues and clients. Thus, as becomes clear from this intercultural aspect, the approach goes beyond mere professional and language skills (education) and provides skills needed to work in another culture (training).
The intercultural competences training for project beneficiaries belonging to the majority society included topics such as sensitivity raising, conflict management and intercultural negotiation techniques.

The project covered about three hundred asylum seekers and migrants (the primary target group, N=286), and different groups of the host society (the secondary target group, N= 80). Unfortunately the results of this project are not clear. The mobility rate of the migrants is so high that they might be all over EU by now, and even those who are still in Hungary are not easy to reach.

One drawback in this project lies in the project based nature of the integration projects by definition, which means that relatively well financed periods are unavoidably followed by underfinanced periods. Moreover the state authorities in charge of initiating, monitoring and evaluating the projects are inexperienced and bureaucratic, consequently the projects usually are not sustainable and do not have the potential to have lasting influence. This problem of sustainability is a general characteristic of all project-based initiatives. In other words the question is how to overcome the inbuilt danger of failure of all project funded initiatives caused by uninterested actors. Usually a single project cannot change the environment since its impact remains below the sensitivity threshold of the law, politics, local policy and labour market actors. There is a great probability that no initiative shall get funded twice.

Another important lesson learnt came from a spontaneous trend that some of the participants in this approach actively participated in employment programs as a volunteer. It was concluded that a special legal employment solution could be based on this participation form, a sort of "public volunteering" to offer such participants flexible and temporary but formal employment.

Two other important lessons are that:

- The success of such a project greatly depends on good cooperation with the municipality and, if there are, with local community NGO’s.
- It would be advisable to have more on-the-job training and practice in the open labour market. This implies the importance of internships, as will be discussed below.

In short, once again several aspects appear which should be accompanying an approach and are discussed in this chapter, such as internships, good cooperation between stakeholders and the importance of sustainable project.

For more information on this approach see annex 3.

If training, for example focused on (intercultural) labour market skills accompanies more formal education, together education and training prepare migrants for the labour market and deal with supply side aspects.

4.2.2 Counselling and advice

In many countries migrants ‘suffer’ from a lack of knowledge about how things work on the labour market or with regard to legal matters. Therefore, counselling and advice is indispensable to familiarize migrants in their new surroundings. Several approaches included elements of counselling and advice. This could be directly focused on labour market aspects. But another possibility is to focus counselling and advice on other aspects, to improve general living conditions of which spin-off to labour market integration could be assumed. That is, if migrants have their affairs in order in other spheres of life, such as housing, legal matters and health insurance, labour market integration becomes easier as well. Good examples of this are the approach in Poland, where counsellors provide advice on job search but also on matters of housing and cultural aspects, and the approach in France, in which support is
given on job-hunting and finding appropriate training but also on available housing and health support services.

When providing counselling and advice to migrants, it is important to maintain the balance between providing ready-made solutions and letting them find out everything on their own. The final aim should be that migrants become more and more self-reliant in all spheres of life.

ÖIF Jobcentre - Austria
The Austrian ÖIF Jobcentre provides a good example of counselling taking into account that migrants should become self reliant. One of the core elements of this approach is help for self help. In the given context, help for self help has its roots in the fact, that asylum seekers upon arrival, and also later on during the asylum procedure, find themselves in the situation that many things like administrative procedures and provision of basic supply are managed for them by aid agencies or other official bodies. Thus, they often experience a limited self determination. After having been granted asylum or subsidiary protection, they have to start again to feel self responsible and take charge over themselves. At the job centre, things are not done for them, but they get advice and all the information needed to look and apply for a job, or, for example, to write curriculum vitae on their own. People should not completely depend on the job centre but be empowered to take over their labour market situation. This way, migrants are assumed to

- Find a job themselves,
- Develop in a way that they are more likely to find a job
- Learn about the possibilities on the labour market and assess these in a realistic way.

This help for self-help is the distinguishing factor of this Austrian approach. The clients shall be enabled to act on the Austrian labour market in an independent and sustainable way.

In 2008 in total 678 people took part in the measure, 29 per cent could be placed in a job and a further 23 per cent went into further education, so in total more than 50 per cent of the clients found direct help and already had left the measure again. Another 24 per cent were still coached at the job centre by the end of the year.

The project is certainly able to sweep out of the way some of the barriers that have been mentioned: Clients learn about the Austrian labour market and its specificities, they are kind of connected with a network of employers and with the Public Employment Service, they get to know social competences they need for finding and keeping a job, they can attend language courses and further education is funded. The network is thus opened and offers are made, but it depends on the client what he makes out of these offers and opportunities and whether he accepts them or not.

*For more information on this approach see annex 3.*

Guidance and counselling could also be focused on another way of overcoming unemployment situations, that is starting a business, which becomes clear from the Portuguese example.
**Office for the support of immigrant entrepreneurship - Portugal**

The National Immigrant Support Centre was, during the course of its work confronted with a number of immigrants who sought information on how to set up a business in Portugal. While the Centre was originally set up to assist immigrants in finding jobs, it realized that self-employment could also be an appropriate way of overcoming unemployment situations.

Therefore, they started a service to specifically address questions related to entrepreneurship: the office for the support of immigrant entrepreneurship. Thus, by flexibly anticipating on this and integrating these two offices, they provide a wider dissemination of the option of entrepreneurship to immigrants, and not just to those who are specifically looking for information on entrepreneurship.

Immigrants that seek this service often:
- do not have a clear idea about the business they wish to set up;
- do not have sufficient knowledge to constitute a business plan or contact appropriate institutions, to obtain funding;
- have difficulties in filling up the necessary forms to obtain financial support.

Therefore, the information provided included:
- information regarding formalities and legal aspects necessary to set up a business (the majority);
- information regarding financial support (2nd most important and with growing importance);
- information on available technical and material support.

The Centre also takes a realistic stance that alerts immigrants to the risks involved in engaging in their own business activity therefore acting to prevent subsequent unemployment and loss of income (as a result of having invested available savings or giving up previous jobs for example).

An important element of this approach is the recognition that just providing information was insufficient to meet immigrants’ needs. Specific training was necessary to effectively assist immigrants in setting up a business. Other important lessons include:
- Being a sole provider of information proved insufficient, closer monitoring and follow up is necessary as well as the development of specific training activities;
- Establishing partnerships with other institutions, namely financial institutions that provide credit, so that the specificities of immigrants’ situations are taken into account and requirements adjusted to this particular public is essential;
- Local partnerships with relevant organisations at the local level are also essential to a wider dissemination of information – decentralised approach of the project as opposed to the office that is located in Lisbon only;
- Staff needs to be involved in training activities to improve competencies and allow the continuation of more informed counselling and coaching beyond the funding time of the training project.

There is no data about the direct results of the project. This was recognised by the staff as a failure of their action, which results mainly from a lack of human resources to follow up the immigrants that contact the Office. In terms of the number of persons that have contacted this service: 134 in 2007, 133 new customers in 2008 and 127 new customers until July 2009.

*For more information on this approach see annex 3.*

As becomes clear from this Portuguese example, just with all the other instruments described in this section, providing counselling and advice alone is not enough. This approach successfully combined providing counselling and advice with training of its own staff, cooperation with stakeholders and the development of partnerships and training activities; elements that are widely discussed in this current and the next section.
Counselling and advice is indispensible to familiarize migrants in their new surroundings. This could be directly focused on labour market issues but also on setting up one’s own business and on other aspects to improve general living conditions, of which spin off to labour market integration could be assumed.

4.2.3 Mentoring and coaching

Out of the 47 approaches, 7 made use of mentoring and coaching. Mentoring and coaching could be used at different stages of the labour market integration process. For example, mentoring could be used for migrants who are already in employment. In this case, mentoring is used to increase the retention of minorities once they have been recruited into the organisation¹. But mentoring is also used, as in the Spanish case described below, during the job-searching process.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>'Analogias' - Spain</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The approach 'Analogias: Integration histories in Spain' is an integrated mediation employment program, involving institutional cooperation (local government, business networks, labour unions, and civil society organisations (CSO) aiming at socio-labour integration of the most disadvantaged groups. The strategies used follow the lines of training and empowerment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The project is organized along six lines or dimensions:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Education. Mediators are educated at the school of intercultural and social mediation of Valencia. This mediation school is also a place for setting up networks, thereby serving as a point of encounter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Mediators network. This network broadens the coverage of social work, which now includes individualised attention for unemployed program participants who access social services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The business mediation department, which informs and motivates businesses to employ persons who belong to disadvantaged groups or groups at risk of social exclusion. Part of this department are the office for labour insertion, which continuously handles job offers and job requests and the office for Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) (see the textbox in section 4.3.2).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Women at work. The project has special training courses for women, such as empowerment and leadership courses and a meeting and discussion point for women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Professional training, to increase the possibility of finding work by the unemployed who lack specific professional training, or whose qualifications are insufficient or inadequate. Training will be offered primarily in those sectors in greatest demand of employment in Valencia’s labour market, thereby taking the needs of employers into account. These sectors are mainly the environmental sector, the restaurant and hotel sector and the new information technology sector.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The evaluation and research unit. Analogías includes self-evaluation and monitoring and publishes studies and reports on the development of the project. This unit also acts as the communication office of the project, keeping in touch with the media, promoting the project and enhancing the visibility of the project among the population as a whole.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

An important element of this Spanish approach is mentoring and coaching. As shortly mentioned above, mentoring can be focused both on people who are already working and on those who are still looking for a job. This approach combines both. Thus, there also is a mentoring program for participants who found a job, to prevent job abandonment. Once participants have gone through the process and achieved employment, a social mediator will do a follow-up (usually by telephone) in order to obtain information on the process and the difficulties encountered in the new job. That information will be very useful to counsel future graduated participants in the program.

But also during the job searching process, the project offers a personalized itinerary to find a job, supervised by one of the mediators. In that sense the time it takes a person to find a job, or to get better qualified, varies from person to person. The mediator acts as a coach that makes use of the different resources of the project to help the client. If necessary, the mediator advises the person to enrol in one of the different professional training courses provided by Analogí@s.

This direct and personalised attention, and work done in conjunction with the participants, allows adapting the intervention to their real needs and gradually achieving a level of autonomy, self-esteem, and social/personal abilities that are necessary for further professional development.

The Analogí@s project has had highly successful results, as it has greatly surpassed projected goals in terms of the number of participants and assistance provided and in terms of the number of jobs contracted by participants with the assistance from mediators of the network. Six months before the end of the Project, 514 contracts were procured already, whereas the aimed figure was only 124.

Finally, the training of mediators, through the intercultural mediation training has multiple effects because the professionals put into practice what they have learned and transmit it to project participants as well as to their co-workers.

For more information on this approach see annex 3.

Mentoring and coaching is a good instrument during the job searching phase, but also, at least during the first phase, for migrants who are already in employment to increase the possibility of sustainable labour market integration.

4.2.4 Diversity management

Diversity management as a business practice is becoming more and more popular in Europe. Managing for diversity is a management strategy that intends to make productive use of differences between individuals, ethnic and otherwise. It is based on the premise that, at least if they are well managed, diverse teams will produce better results and diverse companies will gain a market advantage. Diversity management is primarily driven by ‘the business case’, i.e. by the argument that diversity and/or its management will increase organisational efficiency and profitability¹. It is beyond the scope of this section to widely discuss the question whether this policy actually works. Therefore, we will focus on a concrete example, the diversity management case investigated in this study, the case of IKEA in Sweden, after which we will shortly place the outcomes of this case in a broader perspective.

IKEA Diversity management - Sweden

The Diversity Management Program of IKEA in Sweden started in the mid 1990’s. IKEA seems to have adopted diversity management policies in its workplace for a number of causes, including ethnic, regulatory and economic reasons.

First of all there was the introduction of equality legislation in Sweden. The legislation stipulated that every company with more than 10 employees had to produce an equal opportunities plan. This indicates that implementing legislation might be a good way to stimulate companies to start with employment equity programs.

Secondly, IKEA has the opinion that since it is a large company with many immigrants among its workforce, it has after all a social responsibility, namely helping the integration process of the immigrant population.

Finally, the company decided that the ‘ethnic’ part of the society was an interesting market to work in, growing fast, with higher incomes than among the first generation immigrants. They see the diversity issue as a matter of creating a more challenging business atmosphere and of course expanding the recruitment base - including everyone and not just Swedish men. The diverse workforce in itself also gives a lot of positive business possibilities. In other words, develop and leverage the potential of diverse workforces is regarded by IKEA, like many other Swedish organisations, as a way of gaining a competitive advantage in the marketplace, as the capacity to understand and internally mirror the diversity of its current and potential customers is regarded as a key factor in business success.

For IKEA, diversity could range from advertising and interviewing in various languages, giving fair opportunities in terms of being invited for an interview and be recruited, promotion within the company and stimulating retention in employment because of an equal treatment. A very practical example of diversity at IKEA is that, apart from Swedish and English, twenty-six other languages are spoken at the IKEA/Uppsala store, which was subject to the Swedish case study, of which twenty-one originate from outside the EU. These co-workers can be seen at the store having special badges on their chests with their national flags, indicating which language they speak, apart from Swedish.

The results however, are difficult to assess. Apart from stating that the company’s employees should mirror its customers, IKEA does not explicitly speak of any clear labour goals. There are no external studies that show any relation between unemployment or facilitation of the integration process of non-EU nationals or any other social group and IKEA’s diversity programme. The figures show that the proportion of non-Europeans account to 16 percent of IKEA’s co-workers on the national level, while the corresponding figure for IKEA/Uppsala (8 percent) is far below this average and below the proportion of immigrant population in Uppsala (15%). The reasons for this are not clear. The proportion of migrants among IKEA’s administrative managers in the same store is significantly higher (10.5%), probably higher than in any other store in Sweden.

Although the success is, as said, difficult to measure, a success factor seems to be that diversity has been integrated with HRM and aligned closely with the business plan, especially by the marketing department. Working solely through HR can result in inaction, because diversity is also an issue for line management and not for HR alone. This clearly demonstrates that diversity management is not about human resource management alone, but also about the company’s core business. Other signs that imply that IKEA/Uppsala is successful in its implementation of diversity management, are that employee surveys in the company demonstrate that most employees are aware that both the company and their immediate working group are working to improve diversity practice and that IKEA has got recognition for its diversity engagement, by an Award from the Municipality of Uppsala.

There are potential pitfalls too. One of these is possible ethnic or group polarisation, as certain groups might feel being put in second place and other groups feel being favoured above others. Also the condition that employees should mirror the customers can mean that in areas with hardly any immigrant population there will be no immigrant employees at IKEA.

Another important lesson is the need to have top-level support and involvement in the implementation and continued use of the diversity programme. Within IKEA, top management incorporated diversity management into their day-to-day practice, for instance, during their meetings with colleagues, when looking for international people to recruit and by pushing HR to increase their awareness of diversity. Finally, at a time when IKEA and many other Swedish companies are competing within increasingly difficult global economic markets, diversity is not prioritised any more. However, this might put even more emphasis on the business case for equity and diversity at workforce.

For more information on this approach see annex 3.
This case from Sweden highlights some important elements. First of all the introduction of legislation. As said in the textbox above, this might be a good way to stimulate companies to start with employment equity programs. However, the term employment equity programs is used here instead of diversity management, because what distinguishes these according to the literature is that in diversity management, diversity in organisations is not seen as something that must be achieved for the sake of complying with legal norms but as something that should be achieved and should be desired in order to produce an environment in which people can realise their full potential and maximize organisational successes¹.

Another important aspect is the business case element. After all, what most companies are primarily interested in is making profits. Therefore, if there’s a good business case for implementing diversity management, in other words, if implementing diversity management clearly contributes to increasing profits, there’s a good chance companies will implement it. Indeed, following the literature, the primary purpose of diversity management is to increase organisational efficiency. For profit oriented organisations this means gaining market advantage and maximising profits. Thus, the primary rationale of diversity management is the business case rather than the case for social justice².

The relation between two of the three described reasons for IKEA to implement diversity management, ethic and economic, is, according to the literature, a hierarchical but harmonious relationship. Market advantage comes first, but action directed towards maximising profits is thought to be necessarily directed towards equal opportunities and ethnic equality, because an organisation that values and promotes diversity will be more competitive³.

To summarize, without either legislation (although it could not even be called diversity management then) or a business case, it seems to be difficult to move companies towards diversity management. Social responsibilities alone will not win them over.

One drawback of diversity management is that its effects are difficult to measure, just as in the Swedish IKEA case. Indeed, it is very difficult to evaluate the effects of diversity management due to the large number of factors influencing each of these variables, and due to the multitude of possible causal relations between them. Thus, the actual evidence that diversity or diversity management enhances organisational performance, efficiency and outcomes is less clear and conclusive. Therefore, the conclusion by Fischer (see footnotes) is that “in the end the impact of specific types of diversity upon performance will be either positive, negative or none at all, and we do not have a coherent and tested theory able to explain and predict the exact outcomes in the real-world situations.

---

Diversity management has the potential to be highly successful. However, without either legislation or a clear business case it is difficult to move companies towards diversity management. Social responsibilities alone will not win them over. Moreover, the effects of diversity management are difficult to measure.

---

² Idem.
³ Idem.
4.2.5 Recognition of qualifications and professional experience

As explained in the chapter on barriers, many migrants come to Europe with qualifications or experience which are, in theory, sufficient to find good employment. However, these are often not valued as such in the new labour market context. Several approaches deal with this lack of recognition of qualifications and experience. The approach in the case study from Switzerland most especially did so.

**Qualification+ - Switzerland**

The Qualification+ approach from Switzerland is focused on adults who, although they have a high degree of experience in a particular profession, are formally unqualified or under qualified because they have never obtained a qualification certifying their level of competence. Qualification+ was intended to address these failings by targeting adults possessing significant professional experience by only low-level or no qualifications. The program aims to help these individuals achieve the Federal Vocational Education and Training Diploma and is thereby responding to the demand for institutional recognition from job-seekers wishing to enter or secure their place within an increasingly demanding labour market.

The main aim of the Qualification+ program is to encourage poorly-qualified adults to undertake training in order to facilitate access to employment and to increase job security, but also to increase job mobility. Non-EU migrants are not a specific target group for the program, but given the characteristics of this population, i.e. a high proportion of poorly-qualified persons and a significant presence in the professional sectors concerned such as construction and the household economy, migrants in fact make up a significant proportion of those involved in the program.

Highly-qualified migrants do not fall within the scope of Qualification+, as the recognition of academic qualifications and professional experience is being viewed as principally the task of the higher education system. There are five central elements to the Qualification+ program:

- Develop continuing education and training leading to recognized qualifications
- Establish a partnership with business enterprises in order to create training programs and qualifications recognised in the private sector
- Improve the quality of training, including the validation of standards
- Develop cross-border projects
- Facilitate access to employment and job security, but also job mobility

Qualification+ provides candidates with advice and guidance throughout the recognition process. All candidates follow the same program, which may take up to a year to complete. The stages of the program are as follows:

- **Phase 1:** ‘Welcome, introduction and counseling’ by a Qualification+ advisor. This involves an individual interview and the creation of a case file.
- **Phase 2:** ‘Assessment’ by the Geneva Assessment Centre (CEBIG). The Centre deals with each candidate individually, helping them to identify, assess and document their personal and professional competences and to put together an ‘evidence file’.
- **Phase 3:** ‘Evaluation’ by two experts. The experts examine the evidence file and carry out a ‘verification interview’ with the candidate, who is also required to undertake certain practical tests. The experts then write an evaluation report.
- **Phase 4a:** ‘Recognition Decision’ by the Committee for the Recognition of Prior Experience. This decision is based on the candidate’s file, the evaluation report, the requirements of the professional area in question and any supplementary training requirements that have been recommended.
- **Phase 4b:** ‘Certification’ by the Examinations and Certification Service. The Service checks that the required documentation is in order (certificate of equivalence of existing qualifications, certificate of acquired competences, examination protocol) before issuing the diploma.
The precursor of this program, Qualification+ was already judged to be a success. Between 1999 and 2002 program registrations almost doubled (from 413 to 808), the number of participants undertaking training program increased from 351 to 496, the completion rate increased from only 38 percent to 86 percent and the proportion of participants who failed to pass their final examinations fell from 20 percent to 10.2 percent.

Concerning Qualification+, roughly speaking from 2003 on, the program had more than 300 participants each year and on average approximately half of them obtained VET diploma’s as a result of skills recognition via the Qualification+ program.

One of the success factors in the project is the partnership between the government offices involved in skills validation and the private sector. The private sector now has access to a skills validation system that it trusts. Ten sectoral employers’ organisations out of fifteen have so far agreed to participate in the validation system.

A final interesting element to notice about Qualification+ is that the skills recognition system can now lead to the award of other types of qualification. It can also lead to the certification of transferable skills like team working, problem-solving and information processing, skills frequently referred to as ‘key competences’. The opportunity to obtain formal recognition of these types of skills is unprecedented.

For more information on this approach see annex 3.

What can be said about recognition of qualifications and experiences in general? In a report by DG Education and Culture it was concluded that the effectiveness of different practices depends on the degree to which the following conditions are fulfilled:

- Presence of modular training systems
- Independent examiner system
- Harmonisation of standards
- Coherent system of skills recognition
- Recognition of formal and non-formal learning present on the political agenda
- Maintenance of high standards of transparency
- Widespread information
- Communication between academia, the private sector and non-government organisations
- Partnership with businesses operating in those sectors in which demand for labour is high

All things considered, the Swiss approach seems to fulfil most of these conditions and thereby contributes to the labour market integration of third country migrants, although this group is not especially included as its target group.

As many migrants do possess qualifications and experience, which are not valued as such in the new labour market context though, the formal recognition of qualifications is important. Connecting this to the provision of supplementary training and establishing partnerships with the private sector are important prerequisites for the success of this instrument.

---

1 ECOTEC (2007). European Inventory on validation of non-formal and informal learning: a final report to DG Education and Culture of the European Commission.
4.2.6 Internships

Internships are a good way of learning the skills needed to perform on the job in a real employment setting and at the same time gaining relevant work experience. The lack of professional skills, or the lack of professional experience acquired in the country in which the migrant is residing in, are important barriers. Recognizing this, 8 out of the 47 approaches included elements such an internship, traineeship or voluntary work, to acquire the necessary professional experience.

The German case provides a good example of the use of internships to improve labour market integration of migrants.

**Ausbildungsoffensive - Germany**

The 'Ausbildungsoffensive!' in Germany was organised in the federal state Bremen by the Labour Welfare Organisation in Bremen and the Educational Centre of the Public Service in Bremen. The goal of the project was to raise the percentage of migrants (both the first and the second generation) as well as late repatriates in the public service in Bremen.

The project was started because statistical data show that immigrants are particularly underrepresented in the German public service.

The core element of the approach are internships in the public service, as it was assumed that once German employers gain positive experience with immigrants, they will be more willing to employ them in the future. Internships are an important part of German education. Trainees spend approximately 50 percent of their time in a work-place (i.e. in a bank, office, hospital) whilst the other half of the week is devoted to theoretical classes in a school. In order to get enrolled, a person has to first find an employer, who would be willing to coach her/him during the professional education. The criteria for this used by employers can be discriminatory for migrants.

First of all, much attention is given to recruiting young persons with a migration background. This is done by contacting secondary schools as well as migrants’ organisations, and inform them about the possibilities of pursuing a career in the public service and by presenting the offer during different job-fairs or similar events.

The structure of the approach was as follows:

- Two days - internship in a public service institution
- One day - German language and general knowledge classes (including politics)
- Two days - practical job training

The practical job training focused on aspects such attending a job interview and the general knowledge classes focused on extending their theoretical and general knowledge required in different sectors of the public service. In addition, the organisers invited persons with a migration background employed in the public service to talk about their experience with the participants of the program and thus made use of role models. Teachers coaching the apprentices in the public sector were also trained to prepare them to work with international youth and to de-construct existing national stereotypes.

Thus, as becomes clear, although an internship is the core element of the approach, these are accompanied by several elements which are also discussed in this chapter such as training on job skills, the use of role models and focusing not only on migrants themselves but also on people working with migrants.

The most important result of the project was that the number of immigrants employed in the public sector in Bremen increased from 2.6 percent in 1999 to 24.89 percent in 2004. More than 50% of all participants (151) found a job after completing the trajectory.
An important lesson is that, as in most other cases, it turned out to be crucial to establish and foster contacts with the right stakeholders, such as employers, school directors and members of migrants’ organisations.

For more information on this approach see annex 3.

This German approach could be directly transferable to projects helping immigrants to recognize their qualifications acquired abroad or pursuing occupational retraining. In most cases it is particularly difficult for such persons to find a workplace where they could raise their qualifications and acquire the first practical experience on the new labour market. Internships could be a good way to provide these opportunities for educated migrants. Afterwards the labour market position of these persons is much more competitive. The training mechanisms developed in this project could be also used in such cases.

Although this German approach seems to be successful, it is important to keep in mind the potential pitfalls of internships. This came to light in the Estonian approach. A work trainee program was one of the core elements, but it turned out that participants were uninterested in this program because they had been used previously as free labour force and were not hired afterwards in similar situations. This could be resolved by asking employers to sign an intention agreement, as will be discussed in section 4.3.2.

Thus, when providing internships in order to be effective and keep participants motivated there should be a realistic possibility for internees to be hired afterwards.

Internships are a good way of learning the skills needed to perform on the job in a real employment setting and providing migrants with a more competitive labour market position. In order to be effective though, there should be a realistic possibility for internees to be hired afterwards.

4.2.7 Contextual approach

Not all investigated approaches directly focus on migrants. A project could also focus on the context or, more concrete, the area migrants are living in, thereby indirectly contributing to an improvement of the labour market integration of migrants.

Sensitive Urban Zones - France

The Sensitive Urban Zones (Zones Urbaines Sensibles; ZUS) approach in France originated from the observation that there are deep socioeconomics inequalities among French urban areas. These areas, commonly known as the banlieues, are often characterised by low levels of income, cheap housing conditions, unemployment, low qualification levels and strong communitarian networks and cumulate poverty and marginality. Many third country migrants live in these urban zones.

There are 751 ZUS in France, which covers about 4 650 000 persons. Of these 751 ZUS, 100 are so-called Urban Free Zones (‘zones franches urbaines’; ZFU). These are characterised by tax exemptions. The French government started with tax exemptions for inhabitants and employers in 1996 and also introduced measures for helping the unemployed back into work. This latter policy measure involves the use of special types of employment contracts. In the non-commercial sector, there is the supported contract (‘contrat d’accompagnement’) for unemployed persons who have socio-professional difficulties and the contract for the future (‘contrat d’avenir’) aimed at those in receipt of certain social welfare benefits. In the commercial sector, there is the employment initiative contract (‘contrat initiative emploi’) which is aimed at the long-term unemployed.
Moreover, the National Agency for Employment (Agence Nationale pour l’Emploi or ANPE) also runs other programs designed to support those seeking work. Special emphasis is put on these programs within the ZUS. Indeed, at the end of December 2006, 35.8% of young people under 26 living in the ZUS were involved in these programs. The ANPE programs consist of three measures: social support (advice about the available housing, health and psychological support services), vocational guidance and counselling and assistance with job-hunting and finding appropriate training.

Tax exemptions are the core element of the approach and are a means to promote economic revitalisation. The aim of tax exemption in the ZFU is to make these areas more dynamic by attracting enterprises that would otherwise be reluctant to settle in these zones and that could potentially employ ZFU and/or ZUS residents. Thus, the ultimate direct policy goal is to create employment for ZUS residents. An indirect goal is to provide equal rights and opportunities for ZUS residents, including third country migrants and second and third generation migrants. Companies already operating in the Zones as well as companies that wish to establish themselves there are entitled to tax exemptions, as long as they commit to ensuring that at least one third of their employees are residents of the Zone in question.

However, these tax exemptions alone will not change things. It is therefore, essential that these are accompanied by other contextual measures, such as creating a generally favourable environment for the establishment of businesses, but also by a more global, wider urban strategy. Thus, improving the situation of the French banlieues demands a global strategy that includes not only employment but also education, health, public transport and the environment. These complementary measures are exactly the major distinction between the first generation (1997) of ZFU and the second generation (2004).

Included in this wider policy, in which tax exemptions are embedded but are no longer the only measure, is also a policy of refusal to conceive the ZUS/ZFU as ‘ghettos’. To fulfil this aim, public transport and parking facilities have been developed to improve access to urban centres from ZFU and vice versa.

Also, it may be the case that few local residents are actually employed in the newly created enterprises, for example if the incoming businesses operate in high-tech sectors but local workers are generally low-skilled. Indeed it turned out that there was a frequent absence of a match between the kind of professional profile sought by the new entrepreneurs (high-tech enterprises) and the skills of the job-seekers living in the ZFU. Moreover, there is also a risk that fiscal incentives will be given to enterprises that would have set up a shop in any case. Finally, incentives may be difficult to withdraw. The enterprises that have benefitted may simply say "if the subsidy is cut off, then we leave".

Nevertheless, the results are promising. The goal of attracting enterprises into the ZFU has been achieved as it is notable that the number of new enterprises being established in the ZFU has increased. It is not so clear that the goal of decreasing unemployment has been achieved. Of course, new enterprises are obliged to hire one third of their employees from among the residents of the ZUS in which they are established. However, the number of newly-hired employees increasing the unemployment rate in the ZFU and the ZUS has been more or less stable. Third country migrants seem to be a positive exception to these conclusions. In 2004-2005, the unemployment rate among third country migrants (population aged between 15 and 59 years old) reached about 29 percent, but it decreased to 22.9 percent in 2007. Moreover, a large majority of newly-hired workers in the ZFU were employed on indefinite contracts, which suggests that they have obtained relatively stable jobs.

For more information on this approach see annex 3.

One major drawback of this kind of approach is that its effectiveness and results are difficult to measure and evaluate. As shown in the box above, nothing could be said about the direct effects of this program on the labour market integration of third country migrants, as they are indirectly touched by these measures. Thus, it is very difficult to demonstrate that policy interventions had the desired effect. Improvements in the employment situation
could also be the result of larger economic effects. Although this pertains of course to any real-life intervention outside a closed and controlled, and thus non-existent, environment, with such large scale contextual approaches, this pertain to a far greater extent than with small scale and local labour market interventions.

Moreover, as also becomes clear from this French approach, isolated contextual measures, for example only tax exemptions, might not be highly effective if other contextual conditions are not dealt with, for example shaping a favourable business climate and increasing the availability of commercial property or other more socially oriented measures. In other words, a contextual approach seems only to be effective when it includes a whole integrated package of accompanying contextual measures.

Finally, measures targeted at a whole area could also have contrary effects. In this French case, defining specific areas for urban public policies is said to let young people suffer from double discrimination when applying for a job. From their native origin, revealed by their foreign-sounding name and from their geographical provenance, revealed by their address. In other words, targeting a whole area could stigmatise the people living in these areas even more. Besides, attracting enterprises and giving a lot of attention to a certain area might give rise to a relative neglect of other, neighbouring areas and thus to economic disparities. Therefore, such programs should be implemented with caution, taking possible side-effects into account and trying to counterbalance these.

A contextual, area targeted approach, working on economic revitalisation has the potential to contribute to labour market integration of third country migrants. But the approach should entail a whole integrated package of accompanying measures, possible side effects (e.g. discrimination) should be taken into account and its effects are difficult to measure.

4.2.8 Networking

It is often assumed that the personal network is the most effective way to find employment. Employers often recruit through informal social networks. As also explained in the previous chapter on barriers, these informal recruitment practices can militate against foreign-born jobseekers since they generally lack access to these informal channels”. Therefore, increasing the networks of migrants is, and should be, an important element of a successful approach. That, increasing heterogeneous networks should be an important element, because ethnic homogenous networks could also hamper labour market integration, as also explained in the chapter on barriers. Several of the approaches included elements that aimed to improve and make use of migrants’ networks.

---

In Italy the Modello di occupazione a filiera approach makes use of networks, including leading figures within each immigrant community in order to overcome the mistrust of the immigrants involved in the project. See the textbox in section 4.2.1 and annex 3 for more information.

In the Spanish ‘Analogias’ approach the school for intercultural mediation also serves as a point of encounter and thereby will also be a place for setting up networks. Moreover, this approach includes a meeting and discussion point for women. See the textbox in section 4.2.3 and annex 3 for more information.

In line with this last point, the 4-part agreement in Denmark also makes use of a network for immigrant women, which also includes the establishment of mentor groups. See the textbox in section 4.3.4 and annex 3 for more information.

The Austrian OIF Jobcentre established a constantly growing network of employers (about 200) who already worked with the jobcentre and employed recognized refugees or persons having been granted subsidiary protection. See the textbox in section 4.2.2 and annex 3 for more information.

Networking increases the possibility of finding employment, but networks should be ethnically heterogeneous and include employers.

4.3 Effective mechanisms for implementing the approach

The section above discussed the instruments, or methodologies, used in the case studies. To a large part, the success of an approach lies in a successful implementation and process. Therefore, a good evaluation focuses on what works, for whom and under what circumstances. It is not enough to just look at the outcomes of the applied approach like the number of migrants that found a job. Although important, the outcomes do not provide information on the effective elements of the approach. What makes the applied approach successful? (or what caused it to fail?). Insights in these effective elements are valuable for improving policy and show the extent to which the approach might be applied in other situations or target groups.

Below we discuss these more process oriented elements which came to the forefront from the case studies as elements that contributed to the success of the approaches. As most of these elements could apply to several of the approaches, these could be labelled the ‘working elements’ of the approaches. Just as in the previous section, we highlight each working element with good examples from the case studies.

4.3.1 Staff skills and a personal approach

Staff skills comprises of several aspects, such as professional skills, competences and experience of the people involved in carrying out the intervention and more ‘soft skills’ such as...
as a personal approach, commitment, motivation and enthusiasm. Both are necessary pre-
requisites for a successful approach¹.

**Samen Werken in Kleur** - the Netherlands

The case study on the approach ‘Samen Werken in Kleur’ from the Netherlands provides an excellent exam-
ple of the importance of staff skills and a personal approach. The approach is developed by Interpooling by
Intervention, a private reintegration office, in cooperation with the Dutch information centre for gender,
family and diversity issues E-quality.

The project focuses on black, migrant and refugee women who are not entitled to social benefit and has two
main goals:

- Societal participation of the target group: integration in society, emancipation and social activation.
- Sustainable reintegration by the target group on the Dutch labour market. This aim was translated into
  the following measurable outcomes: placing 30 percent of the participating women into employment
  within half a year and an outflow into employment of 50 percent within one year.

Apart from these main goals a side-aim was to attain more attention for this target group from employers,
by using the arguments that this target group holds potential motivation, knowledge and experience, of
which employers can benefit in a tight labour market.

The approach consists of several elements:

- Family, individual and group coaching
- Mediation
- The use of role models
- Education (language, intercultural communication, professional skills, civic integration)
- Internships and guided working
- Involving employers: they sign an intention agreement that ensures that, when functioning well, the
  women can apply for jobs with the status of an internal candidate

The most distinguishing elements (and success factors) however, are the experience and commitment (i.e. a
personal approach) of the people who carry out the intervention.

The project employs a very personal approach. Each woman is allocated an individual counsellor. First of all
the family situation of the participants is involved, by using family coaches who talk with other family mem-
bers and visit the women at home and take into account very specific wishes (such as only willing to partici-
-pate if the other participants are Muslim women) and the cultural background of participants. This is impor-
tant, because many of these women are in an isolated position and their home environment might impede
them from taking on a job. Moreover, the coaches in this project are available day and night.

The individual counsellors are women with an immigrant background themselves. A bottle-neck in previous
projects was that the coaches did not have a migrant background themselves. Especially with women who
never worked before and who are not particularly socially active outside their family environment, it is es-
-sential to work with coaches who understand the (cultural) context. Therefore, this approach only works with
female coaches with an immigrant background.

The recruitment of coaches goes through networks and ‘self-organisations’, just as with the recruitment of
participants. Their profile is as follows:

- A matching cultural background
- Female
- Experience with working with women
- Commonly an education in welfare work
- Higher educational level

¹ For an elaborate overview of competences that staff should posses, we refer to Volmari, K., Helakorpi, S. and
Frimodt, R. (Eds). Competence Framework for VET Professions. CEDEFOP, 2009 and to an upcoming publica-
tion by Broek, S. and Buiskool, B. on Key Competences of Adult Learning Staff (to be published by DG EAC).
The results of this approach are very promising. Every time a participant is placed into employment, a new participant starts. The project started as a pilot in two municipalities but by now more and more municipalities show their interest. The project manages to obtain the highest re-integration scores in the Netherlands. The intervention 'Samen werken in Kleur' obtains a successful placement score of 90 percent. These placements are all sustainable, measured by a contract renewal after 6 months.

The personal approach also pays off in terms of recruitment of participants and the continuity of participation. That is, previous experiences showed that the basis for and continuity of participation increases by involving the family situation in the approach. When providing information about the project, apart from explaining the project, attention is therefore given to the importance of societal participation and economic independence.

In short, several elements of the staff skills and the personal approach highly contributed to the success of this project:
- An experienced (in working with difficult target groups) and highly competent staff
- Motivated (available day and night) and enthusiastic staff
- Involving the family situation (home visits)
- Coaches with an immigrant background themselves

For more information on this approach see annex 3 and also the following subsections

Concerning staff skills, it also important, as pointed out in the UK case (which will be elaborately discussed in the upcoming subsections), that project managers regularly reinforce awareness among frontline job centre staff. Otherwise, there is a risk that the need for sensitivity in dealing with refugees is forgotten and job seekers with a refugee background are placed into low-paid, low-skilled employment and that their skills and professional background is not fully utilised.

Staff's professional skills, competences and experience, as well as a personal approach, commitment, motivation and enthusiasm are necessary prerequisites for a successful approach. A personal approach entails for example involving the family situation and taking cultural aspects into account.

### 4.3.2 Employer involvement

When trying to integrate migrants into the labour market, the involvement of employers is indispensable. Several of the initiatives under investigation are very well aware of this and involve employers in their approach in various ways. Before discussing a few other examples of employer involvement, we first introduce the Estonian case here, which also incorporated this.
Reducing the risk of unemployment among young people who speak languages other than Estonian’ - Estonia

This approach in Estonia is focused on ‘Reducing the risk of unemployment among young people who speak languages other than Estonian’. The project entailed the following elements:

- Training programme consisting of methods focused on how to look for work, how to present yourself to the employer, and the rules and regulations of the labour market.
- Language training
- Vocational training
- Work trainee program

Especially regarding the work trainee program, the involvement of employers was vital. It turned out that participants were uninterested in participating in the work trainee programme, because they have been used previously as free labour force and not hired afterwards in similar situations. This work trainee program is equally unpopular among young people as well as employers. Therefore, only 50 participants completed the training, which was below the target of 80 participants.

The problem of being hired as free labour force and not being hired thereafter, was resolved by asking the employers for ‘notice letters’ which promised to hire the trainees after the completion of the course. Moreover, before the start of the project, the team did research the needs of local employers in terms of vocational training courses and the exact technicalities of the training. This also resulted in the provision of these ‘notice letters’ by employers.

The project team sees as another solution to raise the unemployment benefits and to implement regulations that forbid to use newly hired workers as cheap labour force.

Overall, the project was very successful. The number of people who found work after the project, 146, completely surpassed the expectations and original goals of 110 participants to find work.

Some important lessons from this project are that it requires extensive collaboration between local authorities and potential employers and that agreements with employers should be made to ensure the success of the project.

For more information on this approach see annex 3.

In the Dutch case employer involvement is an important element as well. Not only by, just as in the Estonian case, acquiring their commitment by having them sign an intention agreement as mentioned in the textbox in the previous section, but also by continuing coaching also after job placement and by always being available for assistance. Employers appreciate that and even get in touch with project executors to see if there are any potential candidates available.

The importance of employer involvement became also clear from the Polish approach (see section 4.3.4). This project failed to involve individual employers. It was felt by the project staff that a direct involvement of individual employers in ICOA would have had a favourable effect on the selection of ‘topics’ of the vocational courses that would better reflect the demand for particular skills, or in other words, the actual needs of employers. Thus, involving employers in the development and execution of an approach enables project staff to better tailor the content of approach (education and training) towards the needs of employers.

With regard to employer involvement we might break a lance for private sector initiatives as in terms of contacts with other private enterprise, they are often one up on the government. That is, if an approach is developed and carried out by a private company, for exam-
ple a commercial reintegration office as is the case in the Dutch approach, there are often much more contacts between these companies and other private businesses. Governmental interventions often lack these contacts. However, obviously cooperation with (local) governments is still needed, for example for funding.

Apart from this, employer involvement on management level is essential. Research shows that "organisations that really want to increase the diversity of their workforce make a person or group of persons within the organisation responsible for the policy and are on average more successful. This would suggest that the key factor for more equality in actual representation lies in getting commitment to employment equity in the boardrooms and management circles of companies and other work organisations".1

**Corporate Social Responsibility**

Concerning involving employers, special focus could be on Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) in terms of human resource management. Nowadays, although it might be moved somewhat into the background as a result of the economic crisis, more and more attention is given to CSR. Not only regarding the environmental behaviour of companies, but also regarding human resource management. This offers possibilities for labour market integration of migrants, as good diversity management and culturally sensitive recruitment strategies, might be assets for companies in what might in the future be the fierce competition between them in attracting employees.

In the Austrian project for example, in which networks with employers are an important element, in the future there will be a further cooperation with enterprises that practice Corporate Social Responsibility through a network structure called "RESPACT". Also interesting is the Portuguese example. In this project, immigrants who want to start their own business are supported in doing so. One of the factors that improved the success of the project, also has to do with calling to corporate social responsibility. The project executor entered into partnerships with other organisations that might provide technical consultancy to support migrants in their business development and assure that the business will survive its starting period. An example of this are accountancy firms that might include such work within their CSR strategy.

The final example comes from Spain. Part of the organisation of the "Analogias” project is the office for CSR development, which publishes information on corporate social responsibility. The office is trying to establish close relations with entrepreneurs in the Valencia area, visiting them at their headquarters, organising short conferences and trying to enhance awareness and greater involvement in CSR among the businesses in the area.

---

4.3.3 Cooperation between stakeholders

Most cases point to the importance of cooperation between different stakeholders, as one player alone in the field of labour market integration is less effective than the joint effort of multiple parties\(^1\).

**Operational Framework for Refugees – United Kingdom**

The UK case study explored efforts at both a policy and operational level to promote the integration of refugees in the labour market. Specifically, it focused on the role of the Operational Framework for Refugees in influencing practices among public employment services in ensuring that UK employment services (through the JobCentre Plus network) are better tailored to meet the specific needs of refugees.

In March 2005, the Home Office in the UK launched *Integration Matters: National Strategy for Refugee Integration*. This emphasises the role of Jobcentre Plus in helping the integration of refugees and the importance of partnership working. The strategy requires co-ordination across government and relevant support agencies. To support the implementation of the strategy, an *Operational Framework for Refugees* was launched on the same date. This was also designed to help support the implementation of the Department for Work and Pensions (DWP) *Refugee Employment Strategy*: ‘Working to Rebuild Lives’. The strategy emphasises the critical role of partnership, expressed by the following phrase: "no single agency can achieve results alone. We will continue to depend on the strong partnerships that we have built across Government and with the voluntary sector".

The purpose of the Operational Framework is to bring together information, guidance and support for JCP staff and to identify ways in which refugees seeking employment and claiming benefits might be better supported in order to facilitate their labour market integration. The approach reflects a broader trend towards a more client-centred, individualised approach to delivering employment services, whereby advice and services to job-seekers are more closely tailored towards individual needs. The type of support provided ranges from assistance in respect of the recognition of qualifications in third countries, addressing a refugee’s training and skills needs (including any retraining needed to make the most of skills and professional experience gained in a third country), and jobs matching.

A key factor regarding cooperation with stakeholders was the successful engagement of the voluntary and community sectors in targeting ‘hard to reach’ groups within refugee communities; we go into further detail on this in the textbox in section 4.3.7.

Among the objectives of the Refugee Operational Framework relating to labour market integration were to:

- ‘move more unemployed refugees into Jobcentre Plus support quickly after they receive refugee status’
- ‘ensure that Jobcentre Plus gives them the help they need to find sustainable work’

With regard to the extent to which these goals have been achieved the following can be concluded:

- There has been progress in encouraging unemployed refugees to use Jobcentre Plus services, particularly among previously ‘hard-to-reach’ groups.
- There has also been a focus on improving practical assistance in terms of accessing and understanding the UK labour market and in obtaining help with English language and other skills to improve employability and access to employment.

---

\(^1\) For a further reading on the importance of partnership and the success and fail factors of cooperation between stakeholders, we refer to Buiskool, B., Grijpstra, D., Kan., C., van Lakerveld, J. and den Oudendammer, F. (2005). Developing local learning centres and learning partnerships as part of Member States’ target for reaching the Lisbon goals in the filed of education and training: a study of the current situation. European Commission.
This support is being provided earlier on than had previously been the case, with efforts to ensure that upon getting refugee status, refugees have early contact with JCPs.

Finally there has also been progress in strengthening partnerships between the DWP and national network of JCPs, other government departments and partnerships at local and national levels with voluntary and statutory organisations.

Unfortunately there are no statistics on how successful the new approach has been in terms of moving refugees out of unemployment into employment and further training, but overall evaluation findings are positive.

For more information on this approach see annex 3.

Obviously, who the important stakeholders are depends on the specific context or the country. In the Nordic countries for example, the labour unions traditionally hold a strong position. In these countries, for an approach to be successful, cooperation with labour unions is highly recommended.

4-part agreement - Denmark

The 4-part agreement approach in Denmark\(^1\) serves as a good example of the cooperation with social partners. The approach is based on the awareness that different actors on the labour market have to cooperate in order to ensure a successful integration.

The 4-part agreement consists of several elements, of which the job-packages are the most important (more about the job-packages in the textbox in the next section). The social partners have had an important influence on this approach, because apart from the fact that they are one of the four cooperating parties, they have been crucial for formulating and developing the content in the job-packages.

The social partners in Denmark have for many years been very important for the organisation of the Danish labour market and Danish labour market policy, which is something special compared to the situation of the social partners in other countries. During the last years their influence has in some areas been weakened, among other things when it comes to the public employment system.

According to the Danish authors, this strong role of the social partners is important for the approach because of the fact that the social partners, compared to policy makers in general, probably have a better feeling of the labour market and the problems employees and employers are facing. However, of course this role of the social partners should be kept in mind when transferring this approach to other countries with another institutional set-up.

For more information on this approach see annex 3.

Concerning cooperation between stakeholders, there is one potential pitfall pointed out in several case studies, which is ineffective cooperation for example because of bureaucracy, as in the Portuguese case for example. Another example is Bulgaria, where apart from the State Agency for Refugees, multiple ministries were responsible for National Programme for Integration of Refugees, which caused serious problems of efficiency. As a result some of the tasks remained uncompleted. The same holds true for The Netherlands. This approach, focused on black, migrant and refugee women, connects to two policy issues, namely reintegration (into the labour market) and (civic) integration, which are commonly two, to be

\(^1\) This case from Denmark will be described in full in the textbox in the next section (integrated approach) and also shortly in section 4.3.5 (transparency and involvement). Because it incorporates so many elements i.e. its integrated approach, it serves as a good example in many sections. Here we just focus on the cooperation with social partners.
sure interconnected issues but often are under the responsibility of two different municipal departments. Often there is no, or a lack of, cooperation between these departments.

The solution seems to be to not to make multiple institutions within the same sphere responsible (such as several ministries, or several departments within one municipality), but to work together with different stakeholders within different spheres of labour market and integration policy and implementation (such as one ministry, the local government, employers, migrant organisations or social partners), of which one institution has final responsibility for the approach. Moreover, it is important to accurately record all agreements and to agree on a clear division of tasks.

One player alone in the field of labour market integration is less effective than the joint effort of multiple parties. Cooperation with stakeholders is thus highly recommended. Potential bottlenecks are bureaucracy, loss of efficiency and working in a compartmentalized manner.

4.3.4 Integrated approach

First of all, an integrated approach applies to a combination of different instruments in the project. Solely providing education or training, without providing knowledge about the way the national labour market works, or providing internships to migrants who do not have sufficient language skills yet, will not be very efficient. Although this seems to be general knowledge as all cases employ several different instruments in their approach, much depends on the way these are combined. In the traditional way, different elements follow each other in an isolated way without much interaction. However, a more successful way seems to be an active interaction between several elements, such as employed in the approaches studies in Denmark and the Netherlands.

4-part agreement - Denmark

A good example of an integrated approach comes from the 4-part agreement in Denmark. This 4-part agreement was established in 2002 between the government, employers in the municipalities and the private sector, the regional level and the labour unions.

The overall goal of the 4-part agreement is twofold: To improve immigrants’ chances of finding a foothold in the labour market and at the same time recruit employees to industries facing labour shortages.

The 4-part agreement refers to an agreement which contains six different employment programmes/instruments:

- A so-called "staircase model" (named after a staircase with several steps) which includes a combination of different instruments such as guidance, upgrading of skills, practical training in a private company and wage subsidy;
- "Job packages": 12 different "job packages" have been introduced in different sectors in order to make the effort more transparent and predictable for those involved;
- Mentorship (support the use of mentors aimed at unemployed people with weak labour market attachment);
- Network for immigrant women (which also includes the establishment of mentor groups);
- Clarifications of competence;
- Local cooperation between municipalities, companies, leaders and workers at the companies.

The core element of this approach is the job-packages, which were developed by the social partners (see the previous subsection). The job package also includes a combination of several elements: clarification of competences of the individual, Danish language lessons and development of skills and employment under special conditions at the workplace until the person is qualified for a job on standard terms.
A job-package is characterised by the following conditions:
- It is contiguous (a successive program);
- It uses several activation instruments which actively interact and have employment as their final purpose;
- The effort is transparent and predictable;
- And finally, the job-packages are introduced in sectors where job chances are high.

When it comes to a judgment of whether the goals have been achieved and problems resolved, it is important to bear in mind however that it can be difficult to separate the effect of job-packages from other effects, because the job-packages, not have to do with a single isolated project, but instead are a new employment instrument implemented at the national level.

The most updated results about the job-packages stem from a closing conference in May 2009, where the results were presented. In the period from April 2007 to May 2009 five municipalities that cooperated succeeded to introduce 313 job-packages and help 117 immigrants with a weak labour market connection into employment.

It is important to keep in mind that when developing an integrated approach, it is not even necessary to develop new instruments. The job-packages do not contain new activation instruments; actually, all the individual instruments have been used in the ordinary activation policy for several years. But the job-packages differ by combining these elements into a coherent programme where all elements are clarified in advance.

Indeed, the success if this project is supported by the fact, that unemployed who have completed a contiguous effort activation-program – according to the social workers, significantly easier obtain employment and stay in employment compared to persons who have participated in isolated activation programmes. In other words, chances to obtain a job and remain employed is bigger if the unemployed have completed a contiguous plan, as compared to single activation programmes.

For more information on this approach see annex 3.

*********

‘Samen Werken in Kleur’ – the Netherlands

Another case that employs this integrated approach in a very promising way is the approach ‘Samen Werken in Kleur’ from The Netherlands. This approach combines many of the elements described in the sections in this chapter on instruments and successful implementation of these instruments. Therefore, this approach could serve as good practice in many of the previous and following subsections.

The approach consist of a combination of different modules such as family, individual and group coaching, successful role models, mediation, (language) education, a personal approach, an internship and involving employers.

For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.3.1 annex 3.

As becomes clear from these Dutch and Danish examples, these approaches combine many of the successful elements discussed in this chapter, such as mentorship, cooperation between stakeholders, networks, the use of role models and much more. Whether it is successful is hard to say based on the Danish example, but the results of the Dutch case as already outlined in section 4.3.1 are very promising.
Of course the importance of combining such elements did not appear out of the blue. In the Dutch case for example, the approach is for the most part in line with the recommendations done by the National Thematic Network Labour Market and Integration, based on good practices from EQUAL projects. Some of these recommendations were:

- Cross linking of labour market inflow and civic integration.
- Search for suitable employers and make arrangement with these employers in which they commit themselves to the project.
- Intensive coaching of participants, from the intake to the work floor.
- An individual, tailor made approach.
- For municipalities: be prepared to invest more in intensive projects, for sustainable outflow.
- Connect to the perception and interest of participants, especially in the case of socially isolated women
- Use intermediaries from the own community to recruit participants.
- Make use of role models

Second, an approach could also be named integrated in terms of not only focusing on the direct recipients or beneficiaries of a project, i.e. migrants, but also on intermediaries, who in their profession often deal with migrants, such as social workers or public employment service employees. In broad terms, this way an approach could focus both on the migrant population as well as on the host society population.

Good examples of such an ‘intermediaries focused approach’ come from Central Europe.

### International Centre of Occupational Adaptation (ICOA) - Poland

The International Centre of Occupational Adaptation (ICOA; Międzykulturowe Centrum Adaptacji Zawodowej) in Poland was set up in 2004 at the University of Warsaw, on the initiative of the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy and financed by EQUAL.

Apart from the migrant themselves (the final beneficiaries), the target group of the approach also consisted of intermediate beneficiaries: representatives of social organisations or agencies rendering diversified services to migrants, such as social workers and other employees of respective regional and local administration, employer’s associations, women rights associations, organisations specialising in vocational training or retraining, labour offices, teachers as well as educationists and psychologists working with children and their parents coming from different cultures.

For the migrants the project was to support their entering, sustained functioning and successful mobility in the Polish labour market. For intermediate beneficiaries the challenges the project deals with include such matters as the deficit in existing knowledge about employment and performance in the labour markets of foreign people, adaptation problems of migrants and their families and upgrading of intercultural competences.

The approach consisted of counselling, education and vocational training, on-the-job training, publications and lobbying. The main form of activities addressed to the intermediate beneficiaries was a post-graduate study on “Supporting the culturally different in the labour market”. In addition, those persons benefited from a variety of courses concerning intercultural social environment and the ways of coping with the problems encountered by persons living in such environment.

---

The results for the migrants were somewhat mixed and difficult to assess, although the number of migrants in employment increased from 14 to 24 (out of the initial 60 participants). Moreover, a large majority of the employed (at the project end) was still in employment for more than two months (all but one) and worked on the basis of contract with no termination date (63 percent). On the other hand, none of the project beneficiaries found the job through direct ICOA assistance.

Concerning the intermediate beneficiaries (social workers, etc.), the project embraced 328 persons (of whom 98 percent held a university diploma). They participated in post-graduate studies on ‘Assistance to culturally different persons in the labour market’, and courses on ‘Work with a culturally different client’, ‘Multicultural education’ and ‘Multiculturalism in occupational counselling’. As many as 90 percent said this broadened their knowledge about the multicultural society. Moreover, 70 percent of the graduates of ICOA courses felt that they used the skills learned thanks to the project in their daily work.

To conclude, it could be said that a factor that contributed to the fulfilment of major goals of the project was adoption of a ‘two sides’ approach including the ‘client’ side and the ‘service providers’ side, which made the project more ‘complete’.

For more information on this approach see annex 3.

******

Artemisszió’s - Hungary

The Artemisszió’s project in Hungary also had two major types of beneficiaries. Apart from migrants these were different social groups of the majority society whose influence on the labour market integration processes were the strongest, such as journalists, teachers, trainers, social workers and employees of organisations working with migrants. The social workers who meet with asylum seekers on a daily basis followed a program with three phases: sensitivity raising, conflict management and intercultural negotiation techniques.

Another target group were journalists specialized in migration, refugees, and intercultural conflicts. The project included a two-day seminar (in cooperation with an independent journalist education centre) on the issue of “Fortress Europe”. The main focus of the discussion was the role media play in generating the popular image of migrants. The seminar analysed the content analysis of the Hungarian media on migrants and refugees.

Together with another Hungarian NGO (and partly commissioned by the UNHCR) an anti-discrimination campaign was launched as well in 2007. During the two months of the campaign (which consisted of a Refugee Day party in Debrecen with about 200 participants) nineteen articles have been published in the media, and 140,000 freecards and city-light posters have been produced, emphasizing the value of multiculturalism and the advantage of integration for the host society.

For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.2.1 and annex 3.

Approaches that combine several instruments in an interactive way are successful. Examples are combining education and training with an internship to use the acquired skills in a real job environment or using mentors with an immigrant background, that function as role models. Moreover, an approach could be complete by focusing not only on direct beneficiaries (e.g. migrants) but also on intermediary beneficiaries (the host society), as these might indirectly influence labour market integration of migrants as well.
4.3.5 Transparency and involvement

For the success of a project it is essential to actively involve project beneficiaries in a project and in the development of their own ‘tailor-made’ approach and not just let them be passive recipients of all the actions undertaken. In other words, the approach should be transparent, also in terms of knowing in advance what elements the approach contains, as this contributes to the involvement and motivation of participants. After all, people are more concerned with something they had a voice in themselves.

**4-part agreement - Denmark**

One of the most important elements of the Danish Job package approach is its transparency. By ensuring that everyone involved in the job-package knows what will happen when, and why, it is expected that the job-motivation among the unemployed will increase. Thus, all elements are clarified in advance. Indeed, evaluations show that the unemployed migrants are more motivated if they know the entire process in advance.

*For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.3.4 and annex 3.*

********

**‘Samen Werken in Kleur’ – the Netherlands**

The Dutch approach ‘Samen Werken in Kleur’ starts with intake talks. These serve to determine the competences and motivation of potential candidates. Moreover, attention is given to their home situation. If necessary, when the family situation of the participant impedes the development of women, a family coach will assist in creating a stable home environment. Together with their coach the participant draws up a personal approach, which contributes to the transparency of the approach and the motivation of participants as they were actively involved in developing their own personal approach.

*For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.3.1 annex 3.*

More or less connected to this, is the importance of a quick placement into employment. In the Dutch approach it turned out that thereby the project fulfils women’s motivation to start working as soon as possible. The prospect of finding employment soon, increases the motivation of the participants.

In short, it is important that participants are aware of what the approach contains in advance, are aware of the time schedule and prospects of successful labour market integration and had a voice in developing their own approach, as this contributes to the motivation of participants and consequently to the success of the approach.

*Transparency in the setup of the approach, so that participants know in advance what elements the approach contains and actively involving migrants in developing their own ‘tailor made’ approach contributes to the involvement and motivation of participants, as does the prospect of finding employment soon.*
4.3.6 Role models

The use of successful role models is a well known approach. Indeed, ‘role models’ of immigrant origin can be very significant in furthering the integration process of all migrants, but the ‘established order’ should provide the necessary opportunities for this.1

A good way to use role models is the use of migrant mentors (see also the previous sections 4.2.3 on ‘mentoring and coaching’ and 4.3.1 on ‘staff skills’). As migrant mentors more easily acquire other migrants’ confidence and often went through the same labour market integration process themselves before, they exert a strong and positive influence on migrant participants.

‘Ausbildungsoffensive’ - Germany

Role models are used in several of the approaches investigated in the case studies. In the German ‘Ausbildungsoffensive’, focused on raising the number of migrants in the public sector in Bremen, the ‘established order’ indeed provided the necessary opportunities to make use of role models. The organisers invited persons with a migration background employed in the public sector to talk about their experience with the participants of the program.

For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.2.6 and annex 3.

******

‘Samen Werken in Kleur – the Netherlands

Another approach that made use of role models is ‘Samen Werken in Kleur’ in the Netherlands. In this approach ‘one of the working elements is the use of role models. Successful immigrants give a presentation on how they fare in the Dutch society and how they managed to successfully participate in this society. This is especially important in this approach because it is focused on an isolated group of women (black, migrant and immigrant women) whose family background might impede labour market integration and who are not entitled to social benefits. Therefore, motivation on behalf of the participants is essential for the success of this project. Role models from their own cultural or ethnic group might significantly contribute to this motivation.

For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.3.1 annex 3.

Role models exert a strong and positive influence on migrant participants as they often went through the same labour market integration process themselves before and could be used as mentors or coaches.

4.3.7 Recruitment of participants

The way participants or beneficiaries should be recruited depends on, among other things, the social security system or state of flexicurity in a country. For example, as described in Chapter 4 on barriers, in countries such as Denmark but also The Netherlands, the social security system is rather generous, social protection is high as are the minimum wages and social benefits. Thereby such a system might embed disincentives that prevent third country migrants from entering the labour market. In such countries, much attention should be

given to the recruitment of participants, because they might feel less necessity to integrate in the labour market. Generally speaking in Southern European countries such as Spain or Portugal the social security system is far less generous. This makes the recruitment of participants an easier job as they might be more devoted to quickly finding employment.

Analysing the case studies this comes clearly to the forefront. For example, in the projects in the Netherlands and the UK much attention is, and should be, given to the recruitment of participants. In these countries, the success of a project lies to a large part in the recruitment and activation strategies employed.

A good way to recruit migrants for an approach is to work together with migrant organisations, which often belong to the voluntary and community sectors. The case studies from the United Kingdom and The Netherlands provide good examples of this.

**Operational Framework for Refugees – United Kingdom**

In the JobCentre Plus network approach in the UK, Refugee and Community Organisations (RCO’s) from the voluntary and NGO sectors play an important role in promoting access to employment for the ‘harder to reach’ refugees, unable (or unwilling) to access mainstream employment service provision. In order to target these groups more effectively, the Jobcentre Plus network at local and national level has sought to establish strong partnerships with these organisations. Sometimes RCO’s worked through outreach workers with an ethnic minority background in order to engage with these refugees.

Without the support of RCO’s, it would not have been possible to make much progress in improving access to the labour market for refugees. However, evidently the specific local operating context varies significantly across the UK and in some areas, it was less easy to work on an outreach basis due to the absence of voluntary and community organisations working with refugees. It was therefore easier to implement this approach in urban areas with high refugee concentrations, where such organisations tend to operate.

Thus, a potential bottle-neck when making oneself too dependent on voluntary and community organisations is that the approach might not work when these organisations are either not available or reliable.

*For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.3.3 and annex 3.*

**‘Samen Werken in Kleur’ – the Netherlands**

In the ‘Samen Werken in Kleur’ approach from The Netherlands the acquisition of participants is one of the core element as the target group, black, migrant and refugee women who are not entitled to social benefits, is a hard-to-reach group. Therefore, acquisition of participants takes place through, and at, so-called ‘self-organisations’ (small organisations founded by migrants), mosques and other communal places.

*For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.3.1 and annex 3.*

---

The way potential participants should be recruited partly depends on the social security system and the in-built incentives or economic necessity to find employment. A good way to recruit migrants for an approach, especially hard to reach migrants, is to work together with migrant organisations.

---

**4.3.8 Organisation, publicity, evaluation and dissemination**

Obviously, an efficient and smooth organisation is essential for the success of a project. Part of the organisation is of course the cooperation between stakeholders, which, as it comes on top as one of the success factors in many cases was already dealt with separately in section 4.3.3, but in this section we discuss other, more practical aspects of the project.
organisation, as well as the publicity given to the project and the dissemination activities.

**International Centre of Occupational Adaptation (ICOA) - Poland**

The importance of a good organisation became clear from the already described Polish ICOA approach. One of the factors that contributed to the success of this project was that the project was carried out at the University of Warsaw. The University logo and affiliation often helped to secure confidence of all beneficiaries, which seemed particularly crucial in case of foreign nationals, and this ultimately enabled an effective recruitment of project beneficiaries. Moreover, the University supported the project in many ways; in the process of application for EQUAL (ESF), financial contribution, in accounting procedures and in wrapping up of the project. In addition, the University pre-financed many activities of ICOA, which facilitated their smooth realisation.

*For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.3.4 and annex 3.*

Significant for the success of a project is also what is done after the project ends. First of all, a thorough evaluation and follow-up of participants is needed, to be able to keep monitoring the results and use the lessons learnt in subsequent projects. If a project is successful there is no need to re-invent the wheel and start a completely different project. ‘Simply’ continuing a successful project might be all that is needed in such a situation. However, and this was clearly pointed out in for example the Hungarian case (see the textbox in section 4.2.1), the project based nature of the integration projects by definition means that relatively well financed periods are unavoidably followed by underfinanced periods.

Part of the organisational aspects is also the publicity given to the approach. The “state of the art of research seems to suggest that employment equity policies may have the potential to contribute to solving the problem of ethnic inequality and discrimination in employment” but cannot do it alone. Therefore, most authors, "implicitly or explicitly emphasise the continuing importance of changing public attitudes through education, the mass media, politics and legislation".¹ Several of the case studies point to such accompanying campaigns to create a more positive attitude towards migrants among the native born population and especially employers.

---

International Centre of Occupational Adaptation (ICOA) - Poland

The Polish ICOA approach also consisted of involving the host society, instead of only direct beneficiaries of the project, i.e. migrants. This project also sought wider publicity with the idea that improving the public opinion of migrants would also contribute to improved labour market integration of migrants. Consequently, one of the aims of the project was providing the employers with up-to-date knowledge about the possibilities (and opportunities) and consequences of hiring migrant workers and the benefits of having an intercultural environment at the workplace.

Thus, publications and lobbying were also part of this approach. The project tried to spread the knowledge about occupational adaptation of foreign nationals among the Polish social services, and employers’ and foreigners’ associations. Over the project duration 10 seminars were organised which brought together 471 researchers and practitioners, and 5 scientific conferences attended by some 600 scholars. The list of ICOA publications comprises 10 books or booklets.

Finally, a public campaign and a series of press conferences, organised by ICOA, were entirely devoted to the information about project goals and results, and especially to the promotion of social partnership and work of culturally different people.

For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.3.4 and annex 3.

To be able to assess the results of a project, continuous evaluation and monitoring should be part of the project organisation. However, evaluations of the effects of employment equity instruments and programmes are not only scarce and difficult to undertake, but the evaluations that do exist only record modest effects in general, and the range of possible unintended consequences is not adequately documented yet. A good example of incorporating evaluation in the project organisation comes from Spain.

‘Analogias’ - Spain

In the Spanish ‘Analogias’ approach a research and evaluation unit is part of the project organisation. This unit publishes studies and reports on the development of the project. Moreover, it controls the level of satisfaction and impact for direct beneficiaries of the project. Finally, it acts as the communication office of the project, keeping in touch with the media, promoting the project and enhancing the visibility of the project among the population as a whole.

For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.2.3 and annex 3.
'Modello di occupazione a filiera’ - Italy

In the Italian ‘Modello di occupazione a filiera’ approach two handbooks were produced, which companies and immigrant workers can use. One is a handbook of ‘Best practices’ for human resources concerning recent migrants in Italy that provides guidance to workers and enterprises alike. Its aim is to provide guidelines and information, concerning both the laws and institutional aspects regulating the presence of immigrant workers in Italy, the employment relationships and work environment. The second is a handbook for the human resources in the agrifood industry. This handbook, which targets third country migrant workers in particular, presents elements connected to ‘agrifood supply chain’ principle used in the Italian approach, such as elements of human resources management in quality processes, the methods and aims of traceability, concepts on corporate social responsibility and on the relevant legislation, sector-specific laws and a few elements on regulated certification and brands.

Moreover, the activities carried out, the models applied and the instruments devised have been shared in an international partnership with the French association FAFSEA (the organisation of French farming undertakings) in order to test the results of the project and enable their application to another European agricultural reality.

Finally, both vertical and horizontal mainstreaming activities have been carried out with seminars, conferences, participation in national and international events and agreements with companies, associations of enterprises and public administrations.

For more information on this approach see the textbox in section 4.2.1 and annex 3.

The organisation (location, funding), constant monitoring, research and evaluation, the publicity given to an approach and the dissemination of results are important elements of a successful approach.

4.4 Contextual factors stimulating or hampering success

When developing a project, it also important to focus on the contextual factors. These could be uncontrollable outside influences, which nevertheless have to be taken into account. Contextual factors can have a positive or a negative influence. Below, we discuss some of the contextual factors that appeared in the case studies.

The economic situation
The main contextual factor impeding the success of these projects and mentioned in most case study reports is the economic situation, more specifically the current crisis.

In the Swedish diversity management case for example, it was noted that at a time when IKEA and many other Swedish companies are competing within increasingly difficult economic markets, diversity might not be prioritised anymore. However, this makes the business case for equity and diversity even more important. As long as diversity is proven to increase the success of a company, the current economic crisis does not have to impede the implementation or further continuation of diversity management.

Arguing along the same lines, the prosperous economic situation in many European countries in recent years contributed to the success of projects carried out during those years. In Denmark for example, there was an employment boom between 2005 and 2008, which resulted in a substantial shortage of labour power at all skills levels, even in spite of a very substantial immigration of guest workers, mainly from Eastern Europe. This economic boom probably increased the success of the Job-packages approach. However, it could be ex-
pected that under the current less favourable economic conditions the success of the approach might decline.

In terms of solutions for this, the general labour market situation and growing unemployment as a result of the economic crisis have been taken into account with regard to further training in the Austrian case. The clients should be placed in crisis-proof branches, which are health care, care for the elderly, childcare and skilled labour in industry. The same holds true for the Dutch approach. The women the approach targets are mainly placed in sectors such as the cleaning industry, care and social welfare, which are not very cyclically sensitive. Therefore, the economic crisis does not seem to impede the success of this project.

**Migration and integration issues**

Regarding contextual factors, something that should be taken into account, especially in the newer Member States, as for example pointed out in the report on Hungary and Bulgaria, is that many migrants perceive these countries not yet as a final destination but as a transit country. An approach aiming to improve the labour market integration, which to a large extent consists of language training might not be suited for migrants in these countries, unless they are explicitly planning on a long-term settlement. The Bulgarian approach did not acknowledge this, offered language training which was not focused on communication skills needed to start working in Bulgaria and consequently suffered from a lack of motivation. The Hungarian approach on the other hand did acknowledge that by offering highly convertible labour market skills in general (such as curriculum vitae writing, business plan development, etc.) with some Hungarian specific extras.

Integration issues might also influence the outcomes of an approach. In Poland for example, it was noted by the author that a rapidly intensifying public discourse on immigration and integration adversely influenced the approach. The project tried to deal with this by adopting a two-sided approach, thus also targeting the host society.

**Legislation**

As also described in the chapter on barriers, the legislation in itself might be a contextual factor hampering the success of an approach. The office for the support of immigrant entrepreneurship in Portugal encountered such factors. As a result of the legal framework, some programmes and funding were not available for immigrants. Examples are the requirements for attributing loans, such as the need of a guarantor which many migrants with low incomes are unable to provide for and the kind of visa needed required to access credit (only permanent residency).

The Hungarian approach discovered a potentially interesting way to get round legislative barriers to formal employment. In many countries asylum seekers are not yet allowed to work and procedures can be lengthy. Based on the spontaneous trend that some of the participants in this approach actively participated in some employment programs as a volunteer, it was concluded that a special legal employment solution could be based on this participation. This could be a sort of ‘public volunteering’ to offer such groups of people flexible and temporary but formal employment, through which they could acquire important skills and work experience during the period in which they are not allowed to work.
Legislation could also improve the success of a project. In Italy the introduction of the Bossi-Fini law played a significant role in the success of the project. This law improved regularisation of employment of, originally care-givers and household helps, and was later extended to include immigrants employed by private companies. This supported the placement of migrants in agricultural businesses.

Composition of the group of participants
Another contextual factor is the composition of the group of participants. In the Dutch case for example, it turned out that the group approach did not work in all cases. Reasons for this were the differences (in skills) between women and the fact that the women often are acquaintances of each other. Therefore, they were more reluctant to show to the other participants that there are certain things they do not master yet. Especially matters such assertiveness or job application training are more suited for individual guidance. To deal with such, sometimes unexpected contextual factors, it is advisable to be as flexible as possible during the execution of an approach as sometimes, it turns out that certain elements are not the working as expected.

Political and institutional arrangements
The political and institutional arrangements are important contextual factors to take into account when developing and implementing an approach. The institutional set-up of the Danish welfare state and the labour market, such as high minimum wages and generous social security schemes as well as the strong involvement of social partners on labour market policy are the key contextual factors of influence in Denmark. As already explained in section 4.3.7 this is for example of influence on the recruitment of participants of labour market integration approaches and of course on the potential transferability of the approach (see the next section).

Local governments might not always be prepared to invest in approaches towards labour market integration of migrants. This turned out to be one of the main bottle-necks in the Dutch approach, a relatively costly approach. When (local) governments are indeed reluctant to start a certain project, it is recommendable to start with a pilot. Then just a small investment is needed and in case of good results and if the project pays off, it might be further pursued.

Another contextual factor related to this is bureaucracy, as was already briefly stipulated in section 4.3.3. In the Portuguese case for example, which supported immigrant entrepreneurship, it turned out that bureaucracy in some institutions made applications (e.g. for funding) a difficult process for migrants, which often prevent migrants from proceeding with their application.

The division of tasks concerning labour market (re)integration and civic integration, could also hamper the success of a project. In the Netherlands, participants in the civic integration course are not allowed to participate in the project. Moreover, there is often a lack of communication and cooperation between the municipal departments of civic integration and reintegration. This while civic integration and labour integration are highly interconnected, together could result in real sustainable integration of migrants in society and thus should be best combined in a single approach. An example from the UK described earlier in this report points to a similar problem. In the UK, two EU funds (European Integration Fund and European Social Fund) are used for projects focused on labour market entry and labour market advancement respectively, while they are set up on the basis of complementing each other. While the existence of these funds is in fact considered helpful, a Home Office
official pointed out that, rather than working on the basis of complimenting each other, they are set up in a compartmentalized manner, which can sometimes lead to problems in using funding effectively.

Finally, concerning the institutional arrangements, cooperation between different stakeholders was identified as one of the most important contextual factors. Successful cooperation stimulates the success of an approach, and the lack of cooperation impedes the success of a project. More specifically, the territorial context where an approach is carried out could influence the quality of cooperation between stakeholders. In Italy for example, the project was mainly carried out in the region of Umbria. Thanks to the greater interconnections between and among the various stakeholders involved in the project and the greater efficiency of public bodies as compared to other areas in the country this supported the implementation of the initiative. The same could be seen in the UK case. A key contextual factor in the approach was the engagement of the voluntary and community sectors. The specific local operating context however, varies significantly across the UK. In some areas it was less easy to work on an outreach basis, due to the absence of voluntary and community organisations working with refugees. It was therefore easier to implement the approach in urban areas with high refugee concentrations, where such organisations tend to operate. See section 4.3.3 and the next section on transferability for a further discussion on cooperation between stakeholders.

**Funding**

Of course appropriate funding is essential for a project. It is, for example, important that the project plan is well written and that a successful project will not run out of funding in case of risks, a restructuring of the project or near the completion of the project. Important for this is, as for example pointed out in the Swiss case, that financing comes from a reliable partner such as the government or the European Commission. Indeed, a clear success factor in the Austrian approach was the engagement of the voluntary and community sectors. The specific local operating context however, varies significantly across the UK. In some areas it was less easy to work on an outreach basis, due to the absence of voluntary and community organisations working with refugees. It was therefore easier to implement the approach in urban areas with high refugee concentrations, where such organisations tend to operate. See section 4.3.3 and the next section on transferability for a further discussion on cooperation between stakeholders.

**Other contextual factors**

Sometimes contextual factors might be very basal. In the Estonian case for example, the construction of a large shopping centre, which created many jobs for women, positively influenced the success of a project and partly explained why women were doing much better in this approach than men. Similarly, Poland is undergoing huge infrastructural investment projects because of the 2012 European Football Championship to take place in Poland and the Ukraine. As a result significant labour shortages and consequently a rising demand for foreign labour in the construction industry emerged. This improved, in a relatively short time the public attitude towards migrants (see also integration issues above) which stimulated the success of the project.

On the other hand basal problems such as housing of migrants could also hamper the success of a project. In Bulgaria for example, the housing of refugees remained an unsolved issue. A general increase in rents and discriminatory practices of landlords towards renting accommodation to refugees caused serious housing difficulties, which hampered their job-search. The French approach, working directly on the context, recognised such contextual factors. Urban renovation, housing improvement and health and education policies are an integral element of the approach and supported authorities to achieve the aims.
At the same time the French approach encountered contextual factors hampering the success of the project. That is, attracting enterprises through tax exemptions gave rise to another problem. There were not enough commercial premises available to meet the demand. Thus, when aiming to improve labour market integration by economically revitalising an area such conditions should be met.

4.5 Innovativeness and Transferability

Innovative aspects
What is considered innovative greatly differs between countries. To illustrate this, the most innovative part of the three Estonian approaches is the fact that attention is given to a formerly often neglected and segregated group of non-Estonian speaking Russians. The same, although to a far lesser degree, holds true for one of the Portuguese approaches, which is labelled innovative for the fact that it is the first specific service that targets immigrants who have difficulties in accessing the labour market.

What follows is that mainly within the context of the New and Eastern European Member States the concept of innovativeness has to be considered differently. Some of the described approaches are innovative for the mere fact that it is the first time such an approach is employed or such a target group is given attention to. At the same time, these approaches might be ‘mainstream’ in some Western European countries, with a longer and different migration history. However, this does not alter the fact these approaches from the New and Eastern European Member States are meaningful to consider within the integration context of these particular countries and that these might contain elements that can be transferred to and learnt from by similar European countries.

Innovativeness might, also in Western European countries, be considered in terms of the target group the approach aims at. An example is targeting a very difficult to reach group, such as girls and young women with a migration background (in Austria) or black, migrant and refugee women (the Netherlands).
Moreover, this target group does not have to be the migrants themselves. Innovative approaches in for example Portugal and the Netherlands, give attention to the employers, by providing courses learning them to work with migrants and with emphasis on the added value of diversity at work. In another approach in the Netherlands, this goes as far as having employers to sign an intention agreement which states that, after their internship, migrant women can apply as an internal candidate.

Mechanisms used are another aspect of the approach that can be innovative. An approach in France for example (‘Sensitive Urban Zones’) instead of working directly on labour market dimensions, works on economic dimensions, while spin off to labour market integration is assumed. This is done by providing fiscal exonerations to companies establishing within certain neighbourhoods or to employers outside these neighbourhoods hiring young people from within the sensitive urban zones.
Another way of innovativeness is to combine several, otherwise fairly mainstream instruments. In the Netherlands, many mainstream approaches subsequently provide different elements, for example by starting with language training, then providing educational courses and finally providing an internship to acquire work experience. In contrast, one of the described innovative approaches simultaneously combines language training, vocational education and job-searching capabilities, while at the same time offering an internship, instead of the different modules following each other.
The nature of the approach can be innovative as well. In Denmark, an approach focused on Somali migrants, consists of a very spontaneous and informal method, in which Somali migrants help other Somali migrants to learn the rules of the game of the Danish labour market. As it turns out, exploiting these informal mechanisms can be very promising for certain groups. Contrary to this spontaneous and informal method, there are examples of more stringent approaches. In Switzerland for example, although rarely used, in one of the Cantons, migrants can sign integration contracts. In these contracts, their integration problems are identified and specific individual programs are developed to overcome these problems. However, these contracts put pressure on migrants. If they do not invest in their problems, there is the possibility not to renew the residence permit. The same type of approach exists in France (called the Reception and Integration Contract).

The basic principle behind the approach can be innovative as well. Many approaches start from a problematic point of view: the migrant faces several barriers and lacks certain skills. While an approach should indeed deal with these barriers, the starting point might also be the added value of migrants at the workplace, thus breaking a lance for diversity management. This is for example the case in one of the UK approaches, in which a Business Case for Employing London’s Refugees was developed. Real life illustrations have been gathered from a variety of public and private employers with regard to ways in which they have benefited from employing refugees in order to address labour market supply shortages.

**Transferability**

An important prerequisite for transferability of a project is its feasibility\(^1\). Approaches towards labour market integration of migrants are instruments (or more commonly sets of instruments, as we saw in the previous sections of this chapter) in a wider context, in this case the context of integration policies in general. When assessing the transferability, wider questions have to be asked pertaining to the background of general policy framing of immigration and integration in a country, the existing institutional structures for such policies, the configuration of actors involved in it (governmental, NGOs, migrants themselves), and even the specific characteristics of the clients/immigrants.

In other words, an approach should be:

- **Politically feasible**: a number of conditions derived from general immigration and integration policies should be fulfilled in order to make an instrument politically feasible.
- **Structurally feasible**: this refers to questions of institutional arrangements and divisions of competences and tasks in policymaking and implementation. An approach can only be organised if institutional structures allow this. An example is the existence of close cooperation of governmental and non-governmental actors.
- **Practically feasible**: Finally there is a third category of conditions that should be fulfilled for an approach to function. Such conditions have to do practical things like accessibility, opening hours and with a client centred service and with communication.

---

\(^1\) The theoretical consideration of transferability outlined here completely draws on: Penninx, R. Evaluation of the on-stop-shop project. February 2009.
This distinction between the three levels of feasibility is a generally accepted one in policy analysis. Moreover, transferability is not only about the content of the approach, but also about the way of communicating about an approach to actors in the field of labour market integration.¹

With the theoretical framework in mind, we draw some general conclusions on the transferability of the approaches studied and the things to keep in mind when trying to transfer one approach to another context or another country. However, it should be noted that most case studies, given the limited scope, did not incorporate a thorough analysis of the transferability of the approach. Thus, as the country reports and the case study reports did not make reference to these three concepts, we can just scratch the surface here.

One of the main prerequisites for a successful approach, as described in most case studies is the requirement of extensive collaboration between different stakeholders (see section 4.3.3 for a discussion on cooperation between stakeholders). However, to realise such cooperation, the structural feasibility, as explained above, has to be taken into account. In other words, if an approach in a certain country draws heavily on the cooperation between several stakeholders, for example among others the social partners, but the institutional arrangements in another country do not allow for such cooperation, for example because social partners only play a marginal role, the chances for a successful transfer of the approach are nil.

An example comes from Hungary. The Hungarian political and policy context is, according to the author of the case study (see annex 3) very undeveloped and unpredictable. This means that on the one hand the role and position of NGO’s in relation to state actors is undefined and depends on the personal relation among the actors as well as on the intentions of the state actor. Moreover, migration related authorities are relatively powerless as a result of which plans and projects are often at the mercy of other state bureaucracies. The local government, at the same time, is often on the one hand hostile, or at least uninterested in any migration or multicultural project, and on the other hand those few municipalities which are interested in such projects are often underfinanced. Finally, the Hungarian NGO sector is small, and as a result its network is vulnerable for unintentional fallouts.

Another interesting case is Denmark. Keeping the political and structural feasibility in mind, the authors question whether the Danish approach is transferable to other countries. Social partners played an important role in this approach and are strong in Denmark. Moreover, the Danish employment system is built upon several institutional features, which for example, makes it possible to provide financial support to the job-packages (e.g. wage subsidy), a very important element in the approach.

The prerequisites for transferability as outlined in the UK case also directly connect to the political arrangement. To transfer the approach there is a need for public employment services to deal with refugee job seekers more sensitively and to recognise that many of them have higher-level skills that need to be fully exploited, with indicates a need for flexibility in the benefits system so that refugees are able to continue to receive state benefits while in training, without being forced to look for low-paid, low skilled employment. Such political and institutional arrangements have to be taken into account when assessing an approach’s political and structural feasibility.

Concerning the practical feasibility, the Polish and Dutch cases provide an example. A core element of the Dutch approach is the personal approach and the fact that coaches are available for their participants by day and night and visit them at home. In the Polish case on the other hand it was noted that the insufficient flexibility of occupational counselling (the availability of counsellors was limited to early morning hours) hampered the success of the project. This example makes clear that under the current circumstances, the Dutch approach is not practically feasible in the Polish context.

An interesting approach concerning transferability is the Italian approach. The approach includes several elements which could be, according to the author, transferred to other areas of the agrifood industry in Italy and abroad. One of these elements is the idea of training ‘experts’ who are able to work all along the production chain, using an ‘upside down’ approach involving, above all, training on the competences needed to process a product in the industrial firm and then on the competences concerning the harvesting process in the agricultural concern. However, the complexity and specificity of the supply and production chain in other industries have to be taken into account.
PART C: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
5 Conclusions and recommendations

5.1 Introduction

In this final chapter we present the conclusions of this study on successful approaches towards integration of migrants into the labour market. We start with general conclusions on the economic crisis, the labour market situation of third county migrants and the barriers they face. After this we link the barriers to the identified approaches or instruments and highlight the points of particular interest for each of these instruments.

Next we turn to concrete and convincing recommendations regarding the effective mechanisms of innovative approaches towards labour market integration of third country migrants. These recommendations will be drawn up by presenting a short problem analysis and linking this to the working element or effective mechanisms. For each of these effective mechanisms we will point out the stakeholders (e.g. policy makers, public employment services, employers) that are the appropriate actors to put these recommendations into place. Finally, each effective mechanism is illustrated by one or more case examples from the 15 innovative approaches that were subject to in-depth case studies. Earlier in this report, examples from all 15 approaches were given. In this section, we only provide examples from a few of the most interesting and useful approaches. In doing so, we go from good practices to best practices.

To conclude, we present some concrete ideas on dissemination and mainstreaming of the study’s results.

Before continuing, the definition of third country migrants as used in this study is provided in the textbox below.

---

**Third country migrants**

The total population resident in the EU can be divided into three basic groups based on place of birth:

- Native-born – those born in the Member State of residence;
- Other EU-born – those born in another EU Member State but living in another;
- Non-EU-born – those born outside of the EU (third countries).

The latter two groups – although both ‘foreign-born’ may have different residence and labour market rights, and differ in terms of labour market outcomes. In this study we focus on immigrants from non EU countries (hereafter referred to as ‘non-EU born’ or ‘third country migrants’).

---


2 The ‘foreign-born’ concept provides a more complete picture by including naturalised third country nationals. In addition, it is in line with most of the more recent migration literature and research which favours an approach based on foreign-born over foreign-nationals when analysing migrant populations.
5.2 Conclusions

European labour markets and third country migrants

The economic crisis and European labour markets

- The economic crisis deeply impacts the European labour markets. Most country analyses point in the same direction with regard to the impact the crisis will have on third country migrants: As they are on average younger, more often working in temporary employment and are working in sectors that are especially sensitive for the effects of the current crisis, the labour market position of third country migrants will worsen in the near future.

Labour market shortages

- Notwithstanding the labour market effects of the economic crisis, the demographic developments will cause labour market shortages in the long run.
- Labour market shortages will become noticeable on the European labour markets in the near future. Many countries are in need of high skilled workers and try to attract them.
- These developments, although from a different perspective, call for labour market integration of third country migrants.

Third country migrants in Europe and their labour market situation

Overall, shares of third country migrants in the Eastern European countries are small, while the shares are relatively large in the North Western European countries and in between those in the Southern European countries. Factors such as the colonial history or a history with guest workers determine the composition of the groups of migrants to a large extent.

- Generally speaking, migrants in the North Western Member States are on average less educated than natives while in the new and Southern Member States this is the other way around. In many countries migrants are overqualified for the job they are in, mainly as result of the failure to recognize qualifications.
- In Bulgaria, Poland, Hungary and Portugal the employment rates of the non EU born are above those of the EU born and in the UK, Denmark, the Netherlands, Austria, Sweden, Germany, Estonia, Spain and Italy this is the other way around. Because these conclusions are based on data gathered before the economic crisis, and more recent data was not included in the study, we have to be ware that the situation in the first mentioned countries (especially Portugal) changed considerably in the last years.
- Vulnerable groups in terms of labour market integration are women, refugees, undocumented migrants and second generation migrants.
- Recent third country immigration consists to a large degree of young adults, comprises more women than men and includes a high share of low skilled working age third country migrants.
The employment rate gap between EU-born and non-EU-born is larger for recent third country migrants and employment rates of migrant women and people of prime working age (25-54) are considerably lower compared to their EU-born counterparts.

It follows that third country migrants’ integration into the labour market may be particularly challenging in the older Member States and for recent third country migrants, migrant women and third country migrants of prime working age. These groups should be among the main target groups.

Barriers to labour market integration

- Barriers are strongly interrelated, cross-cutting and often reinforcing each other. Often there is an interplay of several barriers and no individual barrier could be identified as the most important barrier. Thus, approaches should always focus on multiple barriers. Below, the individual barriers are discussed.

- The lack of language skills is an important barrier in most countries, however it is clearly not the only barrier. Language training is widespread across the countries, although in some countries capacity is lacking or procedures are too complex.

- The lack of professional and educational skills is clearly identified as a barrier in most countries. However, having qualifications is not a guarantee to get a qualified and sustainable job. Many educated migrants face difficulties entering the labour market at their skills level as a result of the failure to recognize diplomas.

- The failure to recognize qualifications was recognized as a barrier in almost all countries. Across the countries, measures are in place to assist migrants in getting their qualifications recognized, but this barrier remains to hamper successful labour market integration of third country migrants.

- In all countries the limited knowledge of the labour market was recognized as an important barrier. This knowledge (or skills) pertains to three different stages in the labour market integration process. The first two, searching for a job and applying for a job deal with entry or access to the labour market. The third one, performing on the job and knowledge of the working culture, deal with advancement or upwards mobility within the labour market.

- A limited social and professional network is identified in a few countries as a barrier to labour market integration. Successful networks can contribute to finding employment. However, ethnic homogenous networks could also hamper labour market integration.

- In most countries, discrimination is identified as an important barrier, which prevents third country migrants from entering or moving upwards in the labour market. Discrimination could be prevented by not only focusing on instances of real behaviour but also by focusing on the attitudes towards and images of immigrants, thus starting from a positive point of view.

- Bad working conditions are identified as one of the main barriers towards successful labour market integration in some countries, where migrants are prone to exploitative working conditions.

- The fact that in most countries asylum seekers are not allowed to work before they are granted a status was identified as a barrier in several countries. Other identified contextual barriers are
complicated legislation, the lack of capacity for the provision of language training and the lack of coordination between stakeholders.

- Extensive social security could function as barrier to labour market integration, because of a lack of incentives. During times of economic crisis however, low social security and low flexibility (low flexicurity) could function as a barrier towards labour market integration. In countries with high flexicurity unemployment rates have raised far less substantial than in countries with low flexicurity, as flexicurity keeps the labour market flexible, makes employees less risk averse. Moreover, companies will hire new employees at a much faster rate when the economy recovers than they would do otherwise.

- Moreover, matters related to the social environment (neighbourhood, health care) might also be a barrier towards labour market integration.

5.2.1 Recommendations: Linking barriers to approaches

After we presented the conclusions on barriers, we now connect these to instruments to overcome these barriers. Which instruments, or approaches, are the appropriate ones for which barriers? This is summarized in the table below, after which we highlight some points of particular interest for each of these instruments. Next we turn to the concrete recommendations on how to effectively implement these approaches and which actors should do so.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Barriers</th>
<th>Approaches</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of language skills</td>
<td>Education and training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Internships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of professional and educational skills</td>
<td>Education and training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Counselling and advice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Internships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited knowledge of the labour market</td>
<td>Education and training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Counselling and advice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mentoring and coaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited social and professional network</td>
<td>Networking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Internships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognition of qualifications and diplomas</td>
<td>Recognition of qualifications and diplomas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Internships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discrimination</td>
<td>Diversity management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Contextual approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mentoring and coaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working conditions</td>
<td>Contextual approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legislation, policy and other contextual</td>
<td>Contextual approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barriers</td>
<td>(Diversity management)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour market situation</td>
<td>An integrated approach, combining several</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>instruments and elements</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To start with, education and training should be focused on different skills, such as language skills, professional skills, intercultural skills and knowledge about the labour market and working culture. Moreover, before focusing on the required job skills and sector skills, first
of all basic skills (communication, computer competences, work ethics, etc.) should be appropriate as these basic skills are pre-requisites for further updating of skills\(^1\), which could partly be done by 'learning on the job'. The approach studied in Italy aimed to make employment of third country migrants more stable and qualified through training and education. The approach successfully combines this with other aspects such as an internship, cooperation with various stakeholders (including leading figures within the migrant community and enterprises) and awareness raising actions, acknowledging that raising educational skills alone will not solve problems.

As with education and training, **counselling and advice** should also be focused both on labour market aspects as well as on other aspects (legal, health care, housing), of which spin-off to labour market integration could be assumed. Also, it should be developed in such a way that migrants are eventually empowered to take over their own labour market situation and become independent ('help for self-help'). Counselling and advice is set up this way in Austria for example. Participants receive advice and are empowered to take over their own employment situation. At the Jobcentre, things are not done for migrants, but they get advice and all the information they need.

**Mentoring and coaching** is a good instrument during the job-search phase, but should be continued for migrants who are already in employment to increase the possibility of sustainable labour market integration. The approach studied in Spain involves mentoring and coaching in an effective way. Mediators are educated at the school for intercultural and social mediation. Moreover, personal and direct coaching is not only provided during the job searching phase, but there is also a mentoring program for participants who found a job to prevent job abandonment.

Another way to ensure that continued attention is given to migrants once they are in employment is **Diversity Management**. However, this will not work if solely driven by social responsibility. Therefore, there should be a business case for diversity management as well. Diversity management should be integrated in top-level management and not just in human resource management. In Sweden, IKEA did just that. The company adopted diversity management policies for ethic, legislative but also economic reasons. Diversity is seen as a matter of creating a more challenging business atmosphere, gaining a competitive advantage and expanding the recruitment base.

Connected to education and training is the **recognition of qualifications and diplomas**. The best way to achieve this is to establish partnerships with the private sector in the recognition process and to connect the recognition of qualifications to the provision of supplementary training. Switzerland provides a good example of this. The comprehensive skills and competences validation program Qualification+ incorporates supplementary training. Moreover, as the private sector trusts this skills validation system, many sectoral employers’ organisations participate in this system.

**Internships** and networking are good instruments to provide migrants with a stimulating and labour market oriented environment. Concerning internships in order to be effective and keep participants motivated, there should be a realistic possibility to be hired afterwards. Moreover, networking increases the possibility of finding employment (because of informal recruitment processes) but it should be assured that these networks are ethnically heterogeneous and also include employers. A good example of networking and internships comes from Germany. By connecting internships to language training and practical job training and establishing and fostering contacts with the right stakeholders, such as employers, school directors and members of migrants organisations, the approach succeeded

---

to lead many migrants into employment and to notably raise the number of migrants employed in the public sector in Bremen.

Finally, when implementing a broad contextual approach (e.g. targeted at a whole area or neighbourhood) a whole integrated package of accompanying measures should be developed. Moreover, possible side effects should be taken into account, as an approach targeted on a whole neighbourhood might stigmatize the citizens of the neighbourhood and lead to discrimination towards them. In France, the government employs a global strategy to improve the situation in the 'banlieues' that includes not only employment, but also tax exemptions to attract enterprises, education, health, the environment and access to public transport.

Linking barriers to approaches, it becomes clear that for many barriers there are multiple appropriate instruments. Moreover, as explained earlier, there is always an interplay of multiple barriers. What follows is that an effective approach should be an integrated approach, including several of the instruments just highlighted and giving attention to multiple barriers. Moreover, approaches should be implemented working along effective mechanisms. Therefore, in the next section concrete recommendations, for stakeholders at different levels, concerning the effective mechanisms are provided.

5.3 Recommendations: Effective mechanisms

In this section we provide six basic tools or effective mechanisms which can, and should be, used to develop a comprehensive and effective approach for labour market integration of third country migrants. These recommendations are in line with and should contribute to the second priority of the "EU2020" strategy: empowering people in inclusive societies. As outlined in this strategy and as a clear 'leitmotiv' throughout this study the rationale behind the importance of getting migrants to work is twofold: despite its substantial contribution to growth, the potential of migration is not fully factored into policy making at EU or national level and employment rates of immigrants can be improved, particularly for specific categories such as immigrants with low levels of education, women and those recently arrived.

A word on the examples of promising practices in Europe

Throughout the text of this report, a great number of issues raised were accompanied by case examples and in this section we will also refer to case examples. These examples are derived directly from promising European practices analysed in the study. The examples are meant as a source of inspiration and consideration rather than as a formula to be copied. National and local contexts will always require specific solutions. Still, elements of examples found elsewhere may add to the quality of the approach. For each effective mechanism, one or more case examples are provided. Furthermore, whenever applicable, the ‘recommendation for different actors’ go along with concrete examples for the case studies.

In this section only examples of some of the best cases are provided. Thus, we go from good practices to best practices.

More information on the cases can be found throughout the report and in the case study reports in annex 3.

5.3.1 Integrated approach

As said above, barriers often come together. Therefore, an approach should always be focused on several barriers and consequently include several instruments and elements. Too often this is not the case as became clear from the identified approaches in 15 European countries. Frequently, approaches consist of just one instrument such as language training or education or, only slightly better, different instruments follow each other during the course of the intervention in an isolated manner without much interaction. Reasons for the relative absence of actual integrated approaches are first of all that these are costly. Obviously, the development and execution of an integrated approach consisting of multiple instruments requires a higher investment. Moreover, it also requires high effort and dedication on behalf of the staff involved in carrying out the approach (see section 5.3.5). And finally, political and administrative arrangements might be such that different governmental departments (for example work and income and civic integration) are working in a compartmentalized manner, while they instead should work together towards an integrated approach (a plea for working in partnerships is discussed in section 5.3.3).

What becomes clear from this study is that a non-integrated approach is not effective. For example, solely providing language training does not solve barriers such as a limited knowledge of the labour market, a lack of professional skills or discrimination. Therefore,

- Different essential elements or approaches as discussed above should be combined in an interactive way and not in isolated way (different elements following each other during the course of an approach). For example, a combination of education and training with an internship to use the acquired skills in a real job environment or a mentor system in which the mentors have an immigrant background and function as role models.
- Moreover, education and training should be focused on different skills: language skills, professional skills, intercultural skills and knowledge about the labour market and working culture.
- Approaches should not only be focused on direct beneficiaries (migrants) but also on intermediary beneficiaries (e.g. the host society), as these might indirectly influence labour market integration of migrants as well.

Case example: Integrated approach

The ’Samen Werken in Kleur’ approach in the Netherlands combines many of the successful elements in an integrated and interactive way. The approach consists of family, individual and group coaching, the use of successful role models, mediation, education, a personal approach, an internship and actively involves employers. Although this approach is relatively costly, compared to mainstream reintegration programmes, it surely pays off. The approach succeeds to place approximately 90 percent of its participants in sustainable employment (contract renewal after six months). Therefore, in the long run a higher initial investment, leads to more people actually working and thereby to lower expenses on further employment activation measures or welfare benefits.

Recommendations for different actors

Government and politics

- As these integrated approaches are costly and might need some time to organize and develop, the EU should seek to provide financial support to start up pilot projects in
Member States for further dissemination of the good practices identified in this study to ensure that Member States learn from these practices and these are finally taken up in mainstream policy.

- At the same time national governments should provide resources for local services such that it permits the development of long-term integrated approaches, as this ensures that successful time-limited project based initiatives are continued as long-term sustainable approaches. In Austria for example, the job centre that was subject of this study, is located within the Austrian Integration Fund, which is entirely financed by public money. The project has no pre-defined ending and is therefore safer in terms of money and planning than clearly defined projects lasting only for a certain period of time.

- National governments should develop overarching policy frameworks that support the development and execution of integrated approaches. One example is to link different governmental departments (for example work and income and civic integration) that are often working in a compartmentalized manner, while they instead should work together towards an integrated approach. Besides, they should also combine different instruments themselves such as combining legal actions to combat discrimination with communication campaigns raising awareness on how migrants enrich the countries of destination. Two of the approaches studied, in Hungary and Poland, included awareness raising campaigns, emphasizing the value of multiculturalism and the advantage of integration for the host society.

**Actors implementing labour market measures**

- Taken the costliness of an integrated approach into account, actors at implementation level (public employment services, NGO’s, private companies) should develop pilot projects to receive the necessary (financial) support from governmental institutions. Pilot projects will, if success is proven, increase the preparedness of (local) governments to invest in migrants and adopt an approach. The approach in the Netherlands mentioned above, was developed by a reintegration company as a pilot project in a few municipalities. Now that the success of the approach becomes clear, more and more municipalities are interested to implement the approach.

- Public Employment Services should combine different essential elements or approaches instead of focussing more on a one sided approach (investing in training programmes, while neglecting bringing learning into real life situation like internships).

- Project executors should arrange their approach as such that they synchronise their activities with other measures. Thus, project executors should not only offer for example an isolated training program, but should also offer accompanying measures/ use accompanying instruments. Moreover, they should, apart from the core elements of the approach, also provide supportive measures in other spheres of live, such as health, housing and the family situation. The French approach provides a good example of adopting a more global, wider strategy, including not only employment, but also education, health, public transport and the environment targeting a specific geographical area in which a lot of unemployed (third country migrants) are living.
**Beneficiaries**

- *Migrant organisations* should not only be concerned with specific aspects of migrant social inclusion or specific projects focused on only one topic, but should adopt a broad, integrated approach as well.

**5.3.2 Tailored approach**

Being not specifically focused towards third country migrants was identified as a fail factor in some projects or labour market policies. Moreover, it even became clear that in some of the New Member States, an approach was labelled as innovative for the mere fact that it included migrants as a target group. However, it turns out that a tailored approach, specifically focused towards the specific needs of the target group (migrants), but also distinguishing between the needs of different individuals within this target group and taking into account the needs of employers, is more successful than mainstream approaches that are also carried out for, for example the native unemployed.

It is important to take cultural factors, such as the family background or culturally determined perceptions on employment, into account. Therefore, it is strongly recommended to employ a tailored approach, especially focused on (third country) migrants, with an eye for the great diversity within this group. Moreover, for the success of a project it is also essential to actively involve project beneficiaries in a project and in the development of their own ‘tailor-made’ approach and not let them be just passive recipients of the actions undertaken.

Just as on the concrete level of the approach itself, on a higher policy level this applies as well. In terms of labour market policy, Sweden and the Netherlands employ a mainstream policy rather than a targeting labour policy. Thus, labour market policy is not especially targeted towards certain groups, such as third county migrants. Based on this research it is not possible to judge this policy, but it is the question whether generic policy leads to successful labour market integration approaches for migrants. However, of course there are many other factors of influence, such as migration history, the structure of the labour market or the particular groups of migrants within these countries.

- ‘One-size fits all approaches’ are not effective for labour market integration of third country migrants. To be successful for third country migrants, approaches should be tailor made, focused towards the needs of migrants.

- In developing approaches there should be more emphasis on assessing the prior experience of third country migrants, identification of the perceived learning needs, demands, motivations and wishes. This includes insights into the intrinsic motivation (e.g., self-generated willingness to learn and work), and the extrinsic motivation (e.g., responsiveness to external pressures from others, the reward of a diploma or mandatory requirements) of third country migrants, the learning trajectories and careers (including gaps) and the societal needs, including the Key competences that people need in fast developing societies, as jobs and the labour market evolve in response to new challenges – technological change, global competition, ageing populations, energy challenges.

- Migrants (and migrant organisations) and also potential employers (and sector organisations) should be involved in developing migrants own tailor-made approach.

- A tailored approach also implies that an approach should be flexible. When identifying, as a result of close monitoring, that certain elements are not working, there always should be the possibility to flexibly restructure these elements of the approach.
Case examples: Tailored approach
The Austrian ÖIF Jobcentre is a best practice of a tailored approach. The courses offered are custom-tailored. The approach provides intense individual coaching and recognizes the target group as such with its special problems and needs. This leads to the empowerment of migrants to take over their own labour market situation. Of the 678 migrants who took part in the measure, almost 30 percent could be placed in a job and a further 23 percent went into further education. Thus, more than 50 percent found direct help through this approach.

Another best practice is the Italian case. As many migrants in Italy are working in seasonal (agricultural) employment and as a result are unemployed during certain times of the year, the approach aimed to make employment more stable by training migrants as experts who could be employed along the whole life cycle of the product, in this case tobacco. The approach started with extensive research into the tobacco supply chain sector in which migrants had to be placed and hence was able to tailor the approach towards the needs of the sector. Specialized professionals provided tutoring and trained migrants. The results went far beyond expectations. As many as 173 unemployed third country migrants were trained, placed in employment and kept their jobs.

Recommendations for different actors

Government and politics
- The EU should give specific attention to the (labour market situation) of third country migrants in the ESF programmes and should further elaborate on the situation of migrants as outlined in the second priority of the EU2020 strategy (‘empowering people in inclusive societies’)

- National and local governments should consider if policy changes are needed at national or regional level to promote a more tailored approach. Countries that currently employ a generic, non-targeted labour market policy, should consider revisiting a targeted policy that allows for labour market integration policy and approaches that are especially targeted at migrants.

- In line with this, national governments should adopt flexible labour market integration policies which could be tailored towards the needs of migrants, especially during uncertain times such as the current economic crisis. Moreover, the labour market needs should be taken into account so that approaches could focus on those labour market skills actually needed. Therefore, national or local governments should make sure that up-to-date analyses of the local or national labour market are carried out. In Denmark, the ‘job-packages’ that were introduced by the government, in cooperation with municipalities, the private sector and social partners, focused at several sectors or industries facing labour shortages, thus taking into account actual labour market needs.

- Employing a tailored approach, implies that in certain countries, national governments should first establish which groups of third country could be identified in their country. Not in all countries such information is easily available. Moreover, it should be investigated to what extent national legislation allows for such tailored approaches, or in other words distinguishing between groups (positive discrimination). Therefore, in disseminating results the EU should have an eye for the national contexts and possibilities for tailored approaches.
**Actors implementing labour market measures**

- **Public Employment Services** should engage more effectively with and better tailor their services to meet the specific needs of migrants in accessing the labour market. They should for example train their frontline staff in how to respond to the needs of migrant clients. The approach in the UK for example, focused on practices among public employment services in ensuring that UK employment services are better tailored to meet the specific needs of refugees. This included cooperation with migrant community organisations and regularly reinforcing awareness of the need for sensitivity in dealing with refugees among frontline staff.

- **Project executors** should arrange their approach as such to provide intensive, tailored, one-to-one case working during the full duration of the approach. This could be done, as in the Dutch approach, by allocating each participant a personal coach, who also takes into account the family and cultural background of participants.

**Beneficiaries**

- **Migrant organisations** should be involved in the whole life cycle of an approach: development, implementation and evaluation. Taking control over their own career will empower third country migrants and make them more motivated for succeeding.

**5.3.3 Partnerships and involvement of stakeholders**

One player alone in the field of labour market integration is less effective than the joint effort of multiple parties. Cooperation between different stakeholders is thus highly recommended (at least to assure an integrated or tailored approach). A partnership encompasses a broad number of types of relationship. It is an undertaking to do something together, a relationship that consists of shared and or compatible objectives and an acknowledged distribution of specific roles and responsibilities among the participants which can be formal, contractual, or voluntary, between two or more partners. There are different types of partnerships: strategic, operational, community and others. Partnerships could be based on funding and sponsorship, cooperation, coordination or collaboration. Furthermore the partnership could be long lasting, medium or short term.

In this study a broad variety of partners were assessed, like e.g.:

- **Government organisations** - determine the legislative and the policy framework of integrating third country migrants and are founders and funders of services that are implementing labour market integrations measures. Herewith they influence the quality of provision (content, resources, measures, and partnerships);

- **Public employment services** – play a key role in matching employers to employees and are often the centre of an approach. In all countries there is a publicly funded employment agency and multiple private businesses which also act as employment agencies.

- **Business enterprises / employers** - provide workplaces (apprenticeships and internships), in-service training for employed third country migrants, and diversity policies. Herewith, they can influence the content of measures in place (see section 5.3.4 for more information);
Learning centres – initiate, develop and deliver training, educational services or activities to third country migrants.

The community sector – provide housing, communication structures, equipments and logistic means to reach the target group.

Non Governmental Organisations – fulfil a role of representation and advocacy of specific third count migrant target groups, establish a link between (public employment) services and society, fund specific reintegration projects and train the employees of their own organisation.

Trade unions - offer a framework in which common interest of the employed and unemployed can be addressed jointly.

Participants – third country migrants influence the content and methods of the measures as well.

The interests represented in partnerships are extremely diverse. However, it may be suggested that the partnerships studied in the research fall into two main categories: governance and resource partners. Governance partners function more at a strategic level, like administrative, developmental, business and political institutions which have a strong influence on the conditions for developing and implementing labour market reintegration measures. Resource partners can be considered as partners at an operational level. These so called resource partners are different professional institutions e.g. public employment services, learning centres, community organisations, education providers, and business enterprises operating in the area of labour market integration.

In several country studies it was noticed that there is a lack of cooperation between important actors and this was identified as an important factor hampering the integration of third country migrants into the labour market. Reason for the absence of a multi-stakeholders approach might be that funding although available for such activities, is often short term. Moreover, the results are all too often neither evaluated nor communicated, as a result of which learning from each other about successful and efficient partnerships does not occur. Finally, such partnerships are time-consuming and require strong collaboration and commitment, especially with respect to financial, human and institutional resources.¹

The cases studied in this research made it very clear that working in partnerships enriches the approaches employed to integrate migrants into the labour market. Although partnerships may have their own dynamics that sometimes aren’t easy to cope with, the added value is evident. A key issue for the future will be how the formation of partnerships may be promoted by informing the potential partners about the advantages of partnerships and by ways and channels of funding. It seems worth considering developing a funding structure that promotes the formation of partnerships. It is important to take into account that it is the quality and the kind of partners involved that matters; not the number of partners.

In developing and carrying out an effective and successful approach several stakeholders, such as national and local governments, employers, trade unions, NGO’s, schools and universities, Public Employment Services and migrant organisations should work together, learn from each other and form partnerships.

Migrants themselves, being obvious stakeholders, should also be actively involved in the development, execution and evaluation of an approach. This should be done in several ways, such as involving them in the development of their own approach, working to-

gether with migrant organisations and making use of migrant role models. They exert a strong and positive influence on migrant participants as they often went through the same labour market integration process themselves before.

**Case example: Partnerships and involvement of stakeholders**

The Danish 4-part labour agreement is a best practice with regard to partnership working. In this approach, the national government, employers (both local government and private sector), regional government and labour unions are working together. The social partners played an important role because they have a good understanding on the supply and demand side of the labour market and the problems employers and employees face. The approach succeeded to help 117 migrants with a weak labour market connection into employment.

**Recommendations for different actors**

**Government and politics**

- The EU should use its funding programs to support cooperation and promote partnership working, especially in areas where the problems of migrants’ labour market integration are most severe and where resources are lacking to tackle these problems.

- The EU should, in line with the strategy outlined in EU2020, promote interdependence between different levels of government (EU, Member States, regions, social partners, etc.).

- *National and local governments* should emphasize more the role of partnerships by declaring the key roles of partnerships and dialogue for integrating third country migrants in various strategic documents and by setting standards and guidelines for partnership working.

- *National and local governments* should bring actors (government departments) together at state level to ensure that policies and administration systems are integrated and not in conflict or working in a compartmentalized manner.

- *National and local governments* should provide funding to migrant (voluntary) organisations as these should be involved in labour market integration approaches as well.

- *Local governments* should promote cooperation of mainstream organisations rather than the unnecessary proliferation of new actors, which might further complicate partnership working.

**Actors implementing labour market measures**

- *Trade unions* should ensure that they are included in arrangements set up for partnership working and seek to learn from experiences elsewhere, where social partners have been influential in shaping cooperation agreements. In Denmark, for example, the social partners played an important role in formulating and developing the content of the so-called job packages.
- **Employers** should be prepared to take part in cooperation arrangements (see next section).

**Beneficiaries**

- **Migrant organisations** should actively take the initiative to become involved in partnerships as well.

- **Individuals** with a migrant background should be prepared (and stimulated) to be involved in labour market integration approaches as role models. In the German approach for example, migrants employed in the public sector were invited and talked about their experiences with the participants of the program.

- Empowerment actions should not only be focused on migrant organisations, but also on the actual target group (migrant themselves) of these migrant organisations. Therefore, *migrant organisations* play an important role in ensuring that empowerment activities actually reach the migrant population.

**5.3.4 Employer involvement**

The involvement of employers is indispensible and therefore will be discussed separately from the previous recommendations. In some projects it turned out that the project failed to involve individual employers. As a result the content of the training program did not reflect employers’ demand for particular skills, which consequently had a negative effect on the outcomes of the approach. Thus, involving employers in the development and execution of an approach, enables project staff to better tailor the content of an approach towards the needs of employers and increases the possibility that migrants are invited for an internship or obtain an appointment.

A Taskforce set up in March 2007 found that a number of employers, particularly to the North, are recognizing the value of investing in the integration of their migrant workforce. Indeed some explicitly recognized the economic benefits of doing so. However, employers often lack the necessary expertise and resources to implement integration strategies in-house. Moreover, developing diversity strategies can often be expensive in terms of providing the necessary infrastructure and administrative support, and this may deter smaller businesses from going down this route\(^1\), for example because of a shortage of time or financial resources. Finally, with regard to the situation of migrants, compared to other groups of (unemployed) people, it might even require more effort to motivate employers, due to a negative or at least indifferent attitude or discrimination towards migrants.

To increase employer involvement, the following should be done:

- During the development of an approach, research should be done on the actual needs of employers.
- Employers’ willingness to cooperate should be increased by continuing coaching after a job placement and always being available for assistance.
- Attention should be given improving employers’ attitude towards hiring migrants.

---

There should be commitment to employment equity in the boardroom and management circles of companies.

Companies should be called to Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) in terms of human resource management as in the end this might entail assets for companies as well.

**Case examples: Employer involvement**

In the Diversity Management Program of IKEA in Sweden, diversity has been integrated with Human Resource Management and aligned closely with the business plan. Diversity is regarded by IKEA as a way of gaining competitive advantage, as the capacity to understand and internally mirror the diversity of its current and potential customers is regarded a key factor in business success. Apart from other results, such as the 26 languages spoken at the Uppsala store and the provision of fair opportunities in terms of being invited for an interview and be recruited, a tangible result is that within IKEA Uppsala, 10.5 percent of the management staff has a migrant background, significantly higher than in any other store in Sweden.

Awareness raising is good way to stimulate employer involvement. A best practice concerning awareness raising is the Artemisszió project in Hungary. The approach also focused on different groups of the majority society and included in its intercultural competences training for those groups topics such as sensitivity raising, conflict management and intercultural negotiation techniques. Moreover, a campaign was launched emphasizing the value of multiculturalism and the advantage of integration for the host society.

**Recommendations for different actors**

**Government and politics**

- The European Union should work with organisations such as ETUC and BUSINESS EUROPE to promote the involvement of employers’ organisations and trade unions at the national level.

- There is a need for balance between ‘top-down’ approaches and ‘bottom-up’ approaches. Employer involvement measures need support from above and may need to be initiated from above by national or local governments. However, through local initiation and local ownership progress can best be made. A good example of this is the approach in the Netherlands, which is developed and carried out by a private company. These companies often have much more contact with other private businesses.

- Connected to this, national and local governments should allow for upward feedback; they should have the capacity to learn from local projects and if possibly adjust or develop national policy.

- National and local government should stimulate Corporate Social Responsibility in terms of human resource management or more specifically in terms of hiring migrants, for example by including such requirements in tender procedures. In Spain, part of the approach is the office for CSR development, which publishes information on corporate social responsibility. The office is trying to establish close relations with entrepreneurs, visiting them at their headquarters, organising short conferences and trying to enhance awareness and greater involvement in CSR among the businesses in the area.
National governments should make use of temporary job agencies and provide the appropriate legislation and environment for these agencies to act in, as these play an important role in getting migrants to work, at least in temporary employment. Moreover, national governments should fight illegal practices within the temporary jobs agency sector, as that might lead to exploitation of migrants. To fight this, national governments, in cooperation with job agency trade unions, should promote self-regulation within this sector, for example by establishing a good practice label.

**Actors implementing labour market measures**

- **Employer involvement** might be easier to realize for larger companies (such as IKEA in the Swedish case) than for smaller companies. Therefore, **employers associations** should play a role as well. This is especially important for smaller businesses that may lack the means to develop human resource strategies for their workforce. These associations should be encouraged to initiate networks and business-to-business partnerships to enable small- and medium sized enterprises to provide services to migrant workers through resource-sharing and the use of external expertise\(^1\).

- **Project executors** should actively involve trade unions and employers in the development of labour market integration approaches, to be aware of the skills needs of employers, to establish a more positive attitude towards migrant workers and to arrange for possible job positions where migrants could gain work experience. Project executors can ensure employers’ involvement by, as in the Dutch case, continuing coaching also after job placement and by always being available for assistance.

- **Employers** should be prepared to cooperate with other organisations and give migrant workers a chance. This may ask for putting more emphasis on potential than on prior experience or formal qualifications. Moreover, employers should be prepared to seek to learn from other employers who are adopting innovative approaches.

- **Employers** should advise those carrying out migrant labour market integration approaches about their employment and training needs and requirements.

**Beneficiaries**

- **Migrant organisations** involved in labour market integration approaches, should ensure that they are well aware and have a better understanding of the position of employers and take the situation of employers into account. Good communication between both parties should lead to a better mutual understanding.

---

5.3.5 Staff skills

Staff (e.g. job coaches, trainers, mentors) plays a key role in helping third country migrants in the process of seeking, finding and keeping a job, as indicated by several case studies. Therefore the professional development of staff is a vital determinant of the quality of the approach. Helping third country migrants finding or keeping a job requires a high number of specific competences, especially considering the need for an integrated and targeted approach (as discussed in the previous sections). Besides being an expert (on the labour market and content specific knowledge for job related training) and being able to deploy a wide number of approaches that help migrants getting a job, staff often have to possess some specific competences in relation to the target group. First of all staff has to deal with heterogeneity, a wide variety of third country migrants each having different backgrounds like educational level; social origin/family background/social class/social milieus; earned income; male/female; age/generations; employed/non-employed; ethnic origins; urban/rural areas. Each of these target groups have specific needs or barriers they face. As a result, staff needs to assess the needs and prior experiences of the specific group they are dealing with. Third country migrants take with them a large amount of (life) experiences, outcomes of informal learning processes etc. In addition to the specific needs of target groups, measures for integrating migrants into the labour market differ also considerably, between target groups, because each target group faces other barriers. Staff has to select and combine the right measures or instruments. Therefore, it is considered desirable that the third country migrant is placed at the centre, both when designing reintegration programmes and when determining their outcomes. The emphasis is not only on providing training for the labour market, but also on focusing on the broader concept, which involves paying attention to the well-being social context, motivation, and transformation, instead of formation of the individual. Aspects to take into account are, for instance, providing a safe and suitable working / learning environment, reinforcing positive attitudes toward the migrant potential for success, and encouraging independent study skills. In addition, it is recommended that several measures are used throughout the intervention, if possible, with the purpose of catering to the needs of third country migrants and enhancing their progress. Moreover, empowering and motivating third country migrants is relevant.

- Attention should be given to the profile of staff members in terms of educational level and previous training, experience in working with the target group, gender and cultural background. Special attention should be given to additional competences for assessing the needs of third country migrants and employers and to match them.
- Specific training programs should be developed for those people helping third country migrant gaining access to employment and assisting them in their professional development later on in their careers.
- To be able to fully employ a personal, intensive and case-like style of working, strong commitment on behalf of the staff should be asked for.
- For the recruitment of staff, cooperation should be sought with migrant organisations
- It is recommended that (at least part of) the staff has an immigrant background themselves (role models).

**Case example: Staff skills**

The personal approach and staff skills highly contribute to the success of the Dutch ‘Samen Werken in Kleur’ approach. Staff members are experienced, highly competent, motivated (available day and night), actively involve the family background of participants and have an immigrant background themselves. As stated earlier this approach succeeds to obtain very high sustainable job placement scores of 90 percent.
**Recommendations for different actors**

**Government and politics**

- The EU and national governments should define the set of competences needed to work in approaches for labour market integration of migrants.

- National and regional governments should ensure that those responsible for implementing and carrying out the approaches are well-trained, committed and professional. (by developing quality certificates and standards)

- For example, local governments should implement train-the-trainer programs to professionalize staff involved in labour market integration approaches. In Spain for example, the mediators carrying out the approach, are educated at the 'school of intercultural and social mediation of Valencia.

**Actors implementing labour market measures**

- Project executors should implement specific measure to recruit high qualified staff and continuously develop them throughout their career (CPD trajectories). For recruiting staff, cooperation should be sought with migrant organisations to recruit staff with a migrant background. Also staff themselves are responsible for their own development and a set of key competences could be used for self assessment and evaluation, selection of training courses and peer learning activities.

- Staff members should be prepared to employ an intensive, individualized style of working. In the approach in the Netherlands, this was ensured by explicitly including this preparedness in the recruitment criteria for new staff.

**Beneficiaries**

- Migrant organisations should develop recruitment strategies among their migrant population, to be able to come out with staff member candidates with a migrant background who could work within labour market integration approaches.

### 5.3.6 Outreach strategy

Certain groups of migrants, such as women or refugees, might be difficult to reach. Reasons for this are a lack of motivation, background characteristics that impede them to search for employment (such as the family background) or the absence of the structural arrangement needed to reach hard-to-reach target groups (such as cooperation with the migrant community organisations). For example, there might be some reluctance among certain ethnic groups to engage in 'mainstream' employment services for a variety of reasons including cultural factors or a lack of confidence in government agencies. For a sustainable and exhaustive improvement of the labour market integration of third country migrants, the recruitment of hard-to-reach groups of migrants for labour market activation measures is essential but carries a great challenge. To recruit these groups:
There should be cooperation with (voluntary) migrant or refugee organisations or for example mosques to recruit potential hard-to-reach participants. Involving the family situation (e.g. a tailored approach) is also valuable.

The state of social security in a country should be taken into account when developing the strategy for recruitment. In countries with a generous social security system, more attention should be given to the recruitment of participants, because there might be less necessity to integrate into the labour market, while in countries with less social security the economic necessity to work is stronger and thus recruitment of participants will be easier.

**Case example: recruitment by working together with migrants**

In the UK Operational Framework for Refugees, the Jobcentre network has sought to establish strong partnerships with refugee and community organisations and sometimes worked through outreach workers with an ethnic minority background. This increases the level of communication, interaction and engagement between Jobcentres and the voluntary sector at the local level, which improves reaching the hard-to-reach target groups. Moreover, support to these groups is provided earlier on that had previously been the case.

**Recommendations for different actors**

**Government and politics**

- The *EU* should disseminate knowledge on good practices of partnerships with migrant organisations in the process of reaching migrants to recruit them for labour market integration approaches.

- *National and regional governments* should provide funding to and work together with voluntary and community migrant organisations to actively involve them in the process of recruiting migrants for labour market integration approaches. In the Dutch approach, for example, recruitment of participants takes place through migrant voluntary organisations, mosques and other communal places.

**Actors implementing labour market measures**

- *Employers* should review their own recruitment practices and assess how they could be adjusted to provide more opportunities to migrants and how they can better reach migrants.

- *Public Employment Services* should be aware of the fact that certain groups are reluctant to engage in mainstream employment services and should therefore be receptive to other ways of recruiting migrants for employment activation measures and to working together with (voluntary) migrant organisations. A good example of partnership working between migrant organisations and public employment services comes from the UK, where the public employment services established strong partnerships with refugee and community organisations from the voluntary and NGO sectors in order to target ‘harder to reach’ groups more effectively.
NGO’s should play an important role in the process of recruiting migrants for labour market integration measures, as they can play an intermediary role between employers and public employment services on the one hand and migrant organisations on the other hand. Therefore, NGO’s should also be stimulated to do so, for example by including this in government policy on subsidies for NGO’s.

**Beneficiaries**

- *Migrant (voluntary) community organisations* should be prepared to work together with other actors and to stimulate their people to take part in labour market integration measures.

### 5.4 To conclude: Mainstreaming and dissemination

The study has triggered an intensive and stimulating professional debate and allowed to gain insight into effective and successful ways of addressing the barriers that migrants face in gaining access to employment. Moreover, this final chapter provided concrete recommendations into who should take the necessary actions to improve the labour market integration of third country migrants.

Now that we have seen so many and such a variety of cases and provided conclusions and recommendations on the effective mechanisms, it is important that these results are disseminated and mainstreamed in regular policy. Therefore, in this final section ideas on the dissemination and continuation of this study are provided.

- First, the research strengthened bonds within a partially existing professional network of experts who cooperated with us in the study. It should be worthwhile to organize a meeting with those who contributed to the cases and those who organised the project as this would tremendously enrich the data and our understanding of these practices. Such a meeting could be organized separately or integrated within a larger event, such as an IOM seminar.

- Second, in order to support activities addressing barriers that migrants face in gaining access to employment and identifying good practices and innovative approaches, it is important to be a role model in that respect. Organisers, decision makers and researchers in this area of work should all work together within a Community of actors in the field of migrants to work to exchange practices for labour market integration. It would be highly recommendable to use existing funds such as ESF and Networks (NCP’s and CLIP) as potential sources to stimulate the working of such a community.

- Third, the results of the study should be spread amongst policy makers and project developers around Europe through publication of the report on websites, the publication of a policy brief or brochure with practical recommendations for successful approaches and using the results in a Commission’s Communication.

- Fourth, it is highly recommended to stimulate the development and execution of pilot projects, based on the effective mechanisms identified in this study. This will provide evidence for the assumptions made in this study and could, in case of success, convince actors at different levels to invest in such projects.

- Fifth, dissemination of good practices should be an ongoing process. For this, thorough evaluation is essential. Therefore, the EU should promote the evaluation of approaches by ensuring that evaluation plans are built into program funding arrangements and
should continue to promote learning between Member States about good practices. The same holds true for national and local governments. They should make evaluation a condition of funding provided to projects and approaches. Finally, project executors should take migrants’ view of the service they received into account when evaluating an approach, as they are the ‘end-users’ of the approach.
Annex 1 The research team and country experts

The research team
Douwe Grijpstra (Research voor Beleid, project supervisor)
Bert-Jan Buiskool (RvB, project manager)
Bram Frouws (RvB, researcher)
Suzanne de Visser (RvB, researcher)

Advisors
The research team was supported by two advisors from IMISCOE.
Rinus Penninx (IMISCOE, advisor)
Karen Kraal (IMISCOE, advisor)

The country experts
Almost all country experts involved in this study are member of the IMISCOE network. IMISCOE, formerly known as the IMISCOE Network of Excellence, unites over 500 researchers from all European countries under the themes of international migration, integration and social cohesion. IMISCOE provides a unique infrastructure for migration researchers to jointly develop innovative research programmes and publish the results of their research, to promote high-quality training for PhD students and to offer worldwide access to a wide variety of migration research, data and expertise. IMISCOE not only targets academic colleagues, but also acknowledges that policymakers, the media and the public at large are all key players in the dissemination of knowledge.
For more information on IMISCOE, we would like to refer to the web page: http://www.imiscoe.org/

Overview of countries and experts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Countries</th>
<th>Experts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>Ursula Reeger</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>Eugenia Markova</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>Jørgen Goul Andersen &amp; Karen Breidahl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>Ervin Trofimov</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>Sandro Cattacin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>Aleksandra Maatsch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>Endre Sik</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>Salvatore Strozza</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Netherlands</td>
<td>Douwe Grijpstra &amp; Bram Frouws</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>Marek Okólski</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>Sonia Pereira</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>Juan Antonio Cebrián</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>Ali B. Najib</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>Sandro Cattacin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>Mark Whittle (CSES)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Contact person for the European Commission
Dr. Torsten G. Christen
European Commission
DG Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities
D/2: European Employment Strategy, CSR, Local Development
Hintergrund der Studie


Auf EU- wie auf nationaler Ebene müssen politische Entscheidungsträger, öffentliche Institutionen, Unternehmen und Nichtregierungsorganisationen Methoden und Ergebnisse der Forschung heranziehen, um effektive Integrationsansätze zu identifizieren und somit die wirksame Integration von Migranten aus Drittstaaten zu ermöglichen. Die Europäische Kommission entschied sich daher, eine Studie in Auftrag zu geben, die innovative Lösungsansätze zur erfolgreichen Arbeitsmarktintegration von Migranten aus Drittstaaten identifizieren sollte.

**Ziel der Studie und Forschungsfragen**

Ziel der Studie:

- Identifizierung der Barrieren, mit denen sich Migranten aus Drittstaaten bei der Arbeitssuche konfrontiert sehen
- Untersuchung innovativer und praktischer Methoden, die zur verbesserten Arbeitsmarktintegration von Migranten aus Drittstaaten beitragen können (aus sozio-ökonomischer Sicht)

Die wichtigsten Forschungsfragen in diesem Zusammenhang:

- Was sind die typischen Charakteristika von Migranten aus Drittstaaten - in Bezug auf demografische Hintergründe, sozio-ökonomischer Status, Qualifikationsnachweise, berufliche Stellung etc.?
- Mit welchen Barrieren haben Migranten aus Drittstaaten bei dem Versuch Zugang zum Arbeitsmarkt zu erlangen zu kämpfen, und in welchem Ausmaß verursachen diese Schranken Arbeitslosigkeit und Inaktivität?
- Welche innovativen und praktischen Methoden (wirtschaftlicher und sozialer Art) sind zur Verbesserung der Arbeitsmarktintegration von Migranten bekannt, und wie können durch diese Methoden die bereits identifizierten Hindernisse überwunden werden?
- Wie und unter welchen Bedingungen können diese Lösungsansätze auf andere Migranten- und andere Situationen und in einem anderen Kontext angewandt werden?


Bevor wir uns näher mit der besagten Studie befassen, möchten wir zunächst den Begriff „Migranten aus Drittstaaten“ in der nachfolgenden Textbox definieren.

---

Identifizierung der Barrieren, mit denen sich Migranten aus Drittstaaten bei der Arbeitssuche konfrontiert sehen

Untersuchung innovativer und praktischer Methoden, die zur verbesserten Arbeitsmarktintegration von Migranten aus Drittstaaten beitragen können (aus sozio-ökonomischer Sicht)
Migranten aus Drittstaaten

Die Gesamtbevölkerung der EU kann, basierend auf dem Geburtsort, in drei Hauptgruppen eingeteilt werden¹:

- Einheimische – d. h. diejenigen, die in dem Mitgliedsstaat geboren wurden, in dem sie wohnen
- In der EU geborene Personen – d. h. diejenigen, die in einem EU-Mitgliedsstaat geboren wurden, aber in einem anderen EU-Land leben;
- Nicht in der EU geborene Personen – d. h. Personen aus Drittstaaten.

Obwohl die letzten beiden Gruppen unter die Kategorie „Im Ausland geboren“ fallen, können hier unterschiedliche Wohn- und Arbeitsrechte gelten und somit stellen sich für die jeweilige Gruppe auch abweichende Erfolge auf dem Arbeitsmarkt ein². In dieser Studie konzentrieren wir uns auf Immigranten aus Nicht-EU-Ländern (nachstehend bezeichnet als „Außerhalb der EU geborene Personen“ oder „Migranten aus Drittstaaten“).

Forschungsmethoden

Die Ziele dieser Studie stehen in Zusammenhang mit drei aufeinanderfolgenden Schritten, die zwischen Januar und November 2009 unternommen wurden. Hierbei wurde bei jedem Schritt der Fokus detailliert auf individuelle Lösungsansätze gerichtet, die die Arbeitsmarktinintegration von Migranten aus Drittstaaten verbessern sollen. Im Rahmen der Studie arbeiteten wir mit Experten für Migrationsthemen zusammen – Mitglieder des EU-Exzellenznetzwerks IMISCOE, die für die Durchführung der Studie in den jeweiligen Ländern sowie für ausführliche Analysen und Fallstudien verantwortlich zeichneten, und die beim Expertentreffen anwesend waren.

- In der Anfangsphase begannen wir unsere Forschung mit einem Überblick über Migranten aus Drittstaaten in Europa und ihre Hintergrundmerkmale sowie einem Überblick über die größten Hindernisse, mit denen Migranten bezüglich ihrer Integration in den Arbeitsmarkt zu kämpfen haben (basierend auf einer umfangreichen Literaturrecherche).


- In der letzten Phase, der tiefer gehenden Detailphase, fokussierten wir unsere Studie auf 15 innovative Lösungsansätze, um Best-Practice-Beispiele für die erfolgreiche Integration von Migranten in den Arbeitsmarkt zu identifizieren.

² Das Konzept über Migranten, die im Ausland geboren wurden, vermittelt ein umfangreicheres Bild, da hierbei auch die eingebürgerten Migranten aus Drittstaaten berücksichtigt werden. Diese Forschungen konzentrieren sich bei der Analyse der Migrantenbevölkerung auf Migranten, die im Ausland geboren wurden, im Gegensatz zu ausländischen Staatsangehörigen.
Ergebnisse der Studie

Wichtigste Schlussfolgerungen bezüglich der Arbeitsmarktsituation von Migranten aus Drittstaaten

- Die Wirtschaftskrise hat starke Auswirkungen auf die europäischen Arbeitsmärkte. Die meisten Länderberichte weisen in die gleiche Richtung in Bezug auf die Auswirkungen, die die Krise auf Migranten aus Drittstaaten haben wird: Da die Migranten im Durchschnitt zur jüngeren Bevölkerung zählen, häufiger Tätigkeiten in Zeitarbeit verrichten und in Bereichen arbeiten, die besonders empfindlich auf die Auswirkungen der derzeitigen Wirtschaftskrise reagieren, wird sich ihre Situation in naher Zukunft noch verschlechtern.

- Ungeachtet der besagten Krisenauswirkungen auf den Arbeitsmarkt werden die demografischen Entwicklungen auf lange Sicht jedoch zu einem Mangel an Arbeitskräften führen.

- Diese Entwicklungen – obwohl aus anderer Perspektive betrachtet – machen die Arbeitsmarktintegration von Migranten aus Drittstaaten dringend erforderlich.

Wichtigste Schlussfolgerungen bezüglich der Barrieren, mit denen Migranten aus Drittstaaten konfrontiert werden

- Mangelnde Sprachkenntnisse stellen ein ernstzunehmendes Hindernis in den meisten Ländern dar, wobei dieser Mangel natürlich nicht das einzige Problem ist. Obwohl Sprachschulungen in den meisten EU-Ländern angeboten werden, fehlen in manchen Ländern die Kapazitäten, um das notwendige Sprachtraining durchzuführen oder aber die Verfahren sind zu komplex.


- Die Nichtanerkennung von beruflichen Qualifikationen wurde in fast allen Ländern als Hindernis identifiziert. In vielen Ländern werden Maßnahmen eingesetzt, die Migranten beim Anerkennungsprozess ausländischer Qualifikationsnachweise helfen sollen; dennoch handelt es sich hierbei um eine Barriere, die die erfolgreiche Arbeitsmarktintegration von Migranten aus Drittländern erschwert.


- Ein begrenztes soziales und professionelles Netzwerk wird in einigen Ländern als Hindernis bei der Arbeitsmarktintegration identifiziert. Erfolgreiche Netzwerke können
zur erfolgreichen Arbeitsplatzfindung beitragen. Ethnisch homogene Netzwerke können jedoch die Integration in den Arbeitsmarkt auch erschweren.

- In den meisten Ländern wird ** Diskriminierung** als ein Haupthindernis identifiziert, das Migranten aus Drittstaaten den Einstieg in den Arbeitsmarkt bzw. den beruflichen Aufstieg erschwert. Diskriminierung kann unterbunden werden, indem das Augenmerk nicht nur auf offensichtlich diskriminierende Verhaltensweisen gelegt wird, sondern speziell auch darauf geachtet wird, dass sich negative Grundhaltungen nicht festigen, dass das Image von Immigranten nicht negativ behaftet ist und dass Migration aus positiver Perspektive beleuchtet wird.

- **Schlechte Arbeitsbedingungen** zählen in einigen Ländern zu den größten Hindernissen in Bezug auf eine erfolgreiche Arbeitsmarktinintegration. Migranten müssen sich häufig ausbeuterischen Arbeitsbedingungen unterwerfen.


- Auch Angelegenheiten im Zusammenhang mit dem **sozialen Umfeld** (Nachbarschaft, Gesundheitsfürsorge) können eine Barriere bei der Arbeitsmarktinintegration darstellen.

**Wichtigste Schlussfolgerungen in Bezug auf Lösungsansätze, die diese Barrieren bekämpfen können**

Im Rahmen dieser Studie wurden zahlreiche Lösungsansätze und -instrumente identifiziert, die angewandt werden könnten, um die oben aufgeführten Barrieren zu überwinden.

Auch auf Beratung und Beistand sollte Wert gelegt werden – sowohl was Arbeitsmarktaspekte als auch andere Gesichtspunkte angeht (Rechtsbeistand, Gesundheitsfürsorge, Unterkunft). Werden letztere Aspekte berücksichtigt, ist vermutlich auch die Integration in den Arbeitsmarkt nicht mehr ganz so problematisch. Auch sollte die Integration in dem Maße erfolgen, dass Migranten letztendlich ihre berufliche Situation selbst unter Kontrolle haben und unabhängig werden können („Hilfe zur Selbsthilfe“). In Österreich wurden Beratung und Beistand in diesem Format bereits umgesetzt. Teilnehmer an Beratungsprogrammen erhalten nicht nur Beistand, sondern sind nach Abschluss des Programms in der Lage, ihre Beschäftigungslage einzuschätzen und selbst in die Hand zu nehmen. Österreichische Berufsinformationszentren beraten und stellen alle zur Arbeitsplatzbeschaffung notwendigen Informationen zur Verfügung; im Rahmen dieser Beratung zeichnen Migranten jedoch selbst verantwortlich dafür, ihre Berufsziele zu erreichen.


Praktika und Networking können ein positives, stimulierendes und arbeitsmarktorientiertes Umfeld für Migranten schaffen. Um Praktika effektiv zu gestalten und die Motivation von Praktikanten beizubehalten, sollte nach dem Praktikum auch die realistische Möglichkeit bestehen, fest angestellt zu werden. Außerdem erhöht Networking – aufgrund des informellen Rekrutierungsprozesses – die Chance, einen Arbeitsplatz zu finden. Dabei sollte allerdings sichergestellt werden, dass diese Netzwerke ethnisch hetero-

Ein kontextueller Lösungsansatz (der z. B. gezielt auf eine bestimmte Gegend oder Umgebung ausgerichtet ist) sollte aus einem Gesamtpaket mit integrierten Begleitmaßnahmen bestehen. Zudem sollten mögliche Nebeneffekte berücksichtigt werden, da ein Lösungsansatz, der sich beispielsweise auf eine bestimmte Wohngegend konzentriert, die Einwohner dieser Gegend stigmatisieren und zur Diskriminierung gegen sie führen könnte. In Frankreich wendet die Regierung eine globale Strategie an, um die Situation in den Vororten, den sogenannten „Banlieues“, zu verbessern. Diese Strategie umfasst nicht nur Arbeitsplatzschaffung, sondern auch andere Anreize, z. B. Gesundheitsfürsorge, Fortbildung und Zugang zu öffentlichen Verkehrsmitteln; Firmen, die sich in den „Banlieues“ ansiedeln, müssen z. B. keine Steuern bezahlen.


**Effektive Mechanismen**

In dieser Studie wurden sechs elementare Instrumente identifiziert, die genutzt werden können – und sollten –, um eine umfassende und effektive Methode für die erfolgreiche Arbeitsmarktinintegration von Migranten aus Drittstaaten zu entwickeln.

**Integrative Vorgehensweise**

Oft sind mehrere Barrieren vorhanden, die einander ergänzen. Daher sollte sich die Vorgehensweise immer auf mehrere Hindernisse und somit auf mehrere Instrumente zur Überwindung dieser Hindernisse konzentrieren. Wie sich gezeigt hat, ist dies bei den Lösungsansätzen, die in den 15 europäischen Ländern identifiziert wurden, oft nicht der Fall. Zu den Hauptgründen, dass integrative Lösungsansätze relativ selten angewandt werden, zählen sicherlich die Kosten; außerdem erfordern integrative Lösungsansätze großen Einsatz und Engagement vonseiten des Personals, das für die Durchführung dieser Vorgehensweisen verantwortlich ist; und nicht zuletzt sind vermutlich auch die politischen und administrativen Abkommen derart geregelt, dass die verschiedenen staatlichen Stellen eher separat und isoliert arbeiten, anstatt gemeinsam an einem integrieren Lösungsansatz zu arbeiten.


Gleichzeitig sollten auch die nationalen Regierungen Ressourcen zur Verfügung stellen und allumfassende politische Rahmenbedingungen für kommunale Dienstleistungen ausarbeiten, die die Entwicklung von integrativen Lösungsansätzen auf lange Sicht ermöglichen. Auf diese Weise wird gewährleistet, dass erfolgreiche zeitlich begrenzte und projektbasierte Initiativen als langfristige, nachhaltige Lösungsansätze fortgeführt werden.

Öffentliche Arbeitsvermittlungsstellen sollten verschiedene essenzielle Elemente oder Lösungsansätze kombinieren, anstatt sich auf einseitige Lösungen zu konzentrieren. Bei einseitigen Lösungsansätzen wird beispielsweise in ein Ausbildungsprogramm investiert, aber kein Arbeitsplatz bereitgestellt, wodurch das realitätsbezogene Lernen am Arbeitsplatz vernachlässigt wird.

Der maßgeschneiderte Lösungsansatz


- Die EU und nationale Regierungen sollten ein besonderes Augenmerk auf die Arbeitsmarktintegration von Migranten aus Drittstaaten richten und dabei abwägen, ob die Änderung von Richtlinien notwendig ist, um Lösungsansätze zu fördern, die auf die Bedürfnisse von Migranten zugeschnitten sind. Länder, die derzeit eine generische, nicht-zielgerichtete Arbeitsmarktpolitik vertreten, sollte eine zielgerichtete Politik in Erwägung ziehen, die die Arbeitsmarktintegration und gezielt auf Migranten ausgerichtete Lösungsansätze ermöglicht.
- Während der Anfangsphase empfehlen sich gezielte Vorgehensweisen, so z. B. intensive, maßgeschneiderte Bearbeitung von individuellen Fällen; wobei dieses System während der gesamten Dauer des Lösungswegs (Entwicklung, Implementierung und Evaluierung) beibehalten werden und auch Migrantenorganisationen einbeziehen muss. Außerdem sollten öffentliche Arbeitsvermittlungseinrichtungen effektiver mit Migranten kommunizieren und ihre Dienstleistungen besser auf die spezifischen Bedürfnisse von Migranten, die Zugang zum Arbeitsmarkt erhalten möchten, abstimmen.

**Partnerschaften und Einbindung von Interessenvertretern**


Die EU sollte Förderprogramme wie ESF und/oder Geldmittel für die europäische Reintegration nutzen, um partnerschaftliche Kooperationen zu unterstützen und gemäß der „EU 2020“-Strategie die Wechselbeziehungen zwischen den verschiedenen Regierungsebenen (EU, Mitgliedsstaaten, Landesregierung, Sozialpartner etc.) zu fördern.

Nationale Regierungen und regionale Behörden sollten dabei helfen, die jeweiligen Akteure (Regierungsstellen) auf staatlicher Ebene zusammenzubringen, um zu gewährleisten, dass Richtlinien und Verwaltungssysteme korrekt integriert werden und nicht miteinander in Konflikt stehen oder separat agieren. Außerdem sollte die Kooperation zwischen Institutionen und Organisationen auf lokaler Betriebsbene angeregt werden.

Einbindung von Arbeitgebern

Die Einbindung von Arbeitgebern ist für einen erfolgreichen Lösungsansatz unerlässlich. Arbeitgeber sollten in die Entwicklung und Ausführung der Vorgehensweise involviert sein, um Projektmitarbeitern die Möglichkeit zu geben, die Inhalte eines Lösungsansatzes besser an die Bedürfnisse von Arbeitgebern anzupassen. Auf diese Weise steigt außerdem die Wahrscheinlichkeit, dass Migranten zu einem Vorstellungsgespräch eingeladen werden oder dass ihnen eine Praktikantenstelle angeboten wird.


Die Europäische Union sollte mit dem Europäischen Gewerkschaftsbund (EGB) sowie BUSINESSEUROPE zusammenarbeiten, um die Einbindung von Arbeitgeberorganisationen und Gewerkschaften auf nationaler Ebene zu fördern. Außerdem sollten sowohl die EU als auch nationale Regierungen das Konzept der unternehmerischen Sozialverantwortung in Bezug auf Personalmanagement fördern.

Nationale Regierungen sollten aus höherer Ebene Unterstützung für die Einbindung von Arbeitgebern initiieren und anbieten; wobei man nicht aus den Augen verlieren sollte, dass die besten Fortschritte durch lokale Initiation und lokale Eigenverantwortung gemacht werden können. Ein Gleichgewicht zwischen „Top-down“- und „Top-up“-Ansätzen sollte daher sichergestellt werden.

Berufliche Fortbildung von Fachpersonal

Hierfür sind Arbeitsmarktexperten gefragt – d. h. Fachpersonal, das viele verschiedene Lösungsstrategien einsetzen kann; Personal, das weiß, mit Heterogenität umzugehen und in der Lage ist, die Bedürfnisse und Vorkenntnisse seiner Zielgruppe einzuschätzen und das letztendlich die richtigen Maßnahmen und Hilfsmittel zu wählen und kombiniert. Es ist zudem wichtig, Migranten zu motivieren und ihnen Hilfe zur Selbsthilfe zu geben. Es ist außerdem hilfreich, wenn zumindest ein Teil des Personals einen Migrationshintergrund hat (Vorbildcharakter). Kurz gesagt: Es ist essenziell, für diese Aufgabe Mitarbeiter mit geeignetem Profil zu betrauen.


Die EU sowie die nationalen Regierungen sollten Kompetenzschemata entwickeln, um zu definieren, über welche Art von Kompetenzen Fachpersonal verfügen muss, um im Rahmen von Lösungsstrategien an der ArbeitsmarktinTEGRATION von Migranten beizutragen. Gefördert werden sollte außerdem die Entwicklung einer Qualifikationsstruktur für Fachpersonal, das mit spezifischen Zielgruppen an der Beschaffung von Arbeitsplätzen arbeitet.

**Outreach-Strategie**

Hilfsangebote für manche Migrantengruppen, so z. B. Frauen oder Flüchtlinge, können sich eventuell schwierig gestalten. Der Grund dafür ist, dass diesen Gruppen oft die Motivation fehlt oder dass Migranten aus diesen Gruppen von Hintergrundmerkmalen (z. B. familiärer Hintergrund) geprägt sind, die sie an der Arbeitssuche hindern. Oft fehlen auch strukturelle Vereinbarungen (so z. B. eine Kooperation mit Migrantenorganisationen), die notwendig sind, um eben diese schwer erreichbaren Zielgruppen anzusprechen.

Um eine nachhaltige Verbesserung der Arbeitsmarktintegration von Migranten aus Drittstaaten zu erreichen und alle Verbesserungsmöglichkeiten auszuschöpfen, ist die Rekrutierung von schwer erreichbaren Migrantengruppen für Arbeitsmarktaktivierungsmaßnahmen unerlässlich – und gleichzeitig eine große Herausforderung. Um alle Migrantengruppen aus Drittstaaten effektiv zu erreichen, sollte eine Kooperation mit (freiwilligen) Migranten- oder Flüchtlingsorganisationen stattfinden. Auch die Teilnahme an sozialen Netzwerken oder beispielsweise die Nutzung von Moscheen als Rekrutierungsstellen für potenziell schwer erreichbare Migranten ist hier denkbar.


Die EU sollte Best-Practice-Beispiele von funktionierenden Partnerschaften mit Migrantenorganisationen, die Migranten für die Integration in den Arbeitsmarkt rekrutieren, weiterleiten.

Nationale Regierungen und regionale Behörden sollten mit freiwilligen und kommunalen Migrantenorganisationen zusammenarbeiten, diese finanziell unterstützen und sie aktiv in den Rekrutierungsprozess von Migranten in den Arbeitsmarkt einbinden.

Rapport de gestion

Contexte de l’étude

« Les sociétés européennes vieillissent tandis que les besoins en main-d’œuvre du marché augmentent. » C’est avec cette notion en tête que nous avons débuté cette étude visant à trouver des approches innovantes permettant de parvenir à intégrer les immigrés des pays tiers au marché du travail. En effet, il y a peu de temps, de nombreux pays étaient à la recherche de populations immigrées afin de faire face au déficit de main-d’œuvre et aux prévisions de diminution de la population active en raison du vieillissement. La crise économique a pourtant interrompu cette tendance, entraînant une hausse du chômage. La position sur le marché du travail des immigrés venus de pays tiers est particulièrement vulnérable lorsque l’activité économique est en baisse. Aussi, l’intégration de cette tranche de la population sur le marché de l’emploi reste un sujet essentiel pour l’Europe, particulièrement pour éviter qu’elle soit la plus touchée par la récession.

Les données statistiques montrent que dans de nombreux États membres, la situation professionnelle des immigrés venus de pays tiers est pire que celle des populations non immigrées. Leurs taux d’emploi a en effet tendance à être bien inférieur à celui des ressortissants de l’UE et ils sont plus susceptibles d’être recrutés à des postes pour lesquels ils sont surqualifiés. La participation au marché du travail est très importante pour intégrer les immigrés de pays tiers dans leur pays d’accueil. Une participation active sur le marché de l’emploi permet de nouer des contacts avec les nationaux et un positionnement indépendant au sein de la société. Toutefois, pour accéder au marché du travail, les immigrés des pays tiers doivent surmonter certaines barrières qui les désavantagent par rapport aux natifs.


Afin de réussir l’intégration des immigrés des pays tiers, les décisionnaires européens et nationaux, les organismes publics, les entreprises et les organisations non-Gouvernementales doivent s’inspirer des recherches réalisées afin d’opter pour des approches efficaces menant à l’intégration. Par conséquent, la Commission européenne a décidé de sous-traiter une étude d’identification des approches innovantes qui permettront d’intégrer avec succès les immigrés des pays tiers sur le marché du travail.
Objectif et questions de l’étude

L’objectif de cette étude était de :

- Identifier les barrières auxquelles les immigrés de pays tiers peuvent être confrontés lorsqu’ils recherchent un emploi
- Examinier les manières innovantes et pratiques d’améliorer l’intégration économique et sociale des immigrés de pays tiers sur le marché de l’emploi.

Les principales questions de l’étude étaient les suivantes :

- Comment les immigrés venus de pays tiers se caractérisent-ils dans les différents pays de l’Union européenne en termes de données démographiques, de statuts socio-économiques, de qualifications, de statuts professionnels,… ?
- Quelles sont les barrières que les immigrés de pays tiers rencontrent pour accéder à l’emploi et à quel point ces barrières entraînent-elles un taux chômage et d’inactivité important au sein de cette tranche de la population ?
- Quelles sont les manières innovantes et pratiques connues qui permettent d’améliorer l’intégration sociale et économique des immigrés de pays tiers sur le marché du travail et comment ces solutions permettent-elles d’aborder les barrières identifiées ?
- Comment et sous quelles conditions ces approches peuvent-elles être élargies à d’autres groupes d’immigrés originaires de pays tiers, d’autres situations et d’autres contextes ?

Les résultats de cette étude ont permis de comprendre clairement la manière d’améliorer la situation des immigrés de pays tiers sur le marché du travail et d’utiliser de manière plus efficace cette tranche de la population en tant que ressource pour le marché de l’emploi. Sachant cela, les décisionnaires devraient être à même de développer des projets pour améliorer l’intégration de ces personnes sur le marché du travail.

Avant de poursuivre, veuillez trouver ci-dessous la définition du terme immigré de pays tiers tel qu’employé dans cette étude.

Immigrés de pays tiers
La population totale résidant dans l’Union européenne peut être divisée en trois groupes principaux qui sont fonction du lieu de naissance1.

- Les natifs : ceux nés dans l’État membre de résidence ;
- Les natifs d’origine européenne : ceux nés dans un autre État membre que celui de résidence ;
- Les natifs d’origine non européennes : ceux nés hors de l’UE (pays tiers).

Les deux derniers groupes, bien qu’ils soient tous deux « d’origine étrangère », peuvent avoir des droits de résidence et des droits sur le marché de l’emploi différents et peuvent diverger également en termes de résultats d’embauche 2. Dans cette étude, nous nous intéressons aux immigrés issus des pays situés hors de l’UE (désignés ci-après sous le terme de « natifs d’origine non européenne » ou « immigrés de pays tiers »).

2 Le concept « d’origine étrangère » fournit une image plus complète en comprenant les ressortissants naturalisés originaires de pays tiers. De plus, ce concept est en accord avec la plupart de la documentation et des recherches publiées récemment sur l’immigration qui favorisent, dans le cadre de l’analyse des populations immigrées, une approche fondée sur le concept « d’origine étrangère » plutôt que celui de « ressortissants étrangers ».
**Méthodes de recherche**

L’objectif de cette étude peut être lié à trois étapes successives entreprises entre janvier et novembre 2009. À chaque étape, nous nous sommes intéressés plus en détail à des approches différentes visant à améliorer l’intégration des immigrés de pays tiers sur le marché du travail. Pour mener à bien cette étude, nous avons travaillé avec une équipe d’experts thématiques nationaux en provenance de toute l’Europe et membres du réseau IMISCOE. Ces spécialistes étaient chargés d’effectuer des études de cas approfondies dans leur pays et d’assister à une réunion d’experts.

- Pour ce qui est de la **phase initiale**, en nous basant sur une recherche documentaire importante, nous avons commencé la recherche en présentant les immigrés de pays tiers en Europe, leurs caractéristiques d’origine et les principales barrières auxquelles ils sont confrontés en matière d’intégration sur le marché de l’emploi.
- Au cours de la **phase intermédiaire**, nous nous sommes intéressés à 15 pays dans lesquels les experts nationaux avaient recueilli plus d’informations concernant la situation particulière des immigrés originaires de pays tiers, les barrières auxquelles ils sont confrontés ; puis nous avons établi un inventaire des approches pratiques et innovantes. Les résultats ont fait l’objet d’une discussion lors d’une réunion d’experts qui s’est tenue aux Pays-Bas.
- Durant la **phase finale d’approfondissement**, nous avons concentré notre étude sur 15 approches innovantes d’identification des meilleures pratiques permettant de mener à une intégration réussie des immigrés sur le marché du travail.

**Résultats de l’étude**

**Principales conclusions sur la situation d’emploi des immigrés originaires de pays tiers**

- La crise économique touche profondément les marchés de l’emploi européens. La plupart des rapports nationaux pointent dans la même direction pour ce qui est de l’impact que la crise aura sur les immigrés de pays tiers : Dans la mesure où ils sont en moyenne plus jeunes, occupent plus souvent des postes temporaires dans des secteurs particulièrement sensibles aux effets de la crise actuelle, la situation professionnelle des populations immigrées originaires de pays tiers va se détériorer à court terme.
- Toutefois, malgré les effets de la crise économique sur le marché du travail, les tendances démographiques vont entraîner à long terme un manque d’effectifs sur le marché de l’emploi.
- Ces tendances, d’un autre point de vue, appellent donc à l’intégration professionnelle des immigrés venus de pays tiers.

**Principales conclusions sur les barrières auxquelles sont confrontés les immigrés de pays tiers**

- Les barrières sont fortement liées entre elles, se recoupent et se renforcent souvent les unes les autres. Il existe souvent une interaction entre plusieurs d’entre elles. De ce fait, il est impossible d’identifier un obstacle plus important que les autres. Les approches doivent donc se concentrer sur plusieurs barrières. Vous trouverez ci-dessous une présentation de chaque obstacle.
- Le **manque de compétences linguistiques** constitue une barrière importante dans la plupart des pays même si ce n’est évidemment pas le seul obstacle. La formation lin-
guistique est un phénomène répandu à travers tous les pays mais la capacité de formation de certains États membres est insuffisante et les procédures parfois trop complexes.

- Le manque de formation professionnelle et éducative est clairement identifié comme une barrière dans la plupart des pays. Toutefois, être qualifié ne garantit pas l’obtention d’un poste à qualifications et à durée indéterminée. De nombreux immigrants diplômés rencontrent des difficultés pour accéder à des postes correspondant à leur niveau de compétences en raison de l’absence de reconnaissance des diplômes.

- L’incapacité à reconnaître les qualifications a été reconnue comme un obstacle dans la plupart des pays. Dans tous les États membres, des mesures sont en place pour aider les populations immigrées à faire reconnaître leurs qualifications mais cet obstacle continue à empêcher l’intégration professionnelle réussie des immigrants de pays tiers.

- Dans tous les pays, le manque de connaissances du marché de l’emploi a été reconnu comme un obstacle important. Ces connaissances (ou compétences) sont liées à trois étapes différentes du processus d’intégration au marché du travail. Les deux premières, la recherche d’un emploi et le dépôt de candidature, correspondent à l’entrée ou à l’accès au marché du travail. La troisième, qui concerne les performances de poste et la connaissance de la culture du travail, correspond aux possibilités d’évoluer ou de gravir des échelons.

- Un réseau socio-professionnel limité a également été identifié dans quelques pays comme un obstacle à l’intégration sur le marché du travail. Le fait de disposer de réseaux efficaces peut contribuer à trouver un emploi. Toutefois, les réseaux homogènes d’un point de vue ethnique peuvent également conduire à une entrave à l’intégration professionnelle.

- Dans la plupart des pays, la discrimination est identifiée comme un obstacle important qui empêche les immigrants de pays tiers d’entrer ou d’évoluer sur le marché de l’emploi. La discrimination peut être évitée non seulement en se concentrant sur les exemples de comportements réels mais également en se focalisant sur les attitudes envers les populations immigrées ainsi que sur les images que les natifs ont d’elles, en partant donc d’un point de vue positif.

- Les mauvaises conditions de travail sont identifiées également comme l’un des principaux obstacles à la réussite de l’intégration professionnelle dans certains pays où les immigrés sont enclins à des conditions d’exploitation.

- Le fait que dans la plupart des pays les demandeurs d’asile ne soient pas autorisés à travailler avant d’obtenir un statut a été identifié comme un obstacle dans plusieurs États membres. Parmi les autres obstacles contextuels identifiés figurent la complexité de la législation, le manque de capacité à fournir une formation linguistique et le manque de coordination entre les différents intervenants.

- Un système de sécurité sociale large pourrait représenter un obstacle à l’intégration professionnelle en raison d’un manque de subventions. Toutefois, en période de crise économique, un système de sécurité sociale faible ainsi qu’une mauvaise flexibilité (une flexicurité faible) peuvent représenter une barrière à l’intégration sur le marché de l’emploi. Dans les pays présentant un degré de flexicurité élevé, les taux de chômage ont beaucoup moins augmenté que dans les pays avec un niveau de flexicurité faible car ce phénomène permet de maintenir la flexibilité du marché et de diminuer l’exposition aux risques des employés. De plus, les entreprises recrutent de nouveaux employés bien plus rapidement lorsque l’économie reprend que dans d’autres États membres.

- Enfin, les questions liées à l’environnement social (le voisinage, l’accès aux soins) peuvent également constituer une barrière à l’intégration professionnelle.
Principales conclusions sur les approches de lutte contre ces obstacles
Cette étude a permis d’identifier une multitude d’approches et d’outils qui pourraient être utilisés pour surmonter les barrières décrites ci-dessus.

- **Les centres d’enseignement et de formation** doivent être axés sur différentes compétences, notamment les compétences linguistiques, professionnelles, interculturelles et sur la connaissance du marché de l’emploi et de la culture du travail. De plus, avant de se concentrer sur les compétences professionnelles et sectorielles requises, il est important que les qualifications de base (communication, compétences informatiques, déontologie du travail,...) soient appropriées car elles constituent des conditions préalables avant de passer à des aptitudes qui peuvent en partie être transmises via « un apprentissage sur le terrain ». L’approche étudiée en Italie visait à stabiliser l’emploi des populations immigrées venues de pays tiers et à transmettre des qualifications via la formation et l’enseignement. Cette approche combine avec succès ces deux notions ainsi que d’autres aspects tels que les stages, la coopération avec les différents intervenants (notamment avec les figures importantes de la communauté immigrée et des entreprises) ainsi que les actions de sensibilisation permettant de reconnaître que la formation ne permettra pas de résoudre à elle seule les problèmes.

- **Les services de conseil** doivent également occuper une place centrale à la fois sur le marché de l’emploi et dans d’autres secteurs (aspects juridiques, médicaux, logement) pour servir de base à l’intégration professionnelle. De plus, ces services doivent être développés de manière à ce que les immigrés puissent prendre en main leur propre situation professionnelle et devenir indépendants (« aider pour que l’autre puisse s’aider soi-même »). Les services de conseil sont définis par exemple de cette manière en Autriche. Les participants reçoivent des conseils qui leur permettent de prendre en main leur propre situation professionnelle. Au centre de recherche d’emploi, les populations immigrées sont responsables des étapes relatives à leur propre carrière et reçoivent des conseils et toutes les informations dont elles ont besoin pour trouver un emploi.

- **Le tutorat et le coaching** forment un outil efficace pour la recherche d’emploi mais celui-ci doit être élargi aux immigrés qui occupent déjà un poste afin d’augmenter leurs possibilités d’intégration durable sur le marché. L’approche étudiée en Espagne implique un service efficace de tutorat et de coaching. Les intervenants sont formés dans une école de médiation interculturelle et sociale. En outre, le service de coaching personnel et direct est assuré non seulement durant la phase de recherche d’emploi mais également dans le cadre d’un programme de tutorat à destination des participants qui ont trouvé un emploi dans le but de prévenir les démissions.

- **La gestion de la diversité** est également une autre manière de s’assurer de prêter une attention continue aux populations immigrées une fois qu’elles ont trouvé un emploi. Cette approche ne fonctionnera cependant pas si elle est motivée uniquement par la responsabilité sociale. Il faudrait donc aussi une proposition structurée pour permettre cette gestion de la diversité. Elle doit être intégrée au niveau de la direction et pas seulement au service des ressources humaines. C’est ce qu’IKEA a fait en Suède. La société a adopté des politiques de gestion de la diversité pour des raisons éthiques, législatives mais également économiques. La diversité est perçue comme un moyen de créer une atmosphère professionnelle plus stimulante qui apporte un avantage concurrentiel et élargit la base de recrutement.

- **La reconnaissance des qualifications et des diplômes** est un aspect important car de nombreux immigrés arrivent en Europe avec des qualifications et une expérience professionnelle suffisantes sans que ces dernières soient jugées à leur juste valeur sur le marché du travail. La meilleure façon de parvenir à une reconnaissance est d’établir des partenariats avec le secteur privé et de lier la reconnaissance des qualifications à une
formation supplémentaire. La Suisse est un bon exemple dans ce domaine. Le programme intégral de validation des acquis et des compétences Qualification+ prévoit une formation supplémentaire. Dans la mesure où le secteur privé fait confiance à ce système de validation des compétences, de nombreuses associations d’employeurs prennent part à ce programme.

Les stages et le réseautage sont de bons outils pour fournir aux immigrés un environnement stimulant et orienté vers le marché de l’emploi. Les stages doivent supposer une réelle possibilité d’embauche par la suite pour garantir leur efficacité et la motivation des participants. Parallèlement, le réseautage augmente la possibilité de trouver un emploi (en raison des processus de recrutement sans formalités). Il faut néanmoins s’assurer que ces réseaux soient hétérogènes d’un point de vue ethnique et qu’ils incluent les employeurs. L’Allemagne fournit un bon exemple de réseautage et de politique de stages. En établissant des liens entre les stages et les formations linguistiques et professionnelles, en créant et en enrichissant le contact avec les bons intervenants, notamment les employeurs, les directeurs d’école et les membres d’associations de protection des populations immigrées, cette approche a permis de trouver un travail pour de nombreux immigrés et d’augmenter le taux d’emploi de cette tranche de la population dans le secteur public de Brême.

Une approche contextuelle (c’est-à-dire ciblée sur une zone ou un quartier entier) doit être développée avec un ensemble intégré de mesures d’accompagnement. De plus, les effets secondaires éventuels doivent être pris en compte dans le cadre d’une approche ciblée empêchant la stigmatisation des habitants d’un quartier en particulier, et par conséquent dans le souci d’éviter la discrimination à leur égard. En France, le gouvernement fait appel à une stratégie globale visant à améliorer la situation dans les « banlieues » dans le domaine de l’emploi, de l’éducation, de la santé, de l’environnement et de l’accès aux transports publics mais également par l’intermédiaire d’une politique de défiscalisation afin d’attirer les entreprises.

Plusieurs instruments sont adaptés à chaque obstacle. En outre, on observe toujours l’interaction de plusieurs barrières. Par conséquent, une approche efficace doit être intégrée, comprendre plusieurs des instruments que nous venons de mettre en relief tout en prêtant attention aux différents obstacles. Enfin, les approches doivent être mises en place parallèlement aux mécanismes efficaces identifiés dans cette étude.

Mécanismes efficaces

Dans cette étude, six outils de base également appelés mécanismes efficaces ont été identifiés. Ces derniers peuvent et doivent être utilisés afin de développer une approche globale et efficace d’intégration des immigrés de pays tiers sur le marché du travail.

Approche intégrée

Une barrière en cache souvent une autre. Par conséquent, une approche doit toujours être axée sur plusieurs obstacles et donc inclure plusieurs instruments et plusieurs éléments. L’identification des approches utilisées dans 15 pays européens nous a permis de comprendre clairement que ce n’était que trop rarement le cas. L’absence relative de véritables approches intégrées s’explique principalement par leur coût. De plus, elles requièrent des efforts et un dévouement importants de la part du personnel chargé de les mener à bien. Enfin, les services politiques et administratifs sont organisés de telle manière que les différents services gouvernementaux (par exemple les services chargés de l’emploi, des revenus...
et de l’intégration sociale) travaillent de façon compartimentée alors qu’ils devraient s’unir dans une approche intégrée.

Les Pays-Bas présentent un exemple d’approche intégrée réussie. Leur approche combine une multitude d’éléments efficaces de manière intégrée et interactive. Cette est fondée sur un coaching familial, individuel et collectif, sur des exemples à suivre, une médiation, un service d’enseignement, une approche personnelle, un stage et sur l’implication active des employeurs. Voir les études de cas présentées dans ce rapport et en annexe 3.

- Dans la mesure où ces approches intégrées sont coûteuses et qu’elles peuvent nécessiter du temps pour être organisées et développées, l’UE devrait chercher à fournir une aide financière afin de lancer des projets pilotes dans des États membres dans le but de transmettre les bonnes pratiques identifiées dans cette étude, pour s’assurer que les États membres apprennent à partir de ces exemples et pour que ces approches soient finalement généralement adoptées par les décideurs politiques.

- Dans le même temps, les gouvernements nationaux devraient fournir des ressources et développer un cadre politique global destiné aux services locaux de manière à permettre le développement d’approches intégrées durables. Ceci garantit que les initiatives basées sur des projets à court terme soient prolongées par des approches durables à long terme.

- Les Services publics d’emploi devraient combiner différents éléments essentiels (ou approches) au lieu d’opter pour une approche axée sur un seul aspect (investir dans des programmes de formation tout en négligeant l’apprentissage en environnement réel).

**Approche personnalisée**

Le manque d’adaptation spécifique aux immigrants de pays tiers a été identifié comme un facteur d’échec pour certains projets ou certaines politiques d’emploi. Une approche personnalisée particulièrement axée sur les besoins spécifiques du groupe cible (les populations immigrées) mais capable de distinguer les besoins des différentes personnes au sein de ce groupe et prenant en compte les attentes des employeurs constitue une solution plus efficace que des approches globales appliquées également par exemple aux chômeurs natifs. En outre, pour assurer le succès d’un projet il est également essentiel d’impliquer activement les bénéficiaires de celui-ci et de développer une approche « sur mesure » qui ne les positionne pas en tant que destinataires passifs subissant les actions entreprises. En bref, « les approches passe-partout » ne sont pas efficaces pour intégrer professionnellement les immigrants venus de pays tiers.

L’Autriche et l’Italie enregistrent des pratiques exemplaires d’approches sur mesure. En Autriche, les cours offerts sont sur mesure. L’approche autrichienne se caractérise par un service de coaching individuel et intensif et par une considération ciblée de cette tranche de la population prenant en compte la spécificité de ses problèmes et de ses besoins. Ceci permet aux immigrants de prendre en main leur situation sur le marché de l’emploi. En Italie, étant donné que de nombreux immigrants occupent des emplois saisonniers (dans l’agriculture) et qu’ils sont sans emploi à certains moments de l’année, l’approche italienne a consisté à stabiliser l’emploi en formant les immigrants comme spécialistes employables tout au long du cycle de vie du produit, dans ce cas, le tabac. Cette approche a commencé par une recherche importante effectuée dans le secteur de la chaîne d’approvisionnement du tabac dans laquelle les immigrants devaient être placés pour pouvoir ensuite établir une approche sur-mesure des besoins du secteur. Les professionnels spécialisés ont fourni des services de tutorat et ont formé les populations immigrées. Voir les études de cas présentées dans ce rapport et en annexe 3.
L'UE et les gouvernements nationaux devraient prêter une attention particulière à l'intégration sur le marché du travail des immigrés de pays tiers et envisager la possibilité d'opérer des changements de politique afin de promouvoir des approches plus personnalisées. Les pays qui font appel actuellement à une politique d'emploi généraliste et non ciblée devraient considérer l'adoption d'une politique ciblée qui permette l'intégration sur le marché de l'emploi et l'apparition d'approches adaptées en particulier aux immigrés.

Au niveau de la mise en œuvre, il est recommandé d'organiser des approches de façon à fournir tout au long de la mise en place une solution intensive, sur mesure et au cas par cas et de manière à impliquer les associations de protection des immigrés dans le cycle de vie de l'approche : du développement à l'évaluation en passant par la mise en œuvre. De plus, les services publics d'emploi devraient s'engager de manière plus efficace et mieux adapter leurs services pour répondre aux besoins spécifiques des immigrés en matière d'accès au marché de l'emploi.

Partenariats et implication des intervenants
Dans le domaine de l'intégration au marché du travail, l'action d'une seule personne est moins efficace que les efforts communs de plusieurs entités (en particulier pour ce qui est d'élaborer des approches intégrées et personnalisées et de mieux atteindre les groupes cibles). La coopération entre les différents intervenants (l'UE, les gouvernements nationaux et les collectivités locales, les employeurs, les syndicats, les ONG, les écoles et les universités, les services publics d'emploi et les associations de protections des immigrés) est donc fortement recommandée. Ces intervenants devraient apprendre les uns des autres, travailler ensemble et former des partenariats. L'absence d'une approche impliquant plusieurs intervenants s'explique peut-être par le fait que les financements, bien qu'ils soient débloqués pour ces activités, sont souvent à court terme. De plus, les résultats sont trop rarement évalués ou communiqués ce qui empêche de tirer des leçons positives à partir de partenariats réussis et efficaces. En définitive, ces partenariats nécessitent beaucoup de temps, de collaboration et d'engagement, particulièrement en termes de ressources financières, humaines et institutionnelles. Cependant, travailler en partenariat permet d'enrichir les approches utilisées pour intégrer les immigrés au marché du travail.

Le Danemark connaît une pratique exemplaire du partenariat et de l'implication de différents intervenants. Dans cette approche, le gouvernement national, les employeurs (du secteur public comme du secteur privé), le gouvernement régional et les syndicats travaillent ensemble. Les partenaires sociaux jouent un rôle important parce qu'ils connaissent bien l'offre et la demande du marché de l'emploi ainsi que les problèmes rencontrés par les employeurs et les employés. Voir les études de cas présentées dans ce rapport et en annexe 3.

L'UE devrait faire appel à des programmes de financement tels que le FSE et/ou le fonds européen d'intégration afin de contribuer à la coopération et de promouvoir les partenariats en accord avec la stratégie UE 2020 de promotion de l'interdépendance entre les différents niveaux de gouvernement (UE, États membres, régions, partenaires sociaux, ...). Les gouvernements nationaux et les collectivités locales doivent réunir les acteurs (les services publics) au niveau étatique afin d'assurer que les politiques et les systèmes administratifs soient intégrés et non en conflit ou en situation d'activité compartimentée par rapport aux autres. De plus, la coopération entre les institutions et les organisations au niveau local et opérationnel devrait être stimulée.
**Implication de l'employeur**

L'implication des employeurs est indispensable à la réussite d'une approche. Impliquer les employeurs au développement et à l'exécution d'une approche permet au personnel du projet de mieux personnaliser le contenu d'une approche pour qu'elle réponde aux besoins de ces derniers et augmente les chances pour les immigrants de se voir proposer un stage ou d'obtenir un entretien.

Toutefois, les employeurs manquent souvent de l'expertise et des ressources nécessaires pour mettre en place des stratégies d'intégration en interne. Qui plus est, le développement de stratégies favorisant la diversité peut souvent être onéreux car il nécessite une infrastructure et un support administratif. Ceci peut en effet décourager les petits entreprises à opter pour cette voie en raison par exemple d'un manque de temps ou de ressources financières. Enfin, par rapport aux autres groupes de personnes (au chômage), l'intégration des immigrants peut éventuellement nécessiter plus d'efforts pour motiver les employeurs en raison d'une discrimination ou d'une attitude négative ou du moins indifférente envers cette tranche de la population. Afin d'améliorer l'implication des employeurs, des recherches doivent être menées pour connaître les véritables besoins de ces derniers, le coaching doit être poursuivi après une embauche, une attention particulière doit être portée à l'attitude des employeurs envers les immigrants (sensibilisation) et la responsabilité sociétale de l'entreprise doit être rappelée à la société au niveau de la gestion des ressources humaines.

La Suède et la Hongrie présentent des pratiques exemplaires en termes d'implication des employeurs. Dans le cadre du programme de gestion de la diversité d'IKEA, la diversité a été intégrée à la gestion des ressources humaines et étroitement alignée sur le plan d'activité de l'entreprise. La diversité est perçue par IKEA comme une façon d'obtenir un avantage concurrentiel, comme la capacité de comprendre et de refléter en interne la diversité de ses clients actuels et potentiels. Elle est considérée comme un facteur clé de son succès commercial. La sensibilisation est également une autre bonne façon de stimuler l'implication des employeurs. L'approche utilisée en Hongrie consiste à s'intéresser à différents groupes sociaux majoritaires et à inclure une formation en compétences interculturelles pour les sensibiliser, pour permettre la gestion des conflits et favoriser des techniques de négociation interculturelle. De plus, une campagne a été lancée pour souligner l'importance du multiculturalisme et l'avantage que présente l'intégration pour la société d'accueil. Voir les études de cas présentées dans ce rapport et en annexe 3.

- L'Union européenne devrait travailler avec la CES et BUSINESS EUROPE pour promouvoir au niveau national l'implication des associations d'employeurs et celle des syndicats. En outre, l'UE et les gouvernements nationaux devraient stimuler la Responsabilité sociétale de l'entreprise au sein des services de gestion des ressources humaines.
- Les gouvernements nationaux devraient lancer et fournir une assistance permettant d'impliquer les employeurs en gardant à l'esprit que les initiatives et l'appropriation des projets au niveau local permettront d'optimiser les progrès réalisés. Il faut donc s'assurer de disposer d'un équilibre entre les approches « descendantes » et « ascendantes ». 

173
Compétences du personnel
Comme l’indiquent plusieurs études de cas, le personnel (composé des coachs à l’emploi, des formateurs et des tuteurs) joue un rôle clé pour ce qui est d’aider les immigrés à chercher, trouver et garder un emploi. Par conséquent, le développement professionnel du personnel est un aspect déterminant et vital à la qualité de l’approche. Aider les immigrés venus de pays tiers à trouver ou à garder un emploi suppose une multitude de compétences spécifiques, en particulier lorsque l’on considère le besoin d’une approche intégrée et ciblée (tel que nous l’avons présenté plus haut). Le personnel doit être composé d’experts du marché de l’emploi capables de déployer toute une multitude d’approches, d’aborder l’hétérogénéité et d’évaluer les besoins et les expériences du groupe spécifique avec lequel ils traitent. Ils doivent également être aptes à sélectionner et à associer les mesures et les outils adéquats. En outre, apporter aux immigrés des pays tiers les compétences nécessaires et les motiver constitue une approche pertinente. Enfin, nous recommandons que le personnel (au moins en partie) ait des origines immigrées lui-même (exemples à suivre). En bref, il faut prêter une attention toute particulière au profil des membres du personnel.

Les Pays-Bas et l’Autriche sont à l’origine de pratiques exemplaires en termes de compétences du personnel. L’approche néerlandaise a consisté à prêter une attention toute particulière au recrutement de celui-ci. Il doit posséder un diplôme d’enseignement supérieur, avoir l’expérience du travail avec les femmes, posséder une formation dans le travail social et correspondre à l’origine culturelle des participants. L’Autriche présente également un autre bon exemple. On y utilise l’argent provenant du fonds d’intégration autrichien pour fournir continuellement une formation avancée aux employés des centres de recherche d’emploi. Ainsi, ces fonds conçus pour l’intégration ont pu également être utilisés pour mettre en place une formation destinée au personnel chargé d’intégrer professionnellement les immigrés venus de pays tiers. Voir les études de cas présentées dans ce rapport et en annexe 3.

- L’UE et les gouvernements nationaux doivent définir un ensemble de compétences nécessaires pour travailler sur les approches d’intégration professionnelle des immigrés et doivent également stimuler le développement de structures de qualification pour les employés qui aident des groupes cibles spécifiques à obtenir un travail.
- Les gouvernements nationaux et régionaux, les organisations sectorielles mais également les prestataires de services d’emploi doivent s’assurer eux-mêmes que les intervenants chargés de mettre en œuvre et d’effectuer les approches sont bien formés, impliqués et professionnels (via le développement de certificats de qualité, de normes ou la mise en place de politiques RH telles que des politiques de recrutement ou des activités de formation tout au long de la vie). Le recrutement du personnel doit passer par une coopération avec les associations d’immigrés afin de sélectionner des personnes d’origine immigrée. Le personnel est également lui-même responsable de son propre développement. Aussi, un ensemble de compétences pourrait être utilisé pour lui permettre de s’auto-évaluer et de s’évaluer, de sélectionner des cours de formation et des activités d’apprentissage en binôme.
Stratégie de proximité

Certains groupes d’immigrés, notamment les femmes et les réfugiés, peuvent être difficilement accessibles. Ceci peut s’expliquer par un manque de motivation, par des caractéristiques contextuelles qui constituent une entrave à la recherche d’un emploi (contexte familial par exemple) ou par l’absence d’une organisation structurelle nécessaire pour communiquer avec les groupes difficiles d’accès (par exemple la coopération avec les associations de communautés d’immigrés).

Afin d’améliorer durablement et profondément l’intégration professionnelle des immigrés de pays tiers, le recrutement des groupes d’immigrés difficiles d’accès est essentiel pour dynamiser le marché de l’emploi même s’il représente un défi de grande ampleur. Afin d’avoir accès à tous les groupes d’immigrés de pays tiers, il faut qu’il y ait une coopération avec les associations (bénévoles) de défense des immigrés et des réfugiés, une participation dans les réseaux sociaux et, par exemple, des mosquées pour recruter les participants potentiels difficiles d’accès.

Le Royaume-Uni possède une pratique exemplaire dans le domaine de la stratégie de proximité. Jobcentre a cherché via son réseau à établir des partenariats solides avec les associations de protection des réfugiés et des communautés minoritaires et a fait parfois appel à des travailleurs de proximité d’origine ethnique minoritaire. Ceci a permis d’améliorer la communication, l’interaction et l’engagement entre les centres d’emploi et le secteur bénévole au niveau local et a favorisé la proximité avec les groupes cibles difficiles d’accès.

Voir les études de cas présentées dans ce rapport et en annexe 3.

- L’UE devrait diffuser des informations sur les bonnes pratiques de partenariats avec les associations d’immigrés afin d’améliorer la situation de recrutement des populations immigrées et de favoriser les approches d’intégration professionnelle.
- Les gouvernements nationaux et régionaux devraient financer et travailler avec les associations de bénévoles et de protection des communautés immigrées afin de les impliquer activement dans le processus de recrutement dans le but de satisfaire aux approches d’intégration professionnelle.
- Les ONG devraient jouer un rôle important dans le processus de recrutement des immigrés car elles peuvent servir d’intermédiaire entre les employeurs et les services publics d’emploi, d’une part, et les associations d’immigrés, d’autre part. Par conséquent, elles doivent également être stimulées pour entreprendre ce rôle, par exemple en intégrant cette compétence dans les politiques gouvernementales de subventionnement des O.N.G.
Annex 3 Case Study Reports
In-depth case studies

In-depth case study Austria
In-depth case study Bulgaria
In-depth case study Denmark
In-depth case study Estonia
In-depth case study France
In-depth case study Germany
In-depth case study Hungary
In-depth case study Italy
In-depth case study Netherlands
In-depth case study Poland
In-depth case study Portugal
In-depth case study Spain
In-depth case study Sweden
In-depth case study Switzerland
In-depth case study United Kingdom
In-depth case study Austria

Background information
Name case study: ÖIF Job Centre
Name country expert: Ursula Reeger, entirely based on an extended expert interview with Mag. Judith Safar, team leader “Employment and Job: Projects and Quality Assurance” at the Austrian Integration Fund
Questions for the problem definition:

- What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?
- What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?
- What is the scope of the problem?
- What supposedly caused this problem?
- Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?
- Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

Problem definition:

- **What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?**

  Generally speaking, the cause for starting the project was the high unemployment rate among recognized refugees and persons having been granted subsidiary protection and their problems in entering the labour market in general and especially in positions that correspond with their qualifications.

  More specifically, clients in other measures of the Austrian Integration Fund (language courses, integration houses) seemed to be confused and disoriented concerning their possibilities and chances on the Austrian labour market as well as their personal perspective and this is where the staff of the Austrian Integration Fund started out from. So it was an “internal idea” to help recognized refugees and persons having been granted subsidiary protection with their access to the labour market in various ways (see below). At the beginning, only persons who were already in other measures of the Austrian Integration Fund were clients of the job centre, but in the course of time, more and more “walk-in customers” from outside the Austrian Integration Fund took part and sought help in finding access to the labour market.

- **What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?**

  The problem addressed can be defined as follows: Though the members of the target group do not face any legal barriers on the labour market but have the same rights as Austrian nationals, they are confronted with other migration related barriers (little knowledge about the Austrian labour market, lacking networks, lacking self esteem after months or even years without the permission to work as an asylum seeker, lacking skills how to apply for a job, lacking know-how concerning the social competencies one needs in Austria).

- **What is the scope of the problem?**

  Generally speaking the problem concerns all recognized refugees and persons having been granted subsidiary protection with differences regarding varying qualifications and aspirations.

  From the point of view of the target group, there is no statistical source about how many recognized refugees actually live in Austria. During the last years the number of recognized refugees varied between 3,000 and 5,000 persons (2008: 3,753 persons, 2007: 5,197; 2006: 4,063). Concerning the persons having been granted subsidiary protection, about 1,100 were living with this status in Austria in 2008.
What supposedly caused this problem?

Due to their special status (same legal position in the labour market as Austrian nationals), this group and its special needs were not really perceived and promoted by the responsible authorities (e.g. Public Employment Service). There were no special measures for recognized refugees and as they were not officially unemployed before, they were often not taken into account in other measures. There was a lack of awareness about the fact, that though they have an unrestricted access to the labour market they are often facing the same barriers (language problems, acknowledgement of diplomas) as other migrants.

Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?

The approach is devised for recognized refugees and persons having been granted subsidiary protection.

Recognized refugees are persons who got permanent asylum in Austria. They are refugees according to the Geneva Convention and have been persecuted in their country of origin because of their religion, political attitudes or for being a member of a certain social group. They can stay in Austria forever and have the same rights as Austrians (also on the labour market).

The asylum applications of persons having been granted subsidiary protection have been rejected though their life and health would be in danger in the country of origin. Therefore they are neither asylum seekers nor recognized refugees (in the sense of the Geneva Convention) but need to be protected from deportation mainly for the following reasons: torture, inhuman punishment, death sentence, severe violation of human rights and threat to life. Concerning the labour market, in principal they have full access, just like recognized refugees. The only difference is, that they do not know, how long they will be allowed to stay in Austria and will be protected, which sometimes makes employers reluctant to give them a job, as they have no guarantee as to the length of stay.

Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

It is specific and generic at the same time. It is specific because of the special situation of flight and the related trauma some of the asylum seekers had to go through. Their starting situation is completely different compared to that of labour migrants as they do not primarily think about working in Austria and the flight took place completely unprepared in this respect, they thus need a longer phase of orientation. They also suffer from a pronounced lack of information about the target country. Moreover, flight often has a negative impact on the learning ability, most of all in the first phase of the stay. Sometimes the asylum procedure is rather long, a phase during which they are not allowed to work (with very few exceptions), which also keeps them from dealing with these issues.

The problem is generic in the sense that the target group is facing many of the problems that other third country migrants are facing regarding the access to the labour market (again language barriers, acknowledgement of diplomas etc.), though they have unrestricted access to the labour market after having been granted asylum or subsidiary protection.
Questions for the approach:
- What approach has been used to address the problem?
- What are the core elements of the approach?
- What is the intensity and duration of the approach?
- How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?
- What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general (international literature, (policy) studies)?
- Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?
- What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?
- Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?

Approach:

What approach has been used to address the problem?

Generally speaking the approach consists of direct work with people concerned, including
- direct, individual counselling and
- help for self-help
by means of using the synergies of already existing offers outside of the Austrian Integration Fund (e.g. Public Employment Service, other information and counselling centres, NGOs).

In the given context, help for self-help as a key element has its roots in the fact, that asylum seekers upon arrival and also later on during the asylum procedure find themselves in the situation that many things like administrative procedures and provision of basic supply are managed for them by aid agencies or other official bodies. They thus often experience a limited self-determination. After having been granted asylum or subsidiary protection, they have to start again to feel self-responsible and take charge of themselves. At the job centre, things are not done for them, but they get advice and all the information needed to look and apply for a job, or, for example, to write a curriculum vitae on their own. People should not completely depend on the job centre but be empowered to take over their labour market situation.

What are the core elements of the approach?

The core elements can be defined as follows:
- Element of counselling (education, qualification, job-related);
- Group trainings with the following contents: practising of interviews for a job, vocabulary for reading and understanding job advertisements, social competencies (clothing, punctuality, behaviour); group trainings take place every week, the group size varies between 3 to 8 persons, clients can come as often as they want to until they feel sure about their competencies in the fields mentioned.
- Networks with potential employers: This network is constantly growing and has to be fostered. For the time being it comprises about 200 employers who have already worked together with the job centre and employed recognized refugees or persons having been granted subsidiary protection. Furthermore there is a project-related cooperation between the job centre and the Austrian Federal Economic Chamber as well as the Federation of Austrian Industries. In future there shall be a further cooperation with enterprises that practise “Corporate Social Responsibility” (Network “RESPACT”).
- Raising awareness of the potentials of the target group among the stakeholders just mentioned, stands with information about the job centres at trade fairs and other occupation fairs; journal publication “Integration im Focus” edited by
the Austrian Integration Fund again and again informs about the project, with a wide dissemination as the journal is sent to all Austrian mayors and other local politicians as well as to many other stakeholders involved in the field.

■ **What is the intensity and duration of the approach?**

On the project level: Beginning in 2007, no defined end, as it is a measure within the Austrian Integration Fund;

On the individual level: The work with the clients is very intense, they can always make appointments to come around. The duration of course depends on the success, sometimes it is very short, the average “length of stay” within the measure is six weeks. Anyway, some clients have to be advised for several months.

■ **How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?**

There are several means of resolving the problem recognized refugees and persons under subsidiary protection are facing when they try to access the Austrian labour market. Basically, the clients are coached through information, vocational backing and motivation in way that they either:

1. Find a job themselves,
2. Develop in a way that they are more likely to find a job or
3. Learn about the possibilities on the labour market and assess these in a realistic way.

■ **What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general (international literature, (policy) studies)?**

Though there are many projects concerning the integration of third country migrants into the labour market across (Western) Europe, it is hard to find similar approaches defined for exactly the same target group.

One of these is “co-opera”, a vocational integration course offered in Switzerland, with just the same target group as in the Austrian case. It already came into existence in 1995 and has been evaluated externally in 1997 and 2000. In a project report that dealt with the question about the role of further qualification for labour market integration of recognized refugees it turned out, that people who went through further qualification in Switzerland had better chances on the labour market and their integration was more successful (see [http://www.sah.ch/data/EF811B40/Arbeit_ML_Gerber.pdf](http://www.sah.ch/data/EF811B40/Arbeit_ML_Gerber.pdf)).

The lesson to be learnt from co-opera is the importance of clarifying the occupational possibilities in an in-depth way by means of individual coaching that (recognized) refugees seem to need more urgently than “normal” labour migrants. This offers a first insight into the working world of the receiving country and provides insights into realistic possibilities on the job market.

The project “Self-improvement through Work” with similar aims as the ÖIF job centres has been implemented in the Czech Republic in 2009, so nothing can be said about its effectiveness at this point in time.

■ **Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?**

As mentioned above, the approach has been used in Switzerland within the project “co-opera”. Generally speaking, there are measures dealing with the labour market situation
of third country migrants, but not much for this special target group. The new element in this project is the fact, that the target group has been recognized as being in a special situation with special needs as described above. It is most of all their completely different starting situation with the experience of a flight that makes them different from “normal labour migrants”.

What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?

Help for self-help as the core element is a distinguishing factor: The clients of the job centres shall be enabled to act on the Austrian labour market in an independent and sustainable way.

Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?

There have been no elementary changes within the measure, just some slight adaptations since it has started:
- Group trainings turned out to be very efficient and that is why there is more emphasize on this element than at the beginning.
- The substantial role of potential employees has made them a more and more important target group.
- Experiences in the project also led to a certain change away from mere counselling towards more emphasize on match-making and coaching.

Questions for the contextual factors:

What conditions have influenced the project?
What factors improved the success of the project?
What factor put a check on the success of the project?
Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?

Contextual factors:

What conditions have influenced the project?

1. The general labour market situation in Austria which has been heavily influenced by the economic crisis during the last year and the growing unemployment (rate) have been taken into account with regard to further training. The clients should be placed in crisis-proof branches (most of all in Styria, a federal state heavily influenced by growing unemployment). The most important branches in this respect are: health care, care for the elderly, childcare (mostly among women) and skilled labour in industry.

2. As has already been pointed out in the Austrian country report, the recognition of (academic) certificates is a big barrier influencing the measure in a negative way. The procedures are expensive, long and complicated.

What factors improved the success of the project?

1. Synergies with the Public Employment Service (among others) and a constantly growing network also including new partners (= employers, other stakeholders from the Austrian Federal Economic Chamber and the Federation of Austrian Industries, local NGOs) make the work within the measure more and more successful.
2. The measure also tries to convey a positive picture which has an impact on potential employers. As described above, public relations with this target group and other stakeholders playing an important role on the labour market have the goal to make the project known and to point out the potentials of recognized refugees and persons having been granted subsidiary protection.

- **What factor put a check on the success of the project?**

  As mentioned above: To some extent the current economic crisis.

- **Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?**

  The factors are not specific, as the current situation is problematic for all third country migrants on the labour market.

**Questions for the results:**

- What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?:
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
  - putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
  - the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
  - the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;
  - .....

- To what extent have these goals been achieved?

- To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?

- How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

- How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

- If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

- Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct / indirect)?

- Are there any differences in results among different target groups?

- How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?

**Results:**

- **What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?**
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for the target group;
  - putting the target group’s human capital to good use;
  - the integration of the target group into high-quality employment;
  - the provision of equal opportunities for the members of the target group in the labour market;
helping the members of the target group with their first access into the labour market, people that have never been employed in Austria before; bringing them into stable positions with a perspective for further professional development.

To what extent have these goals been achieved?

see below, question after next

To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?

In order to answer this question, a distinction between different steps of the coaching process has to be made. Sometimes the coaching itself is successful, but the client is not able to find a sustainable job, sometimes the coaching process itself is also problematic.

The project is certainly able to sweep out of the way some of the barriers that have been mentioned: Clients learn about the Austrian labour market and its specificities, they are kind of connected with a network of employers and with the Public Employment Service, they get to know social competencies they need for finding and keeping a job, they can attend language courses and further education is funded. The network is thus opened and offers are made, but it depends on the client what he makes out of these offers and opportunities and whether he accepts them or not.

How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

The project started in Vienna in March 2006, in Upper Austria in October 2007 and in Styria in March 2007. The following numbers refer to the year 2008: in total 678 people took part in the measure, 29 per cent could be placed in a job and a further 23 per cent went into further education, so in total more than 50 per cent of the clients found direct help and already had left the measure again. Another 24 per cent were still coached at the job centre by the end of the year.

How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

This question can hardly be answered as after having left the job centre it is problematic to reach the former participants as the tie-up is over. It depends on the clients' initiative to visit the job centre afterwards. Example Vienna: Of those who got a job in 2008 or went to further education and could be reached via telephone, some 50 per cent were still employed or in a qualification measure.

Concerning the clients with a university degree it is too early to say something about sustainability as nostrification takes a long time in Austria, so the coaching in these cases is still going on.

If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

The measure is about the first entry into the labour market, so nothing can be stated here.
Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct/indirect)?

The results are surely directly related to the job centre: Without all the information and personal coaching, it would take much longer for the members of the target group to find access to the labour market and more generally to find a way there.

Are there any differences in results among different target groups?

There is one major difference between the two sub-groups, namely recognized refugees and persons having been granted subsidiary protection with the latter not having the possibility to be sure about a stay unlimited in time, as the might loose their right to stay in Austria and be sent back to their country of origin at some point in time. This discourages some employers to give these people a job.

Concerning the chances on the labour market, the differences are just the same as in the total work force: Women with children find it harder to get access to the labour market, elder people are more disadvantaged compared to young ones etc.

How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?

Co-opera and the ÖIF job centres differ in size considerably. In 2007 (source: [http://www.sah.ch/data/9D1B450C/KP_SAH_Jahresbericht_2007.pdf](http://www.sah.ch/data/9D1B450C/KP_SAH_Jahresbericht_2007.pdf)) co-opera had 122 participants in three different fields (69 persons in basic courses, 30 in the “job seeking group” and 23 in the mentoring measure). More than one third of the people in basic courses found a job, 26 participants of the job seeking group left co-opera by the end of 2007 and 22 of them (81 per cent) found a job (often temporary) or a work experience. 12 participants left the mentoring measure in 2007, among these 8 found an employment. Due to the differing internal structures of the projects, a direct comparison would deliver rather vague results.

Questions for important lessons:

- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)?
  What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?

Important lessons:

- **What are the success and fail factors of this approach** (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?

  1. A clear success factor is that the job centre is located within the Austrian Integration Fund which is entirely financed by public money. Thus the measure has no pre-defined ending and is more “safe” in terms of money and planning than clearly defined projects lasting only for a certain period of time.
2. Quality management is carried out at the Austrian Integration Fund, there are four employees in the job centres for whom advanced training is constantly provided in the following way:
   • The Austrian Integration Fund provides an extensive training programme for all its employees with the advantage that it is demand-oriented and people are put together in groups in order to advance internal communication and cooperation.
   • The courses are custom-tailored for special situations, e.g. development of a conversation guide for contacts with employers, interviewing and discussion techniques, professional communication or coaching strategies. Supervision also makes a part of the training possibilities offered.

3. Sometimes problems occur in the individual work with the clients as there may be lacks of flexibility concerning their aspirations and the clients have too high hopes as to what kind of job they can obtain. The jobs offered often are de-qualifying and people have to learn that the recognition of diploma, for example, can take a long time.

**What can others learn from this particular project?**

1. Intense individual coaching pays off, as obstacles for the clients get transparent.
2. A simple recognition of the target group as such with its special problems and needs.

**To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations** (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)? What helps and what does not?

This depends on the context, most of all concerning the legal status of the target group in other countries. Help to self-help as the core element can anyway be transferred to other target groups and other situations. The awareness building process among stakeholders is also easily transferable.

**What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?**

It is important not to put the members of the target group into a victim role but also to challenge them, always keeping in mind the dreadful experience of a flight. This is where the concept of coaching used at the job centres starts out from: Not to carry out visits to the authorities, applications for a job or the draft of a curriculum vitae for the clients but to teach and help them to do these things on their own, or briefly worded: help to self-help.

Furthermore is also important to have clear rules and conditions for coaching. At the job centres the clients and the supervisors sign a “support agreement” that contains rights and duties of both “parties”, e.g. adherence to appointments. It also contains the indication that in case of non-adherence the support will be stopped.
In-depth case study Bulgaria

**Background information**

Name case study: National Programme for Integration of Refugees (NPIR), 2005-2007; Integration Centre of the State Agency for Refugees

Name country expert: Dr Eugenia Markova
Questions for the problem definition:
- What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?
- What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?
- What is the scope of the problem?
- What supposedly caused this problem?
- Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?
- Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

Problem definition:

Since 1993 when the first asylum seekers were granted refugee status in Bulgaria, it has been particularly difficult for refugees to find regular employment mainly due to the shrinking labour market and high unemployment rates, which were close to 20 per cent at the end of the 1990s. Even though those who are granted refugee or humanitarian status acquire all the rights of the Bulgarian citizens, they also become responsible for their subsistence. The state benefits are generally very low, at about 26 EUR per person per month (Zhelyazkova et al., 2008, p. 28). The majority of them lack any knowledge of the Bulgarian language or their knowledge is very poor, which, coupled with the high unemployment rate in the country, poses additional hurdles towards their access to the labour market. Jobless and unable to pay for accommodation, they easily fall into a hazardous situation that forces them to try and migrate again further in Europe. Others join the shadow economy and take any manual job available. However, refugees with high qualifications are forced to work in the shadow economy as well performing menial tasks, which often causes them further psychological distress and illness. Findings of a recently conducted research on foreign workers in Bulgaria (Zhelyazkova et al., 2008) reveal that qualified and high skilled foreigners coming from war zones, such as Afghanistan and Iraq, were especially vulnerable in the new environment where they had lost social and professional status, and had to earn their living under dubious conditions.

Other barriers to refugees’ access to the labour market are the lack of previous professional experience in Bulgaria and recognition of diplomas. Most of them have professions that are either not transferable nor in demand in the Bulgarian labour market. Refugees as well as economic migrants often face other problems related to the lack of support from relatives and friends, employers’ preference for hiring people with longer experience and employers’ prejudice towards recruiting foreign labour. Due to the lack of years of service acquired in Bulgaria, refugees are not entitled to unemployment benefits; usually they cannot find a job as employers prefer to hire people who have some education and professional experience. The question of the extent to which the previous experience and formal qualifications of refugees and immigrants are recognised by potential employers can clearly be a significant factor in hiring decisions and in deciding upon remuneration. The issue here is on asymmetry of information on the part of employers who may be ill-equipped to assess to expected productivity of workers being considered for employment (Stark, 1991). In addition, refugees and immigrants alike often encounter employers who are prejudicial towards the employment of foreign workers. Hence, refugees have hardly any competitive power on the local labour market (http://aref.govt.government.bg). However, researchers have compared refugees’ and immigrants’ vulnerability with that of the Roma minority in Bulgaria, the latter being subjected to harsher discrimination by employers, they claim.

The National Program for Integration of Refugees (NPIR) was designed and implemented in order to tackle the above mentioned labour market barriers faced by refugees. Similar programmes have been developed for the Roma minority in the country and implemented by the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy (interview with Ms Valia Koeva, Director of the Integration Centre of the State Agency for Refugees).
The main target group of the Programme were those foreign nationals who were granted refugee or humanitarian status.

Questions for the approach:
- What approach has been used to address the problem?
- What are the core elements of the approach?
- What is the intensity and duration of the approach?
- How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?
- What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general (international literature, policy studies)?
- Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?
- What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?
- Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?

Approach:

The National Programme for Integration of Refugees in Bulgaria (NPIR) was designed and implemented with the purpose of providing refugees and those granted humanitarian status with special support with their economic, social and even psychological integration and adaptation. The programme was delayed for financial reasons and officially started in 2006, with a budget of 300,000 BGL to cover the integration measures for 100 refugees only (section one the programme, "Measures for the integration of newly recognised refugees"). It was managed and implemented by the Integration Centre of the State Agency for Refugees, in conjunction with the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy. It ended in 2007. In 2008, a new, revised and improved national integration programme for refugees was adopted that is expected to last by the end of 2010.

A ten-member Integration Commission (IC) was set up for the implementation of the programme, including representatives from the State Agency for Refugees, Bulgarian Red Cross, Caritas-Bulgaria, and the Association for integration of refugees and migrants. The IC reviewed the applications for participation in the NPIR. Certain criteria were applied for selecting participants for the programme and priority was given to bigger families and single parents. A contract was signed with each participant in the programme specifying his/her responsibilities in case of inappropriate behaviour in or absenteeism from the programme training classes. Initially, all applicants for participation in the programme were interviewed in the presence of a translator. Following the interview, successful candidates were given personal integration plans, mapping the concrete integration measures to be adopted for each one of them. These personal integration plans contained information on refugee’s circumstances before joining the programme, the individual integration measures adopted, the deadlines for their completion, the expected outcomes and the suggested financial assistance during the period of participation in the programme.

Bulgarian language training constituted a core element of the programme. It was embedded in the premise that knowledge of the Bulgarian language was essential to refugees’ participation into every sphere of life in the host country, i.e., employment, housing, education, health and social connections, and interactions.

Bulgarian was taught in 600 school hours and was based on a curriculum approved by the Bulgarian Education Ministry. The course had to be adapted to the lower literacy or even illiteracy levels of the trainees. Main difficulties encountered during the language training included trainees’ slow adaptation to the teaching course conducted in a new for them environment; their very low literacy or illiteracy in the mother tongue; the lack of habits for formal learning; the high turnover in the class, and the continuous replenishment with new students. Refugees’ low

3
motivation to attend the language classes was partly explained by their perception of Bulgaria as a transit country (Zhelyazkova et al., 2008). Nonetheless, the insufficient amount of state benefits (daily allowance of 1.50 EUR (3 BGL)) also contributed to foreigners’ abandoning the language classes and joining the labour market, often its secondary tier. For these reasons, the program needed to be readjusted several times and to introduce several learning levels within the same language class. Similar practice in the USA has proven to be beneficial; language programmes in the USA that have served people with different English language skill levels were offering situations rich with opportunities for participatory education; the more experienced class members were serving as resources to the new arrivals (Ranard and Pfleger, 1993).

After successfully completing the Bulgarian language training programme, refugees were awarded certificates that allowed them to continue with professional training and re-training. Training was offered on professions such as tailoring, hairdressing, cosmetics, IT and cooking, for which the Integration Centre has a licence, issued by the National Agency for Vocational Education and Training (NAVET) (license No. 200412168 of 19.05.2004). The vocational training took into consideration the specific needs of the foreigners who had received asylum on the one hand, and on the current state of the labour market in Bulgaria, on the other. After completing the professional training course participants received certificates for the acquired professions. Vocational training outside Integration Centre premises was carried out by the regional labour offices. Health insurance was provided for all participants in the programme and it expired with the completion of the programme or with a participant’s dismissal. Elsewhere, similar approach to vocational training that took consideration of the good match between labour market demand and supply, proved successful. For example, in Estonia, in the Ida-Virumaa county, demand was identified for certain specialties and vocational training in these occupations was offered to unemployed Russian speakers (presumably, they found jobs after completing the training). These occupations included builder, welder, cook, shop assistant, security guard, IT administrator, cleaner and chambermaid (European Commission, 2007, p. 54).

Overall, similar Integration programme has been applied in Sweden sometime since 1985. However, it was implemented by the local municipalities; was not compulsory and unlike in the Bulgarian case, all refugees and their families could join. A preliminary assessment was conducted to determine whether the refugee or the immigrant was ready to join the local labour market. If not, then an action plan was developed together with the immigrant to map out a specific strategy for movement into the labour market. This would generally involve, at the very least, language training and introduction to life in Sweden, but could also involve specific vocational upgrading or training, as required (Lemaitre, 2007). Similarly to the Bulgarian integration programme, the thrust in the Swedish programme was language training. In this respect, a number of improvements were introduced in some municipalities such as grouping immigrants by educational levels, introducing occupation-related introduction and insuring that language instruction took place concurrently rather than consequently, to maintain a link to work during the instruction period and to avoid prolonging the induction period (ibid). The latter might be an useful suggestion for improvement of the Bulgarian NPIR.

Questions for the contextual factors:

- What conditions have influenced the project?
- What factors improved the success of the project?
- What factor put a check on the success of the project?
- Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?
**Contextual factors:**

Throughout the project, serious difficulties occurred with housing of refugees. Several factors contributed to that, namely, a general increase in rents and particularly in rents for the designated houses for refugees, and a profound increase in discriminatory practices of landlords towards renting accommodation to refugees. At times, accommodation problems put at stake refugees’ participation in the training courses of the Integration Centre. Furthermore, secure housing facilitates foreigners’ job search. It also determines, to a certain degree, the specific labour market where a job is more likely to be found; jobs far away from home would entail higher transport costs; such jobs are more likely to be temporary and lack flexibility; they might not be even an option for foreigners with parental responsibilities. Housing of refugees remained an unsolved issue after the ending of the program. Most of the refugees and those granted humanitarian status remain on the territory of the capital Sofia, which puts additional pressure on the housing market in the area. Access to council accommodation is regulated by the Law for public property that requires “…at least one family member (member of the household) to be Bulgarian citizen who have resided on the territory of the capital Sofia for at least ten years without interruption.” (PARA 2, point 1, Regulation for the terms and conditions for managing council accommodation on the territory of Sofia). In practice, the regulation bans refugees and those granted humanitarian status to apply for council accommodation. Most of these people can’t also satisfy the requirement for a ten-year continuous residence in Sofia.

The programme in consideration provided insufficient monthly financial support for accommodation and subsistence in the range of 75 EUR (150 BGL) for individuals and up to 200 EUR (400 BGL) for families, that could only cover the rent, without anything left for utilities and food.

**Questions for the results:**

- What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?:
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
  - putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
  - the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
  - the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;
  - ....
  - To what extent have these goals been achieved?

- To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?
- How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct / indirect)?
- Are there any differences in results among different target groups?
- How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?
Results:

The main objectives of the refugee integration programme included, among others, learning of the Bulgarian language, mastering some professional skills, getting some knowledge about life in Bulgaria, the operation of the state and its institutions, getting access to funded accommodation, and getting health insurance. After completing the one-year programme, the refugees were expected to be able to apply for jobs and become independent of institutional support. Unfortunately, no data exists as to how many of those completing the programme have actually found jobs, what these jobs were and how sustainable they proved to be. Similar lack of data refers to the number of foreigners.

For the period October 2006 – December 2007, 197 foreigners were interviewed and enrolled in the programme (they were mainly men, 81.5%, coming mainly from Iraq, Iran, Afghanistan, Syria and Somalia). Some 85 refugees and those granted humanitarian status had successfully completed the programme; another 67 foreigners continued the programme into the year 2008 because of delays in granting legal status, and 45 had dropped out of the programme.

For the same period, on average, 23 refugees and their families, out of 197 (12%), received financial assistance for accommodation and subsistence. For the same period, 127 refugees (65%) received one-time financial aid and payment-in-kind after leaving the reception centre and moving into a rented accommodation.

At the end of the programme, in 2007, some 57 refugees were trained as auto-mechanics, hotel staff, drivers, layer-outs and computer specialists.

Following the completion of the programme and with the assistance of the Integration Centre of the State Agency for Refugees, some 53 refugees out of the 85 who had successfully completed the programme (62%) found employment: 10 people were recruited by ‘Coca-Cola’; 5 people were seasonally employed by two municipalities in Sofia, ‘Krasno selo’ and ‘Ovcha kypel’; 2 people were recruited by an auto-mechanical warehouse; 15 were recruited as labourers; 9 were recruited in fast-food restaurants; 10 were employed at shops; and, 2 were recruited by restaurants.

Some refugees refused to take part in the integration programme. Their main motivation was the insufficient financial assistance during the training, which would not allow them even a minimal living standard.

A substantial drawback of NPIR is its lack of continuity. It does not even keep records on how the graduates of the program fare on the labour market. This is partly explained by the fact that labour market placement of refugees is a responsibility of the local labour offices of the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy. Interviews with some of the foreigners who had completed the 600-hour language training of the Integration Programme thought the language preparation was not enough to sufficiently equip them for independent access to the labour market. To a certain degree, the content of the programme might account for it, placing a primary focus on pronunciation and structure rather than on communication. There might be a little connection between the Bulgarian that refugees studied and the Bulgarian that they used outside the classrooms. In this respect, it is not the number of hours that a language is taught but rather the content of the language instruction that can serve as a more reliable evaluation criterion. Empirical results for Sweden indicate that over half of the programme participants take less than 300 hours of language instruction. An analysis of employment rates four years after entry into Sweden for immigrants 15-64 having entered in 1997, controlling for age, sex, marital status, educational attainment, type of migration and region of origin, indicates some additional likelihood of employment after three to five hundred hours of language training (taken during the
Questions for important lessons:

- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)?
- What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?

Important lessons:

Some lessons learned:

- The relative success of the programme was mainly attributed to the dedication and commitment of the staff involved in the programme implementation, mainly vocational training instructors and language tutors.
- Given the high turn over in the Bulgarian language classes and the low language competence after graduation, it is recommended that compulsory Bulgarian language training is introduced for a certain period following the granting of the refugee or humanitarian status to a foreigner (see Sabeva and Radeva, 2005).
- Participants might benefit more of the programme in Bulgarian language training if a more competence based approach is adopted. With it, the focus would be more on the language that is needed for real-life tasks (e.g., how to explain a medical problem to a doctor; how to apply for a job; how to write a CV and how to handle a job interview) (see Adkins, 1986, in Ranard and Pfleger, 1993). At the same time, the language training programme is easily adjustable to teaching literacy classes to Roma people.
- The involvement of several institutions in the implementation of the programme obstructed the development of the full potential of the programme. For instance, for the implementation of the 2005-2007 National Programme for Integration of Refugees, the responsible institution was not only the State Agency for Refugees but also some ministries, which caused serious problems of efficiency in the programme implementation. As a result, some of the tasks in the programme remained uncompleted, namely, those related to the establishment of supplementary schools, projects for financial assistance with accommodation for refugees, projects for individual social work with refugees and the publication of relevant information materials. Previous experience has shown that in order for such a programme to work, the leading institution responsible for its implementation must be the State Agency for Refugees, instead of a ministry. For this reason, the Integration Centre of the State Agency for Refugees is the solely responsible institution for the implementation of the 2008-2010 integration Programme and it is also the main programme sponsor.
- Appalling living conditions in the reception centres for refugees/ insufficient housing served as a put-off for refugees' participation in or regular attendance of the Programme. Some asylum seeking families who belonged to the middle and upper-middle classes in their origin countries, found it unbearable to live in destitution in the dormitories of the State Agency for Refugees or in the shelter in Busmantsi. They soon realized that even if they acquired legal refugee status they would not have any chance to succeed in competition with high skilled local labour; recognizing diplomas (e.g. doctors, engineers) and learning the language to a professional level would take too long; even if they succeeded in finding a job corresponding
to their prior training and qualifications, they would still be paid much less than equally qualified Bulgarians. It’s under such circumstances that refugees reconsider their stay in Bulgaria as a transit stop and plan a new journey further to Europe.

- A need for post-programme assistance on the labour market was identified. A number of respondents in a recent immigration survey by IMIR (2007) who had completed the 2005-2007 National Programme for Integration of Refugees, and especially those who had gone through a lengthy procedures of acquiring a refugee status, spoke of an essential element missing in the system for integrating refugees and immigrants into the labour market namely, a specialist employment office that could provide support at least during the initial stages of access to the labour market after a refugee status had been granted and when the integration programme has been completed. One said “even after you had overcome the stressful run away, the hazardous crossing of borders, long months in the dormitories of the State Agency for Refugees, the court proceedings, the classes in Bulgarian that lasted for 3-6 months, you are chucked on the street and you have to find your own way – with very poor knowledge of Bulgarian, without friends, with no money for accommodation and no money to allow you to look for job”. Such integration programmes need continuity. There should be post-programme measures to assist with refugees’ initial employment. A relevant example is LORECA (London Refugee Economic Action) established in 2004 by the London Development Agency as the lead body on employment, enterprise and training for refugee and asylum seekers in London (LEED Programme and LDA, 2005). The Integration Centre of the State Agency for Refugees can be the founding institution for a similar entity at a pan-Sofia level.

- Similar integration programmes might benefit of the involvement of employers’ organizations in the design and implementation of the vocational training courses.

6. Overview literature (sources used)

Materials provided by Ms. Valia Koeva, Director of the Integration Centre of the State Agency for Refugees (Report on the implementation of the National Programme for Integration of Refugees in the R Bulgaria for 2008; Report on the implementation of the National Programme for Integration of Refugees in the R Bulgaria for 2005-2007).


Sabeva, K. and M. Radeva (2005) Practical Aspects of Employment and Vocational Training of Aliens Who Have Been Granted Refugee or Humanitarian Status in the Republic of Bulgaria. 10th UNHCR Rountable on Bulgaria’s EU Integration, European Asylum Harmonisation and International Refugee Protection in cooperation with the State Agency for Refugees, the Humanitarian Rights and Religious Affairs Committee with the National Assembly.


In-depth case study Denmark

Background information
Name case study: 4-past agreement
Name country expert: Jørgen Goul Andersen and Karen Breidahl
Questions for the problem definition:
- What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?
- What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?
- What is the scope of the problem?
- What supposedly caused this problem?
- Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?
- Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

Problem definition:

The first 4-part agreement was established in 2002 between the government, employers in the municipalities, the regional level and the private sector and labour unions, and in December 2006 it was decided to carry on and improve some of the initiatives as an element of the 2006 welfare reform compromise between the major parties in Parliament.

The 4-part agreement was introduced in continuation of several other initiatives targeted at immigrant employment during recent years (e.g. the introduction of the start allowance/introduction allowance in 2002 and the integration package “A new Chance for All” from 2005).

The 4-part agreement can be characterized as a so-called framework law, which means that it is up to different actors to implement it at the local level. The 4-part agreement does therefore not refer to a specific project, but to an agreement which contains six different employment programmes/instruments. These six instruments will be elaborated in the following section.

The six instruments differ in several ways. In the description below we focus on the job-packages since they represent a core element in the 4-part agreement. Furthermore, this is the element in the agreement which have demonstrated the most significant results (Internet source 2).

The 4-part agreement is based on an awareness, first, that different actors on the labour market have to cooperate in order to ensure a successful integration, secondly, that upgrading of qualifications is very important for third country migrants’ possibility to enter the labour market, and thirdly, that an active employment effort makes a difference – also for unemployed people with problems other than unemployment.

The last point also refers to the more general assumption (in this case fulfilled) that participation in activation programs increases the chances for unemployed people to reach employment.

The problem addressed

The overall problem addressed by the job-packages is low employment rates among immigrants – especially among third country immigrants. The more specific problems/barriers for immigrants which the job-packages are expected to address, are the following:
- Lack of education and language skills
- Lack of basic understanding of the Danish working culture
- Lack of work motivation

(The 4-part agreement, 2006 – Internet source 1)

As it appears, these barriers are mainly (seen as) intrinsic barriers and not as external barriers such as problems in the employment system, discrimination and lack of demand for labour. It is
also implied (without any documentation) that immigrants may often lack understanding of the Danish working culture and even motivation to work. At least the latter premise is in fact contradicted by available empirical findings (Goul Andersen, 2008).

However, external barriers are indirectly addressed as a problem since many immigrants (and unemployed in general) have participated in several activation programs without reaching employment. This can be attributed to problems in the employment system, unwillingness among employers to hire third country nationals, or to statistical discrimination against third country nationals and long-term unemployed. Instead of gaining employment, participants gradually become increasingly frustrated and de-motivated (e.g. Breidahl, 2007: 70-73; Knocke, 2005; Thomsson & Hoflund, 2000). This is why it was considered important to introduce a more transparent and predictable effort which to a greater extent live up to the expectations among the unemployed.

Another problem indirectly addressed, is lack of contact to the labour market and lack of an employment-relevant social network among immigrants. These are important as job recruitment is often informal. The job-packages can help to establish a direct contact between companies and the unemployed immigrants and overcome barriers such as missing information about job openings, statistical discrimination among applicants etc.

The problem addressed does not take into account more quality aspects of employment (such as wages and working conditions) but only whether the unemployed immigrants reach employment or not. From the literature we know that immigrants are overrepresented in certain sectors – typically the less privileged parts of the labour market - and that many men from non-western countries are overeducated for the jobs they have (Nielsen, 2007; Statistics Denmark, 2008).

In 2006 when the 4-part agreement was signed by the government and the social partners, low employment rates among immigrants was seen as an important problem for the Danish society. Hence, the agreement explicitly referred to the fact that only 5 out of 10 immigrants were in employment compared to 8 out of 10 native Danes (The 4-part agreement, 2006 – Internet source 1).

In the literature and the public debate there is no consensus about the causes of this ‘employment problem’ among third country immigrants (see the country report). Instead, why third country nationals face problems entering the Danish labour market is a huge research topic and a controversial issue in the public debate.

Some refer to intrinsic barriers (also called supply side barriers), others to external barriers (also called demand side barriers) and some are referring to more contextual barriers. In government documents, and in public debates, one typically finds most emphasis on intrinsic and contextual barriers.

When it comes to the contextual barriers, some have referred to the disincentives embedded in the social security system which, it is sometimes argued, furthermore tends to attract less employable immigrants to the country. Besides it is argued that there is a tension between the low level of qualifications of many immigrants and a labour market system characterised by high minimum wages and generous social security (e.g. Orrenius & Solomon, 2006; Tranæs & Zimmermann, 2004; Pedersen et al., 2003; OECD, 2005). Sometimes the social partners have been urged to adopt an “introduction wage” for immigrants, but (not surprisingly) unions have preferred subsidies as this would have an equivalent effect on employment, but without social costs.

Others (Albrekt Larsen & Pedersen, 2009) have emphasized the lack of employment-relevant networks among immigrants and the recruitment process among employers which is often
informal and based on contacts/recommendations; besides, it has been demonstrated that employers are reluctant to hire people from the employment office in general and long term unemployed in particular (for most employers, this is actually much “worse” than being an immigrant). Correspondingly, it takes more skills for people with an unemployment record to convince an employer via an application (Pedersen, forthcoming), and many immigrants have small resources to overcome this barrier (Lyngdahl, 2006).

During the economic boom period 2005-2008, employment rates among immigrants (not least among women) increased very significantly. This further confirms the latter hypotheses, but as incentives have been tightened simultaneously (e.g. the Start assistance/introduction allowance and the so called 300-hours rule), it does not disconfirm the first mentioned hypotheses which have been the most widespread among policy makers.

The target group

The target groups in the job-packages are newly arrived immigrants and refugees incorporated in introduction programmes, as well as social assistance recipients with a poor connection to the labour market. Most of the target group will belong to so-called matching group 3 and 4, that is, to the two lowest ranging categories among those considered (to some extent) employable.1

Most of the barriers and the problems emphasised above are not specific for immigrants. Hence, other unemployed may face some of the same problems – especially lack of skills and health problems (Clement, forthcoming).

Questions for the approach:

- What approach has been used to address the problem?
- What are the core elements of the approach?
- What is the intensity and duration of the approach?
- How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?
- What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general (international literature, (policy) studies)?
- Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?
- What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?
- Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?

Approach:

As mentioned, the 4-part agreement contains six different employment programmes/instruments:

1) A so-called "staircase model" (named after a staircase with several steps) which includes a combination of different instruments such as guidance, upgrading of skills, practical training in a private company, wage subsidy etc.

2) “Job packages” where 12 different “job packages” have been introduced in different sectors in order to make the effort more transparent and predictable for those involved.

3) Mentorship (support the use of mentors aimed at unemployed people with weak labour market attachment).

---

1 In 2005 5 so-called matching groups were introduced: gr. 1: good match, gr. 2: good match, a few qualifications missing, gr. 3: partial match: some relevant qualifications, gr. 4: low match: only very limited job functions are possible, gr. 5: no match: no job functions possible (no requirements of job).
4) Network for immigrant women (which also includes establishment of mentor groups).

5) Clarifications of competences and

6) Local cooperation between municipalities, companies, leaders and workers at the companies.  
   (The 4-part agreement, 2006 – Internet source 1)

In the following description we focus on the job-packages.

The 12 different job packages developed by the social partners cover the following sectors:  
Production staff in the industry, warehouse operatives in the medical industry, postal workers,  
slaughterhouse workers, truck drivers, bus drivers, warehouse operatives in the transport sector,  
lead- and cable workers, cleaning operatives, kitchen-assistants, shop-assistants and service  
assistants in the public sector. The job-packages have thus primarily been targeted at unskilled  
employment.

The job package includes a combination of several elements: clarification of competences of the  
individual, Danish language lessons, development of skills and employment under special  
conditions at the workplace until the person is qualified for a job on standard terms. As indicated,  
the idea of the job package is geared mainly towards the most unskilled group of unemployed  
immigrants.

A job-package is characterised by the following conditions:

- It is contiguous (a successive program)
- It uses several activation instruments which actively interact and have employment as their  
  final purpose
- The effort is transparent and predictable
- And finally, the job-packages are introduced in sectors where job chances are high  
  (Arbejdsmarkedsstyrelsen, 2008).

These different elements in the job-packages are supposed to increase qualifications and  
language skills, as well as to generate a basic understanding of the Danish working culture  
among immigrants. Perhaps most importantly, by ensuring that everyone involved in the job-  
package knows what will happen when, and why it is expected that the job-motivation among the  
unemployed will increase (which among the policy makers is assumed to be low).

The job-packages do not contain new activation instruments; actually, all the individual  
instruments have been used in the ordinary activation policy for several years. But the job-  
packages differ by combining these elements into a coherent programme where all elements are  
clarified in advance.

Below we shortly describe one concrete example of a job-package for cleaning assistants  
(Internet source 3).

This job-package begins with a clarification process, including considerations about whether the  
unemployed person needs more language training.

The clarification process also include an introduction to the Danish labour market and focus on  
questions such as, what a company expects from its employees (e.g. working hours,  
involvement) and what employees expect from companies.

After the clarification process the unemployed moves on in the contiguous effort consisting of  
language training, elementary courses in cleaning in a vocational training centre, and practice in
a company.
After completing the training course, the immigrant may be hired as a cleaning worker in the company – sometimes in an ordinary position and sometimes under special conditions (e.g. with wage subsidy).

The intensity and the duration of the job-packages may vary. Sometimes job-packages are extended, for example because the unemployed needs more language training etc.

The job-packages do not necessarily have to take their starting point in these 12 concrete job-packages. Instead they can be used as a kind of inspiration for the development of other kinds of job-packages in the same sectors or in other sectors. One evaluation of the job-packages (MHT consult, 2008; see also below) also finds that this is the case in some of the municipalities.

The initiative to establish a job-package programme is taken jointly by the local jobcentre together with the relevant companies.

The job-packages can be established all over the country, but in order to develop and go more into depth with the job-packages (and some of the other instruments in the 4-part agreement) some of the actors in the 4-part agreement decided to start out a pilot-project entitled “Company-oriented integration” (In Danish: “Virksomhedsrettet integration”). The ambition of this pilot-project was to develop the job-packages methods and to ensure knowledge sharing (see also the project homepage: www.vip2.dk – Internet source 4).

This pilot-project included the Association of Danish Municipalities (KL), The confederation of Danish employers (DA) and The Danish confederation of labour unions (LO) alongside 5 municipalities (at first there was 6)

The pilot-project started in April 2007 and was intended to be completed by the end of March 2009, but the period was extended until the end of September 2009 in order to ensure knowledge sharing and development. This is one of the reasons why there are no final evaluations of this pilot project at the moment – only interim (see below). In the description of the results we will go more into depth with this pilot-project.

Questions for the contextual factors:
- What conditions have influenced the project?
- What factors improved the success of the project?
- What factor put a check on the success of the project?
- Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?

Contextual factors:
Several conditions can have influenced the job-packages. Some of the most important conditions are probably the economic situation and environment in Denmark during recent years and the institutional setup of the Danish welfare state and labour market.

There was an employment boom in Denmark in 2005-2008, and by 2007-2008 there was a substantial shortage of labour power at all skill levels, in spite of a very substantial immigration of guest workers from other countries, mainly from Eastern Europe. According to national figures (which are substantially lower than harmonized unemployment rates), unemployment declined to 1.6 per cent of the labour force in the early autumn of 2008. Even though economic growth was
negative in 2008 (minus 1.1 per cent), unemployment remained unusually low until the end of
the year.

Immigrants – western as well as non-western – have benefited very significantly from this
situation. To take the weakest group, the employment rate among immigrant women from non-
western countries increased from 26.8 per cent to 46.2 per cent from 1997 to 2007. The
strongest increase took place within the last few years. 2009 has witnessed a significant increase in unemployment (a doubling by July 2009), with particular grievances in manufactory and construction. For the first time in decades, unemployment is higher among men than among women. By July 2009, unemployment had reached 103,000 (3.7 per cent), according to official figures, as compared to 340,000 in 1993). As measured by standardized/harmonized unemployment rates, the figure was slightly above 6 per cent by July 2009 and around 10 per cent in 1993. This significant change in the unemployment can be seen as a consequence of the economic crisis in several countries.

This economic boom has probably improved the success of the job-packages, especially because several sectors have experienced a shortage of labour power. Under less favourable economic conditions, one could expect that the success of the job-packages might decline. However, the added value as compared to doing nothing might remain; further, it appears that immigrants have so far managed quite well as regards employment during the first stage of the economic recession since 2007/2008. Finally it is also noteworthy that the latest findings from the pilot-project entitled "Company-oriented integration" from November 2009 yielded quite good results (see results below).

A factor such as the economic boom is not specific for the Danish case. It is however the case for some other keys conditions, such as the institutional setup of the Danish welfare state and the labour market (such as high minimum wages and generous social security schemes) as well as a traditional strong involvement of the social partners on labour market policy and the strong alliance between trade unions and employer’s organisations.

The social partners in Denmark have for many years have a great importance for the organisation of the Danish labour market and Danish labour market policy, which is something special compared to the situation of the social partners in other countries.

During recent years the role and the importance of the social partners on the Danish labour market has in some areas been weakened, among other things when it comes to the new public employment system. On the other hand, when it comes to the 4-part agreement and the job-packages the social partners have had an important influence, among other things because they have been crucial for the formulation of the content in the 12 job-packages.

The institutional conditions for the Danish labour market are often referred to as “The Danish flexicurity system” or as the golden triangle. In this model high mobility between jobs (flexibility) is combined with a comprehensive safety net for unemployed (security) and an active labour market policy (Bredgaard; Larsen & Kongshøj Madsen, 2005). According to Madsen (2005: 271) “The Danish model therefore fits the picture of a possible "trade-off" between a very flexible employment relation and a social protection system combined with active labour market programmes, which defends the individuals from the potential costs of a low level of employment security”.

The Danish flexicurity system is also important in order to understand the key conditions for the job-packages, among other things the interplay between security and active labour market policy. But it is important to bear in mind that the group referred to in the flexicurity triangle is often people receiving unemployment benefit (insured), while the target group for the job-packages
mostly is people on social security benefit (un-insured) which often face several additional problems than unemployment.

As mentioned the institutional setup of the Danish welfare state (as well as the Scandinavian in general) has been criticised for the disincentives embedded in the social security system which, it is sometimes argued, furthermore tend to attract less employable immigrants to the country. Besides it is argued that there is a tension between the low level of qualifications of many immigrants and a labour market system characterised by high minimum wages and generous social security.

The question is whether we should see the institutional setup of the Danish welfare state and labour market as contextual factors that either improve or put a check on the success of the job-packages. Whether it is the case or not is a topic which is very complicated and up for discussion. But if we consider the job-packages as a distinct policy instrument it is unquestionable that they rest on existing tools in the legislation (such as several activation programs, wage subsidy etc.), which is very important for the job-packages and the methods used.

Questions for the results:

- What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?:
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
  - putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
  - the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
  - the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;
  - .....  
- To what extent have these goals been achieved?

- To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?
- How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct / indirect)?
- Are there any differences in results among different target groups?
- How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?

Results:

The overall goal with the 4-part agreement is twofold: To improve immigrants’ chances of finding a foothold in the labour market and at the same time recruit employees to industries facing labour shortages. Furthermore the purpose has been to develop methods and initiatives in order to fulfil these goals.

The overall problem addressed by the job-packages is low employment among immigrants –
especially among third country immigrants. The more specific problems/barriers among immigrants which the job-packages are expected to address are the following:

- Lack of education and language skills
- Lack of basic understanding of the Danish working culture
- Lack of work motivation

When it comes to a judgment of whether the goals have been achieved and problems resolved, it is important to bear in mind that it can be difficult to separate the effect of job-packages from other effects, because the job-packages, not have to do with a single isolated project, but instead are a new employment instrument implemented at the national level. But we can use the experience from the pilot-project entitled “Company-oriented integration” in the five municipalities in order to point out some results.

Some evaluations have been made about the job-packages, but the number is limited and most of the results are at the moment preliminary, among other things because the pilot-project with the five municipalities will be closed by the end of September 2009. Moreover, quantitative assessments are particularly rare, which is why some of the results we will refer to are more qualitative (e.g. about more initial experiences).

Whether the overall goal with the 4- part agreement has been achieved is therefore difficult to answer fully. Further work will hopefully bring some more results.

One evaluation focuses on experiences and results from the pilot-project “Company-oriented Integration” between some of the social partners and five municipalities, which were presented earlier (MHT consult, 2008).

This evaluation is from April 2008 and finds that the use of job-packages is widespread in the five municipalities, and that several new kinds of job-packages have been developed and introduced. Furthermore, the evaluation finds that the five municipalities in the project have experienced a high reduction in the number of social benefit receivers – especially when it comes to receivers of unemployed benefit and to a lesser degree recipient of social assistance (MHT consult, 2008).

The evaluation also points out some more negative findings. Hence, the evaluation points out that the knowledge about the job-packages among companies is often low and that some companies are uncertain and other directly sceptical when it comes to the believe in integrating the remaining group of unemployed into the labour market (MHT consult, 2008). One improvement proposal could therefore be to focus more on increasing the knowledge about the job-packages by do more communication and develop descriptions and pamphlets about good examples from the use of job-packages.

Some more updated results about the job-packages from the project “Company oriented integration” stem from a closing conference in May 2009, where the results were presented. In the period from April 2007 to May 2009 the five municipalities succeeded to introduce 313 job-packages, and help 117 immigrants with a weak labour market connection into employment (Internet source 5).

In a newsletter from November 2009 some very promising results were outlined. Hence, 39 percent of the unemployed who have completed a job-package have obtained ordinary employment. Another 30 percent have not finished the activities in the job-packages yet (Internet source 6). The next step is to spread the knowledge and the experience about the success associated with using these job-packages to the other Danish municipalities. Therefore a network entitled “Job-package ambassadors” has been established, consisting of representatives (employees) from the Danish jobcentres.

Another evaluation is from December 2008 (Arbejdmarkedsstyrelsen, 2008) and does not only focus on
the five municipalities participating in the pilot-project. Instead, the purpose of this evaluation was to provide an overview of the use of the job-packages in all the Danish municipalities. Empirically, it is based on a survey conducted in the Danish jobcentres where social workers are asked about their experiences with the job-packages. Furthermore, several qualitative interviews have been conducted.

The authors stress that the findings should be interpreted as preliminary guidelines rather than as final conclusions.

Some of the findings of this evaluation are listed below:

- Many social workers do not use the job-packages in the employment effort and the concrete experiences with the job-packages among social workers are modest
- The social workers have very different views about what a job-package should include, which can be attributed to the fact that many social workers not have much knowledge about the job-packages

Moreover, the evaluations find that the unemployed – according to the social workers - are more motivated if they know the entire process in advance and that the chances to obtain a job and remain employed is bigger if the unemployed have completed a contiguous plan, as compared to single activation programmes.

To sum up, it is our judgement - on the background on these primarily results and the limited number of evaluations - that the spread of the job-packages all over the country has been limited (Arbejdsmarkedsstyrelsen, 2008), but when they have been used the experiences have been successful (MHT Consult, 2008).

Whether the two goals mentioned above have been achieved is not easy to answer. In the period from 2006-2008 the employment rate among immigrants from non-western countries has increased from 49,1 to 56. But as mentioned, it can be complicated to separate the effect of job-packages from other effects.

The immigrants which during the job-packages have find a job has to a large extend find job in industries facing labour shortages.

Neither of the two evaluations takes into account the effects of job-packages on language skills, knowledge about the working culture and motivation. But as mentioned does one of the evaluations point out that the unemployed – according to the social workers - are more motivated if they know the entire process in advance (Arbejdsmarkedsstyrelsen, 2008).

Whether the problems have been resolved depends on, whether the problems addressed (lack of education and language skills, lack knowledge about Danish working culture and lack of job-motivation) were really the problem in the first place. Whether this is the case is questionable. As mentioned, also lack of employment relevant network and problems in the employment effort can also be pointed out as some of the problems third country immigrants are facing.

Questions for important lessons:
- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)? What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?
Important lessons:

The success and fail factors

Some of the success and fail factors have already been mentioned above. Below some of them are summed up:

- The spread of job-packages all over the country has been limited and many companies does not seem to have knowledge about the job-packages – although it is the social partners who have played a key role in formulating these packages. One recommendation is therefore to focus more on the communication aspect and knowledge spreading (e.g. MHT consult).

- The job-packages were implemented at the same time as a comprehensive reform of the public sector was carried out from in January 2007 and a new organization of the public employment system where introduced. Hence, in 2007, a two-tier employment system was merged into a unified structure consisting of 91 local Jobcentres. One of the evaluations point out, that this has removed the focus away from, among other things, job-packages (Arbejdsmarkedsstyrelsen, 2008).

- As mentioned, the 4-part agreement can be characterized as a so-called framework law, which means that it is up to different actors to implement it at the local level. The question is, whether the actors on the local level are also willing to use the job-packages in periods with economic recession? We have no knowledge about whether this is the case. This economic boom has probably improved the success of the job-packages, especially because several sectors have experienced a shortage of labour power. Under less favourable economic conditions, one could expect that the success of the job-packages might decline. However, the added value as compared to doing nothing might remain; further, it appears that immigrants have so far managed quite well as regards employment during the first stage of the economic recession since 2007/2008.

- It is questionable whether the institutional factors of the Danish welfare state and Labour market can be seen as success or fail factors, but whatever they are an important prerequisite for the existence of the job packages.

- An important success factor is the establishment of a direct contact to companies for unemployed immigrants during the job-packages, which can help creating an employment relevant network.

Are the job-packages transferable?

The job-packages should be transferable to unemployed facing other barriers, e.g. more external barriers (discrimination barriers) but also to unemployed facing barriers such as lack of employment-relevant network. In order words, we could expect that job-packages also could help fighting different kind of discrimination and compensate for a lack of employment-relevant networks among immigrants.

Furthermore, the job-packages are also transferable to other target groups (e.g. unemployed in general). In other words, unemployed in general can also benefit from this approach.

It is more questionable whether the job-packages are transferable to other countries. First of all we have to take into account, that the Danish employment system is build upon several institutional features, which makes it possible to deliver financial support to the job-packages (e.g. wage subsidy). This is a very important element in the job-packages. Furthermore, the
social partners, who have played a crucial role in the development of the job-packages, are strong in Denmark. This is important to bear in mind because of the fact, that the social partners compared to policy makers in general probably have a better feeling of the labour market and the problems employees and employers are facing.

But the underlying idea behind the job-packages is transferable if these institutional features are taking into account.

To sum up, project executers have to bear in mind when applying their approach in their own project that institutional factors are very important. Furthermore the spread of knowledge about the job-packages is important.

What are the most important lessons from the use of these job-packages?

Some of the most important lessons from the use of job-packages in Denmark are listed below:

- Contiguous activation programmes, which are transparent and predictable, as well as a holistic approach can make a difference. The importance of this is illustrated by the fact, that many unemployed immigrants in the five municipalities in the project "Company oriented integration" reached employment by using this practice.

- This success is supported by the fact, that many of the unemployed – according to the social workers, significantly easier obtain employment and stay in employment compared to persons who have participated in isolated activation programmes.

But, as already mentioned, we have to take into account that it is complicated to isolate the effects of the job-packages from other efforts, and that some of these conclusions are based upon the social workers judgements, which is why the findings should be interpreted as preliminary guidelines rather than as final conclusions.

- Contextual factors matters - the institutional setup of the Danish welfare state and labour market, the role of the social partners and not at least the economic boom during the last years. But as mentioned it is also up for discussion whether the institutional setup only acts as success factors or also in some instances fail factors.

- The introduction of job-packages does not necessarily mean that they also are being used. Knowledge-spreading is therefore very important.

6. Overview literature (sources used)


Bredgaard, Thomas; Larsen, Flemming; and Kongshøj Madsen, Per (2005). Det fleksible danske arbejdsmarked – en forskningsoversigt i Flexicurity – Udfordringer for den danske model: Beskæftigelsesministeriet


Madsen, Per Kongshøj (2005): “The Danish Road to 'Flexicurity' Where are we? And how did we get there?” i Bredgaard & Larsen (red.). Employment policy from different angles: DJØF Publishing Copenhagen.


Internet sources:

Internet source 1: Note about the four-part agreement:
http://www.nyidanmark.dk/resources.ashx/Resources/Publikationer/Andet/2006/aftaletekst_firepart.pdf

Internet source 2:
http://www.vip2.dk/Logoor_billeder/S%C3%A5dan%20pakker%20du%20en%20jobpakke.pdf

Internet source 3: http://www.nyidanmark.dk/NR/rdonlyres/38209341-84D9-4855-BF07-D5C8EEA5B1E2/0/rengoeringsmedarbejder.pdf

Internet source 4: Homepage for the pilot-project – Company oriented Integration:
http://www.vip2.dk/

Internet source 5: Speeches from the closing conference in May 2009:

Internet source 6: Newsletter from the pilot-project – Company oriented Integration:
http://www.vip2.dk/default.aspx
Background information

Name case study: Reducing the risk of unemployment among young people who speak languages other than Estonian

Name country expert: Ervin Trofimov
Questions for the problem definition:

- What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?
- What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?
- What is the scope of the problem?
- What supposedly caused this problem?
- Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?
- Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

Problem definition:

East-Estonia is the area where most third country migrants reside. The surroundings do not contribute to speaking Estonian, since a large part of the service sector is comprised of Russian-speaking people, which in turn allows for residents to go about their lives with generally limited knowledge of the Estonian language. This situation is critical for young people, who, often having given up learning Estonian, concentrate on English or another foreign language and setting their goals abroad. This leads to a significant outflow of workforce from Estonia – a force that could effectively be used to support the region’s struggling economy. With poor language and social skills needed to perform in the competitive labour market, young people of East-Estonia face a great risk of being unemployed.

The contributing factors are a poor education system, insufficient social and language skills, lack of retraining opportunities and discrimination. The main reason for unemployment rises in this area being the restructuring of the economy in the 1990-s. There simply are not enough young people with suitable qualifications to fill the specific jobs in the area. Most of the ones with enough qualifications and language skills move to the capital Tallinn or abroad for better salaries.

The data from Estonian Labour Force Surveys allow for clear and unequivocal conclusions to be drawn: the transition experience in the labour market was considerably more dramatic for non-Estonians than for Estonians. The risk of unemployment for non-Estonians has consistently been greater than for Estonians, and their lag in employment in top positions on the job market has been noticeable. The differences are also significant in the case of young people.

The economic boom at the beginning of this century was not accompanied by any significant changes in the distribution of risks of unemployment and opportunities. With regard to the prevention of risks, the economic boom turned out to be more beneficial for Estonians, with the unemployment rate for Estonians decreasing faster than for non-Estonians: the unemployment rate for non-Estonians was 1.6 times higher in 2001, while by 2006 the difference was 2.4 times. In the case of young people (20-34-year-olds), the Estonians' advantage tended to increase - the unemployment rates of young non-Estonians was less than double that of Estonians in 2001 (17.1% and 11.8% respectively), while by 2006, it was more than double (10.7% and 4.0% respectively).

However, the great lead held by Estonians in employment in top positions in the labour market did decrease somewhat - less than 30% of Estonians and only 15% of non-Estonians worked as managers or professionals in 2001, while by 2006 the corresponding indicators were 31% and 19%, or the difference decreased from 2 times to 1.6 times. Among 20-34-year-olds, the difference decreased as follows: while 26% of young Estonians and only 10% of non-Estonians were employed as managers or professionals in 2001, by 2006, the corresponding ratios were 20% and 17%; in other words, the overrepresentation of young Estonians in top positions in the labour market had decreased from 2.6 times to 1.8 times. Overall non-Estonians are doing better in top positions, as the language skills of non-Estonians are valued more. Perfect knowledge of both
Russian and Estonian is invaluable for working as an executive. Estonian Labour Market study shows that about half of 15-24-year-old non-Estonians believe that their skills are inadequate for finding a suitable job (among Estonians this percentage is 38%). Young non-Estonians’ negative opinion on the adequacy of their skills may also be related to generally high expectations, although this nevertheless demonstrates greater uncertainty among young non-Estonians regarding their work-related knowledge. Compared to older age groups, young people generally give the adequacy of their skills a more negative assessment, although this may also be caused by lack of work experience, or by the fact that the young people who are still studying do not consider their skills to be adequate for getting an acceptable job. Similar to young non-Estonians, more than half of the oldest age group of non-Estonians assesses their work-related skills and knowledge to be insufficient.

There is an ongoing tendency that young people who have lower education and live away from bigger cities such as Tallinn and Narva are unable to find work. Under these circumstances this group has a high risk of becoming involved in alcohol, drugs and crime. It should be noted that the regions covered in the project are at the top of alcohol, drug abuse and crime rates in Estonia.

Considering these factors, the project was devised to reduce the risk of unemployment of young people through language and vocational training (a common trend in Estonia’s policy toward third country migrants today).

The target group was extended to include ages from 16 to 35, one reason being a poor interest from young people in the project and the need to run the project on the full scale. This helped to involve other risk groups - people recently released from prison and mothers at home with children. The project targets at unemployed people with multiple risk factors: language, age and location.

This problem is specific to East-Estonia and Tallinn along with Tallinn county Harjumaa. The project was performed in cooperation with regional authorities and the Estonian Labour Market Board.

Questions for the approach:

- What approach has been used to address the problem?
- What are the core elements of the approach?
- What is the intensity and duration of the approach?
- How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?
- What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general (international literature, (policy) studies)?
- Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?
- What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?
- Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?

Approach:

The approach consisted of Estonian language training and vocational training. This is also the general approach of the Estonian Integration Program for 2000-2007 and 2008-2013.

The core elements were:

- Training programme consisting of methods focused on how to look for work, how to present yourself to the employer, and the rules and regulations of the labour market. Training for 200 people in Russian and Estonian languages. Length of training: 80 hours.
Estonian language tuition. Length of tuition: 120 hours.
Organising an Estonian language examination
Vocational training
Work trainee program

The duration of the project was 22 months in the timeframe of 20.04.2006 – 30.06.2008
The language courses were intensive, but what made them somewhat less effective was a 3 month (over the summer) gap between the courses and the actual examination.

The approach is supposed to resolve the problem through educating young people in how to find work and present themselves and by offering specific vocational language training and work trainee programme.
These kinds of projects are fairly common, although the combination of the current core elements is unique and innovative in the Estonian case.

Although language training programmes are fairly common in Estonia, this particular combination of project elements and the target group make the project an unique case for Estonia. There are no materials on this kind of projects being undertaken elsewhere. The main factors that distinguish this approach are language training combined with social and vocational training in a risk target group in a high-risk unemployment geographic area.

**The approach has been edited during the course in several ways:**
First, to ensure the full attendance of the project, the target group was broadened to include 16-35 year olds.
Second: since there were more participants than expected, the vocational training staff was lacking. This was solved by sending some participants to other vocational training courses in the area.
Third: participants were uninterested in participating in the work trainee programme, because they have been used previously as free labour force and not hired afterwards in similar situations. This was resolved by asking the employers for “notice letters” which promised to hire the trainees after the completion of the course.

**Questions for the contextual factors:**
- What conditions have influenced the project?
- What factors improved the success of the project?
- What factor put a check on the success of the project?
- Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?

**Contextual factors:**
As a positive influence on the project was the construction of a large shopping centre in the area, which created many jobs for women. The women were active to use this opportunity.
The men, on the other hand, were passive. This could be due to lack of motivation or attention given to psychological aspects. Perhaps such a course (psychological training) should be added to later projects, especially where young people are concerned. This is a common problem in such type of projects in Estonia.
The biggest factor in the success of the project was that the number of people who found work after the project completely surpassed the expectations and original goals. This was partly due to a small restructuring of the project and increasing the target group to include slightly older people, than would generally be considered in a youth project (in this case 16-35 years).

Questions for the results:

- What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?:
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
  - putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
  - the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
  - the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;
  - ...

- To what extent have these goals been achieved?

- To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?
- How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct / indirect)?
- Are there any differences in results among different target groups?
- How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?

Results:

Direct goals of the project were:

1. 200 participants have completed the work seekers training.
Result: 164 participants completed the training successfully with 80% attendance rate. Participants found the training extremely helpful and many participants found a job after the training (based on oral feedback).

2. 200 participants have completed the Estonian language training course
Result: 206 participants registered for the course and 92 completed the Estonian language examination.

3. 30 participants have completed the vocational training
Result: 27 participants completed the training successfully, 2 quit during the course and 3 cancelled. Based on oral feedback, some of the participants have found work and others are actively looking.

4. 80 participants have completed the work training programme
Result: Work trainee programme is equally unpopular among young people as well as employers. 50 participants completed the training. Some participants were given notice letters from potential employers that they would be hired after the completion of the whole programme. Those who were given the notice letters, were hired.

5. 110 participants have found employment
Result: 146 participants found work
The coordinators believe that the unemployment risk has subsided among the target group and the “word is out” among the people that similar projects will be undertaken.

The goals of the project and actual results:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Planned result</th>
<th>Actual result</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total unemployed participants in the project</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>333</td>
<td>Because some participants did not require all activities in the project, new members were recruited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>307</td>
<td>Women are more active in registering and participating in projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>During the course of the project there was a higher demand for male workforce. The remaining unemployed were passive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants who found work after participating in the project</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>146</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>During the course of the project demand for women in the market sector grew substantially (several shopping centres were opened in the area). Women took active advantage of the opportunity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Most of the young males were passive and not actively interested in finding work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jobs created during the course of the project</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>33</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>Women were more active in entrepreneurship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonian language examination results</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>92/39</td>
<td>92 participants registered for the exam out of which 39 passed. This is considered a good result</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There was a much higher activity and success rate among women than men. This could be partly due to the large opening of jobs in the middle of the project (shopping mall), where many women found work. At the same time, the need for male labour force was high, but it was the lack of initiative and interest from the young men, that kept the results low.

The results are achieved because of the effectiveness of the approach. Vocational training completed with vocational specific Estonian language training is the method proven to be most effective in these areas of the country. However, the project showed that it was very difficult to engage passive and long term unemployed males, which is clearly visible in the project outcome. This is a research topic for further development.

The project is planned to continue in West-Estonia.
Problems faced during the project:

1. Lack of staff for the vocational training groups. In the case of some training types, there were few or no participants. The problem was solved by directing participants to other vocational training courses operating in the area. Sometimes this approach was not successful due to lack of space, additional costs etc. In some cases participants, who went to other vocational training courses, did not return.

2. Before the start of the project, the team did research the needs of local employers in terms of vocational training courses and the exact technicalities of the training. As a result some active participants were given notice letters, that they would be hired after the completion of the whole course (including vocational training).

3. The unemployed were not interested in participating in work training. They feel themselves being used as a free workforce, since after the training, employers are not interested in hiring them. The project team sees as a solution to raise the unemployment benefits and implementing regulations that forbid to use newly hired workers as cheap labour force.

4. Some participants were not interested in participating in the project until the end. They chose the courses that they liked and quit on their own account after some time to participate in another course or training elsewhere. The project team sees a solution in restricting the movement of participants in one project, so they cannot simultaneously participate in several projects.

Questions for important lessons:
- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)? What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?

Important lessons:

The project was carried out on a very small scale. This tends to be the often the case, since different approaches are being tested and tried out constantly. These kind of social projects tend to operate on a small scale in Estonia due to lack of multiple factors such as providers, staff, training, experience and funding.

The project is considered successful since some of the goals and expectations have been surpassed considerably. These results lead to the planning of the next phase of the project, which will take place in West-Estonia.

A large part of the success was due to cooperation with local governments, social centres and coordinators as well as the experience of the Integration Foundation of Estonia (MEIS) in coordinating projects and strategy activities since 1998 on the state level.
The main success factors were: a carefully chosen target group, geographical location, lack of similar projects in the area, perfect coordination between the project team and local governments, well written project that insured they would not run out of funding in case of restructuring goals/risks.

Others in Estonia can learn how to coordinate a fairly complex project and adapt to changing conditions.

With difficult target groups, is wise to keep the project scale small in order to have better control and overview as well as more flexibility to change some approaches in the middle of the project, if necessary, with less risk.

This approach is transferrable to other areas and countries with the notion that it requires extensive collaboration between local authorities and potential employers. Perhaps even some agreements of employment could be made to ensure the success of the project.

It is increasingly difficult to motivate young people and ensure their participation in such projects. Potential risks such as not being employed after work training should be avoided. It should be noted that in such rather difficult target groups as these consisting of, among others, long term unemployed, recently released from prison and single mothers - the results are rather satisfactory (see goals and actual results).

6. Overview literature (sources used)

1. Project materials from the archive of Integration Foundation of Estonia (MEIS)
   Liimi 1, Tallinn 10621 ESTONIA
   Telephone: +372 6599 021
   Fax: +372 6599 022

2. Interview and additional info:
   Eda Silberg, MEIS Administrative director
   eda.silberg@meis.ee
In-depth case study France

Background information
Name case study: Zones urbaines sensibles
Name country expert: Laure Kaeser, Sandro Cattacin
Questions for the problem definition:
- What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?
- What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?
- What is the scope of the problem?
- What supposedly caused this problem?
- Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?
- Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

Problem definition:

* The immediate cause for starting up the project was based on the observation that there are deep socioeconomics inequalities among French urban areas. In fact, some of them are characterised by low level of income, cheap housing conditions and strong communitarian networks. In those areas, about one quarter of the inhabitants are French by naturalization or foreigners, among them two third come from outside EU. Foreigners are more concerned by this situation. These (urban) neighbourhoods cumulate poverty and marginality. In a certain way, they concentrate some of the socioeconomics difficulties of the country: lower qualification of the population, unemployment, lack of economic development. These areas are called sensitive urban areas (zones urbaines sensibles, ZUS), and constitute specific zones inside urban areas, defined by the French government to be a priority of urban policies. There are 751 ZUS, which covers about 4 650 000 persons.

* The high level of unemployment that characterizes the ZUS, and especially the third country nationals, is a structural problem. From the 1970s, flows of migrants, especially from Maghreb, came to France to fulfill the needs of the French economy. They were mainly established in the industrial basins. With family reunification, immigrants settled in France and gave born to a second generation of migrants. At the same time, the industrial sector was in a constant slow down. The rate of unemployment has gradually increased. Suburbs have then concentrated socioeconomic difficulties as high unemployment level (reinforced by job discrimination, in particular for the youngest generation) and lack of economic dynamism.

* The target groups concerned by public policies undertaken in the ZUS are the highly touched by unemployment, which means young people. In fact, one third of people between 20 and 29 years old are unemployed in 2002. There is no specific measure for third country migrants but they are by the fact integrated into the public policies which aim at the whole ZUS population: in 2007, 23% of the 15-59 years old who live in the ZUS and have a high rate of unemployment are immigrants, particularly from outside UE.

* Nevertheless, the problem of high unemployment is not specific to young people or third country migrants: about 12% of the ZUS population aged between 15 and 59 years old was unemployed in 2007 (against 6% at the national level).

Questions for the approach:
- What approach has been used to address the problem?
- What are the core elements of the approach?
- What is the intensity and duration of the approach?
- How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?
- What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general (international literature, (policy) studies)?
- Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?
- What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?
- Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?
Approach:

* There are 751 ZUS, of which 100 are the so-called urban free zones (‘zones franches urbaines’ or ZFUs). For thirty years these zones have been at the centre of renewal projects and government initiatives to improve quality of life and reduce inequalities. The French government’s principal aim in defining the ZUS has been to revitalize local economies. To this end, starting in 1996, the ZUS have benefited from measures such as tax exemptions for inhabitants and employers, and programs for helping the unemployed back into work. This latter policy measure involves the use of special types of employment contract. While the use of these contracts is not confined to the ZUS, they are aimed at the long-term unemployed and those in receipt of certain social welfare benefits, two categories which are disproportionately present in these areas. In the non-commercial sector, there is the supported contract (‘contrat d’accompagnement’) for unemployed persons who have socio-professional difficulties, and the contract for the future (‘contrat d’avenir’) aimed at those in receipt of certain social welfare benefits. In the commercial sector, there is the employment initiative contract (‘contrat initiative emploi’) which is aimed at the long-term unemployed. In addition to these special contracts, the National Agency for Employment (Agence Nationale pour l’Emploi or ANPE) also runs other programs designed to support those seeking work. Special emphasis is put on these programs within the ZUS. Indeed, at the end of December 2006, 35.8% of young people under 26 living in the ZUS were involved in these programs as against 26.2% for those living outside the ZUS. The ANPE programs consist of three measures: social support (advice about the available housing, health and psychological support services), vocational guidance counselling, and assistance with job-hunting and finding appropriate training. These measures are not specifically addressed at third country migrants although migrants are eligible to participate in the various programs. Indeed, they constitute a group characterised by a high level of unemployment.

* In this paper, we want to focus on the tax exemption measures in the urban free zones (ZFUs). The ZFUs are ZUSs that are characterised precisely by these tax exemptions. A ZFU is a district of 10,000 inhabitants where the government has decided to use exceptional means to promote economic revitalization. The core element of this approach is to offer exemptions from tax and social insurance charges to small businesses (50 or fewer employees) already operating in the ZFU or that wish to establish themselves there. In return, businesses must commit to ensuring that at least one third of their employees are residents of the Zone in question. This system operates alongside a program of actions led by the local authorities, their partners and the State, in areas of direct concern to local residents and businesses: urban renovation, professional education, access to employment, public transport, public services, services and commercial development, enterprise development and so forth.

* The principal aim of the tax exemption system in the ZFUs is to attract enterprises that could potentially employ ZFU and/or ZUS residents. The fiscal incentives are reinforced by support programs that aim to facilitate the settlement of enterprises in the ZFUs. If the ZFUs are to function properly, these measures— appointing a single ZFU ‘representative’, introducing an administrative ‘one-stop shop’ for enterprises, developing the range of available business premises and so forth — have to be put in place before new businesses start to become established. The first generation of ZFUs (1997) did not have these services while the second generation (2004) did. The results cannot be measured precisely but the measures taken to facilitate the setting-up of businesses do seem to have contributed to attracting new employers into the ZUSs. In the case of tax exemption measures, then, it seems that it is not simply the fiscal incentive that counts, but the creation of a more generally favorable environment for the establishment of businesses. In the case of enterprise settlement in the ZUSs, increasing the availability of commercial property is one of the key measures that needs to be put in place.
The ZFUs are the core element of this urban policy. As of January 1997, 44 such zones had been created. By January 2004 there were another 41 and by January 2006 another 15, making a total of 100. At the time of writing the policy approach remains in place and is kept under evaluation by the National Observatory for ZUS.

The ZFUs are concentrated in those urban areas that have the highest level of socioeconomic problems. More precisely, the departments that have the largest number of ZFUs are Val-de-Marne, Essonne, Nord, and Bouches-du-Rhône. Businesses in the ZFUs are entitled to a total exemption from the employer's social insurance contribution for a duration of 5 years. A progressively-diminishing partial exemption is granted for a further three years for businesses with more than five employees, and for nine years for businesses with fewer than five employees. This approach is intended to reduce the rate of unemployment and revitalize these urban areas by developing economic opportunities for their residents.

Tax exemptions are usually granted to individuals or organizations that fall within a group which the government wishes to promote economically. The practice of promoting certain types of economic activity by reducing the tax burden on those enterprises who are involved in that activity is widespread. Depending on the purpose of the tax exemption, the effects can be highly variable. In certain cases, exemptions attract enterprises in a specific area of activity that then benefits from economic development. In other cases, attracting enterprises to one region may give rise to a relative neglect of neighboring regions and thus to economic disparities.

Ireland is often referred to as the "Celtic Tiger", a name invented in the 1990s in order to draw attention to similarities between the Irish economy and the fast-growing 'tiger economies' of southeast Asia. Indeed, between 1994 and 2000 the rate of growth of Irish GNP was between 6 and 11%. Many economists attribute this economic growth principally to a low rate of corporate taxation (10 to 12.5% throughout the 1990s) although this was not the only measure taken to support economic growth. High levels of foreign direct investment, improved economic management, funding from the European Union and a new "social partnership" approach to economic and social policy development also contributed to Irish economic success. Consequently, the unemployment rate fell significantly to reach 4% in 2000, while income tax was about half of its 1980s rate. What can be learnt from this experience is that while tax exemption policies can contribute positively to economic development, they cannot be conceived separately from a broader strategic approach. In other words, fiscal incentives alone are unlikely to lead to economic development and the consequent reduction of unemployment, but they can nevertheless amount to an excellent strategy to encourage the establishment of businesses where environmental factors are also favorable (level of education, social partnership, support from richer region/country, exchange of information on good practices).

Tax exemption policies have been applied in other parts of the world, especially in developing country 'export processing zones' (EPZ), sometimes also known as 'zones franches'. These zones are generally specialized in the labour-intensive production of consumer goods. The main reason that businesses invest in these zones is to reduce the costs of production through tax exemptions and low wages. The Madagascar EPZ has been the object of detailed studies on its macroeconomic impact in terms of exports and jobs. The 1990 decision to choose an export-led growth strategy followed the structural adjustment policies adopted in the late 1980s under Bretton Woods Institution recommendations. Generous fiscal incentives and low wages led to sustained growth in the Madagascaran zone franche. At the end of 2004, there were 180 firms in business with over 100,000 employees. However, expansion was halted in 2005 by the expiry of the World Trade Organisation Agreement on Textiles and Clothing, which had the effect of ending quotas on clothing products, a sector in which the Madagascaran zone franchewas specialized. Despite a major contribution to job creation, real wages have decreased in the zone franche and labour standards have deteriorated due to increased international competition.
In the international literature, tax exemptions are treated as subsidies intended to attract enterprises. Nevertheless, it is not guaranteed that the on-paper potential of such measures will be achieved in practice. It may be the case that few local residents are actually employed in the newly created enterprises, for example if the incoming businesses operate in high-tech sectors but local workers are generally low-skilled. There is also a risk that fiscal incentives will be given to enterprises that would have set up shop in any case. Finally, incentives may be difficult to withdraw. The enterprises that have benefitted may simply say "if the subvention is cut off, then we leave". A further complication is that is very difficult to demonstrate that policy interventions have had the desired effect. Any improvement or deterioration in the employment situation, for example, could simply be the result of larger economic factors.

In the French case, tax exemptions should be included as part of a wider urban policy. Improving the situation of the French banlieues (suburbs) demands a global strategy that includes not only employment but also education, health, public transport and the environment. The approach has been monitored during the course of the project by the National Observatory for ZUSs, created in 2003, whose reports are available at http://www.ville.gouv.fr/rubrique.php3?id_rubrique=24. Each year a comprehensive report evaluates the impact of public policies in the ZUSs. They contain descriptive statistics with analyses of the following topics: employment, enterprises, incomes, housing, health, education, security, and perspectives. The National Observatory for ZUSs was established just before the second wave of ZUS creation in 2004 to evaluate the successes and the failures of urban policy. The distinguishing characteristics of the second generation of ZFUs — measures complementary to tax exemptions (described above), the minimum 33% local employment ‘quota’ (raised from 20%) and the opening of the various incentives to the non-commercial sector— are a result of the Observatory’s work.

Questions for the contextual factors:
- What conditions have influenced the project?
- What factors improved the success of the project?
- What factors put a check on the success of the project?
- Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?

Contextual factors:

The French government’s approach has been to target policy interventions on urban zones known to have particular socioeconomic problems. Since 2003, the impact of these interventions has been evaluated by the National Observatory for ZUSs. These evaluations have led to revision and improvement of policy measures as well as better targeting.

There are many factors that have contributed to the success of the ZUS project. Of these, perhaps the most important was the adoption of a global urban employment policy including but not limited to tax exemption measures. Tax incentives were embedded in a wider policy of refusal to conceive the ZUSs/ZFUs as ‘ghettos’. To fulfil this aim, public transport and parking facilities have been developed to improve access to urban centres from ZFUs and vice versa. Urban renovation, housing improvement, health and education policies have also been supported by the local authorities to better achieve these aims. Moreover, tax incentives have had an accelerator role in the development of enterprises: material and immaterial investments have been developed faster. Some entrepreneurs have begun to take a longer-term perspective on the establishment of their businesses in particular areas and on the integration of the business into the social life of the zone.
Nevertheless, defining specific geographical areas as targets for public policy interventions may also have negative consequences. For example, second or third-generation immigrant young people may suffer from a double discrimination when applying for a job: their ethnic origin, as revealed by their foreign-sounding names, and their status as residents of an ZUS, as revealed by their address. In addition, the effect of fiscal incentives as a means to attract new enterprises has been limited by the frequent absence of match between the kind of professional profile sought by the new entrepreneurs (high-tech enterprises) and the skills of the job-seekers living in the ZFUs. In fact, half of those hired in the ZFUs in 2006 had a level of education below the baccalaureate. Of these, 22.1% had completed only the first stage of secondary schooling (the ‘brevet’). For this reason, the main business sectors represented in the ZFUs are the construction, services to enterprises, transport and domestic sectors. Attracting enterprises via the use of tax incentives also gave rise to another problem: not enough commercial premises were available to meet the demand. The enterprise creation rate varies depending on the availability of premises. The more commercial premises that are available, the greater the impact on enterprise development. Finally, because of the time-limited nature of tax incentives, ZFUs are often seen as a place to start an enterprise that will later be transferred to another region. It is also the case, of course, that not all businesses survive: only 32.5% of the 29,000 enterprises created in the ZFUs between 1997 and 2001 were still active in the ZFUs after 5.5 years.

Other national cases described in the literature suggest that the French case is far from unique. First of all, the inclusion of tax exemptions as part of a broader set of policy measures is common practice. Tax exemptions in and for themselves are not the solution to structural socioeconomic problems, as the Irish case shows. Second, tax exemptions promote the establishment of new enterprises and (consequently) job creation. In the UK, the free zones created in the early 1980s led to the attraction of many small firms and the creation of 58,000 jobs. The factors that tend to limit the impact of tax exemption also seem to be internationally consistent. As seen in the ZFU case, the availability of commercial premises is often a limiting factor. In the case of the UK, high rents in the zones cancelled out other benefits, whereas in the French case many enterprises were simply unable to find appropriate premises. Furthermore, because of the mismatch between the professional profiles sought by high tech enterprises and the low average skill level in the ZFUs, some sectors like the construction and domestic sectors are overrepresented among the businesses operating in ZFUs. The same mismatch seems to have been a factor in the UK free zones, where no jobs were created in high-tech manufacturing. Finally, in the UK case, while time-limited fiscal incentives were initially successful in attracting investment, many firms collapsed when the incentives ended. It may also have been the case that time limits may have discouraged new investment. As we have already seen, this is similar to the French ZFU experience.

Questions for the results:

- What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
  - putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
  - the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
  - the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;
  - …..

- To what extent have these goals been achieved?

- To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?

- How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct/indirect)?

Are there any differences in results among different target groups?

How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?

**Results:**

The aim of tax exemption in the ZFUs is to make these areas more dynamic by attracting enterprises that would otherwise be reluctant to settle in these zones. The ultimate direct policy goal is to create employment for ZUS residents. An indirect goal is to provide equal rights and opportunities for ZUS residents, including third country migrants and second and third generation migrants. The rate of unemployment among ethnic minorities is higher due to job discrimination.

Between 1999 and 2002, the number of businesses located in the ZUSs grew by 10.5%. Since the introduction of ZFUs in 1997, a special dynamism has touched them, especially those having commercial premises. Between 1997 and 2004, a large number of enterprises and jobs were transferred into the ZFUs. The support services for enterprises we discussed above were introduced in 2004 along with the second generation of ZFUs. Business development in the ZFUs has proceeded as shown in this table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2002</th>
<th>2003</th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2007</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Enterprises</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>benefiting from</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>corporate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tax exemption</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in the ZFUs</td>
<td>9'248</td>
<td>10'147</td>
<td>13'500</td>
<td>13'500</td>
<td>19'083</td>
<td>20'916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employees</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>giving right to</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>social and</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>corporate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tax exemption</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in which: newly</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hired employees</td>
<td>7'923</td>
<td>8'376</td>
<td>11'930</td>
<td>13'527</td>
<td>15'825</td>
<td>18'452</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Accoss, Dares*

It is notable that the number of new enterprises being established in the ZFUs has increased. The goal of attracting enterprises into the ZFUs has therefore been achieved. It is not so clear that the goal of decreasing unemployment has been achieved. Of course, new enterprises are obliged to hire one third of their employees from among the residents of the ZUS in which they are established. But despite the number of newly-hired employees increasing (as shown above) the unemployment rate in the ZFUs and the ZUS has been more or less stable:
Unemployment rate (active population: 15-59 years old, percentages) between 2004 and 2007 in the ZUS and in the ZFUs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>ZUS (ZRUs and ZFUs not included)</th>
<th>ZFUs created in 2004</th>
<th>ZFUs created in 2006</th>
<th>ZFUs (total)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>19.9</td>
<td>21.6</td>
<td>19.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>14.6</td>
<td>18.5</td>
<td>22.3</td>
<td>20.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>18.1</td>
<td>22.7</td>
<td>22.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>14.6</td>
<td>17.9</td>
<td>19.7</td>
<td>19.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: INSEE

The impact on unemployment seems to be strongest in the first year and then to decrease. This could be explained by the logic of short term incentive. Indeed, tax exemption lasts only 5 years and attracts short term investment. The slight variation of the unemployment rate in the ZFU could be caused by fluctuating economic factors and not necessarily by the presence or absence of incentives. In any case, it seems that overall success in reducing unemployment has been limited. Third country migrants seem to be something of an exception to these conclusions. Migrants are especially exposed to unemployment but a marked improvement can be observed between 2005 and 2007. In 2004-2005, the unemployment rate among third country migrants (population aged between 15 and 59 years old) reached about 29%. It decreased to 22.9% in 2007 (in 2005 and 2006, it respectively reached 29.3% and 25.5%). Unfortunately, there are no comparable figures for previous years.

As third country nationals are only indirectly touched by the urban public policies introduced in the ZUSs, there are no specific statistics on policy outcomes for this group. Consequently, there is no precise data on the sectors in which third country migrants are employed. Nevertheless, it seems reasonable to assume that they are occupied in the traditional industrial sectors present in the ZFUs (construction, transport, services to enterprises, domestic sector). Here are the sectors mainly represented in the ZFU:

Again, specific information is not available for third country migrants, so the results below summarise the types of contract on which newly–hired workers in the ZFUs are employed:
A large majority of newly-hired workers in the ZFUs were employed on indefinite contracts, which suggests that they have obtained relatively stable jobs. The duration of fixed-term contracts was mostly between 12 and 24 months. It is also the case that the overall level of employment before taking up a new job among ZFU residents is only 31% as opposed to 40% in the population as a whole (see illustrations below). Since the principal type of contract used by new employers in the ZFUs is the indefinite contract, it seems safe to conclude that the employment situation for those hired by newly-installed ZFU enterprises has improved:

In 2006, one third of the new employees in ZFUs were less than 25 years old, about 70% were men, and 30% were ZFU residents. Nevertheless, variations exist among the different generations of ZFU (as a reminder: 44 ZFUs were created in 1997, 41 in 2004 and 15 in 2006). In the newest ZFUs (2006 generation), the proportion of women among new employees is 44.6% as opposed to 28.2% in the 1997 generation. A similar difference can be observed for young people under 25 years old, who make up 37.8% of new employees in the 2006 ZFUs as against 28.8% in the 1997 ZFUs. 29.1% of new employees in the 2006 generation of ZFUs have a baccalaureate against 17.6% in the 1997 generation. The situation is reversed for new employees holding a vocational training qualification. 28.6% of 2006 ZFU new employees have a vocational qualification as opposed to 32.3% of 1997 ZFU new employees. The situation is similar for those who have
accomplished only the first stage of secondary school (22.1% of new employees in 2006 ZFUs against 27.9 in 1997 ZFUs). So there has been a slight shift towards higher skilled employees, although the overall proportion of employees having a post-secondary education has remained low (20.3% in 2006 against 22.3% in 1997).

Questions for important lessons:

- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)?
- What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?

Important lessons:

- In attempting to deal with high structural unemployment, the public authorities in France have adopted a global strategy to economically revitalize weak areas. Targeted measures provide an opportunity to have a strong impact in a given region, reinforced by the monitoring of the system by the National Observatory for ZUSs. Moreover, global urban policies help to combat 'ghettoisation' (via urban renovation, the development of public transport, reinforcement of education, programs to assist the unemployed back into work) and help to support the overall cohesion of project. It is clear that tax exemption is not the only success factor in local economic revitalisation. Lessons learnt from the first generation of ZFUs have encouraged the introduction of support services like the ZFU project leader, the 'one stop shop' for establishing businesses and the development of commercial premises. These services have proved their effectiveness, especially the ZFU project leader who is the unique interlocutor for any questions businesses may have about the ZFUs. Finally, the strategy of active partnership with different urban and economic actors has been shown to be a success factor. The involvement of chambers of commerce, other business and civic associations, enterprise creation support networks and so forth has been found to have a very positive effect.
- Inevitably there are certain downsides to this policy approach. By targeting specific geographical areas, the system may be creating a new discrimination based on urban origins. This is strongly felt in job application processes when the applicant’s address must be written on his or her CV. It is also the case the effects on employment are mixed. The mismatch between the professional profile demanded by enterprises and a labour market dominated by low-skilled persons has led to the predominance of certain sectors such as transport, construction or services to enterprises, whereas other sectors, and notably the high-tech sector, are underrepresented. Finally, the policy of tax exemption has two major negative consequences: It can amount to a windfall gain for companies that would have become established in a ZUS whether or not the incentive had been offered; and it may contribute to a low rate of business survival in the ZFU because of the short-term nature of the incentive.
- Tax exemption is the core of the French approach, but experience strongly suggests that this strategy is ineffective in the absence of complementary support measures. The more successful ZFUs are those in which fiscal incentives are accompanied by concrete measures (as enumerated above) to help businesses become established.
### Reports and laws


Décret n°96-1155 et 56 du 26 décembre 1993.


Loi d'orientation pour la ville (LOV) du 13 juillet 1991.

Loi d’orientation et de programmation pour la ville et la rénovation urbaine du 1° août 2003.


### Articles and Books


CLING Jean-Pierre, RAZAFINDRAKOTO Mireille, ROUBAUD François (2007).« Export Processing Zones in Madagascar: The impact of the dismantling of clothing quotas on employment and labour standards ».Paris: Institut de Recherche pour le Développement, DIAL.

### Websites

Site du Ministère délégué à la ville: [www.ville.gouv.fr](http://www.ville.gouv.fr)

Site du Ministère de l'Emploi, de la Cohésion sociale et du Logement: [www.travail.gouv.fr](http://www.travail.gouv.fr)

Site du Sénat: [www.senat.fr](http://www.senat.fr)
In-depth case study Germany

**Background information**
Name case study: Ausbildungsoffensive
Name country expert: Aleksandra Maatsch
Questions for the problem definition:

- What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?
- What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?
- What is the scope of the problem?
- What supposedly caused this problem?
- Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?
- Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

Problem definition:

A short background note from the author

Sources
This report was compiled on the basis of three kinds of sources: (a) interviews with the project-leader Ms Carolina Monfort-Montero and the project member Ms Olga Ils, (b) written materials obtained from the interviewed persons, (c) general literature on the subject.

What is the ‘Ausbildung’ (Internship) system in Germany about?
In Germany there is a special system of professional education that aims at combining theoretical and practical knowledge. It is called ‘Ausbildung’. This path is available to persons who do not want to or cannot continue their education at the university level. In order to learn some professions (i.e. a bank accountant) it is necessary to have the final secondary examination (called ‘Abitur’ in German). Therefore, all graduates of secondary schools in Germany can opt for this type of professional education (see the first report on Germany to learn more about the educational system).

The system of ‘Ausbildung’ takes from 2 to 4 years and combines practical professional experience (de facto internship) with theoretical courses. The trainees spend approximately 50% of their time in a workplace (i.e. in a bank, office, hospital) whilst the other half of the week is devoted to theoretical classes in a school. In order to get enrolled, a person has to first find an employer, who would be willing to coach her/him during the professional education. Otherwise it is impossible to begin the education. There are two problems concerning this system: first, it is very much dependent on the economic situation at the given moment of time, second, it allows the German employers to decide who will receive the professional education, and who won’t. Furthermore, the German employers are not obliged to follow any pre-defined rules concerning the selection of candidates. As a result, employers select their trainees according to their own criteria which can be discriminatory. As the statistical data demonstrate (see the first country report on Germany), immigrants of the first and second generation are discriminated by this recruitment system.

The project ‘Ausbildungsoffensive!’ was organised in the federal state Bremen by the Labour Welfare Organisation in Bremen (Arbeiterwohlfahrt Bremen, AWO) and the Educational Centre of the Public Service in Bremen (Aus- und Fortbildungszentrum für den bremischen öffentlichen Dienst, AFZ). The goal of the project was to raise the percentage of immigrants (both the first and the second generation, also naturalized ones) as well as late repatriates in the public service in Bremen. The statistical data show that, immigrants are particularly underrepresented in the German public service (Rockwool Foundation on Migration Survey quoted in K. Zimmermann, H. Hinte "Zuwanderung und Arbeitsmarkt. Deutschland und Dänemark im Vergleich", Springer Verlag Berlin Heidelberg, 2005). The national integration report from October 2008 states that one of the major goals in the national integration plan is immigrants’ occupational advancement in education and the labour market. This goal is to be achieved through introduction of equal chances in each sector of the labour market as well as combating of discrimination. Hence, the public sector is one of the professional branches in Germany where more intensive fostering
of equality and non-discrimination are particularly desired. The project was organised for all groups of immigrants (1st or 2nd generation, third country nationals and immigrants from the new EU member states). In the public sector all groups of immigrants are underrepresented, therefore the project organizers decided not to target any specific group of immigrants.

The employers that took part in the project represented the following branches of the public sector: trade and commerce, finances and taxes (i.e. federal fiscal bureau), administration, accountancy, medical personnel (assistants).

According to the interviewed project organizers, the following factors caused the problem:

- Negation of the fact that Germany became an immigration state. In the German public sphere and politics the migratory heritage has only recently been acknowledged. In the past decades (the seventies and the eighties) the governing Christian-Democrats ignored the issue claiming that “Germany is not an immigration state and cannot be one”. Immigrants residing in Germany were perceived as temporary residents: they were not expected to settle down permanently. Introduction of an integration policy was therefore not regarded to be necessary.
- “German arrogance”. As the interviewed persons explained, the general hostility towards immigrants in the German society has had an impact on immigrants’ discrimination on the labour market.
- Sensitivity of the public sphere sector: this sector is considered to represent the state in the society. Therefore, immigrants were often regarded as ‘improper’ employees, simply given their foreign background.
- Low level of information and negative self-selection among immigrants. Immigrants themselves tend to have incorrect information concerning the required qualifications (i.e. many have thought they should be naturalized in Germany in order to work in the public sector). Furthermore, immigrants often do not consider themselves skilled enough or think that public sector is not a ‘proper’ work-place for them because they have a different cultural background.

Questions for the approach:

- What approach has been used to address the problem?
- What are the core elements of the approach?
- What is the intensity and duration of the approach?
- How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?
- What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general (international literature, (policy) studies)?
- Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?
- What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?
- Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?
Approach:

1. Obtaining young persons with migration background
The organizers contacted secondary schools (teachers and headmasters), as well as immigrants’ organizations, and informed them about the possibility of special courses organised for young immigrants. They have also presented their offer during different job-fairs or similar events. In the second step the organizers were invited to schools in order to inform pupils about possibilities of pursuing a career in the public service.

2. Profiling and coaching
After the presentations in schools and other institutions, persons interested in pursuing a career in the public service could make an appointment for a longer conversation during which the organizers had an opportunity to get to know the applicants better whilst the applicants could obtain detailed information about the courses. During these appointments young immigrants could also ask for advice concerning the choice of their professional career.

3. Empowerment
Each course lasted 10 months and was composed of different panels that were recommended to participants depending on their needs, for instance, those who had problems with the German language were recommended to take more sessions of the language classes. In principle, all the participants had seminars devoted to practical skills like attending a job interview, assessment of each persons’ professional strengths and weaknesses and so on. The participants also attended courses that extended their theoretical and general knowledge required in different sectors of the public service. In addition, the organizers invited persons with a migration background employed in the public service to talk about their experience with the participants of the program.

The weekly structure of the course was the following:
- Two days – internship in a public service institution
- One day – German language and general knowledge classes (including politics)
- Two days – practical job training

4. Training of teachers coaching the apprentices in the public sector. The training was supposed to prepare them to work with international youth and to de-construct the existing national stereotypes.

The first edition of the project started on 01.09.2005 and lasted until 31.08.2006. The project ended with a success and earned a reward of the German Federal Ministry of Economics and Technology. Afterwards, the organizers applied for new funds from the ESF and the Ministry of Economics and initiated the second edition of the project that lasted until 11.07.2008.

The approach of the project was positively tested during the first edition and therefore the organizers did not find it necessary to change it afterwards.

Questions for the contextual factors:
- What conditions have influenced the project?
- What factors improved the success of the project?
- What factor put a check on the success of the project?
- Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?
Contextual factors:

- Factors that positively influenced the success of the project: competent and devoted project members, external funding and knowledge how to obtain it successfully, knowledge of stakeholders’ institutions (immigrants’ organizations, schools, employers...) and prior positive work-experience with these institutions.

- Factors that put a check on the success of the project: ‘jealousy’ of the federal institutions (in Bremen) that are also responsible for immigrants’ integration. The interviewed persons did not want to name the concrete institution(s) in order not to make a negative impression. However, they noted that the success of their project was not acknowledged and did not contribute to closer cooperation with other institutions responsible for integration in the federal state of Bremen. In other words, internal competition of institutes does not foster cooperation in projects fostering immigrants’ integration.

- Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature: they are of generic nature. According to the interviewed persons, immigrants are faced with discrimination in all the sectors of the German labour market. In the public sector the intensity of the problem is simply higher than in other branches.

Questions for the results:

- What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?:
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
  - putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
  - the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
  - the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;
  - ...

- To what extent have these goals been achieved?

- To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?

- How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

- How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

- If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

- Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct / indirect)?

- Are there any differences in results among different target groups?

- How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?
Results:

What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?

- high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants: **YES, INDIRECTLY**
- retention of third country migrant workers in employment: **NO**
- putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use: **YES**
- the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment: **YES**
- the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market: **YES, INDIRECTLY**
- **FUTURE OF GERMANY AS AN IMMIGRATION STATE:** according to the interviewed persons, the German national integration program was developed rather late, when the second generation of immigrants was already grown-up. It is therefore particularly important that integration remains a priority issue for each government: Germany is still far away from reaching a satisfactory level of immigrants’ integration. Each project, conducted both on the national and the federal level, contributes to the general improvement of immigrants’ position in Germany.

The project had the following goals:

- Influencing employers: the organizers contacted them in order to make them willing to take part in the project and employ immigrants in their institutions (as trainees). The organizers wanted to de-construct employers’ stereotypes concerning immigrants in general or selected nationalities. They assumed that once the German employers gain positive experience with immigrants, they will be more willing to employ them in the future.

- Introduction of positive discrimination was **NOT** the goal of the project: the courses were supposed to improve immigrants’ qualifications on the labour market and prepare them for open competition, without positive discrimination.

- A structural change of the German public sector: employment of immigrants in the public sector was only considered as the first step. The long-term goal of the project was to increase the number of immigrants in the leading positions in the public sectors (i.e. heads of the units, directors, etc...)

The project !Ausbildungoffensive! was a pioneering initiative in Germany. Other projects organised in the eighties (in Nordrein-Westfalen, Bremen, Hagen) aimed at the same goal, but used different methods. These projects reflected the assumption that the number of immigrants employed in the public sector can be raised if immigrants are adequately informed about the employment requirements. However, the experience showed that advertisement, as the only method in use, is itself is not sufficient. The project !Ausbildungoffensive! demonstrated very clearly that an institutional change is not possible without bringing into play the employers and changing their attitudes.

All the goals of the project were achieved, see the points below:

- **Raising the number of immigrants employed in the public service in Bremen:** The most important result of the project was that the number of immigrants employed in the public sector in Bremen has also increased from 2,6% in 1999 to 24,89% in 2004 (based on the project report).

- **Higher employment rate among immigrants & upwards mobility:** More than 50% of all participants found a job after completing the trajectory (151 persons trained in total). The existing data concerned only those, who have already completed their internship. Furthermore, some participants decided afterwards to study at the university and therefore did not take up any position.

- All migrants found a sustainable job. This is, however, the German ‘specificity’. In this system of professional education a person is usually offered a 1-2 years’ long contract.
Employers’ attitude change: This was not a planned outcome of the project. The contacted employers changed their attitudes towards immigrant-workers. Their attitude was not measured by any survey (this was not the goal of the project), but the interviewed persons said that many employers contacted them after the project expired because they were interested in further cooperation. The employers said that they made a very positive experience with the immigrants that took part in the project and wanted to continue the cooperation.

Putting immigrants’ human capital into use: There was upwards mobility in all the cases: all of the participants were either school-graduates or unemployed.

The results are a direct result of the approach – there was no parallel initiative undertaken with the same goal.

Concerning differences between target groups, the older participants (over 27 years, 30% of all), who were previously unemployed, were more motivated than the younger school-graduates. This was not an expected result of the project and the organizers have not examined this phenomenon further. They reported, however, that the older participants perceived their participation in the project as “the last chance to find employment”.

No similar projects were introduced until now in Germany, no possibility of a direct comparison. The interviewed persons have also not heard about any similar project conducted abroad.

In general terms, the project contributed to improving the situation of immigrants on the federal labour market.

Questions for important lessons:

What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?

What can others learn from this particular project?

To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)?

What helps and what does not?

What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?

Important lessons:

The most important success factors of this project: good contact with schools, teachers and employers, advertisement during various internship-fairs in Germany, know-how of the public sector.

It is important to contact the ‘right’ stakeholders, both on employers’ and employees’ side (i.e. on the employees’ side: school directors, members of immigrants’ organizations; on the employers’ side: persons responsible for recruitment or internship in a given institution/company).

The approach could be directly transferable to projects helping immigrants to recognize their qualifications acquired abroad or pursuing the occupational retraining. In most cases it is particularly difficult for such persons to find a work-place where they could raise their qualification and acquire the first practical experience on the new labour market. Afterwards the labour market position of these persons is much more competitive. The training mechanisms developed in this project could be also used in that case.

It is crucial to establish and foster contacts with stakeholders, mostly immigrants’ organizations. Project leaders should be also prepared that in many sectors people can be also discriminated because of their age. Furthermore, it is more difficult to obtain external funding for projects focusing on older immigrants, over 25/27 years old. The project organizers said it is usually easier in Germany to obtain funds for projects in which immigrant school graduates are the aim group.
6. Overview literature (sources used)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interviews with Ms Carolina Monfort-Montero (project leader) and Ms Olga Ils (project member), 03.04.2009.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(!Internship-attack! – Results, Examples, Perspectives. An Initiative Towards Raising the Quota</td>
<td>of Young Persons with Migration Background in the Public Sector in Bremen), a project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Ausbildungsplätze im öffentlichen Dienst des Landes und der Stadtgemeinde Bremen&quot;, ABiG</td>
<td>Ausbildungsgesellschaft Bremen mbH, 2008 (Internship in Public Sector in the Land and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rockwool Foundation on Migration Survey quoted in K. Zimmermann, H.</td>
<td>Hinte “Zuwanderung und Arbeitsmarkt. Deutschland und Dänemark im Vergleich”, Springer Verlag</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nationaler Integrationsplan, Erster Fortschrittbericht (National</td>
<td>Integration Plan, the First Progress Report), (Presse und Informationsamt der Bundesregierung,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integration Plan, the First Progress Report), (Presse und Informationsamt der Bundesregierung, October 2008).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In-depth case study Hungary

Background information
Name case study: Artemisszió
Name country expert: Endre Sik
Questions for the problem definition:
- What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?
- What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?
- What is the scope of the problem?
- What supposedly caused this problem?
- Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?
- Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

Problem definition:

“Individually - through EQUAL chances” – the Artemisszió’s labour market integration project

The immediate reason of the project was the long lasting and ever growing obstacles (both intrinsic and external barriers see later) that hindered the temporary protected persons, asylum seekers or third country migrants to get hired on the labour market or starting a small scale entrepreneurship.

As the president of Artemisszió Foundation worded, the core issue of the project was to solve the paradox – to train people to become employable or starting an entrepreneurial activity when by law both were either completely forbidden or heavily hindered: “How can we integrate to the labour market people who are by law not entitled to work formally? … This is even more the case since it is obvious that in our globalised era such situations remain a constant element of the European labour market. … Millions of various types of migrants will spend years in a legal limbo as well as in a precarious labour market situation being forced to inactivity or informality. This would on the one hand mean a huge waist of human potential (both for the migrants themselves but also for the host society), on the other hand increase the suspicion (assuming them to be free riders of the welfare system) and hostility against them by the host society”.

Consequently, the aim of the project had to be twofold: lobbying for a change in the legal framework, and develop integration projects to ease the process of the potential beneficiaries.

In contemporary Hungary the scope of the problem is relatively limited. This is partly due to the fact that the number of asylum seekers and temporary protected persons is small, and that a substantial proportion of these people do not consider Hungary as a target country and intend to leave Hungary as soon as possible. As to third country migrants, their number is very small as well, and the overwhelming proportion of them are either ethnic Hungarian from neighbouring countries (Ukraine or Serbia) or entrepreneurs or family members from Asia (mostly China) who do not need integration. As to the first group the reason for the lack of need of integration is obvious, these ethnic Hungarian groups have always been part of the Hungarian culture (they had been made Yugoslavian only after World War I as a consequence of the move of the Hungarian border), and not only speak Hungarian fluently but had have regular visits in Hungary for years consequently are familiar with the labour market conditions.

As to the Chinese in Hungary (Nyíri, 2007), they arrived in thousands between 1989 and 1992 (when there was no mandatory visa regulation between China and Hungary) with the sole purpose – to be successful entrepreneurs in the small scale but widely spread informal cross-border trading (often called suitcase trade). Being intermediaries between the worldwide Chinese Diaspora and the its newborn Hungarian filiale, they have not been interested in any integration scheme.
There are external and intrinsic contextual factors that explain the need for integration projects such as:

- the Hungarian labour market has never recovered from the serious job losses during the 1990ies. Since then there is jobless economic growth – at least in the formal economy. The result is in an EU comparative perspective a low level of activity coinciding with medium level unemployment. The employment rate has always been lower in Hungary compared to EU average. In 2007 the employment rate was 51% (in the EU 58% among the 15-74 years old). The employment rate was significantly higher among males (58%) than females (44%) both below the average EU figures (66% and 51% respectively).

- Another relevant contextual factor is the level of xenophobia. Apart from some oscillation, the level of xenophobia in Hungary is stabilised, i.e. open xenophobia had characterised about 15% of the adult population in 1992, within a few years this figure almost tripled to 40% then fall back again and in the past years has stabilised around 25-35%.

- As to policymaking, standard labour market actors such as employers, associations and trade unions are not active in combating discrimination on the labour market (Neumann, forthcoming, Neumann, Sik, forthcoming). Anti-discriminatory, integration actions are only experimental and project financed, consequently are fragmented, temporary, and do not have lasting effects (Kováts-Sik, 2007). Since 2007 the EU Integration Fund started to fund several very innovative multicultural awareness raising and anti-xenophobic projects (such as adapting diverse foreign documentary movies for Hungarian students, "teaching the teachers" for tolerance, etc.).

- Finally both temporary protected persons and refugees suffer from two forms of handicap on the Hungarian labour market, i.e. the lack of Hungarian language skills and illegality. The former is a major handicap since the Hungarian language is difficult to learn and since the Hungarian labour market is small and shrinking, so to learn Hungarian is not a good investment in general. Illegality on the one hand dooms all forms of human capital investment risky (the chance of losing such investment is high due to the precarious legal situation). On the other hand, in the informal economy integration is smooth (the secondary labour market does not assume the command of the language, on-the-job training or formal education) but on the long run an informally well integrated person might completely exclude him- or herself from being employable on the formal labour market.

In the light of the above, the project intentionally
- covered the small but intertwining groups of asylum seekers, temporary protected persons as well as third country migrants,
- offered the integration services for legally mostly non-employable
- whether they intended to remain in Hungary or not.

**Questions for the approach:**

- What approach has been used to address the problem?
- What are the core elements of the approach?
- What is the intensity and duration of the approach?
- How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?
- What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general (international literature, (policy) studies)?
- Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?
- What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?
- Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?
**Approach:**

The project was envisioned as a multiplayer and multilevel (or multi-layered) exercise. As to the multiplayer character of the project, it had two major types of beneficiaries: (1) various types of migrants and (2) different social groups of the majority society. As to the multilevel nature of the project, several intertwined activities (workshop, training, animation, research, dissemination, etc.) have been carried out.

(1) Due to the composition of the potential beneficiaries (most of them originating from the lower social strata of various developing countries, they are often uneducated but ambitious, often intending to move on towards more developed EU countries in the shortest possible time) the project organisers decided to offer highly convertible labour market skills in general (such as curriculum vitae writing, business plan development, etc.) with some Hungarian specific extras for those who might decide to stay. This empowerment included a flexible mix of general human capital assets, basic information on the Hungarian labour market, psychological advice, etc.

(2) The most relevant groups of the host society the project wanted to reach, were those whose influence on the labour market integration processes were the strongest, i.e. journalists, teachers, trainers, social workers and employees of organisations working with migrants.

The overall aim of the project was to increase the chances of the labour market integration for asylum-seekers, temporary protected persons, and third country migrants in Hungary. The project lasted for two years (between 2005 and 2007).

The objectives of the project were realized within a multi-layered program that relies on exploring and making use of various methods of empowerment. The multi-layered program consisted of the following parts:

- Professional training
- Entrepreneurial training
- Intercultural training
- Animation
- Research
- Creating a more inclusive environment.

They offered various trainings for the asylum seekers at our larger reception centres, Debrecen and Békéscsaba. Each training was built on skills and professional know-how, which could be necessary for acquiring a given job in Hungary. As for their methodology, the training courses were tailor-made for the culturally and language-wise heterogeneous group of asylum seekers. The trainings were offered in the following fields: hairdressing, gardening (horticulture), carpet weaving, and pottery.

One of the most innovative parts of the project, a special emphasis was made on the entrepreneurship module. The aim of the course lied in the notion of asylum seekers being aware that despite the difficulties of entering the labour market as employees, there is an alternative way of starting an own enterprise, or to join an already existing business. Beyond fundamental principles of entrepreneurship and enterprise development, the course focused on three major fields: catering, retail and handicraft. The paramount scope of the program was to provide the asylum seekers an alternative and concrete tool ready to be used in order to improve their own conditions.
The **intercultural** aspect of the project was based on the assumption that labour as any other human activity acquires a cultural determination independent from occupation or vocation. The communication, the hierarchic relations, the cooperation and the use of space and time reflect our representations determined culturally, which also define our expectations referring to everyday situations. Breaching these expected scenarios – either due to ignorance or difficulty of adaptation – could lead to a conflict situation. Talking about ourselves and introducing ourselves also reflect cultural patterns, which could create a communication obstacle between the two parties and hinder the admission to a job. The intercultural training motivated the participants to perceive the cultural patterns more consciously and to acquire such skills that assist them to cooperate with the local employers, colleagues and clients.

**Questions for the contextual factors:**
- What conditions have influenced the project?
- What factors improved the success of the project?
- What factor put a check on the success of the project?
- Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?

**Contextual factors:**

The most important characteristics of the contextual factors that influenced the project can be summarized as follows:
- As already mentioned the typical beneficiaries of the project were unemployable and mobile persons, consequently to reach them and keep them active in the project assumed special efforts. The Hungarian political and policy context is very undeveloped and unpredictable. This means that on the one hand the role and position of NGOs in relation to state actors is undefined and depends on the personal relations among the actors as well as on the intentions of the state actor. On the other hand due to the fiscal crisis of the Hungarian economy and partly the relatively powerless status of migration related authorities, the plans and projects are often at the mercy of other state bureaucracies, i.e. unexpected and unexplained changes might occur.
- An important actor (the local government) in Hungary is on the one hand usually hostile (or at least uninterested) in any migration or multicultural project, on the other hand those few municipalities which are interested in such projects are usually underfinanced.
- The project based nature of the integration projects by definition means that relatively well financed periods are unavoidably followed by underfinanced periods. Moreover the state authorities in charge of initiating, monitoring and evaluating the projects are inexperienced and bureaucratic, consequently the projects usually are not sustainable and do not have the inertia to have lasting influence.

Since the Hungarian NGO sector is small, the network among them is vulnerable both against opportunistic behaviour and unintentional fall-outs, i.e. it is very difficult to replace a non-provider.

**Questions for the results:**
- What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?:
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
  - putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
- the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
- the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;
- ....

To what extent have these goals been achieved?

To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?

- How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct / indirect)?
- Are there any differences in results among different target groups?
- How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?

Results:

The actual programmes lasted for 18 months. Most of the activity took place in the two refugee camps (Debrecen and Békéscsaba). The project covered about three hundred asylum seekers and migrants (the primary target group, N=286), and different groups of the host society (the secondary target group, N app. 80).

As to the programme elements for the primary target group, the animation programmes were organised and moderated by two trained animators who has worked full time during the project in the two camps. These programmes served as the general frame to activate the asylum seekers, and integrate them into the local community by offering opportunities for joint activity for locals and asylum seekers. The most popular programmes were the sport activities (football and table tennis matches, karate exercises, and volleyball matches) as well as various entertainment and cultural activities such as belly dance club, handicraft, cooking and do-it-yourself education, children and internet clubs, etc. In the animation programmes (self-)selected participants from the target population were hired on a part-time basis.

There were three intensive animation programmes suggested by the would-be participants themselves, photo and computer skill development and Hungarian language course. The courses were so popular that they have been repeated several times during the period, and an exhibition was held from the photos made by the participants. This success was partly due again to the social capital sensitive planning and organisation of the project, i.e. in the planning phase would-be beneficiaries were intensively involved, in the course of running the project they participated as volunteers or as part-time coordinators. The organisers assumed that the positive experience of being able to organise such groups and prove the usefulness of the newly learnt skills had a lasting effects on the self-esteem of the participants - major potential source of success on the labour market.

The entrepreneurial programmes were tailored to the needs of the participants. And since the composition of the two refugee camps was different, consequently there were different entrepreneurial programmes (in both camps three times during the project) as well.
The general idea was to offer the participants vocational skills sought for on the labour market but at the same time simple and flexible enough to be the basis of entrepreneurial activity as well. These were catering, retail trade, and handicraft. But the programmes did not restrict their activity to technical skill development only. It offered on the one hand basic economic skills necessary for start-up business ventures (legal environment, accountancy, etc.), on the other hand psychological training to develop the participants’ creativity, confidence and self-esteem.

Taking into consideration the cultural base and previous experience of the two groups, after some preliminary discussions with the participants they started different courses in the two refugee camps. In Békéscsaba the two selected vocational trainings were carpet weaving (two courses) and pottery (one course), in Debrecen hairstylist and horticulture (in both cases two courses).

Three times during the project there were intensive courses for all participants in a nearby lakeshore residence hotel (Poroszló at the Lake Tisza) to improve their general skills (C.V. writing, learning the portfolio method), to introduce them a little to the Hungarian culture, society and history, and last but not least to offer them an opportunity to spend time outside of the camp and meet different people.

As to the programme elements targeted to the host society, the main target groups of the course on the development of intercultural competence were those social workers (N=17) and other employees (N=10) who meet with asylum seekers on a daily basis. This selected method (the Cohen-Emerique technique) includes three interrelated phases: sensitivity raising, conflict management and intercultural negotiation techniques.

Another target group consisted of those journalists who specialize on migration, refugees, and intercultural conflicts. The project included a two-day seminar (in cooperation with an independent journalist education centre) on the issue of “Fortress Europe”. The main focus of the discussion was the role media play in generating the popular image of migrants. The seminar analysed the content analysis of the Hungarian media on migrants and refugees. Together with another Hungarian NGO (and partly commissioned by the UNHCR) an anti-discrimination campaign was launched as well in 2007. During the two months of the campaign (which consisted of a Refugee Day party in Debrecen with about 200 participants) nineteen articles have been published in the media, and 140,000 freecards and city-light posters have been produced emphasizing the value of multiculturalism and the advantage of integration for the host society.

Finally, a sociological survey was financed to analyse the potentials and obstacles both from the supply (human capital, language competency, migration history and potential, etc.) and the demand side (expectations, xenophobia, etc.) of the employability of migrants on the Hungarian labour market. This research was followed by an analysis of the Hungarian legal system from the labour market integration point of view – without any tangible result as of yet.

Beyond the standard dissemination techniques (conferences, visits, workshops, research publication (in English with Hungarian summary in 200 copies), DVD, home page (www.needs.hu), etc.) there were two brochures (both in Hungarian and in English and in printed ((with a print run 100) and CD format) in which the potential employees and entrepreneurs were given practical information how to proceed in the contemporary Hungarian situation. Moreover with a slightly bigger print run (150) the four entrepreneurial activities were backed with separate leaflets in English and Hungarian. Finally, with their partners (SPARK – Hollandia http://www.equal-spark.nl, MOBILEE – Hollandia http://www.equal-mобильe.nl FIRST AID IN INTEGRATION – Austria http://www.first-aid-in-integration.at, AROS- ASYL-Svédország http://www.uparos.se ) they disseminated the results of the project internationally and – after careful evaluation and if necessary adaptation and modification - made use of the experiences of them.
It is not by chance that the quantification of the survey results are focusing on the number of trainees reached and not on the actual success rates. That is, from the contextual analysis as well as from the next chapter (on lessons to be learnt), it is clear that such data does not (and cannot) exist since the mobility rate of the migrants is so high that they might be all over EU by now, and even those who are still in Hungary are not easy to reach (and definitely the official documents do not contain any data on them). It might need a follow-up research to find out what happened with the clients.

Questions for important lessons:

- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)? What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?

Important lessons:

1) As we saw in the previous section (results) the original plan to reach three hundred asylum seekers and migrants was successful, however, such a programme cannot meet with all the details planned ahead. For example while two third of the target population of the project was female, the proportion of females in the actual population was one third only. Such deviations from the original plans are unavoidable since the target population is highly mobile, its composition might often change, etc. Consequently projects in the future should rely more on indicators (such as turnover rates, time series data, etc.) which are more sensitive towards the mobile nature of the target population.

2) An important indirect result of the integration project was that the participants often attended in more than one program, moreover some of them actively participated in some programmes as volunteer as well. This on the one hand reinforced their self-esteem and social ability, on the other hand showed the adaptability of their resourcefulness, another important socio-psychological resource on the labour market. Another important lesson we learnt from this spontaneous trend was to recognise the relevance of "soft skills" (i.e. volunteering) on the labour market. We concluded that a special legal employment solution could be based on this participation form, a sort of "public volunteering" to offer such participants flexible and temporary but formal employment.

3) Since formal employment is legally restricted the evaluation of the project is impossible using standard evaluation methods. Due to the lack of accredited education it is unlikely that the target population can rely on this when applying for a job on the Hungarian labour market, let alone those who in the course of further migrations want to use it elsewhere. To improve the skills learnt as well as to make the project more visible for labour market participants it would be advisable to have more on-the-job training and practice in the open labour market. This would also ensure a much more flexible capacity building strategy, focused on the individual.

4) The good cooperation with the municipality (and if there are with local community NGOs) is crucial. The negative example of this case was the Refugee Day in Debrecen where due to the lack of cooperation on behalf of the municipality and the weakness of the NGO sector the original plan (to have a big open air party (including activities such as musical performance, cooking their national food, temporary photo exhibition ) on a main square) failed, and the meeting was hold in a school yard.
The problem of sustainability is a general characteristic of all project-based initiatives. In other words the question is how to overcome the inbuilt danger of failure of all project funded initiatives caused by uninterested (let alone hostile) actors. Usually a single project cannot change the environment since its impact remains below the sensitivity threshold of the law, politics, local policy and labour market actors. But due to funding principles (the idea of distributive justice, bureaucratic balancing) as well as due to the power relations among the actors of the process of fund allocation, there is a great probability that no initiative shall get funded twice.

To overcome the inbuilt limitation of sustainability there are only rather weak techniques. For example to publish the results and the know-how of the project. In our case especially those information written for social workers and activists can help to spread the results of the project.

Moreover, since such projects are new in Hungary the know-how of it in itself can be considered as a new product, and its materials, organisational solutions, troubleshooting techniques should be made available for the next generation of such projects. Since the end of the project, Artemisszió has started two new projects, and in both cases could use certain experiences from the project proper:

1. partly they developed a labour market integration project based on a new flexible contractual form (volunteer employment),
2. partly they devised an innovative technique to measure the level of skill competency of potential participants on labour integration projects.
3. Moreover, on the basis of the project experiences they accredited a social worker training and educational programme which is now available for the general audience.

6. Overview literature (sources used)


In-depth case study Italy

Background information
Name case study: Equal MOAF – “Modello di occupazione a filiera: dalla stagionalità alla piena occupazione”
Name country expert: STROZZA Salvatore
Questions for the problem definition:

- What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?
- What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?
- What is the scope of the problem?
- What supposedly caused this problem?
- Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?
- Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

Problem definition:

The developers of the MOAF project highlight that heavy recourse to third country migrant labour in agricultural undertakings (firms, companies), which has been constantly growing in the last few years, in early 2000 had not been given a tool for planning and control and for the full integration of the workers. Only 8% of the immigrants working in the sector had a permanent employment contract. Immigrants were only employed in marginal roles and profiles, having no opportunities for negotiation, professional growth or qualification: mere ‘arms’ to be used in the harvest of agricultural produce. This situation is partly due to the lack of a well-structured view of the supply chain on the part of enterprises with regard to employment issues.

The promoters of the MOAF project also remarked that in the agrifood industry the demand is increasing for qualified, professional workers with competence and skills in the primary sector. The new legislation on product quality and traceability for the end user’s safety imposes a new organisational model on enterprises, which may enable them to control the end product throughout the supply chain based on the workers’ competence, reliability and professionalism.

It has been remarked that in the agrifood sector tobacco is the area (division) which has the best chain-like structure thanks to the interactions existing between the enterprises involved in the various stages of the production process. The production cycle of tobacco is, indeed, integrated in the local agribusiness sector which, in turn, is comprised of a system of enterprises organised in a supply chain. Two different types of enterprises are present: agricultural undertakings, which grow the plant, and industrial enterprises that process the product industrially. While the economic and production aspects are managed within a supply-chain structure, no such system has been put in place for the management of labour, which is however a strategic aspect considering the new conditions of product quality and safety.

The lack of an organisational system for the labour market and human resources brings about problems on the economic and qualitative aspects of the product(s) and a fragmentation/marginalisation of the human resources involved. At the beginning of this decade there were about 155,000 people employed in the sector, of which 135,000 in the farming stage, 15,000 in first processing and 5,600 in manufacture (Nomisma, 2001). This very division (tobacco) was chosen to experiment with a model of intervention to be later applied to other industrial agrifood products.

In synthesis, the project originates from the analysis of the peculiar need of labour and professional skills of companies working in the tobacco supply chain and from the fact that such needs are mainly met by third country migrants who, however, enter this sector in a type of activity (hired farm hands) which do not make employment qualification and stability possible.

Based on what is reported in the project, the problems this initiative wishes to deal with are: a) analysing the needs of labour and professional skills of companies in the tobacco chain; b) resolving the typical seasonal/marginal nature of third country migrant work in the sector by intervening in the workers’ professional training in the various stages of the chain. This enables a more stable employment of these workers and gives them the opportunity to benefit from these added skills on the job market in the agrifood sector and in the local industrial districts; c) bringing out the need of companies in the sector for qualified professional profiles who may be employed all along the chain. In synthesis, the difficult matching of demand and supply of third country migrant work, the instability and poor
enhancement of third country migrant workers' competences and human capital, the lack of a widespread perception of the importance of having qualified employees who may work in the various stages of the supply chain are the problems that the project proposed wishes to investigate.

The discriminating factors and barriers the third country migrant workers encounter can be ascribed to: a) de-qualification of the jobs done by immigrant workers in the farming stage (immigrant workers are considered only as hired farm hands); b) fragmentation in the recruitment process within the supply chain with great seasonality and precariousness of the work; c) scarce or no stabilisation of employment, both on the territory and within the company (frequent changes of the place and the company of employment). This entails a number of hindrances in terms of protection of health, minors' school integration and family re-union – all aspects which produce psychological uneasiness and a perception of work seen only as a source of wealth rather than as a way to achieve human and social fulfilment; d) scarce or no ability to become integrated in the processing stage; e) scarce or no skills in wage (trade union) bargaining.

The whole agrifood industry is involved in this problem at the national level. However, the tobacco sector showed the most evident conditions in supply chain disconnections and thus it seemed to be the ideal setting to test the project model, which could then be transferred to the other agricultural and agribusiness products in Italy and the European Union.

The main causes of the problem are: 1) lack of information about alternative opportunities on the labour market, regarding both the regulations in force concerning labour (employment contracts, social security, taxation and other rights and duties) and the opportunities for cultural and professional growth; 2) language inequality, meaning not only basic language knowledge, but rather a development and adjustment of language competences which individuals very often have, when they have received a profession-oriented education in their countries of origin, and which they need to upgrade in the light of the opportunities offered by the information society; 3) control and exploitation of immigrant labour by illegal organisations operating on the territory, e.g. gangmaster systems; 4) lack of flexible education models able to meet the needs of the chain-based enterprise system and to match the characteristics of (immigrant) labour supply; 5) lack of access to the labour market based on strategies bringing together social cohesion policies and labour educational policies (at the beginning of this decade there were no training experiences that considered social integration and labour insertion in agriculture jointly); 6) inadequate actions to support the enterprise system aiming at the quality and traceability of consumption products.

The approach targeted unemployed third country immigrants who were potentially employable in the farming and first processing of tobacco in the regions with the greatest levels of tobacco crops (Umbria, Veneto and Campania). The training project originally envisaged 100 beneficiaries to be included and directed to work with the role (profile) of supply chain employee. The problem highlighted does not concern third country immigrants working in the sector of tobacco alone, but also those in other areas of agriculture and in the agrifood business.

Questions for the approach:
- What approach has been used to address the problem?
- What are the core elements of the approach?
- What is the intensity and duration of the approach?
- How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?
- What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general (international literature, (policy) studies)?
Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?  
What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?  
Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?

**Approach:**

The project developed an integrated model in the form of a series of services, methodologies and instruments which may bring about and speed up organisation and innovation processes within the enterprises and within the labour demand/supply system.

In particular, the action was comprised of 4 specific approaches:

A) The "Network approach", to identify a model which may define the organisation of labour supply and innovate the demand of labour by enterprises (considering the chain structure of the sector). The model involves: the enterprise system, with the various stages of the supply chain (farming, services, first processing), the relevant institutional system (i.e. consultation table at the national level and for job matching); the social system supporting immigration;

B) The "Approach to the disadvantaged person", aiming at providing professional upgrading and qualifications to disadvantaged people by means of integrated education and support to work placement;

C) The "Approach to the enterprise system", viewed as part of a supply chain, which may establish the product’s economic integration but also the integration of work, going beyond seasonality and precariousness by shifting from the figure of unskilled farm labourer (field hand) to one of supply chain expert ("addetto di filiera");

The "Gender approach", involving all the aspects of the action, which means to offer the female immigrant population, who are mainly employed in processing companies, equal conditions for moving up the company ladder and acquiring specialised competences.

The strategy proposed developed along two working axes:

1. a systemic support to qualifying the supply of work linked to the organisational innovation of demand, in a supply chain-based logic, and to quality control of the end product meaning quality of the whole local production system. This means acting to optimise the whole production cycle, by rationalizing the distinct phases into individual companies and linking the lifecycle of the agri-industrial product to the qualified employment dynamics of workers. In synthesis the objective was to stimulate the demand (of the enterprises) of a new professional profile that cover all the different phases of productive cycle and to train the third country immigrants to cover this role.

2. the establishment of a virtuous circle between the companies’ demand of labour and supply, which may, wherever possible, match the workers’ degree of motivation, expectations and experiences with the profiles needed by the enterprises.

Developing the approaches proposed entailed putting in place a series of interactive instruments making it possible to know, quantify and link the consistencies and features of work demand and supply in the tobacco supply chain, in the relevant territories, by involving local institutions, the partners concerned in the project (see section 3), the relevant national and local entities working with immigration (trade-unions, NGOs, immigrant associations and so on) in an operational approach.

The hypothesis is that enterprises in the sector need qualified employees’ profiles who may be employed all along the supply chain, thus becoming strategic for the quality of end products. It is, however, necessary to bring to light this need and to set up the conditions needed for job matching by setting up a number of relations between the various subjects involved (agricultural undertakings and first processing industries, local public bodies, trade unions and voluntary organisations) which may enable the training/qualification of the potential workers in the sector.

According to the programme proposed, the whole experiment was to be carried out over two years with the following structure:
Activities envisaged by macro-phases in chronological order:

Macro phase 1 (15 May 2002 – 31 October 2002) – “Research into and analysis of the sector with the supply chain model”:

1. Research/Analysis of the sector with the supply chain model
2. Setting up and Implementation of the data bank
3. Development of the action’s experimental model

Macro phase 2 (November 2002 – October 2003) – ”Model experimentation”:

1. Setting up and management of the observatory and data bank
2. Setting up of the portal
3. Opening of territorial points: guidance
4. Education/training
5. Placement in companies
6. Intercultural activities
7. Checking and adjustments of the model and balance of competences
8. Devising the Territorial Development Model
9. Mainstreaming

Macro phase 3 (01 November 2002 – 15 April 2004) – “Setting up of a network system”:

1. Production and publication of handbooks
2. Implementation and start of services to enterprises at the territorial points
3. Making the model part of a network


1. Coordination, project running and administrative management
2. Assessment and monitoring

For the research and analysis phase, the Regions which had been envisaged to be directly involved in the project were Veneto, Umbria, Campania, Tuscany and Apulia. For the setting up and management of the observatory and for education/training the regions involved were to be Campania, Veneto and Umbria. By involving the universe of tobacco processing industries directly, the project proposed should have concerned all the regions involved in the farming stage, also including less significant ones like Lazio, Abruzzo etc.

The crucial phase of the project was that of education/training and placement in companies of third country immigrants (points 4 and 5 of phase 2). The education/training phase, in two modules, preceded the immigrants’ placement within companies. The aims of the theoretical education concerning the industrial phase (November-December 2002) were learning about

- the trade union regulations for industry workers
- the trade union regulations on health and safety on the workplace
- the industrial production cycle
- the various categories of industrial products
- grades by colour and consistency
- logistics in a processing plant.

The theoretical education for the agricultural phase (scheduled for June 2003) had the following goals:

- learning about the trade union regulations about the agricultural sector
- acquiring basic competences on the varieties of tobacco
- acquiring the basic competences on the shape of the crown of tobacco leaves
- acquiring basic knowledge on the various degrees of ripening with a view to harvesting.

Therefore, the beneficiaries were trained as “Experts” following an upside-down supply chain approach which envisaged, above all, the development of the necessary skills to process the product and then to harvest it. The following placement in the industrial company (first
processing) and in the agricultural undertakings included tutoring and working with specialised professionals, short-term employment and increased qualifications and competences of the employees.

The proposing entity remarks the presence of several innovative elements concerning the process:

- it targets the enterprise system by combining the need to control the product’s lifecycle with social and economic goals; it shares job integration projects for disadvantaged people and focuses on the beneficiaries as the protagonists of the products’ and the environment’s quality;
- it targets the institutional system which manifests itself in the definition of integrated models of typical agrifood local districts (with the possibility for local labour institutions to manage the demand and supply of labour more effectively);
- it targets the individuals (third country immigrants), customising and building different pathways of integration in the labour market involving several actors and with a strong involvement of the beneficiary subject, by guaranteeing access to stable and regular forms of work.

In terms of context, the approach of the action is innovative in that it recovers the productive organisation levels of the enterprises, which have already long been acting with exchanges within the production process, but not with regard to the human resources involved in the production process. In the supply-chain structure of employment, this action goes beyond the fragmentation of times and functions of seasonal work as farm labourers to construct conditions of full employment by professionalising and qualifying the workers in the sector and by giving them the competence to bargain employment conditions.

The most innovative aspect probably lays in the idea of identifying a new professional figure whereby to make the employment of third country immigrant workers stable and qualified while guaranteeing the enterprises involved in the supply chain the quality and traceability of the end product, a crucial objective in the production process. Indeed, the new professional profile identified, i.e. the tobacco supply chain expert, can be employed along the whole life cycle of a product, and guarantee its quality thanks to competences which can meet the new demand coming from enterprises. This idea ought to raise interest among people involved on the sides of both demand and supply.

Finally, it should be remarked that some of the instruments adopted are innovative as well. Supply chain matrices have been designed for on-field data collection, elaboration and analysis. The timeliness and congruity of the dynamic data of all the business functions – employment above all – seem to be essential to shed light on needs and contribute to the job-matching processes.

Several aspects of the mix of actions proposed are those which also have been put in place by other projects aiming at favouring the job placement of third country immigrants. In general, integrated, multi-dimension strategies have been put in place (ISFOL, 2006). Hence the activities carried out can be adapted to several fields of action involving specific activities. The setting up of a network wishing to encourage dialogue between enterprises, public actors and voluntary organisations and aiming at creating an integrated information system, is one example of this. Another is combining vocational training activities with language training. In training the new professional figure specialised for the tobacco sector, the characteristics and needs of individual beneficiaries of the initiative are also taken into account. In general, the approach used reflect the necessity of more extensive linkages between the different phases of productive processes in the field of labour supply too. In Italy there were no other experiences involving third country immigrant workers. Also at the international level the effectiveness of the specific approach adopted does not seem to be evaluable.

During the implementation of the programme, a few changes were introduced to take into account the actual situation. First of all, the setting up and management of the observatory, as well as the education/training and placement in the companies were concentrated in Umbria alone. The
education/training phase had been originally planned as a residential course at the Mancini Centre (in Umbria) but the beneficiaries expressed the need to go back to their homes every day. For this reason, the funds that had been allocated to cover the costs of hosting the people on site were used for services provided by the kindergarten of the Training centre to the children in pre-school age whose mothers were immigrant women involved in the project.

Moreover, the original idea was to train 100 third country immigrants as supply chain experts and place them within companies working in the sector. The project went far beyond that figure, considering that as many as 173 people have been trained and placed (VV.AA., 2004).

Questions for the contextual factors:

- What conditions have influenced the project?
- What factors improved the success of the project?
- What factor put a check on the success of the project?
- Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?

Contextual factors:

One contextual factor that may have played a significant role in the success of the project was certainly the 2002 regularisation introduced by Law 189/2002 (known as the Bossi-Fini law). This law, originally limited to care-givers and household helps, was later extended (Law 222/2002) to include the immigrants employed by private companies. Considering that the educational activities started at the time when applications for the regularisations were being submitted, it is possible that this circumstance has positively affected the selection of beneficiaries of the project (not only legal but also irregular third country immigrants involved in the amnesty) and it has supported the placement within agricultural undertakings of the immigrants who took part in the training.

The territorial context in which the project was mainly carried out (region Umbria) certainly had a role in supporting the implementation of the initiative, thanks to the greater interconnections between and among the various subjects involved in the project and the greater efficiency of public bodies as compared to other areas in the country. The territorial context can definitely play a major role in determining the success of the initiatives proposed, although its role should not be as important.

One of the factors which definitely contributed to the success of the project was the structure of Temporary Association for a specific Purpose (Associazione Temporanea di Scopo - ATS) which included, among others, the Italian Association of Tobacco Processers (APT), the National Union of the Associations of Tobacco producers and INIPA (National institute for Professional education in Agriculture) of Coldiretti. These are trade associations of agricultural undertakings and processing industries working with tobacco. This situation provided the right conditions for the new professional profile to meet the needs of demand of labour and to be successful among the farms and agrifood industries involved in the initiative.

Generally speaking, the project’s managers viewed as fundamental the analysis of the actual feasibility of the work placement and the parallel intercultural activities that set up interpersonal relationships between ethnic groups, enhanced personal self-esteem in participants and helped overcoming all hindrances to participation especially among women (logistical and babysitting services in agreement with a local kindergarten and nursery).
Questions for the results:

- What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?:
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
  - putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
  - the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
  - the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;
  - ...

To what extent have these goals been achieved?

- To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?
- How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct / indirect)?
- Are there any differences in results among different target groups?
- How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?

Results:

The project aims at setting up a model to place employment relationships on formal footings and make them stable, recovering a systemic vision of employability in the supply chain, going beyond the segmented activities and seasonality of the companies themselves and bringing about competitive advantages to both companies and workers. The project wishes to resolve:

a) the seasonal nature of the jobs currently available in the sector, by professionalising the workers in the various stages of the supply chain: this would enable their permanent employment and allow them to benefit from this upgrading to find work in the agrifood industry and in local productive districts. In other words, the idea was to create a professional figure with competences in all the phases of a product’s processing;

b) the demand by enterprises for qualified labour that, together with technology, may have an active role in improving the quality of the end product and of the production processes.

In short, the main aim was to create a new professional figure that could guarantee stability and professional qualification to the workers in the sector while being a guarantee of quality and traceability of the end product for the enterprises involved.

The initiative implemented was basically a pilot action to test a systematic approach and devise a model for intervention on the employment aspects of the sector of tobacco. The goal of placing 100 immigrant workers into permanent jobs as chain experts went far beyond expectations. Indeed, as many as 173 unemployed third country immigrants were trained and placed, namely 137 women and 36 men belonging to 12 different ethnic groups (VV.AA., 2004). Notwithstanding the crisis in the sector of tobacco in Italy, the beneficiaries of the project kept their jobs in the enterprises (100%) after the end of the project (ISFOL, 2005). In addition, experimentation has been started in Campania and Veneto in other areas of the agrifood industry. The problem defined...
seems to be resolved (or resolvable with the adopted measures/actions) in the productive chain of tobacco but there are not evaluable results for other sectors of agrifood industry.

During the training courses all the beneficiaries were provided with the necessary logistics and support services. Among the services offered, it is worthwhile remarking that the kindergarten of the Training Centre welcomed 40 children in pre-school age whose mothers were immigrant women involved in the project. At the same time as the job placement, an intense intercultural activity was also carried out. This activity led to the setting up of a performance with music from the various ethnic groups, which has been recorded on a CD (called "Voci") whose protagonists are the immigrants themselves.

A national observatory for the agrifood industry of tobacco was set up with three points (Veneto, Umbria and Campania), which monitors work demand and supply and provides guidance to work, for new or recent immigrants in Italy, based on aptitudes, motivation, experience and professional skills. The Observatory constituted the area of exchange for all the actions within the MOAF project (Pieroni et al., 2004). The partner “Le Fonti” guaranteed continuation of the activities of the observatory until December 2005 - well beyond the conclusion of the project – as an instrument which the agricultural farms could use to recruit human resources (ISFOL, 2005). As far as we know, this Observatory is still operating and the information it holds shows that most of the beneficiaries of the project are still employed in the sector in which they were placed.

A service network was set up involving the enterprises and workers in the three regions with the greatest impact in terms of production of tobacco (Veneto, Umbria and Campania) by means of new software which can be adapted to other supply chains and sectors. This network monitors employment and professional dynamics in the tobacco supply chain, with regional modules interacting at the central level.

The Department of Economic Sciences at the University of Perugia carried out an in-depth study on the employment and socio-economic aspects of the tobacco sector all over Italy (VV.AA., 2004), exploring the structure of employment in the Italian production chain based on official INPS data and on direct surveys on a large sample. The Italian Ministry for Agriculture and Forestry adopted the result in the first document dealing with the impact of the proposed reform of the COM (Common Organisation of the Market) of tobacco and DG Agriculture has considered the outcome of this study. The results show that the total employment was made up of 22.5% of farm entrepreneurs, 29.5% of family employees and 48% of waged workers. The share of the total employee work due to the members of the entrepreneur’s family is below 50%, and this is true also considering that family employees are employed for a longer period than external waged workers (almost all with non-permanent contract). The economic and organizational structure of the enterprises has been discussed and the modalities and channels of recruitment of seasonal labour have been analyzed at the different locations of the enterprises in the tobacco chain. Among the external waged workers, women were prevailing and third country immigrants were a very important component, especially in the farming phase of the tobacco supply chain. According to quali-quantitative survey in Veneto, Umbria and Campania, special attention has been devoted to the analysis of the characteristics of immigrants and their working activity in the tobacco sector.

Another important result of the project was the creation of an actual model for territorial development based on a systematisation of the supply chain in the agrifood sector, with the small and medium enterprises and the services available locally.

Yet another product of the project was a new model for action on employment processes starting from the involvement of enterprises, based on a knowledge of their organisational models and the demands expressed, to intervene on human resources with targeted, complex actions. A volume (Pieroni et al., 2006) was produced showing the structure of the Equal-MOAF project and presenting factfiles which highlight the transferable elements tested to other supply chains and/or sectors.
Two handbooks were produced, which the companies and immigrant workers can use:

A) A handbook of “Best practices” for human resources of recent immigration to Italy including cross-linked sections that can be referred to for guidance by workers and enterprises alike. Its aim is to provide guidelines/information, concerning both the laws and institutional aspects regulating the presence of immigrant workers in Italy and the employment relationships and work environment. It wishes to contribute to improving immigrants’ lives in Italy. Section D is especially devoted to best practices and develops the issues concerning the management of the worker’s and the enterprise’s virtuous behaviours in order to bring about a constant improvement of profiles and relationships until the involvement of workers becomes the norm for the system's quality;

B) A handbook for the human resources employed in the quality processes of the agrifood industry (Le Fonti, 2003b). This handbook, which targets in particular third country immigrant workers, presents the main terms used in the concept of ‘agrifood supply chain’. Moreover it introduces some elements of human resources management in quality processes, the methods and aims of traceability, presents a few concepts on corporate social responsibility and on the relevant legislation, introduces the sector-specific laws and concludes with a few elements on regulated certification and brands.

The activities carried out, the models applied and the instruments devised have been shared in an international partnership with the French association FAFSEA (the organisation of French farming undertakings) in order to test the results of the project and enable their application to another European agricultural reality (VV.AA., 2004). Finally, both vertical and horizontal mainstreaming activities have been carried out with seminars, conferences, participation in national and international events and agreements with companies, associations of enterprises, public administrations.

**Questions for important lessons:**

- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)? What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?

**Important lessons:**

The success factors of this approach include:

- the organisation of work, proposed by the project and after the project itself, which envisaged a shift beyond the seasonal nature of work (2 months) for all the participants and beyond the conditions usually offered in agriculture, towards stable job lasting for more than 9 months in a row in the supply chain organisation of the companies involved
- the criterion used to choose the territorial context, which aims at prioritising the opportunities for greater interconnections between and among the various stakeholders
- the setting up of a Temporary Association for a specific Purpose (Associazione Temporanea di Scopo) bringing together all the main subjects involved in the sector concerned
- the active involvement of the top Italian enterprises working in the agribusiness/tobacco supply chain who had officially committed to employ people coming from the MOAF project (supply chain experts) in their own companies
- the positive action of the companies’ trade unions
- the interdisciplinary make-up of the coordinating technical staff: agricultural economists, sociologists, intercultural experts, educators, technicians of the agricultural section of the supply chain, technicians of the industrial segment of the supply chain (all too often training activities are not linked to the needs and know-how of enterprises)
- the adoption of awareness actions concerning the project targeted to both the immigrant communities and the enterprises operating in the sector
- the identification of a network of contacts including leading figures within each immigrant community in order to overcome the mistrust of the immigrants involved in the project
- bringing the managers of the companies involved into the teaching and tutoring process in order to deliver a training which is more directly connected to real needs and problems and to favour job-matching processes (Pieroni et al., 2004).

The principal fail factors of this approach could be the following:
- the difficulty to involve the small family agricultural undertakings in the projects
- in compliance with the current national legislation, the impossibility to train illegal third country immigrants that are the greatest part of the immigrants employed in agriculture in irregular and instable conditions
- the need to keep human and organisational structures at the local and central levels for the constant monitoring of the sector, the match between labour demand and supply and the training of new workers
- the difficulty to adopt this project in some other agrifood industries because of the complexity and specificity of the production chain.

The need to find converging interests among the subjects involved (in this case third country immigrants, enterprises and public institutions) can be an important lesson for all the activities devoted to promoting the regular and stable placement of immigrant workers in specific segments of the productive system, especially in agriculture, where unstable and irregular employment is extremely frequent. Another lesson could be the opportunity, in some cases, to define new professional profiles that may raise interest in enterprises based on a precise, in-depth analysis of the supply and demand of labour and of the different phases of the production chain.

The approach has several elements which can be transferred to other areas of the agrifood industry in Italy and abroad. One of these elements is the idea of training ‘experts’ who are able to work all along the production chain, using an ‘upside down’ approach involving, above all, training on the competences needed to process a product in the industrial firm and then on the competences concerning the harvesting process in the agricultural concern.

The most remarkable aspect, which can certainly be transferred, is the interdisciplinary approach of the training activities, which rests on a real, precise analysis of the needs of the companies and of those of the demand of immigrant labour.

The methodological instruments adopted are also transferable, namely the construction of supply chain matrices for on-field data collection, elaboration and analysis.

For applying this approach the project executors have bear in mind that the success of the action is linked to the adoption of measures devoted to actual match between labour demand and supply. On the base of the analysis of the specific labour market, the characteristics of the productive chain and the study of national and international rules, the project executors have to train the third country immigrants to gain a professional profile corresponding to their interests and that of the enterprises acting in the sector.
6. Overview literature (sources used)

Le Fonti (a cura di), *Manuale delle Buone Prassi per i lavoratori immigrati*, Iniziativa Equal MOAF, Litostampa, Perugia, ottobre 2003a.
Le Fonti (a cura di), *Manuale per gli operatori di qualità della filiera agroalimentare*, Iniziativa Equal MOAF, Litostampa, Perugia, ottobre 2003b.
In-depth case study The Netherlands

**Background information**

Name case study: Samen Werken in Kleur
Name country expert: Bram Frouws
Questions for the problem definition:
- What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?
- What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?
- What is the scope of the problem?
- What supposedly caused this problem?
- Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?
- Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

Problem definition:

The project ‘Samen Werken in Kleur’ is developed by the company Interpooling by Intervention, in cooperation with E-Quality, the Dutch information centre for gender, family and diversity issues. E-Quality provided advise and support, will perform an evaluation by the end of 2009 and played an important role in coming in contact with migrant- and women organisations.

Cause
The immediate cause for starting up the project was the observation that few black, migrant and refugee women are in employment or are economically independent. Moreover, in 2006 there were significant labour market shortages which were foreseen to increase in the upcoming years. Therefore, the Dutch economy and labour market urgently needed groups that are not participating in the labour market, to start doing so. As a result of the economic crisis, this last cause might be pushed somewhat into the background by now.
Another underlying cause is the overall aim of the Dutch government to increase the labour market participation of women in general and women from ethnic minority groups in particular.

Problem
Black, migrant and refugee women are an isolated group in the Dutch society. The project ‘Samen werken in kleur’ focuses, more specifically on black, migrant and refugee women who are not entitled to social benefits. As they are not entitled to social benefits, they are not registered at the UWV WERKbedrijf (the formerly Centre for Work and Income) and they are not obliged to participate in reintegration initiatives.

According to the director and project manager from re-integration company (Interpooling) the barriers these women face are (i1):
- Generally a lack of work experience
- A limited mastery of the Dutch language
- Generally a low education level (although highly educated migrants, especially refugees are also targeted by this intervention)
- For refugees, the legislation is a barrier
- The women do not have a CV
- Job interviews commonly go off with difficulty
- The home environment of the women might impede their participation (for example: a woman needs permission to work from her husband)
- Employers are careful in hiring migrant women

Concerning these last two barriers, the project tries to solve these by using family coaches and agreeing on temporary placements with employers.
Another barrier is that municipalities are not always interested in the target group of people who are not entitled to benefits (i1).

Another problem is that different research showed that many women who completed their civic
integration course do not receive further guidance in finding employment afterwards. The result is a lack of societal participation or even a socially isolated position. Thus, the civic integration course lacks long term, long lasting effects.

**Target group**

The target group consists of black-, migrant- and refugee-women who are not entitled to benefits (so called ‘nuggers’). Commonly, this is an isolated group of women, as they are not registered at the UWV WERKbedrijf because they are not entitled to benefits and are not obliged to participate in reintegration initiatives. Often, they are unemployed for an extended period of time (although often not registered), and a result they lack actual knowledge and skills and labour rhythm. Although the project is focused on non-western migrant women, there are also participants from Russia, Poland and Hungary (i1).

The project description divided this target group in five categories:
- Women who received an education in their country of origin, that does not fit the Dutch demands and
- Highly educated women working far below their skill level
- Women who received low or few education
- Women who received their education in the Netherlands, but do not succeed in finding a job
- Women who want to start their own company

This is a difficult target group, as placement into employment can take a long time for this group of women. Moreover, there’s no direct incentive for municipalities to invest in this group (i2).

Some of the problems are specific to this target group. For example, the socially isolated nature of this group as a result of their cultural background and the fact that they are not entitled to social benefit, is specific to this group. On the other hand, barriers such as the lack of work experience, the low education level or the reluctance of employers to hire them, might also apply to other groups of immigrants, or even to natives with a large distance to the labour market.

**Questions for the approach:**
- What approach has been used to address the problem?
- What are the core elements of the approach?
- What is the intensity and duration of the approach?
- How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?
- What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general (international literature, (policy) studies)?
- Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?
- What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?
- Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?

**Approach:**

The intervention consists of a combination of different modules, such as family-, individual- and group-coaching, successful role models and mediation.

Other characteristics of the approach:
- If possible, the coaches have an immigrant background themselves.
- The employers sign an intention agreement that ensures that, when functioning well, the women can apply for jobs with the status of an internal candidate.
The working elements of the approach are:
- Involving the family situation of the women (family coach)
- Women of similar background as counselors.
- An individual as well as a group approach
- Using the intrinsic motivation of women, for example by emphasizing the chances offered through employment and participation
- Implementing measures to make employment attractive for women (job close to home, childcare etc.)
- Role models. Successful immigrants will give a presentation on how they fare in the Dutch society and how they managed to successfully participate in this society.

Core elements
An important starting point of the project is the flexible and ‘tailor-made’ approach. Nevertheless, the approach consists of some basic elements, such as coaching and a personal approach (i1). Each women is allocated an individual counselor. This counselor is a women with a migrant background herself.

In the first stage of the approach, interest, motivation and assertiveness play an important role. The importance of intrinsic motivation is stressed. In case of a lack of motivation, women can be excluded from participation in the project.

Core elements in the approach are the power of these women, group processes, education, knowledge and skills and coaching. Another core element is the acquisition of participants. As explained this is a hard-to-reach group. Previous experiences show that the basis for and continuity of participation increases by involving the family situation in the approach. When providing information about the project, apart from explaining the project, attention is given to the importance of societal participation and economic independence. Acquisition of participants takes place through, and at, so-called ‘self-organizations’ (small organizations founded by migrants), mosques and other communal places.

Recruitment of coaches goes through networks and ‘self-organisations’. Their profile is as follows (i1):
- A matching cultural background
- Female
- Experience with working with women
- Commonly a education in welfare work
- Higher educational level

A further important element is the employer-approach. After a job placement, Interpooling continues coaching and is always available for assistance. Employers appreciate that and even get in touch with Interpooling to see if there are any potential candidates available (i1).

Intensity and duration
The duration of the approach is at least 2 years. The approach consists of five phases:
- Intake talks serve to determine the competences and motivation of potential candidates. Moreover, attention is given to their home situation. If necessary, when the family situation of the participant impedes the development of a women, a family coach will assist in creating a stable home environment. Together with their coach the participant draws up a personal approach.
- In the second phase individual and group talks prepare the participants for a job. Acquiring confidence and social skills are the most important elements of this phase.
- In the third phase, attention is given to skills and education. Education might connect to earlier received education in the country of origin.
In the fourth phase, the coaches search for a job or internship. Job seeking skills are a central element during this phase. Matching towards sustainable employment takes place.

The final phase is called ‘guided working’. As soon as a job is found, a 6-month contract is offered. During these six months extensive coaching takes place. At the end of this sixth phase the further development is discussed with all the involved stakeholders.

Education is offered by recognized educational institutions and can be focused towards:
- Speaking and writing the Dutch language
- Civic integration (course)
- Acquiring (field)knowledge needed for performing in a job
- Intercultural communication training
- Consultation between colleagues, focused on behaviour, attitude and presentation.

**Effectiveness of the approach in general**
The approach is for the most part in line with the recommendations done by the National Thematic Network Labour Market and Integration, based on good practices from EQUAL projects. It is beyond the scope of this case study to discuss all these recommendations. Below, some recommendations which are in line with the approach ‘Samen Werken in Kleur’ employs are summed up:
- Cross linking of labour market inflow and civic integration.
- Search for suitable employers and make arrangement with these employers in which commit themselves to the project.
- Intensive coaching of participants, from the intake to the work floor.
- An individual, tailor made approach.
- For municipalities: be prepared to invest more in intensive projects, for sustainable outflow.
- Connect to the perception and interest of participants, especially in the case of socially isolated women
- Use intermediaries from the own community to recruit participants.
- Make use of role models

To summarize, the approach of ‘Samen Werken in Kleur’ combines many of these good practices from previous approaches.

**Distinguishing characteristics**
- Interpooling has extensive and intensive contact with companies. Governmental interventions often lack these contacts.
- Interpooling cooperates with many different parties, while other institutions that carry out interventions, often are inclined to do everything on their own.
- The most distinguishing characteristic (and success factor) is the experience and commitment of the people who carry out the intervention (i1).

Moreover, the project is focused towards a target group which is not approached very often by other organisations (i2).

**Adjustment of the approach**
During the course of the project it turned out that a group approach did not work out in all cases. Reasons for this were the differences (in skills) between women and the fact that the women often are acquaintances of each other. Therefore, they might be more reluctant to show to the other participants that there are certain things they do not master yet. Especially matters such as assertiveness or job application training is more suited for individual guidance (i1).
Questions for the contextual factors:
- What conditions have influenced the project?
- What factors improved the success of the project?
- What factor put a check on the success of the project?
- Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?

Contextual factors:

Conditions that influenced the project
Although employers might be reluctant to hire immigrant women, overall employers are happy to hire employees out of the target group of people who are not entitled to benefits. That is, regarding wage demands this is an ‘easy’ target group, because they are often quickly satisfied to have a small amount of own income. Moreover, in general they are very motivated (i1).

Improving success
When developing the approach Interpooling used previous experiences from inside and outside the organisation. A bottle-neck in previous projects was that the coaches did not have a migrant background themselves. Especially with women who never worked before and who are not particularly socially active outside their family environment, it is essential to work with coaches who understand the (cultural) context. Therefore, this approach only works with female coaches with an immigrant background. These are often freelancers with many experience with the target group. Matching based on background characteristics makes that coaches are more active and motivated (i1).

Impeding factors
The fact that participants in the civic integration course and women who receive social benefit are not allowed to participate in this project impedes the participation of a certain group of women. Another impeding factor is bad communication between the municipal departments of civic integration and re-integration. Often there is no cooperation between these departments, which is why the government often does not succeed in developing a broad approach. Apart from implementation problems due to the lack of cooperation, this is also due to legislation (i1).

The current economic crisis might be an impeding contextual factor. However, the women are mainly placed in sectors such as the cleaning industry or care or social welfare sectors, which are not very cyclically sensitive. Therefore, the economic crisis does not seem to put a check on the success of the project (i2).

Questions for the results:
- What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?:
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
  - putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
  - the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
  - the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;
  - ....
- To what extent have these goals been achieved?
To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?
How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct / indirect)?
Are there any differences in results among different target groups?
How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?

Results:

Goals
This project has two main goals:
- Societal participation of black-, migrant and refugee women: integration in society, emancipation and social activation.
- Sustainable reintegration by black-, migrant and refugee women on the Dutch labour market.

This aim was translated into the following measurable outcomes: placing 30 percent of the participating women into employment within half a year and an outflow into employment of 50 percent within one year.

Apart from these main goals a side-aim was to attain more attention for this target group from employers, by using the arguments that this target group holds potential motivation, knowledge and experience, of which employers can benefit in a tight labour market. It seems to be that there are no explicit goals set regarding the quality of employment.

Achievement of goals
By the end of 2009 E-quality will carry out a process evaluation of the project, in which participants will be questioned. Based on the results so far (see below), it could be stated that the project achieved its two main goals of societal participation and sustainable reintegration.

Direct and indirect results of the approach
Approximately 50 women constantly participate in this project. Every time a participant in placed into employment, a new participant starts. The project started as a pilot in two municipalities (Heemskerk and Beverwijk), but by now more and more municipalities show their interest. The results are very good. Interpooling manages to obtain the highest re-integration scores in the Netherlands. The intervention ‘Samen werken in Kleur’ obtains a successful placement score of 90 percent. These placements are all sustainable, measured by a contract renewal after 6 months. The results are that good that certain municipalities now provide the possibility for potential participants to participate in either the civic integration course or in the project (i1).

Differences between target groups
The group of participants of this project, is very homogenous and mainly consists of Turkish women. Therefore, it is not possible to discover any differences between target groups. According to E-quality, working with such a homogenous group might be one of the success factors of this project, but further research is needed to confirm this. It remains to be seen if the approach is as successful for other ethnic groups, but there is no indication that it won't be (i2).
Questions for important lessons:
- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)?
- What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?

Important lessons:

Success factors
According to Interpooling (i1), the success factors of the approach are the following:
- The approach is broad and holistic.
- The project combines certain aspects of civic integration and re-integration (into employment).
- Bottom-up initiatives from commercial or societal organisations often gain the best results. This often works better than governmental initiatives. Consequently, these bottom-up initiatives can find their way to general integration and labour market policy.
- Personal involvement (by coaches).
- Experience in working with difficult target groups
- Knowledge of cultural aspects (working with coaches who have an immigrant background themselves).
- Being prepared to work together with other organisations (such as ‘self-organizations’, which are small organizations founded by migrants)

E-quality (i2) added to this:
- A homogenous group of participants (Turkish women)
- A strong motivation, both on the part of the participants (who are screened beforehand to assess their intrinsic motivation) and the coaches
- A very intensive approach. Coaches are available day and night
- A personal approach. Coaches visit participants at home and take into account very specific wishes (such as only willing to participate if the other participants are Muslim women) and the cultural background of participants
- A quick placement into employment. Thereby the project fulfils women’s motivation to start working as soon as possible. The prospect of finding employment soon, increases the motivation of the participants

Fail factors and bottle-necks
As already mentioned above, the group approach did not work out in all cases. However, it might be that this group approach will work for other target groups (i2).
One of the main bottle-necks at the beginning of the project, was to find municipalities being prepared to participate in this project. As said, there is no direct incentive for municipalities to invest in this target group (as they are not entitled to social benefit). Moreover, the approach is relatively costly, although it seems that this will pay off as the results clearly show sustainable placement into employment (i2).

Lessons to be learnt
One of the most important success factors for placement into employment remains language. In case of language deficiencies, language training should be part of the approach (i1). Apart from
this, the success factors can be considered as important lessons to keep in mind when developing future interventions.

Transferability of the approach
The project is mainly targeted towards women with an immigrant background, although the approach entails enough flexibility, to make it suitable for other target groups (i1).

Bearing in mind when applying the approach
People (immigrants) not entitled to social benefits are not always seen as an important or interesting target group. Moreover, the costs of this approach are fairly high. Therefore, (local) governments might be reluctant to start a project such as this one. In this case, the recommendation to governments might be to start a pilot with for example 5 participants. In case of good results, the project might be pursued (i1).

6. Overview literature (sources used)

www.interventiesnaarwerk.nl: This website is an initiative by the Ministry of Social Affairs and Employment, UWV Werkbedrijf, the Council for Labour and Income (RWI) and other partners and aims to provide inside into the functioning and effectiveness of interventions to work.


Interview 1 (i1) with: Gerard Wiegman and Sebahat Yurdusen, Interpooling by Intervention (the executor of the intervention).

Interview 2 (i2) with: Arthie Schimmel, E-quality (involved in the development and evaluation of the approach).
In-depth case study Poland

Background information
Name case study: International Centre of Occupational Adaptation
Name country expert: Marek Okólski (collaboration: Ewa Matejko)
Questions for the problem definition:

- What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?
- What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?
- What is the scope of the problem?
- What supposedly caused this problem?
- Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?
- Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

Problem definition:

International Centre of Occupational Adaptation (ICOA)\(^1\) was set up in 2004 at the Faculty of Pedagogics, University of Warsaw, on the initiative of the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy. Its financial resources came from EQUAL Project. EQUAL (operative until the end of 2008) was "a part of the European Union's strategy for more and better jobs and for ensuring that no-one is denied access to them. Funded by the European Social Fund, this initiative [was] testing since 2001 new ways of tackling discrimination and inequality experienced by those in work and those looking for a job" ([http://ec.europa.eu/employment_social/equal/index_en.cfm](http://ec.europa.eu/employment_social/equal/index_en.cfm)). Until 2006 ICOA was headed by Dr. Krystyna Bleszynska. In 2006 ICOA was incorporated into the Institute of Social Prophylactics and Resocialisation, and its head became Professor Tadeusz Pilch. Because of termination of the EQUAL funding in March 2008, since 2009 ICOA activities have been reduced to running the post-graduate studies devoted to "Labour market support to persons of various cultural backgrounds".

ICOA was both an extensive project and an organizational unit within the university structure. An immediate reason of launching the project was a widespread perception among policymakers and experts of inadequate responsiveness of Poland to the needs of immigrants entering the labour market, which was reflected in diverse difficulties encountered by the foreign nationals in job searching and functioning in employment as well as the lack of experience and deficient knowledge on the part of employers and social workers with regard to the instruments and procedures facilitating the adaptation of immigrants to the labour market in Poland. The project was to cope with those deficiencies. In particular, the following facts contributed to the project setting up (Madej 2007):

- ever increasing inflow to Poland of immigrants, asylum seekers and co-ethnics (from the former Soviet Union);
- observed or perceived cases of migrant’s discrimination regarding social and economic adaptation of that category of people in Poland;
- paucity or imperfections of relevant legal acts in Poland;
- insufficient awareness among the Polish society concerning the functioning of various categories of migrants in Poland;
- limited awareness and cultural competences among social workers expected to deal with the problems of migrants;
- lack of relevant personnel and infrastructure.

ICOA was addressed to two different target groups, called – respectively – final and intermediate beneficiaries, i.e.:

- migrants being the residents of Poland, that is the refugees, the repatriated co-ethnics and other categories of documented ("legal") immigrants, as well as their associations;
- representatives of social organizations or agencies rendering diversified services to migrants, such as social workers and other employees of respective regional and local administration, employer’s associations, women rights associations, organisations specializing in vocational

---

\(^1\) Polish name: Międzykulturowe Centrum Adaptacji Zawodowej ([http://www.mcaz.org.pl](http://www.mcaz.org.pl) and mcaz@uw.edu.pl).
training or retraining (through, especially, extramural courses), labour offices, teachers as well as educationists and psychologists working with children and their parents coming from different cultures.

With regard to individual migrants (the final beneficiaries), the project was to support their entering, sustained functioning and successful mobility in the Polish labour market. In turn, it also addressed the challenges faced by intermediate beneficiaries (organizations of social workers, employers, etc.), such as the deficit in existing knowledge about employment and performance in the labour markets of foreign nationals, adaptation problems of foreigners and their families, upgrading of intercultural competences, etc. In addition, ICOA was designed in such way as to address a systemic problem stemming from the lack of a (central and coordinating) institution for comprehensive and complex support of immigrants in the labour market in Poland.

The scope of the problem can be defined through the number of potential beneficiaries, i.e. documented foreign nationals (and other migrants) living in Poland, ethnic or immigrant associations representing those persons, administrators and social workers dealing with migrants’ matters and employers’ associations. By all means, the scope was national; the project goals pertained to the beneficiaries all over Poland. On the other hand, however, it is well known that a large majority of documented foreigners live in only few big cities: Warsaw, Krakow, Poznan, Gdansk and Lodz (Kepinska 2007).

Since, especially at the time of project take-off, the Polish economy suffered from a very high unemployment rate (especially the long-term unemployment of structural character), it might be argued that the project goals with regard to the final beneficiaries were of a more or less general and universal character since many problems encountered by foreign nationals in the labour market (especially, labour market inclusion) pertained to a similar degree to Polish nationals. Quite opposite to this, the respective representatives of social services and employers dealt with those problems rather rarely due to a very low level of labour inflow to Poland. Thus, as far as the intermediate beneficiaries are concerned, the project goals could be perceived as specific and “novel”. This is because before then the respective Polish social services had no experience and sufficient skills to deal with foreign client (e.g. knowledge on how to solve legal problems of a foreign national; cross-cultural communication skills; adequate proficiency in foreign languages, etc.).

Questions for the approach:

- What approach has been used to address the problem?
- What are the core elements of the approach?
- What is the intensity and duration of the approach?
- How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?
- What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general (international literature, (policy) studies)?
- Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?
- What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?
- Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?
Approach:

The ICOA project was being implemented through counselling, education and vocational training, on-the-job training, publications and lobbying. Its activities include three basic directions: education, counselling and intervention in emergency, and (inter alia) comprised the following:

- project administration;
- activities that facilitate entering the labour market by persons that represent different cultures by individual counselling (including occupational, legal and psychological support), providing educational services (vocational training) and facilitating on-the-job training, and organising socio-cultural adaptation courses;
- activities that improve the intercultural competencies of representatives of the social services who deal with foreigners’ entry and functioning in the labour market;
- designing and testing of a model Intercultural Centre of Occupational Counselling (ICOC), i.e. creating a general framework for occupational counselling for migrants and developing it into good practices in that area;
- designing and testing of a model rehabilitation unit (rendering psychological assistance) addressed to refugees, victims of trafficking in migrants and other culturally different persons in need, which would lead to elaboration of a general framework for designing good practices in dealing with migrants in precarious situation;
- supporting culturally different women in their entering of the labour market;
- spreading the knowledge about occupational adaptation of foreign nationals among the Polish social services, and employers’ and foreigners’ associations.

The scope of the project embraced migrants who were granted legal stay on the territory of Poland, and among them only those who resided in Warsaw or its suburbs, and in addition employees of various units of the administration responsible for providing appropriate social services.

Eligible foreign nationals and other groups of eligible migrants benefited above all from a variety of adaptation courses, such as Polish language courses, courses on the basics of Polish law, introduction to small entrepreneurship, introduction to Polish culture (in comparative cross-cultural perspective), and a number of fast-track courses improving occupational skills (e.g. introduction to computer use, courses for tourist-tour guides, body massage, manicure and pedicure courses, driving licence courses, courses for cooks, book-keepers, machine operators, tile layers, hair stylists and others). Basically, individual final beneficiaries were covered by those activities systemically and over a long period of time\(^2\), and only exceptionally an emergency assistance was provided to them.

The main form of activities addressed to the intermediate beneficiaries was a post-graduate study on “Supporting the culturally different in the labour market”. In addition, those persons benefited from a variety of courses concerning intercultural social environment and the ways of coping with the problems encountered by persons living in such environment.

An important element of the approach followed by ICOA was international collaboration with two partnerships – composed by countries of the “old” European Union, i.e. with CEED (a partnership of the following projects: Beyond Face Value, the United Kingdom; Norddeutsches Netzwerk zur beruflichen Integration von Migrantinnen, Germany; Imigracion en Extremadura, Spain) and CONCENTUS (a partnership of the following projects: Asylum Seekers Pursuing Integration, Refuge and Empowerment, the United Kingdom; Brucke zur Reintegration durch Grandlegende Kompetenz, Germany; Inclusion Refugees Network, Italy). A principal aim of that collaboration was an exchange of “best/good

\(^2\) Long period of time means the duration of involvement of an individual beneficiary (a migrant) from first contact (consultation) through designing an individual programme of assistance until active job search by such beneficiary, within the duration of the project.
practices”, which was accomplished through conferences, study visits and workshops. This led to a systematic collection of instruments, good practices and procedures, which were applied to designing of a model ICOC.

From the organisation view-point ICOA consisted of five sections:
- ICOC Section;
- Training Section;
- Section for Conferences, Courses, Seminars and Promotion;
- Post-graduate Studies Section;
- Project Evaluation Section.

The project was carried out in cooperation with Polish organisations involved in migrants’ support in the labour market. Apart from general coordination, the leading organisation (University of Warsaw) was responsible for adaptation and occupational courses, legal, psychological and occupational counselling for the final beneficiaries, and for post-graduate studies and specialised courses for the intermediate beneficiaries. Other responsibilities were shared by five other (external) organisations:
- National Centre of Support for Vocational and Continual Training (Krajowy Osrodek Wspierania Edukacji Zawodowej i Ustawicznej) was in charge of courses for social workers and employers;
- Warsaw Centre of Family Assistance (Warszawskie Centrum Pomocy Rodzinie) took over the recruitment of project beneficiaries, running of the Club of Refugee and providing migrants with emergency help;
- Foundation Against Trafficking in Human Beings and Slavery (Fundacja Przeciwko Handlowi Ludzmi i Niewolnictwu) “La Strada” became responsible for running of the Vietnamese Confidence Telephone, and it was involved in the recruitment of project beneficiaries and providing migrants with emergency help;
- Centre of Education and Rehabilitation (Centrum Kształcenia i Rehabilitacji) implemented specialised vocational courses for immigrants;
- Association of Legal Intervention (Stowarzyszenie Interwencji Prawnej) provided social work and employers’ organisations with legal expertise and it organised specialised seminars for those groups of beneficiaries.

Application of this approach resulted from practical observation and research experience of Dr. Krystyna Bleszynska who was first to head the ICOA. Her idea was to provide support for migrants in their adaptation into the Polish labour market and social services, such as education, training and consultancy. Those activities were supposed to bring about durable results and benefits for both direct and indirect beneficiaries, especially with regard to ‘know-how’ about services relevant to migrant entry and mobility in the labour market. Moreover, Dr Bleszynska introduced, as a theoretical goal of the project, the concept of ‘best model of organisation’ that would facilitate migrants’ integration in the Polish labour market. This was of particular importance for future developments in this area because Poland is a very ‘young’ immigration country with no prior experience in dealing with occupational adaptation of migrants.

The expected results were to be attained within the three-year time-span (2006-2008) and those results included:
- improving skills and occupational flexibility (or mobility) of the final beneficiaries;
- improving intercultural competences among employees of social services and other organisations active in the area of facilitating the access to the labour market;
- providing the employers with up-to-date knowledge about the possibilities (and opportunities) and consequences of hiring migrant workers and the benefits from having an intercultural environment at the workplace.

After a rather lengthy period of running-in, the core project started in February 2006 and it was supposed to be completed in March 2008. Some activities, however, extended few months beyond the final date.
Because of, in a European perspective, a relatively low inflow to and presence in Poland of foreign nationals, the issue of migrant adaptation to labour market is rather new. For this reason the ICOA project was a novelty and pioneering effort in Poland. ICOA proved to be the first initiative rendering complex services to immigrants from the point of view of their adaptation to the labour market. Additionally, a "two sides" approach including the "client" side and the "service providers" side seemed to have increased a possibility of successful attaining of major goals of the project, especially – through an increase in the competences of the project beneficiaries – an improvement of labour market adaptation of foreign workers (or other migrants) in Poland.

As mentioned above, the approach followed by within ICOA was entirely new in Poland. Although elements of that approach, such as vocational training, counselling or emergency assistance, were applied in earlier years within other projects aimed at immigrants’ support (e.g. by Polish Humanitarian Action, Helsinki Foundation for Human Rights or Warsaw Centre of Family Assistance), a clear novelty of the ICOA project was in its complexity and comprehensiveness.

During the implementation of ICOA several modifications in the project contents were introduced. Those modifications included:

- counselling activities: team work of counsellors became a preferred form of dealing with specific individual cases (instead of an earlier preference to individual work of a counsellor on a given case); counselling of social workers in matters of housing (accommodation) and job search was added to the areas dealt with by the project counsellors; psychological counselling (which name proved to be a little awkward) was renamed to cultural counselling;
- collaboration with partners: activities related to the Vietnamese Confidence Telephone (managed by La Strada) were discontinued due to the lack of demand on the part of final beneficiaries; instead La Strada increased its involvement in the recruitment of project beneficiaries (participants of educational and vocational courses);
- a new spontaneous initiative: on the initiative of employers taking part in the project (intermediate beneficiaries) a “mini labour exchange” was set up, which provided migrants with updated information on job availability by using a notice board in the ICOA office where employers and migrants could place their job-search-related announcements; this activity constitutes one of the recommendations for future project in the area of occupational adaptation of migrants;
- technical modification: the ICOA office was moved to a new site.

Questions for the contextual factors:
- What conditions have influenced the project?
- What factors improved the success of the project?
- What factor put a check on the success of the project?
- Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?
**Contextual factors:**

An important contextual element bearing on successful implementation of the project was the paucity in Poland of organisations systematically providing assistance to immigrants who encounter difficulties in the adaptation in the labour market. That gap was to be filled by ICOA.

The fact that the project was carried out at the University of Warsaw proved to be favourable to its implementation. In project staff’s view, the University logo and affiliation often helped to secure confidence of all beneficiaries, which seemed particularly crucial in case of foreign nationals, and this ultimately enabled an effective recruitment of project beneficiaries. From the perspective of technicalities of ICOA, especially the project management, the University supported the project in many ways – in the process of application for EQUAL (ESF) financial contribution, in accounting procedures in the course of ICOA implementation and in wrapping-up of the project. In addition, the University prefinanced many activities of ICOA, which facilitated their smooth realisation.

A factor that contributed to the fulfilment of major goals of the project was adoption of a “two sides” approach including the “client” side and the “service providers” side, which made the project more “complete”. Still another favourable circumstance that affected the outcomes of the project was the participation of experienced and knowledgeable partners who, in the process of recruitment of beneficiaries and their counselling and training, made up a complementary and harmonious team. Serious constraints of the project proved to be a failure to recruit individual employers (in addition to the representatives of employers’ associations) as its intermediate beneficiaries and recruiting of a limited number of the employees of local labour offices (another category of project intermediate beneficiaries). It was felt by project staff that a direct involvement of individual employers in ICOA could have a favourable effect on selection of “topics” of the vocational courses that would better reflect the demand for particular skills (or, in other words, the actual needs of employers). It was also felt that a larger participation of the representatives of labour offices, by willingly assuming a role of employment “intermediaries”, could have a positive impact on the successful job searching by foreigners taking part in ICOA activities. Some other constraints of the project directly stemmed from the fact that it addressed solely the metropolitan area of Warsaw and did not reach to other parts of Poland. Some minor problems resulted from the lack of office space.

Specific factors, albeit of indirect nature, that adversely influenced ICOA were the unstable (highly dynamic) macroeconomic context during the project realisation and a rapidly intensifying public discourse on immigration to Poland. In the period 2006-2008 the economy grew at a fast pace and great numbers of Poles migrated for work to “old” countries of the European Union. Simultaneously the Polish economy was undergoing a deep modernising restructuring, in a large part financed from the European Funds, and huge infrastructural investment projects started because of the 2012 European Football Championships (to take place in Poland and Ukraine). There emerged several strong symptoms of labour shortages and a rising demand for foreign labour, especially in the construction industry (Grabowska-Lusinska, Zylicz 2008). Mass media quickly elevated immigration to the rank of topical issues, and in a relatively short time the attitudes towards foreign nationals changed to better. Obviously the original goals of ICOA hardly “addressed” that new macroeconomic situation, and, on the other hand, at that time it was impossible to radically change the goals and strategy of the project.

Summing up, the described above contextual factors were mostly favourable to project final outcomes and only few of them hampered their achievement. It should be stressed, however, that small involvement of employers, as project indirect beneficiaries, seriously undermined the degree of its goals fulfilment (see chapter on project results). In general, the project was overly successful but larger incorporation of employers to the project might have significantly risen this positive ‘score’.
Questions for the results:

- What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?:
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
  - putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
  - the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
  - the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;
  - ....

- To what extent have these goals been achieved?

- To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?

- How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

- How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

- If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

- Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct / indirect)?

- Are there any differences in results among different target groups?

- How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?

Results:

The principal goal of ICOA was put as follows: preventing the social exclusion through combating the discrimination in the labour market and facilitating entry in the labour market of people of different cultures who arrive in Poland as immigrants or asylum seekers or fellow countrymen (the repatriated co-ethnics). Also a specific goal was set forth assuming the elaboration and testing of a model of intercultural occupational counselling.

It was expected that indirectly this would result in growing participation of foreign nationals in the labour market, increasing their employment rate, improving the efficiency of social service organisations, and – in effect – improving the adaptation of migrants in the labour market in Poland.

In real life targets of the project were achieved to various degree, depending (among other things) on possibilities to recruit the project beneficiaries. The timing of project assumed that its subsequent elements or stages required a successful implementation of preceding elements or stages; therefore inability to recruit a sufficient number of beneficiaries (which due to a very small number of immigrants in Poland severely affected the group of final beneficiaries) did not only undermine the fulfilment of a given target but also caused a delay in and endangered the realisation of further targets.

The degree to which various project goals were fulfilled can only be assessed by considering those goals separately – for immigrants (and other groups of final beneficiaries) and representatives of the Polish services assisting immigrants (intermediate beneficiaries).

With regard to the former group, as many as 449 migrants were covered by the ICOA activities, of which 221 refugees, 33 repatriated persons, 185 other migrants and 10 persons whose status was not
determined. The share of females was just 35% (and of males 65%). A large majority, 125 persons (28%), constituted migrants from the Russian Federation, mainly from Chechnya, followed by those from Ukraine (49 persons), Nigeria (34 persons), Belarus (27 persons), Kazakhstan (18 persons) and Pakistan (16 persons). Migrants who completed a secondary school predominated (231 persons, i.e. 51.5%), followed by those with a university diploma (134 persons). Only 21 migrants completed vocational school and 14 elementary school. The final beneficiaries were typically rather young – 78% were between 25 and 49 years of age (14% were aged 16-24 and 4% 65 or more).

By far the largest group comprised the unemployed (51%), followed by students (16%) and employees (10%). Only six beneficiaries were self-employed (“small entrepreneurs”). Every fourth migrant participating in ICOA was economically inactive.

The most popular activities included various vocational courses\(^4\) (243 persons) and adaptation courses\(^5\) (216 persons). As many as 294 persons successfully completed courses and obtained relevant certificates, of whom 78 obtained diplomas or licences (driving licence, computer proficiency diploma) although only 260 participants of ICOA training courses were formally admitted (and were allowed a financial grant for the purpose).

The evaluation of the project carried out (by an external auditor) after its completion on a sample of direct beneficiaries revealed that from among 36 initially unemployed persons (out of the total 60 migrants in the sample who joined ICOA activities at the very beginning of the project), 25 persons continued to be unemployed. However an active job searching visibly increased among those migrants; over the time of project implementation the share of unemployed who registered with local labour offices rose from 3.3% to 5.0%.

At the same time the number of project final beneficiaries in employment increased from 14 to 24, to reach 40% of the initial target group. A large majority of the employed (at the project end) were already in employment for more than two months (all but one) and worked on the basis of contract with no termination date (63%) while every fourth of the employed worked as a sub-contractor. Almost all of them worked legally.

On the other hand, none of the project beneficiaries found the job through a direct ICOA assistance, whereas in case of more than half (58%) of them, friends or family members turned out to be the intermediaries\(^6\). The evaluators of the project found that the major obstacles migrants felt for taking employment were “too low” remuneration offered (30% job-seeking migrants) and the lack of offers fitting the migrant skills (12%)\(^7\). Despite the fact that a relatively large number of final beneficiaries completed more than one vocational course provided for by ICOA, migrants generally felt that they had a very limited chance for upward professional mobility. Almost one-half of those in employment were dissatisfied with their remuneration and more than one-third with their occupational position. This might mean that the project did not significantly contribute to immigrants’ functioning in the labour market in Poland. On the other hand, the final beneficiaries themselves viewed the ICOA training courses as beneficial; more than 50% of the investigated migrants said the courses were ”very important” or “important” for them, and in this number as many as 48% said that ICOA helped them in improving their skills. Only 10% did not find their participation in vocational courses offered by ICOA useful. Moreover every second migrant was of the opinion that the project failed to facilitate their direct contacts with the

\(^4\) Those included introduction to computer use, tourist-tour guiding, body massage, manicure and pedicure, car driving, cooking, book-keeping, machine operating, tile laying, hair styling, etc.

\(^5\) Such as Polish language courses, planning of own career development, basics of Polish law and economic activity, etc.

\(^6\) The project staff did not include social workers who would render services like intermediating in job search. However, in January 2008 (just two months before the project completion), as a result of requests or suggestions that were frequently expressed by ICOA final beneficiaries, a social worker joined the project.

\(^7\) According to the surveyed migrants’ declarations.

\(^8\) Most often the offers required very low skills while a large proportion of migrants comprised the highly skilled.
employers. It must be mentioned, however, that approximately 40% final beneficiaries could not clearly answer relevant questions asked by the evaluators.

According to the opinions presented by final beneficiaries, the project was more successful in providing the migrants with legal and occupational counselling (opinions about the usefulness of cultural or psychological counselling were more sceptical). Altogether, more than 400 foreign nationals addressed the ICOA counsellors with their problems, of which 219 with occupational and 123 with legal problems. A survey among the final beneficiaries, conducted after termination of the project, revealed that for 17% of them the counselling was very helpful in job seeking and for 52% it was just helpful. Also 50% migrants viewed the occupational counselling as a positive factor in their adaptation in the labour market while only 30% migrants thought that cultural counselling contributed to the adaptation.

With respect to the intermediate beneficiaries (social workers, etc.), the project embraced 328 persons (of whom 98% held a university diploma). Those persons included the representatives of social services directly addressing foreign nationals, labour offices, educational institutions and information centres of different kind. In turn, 79 persons took part in the post-graduate studies on “Assistance to culturally different persons in the labour market”, 60 persons in courses on "Work with a culturally different client", 65 persons in courses on “Multicultural education” and 124 persons in courses on “Multiculturalism in occupational counselling”.

The graduates of those studies and courses were of generally very high opinion of their curriculum and quality of instructors. As many as 90% said they broadened their knowledge about the multicultural society. As far as the post-graduate study is concerned, the graduates felt that its programme contributed more to their general intellectual development than to increasing their practical skills. However, a survey carried out after the project termination brought about a much more optimistic message: 70% graduates of ICOA courses felt that they used the skills learned thanks to the project in their daily work.

As already mentioned, in addition to training, education and counselling, ICOA also included social campaigns promoting multiculturalism and preventing discrimination, and organised academic events. Over the project duration 10 seminars were organised which brought together 471 researchers and practitioners, and 5 scientific conferences attended by some 600 scholars. Two large research projects were carried out within ICOA, one devoted to the situation and functioning of Chechen refugees and Vietnamese immigrants in Poland. The list of ICOA publications comprises 10 books or booklets (some of them listed in Overview literature, below).

A public campaign and a series of press conferences, organised by ICOA, were entirely devoted to the information about project goals and results, and especially to the promotion of social partnership and work of culturally different people. The project also involved an extensive exchange of theoretical and practical experiences between ICOA and foreign partners (British, German and Italian). On 5-9 November 2007 the partners met in Brussels to finalise the partnership “Connecting Policy with Practice”; the presentation by ICOA of its practical outcomes was highly appreciated and the project was honoured with European Regional Champions Award 2007.

In general, ICOA has established itself in the perception of (actual and potential) final and intermediate beneficiaries as an important facilitating agent in the labour market of Warsaw Metropolitan Area. Even though most of the project activities have been discontinued in April 2008, in the following months still new foreign nationals and representatives of other groups of beneficiaries inquired (through phone calls, emails or personal visits to ICOA office) about availability of different forms of assistance.

All in all, it seems that ICOA – despite its relatively small scale – resulted in a variety of positive effects. Besides immediate help rendered to foreign nationals and providing Polish practitioners with higher skills,
the project accumulated vast experience, which could be used for designing a project of comprehensive support to foreign nationals in their occupational adaptation in Poland, and for elaborating good and bad practices in that field. In general, however, the project should be regarded as a pilot study that enabled testing various experiences, strategies and concrete activities. Specific effects in combating discrimination of immigrants or members of ethnic minorities and in promoting their adaptation in the labour market certainly require much longer time than the ICOA project allowed for.

Questions for important lessons:
- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)? What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?

Important lessons:
- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)? What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?

Success factors of the project:
organisation
- Systematic evaluation and instant adjustment of project goals and activities in various stages of ICOA implementation;
- Skilful management of the project thanks to placing it within the University of Warsaw, one of the largest and most experienced academic institutions in Poland;
- Prefinancing of the project by the University of Warsaw, which secured its smooth and uninterrupted realisation;
- Setting up of an efficient mode of recruitment of project beneficiaries by establishing a multiplicity of recruitment channels (thanks to the assistance of partner institutions);
- Providing final beneficiaries with communication tools necessary in the job searching process (e.g. telephone line, fax machine, computer and access to internet).

human resources
- Competent, creative and flexible team of occupational counsellors and instructors.

methodology
- Long-term strategy in dealing with individual cases (foreign nationals);
- Flexibility of project strategy that enabled accounting for the needs of final beneficiaries that were overlooked (not included) in the phase of project designing.
Failure factors of the project:

organisation
- excessively modest office space;
- insufficient flexibility of occupational counselling (availability of counsellors limited to early morning hours);
- organisational deficiencies in the functioning of post-graduate studies (unjustified changes in time-table, poor communication between instructors and students);
- inefficient communication between supervising institution and the partners during implementation of the project;
- insufficient collaboration between project partners in the efforts to widen or improve services offered to the final beneficiaries.

methodology
- unawareness among beneficiaries of the complex model and strategy of occupational adaptation pursued by ICOA;
- the lack of coherent concept of adaptation to the labour market and occupational counselling (a gap between the concept of occupation adaptation in the labour market and the concept of occupational counselling);
- imbalances in the project strategy between psychological support (emphasised by ICOA) and specialised training and counselling (preferred by the beneficiaries);
- insufficient involvement of employers in the project goal-setting;
- too limited collaboration with employment intermediaries;
- inadequate guidelines for the activities for the team of the counsellors.

Principal recommendations in the area of occupational adaptation of foreign nationals:
- higher effort devoted to the adaptation of foreigners aged 50 or more;
- bringing more female final beneficiaries to the project;
- adjusting goals and tools of the project to different categories of migrants’ education;
- linking the goals and contents of counselling with those of training;
- adding employment intermediation to the range of services offered to the final beneficiaries;
- increasing involvement of the employers in the project;
- continuity of relevant projects and financial support over time;
- using good and bad practices developed/elaborated during project implementation as a foundation for future projects of occupational adaptation;
- setting up of a project in the area of migrants access to health services, housing and public education.

The project seems transferrable to other situations under the assumption of a similar socio-economic and political context. This is because ICOA was conceived as a general approach and strategy, which would be applicable to various groups of beneficiaries. An important constraint in its transferability would be ethnic/cultural heterogeneity of final beneficiaries; the project to be transferrable should account for ethnic/cultural specificity of each group of final beneficiaries. A strong advantage of ICOA from the view-point of transferability was its emphasis on flexibility and long-term work with individual beneficiaries, which enabled migrants and service providers to build a mutual trust and develop viable individual strategies of occupational adaptation. Last but not least, the project is demanding as it requires a high administrative efficiency, and at the same time a flexible and highly competent staff.

---

9 For instance, collaboration between the section of ICOA responsible for counseling and the section responsible for education proved to be very weak. In effect, the courses offered to direct beneficiaries often failed to the actual needs of migrants, which reflected labour market situation.
### 6. Overview literature (sources used)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title and Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Interview with Ms. Marta Smagowicz – an assistant in the ICOA project (MCAZ), conducted on 14 September 2009.
In-depth case study Portugal

Background information
Name case study: Office for the support of immigrant entrepreneurship
Name country expert: Sonia Pereira
Questions for the problem definition:
- What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?
- What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?
- What is the scope of the problem?
- What supposedly caused this problem?
- Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?
- Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

Problem definition:

The project originated in the office responsible for the promotion of immigrants’ employability in Portugal and is part of an integrated national response to the problems immigrants face in the labour market, particularly regarding unemployment. It is part of the services provided by the National Immigrant Support Centre, which was an initiative of the High Commission for Immigration and Intercultural Dialogue (with tutelage from the Minister for the Presidency). During the course of its work this office was confronted with a number of immigrants who sought information on how to set up businesses in Portugal. At the same time, this office – directed to assist immigrants in finding jobs – realized that self employment and the creation of businesses could also be an appropriate way of overcoming unemployment situations. Difficulties in overcoming unemployment, particularly at the present economic situation when job opportunities are scarce, are one of the problems immigrants face in the labor market that this project seeks to address. The other is the promotion of a route to socio-economic upward mobility through entrepreneurship since socio-economic advancement through wage jobs has proved more difficult for immigrants. The first problem is not ‘immigrant-specific’ even though immigrants have been more affected by the increase of unemployment than natives. The second problem is a characteristic of immigrants’ economic integration processes in Portugal. Setting up businesses is therefore a way of either overcoming unemployment or improving income (Oliveira and Rath 2008: 25 refer that immigrant entrepreneurship is seen as a way of improving economic insertion and fighting social exclusion). However officers involved in this project also alert immigrants to the risks involved in such activity. Indeed, the experience of the project officers is that this path is chosen by either unemployed immigrants that are experiencing difficulties in accessing the labour market (the majority at present), especially in the current context of rising unemployment, or by those that have sufficient experience in one particular activity (in Portugal or the country of origin) and wish to set up the same activity in Portugal.

Immigrants that seek this service often: 1) do not have a clear idea about the business they wish to set up; 2) do not have sufficient knowledge to constitute a business plan or contact appropriate institutions, in order to obtain funding for example; 3) have difficulties in filling up the necessary forms to obtain financial support, for example.

This initiative targets immigrants, regardless of their immigration status – because it is located in a one stop shop with different services for immigrants. If the immigrant is irregular he/she is directed first to the legal services.
Questions for the approach:
- What approach has been used to address the problem?
- What are the core elements of the approach?
- What is the intensity and duration of the approach?
- How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?
- What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general (international literature, policy studies)?
- Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?
- What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?
- Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?

Approach:

The approach developed by the office for the support of immigrant entrepreneurship consisted, initially, of the provision of information and assistance/counseling to immigrants who sought information on how to set up businesses in Portugal and later evolved to the development of specific training for immigrants with more solid plans for business constitution.

When it was set up – in 2007 – and during most of its existence (up until 2009) the office acted mainly as a source of information/counseling for immigrants wishing or considering setting up a business in Portugal. Information provided included: information regarding formalities and legal aspects necessary to set up a business (the majority), information regarding financial support (2nd most important and with growing importance) and information on available technical and material support. It also takes a realistic stance that alerts immigrants to the risks involved in engaging in their own business activity, therefore acting to prevent subsequent unemployment and loss of income (as a result of having invested available savings or giving up previous jobs for example). At the same time it also acted as a referral service to other institutions that assist the general public (natives and immigrants) with the specificities of creating a business and obtaining funding – for example the Employment and Vocational Training Institute (IEFP) and the National Association for Right to Credit (that facilitates access to micro credit) or initiatives that exist at the local level.

During the course of its work, project officers realized that there was a need for a closer monitoring of the immigrants’ business projects that could not only accompany just the inception phase but also the first phase of the business activity (at least during the first 6 months). As a result a specific training project (designated Promotion of Immigrant Entrepreneurship - PEI) was put in place to train and assist groups of immigrants that wish to set up a business. At the same time the project also intends to act as a way of stimulating an entrepreneurial attitude amongst immigrants. The training, which consists of group classes and individual sessions (14 sessions per group), was initiated in the summer 2009 with three groups in three locations: Lisboa, Porto and Sintra (53 persons – 57% female). Four more groups will start in September (57 persons) in Lisboa, Beja, Portimão, Oeiras and three more in November in Lisboa, Amadora, Vila Franca (13 persons). A total of 123 persons will benefit from this project. The schedule of training was adjusted to the trainees’ needs. The course included one training manual regarding business constitution and working thematic files about: 1) Product/service; 2) Place; 3) Competition; 4) Clients; 5) Promotion; 6) Costs; 7) Sales; 8) Profit; 9) Evaluation of competencies.

To start the project local partnerships were developed with relevant organisations - local units (usually run by NGOs and other civil society organizations including immigrants’ associations) that promote the insertion of immigrants in the labor market and are part of the office.
responsible for the promotion of immigrants’ employability - that work closely with immigrants and a contest for business ideas was launched. A total of 131 persons applied with a business idea and a number with the most promising ideas were selected to take part in the course. Both the contest and the training project were widely advertised through local partners (limited information regarding routes to entrepreneurship has been referred as a barrier for immigrants to start businesses – see for example Ramsden 2008).

The office staff as well as local partners also benefited from training at the beginning of the training project (PEI) to further increase their ability to provide assistance to immigrants that wish to set up their own business. This course was developed in 4 sessions of 6 hours each and encompassed the following themes: 1) introduction to entrepreneurship; 2) visions about entrepreneurship (economic perspective; social perspective; idiosyncratic perspective; conjunctive perspective); 3) risk analysis to support decision making processes; 4) 3 analytical pillars (manager, business, family); 5) strategic analysis – key elements (place, competitive advantages, 5 Porter forces); 6) Counseling: orientation, scale and options; 7) Project Analysis; 8) Referral.

The line of reasoning behind the development of these two core elements of the project - provision of information/counseling and training - is that through solid and informed support immigrants will succeed in setting up viable businesses that will either constitute a route out of unemployment or respond to their socio-economic aspirations and thereby promoting upward mobility.

In different countries there are a number of initiatives to promote immigrant entrepreneurship through coaching and training (see for example Entrepreneurship, 2008: URL: http://ec.europa.eu/enterprise/entrepreneurship/support_measures /migrant/eme_study_en.pdf for a revision of good practices in this domain in 9 different European countries). These approaches have been effective as contributors to increase the capacity of service delivery to immigrants. These services are aimed at empowering immigrant entrepreneurs mainly by strengthening their human capital. There are a small number of services which also target the building up of social networks, provision of financial services or material assistance (through incubator services, for example). However, according to the authors of the above mentioned study, the emphasis of these services has been much more on the agency of the entrepreneur than on changing structural conditions.

The case referred here has, however, some distinctive aspects:
* Most approaches tend to have a regional or local focus, while the case under study is of national scope but decentralised, which enables immigrants in different parts of the country to have access to specific training on entrepreneurship.
* Other initiatives appear to put less effort in the creation of relevant partnerships to enable the success of immigrants’ business projects through awareness raising to the specific situation of this group.
* Having access to counseling and supervision during the first months of the business seems to be also an innovative approach to promote the success of the business venture.
* The integration of the office for the promotion of immigrant entrepreneurship with other services that provide assistance regarding labour market insertion of immigrants provides a wider dissemination of this option to immigrants (and not just to those who are specifically looking for information on entrepreneurship)
Questions for the contextual factors:

- What conditions have influenced the project?
- What factors improved the success of the project?
- What factor put a check on the success of the project?
- Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?

Contextual factors:

- Conditions that have influenced the project
  - Lack of human resources with specific competencies regarding the technical specificities of setting up a business created the need for developing a specific training activity that is conducted by an external firm with competencies in this area (which will also provide technical consultancy to the staff).
  - Recognition that just providing information was insufficient to meet immigrants’ needs. Specific training was necessary to effectively assist immigrants in setting up a business.

- Factors that improved success:
  - Development of partnerships at the local level with organisations that work with immigrants regarding their situation in the labour market.
  - Development of partnerships with relevant institutions – including the National Association for the Right to Credit to facilitate access to micro credit and the Employment and Vocational Training Institute (IEFP), that also attributes funding.
  - Partnerships with other organizations or individuals that are experienced managers or are training in this field, that might provide technical consultancy to support the business development and assure that the business will survive its starting point (for example accountancy firms that might include such work within their social responsibility strategy). A mentorship/coaching program was therefore launched following contacts with several business schools in Portugal and one association for the promotion of social responsibility (GRACE) and a site (www.empreendedorismoimigrante.com) was created with the objective of promoting matches between mentors and entrepreneurs – through this site interested mentors may find information about successful projects that have emerged from training and propose to assist the entrepreneur for around 10 hours during a period of 3-6 months. The objective of the project developers is that around 40 mentors will assist entrepreneurs with: strategy; daily management and problem resolution; networking and knowledge sharing; one of the prerequisites is that the mentor is located near the business it seeks to coach. PEI’s officers are responsible for putting potential mentors and entrepreneurs in contact following the interest demonstrated by the potential mentor. At present, there is one mentor already working with one of the entrepreneurs of the first training group.
  - Training provided to the office staff and to local partners that will make available the necessary competencies to better assist immigrants who wish to set up a business.

- Factors that limit success:
  - Bureaucracy in some institutions that make applications a difficult process for immigrants (for example, complex forms for funding applications – according to the staff interviewed this often prevents immigrants from proceeding with the application).
  - Regulations – Legal framework: some programmes/funding are not available for immigrants (for example some programmes developed by municipalities).
  - Some institutional practices, namely in terms of requirements for attributing loans – for example the need of a guarantor (many immigrants with low income are unable to provide
this); or the kind of visa required to access credit (only permanent residency, for example). The office is working to reduce these constraints through the production of documents that aim at informing and raising awareness to the specific situation of immigrants (also referring to the rights that assist immigrants regardless of their immigration status).

- Specificity of these barriers – both the conditions of access to credit, institutional barriers and regulations/legal framework are common obstacles to immigrants in different contexts (see for example Entrepreneurial Diversity in a Unified Europe: Ethnic Minority Entrepreneurship/Migrant Entrepreneurship, 2008: URL: http://ec.europa.eu/enterprise/entrepreneurship/support_measures/migrant/eme_study_en.pdf)

Questions for the results:

- What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?:
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
  - putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
  - the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
  - the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;
  - …..

- To what extent have these goals been achieved?

- To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?

- How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

- How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

- If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?

- Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct / indirect)?

- Are there any differences in results among different target groups?

- How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?

Results:

The initial goal of the office for the support of immigrant entrepreneurship was to provide specific information and support to immigrants who consider the possibility of setting up their own business. In terms of the number of persons that have contacted this service: 134 in 2007 (majority Brazilians followed by Ukrainians and slightly higher percentage of women), 133 new customers in 2008 (majority Brazilians, followed by Ukrainians and Angolans and a higher percentage of men) and 127 new customers until July 2009 (majority Brazilians, followed by Angolans and Ukrainians and also a number of holders of Portuguese nationality and a higher percentage of men) (the increase in contacts is mostly due to PEI). However, there is no data in terms of the outcomes of the information provided to immigrants that seek the help of the office for the support of immigrant entrepreneurship. This was recognised by the staff as a failure of their action, which results mainly from a lack of human resources to follow up the immigrants that contact the office. Nevertheless, some of them were contacted to take part in the training
project (those that had a more consolidated business project or with repeated contacts).

As for PEI (the training project), which was developed as a result of the work of the office, the expectation was to involve around 120 persons in the training and that around 25% of trainees will succeed in setting up their own business after the training is completed. The objective is to promote viable business ideas with good potential for success. This means that, in some cases, the initial idea might have to be substituted by a different one or the trainee will give up on the business (this might also be seen as a positive outcome of the training that has worked to prevent a business failure). However results will only be available at the end of the year when the training phase is completed and further results regarding the success of business implementation only the following year.

The first group was constituted by 53 immigrants with a slightly different profile from that of the immigrants that have sought the support of the office – the majority was female, 23% were from Brazil, 23% from Cape Verde and 13% Angolan (which denotes a higher adherence of Cape Verdeans, in particular, to the training in opposition to Ukrainians whom had sought the office in larger numbers). The training was successfully completed by 55% of the trainees (29), of which 55% females, 31% from Brazil, 14% from Angola and 14% from Cape-Verde. Thus, Brazilians were relatively more successful in the training, in comparison to Angolans and Cape-Verdeans. In terms of business constitution, 55% of these trainees (16) are in the process of setting up their own business. These include 56% of women, 44% Brazilians, 19% Cape-Verdeans and 13% Ukrainians. Businesses developed during this course were diversified: African hairdresser's; laundry/ironmongers; building/small repairs; renewable energies; electricity and telecommunications; training in languages and culture; carpentry; Brazilian bar; barbecue restaurant; jewelry shop (with room for training); development of control and security systems to monitor houses from a distance through automation and IT; Atelier of communication and talents management, personal image and competencies. Regarding funding, 44% obtained funding through the National Association for the Right to Credit (microcredit) and 31% through the Employment and Vocational Training Institute (IEFP).

Further evaluation results regarding training are not yet available.

Questions for important lessons:
- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)? What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?

Important lessons:
- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)? What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?
Success Factors – Contextual:
- Access to a network of local institutions that promote the integration of immigrants in the labor market to disseminate information. Some were included as partners in the project.
- Inclusion of the office in a one-stop shop with integrated responses to immigrants’ situations that both contribute to disseminate information and resolve problems more promptly (for example irregular immigrants can be easily directed to legal counseling in the same building).

Success Factors – Internal:
- Partnerships established with relevant institutions – at the local level with units that work towards the integration of immigrants in the labor market; with funding institutions such as the National Association for the Right to Credit (for the attribution of micro-credit) and the Employment and Vocational Training Institute (IEFP), that also attributes funding; with other organisations that might provide technical consultancy to support the business development and assure that the business will survive its starting point (for example accountancy firms that might include such work within their social responsibility strategy).
- Training provided to the staff by PEI

Fail Factors - Contextual:
- Legislation – some programmes and funding are not accessible for immigrants
- Institutional practices – for example: the need of a guarantor to obtain funding (many immigrants with low income are unable to provide this); or the kind of visa required to access credit (only permanent residency, for example); complex forms for funding applications.

Fail Factors – Internal:
- Lack of human resources (to follow up immigrants that seek the help of the office, for example)
- Insufficient training of human resources

Some lessons can be learnt from the development of this dual approach to the promotion of entrepreneurship (information/counseling service + specific training):
* Being a sole provider of information proved insufficient, closer monitoring and follow up is necessary as well as the development of specific training activities.
* Establishing partnerships with other institutions namely financial institutions that provide credit so that the specificities of immigrants’ situations are taken into account and requirements adjusted to this particular public are essential.
* Local partnerships with relevant organisations at the local level are also essential to a wider dissemination of information – decentralised approach of the project as opposed to the office that is located in Lisbon only.
* Staff needs to be involved in training activities to improve competencies and allow the continuation of more informed counseling and coaching beyond the funding time of the training project.

Bearing this in mind, this approach - based on specific training to raise competencies in one possible route to labour market integration, together with the development of relevant partnerships with other institutions that can facilitate the success of training - could be replicated to other domains of labour market integration and countries (however specific context dimensions will need to be taken into account). One of the project officers highlights precisely the importance of partnerships with local institutions to reach more vulnerable groups and establish relationships of trust and proximity with the target groups. Another critical factor for success that the project leader highlights is the emphasis on raising entrepreneurial competencies (which are transferable to other contexts and life situations) instead of focusing on the more technical aspects of the business plan constitution.
6. Overview literature (sources used)

* Interview at the Office for the support of immigrant entrepreneurship with 2 members of staff, including one project coordinator (20th August 2009)
In-depth case study Spain

**Background information**

Name of case study: Analog@s: Integration histories. Valencia, Autonomous Community of Spain.

Name country expert: Juan A. Cebrián, Madrid, Spain.
Questions for the problem definition:
- What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?
- What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?
- What is the scope of the problem?
- What supposedly caused this problem?
- Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?
- Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

Problem definition:

Case study identification:
- Project executive institution: CeiMigra – Centre for Studies on Immigrant Social Integration and Training.
- Type of institution: Foundation.
- Registration: Autonomous Community of Valencia, Spain.
- Name of project: Analogí@s: Integration histories.
- Project financed by “EQUAL” – a Community Initiative (CI) of the European Social Fund (ESF) of the European Union (EU).
- Duration: 3 years (2005-2007)

What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?

“Analogí@s” was a project designed under the EU Community Initiative EQUAL, which secured important funds to confront discrimination in the labour market in the Autonomous Region Autonomous Community of Valencia, in Spain. Those were the days when big influxes of immigrants were arriving to most regions in Spain, being always Valencia among the top four immigration areas. Immigrants became immediately an important part of the population of Valencia that were facing real insertion/integration problems in the labour market, joining other local vulnerable collectives as targets of antidiscrimination projects. Analogí@s became the main component of aiding in the labour insertion/integration of immigrants, women, ethnic minorities and disabled persons.

The EQUAL initiative allowed for the implementation and testing of a new work and intervention methodology in the social and labour insertion area of the municipal administration social services of the city of Valencia. Besides, eight other organizations in the Autonomous Community of Valencia entered the project, forming a Development Group (DG) named “Links”. All of these agencies provide direct client services. The EQUAL initiative is part of the integrated European employment strategy.

The newness of the Analogí@s project relies on four main components:
1. To build a distributed data base that provides instant access to the set of job offers times the set of job requests
2. To include “social clauses” in work contracts to commit the employers in the solution of the labour insertion problem
3. To get several agencies to work as a net
4. To establish a school of socio cultural and genders mediators

What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?

The project addresses both labour market situation and barriers.
Because of its principal motivation (do not forget that Analogí@s was designed as an EQUAL initiative project), the project places itself in total opposition against all forms of discrimination and inequality that arise in the labour market, especially those that are based on gender, race, ethnic origin, beliefs, or age. Equal opportunity in the job market is a fundamental concern. These statements are easily translatable into a barrier-centred discourse. When facing discrimination, the project team reacts looking for which barriers impede the desirable blend of people with different backgrounds into the workplace. Indeed, the project acknowledges the existence of several labour barriers in Valencia’s society, and ranks them by their consistency: national/ethnic barriers, gender barriers, barriers for the disabled, etc. Incidentally, it looks like the project was first geared to overcoming gender barriers, and changed thereafter to detour national/ethnic barriers, as they became much stronger since the year 2000.

The project is not oblivious of the labour market situation in Valencia, which can be extrapolated to the whole Spain: the stratification and precariousness of jobs. That is to say: they are very different layers in the labour market, and it is very hard to go through the borders that delineate them. Upward moving trajectories in the job market are seldom. Current immigrants in Spain enter the lower levels of the job market, and get stocked there most of the time. One of the goals of Analogí@s is precisely to fight that market response, by coaching immigrants, women, and disabled people to acquire better job-seeking strategies. Helping immigrants and the like can have a remarkable side effect: to take advantage, as much as possible, of their human capital, since many of them are taking jobs that are far below their qualifications.

Jobs are precarious: temporal contracts are plenty. Better scheduling and more information in the hands of the immigrants will help them to minimize the employment gaps. Analogí@s’ approach, in this case, is to keep track of the job itineraries of its clients, accompanying them for a longer period than the time that is necessary to get the first –normally, very vulnerable— job.

Included in the Project is a liaison to business executives, in order to attract them ever more closely to practices that are more in line with the principles of Corporate/Business Social Responsibility (RSC/RSE). This project intends to contact cooperating employers who will become socially active agents, by conducting campaigns and workshops, to sensitize not only business people and owners, but also human resources departments that are ultimately responsible for hiring.

Analogí@s was implemented and run before the current global economic crisis, that ravaged the employment levels and salaries in Spain (from 2008, on).

- What is the scope of the problem?

Although the problem affects the whole Spain, by definition, the problem has a limited scope that is regional: labour discrimination suffered by certain social groups in Valencia. The scope of the problem is further delimited by specifying those target groups –immigrants, women and disabled persons.

The project is a method to raise the hireability of a person belonging to one of the target groups. The method is that of the practice of social, intercultural and gender based mediation.

It is assumed that successful labour insertion/integration is a prerequisite of the socio cultural integration of migrants.
What supposedly caused this problem?

One of the reasons why socially vulnerable groups can be such is the difficulty in finding stable and quality employment, which is frequently caused by economic difficulties and the lack of specific training or work experience. These persons need extra help in order to find a normal socio-labour insertion. Women and disabled persons were among the typical vulnerable groups in terms of remunerated, stable and quality employment.

In the last decade, however, Spanish society is being subjected to profound changes due the arrival of people of other countries and cultures. The incorporation of these people takes place in all social environments, such as community, education, health and labour market. These changes at times cause undesired social situations and conflicts to which there must be an answer. Meanwhile, immigrants face difficulties and discrimination, everywhere, as a real vulnerable group. Compared to other vulnerable groups, immigrants are much more numerous and fast growing.

Immigrants, women and disabled persons need extra help in order to find a normal socio-labour insertion. That is all Analogi@s is about.

Besides dealing with job-seeking people, this project intends to contact cooperating employers. Several cooperative agreements were signed, in which businesses have shown a commitment to incorporate disadvantaged or socially marginalized workers on in their staff, especially those persons coming through the Labour Orientation Services of Analogi@s.

Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?

The authors of the project declare that there are three definite profiles of potential beneficiaries of the implementation of Analogi@s:

1. Unemployed persons at risk of exclusion, especially immigrants, women, and the disabled.
2. Social workers active in the area of social and labour insertion of disadvantaged groups, as well as the labour union representatives of the same group.

The project doesn’t exclude any disadvantaged collective: young people, disabled persons, women, and immigrants in danger of social and exclusion and marginalization. In practice, as the project progresses, immigrants and women in search of employment and unemployed are those to be most aided.

Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

It depends on how we define the target group. If every person who has a serious labour insertion/integration problem is considered a potential target of the project, then the problem is specific.

However, in practice, the project narrows down to help the most typical incoming requests from immigrants and women looking for a job.

Helping people to enter the labour market cannot ever be a specific goal, since there are always too many and too diverse kinds of people.
Questions for the approach:

- What approach has been used to address the problem?
- What are the core elements of the approach?
- What is the intensity and duration of the approach?
- How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?
- What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general (international literature, (policy) studies)?
- Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?
- What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?
- Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?

Approach:

- **What approach has been used to address the problem?**

Analogí@s is an Integrated Mediation Employment Program, involving institutional cooperation (local government, business networks, labour unions, and civil society organizations (CSO) to foster the socio-labour insertion of the most disadvantaged collectives. As defined, Analogí@s is an ambitious and pluralist employment program that is focused on social interaction, and in which strategies are developed along the lines of training and empowerment of social actors, especially women and immigrants from third countries.

- **What are the core elements of the approach?**

The project is organized along six lines or dimensions.

1. **Education**

   a) The school for socio cultural and gender mediators (regular courses and programs of continuing education and specialisation). Preparation for active participation in the programs of socio-labour insertion by means of:
   
   i. Participation as monitors in sessions of occupational training
   
   ii. Acting as monitors in job skills training of participants in labour insertion programs
   
   iii. Prospecting job offers from businesses in the areas where participants may be hired.
   
   iv. Overseeing active job searches by participants
   
   v. Mentoring program participants who find a job, to prevent job abandonment

   The School of Intercultural and Social Mediation of Valencia, which offers this education, is a public service offered and administered by CeiMigra (a Foundation in the Autonomous Community of Valencia)

   b) Point of encounter and continuous reflection. The mediation school will also be a place for setting up networks, thereby serving as a point of encounter and continuous reflection on new methodologies for resolving interpersonal conflicts, on dialogue between cultures and arriving at a culture of peace as an overarching goal. Instruments are: seminars, on-line forums, magazines, meetings by the different autonomous communities, etc.
2. Mediators network (with access to databases updated by the very practice of social mediation). The network offers an optimisation of already-existing resources and a broadening of the coverage of social work, which now includes individualised attention for unemployed program participants who access social services. The network takes advantage of state-of-the-art TIC products, referred as the Technical Employment Structure, to facilitate access to the Business and the Equal Opportunity Modules to all the mediators.

3. The business mediation department informs and motivates businesses to employ persons who belong to disadvantaged groups or groups at risk of social exclusion. This department unfolds itself into two main sections:
   a. The office for labour insertion. A continuous job offers and job requests management service.
   b. The office for Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) development, which publishes information on corporate social responsibility in many different formats and media. The office is trying to establish close relations with area entrepreneurs, visiting them at their headquarters, organizing short conferences in the Foundation’s premises, in order to define a practical program which will enhance awareness and greater involvement in CSR among the entrepreneurial class in the Autonomous Community of Valencia.

4. Women at work. The Project is testing proactive policies to place women in key posts, especially in those related to employment issues, to counteract any kind of discrimination by gender in the work place. The project has special training courses for women, a meeting and discussion point for women, a computer room fully equipped, and empowerment and leadership courses for women.

5. Adaptive professional training, so as to increase the possibility of finding work by the unemployed who lack specific professional training, or whose qualifications are insufficient or inadequate. Training will be offered primarily in the job sectors in greatest demand in Valencia’s labour market:
   i. Environmental sector
   ii. Restaurant and hotel sector
   iii. New Information Technology sector

6. The evaluation and research unit. Analogí@s includes a self-evaluation and monitoring module, that:
   - Elaborates and, eventually, publishes studies and reports on the development of the project.
   - Controls the level of satisfaction and impact for direct beneficiaries of the project.
   - Acts as the communication office of the project, keeping touch with the media, promoting the project, enhancing the visibility of the project among the population as a whole, etc.
What is the intensity and duration of the approach?

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ENTITY</th>
<th>5/05-9/05</th>
<th>10/05-3/06</th>
<th>4/06-9/06</th>
<th>10/06-5/07</th>
<th>Project Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Municipality of Valencia</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>179</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association for Professional Promotion and Insertion (APIP)</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socio labour Integration Network (RAIS)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>17*</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEIMIGRA Foundation</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel and Tourism School (EHT)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centre for International Rural Studies (CERAI)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>699</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

% TOTAL 22.0% 45.8% 19.3% 12.9% 100%

Analogi@s lasted three years. Table 1 gives us data relating the number of people involved in the project in four different moments, showing very clearly that the third and fourth periods show a significant decline in the percentages of participants incorporated into the project. This decline is not a coincidence, but a result of an agreement of the executive committee of Analogi@s to keep the number of people assisted under control. By March 2006, the original number of people to reach (500 people) was already surpassed. The decision was to put into effect an improvement for the beneficiaries of the project that emphasised quality over quantity.

The project offers a personalized itinerary to find a job, supervised by one of the mediators. In that sense the time it takes a person to find a job, or to get better qualified, varies from person to person. The mediator acts as a coach that makes use of the different resources of the project to help the client.

If necessary, the mediator advises the person to enrol in one of the different professional training courses provided by Analogi@s: environmental technologies, new technologies and restaurant and hotel work. Also, the candidate may attend a especial course (called lab) on employment. For instance, Analogi@s will contact entrepreneurs with specific job offers in an area (a city district; a rural area; an industrial and service park, etc.), bringing a selection of its clients, who manifested their interest in those job offers. The lab covers typically a weekend per month (from Friday at 4pm –till Sunday at 5pm) until job positions are all filled, or there are no more jobseekers left. A lab can be operational for six months or less. Those labs provide very specific training on the workplace and interaction among hiring people and potentially hired people.

How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?

Direct and personalised attention, and work done in conjunction with the participants, allows adapting the intervention to their real needs and gradually achieving a level of autonomy, self-esteem, and social/personal abilities that are necessary for further professional development. An exhaustive record on the integrated itinerary of socio labour insertion is kept for each participant.

More than 50 percent of the program participants have gone through one of the training courses for the unemployed in the hotel, specialized care of dependent people, the environmental and the information technology sectors. Once the training period has been completed, those graduating from the courses will be assisted in their incorporation into the job market: on the one hand they will be given the information necessary about the sector.
in which they have been trained: special reference addresses and information on job banks. Once they have gone through the process and achieved insertion into a job, a social mediator will do a follow-up (usually by telephone) in order to obtain information on the process and the difficulties encountered in the new job. That information will be very useful to counsel future graduated participants in the program.

Beyond helping clients to find a job, because of the project’s connection with the 11 Municipal Social Services Centres of the Municipality of Valencia, assistance is provided in finding housing, accessing the public health system, as well as counselling resources, and supplemental training courses or labour orientation.

The great uncertainty in the labour market doubtlessly affects immigrants. While providing services to participants, among them some suffered from depression, anxiety, nervousness and psycho-somatic and related disorders.

■ What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general?

The Analogí@s project has had highly successful results, inasmuch as it has greatly surpassed projected goals and the number of participants and assistance provided, as well as the number of jobs contracted by participants with the assistance from mediators of the network.

Six months before the end of the Project, 514 contracts were procured already, whereas the aimed figure was only 124 –the real efficiency was more than three times the predicted outcome.

■ Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?

Obviously, the approach belongs to “a family of projects” that relies on personal help to get unemployed people, mostly immigrants and/or women, into the labour market. Nonetheless, the approach combines different methods in a way that makes it somewhat original and successful.

More specifically, the methodology of integrated itineraries of socio labour insertion keeps track of all the steps of a person towards employment. Each person is taken care of by a social mediator who is knowledgeable in labour market issues. Mediators, normally, work in groups, sharing their expertise to help clients.

When the designers of Analogí@s talk about combining this methodology with other tools in the project they refer to the fact that complementary activities are managed by the same umbrella, for instance, the formation of mediators in their school, adaptive professional training for the clients of the project, the relationships between the foundation and private and public employers, the transfer of good practices to labour market stakeholders, etc.

■ What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?

The core of Analogí@s is an educational body: a school for social mediators. Socio cultural and gender mediators are the main actors, since they connect all the players involved. A successful school of mediators will make a very successful program.

Besides, the program gets together the metropolitan administration and the entrepreneurial resources within it to discuss a code of good practices—better practices—to rule the labour
market. Among them, in the first place are, hiring practices are reviewed.

Analogi@s is backed by a well established Foundation (CeiMigra).

The whole process is run as an experiment, since all the proposals are built and tested on a numerous collective of unemployed people.

- *Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?*

The approach did not change essentially for the period of concern. Continuous evaluation allowed for correction to small problems in the realisation of the project. However, the institutions involved –public and private— adjusted gradually some of their hiring protocols and human resources procedures.

The project included evaluation procedures which resulted in a series of recommendations for future implementations of the approach:

Most social mediators recommended reducing the amount of paper work that corresponds to the strict recording of integrated itineraries of socio labour insertion.

Changes in the program should be made if is meant to help extremely marginal people (old age, no education, no personal relations, etc.), or mono parental homes.

The expectations about the role of the entrepreneurial participation were far above reality. The amount and the quality of contracts coming from those firms were just average.

**Questions for the contextual factors:**
- What conditions have influenced the project?
- What factors improved the success of the project?
- What factor put a check on the success of the project?
- Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?

**Contextual factors:**

- *What conditions have influenced the project?*

The program was designed after the EQUAL Community Initiative. That makes it the principal contextual factor. As such, Analogi@s was established as a device to reduce discrimination of all kinds in the labour market in the Autonomous community of Valencia, Spain.

Thereafter, because of the large influxes of economic immigrants in Spain in the first decade of the 21st century, the population looking for jobs in Spain and in all its Autonomous Communities grew dramatically. Immigrants do not fare as well as nationals in the labour market. Soon, immigrants became the largest group assisted by Analogi@s. Thus the recent immigration in the whole Spain constitutes another principal contextual factor.

Although in a recession from 2008 on, previously, economy was booming in Spain, and Valencia was amongst the fastest growing Autonomous Regions. The job placing chapter of Analogi@s became well known among local entrepreneurs in need of man labour.
What factors improved the success of the project?

One of the factors that have influenced the success of the project is networking between public and private entities.

The application of IC technologies in the area of socio-labour integration: social and intercultural mediation and the social responsibilities of the business sector.

A team of domestic and international experts.

The welcoming attitude and active participation on the part of the social actors involved.

The participation of several hiring actors engaged in the project –local and regional firms found employees through Analogí@s.

The technical expertise of the team of professionals involved in the project.

More than 50% of the beneficiaries of the program attended at least one of the professional training courses that were openly advertised. That makes it the most common recruitment method for the project. Once a training course is over, the mediators will work individually with job seeking individuals, providing them information on specific job offers, on places to look for a job, teaching them how to apply for a job, how to write a curriculum vitae, etc.

What factor put a check on the success of the project?

There were no unforeseen setbacks that seriously impeded the progress and completion of the project. Honestly, I could not retrieve more information about this question, neither when interviewing the officials of the program, nor when reading carefully the large reports that they made accessible to me.

Not considered as a setback, but a weakness of the project itself: the final report list the disparities between the job offers and the professional profiles of some people in the project, regardless of the important formation chapter included in Analogí@s.

Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?

Whether a contextual factor or not, it is a fact that Analogí@s was designed as a very ambitious, comprehensive project, where unemployed people (immigrants, women, disabled people, etc.), social mediators, NGOs (The Foundation), private entrepreneurs, public agencies, the Municipality of Valencia, Valencia University, etc. met in order to facilitate the negotiations that take place in the labour market place.

Questions for the results:

What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?:

- high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
- retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
- putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
- the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
- the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;
- …..

To what extent have these goals been achieved?
- To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?
- How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct / indirect)?
- Are there any differences in results among different target groups?
- How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?

Results:

- **What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?**
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;

Analogi@s includes an important module on orientation, counselling, and job search, job training and employment workshops (there are 4 workshops that teach job searching skills. Other workshops are more specialized). There is also counselling and courses on self-employment.

Overall 699 migrants joined the project, of them 383 found employment, and another 12 are self-employed (see Tables 1 and 2).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total of the persons hired or contracted by May 2007</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Persons hired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1st Period</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd Period</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd Period</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4th Period</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>383</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL PARTICIPANTS**

699

Hiring rate: 56.5%

(more than half of the beneficiaries of the project have been hired)

- retention of third country migrant workers in employment;

Of the 514 contracts obtained, only 36 were permanent while the remaining 478 were temporary, which means that in this project, 92.4 percent of the immigrants obtained temporary contracts. The 2007 Yearbook of the Spanish Ministry of Labour publishes that 88.7% of the contracts signed by immigrants are temporary. Temporary work is also common among native-born workers, but not in such a high proportions. The Spanish National Employment Institute (INEM) published a study showing that on average 76 percent of the contracts in Spain are temporary contracts. The performance of Analogi@s is reasonable, since most of the contracts involved must be entering contracts.
Even if a job contract of three months, for example, cannot be considered real labour insertion it is a step towards insertion. There has been an open debate on this that has yet to be resolved. Therefore, it is preferable to speak of contracts rather than labour insertions.

Thanks to agreements signed with certain businesses, and as an aspect of CSR, follow-up of the participants inserted into a business is guaranteed, since the agreements entail the formation of a committee of representatives of businesses and social workers from Analogi@s that, besides selecting candidates for job offers, will also do the follow-up and mentoring during the process of insertion. The involvement of businesses and their linkage to this program guarantees a stable supply of job offers and for the project as well as it provides businesses with the opportunity to find possible candidates to fill future vacancies. This way, an active dynamic of cooperation and feedback is created.

- putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;

The project seeks to achieve this goal with its School for Intercultural and Gender Social Mediation, which has trained nearly 1,000 students over the last three years. Graduates of the school (40% immigrants and 70% women) are involved principally in labour insertion of program beneficiaries. In 2008, there were 40 students registered in “Intercultural Mediation in the socio-labour environment”. Among them there were 16 immigrants of quite varied provenance (Romanians, Moroccans, Africans, Colombians, Italians, and Argentines). From the point of view of intercultural issues, it was an enriching experience. According to the course catalogue of the School, the goals of the course are “to give methodological and theoretical tools to professionals in the area of immigrant labour intervention”. These tools are derived from a systematic knowledge of the realities of the job market.

- the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;

The project opposes all forms of discrimination and inequality in the labour market and, especially, those that are based on gender, race, ethnic origin, beliefs, or age. The project has as a fundamental concern that of promoting equal opportunities in the labour market. The gender distribution for the project is as follows: women: 71.5%, men: 28.5%. As for other vulnerable groups in the project: immigrants: 46%, unemployed over 45 years of age: 14.5%, youth without training: 12.5%, homeless: 8.3%, disabled: 3%, drug addicts: 1.4%.

A notable part of the project is the ‘Encounter for Women’. This entails activities that facilitate the socio-labour insertion of female participants through empowerment and mentoring. This service has become a reference point to many women who participated in it. Women sent by municipal social services and other entities cooperate with the social workers assigned by the project in their itineraries. Currently, local government shares the funding of the initiative.

- To what extent have these goals been achieved?
- To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?
- How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative
compared to the total number of participants)?

- Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct / indirect)?
- Are there any differences in results among different target groups?
- How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?

**Table 3**

**Level of accomplishment of the Project**

Number of contracts predicted and achieved, by entities, as of May 2007

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Entities</th>
<th>TARGET</th>
<th>RESULT</th>
<th>Level of Project success by number of contracts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Municipality of Valencia</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>374</td>
<td>498%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association for Professional Promotion and Insertion (APIP)</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>520%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centre for International Rural Studies (CERAI)</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>650%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel and Tourism School (EHT)</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>68.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socio labour Integration Network (RAIS)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>270%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>124</strong></td>
<td><strong>514</strong></td>
<td><strong>361%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Until 31 May 2007

In general, as can be seen in Table, above, all of the entities participating in the project, with the exception of CERAI and the Hotel and Tourism School, are achieving more than 50% of the objectives assigned by the Analogí@s with respect to contracts obtained; the total percentage of achievement for May 2007 was 361%, thereby surpassing by more than 3 times the expected goals for the Project.

If we classify the total number of contracts obtained by gender we arrive at the following marks: 500 **women (72%)** and 199 men (28%). Otherwise, if we look at whether the hired person is an immigrant or not, the numbers are: 377 nationals (54%) and 322 **immigrants (46%).** See above (the provision of equal rights and opportunities...)

**Questions for important lessons:**

- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)? What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?
Important lessons:

We summarize at the beginning of this section on Important Lessons the results of a **SWOT (Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, Threats) analysis** performed at the end of the project by one of the nine collaborating entities: The University of Valencia. It represented an important chapter within the internal evaluation required by the funding agencies.

Only statements that are closer to lessons learned are reproduced

a) **Within the strengths** of the project, the most valued characteristic was the participation level reached in most decisions, at all levels: **networking**. Very highly ranked was the implicit challenge to have available better social workers and mediators in labour insertion/integration. The School of Mediators established by CeiMigra helped a lot providing well trained mediators, and benefited from the situation by having to update and enlarge its curricula. A third strength of the project was underlined: Having the public sector involved in it (the Municipality of Valencia), it was easier to transfer a set of good practices discovered in the project to public institutions, giving continuity to effective practices. For instance, from now on, the **social services of the Municipality of Valencia have labour insertion/integration offices**.

b) **Weaknesses**: Shortage of job offers as compared to the number of beneficiaries, and a tight financial budget to support the insertion needs. To overcome these weaknesses it was recommended to strengthen and widen the links to the entrepreneurial fabric in the region.

c) **Opportunities**: After accomplishing the take-off of this project, it should be possible to establish relationships with similar initiatives in other Spanish and European regions, in order to exchange expertise in the labour insertion/integration field. Having the Municipality of Valencia in the Development Group increased public awareness of the problems faced by the targeted groups of this project, which eventually can result in the funding of stronger municipal programs.

Keeping updated records of **Integrated Insertion Itineraries** takes a lot of time and energy. But it gives the social mediators the confidence of a systematic, planned and operative work. At CeiMigra School of Mediators, they are experimenting new synthetic ways to record itineraries. If they are successful, this widespread methodology will be greatly enhanced.

Opinion, however, is divided among the participants with respect to the direct contribution of **job training** to labour insertion. Immigrants enter the labour market at the very bottom, where qualifications are not required. Indirectly, though, the professional training that offers Analogí@s could be very useful to move upward, later in life.

The efficiency of the working network has been recognized by authorities of the Welfare Board of the Municipality of Valencia. **From now on Labour Orientation is an option in all the Municipal Social Services**, as part of their social intervention.

For a project of these characteristics, that is oriented towards a population that is usually isolated from traditional media sources, the effort to break through these barriers and bring offers and mechanisms closer to the beneficiaries (persons at risk of social and labour exclusion) constitutes one of the most significant points in the methodology fostered by the designers.
Good Practices

Good practices are those that are demonstrated to be efficient and effective in achieving the planned objectives of insertion, and that are therefore taken up by other social entities, public employment policies, and by public institutions that are involved in the socio-labour insertion of disadvantaged groups.

In Project Analogi@s, there are certain services, tools and resources that were much more effective than expected. Overall, the results were so favourable so as to continue putting into practice these techniques and resources.

The project made use of the internet, by creating a database containing personal information of the beneficiaries, which the social workers could use to undertake a follow up of the job search process, and to provide updated data to the entire network of mediators. The Council of Valencia has shown its interest in continuing to use this database in the 11 Municipal Social Services Centres.

Within the project, the Municipality of Valencia was the only public administration entity. It is very important that the practices developed in Analogi@s could reach the public administration soon, since the public administration is one of the largest job-contracting actors and can influence the behaviour of the business sector.

Conclusions

Training in intercultural mediation has now reached many professionals who work in social entities, thereby changing their way of intervention seeing the world. The intercultural mediation training has multiple effects because the professionals put into practice what they have learned and transmit it to project participants as well as to their co-workers.

Immigrants, even while they may be highly trained, need professional development in order to adapt to the Spanish job market. The integration of these persons into the Spanish labour market is easier, if they can take courses in which they receive complementary modules on Rights and Responsibilities of Workers, or a module specifically on job searching.

The unsuccessful negotiations with area firms for longer and lasting jobs has been one of the most notable weaknesses of the project.

The use of the internet database, a virtual platform of information with access restricted to social workers in the network, has eased and modernized the intervention processes, and is one of the most important innovations of the project.

Finally, the mediators; most of them had to recycle themselves, to learn how to work with foreign people, to confront kinds of discrimination to which they have never been exposed.
6. Overview literature (sources used).

1. Notes from the conversations with Rafael Benítez (CeiMigra Foundation).
2. Notes from the conversations with Marita Macías (CeiMigra Foundation).
3. “A transnational approach to intercultural mediation”. France, Italy and Spain.
5. Analogí@s, Project Summary.
6. Analogí@s, The Report (includes a section on Transferability and a Manual on Good Practices Learned by Doing).
7. Analogí@s, The final version.
8. Guía Básica para la gestión sostenible de la PYME agroalimentaria de la C.V. (by Project Analogí@s by the International Centre for Rural and Agricultural Studies – CERAI, an agency specialized in environmental issues and job training in rural areas).
10. Integración social y ciudadanía corporativa. (the publication provides best practices regarding RSE and the Social Clauses that have been developed by Analogí@s, in addition to providing issues for discussion on the role of business as a social actor and an important part of arriving at the social justice demanded by all social actors. One aspect to be kept in mind is the removal of discriminatory personnel selection methods, which were based in prejudices and negative stereotypes rather than estimates of the actual capacities of job applicants.
11. Internal evaluation, by Valencia University.
12. “Social responsibility and Socio labour insertion”.
13. “Stories of affection and kindness, stories of inequality and discrimination: immigrant women in domestic service speak.” (This publication attempts to give a voice to these women and provide a means of communication by converting the object of the study into a protagonist and participant in it. It also puts into context the immigrant phenomenon with domestic service, including the course the sector has taken over recent decades, while also noting the legal situation of the sector and of the women involved, so that we can have a global view of the issue as a whole.)
In-depth case study Sweden

Background information
Name case study: IKEA, Sweden
Name country expert: Ali B. Najib
Questions for the problem definition:

- What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?
- What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?
- What is the scope of the problem?
- What supposedly caused this problem?
- Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?
- Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

Problem definition:

Cause for starting up the project
IKEA seems to have adopted diversity management policies in its workplace for a number of causes, including ethic, regulatory and economic reasons.

IKEA began to look at diversity in the mid-1990s, due to the introduction of equality legislation in Sweden. The legislation stipulated that every company with more than 10 employees had to produce an equal opportunities plan. Company representatives stress that ethical reasons were the primary drivers for adopting equity and diversity practices. The company took action because it was the right thing to do.

Another factor that has driven the development of diversity management at IKEA was its international engagement. For instance, in USA and Canada where they had a strong tradition of diversity and equal opportunities and this influenced IKEA. In North America they have come a long way when it comes to gender diversity, ethnic diversity and so on. So IKEA learned a lot and gained a lot from this part of the world.

Sofi, himself an immigrant, argues that, since IKEA is a large company with many immigrants among its coworkers (workforce), it has after all a social responsibility, namely helping the integration process of the immigrant population. Therefore, the company started to pay special attention to developments at all local areas where various IKEA stores were operating. In fact, IKEA saw that not only the demographic situation of local communities in Sweden was changing, but also its potential customers. The managers were interested in what implications it could have for the company – new customers, new personnel, and the most important of all if there is a need for IKEA’s product; and if IKEA wants to maintain its dominant market position, it could not just ignore these demographic changes. Hence, already the mid-1990s, the company decided that the ‘ethnic’ part of the society was an interesting market to work in, growing fast, with higher incomes than among the first generation immigrants.

IKEA wanted to achieve a positive image in terms of equity, diversity and inclusion and believed that commitment to these issues is essential for IKEA to be viewed as a modern, progressive and well managed company.

Diversity at IKEA can be summarized by the following statements: “We see the diversity issue as a matter of creating a more challenging business atmosphere and of course expanding the recruitment base - including everyone and not just Swedish men. It also gives us a diverse workforce with a lot of positive business possibilities” (Kling & Goteman, 2003). Another study states that IKEA understands diversity management in the following way (Fajtová, 2007): “Diversity at IKEA is when people from different backgrounds feel comfortable and confident, when they can apply their perspectives and approaches at work and when they are included at all levels and functions in the organization.”
Problem

It seems that there is some resistance concerning DM at IKEA/Uppsala. In apart, resistance was felt to be an issue perhaps because of either increased workload or because of perceptions that existing employees would be discriminated against (though prejudice may also be an issue). In order to reduce the possibility and impact of any resistance, some measures may be taken such as running awareness programmes for concerned staff, providing training for management in diversity related skills and attitudes and ensuring that new employees are treated on the same basis as older employees.

Target group

Although IKEA representatives argue that the diversity management programme was partly developed as an instrument for integration of immigrants into the labour market. It is clear (from both interviews and company documents) that IKEA’s diversity programme does not primarily aim at these groups but rather at organisational structures of the company. Hence, working with any specific target groups was not a focused at IKEA’s DM.

Questions for the approach:

- What approach has been used to address the problem?
- What are the core elements of the approach?
- What is the intensity and duration of the approach?
- How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?
- What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general (international literature, (policy) studies)?
- Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?
- What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?
- Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?

Approach:

Approach (core elements, line reasoning)

In recent years, Sweden has issued important legislation aimed at guaranteeing equal opportunities and treatment in employment. Swedish laws have covered direct and indirect discrimination on the grounds of race, ethnic origin, religion, belief, disability, age and sexual orientation. Such anti-discrimination laws have acted as catalysts for deeper and wider legislative initiatives in the field of equal opportunities. Against this backdrop, 2007 has been chosen as the year of ‘Equal Opportunities for all citizens’, with a special key action dedicated to raising awareness about the business benefits of diversity in the workforce. These activities have encouraged many private companies initiate and start diversity employment programmes.

Thus, diversity in today’s societies is increasingly reflected inside the workplace, with more companies realising the direct and indirect benefits that come with a wider variety of thoughts, ideas, backgrounds and beliefs. In this context, the development of initiatives to recruit, develop and leverage the potential of diverse workforces is regarded by IKEA, like many other Swedish organisations, as a way of gaining a competitive advantage in the marketplace.

Furthermore, diversity policies also have an important external component. As IKEA competes for new niche markets and pools of more informed and demanding customers, the capacity to understand and internally mirror the diversity of its current and potential customers is regarded as a key factor in business success. Such practices have probably fostered higher levels of creativity and innovation, as well as a greater balance of skills and competencies among staff.
Moreover, these policies may ultimately translate into the development of new products and services, hence contributing to employment creation and business growth within the company.

For IKEA, diversity could range from advertising and interviewing in various languages, giving fair opportunity in terms of being invited for an interview and be recruited, promotion within the company and opportunities to retain in employment because of an equal treatment. According to Eva Lorge, personnel chef at IKEA/Uppsala, diversity at IKEA could also mean respect for coworkers, for the community and for individuals, which are seen as crucial not only for business success but also for harmony in such a diverse workplace. (see, also citations under section 2 above)

**Effectiveness of the approach in general (literature on diversity management)**

Critics of the concept of diversity maintain that: one of the big problems with diversity is that it is caught in double bind when it comes to defining what it really means. Accordingly, diversity is simply a politically correct way of speaking of issues concerning women, ethnic minorities as well as other disadvantaged groups; in other words, diversity is taken to be ‘all inclusive’, encompassing all employees regardless of gender, race, ethnicity and so on, in which case no difference is made between, for instance, immigrants and women. Furthermore, there are no concrete measurement methods to show whether up set goals are achieved or not. In addition, rarely are the drawn goals for diversity clear so that they can be measured or effectively evaluated.

Generally speaking, the concept of diversity has three broad themes: a) demographic diversity – this embraces such criteria as population characteristics as age, cultural or ethnic origins, socio-economic status, gender, ability and sexual orientation; b) informational diversity – this covers such issues as educational background, international experience, professional experience, industry experience and so on; and c) values diversity – this includes such concepts as life-style choices, motivation, personal values, and work-style preferences.

**Distinguishing elements of the approach**

Fundamental elements that underpin IKEA’s diversity management practice are zero tolerance of harassment in any form and full compliance with legislation in the country of business operation.

Another important aspect of IKEA’s diversity policy is that it is not based on setting targets for specific groups in the workforce, as this approach runs the risk of missing out on essential learning. Rather, IKEA takes the approach of enhancing business effectiveness through broadening competence and deepening customer insight in the decision-making process. Diversity management also have to take in consideration the legal side, the equal opportunities, the human rights side, the legislation and so on. The company has to balance between pure business or economic issues and moral (equity) or legislative aspects.

In recent years, diversity is given serious attention in all IKEA’s business plans. Specifically, focus is on reflecting the diversity of IKEA’s customers and coworkers. Key actions include the assessment of the current sales situation and the market potential and the consequent creation of market-specific plans. IKEA has also committed to targeting immigrant customer groups in their marketing efforts as well as in the sales organisation. For example, if IKEA could increase sales to these ethnic groups in Sweden more furniture would be sold per year.

**Alterations of the approach**

The business case for diversity offers opportunity for a company or organisation, but only when managed properly that it can result in increased productivity and profit. See also above, section 2.
Questions for the contextual factors:

- What conditions have influenced the project?
- What factors improved the success of the project?
- What factor put a check on the success of the project?
- Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?

Contextual factors:

Contextual factors that improved success

This case shows that diversity in workforce has opened the gates of IKEA, and probably of other large Swedish companies, but only to certain level. There are signs that, for instance, in IKEA this awareness is growing fast and has created job opportunities for immigrant groups. However, diversity management can only bring as much success or social justice as IKEA and other Swedish companies will allow.

Impeding factors

According to Sofi, IKEA characterises itself as still being in the early stages of implementing diversity practice. One of the key steps taken by the organisation was the implementation of a diversity directive, i.e. a policy document setting out IKEA’s definition of diversity, responsibilities for managing and working with diversity, and a plan of action. The activities specified in this policy are audited. Additionally, in 2005, IKEA started an accelerated diversity management initiative, which marked a more focused diversity strategy for the company. IKEA has a global diversity team led by the head of human resources and comprises the line managers of the different functions in the company. In the beginning the team met three to four times a year, but now they meet more often to oversee the operation of diversity policy and practice. This indicates an increased commitment to the company diversity policy.

Questions for the results:

- What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?:
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
  - putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
  - the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
  - the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;
  - ...
- To what extent have these goals been achieved?
- To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?
- How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct / indirect)?
- Are there any differences in results among different target groups?
- How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?
Results:

(Labour market) goals
Apart from writing that the company’s employees should mirror its customers, IKEA does not explicitly speak of any clear labour goals. Even if the company representatives sometimes mention that their diversity programme is intended to reduce unemployment or facilitate integration process of non-EU nationals or any other social group, there are no external studies that show any closer relation between labour market goals and IKEA’s diversity programme.

Achievement of goals
For diversity programmes to succeed, for instance at IKEA/Uppsala, the company needs to overcome an overriding obstacle to achieve its goal, e.g. IKEA says their employees should mirror the company’s local customers. However, nothing is said about in what way or to what extent should such a goal be measured. Even if the proportion of non-Europeans account to 16 percent of IKEA’s coworkers on the national level, the fact remains that the corresponding figure for IKEA/Uppsala (8%) is far below the proportion of immigrant population in Uppsala (15%).

One reason could be that the company faces opposition in the workplace in terms of discriminatory attitudes and behaviours as a challenge in promoting diversity in the company. However, Eva Lorge, denies that there are any such problems at IKEA/Uppsala. A fact that supports what Eva Lorge says is that IKEA has currently a very low personnel turnover; it seems that once people enter IKEA they stay with the company. This could also have an indirect negative impact on the recruitment of new immigrant, since most of those who are already with IKEA are ethnic Swedes. On the other hand, the proportion of immigrants among IKEA’s administrative managers in the same store is significantly higher (10.5%), probably higher than in any other store in Sweden, which is positive.

Another positive aspect is that apart from Swedish and English, twenty-six other languages are spoken at the IKEA/Uppsala store. Twenty-one of them are non-EU nationals. These coworkers can be seen at the store having special badges on their chests with their national flags, indicating which language they speak, apart from Swedish.

Figures (e.g. number of migrants employment)
Today, IKEA employs over 100,000 people around the world. By the end of 2008, the company employed about 6000 people in Sweden, of which 1000 (or 16%) were of immigrant background.

In Uppsala, IKEA employs currently (September 2009) over 400 people and 34 (8.5%) of them are either immigrants themselves or children of immigrants; approximately 10.5 percent of the middle managers at the Uppsala store are of immigrant background.

Questions for important lessons:
- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)? What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?
Important lessons:

Success factors
A number of positive outcomes are evident as a result of implementing diversity management. More men and women of immigrant background have been recruited and some of them have been appointed to mid-level positions in the company as a result of focused activities related to focus on ethnicity in the company. Diversity has been integrated with HRM and aligned closely with the business plan, especially by the marketing department, a feature that is regarded as a real success factor. Moreover, employee surveys in the company demonstrate that most employees are aware that both the company and their immediate working group are working to improve diversity practice. IKEA has got recognition for its diversity engagement, among others by an Award from the Municipality of Uppsala.

Fail factors
IKEA has encountered a number of difficulties in implementing its diversity management programme. For example, the HR function within an organisation acts, sometimes, as a potential barrier to the effective implementation of diversity management. Working solely through HR can result in inaction, because diversity is also an issue for line management and not for HR alone. Perhaps the biggest challenge facing workplace diversity is the difficulty of dissemination of information and awareness of diversity issues and practices to all concerned parts in the organisation. The main source of information on workplace diversity for IKEA is employers’ organisations and networks. They are therefore likely to continue to play a key role in the dissemination of IKEA’s materials and in the wider adoption of diversity of diversity and equality policies and practices.

Lessons to be learnt
A number of lessons were learned through IKEA’s experience of working with diversity. Potential pitfalls include the need to avoid ethnic or group polarisation and the underestimation of the power of legislation. In addition, implementing effective diversity management may call for changing power structures in an organisation and this issue needs to be explicitly addressed if success is to be achieved. Other important lessons concern is the need to have top-level support and involvement in the implementation and continued use of the diversity programme. Niklas Sofi highlighted this, when he explained the important role that the commitment to diversity management by leaders at all management levels played in the acceptance of the programme in the company. He felt that top management had incorporated diversity management into their day-to-day practice, for instance, during their meetings with colleagues and when looking for international people for their new recruits, and pushing HR to increase their awareness of diversity. They do not just talk about the job description but also emphasise the importance of the diversity of the candidates to be presented.

Transferability of the approach
The main lesson we can learn from the IKEA case is that it is the specific objective of managing diversity that decides its impact on employees. The customer or marketing-oriented objective reinforced a kind of ‘glass ceiling’ for immigrants as employees in the company. The condition that employees should mirror the customers can mean that in areas with no immigrant population there will be no immigrant employees at IKEA. An interesting question would be what kind of impact diversity management might have on employees if its objectives are genuinely business.

As for transfer of the approach, diversity practices have been ongoing in various IKEA stores across the world. The approach has been transferred easily between these stores, learned and implemented without any major difficulties. However, the approach must be readily adjusted to its local context.
Bear in mind
One important critic of diversity management within IKEA concerns an emphasis on diversity as good for business risks displacing the moral imperative for equal opportunity for all and the need for labour market integration measures or employment equity programmes in support of this critical objective. Hence, in the absence of a strong law pressure to implement more firm diversity practices, there is a big risk of making a business case of the approach rather than for increased workplace diversity.

Thus, anti-discrimination measures are an essential complement to diversity, especially as a diversity approach is not incompatible with taking strong action on discrimination. Particularly, when experience suggests that diversity management operates best in the context of strong anti-discrimination law, and within diversity management policies themselves there must be anti-discrimination elements (Ashgate and Wrench, 2007). In other words, diversity management should be seen as a way of mainstreaming anti-discrimination attitudes and not a substitute for them. But although there remains much to be done in the implementation of diversity at IKEA, there is a growth in the degree of diversity consciousness within the company.

Finally, at a time when IKEA and many other Swedish companies are competing within increasingly difficult global economic markets diversity is not any more prioritised. However, the business case for equity and diversity at workforce is becoming more important than ever, because it has a strong resonance for companies as they compete in turbulent world.

6. Overview literature (sources used)

Data on which this case is based are obtained from consultation of company documents and literature review as well as on telephone reviews. Niklas Sofi (responsible for IKEA’s HRM at HQ, Älmhult) and Eva Lorge (personnel chef at IKEA/Uppsala) were telephone interviewed and provided vital information on diversity management practice at IKEA.

References used:
- IKEA. 2006. why work at IKEA?, Vol. 2007: Inter IKEA Systems B.V.
In-depth case study Switzerland

**Background information**

Name case study: Qualification+
Name country expert: Laure Kaeser, Sandro Cattacin
Questions for the problem definition:

- What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?
- What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?
- What is the scope of the problem?
- What supposedly caused this problem?
- Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?
- Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

Problem definition:

* The inclusion of article 41 within the federal law on professional training and development (LFPr) reflected the wish of the Swiss government to open up access to training and qualifications to adults who, although they have a high degree of experience in a particular profession, are formally unqualified or under qualified because they have never obtained a qualification certifying their level of competence. At the same time, the independent body charged with evaluating public policy in the Canton of Geneva concluded that little was being done to assist persons with a low level of formal qualifications living in the canton to find work. In order both to remedy this lack and to put article 41 of the LFPr into operation, the Office of Careers Advice and Professional Training & Development (later to become the Office for Careers Advice, Professional Training & Development and Continuing Education or OFPC) set up a pilot project in 1999 called Qualification 41. In line with current practice in other European countries, the project was centered on the principles of competence assessment and the recognition of prior experience.

* It is certainly the case that those who have no formal qualification certifying their professional competences encounter significant difficulties with promotion and career progression, salary levels and job security. These problems, which are common to the greater part of Europe’s national labour markets, are indicative of the emphasis placed by employers on formal certification, in other words the possession of a recognized qualification that ‘matches’ professional experience. Employers appear to believe that different levels of formal qualification should correspond with different levels of salary and professional responsibility. In the absence of an appropriate formal qualification, requests for salary increases or promotion may be seen as less legitimate. Within labour markets that place ever-increasing demands on employees, possession of some kind of formal, competence-validating qualification is frequently the key to improved opportunities for access to employment or to increased security in an existing post. What is more, labour market slowdowns in Switzerland — such as that we are currently experiencing — have a greater effect on less-qualified workers who are as a consequence more likely to lose their jobs. A study carried out by the Swiss Federal Statistical Office (OFS) and published in December 2008 shows that the level of formal training is a more important factor in labour market outcomes than professional experience. With respect to the general situation in Switzerland, a series of studies have also shown that although there has been a significant change in the level of qualification, with a general increase in the number of people holding high-level qualifications (2008, active population, percentage of persons holding high level qualifications regarding the origin: Swiss = 21.9%; non-Swiss with foreign education = 30.4%), a large and disproportionately non-Swiss section of the population has only low-level or no qualifications (2008, active population, percentage of persons having low-level or no qualifications regarding the origin: Swiss = 8.2%; non-Swiss = 29.1%).
Questions for the approach:

- What approach has been used to address the problem?
- What are the core elements of the approach?
- What is the intensity and duration of the approach?
- How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?
- What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general (international literature, (policy) studies)?
- Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?
- What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?
- Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?

Approach:

The response of the Canton of Geneva to the mismatch between the demand for highly qualified labour in Switzerland and a local labour characterised by a significant proportion of poorly-qualified job-seekers had historically been rather incoherent. While a plethora of training courses was on offer, they were difficult to access and, perhaps more significantly, did not lead to a recognised qualification. *Qualification 41* – introduced in 1999 and renamed *Qualification+* in 2003 – was intended to address these failings by targeting adults possessing significant professional experience by only low-level or no qualifications. The programme aims to help these individuals achieve the Federal Vocational Education and Training Diploma.

It is clear from the statistics cited above that migrant workers will be covered by the programme. The Swiss labour market is oriented principally towards the service sector. As such it not only generates jobs for highly-qualified workers, but also demands a significant amount of low-skilled labour — to work in personal services, catering, domestic work, janitorial services, public transport, construction and so on. Given the increase in the proportion of the Swiss workforce holding higher-level qualifications, meeting labour market demand unavoidably involves the resort to immigrant workers without formal qualifications. As a consequence, this population of workers falls within the remit of the *Qualification+* programme. Among other functions, the programme enables workers to achieve qualifications relevant to the construction and domestic economy sectors. We should note here that highly-qualified migrants do not fall within the remit of *Qualification+*, the recognition of academic qualifications and professional experience being principally the task of the higher education system.

In order to facilitate the recognition of the professional experience of workers with low levels of formal qualifications, the Office for Careers Advice, Professional Training & Development and Continuing Education of the Canton of Geneva put into place a system with a single point of entry for all workers seeking recognition of their experience. The system allows candidates to be directed towards a training programme leading to an appropriate VET Diploma. Before this
system was in place, the only possibility for candidates was either to sit every possible VET Diploma examination or to try to find a training course that did not lead to a qualification from among the few ill-assorted such courses that existed, for example courses in the French language. Skills and competences acquired ‘on the job’ were simply unrecognized. The first stage in resolving this problem was the LFPr, which permitted the development of a system for the recognition of prior experience with a view to promoting greater take-up of training opportunities and providing targeted groups with formal qualifications. In the Canton of Geneva, Qualification+ is one of the means by which the law is being put into practice.

The Qualification+ programme operates as follows. The candidate’s professional competence is evaluated, following which he or she is granted a certificate of qualification at the appropriate level and in the appropriate area. This certificate is the equivalent of one or more of the modules that go to make up the VET Diploma and the candidate is thus given exemption from the associated examinations. The candidate is then required to sit examinations in those areas in which his or her experience is insufficient to be recognized as equivalent to a qualification, having followed an appropriate training programme if necessary.

There are five central elements to the Qualification+ programme:
- Develop continuing education and training leading to recognized qualifications
- Establish a partnership with business enterprises in order to create training programmes and qualifications recognized in the private sector.
- Make efforts to improve the quality of training, including the validation of standards
- Develop cross-border projects, in particular in the context of the ‘Projet d’agglomération Franco-Valdo-Genevois’
- Facilitate access to employment and job security, but also job mobility

In Geneva at present there are four ways to have professional experience recognized:
- Obtain a VET Diploma on the basis of professional experience
- Obtain one or more of the modules that go to make up the Federal Certificate in Adult Education & Training
- Obtain a Cantonal Certificate of Qualification in a particular professional area
- Obtain a Cantonal Certificate of Qualification in a key competence area

Qualification+ provides candidates with advice and guidance throughout the recognition process. All candidates follow the same programme, which may take up to a year to complete. The stages of the programme are as follows:
- Phase 1: ‘Welcome, introduction and counseling’ by a Qualification+ advisor. This involves an individual interview and the creation of a case file.
- Phase 2: ‘Assessment’ by the Geneva Assessment Centre (CEBIG). The Centre deals with each candidate individually, helping them to identify, assess and document their personal and professional competences and to put together an ‘evidence file’ (dossier de preuves).
- Phase 3: ‘Evaluation’ by two experts. The experts examine the evidence file and carry out a ‘verification interview’ with the candidate, who is also required to undertake certain practical tests. The experts then write an evaluation report.
- Phase 4a: ‘Recognition Decision’ by the Committee for the Recognition of Prior Experience. This decision is based on the candidate’s file, the evaluation report, the requirements of the professional area in question and any supplementary training requirements that have been recommended.
- Phase 4b: ‘Certification’ by the Examinations and Certification Service. The Service checks that the required documentation is in order (certificate of equivalence of existing qualifications, certificate of acquired competences, examination protocol) before issuing the diploma.
With its single point of entry system, the Qualification+ programme provides advice and guidance to those who wish to have their professional experience formally recognized. In this way, the programme is responding to the demand for institutional recognition from job-seekers wishing to enter or secure their place within an increasingly demanding labour market. Qualification+ thus follows the logic of professionalization and of the recognition of professional competences. The programme integrates the different stages of the process into a single system taking candidates from initial advice all the way to the award of a formal qualification. Qualification+ is free of charge for the candidates and is financed by the Canton of Geneva.

The approach adopted in Geneva has also been used in other European countries. The European Inventory on Validation: 2007 Update provides an inventory of validation practices in use in Europe. Each country report reflects developments in policies and systems for the recognition of formal and informal learning since 2005, although Switzerland is not among the countries covered. The 2007 report is an update of a 2005 document entitled: "European Inventory on validation of non-formal and informal learning: a final report to DG Education & Culture of the European Commission". This report stresses the diversity of practices in Europe in the domain of skills recognition. It finds that the effectiveness of different practices – defined as their contribution to the progressive integration of formal education and informal out-of-school training – depends on the degree to which the following conditions are fulfilled:

- Presence of modular training systems
- Independent examiner system
- Harmonisation of standards
- Coherent system of skills recognition
- Recognition of formal and non-formal learning present on the political agenda
- Maintenance of high standards of transparency
- Widespread information
- Communication between academia, the private sector and non-government organisations
- Partnership with businesses operating in those sectors in which demand for labour is high

With Qualification+, the Canton of Geneva is still in the early stages of reforming its skills recognition system. However, other European countries have experience with similar types of system and have obtained convincing results. In France, for example, the confidence of the different stakeholders (enterprises, training organisations) in the concept of skills recognition has gradually increased. The introduction of a system of recognition of prior experience has been relatively successful and is seen as a ‘second chance’ for applicants. Demand for progression towards a higher level of qualification has increased. Between 2002 and 2005, 50’000 people were able to obtain qualifications via the French skills recognition system (known in French as VAE – validation des acquis de l’expérience). The VAE system is modular and hence it is not necessary to complete an entire programme before receiving a qualification. Applicants can obtain specific modules that are recognised in the labour market without needing to ‘go all the way’ to achieving a Vocational Certificate of Education.

It is worth noting that Qualification+ differs from the Swedish equivalent in that migrants are not specifically targeted. Although, as we have seen, the Geneva programme in practice covers a significant number of migrant workers, this is not an explicit goal. By contrast the Swedish skills recognition system specifically targets adult immigrants.

We come now to the changes and modifications made to the Qualification+ programme since its creation. In 1999, when it was known as Qualification 41, the programme was primarily a pilot project established with a view to supervising the new approach to skills evaluation, the choice of the initial sectors of application – those in which there were a significant number of unqualified

---

1Available at: www.ecotec.com/europeaninventory/2007.html
workers and where there was a high degree of involvement of voluntary organisations – and the evaluation of the programme itself by federal and cantonal government experts with a view to making recommendations on whether or not to roll out the programme to a wider range of sectors. The programme was judged to be a success. Between 1999 and 2002 programme registrations almost doubled (from 413 to 808), the number of participants undertaking training programmes increased from 351 to 496, the completion rate increased from only 38% to 86%, and the proportion of participants who failed to pass their final examinations fell from 20% to 10.2%. This success, together with the Cantonal legislation on continuing education and training passed in 2001, meant that opportunities for skills recognition in the Canton of Geneva have been greatly expanded. Any person having worked in a particular area for a year or more now has the right to apply for formal recognition of their skills and experience with a view to obtaining a formal qualification. The application of this principle has gone hand-in-hand with a significant opening-up of the vocational training system. It is no longer the case that skills recognition is effectively confined to those professions the practice of which has traditionally involved obtaining a Federal VET Diploma. The skills recognition system can now lead to the award of other types of qualification. It can also lead to the certification of transferable skills like teamwork, problem-solving and information processing – skills frequently referred to as ‘key competences’. The opportunity to obtain formal recognition of these types of skills is unprecedented. Qualification+ is subject to ongoing monitoring by a range of cantonal government departments (the Integration Office, the Social Affairs Office, the Population Office and the OFPC) as well as by voluntary organizations working with migrants. In the longer term, Qualification+ should be able to offer a system similar to that which exists in France, in which a limited number of discrete modules lead directly to a formal qualification.

Questions for the contextual factors:
- What conditions have influenced the project?
- What factors improved the success of the project?
- What factor put a check on the success of the project?
- Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?

Contextual factors:
* Since its creation, Qualification+ has been subject to repeated evaluations, notably by the Evaluation and Development unit of the OFPC. Initially a pilot project, it is now fully integrated into the OFPC’s overall approach to professional training. The fact of this repeated re-evaluation and reorientation of the programme has not been without its effects, but the arrival of Cyrille Salort as head of the programme in 2007 seems to have given Qualification+ a new lease of life. Mme Salort, who is French, aims to reproduce the flexibility inherent in the French skills recognition system while avoiding its failures. Thus, beginning in 2008, Qualification+ has allowed participants to obtain a recognised qualification on the basis of a limited number of modules. This approach will be re-evaluated in 2012.

* The success of the project is mainly due to the partnership between the government offices involved in skills validation and the private sector. The transparency and professional value of skills validation has steadily increased. Although it has taken some time to achieve, the private sector now has access to a skills validation system that it trusts. The time taken to achieve this trust has clearly been worthwhile, however, given that the different partners appear to feel included and involved in the project. This feeling of ownership significantly increases the impact of the programme. Ten sectoral employers’ organisations out of fifteen have so far agreed to participate in the validation system.
* The emphasis on partnership between the different stakeholders is due principally to the experience of Cyrille Salort in the area. Negotiation with and involvement of all the partners in the discussions are the preconditions a successful — if slow — process, as the report European Inventory on validation of non-formal and informal learning shows.

Questions for the results:

- **What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?:**
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
  - putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
  - the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
  - the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;
- .....  
- To what extent have these goals been achieved?

- To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?
- How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct / indirect)?
- Are there any differences in results among different target groups?
- How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?

Results:

The main aim of the Qualification+ programme is to encourage poorly-qualified adults to undertake training in order to facilitate access to employment and to increase job security, but also to increase job mobility. As we pointed out above, non-EU migrants are not a specific target group for the programme, but given the characteristics of this population — high proportion of poorly-qualified persons, significant presence in the professional sectors concerned — migrants in fact make up a significant proportion of those involved. In 2002, 47% of those registered in the programme were non-Swiss. These participants frequently begin the process of skills recognition with courses in the French language, which sometimes also involve basic literacy. Among other benefits, improving the language skills of participants means that they are better able to explain their professional skills during the recognition process. Clearly, then, the objective of the programme with respect to these workers is less their placement in high-quality employment than the possibility of their participation in the labour market at all.

The table below shows the number of participants in the programme in each year since 2003 as well as the number of VET Diploma’s awarded as a result of skills recognition via the Qualification+ programme.
### Number of individuals participating in Qualification+ and number of qualifications awarded

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number of participants</th>
<th>VET Diplomas awarded</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>390</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>403</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>330</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>329</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>315</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Figures for Migrants

The majority of the participants in Qualification+ are women (61% in 2002) and are principally aged between 31 and 40 years. A large majority are already in work (91% in 2008). Adem’s story shows the kind of success to which Qualification+ can lead. Adem’s mother tongue is Turkish. Having started his Swiss education in a remedial class, he moved into a mainstream secondary school programme. Having left school at 16, he began an apprenticeship as a motor mechanic. Realising after a short time that this was not for him, he went back to school, enrolling in the ‘École de Culture Générale’, a three-year programme mid-way between an academic and vocational education. However, he left school after two years, did his military service and found work in a mail and transport company. He then spent six months in Canada in order to learn English. On his return he started to work as a ‘logistics assistant’, dealing with imports and exports, including preparing invoices and customs declarations, packing lists, certificates and so on. Employed on a part-time basis, he finished his schooling at evening classes, obtaining his diploma in 2005. After another stay in Canada, Adem decided to apply for a VET Diploma in Commerce on the basis of recognition of his prior experience. Over a period of several months he carefully prepared his evidence file in the run up to his competence assessment. As it turned out, in order to qualify for the diploma he needed to take an accountancy course in addition to carrying on his existing work in a bank. At 28, Adem has no intention of staying where he is, and now plans to try for admission to the Haute École de Gestion de Genève. What this portrait shows is how Qualification+ can play a key role in the career development of poorly-qualified individuals, in some cases acting as a veritable springboard to upward economic and social mobility.

At the national level, the Canton of Geneva is something of a pioneer in the area of the recognition of prior experience. However, on the international level there are a number of countries that have greater experience of this type of programme. This is true most notably of France. Although initially met with some caution – there were worries that the system would result in a reduction in the value of qualifications – confidence in the system for recognising prior experience has grown to the extent that today its effectiveness is no longer in question. Between 2002 and 2005, some 50,000 qualifications were awarded. The French system differs from the Swiss not only in its scale, but also in the fact that it includes university-level qualifications. Nevertheless, the two systems are similar in other respects. In both cases, the candidates for skills recognition are predominantly female, skills recognition is concentrated in certain sectors – more than a quarter of the qualifications awarded in 2004 and 2005 were in the health and social care sectors – and particular emphasis is placed on getting information to targeted groups. In Geneva this last task is that of the Cité des Métiers.

---

2 Not his real name
Questions for important lessons:
- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)?
- What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?

Important lessons:

The success factors of the Qualification+ approach are as follows:
- The integration of the programme, simplifying the process of skills recognition;
- The involvement of all stakeholders, strengthening the impact of the measures;
- The programme is free of charge for applicants;
- The programme receives financial support from the Canton of Geneva and from the European Commission;
- The programme has adopted a strategy oriented towards the benefits of training and development for individuals as well as economic necessity;
- The geographical proximity of the French model, which has been a partner in the exchange of good practice.

For the individuals involved, the combination of their professional experience with a formal qualification corresponds precisely with the demands of the labour market. For certain participants, the qualification they receive as a result of the Qualification+ programme is the first official Swiss document they will possess that is of any use in opening access to employment opportunities.

The ‘fail’ factors of the Qualification+ approach are as follows:
- The process is long (up to a year);
- The programme makes no specific provision for third country nationals.

To these factors we might add the observation that the process of recognition of prior experience reveals a certain tension between the quest for skills recognition for its own sake (for the sake of the self-esteem of those involved) and the obligation to have skills recognized in order to be able to participate in the labour market. This new type of procedure, which is central to the future economic development of Europe, is underpinned by highly individualist values. It is for the individual worker to take action on his or her own account, to be autonomous, responsible, and sufficiently motivated to carry forward the project on his or her own. The individual must be able to make their presence felt. For some, however, the very absence of the education for which engaging in the process is supposed to be a remedy acts as a brake on their process of recognition. Candidates for recognition have to be able to put their experience into words, describing what they know how to do and expressing it in terms of competences. For many participants, this is likely to be the most difficult stage in the process. Neither is the process without risk for participants. If ultimately the quest for recognition fails, it may prove to be very difficult to recover from the formal rejection of the experience which is at the root of the candidate’s identity as a worker and which allows him or her to feel competent in their work.

Specifically with respect to third-country nationals, we need to note that while the Qualification+ approach is aimed at poorly-qualified individuals, third country nationals are rarely allowed to stay in Switzerland unless they are highly-qualified. Thus, many of the poorly-qualified migrants have no legal administrative status and cannot be beneficiaries of Qualification+.
Unfortunately, during an interview (18th September 2009), Cyrille Salort, Director of the Continuing Education in Geneva, was unable to give specific information on the extent to which third country migrants make use of the programme.

Final part
The preservation of rights to privacy and confidentiality means that it is difficult to obtain information about the ethnic origin of participants in the Qualification+ programme. In any case, from a practical perspective it would require a considerable investment of financial and human resources to obtain this information as it is not routinely collected by the OFPC. At this point in time, it is possible to distinguish only between participants who are Swiss and those who are non-Swiss, the division being roughly 50:50.

Despite all this, Qualification+ still appears to be one of the best means of placing migrant workers in the Swiss labour market as the nature of the programme is such that it will inevitably involve this section of the population. The sole criterion for participation is to have been living or working legally in the Canton of Geneva for at least one year. Excluding the (many) undocumented workers in low-skilled jobs who are unable to participate in the Qualification+ programme by virtue of their unlawful status, 8.5% of non-Swiss, non-EU/AELE workers are manual or unskilled workers, 21.7% work in the hotel and catering industry or in personal services, and 23.5% are employed in commerce, transport and distribution. However, the sector that employs the greatest number of third-country migrants is construction, accounting for 56.8% of the total. As Qualification+ offers skills recognition in all of these sectors, it is clear that there is considerable potential for reaching third-country migrants via the programme.

In order to realize this potential, however, it is clear that measures such as the following must be taken:

- Ensuring the availability of clear, comprehensible information, including foreign language versions of all materials;
- Ensuring that all services remain free of charge to ensure that the training is available to all;
- Pursuit of the logic of partnership — with the private sector, to ensure that qualifications remain relevant and valued; with other regions in Europe with a similar socioeconomic profile, for example cross-border projects;
- Provision of communications skills training and courses in the French language in order to ensure that participants are able to put their experience into words (verbal expression being of central importance in the skill recognition procedure). It may also be valuable to mention migrants specifically in any legislation on skills recognition in order to accentuate the need for this type of provision.

In the context of an ever-more-demanding labour market, individualized strategies for skill certification and development like continuing education, internships, recognition of prior experience, apprenticeships, formal qualifications and so on have in effect become obligatory. In establishing itself as the single starting point for the recognition of skills and of prior experience, the Qualification+ programme represents a highly effective means of enabling workers to adopt these strategies.
6. Overview literature (sources used)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>* Loi fédérale sur la formation professionnelle (LFPr)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* Loi sur la formation continue des adultes du 1er septembre 2000.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Articles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Books</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reports</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
In-depth case study UK

**Background information**

**Name case study:** The development of better tailored public employment services for refugees to promote their integration into the labour market

**Name country expert:** Mark Whittle
This case study explores efforts at both a policy and operational level to promote the integration of refugees in the labour market. Specifically, it focuses on the role of the Operational Framework for Refugees in influencing practices among public employment services in ensuring that UK employment services (through the JobCentre Plus network) are better tailored to meet the specific needs of refugees.

Questions for the problem definition:
- What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?
- What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?
- What is the scope of the problem?
- What supposedly caused this problem?
- Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?
- Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

Problem definition:

The main reason for putting in place a new framework for integrating refugees in the labour market was to tackle the considerable labour market disparities between the employment and unemployment rates of refugees and those of the average UK population.

The UK is a recipient of a high number of asylum seekers and refugees. While employment rates are high among migrants having entered the UK through managed migration programmes, high unemployment rates persist among refugees. A further problem – outside the scope of this case study – is that asylum seekers are not legally able to work which has potential implications in terms of delaying the integration into the labour market of those subsequently given refugee status. This risks skills being lost, and a lack of continuation in employment record, which may then subsequently affect the ability of refugees to enter the jobs market.

While there are no official statistics on unemployment among refugees, research on behalf of the Department for Work and Pensions (DWP) in 2003 suggests that refugees experience multiple barriers in accessing the labour market. With regard to the scope of the problem, DWP estimated that the unemployment rate among refugees in the UK was as high as 36%. Consequently, refugees experience higher unemployment levels, lower participation rates and are at higher risk of social marginalisation than the majority population. A large distinction can be drawn between the labour market situation of refugees compared with other types of migrants from third countries coming to the UK through managed migration programmes via the tier-point system.

Among the main barriers include: lack of English language skills, lower than average educational attainment rates, and in some cases, discrimination. There is also evidence that refugees face a higher risk of ‘occupational downgrading’ in order to enter into employment due to the lack of recognition of some types of qualifications from third countries. Consequently, some highly-skilled refugees are working in low-skilled, temporary and badly paid jobs.

A Policy briefing on the assessment of skills and recognition of qualifications of refugees and migrants in Europe by the NGO Network of Integration Focal Points identifies some of the additional problems that refugees face compared with other types of migrants from third countries in gaining the recognition of qualifications. ‘Refugees often leave in a hurry without knowledge of their final destination. They are not always able to bring all their diplomas and certificates with them and/or cannot access the institutions in their host countries that issued their documents. Refugees are more often confronted with these problems because, compared to other immigrants, a larger proportion tend to have higher educational and professional backgrounds’.
However, compared with many other EU countries, the UK has been active in promoting improvements in the recognition of qualifications obtained outside the EU through a dedicated government-supported National Agency called UK NARIC. This organisation is responsible for providing information, advice and expert opinion on vocational, academic and professional skills and qualifications from over 180 countries. However, despite improvements in the recognition of qualifications from third countries, there remains a risk that refugees’ skills may not be used to their full potential, especially for those with professional experience prior to becoming refugees.

Refugees sometimes experience direct and indirect discrimination in accessing the labour market resulting in their unemployment or under-employment. In recent years, asylum seekers and refugees have faced some hostility in the media. Whilst no reliable data is available on the impact of discrimination as a barrier, it is a contributing factor to higher levels of unemployment among refugees than the majority population.

The UK’s national network of Jobcentre Plus plays an important role in promoting access to employment for refugees. However, there remain challenges in encouraging more refugees to make use of the job matching and career advisory support services they offer. The UK’s London Development Agency (LDA) published research on the labour market integration of refugees, as part of an OECD LEED study on the Local integration of immigrants into the labour market: *UK Case study – The case of refugees in London* (Institute for Employment Research (IER), University of Warwick, UK). According to this research, only about 50% of refugees use Jobcentre Plus services. There is a reluctance among some ethnic groups to engage with ‘mainstream’ employment service provision for a variety of reasons including cultural factors. These groups are known as ‘harder to reach’ refugees, and a key policy challenge lies in targeting these individuals. In order to target these groups more effectively, the Jobcentre Plus network at local and national level has sought to establish strong partnerships with Refugee and Community Organisations (RCOs) from the voluntary and NGO sectors.

Community-based organisations play an important role in promoting access to employment for those unable (or unwilling) to access mainstream employment service provision. Sometimes, RCOs work through outreach workers with an ethnic minority background in order to engage with refugees from ‘harder to reach’ communities in order to help them enter or re-enter the labour market. This case study focuses on ways in which Public Employment Services might engage more effectively with, and better tailor their services to meet the specific needs of refugees in accessing the labour market.

**Questions for the approach:**

- What approach has been used to address the problem?
- What are the core elements of the approach?
- What is the intensity and duration of the approach?
- How is this approach supposed to resolve the problem (line of reasoning)?
- What is known about the effectiveness of the approach(es) used in this case in general (international literature, (policy) studies)?
- Is this a new approach or has this approach been used elsewhere?
- What distinguishes this approach from other (similar) approaches?
- Has the approach been edited during the course of the project? If so, in what way?

**Approach:**

Given the multiple barriers faced by refugees in accessing the labour market, the UK government has sought to develop a cross-government strategy to promote the employment integration of refugees.
In March 2005, the Home Office launched *Integration Matters: National Strategy for Refugee Integration*. This emphasises the role of Jobcentre Plus in helping the integration of refugees and the importance of partnership working. The strategy requires co-ordination across government and relevant support agencies and aims to ensure that refugees are able to make ‘a full and positive contribution to society’. To support the implementation of the strategy, an *Operational Framework for Refugees*, which has the aim of strengthening refugees’ access to Jobcentre Plus programmes was launched on the same date in March 2005. This was also designed to help support the implementation of the DWP’s *Refugee Employment Strategy: ‘Working to Rebuild Lives’*. The strategy emphasises the critical role of partnership, ‘no single agency can achieve results alone. We will continue to depend on the strong partnerships that we have built across Government and with the voluntary sector’.

The purpose of the Operational Framework is to bring together information, guidance and support for JCP staff and to identify ways in which refugees seeking employment and claiming benefits might be better supported in order to facilitate their labour market integration. It also incorporates specific signposting information and provides examples of good practices.

The document is divided into 3 parts. The first part deals with strategic planning and working with partners. Specifically, it provides policy advice and information for Jobcentre Plus District Managers and Business Development / External Relations managers in developing local Jobcentre Plus services to meet the needs of refugees and their communities and explore partnership working with refugee and community organisations. It then provides information for external partners about Jobcentre Plus so as to encourage partnership working to support refugees.

In the second part, guidance and support is provided on refugee issues. Internal and external sources of further information, together with guidance for staff taking unemployment claims and supporting refugees in accessing employment is detailed.

In the third part, a customer services leaflet is provided aimed at refugees and supporting organisations to increase their awareness of, and explain, Jobcentre Plus services and support. It is expected that the leaflet will be produced in other languages and will be displayed in Jobcentre Plus offices.

The objective of putting in place the Operational Framework was to better recognise the specific need of refugees using employment services across the UK, as well as to promote closer partnership working with the community and voluntary sectors in order to access ‘hard to reach’ target groups. The approach adopted by DWP reflects a broader trend towards a more client-centred, individualised approach to delivering employment services, whereby advice and services to job-seekers are more closely tailored towards individual needs.

There was an emphasis in the framework on the use of signposting and referral to specific support services. An example of how this approach has worked in practice comes from Harrow in West London. The team working at Harrow Jobcentre Plus noticed that a number of refugees had moved from the North of England to the area, and were looking for employment in the manufacturing sector. JCP staff approached Refugees into Jobs (RIJ), a voluntary sector agency, and encouraged these job seekers to use its services in order to familiarise themselves with relevant labour market opportunities in West London and to support them in preparing for available job vacancies.

The Framework has also promoted the use of innovative approaches to target refugees who might not otherwise have had access to mainstream employment services. At the operational level, an example of this approach in practice was the use of an outreach approach in the London area. Voluntary sector agencies such as Refugees into Jobs were invited to make presentations to staff at JobCentre Plus in order to strengthen awareness about the specific needs of refugees in accessing employment opportunities.
This was then followed up by presentations to JCPs in the London area with a staff member within JCP (either a manager, a team leader or careers adviser) being designating as the main point of contact with which refugee and community organisations should liaise on issues relating to the integration in employment of refugees. This approach was thought to have been effective because it means that refugees previously unwilling to use the services of Jobcentres Plus have access to specialist support and advice. This has been beneficial not only for refugees themselves, but also in terms of the closer working relationship developed between voluntary and community organisations and JCP staff, with the possibility of experiences being transferred about the specific needs of refugees to JCP staff. Voluntary career advisers with experience of working directly with refugees were invited to base themselves twice a month at JCP offices and undertake work with refugees on an outreach basis.

With regard to delivery mechanisms to implement the Operational Framework, the Department for Work and Pensions is responsible at national level for implementing the framework through its nationwide Jobcentre Plus network. JCPs work to determine the employment situation of individual refugees and then to tailor support to meet their support needs and to help them gain access to the labour market. The type of support provided ranges from assistance in respect of the recognition of qualifications in third countries, addressing a refugee’s training and skills needs (including any retraining needed to make the most of skills and professional experience gained in a third country), and jobs matching.

The case study research revealed some interesting examples of how the better tailoring of support so as to meet the specific needs of individual refugees has made a difference. For instance, in some JCPs, training delivered by Job Centre Plus managers has taken place with frontline staff involved in dealing with job seekers (including refugees) claiming Job Seekers Allowance. The aim of the training was to train JCP personnel to be more sensitive with regard to ensuring that refugees’ full employment potential was taken into account, to better identify refugees with previous professional experience and/or qualifications and to assist these individuals in obtaining further support and assistance either to re-qualify, or to obtain recognition for qualifications and experience obtained in a third country.

This was found to have made a difference in practice. An example was the case of a well-qualified dentist with a refugee background, who had initially been encouraged to apply for agricultural work, rather than to retrain. Given the need to be actively job-seeking in order to qualify for Job Seekers Allowance, this would have had very negative consequences in terms of occupational downgrading for the individual concerned. However, following intervention by a manager, the Job Centre staff no longer encourage refugees into low-paid employment, and instead provide them with scope where appropriate to retrain and obtain the relevant professional qualifications needed in order to fulfil their potential.

Questions for the contextual factors:
- What conditions have influenced the project?
- What factors improved the success of the project?
- What factor put a check on the success of the project?
- Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?

Contextual factors:
Among the factors that influenced the successful implementation of the Operational Framework for Refugees was the commitment of senior management within Jobcentre Plus both to developing better tailored support services for refugees through training and awareness-raising, as well as to reaching ‘hard to reach’ groups. Without such commitment, it would have been difficult to drive the organisational
changes among frontline JCP staff required in terms of the way in which the specific needs of refugees in accessing the labour market are dealt with.

Another key contextual factor was the successful engagement of the voluntary and community sectors in targeting ‘hard to reach’ groups within refugee communities. Without their support, it would not have been possible to make much progress in improving access to the labour market for refugees. Evidently, the specific local operating context varies significantly across the UK and in some areas, it was less easy to work on an outreach basis due to the absence of voluntary and community organisations working with refugees. It was therefore easier to implement this approach in urban areas with high refugee concentrations, where such organisations tend to operate.

Among the factors that may hinder the more effective delivery of employment services to individuals with a refugee background include the need to regularly reinforce awareness among frontline job centre staff. Otherwise, there is a risk that the need for sensitivity in dealing with refugees is forgotten and job seekers with a refugee background are placed into low-paid, low-skilled employment and that their skills and professional background is not fully utilised.

Questions for the results:
- What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?:
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
  - putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
  - the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
  - the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;
  - ....
- To what extent have these goals been achieved?
- To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?
- How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct / indirect)?
- Are there any differences in results among different target groups?
- How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?

Results:
Among the objectives of the Refugee Operational Framework relating to labour market integration were to
i) ’move more unemployed refugees into Jobcentre Plus support quickly after they receive refugee status’, and to
ii) ’ensure that Jobcentre Plus gives them the help they need to find sustainable work’.
With regard to the extent to which these goals have been achieved, there has been progress in encouraging unemployed refugees to use Jobcentre Plus services, particularly among previously ‘hard-to-reach’ groups. There has also been a focus on improving practical assistance in terms of accessing and understanding the UK labour market and in obtaining help with English language and other skills to improve employability and access to employment. This support is being provided earlier on than had previously been the case, with efforts to ensure that upon getting refugee status, refugees have early contact with JCPs. There has also been progress in strengthening partnerships between the DWP and national network of JCPs, other government departments and partnerships at local and national levels with voluntary and statutory organizations.

It has not been possible to obtain statistics on how successful the new approach championed in the Refugee Operational Framework has been in terms of moving refugees out of unemployment into employment and further training. However, it has been possible to analyse anecdotal examples of ways in which the approach adopted has been effective. In particular, we examined the extent to which the aim of better tailoring support services to meet the specific needs of refugees had been met and considered the extent to which partnership working had been strengthened. The case study also draws on a small-scale evaluation carried out by the Employability Forum for the Department for Work and Pensions on the implementation of JCP Refugee Operational Framework.

A questionnaire was sent to Jobcentre Plus having participated in the framework, as well as obtaining the views of “users” of the employment and career advisory services provided by JCP i.e. both refugee clients and voluntary sector providers of services to refugees on an outreach basis. Among the findings were that as a result of the Framework, partnership working has improved as a result of the increased level of communication, interaction and engagement between JCPs and the voluntary sector at the local level.

However, less positively, some voluntary and community organisations participating in the Operational Framework expressed frustration that while managers were aware about the initiative, front-end JCP staff dealing directly with job-seekers were generally unaware about its existence. Moreover, there remain low levels of awareness about what the specific needs of refugee clients are, and how to address these. Stakeholders organisations ‘testified to their frustration with JCP staff who on the whole are not aware of the Operational Framework and in many cases found out about it for the first time from external agencies’. Another problem identified was that personal advisers working with job applicants in JCPs had inexperience in dealing with clients with a professional background. They typically provided assistance with job search for the unemployed into low paid, low-skilled jobs. This meant that they sometimes failed to recognise the full employment potential of job seekers with a refugee background, and lacked understanding about how to make the most of overseas work experience, which was often undervalued. Some lacked knowledge about retraining possibilities and about how refugees might obtain recognition of qualifications obtained abroad.

However, overall, the findings from the evaluation were positive. The framework has helped to strengthen partnership working through regular communication and interaction between Jobcentre Plus and the voluntary sector at local level. This has made a positive difference in terms of the way in which the needs of refugees in accessing the labour market are being met. While there remains some way to go in ensuring that frontline staff working with job seekers are fully aware about how to deal with refugee clients, some progress has been made in improving the treatment of refugees by the national public employment service.
Questions for important lessons:

- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organizations or in other countries)?
- What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?

Important lessons:

Aspects of the approach adopted are potentially transferable, with lessons being applicable quite widely. In particular, there is a need for public employment services to deal with refugee job seekers more sensitively, and to recognise that many of them have higher-level skills that need to be fully exploited, with a need for flexibility in the benefits system so that refugees are able to continue to receive state benefits while in training, without being forced to look for low-paid, low-skilled employment which would be inappropriate to their professional background.

The case study highlights a number of good practices, including:

- The importance of tailoring employment services to meet the specific needs of refugees
- The need to carry out a proper appraisal of refugees skills and professional background in order to ensure that their full employment potential is realised. This may involve several contacts with more than one service provider and there may be a need for specialist assistance
- Better valuation of the educational qualifications obtained by young refugees so that the positions they obtain truly reflect their abilities
- The key role that strengthened partnership working between employment services and the voluntary and community sectors can play in engaging with refugees from 'hard to reach' national and/or ethnic backgrounds, to ensure that they have access to mainstream provision, or if appropriate, can access outreach employment services delivered by refugee community organisations
- The value of ensuring that training in how to respond to the needs of refugee clients is targeted at frontline staff working in public employment services, since these deal with refugees at an operational level, and there is a need to ensure staff are attuned to the specific needs of, and opportunities for refugees in accessing the labour market
- The need for public initiatives to encourage entrepreneurship among refugees mainly consisting of the funding of business support programmes aimed at bringing refugees up to speed with business rules and regulations.

6. Overview literature (sources used)

A number of sources were used. These include:

- Jobcentre Plus Refugee Operational Framework, Department for Work and Pensions
- Policy briefing on the assessment of skills and recognition of qualifications of refugees and migrants in Europe, European Council on Refugees and Exiles (ECRE) and the NGO Network of Integration Focal Points, 2007
- The Home Office refugee strategy, 'Integration Matters', 9 March, 2005
- The DWP Refugee Employment Strategy, 'Working to Rebuild Lives; a refugee employment strategy'
Annex 4 Extended methodology chapter

This annex provides a more detailed description of the aims of the study, the research questions and methodological approach we used for this study.

A4.1 Aim of the study

The study aims to:

1. Identify the barriers that third country migrants may face finding employment.

2. Examine innovative and practical ways to improve the integration of third country migrants into the labour market, from an economic and social point of view.

The results lead to a clear understanding of how to improve the position of third country migrants on the labour market and how to make better use of third country migrants as a labour market resource. Based on this knowledge, policy makers should be able to develop projects to improve the integration of third country migrants into the labour market.

To successfully improve the integration of third country migrants into the labour market, such a project needs to meet at least these three criteria:

1. Specificity – the approach needs to concentrate on a specific group of third country migrants and/or specific barriers to the labour market. In short, the project needs to make an explicit connection between a problem and a certain solution.

2. Applicability – an approach should be easily copied and implemented in another context. The process of the approach must be clear, practical, and reproducible.

3. Mainstreaming – the project not only needs to find a solution for a specific context, it also needs to be useful in similar situations in other areas or different situations in similar settings.

Keeping these three criteria for the investigation of barriers and innovative approaches in mind, the aims of the present study could be translated into a number of research questions as described in the following section.

A4.2 Research questions

1. What are the characteristics of third country migrants in the different EU countries in terms of their demographic background, socio-economic status, qualifications, occupational status, etc?

2. What barriers do third country migrants encounter in gaining access to employment and to what extent do these barriers cause unemployment and inactivity?

3. What innovative and practical ways to improve the integration of third country migrants into the labour market, socially and economically, are known and how do they tackle the identified barriers?

4. How and under what conditions can these approaches be extended to other groups of third country migrants, other situations and contexts?
These four research questions formed the basis for this study. The questions are made operational and specified in further detail in the discussion of the methodological approach in the following sections of this annex.

### A4.3 General overview of the approach

The aims of this study can be linked to the three different steps we followed in the research process between January and November 2009. With every step we focused in more detail on individual approaches that attempt to improve integrating third country migrants in the labour market.

- **An inception phase (January – February)** in which we started by providing an overview of third country migrants in Europe, their background characteristics and the main barriers they face when integrating in the labour market;
- **An interim phase (March – July)** in which country experts focused on 15 countries in which we collect more information on the specific situation of third country migrants, barriers they face, and made an inventory of practical and innovative approaches;
- **In in-depth phase (July–November)** in which we focused our study on 15 innovative approaches in order to identify the best practices.

The three step approach is outlined in figure A4.1.

**Figure A4.1 Phases of the assignment**
A4.4 Inception phase

As described, the first aim of this study was to provide a rough overview of the labour market situation and developments in Europe and zoom in on the specific situation of third country migrants, their background characteristics, their labour market position and the barriers they face when integrating in the labour market. This information was gathered by the Research Team in the inception phase of this study and served as an input for defining the concepts and setting up the framework for data collection in the subsequent phases. Questions of this first phase are included in the table below.

Table A4.1  Question for the inception phase

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions for the inception phase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. How will current labour market and demographic developments influence reliance of European Member States on third country migrants?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. How many third country migrants are registered in the various countries?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Which percentage of them is employed?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. What is known about the background of the third country migrants (e.g. country, level of education, age, gender)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. What information is available about the type of jobs (e.g. economic sectors, type of contract, level of education)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. What are the future needs of European labour markets in terms of skills and jobs?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. What are the challenges for third country migrants (including second and third generation children) regarding these future needs?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. What barriers do third country migrants encounter in the process of seeking, finding and keeping a suitable job?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. What can be said about (innovative or practical) solutions, policies and projects that have been run to improve the situation of third country migrants on the labour market?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All this data served as a stepping stone towards developing the research design of the qualitative in-depth study in which we identified the barriers towards successful integration into the labour market and the innovative approaches to overcome these barriers. The statistics also served as the foundation for the final selection of countries in which the case studies were conducted (see the next section).

A4.5 Interim phase

A4.5.1 Collection of country information

In the second phase of the assignment the country experts got to work. In a selection of 15 countries, they collected specific national information on (1) the characteristics of third country migrants and their position in the labour market; (2) the main barriers that (different groups of) third country migrants encounter in gaining access to employment; and (3) investigated approximately three (innovative) approaches that attempt to improve migrants’

---

1 The experts were selected from the IMISCOE Network (www.imiscoe.org). They are responsible for the country studies and will be responsible for carrying out the in-depth case studies during the final phase of this study.

2 The final selection of countries was based on the state of flexicurity in the country, labour market position of third country migrants and geographical coverage.
integration on the labour market. In collecting this information the experts used pre-defined formats in order to make sure that the data is collected in a uniform way (see annex 5 for the format that the experts used for their data collection).

The selection of 15 countries consisted of:

- Austria
- Bulgaria
- Denmark
- Estonia
- France
- Germany
- Hungary
- Italy
- The Netherlands
- Poland
- Portugal
- Spain
- Sweden
- Switzerland
- United Kingdom

The use of statistics in the country reports
To grasp the labour market situation of third country migrants in a certain country, reliable statistics are indispensable. Therefore, in the format for data collection we asked the experts to provide statistical information on the following topics:
- Volume of third country migrants (total number of third country migrants)
- Composition of third country migrants (e.g. region of origin or educational level)
- Labour market situation of third country migrants (e.g. employment and unemployment rates)
- Quality aspects of employment (e.g. types of employment or over-qualification)
- Differences in labour market situation and quality aspects of employment between different groups of third country migrants (e.g. based on gender or country of origin)

The experts provided us with a great detail of valuable statistical information. However, this information is hardly comparable between countries. Because we anticipated on this, when providing the instructions to the experts before and during the process of the country studies, we repeatedly and explicitly stressed to use the European Commission publication ‘Employment in Europe’ (2008). Employment in Europe provides a thorough and detailed overview of the labour market situation of third country migrants and includes all most recent data available on European level. Nevertheless, many experts provided much more statistical information, mostly collected on a national level. As said this information cannot be compared, as many countries use different concepts, different methods of collecting information, different time series etc.

Moreover, not in all countries the concept of ‘third country migrant’ seems relevant. In some countries the concept of third country migrants, using the foreign born definition is not meaningful. This is for example the case in Poland where many older people are foreign born as a result of agreements on post war boundaries. Another example is Italy where many foreign born people are returning former emigrants of Italian descent. And in the Netherlands the focus in literature, research and statistics is mainly on so called ‘allochtonen’, people with at least one of their parents born abroad.

For a comparable overview of the European labour markets, we refer to chapter 2 of this report.

---

1 This publication combines various data sources such as Eurostat, the EU Labour Force Survey, OECD and national accounts and thereby serves as an all-embracing guide to provide a European and cross-country comparable overview of the labour market and third country migrants.
A4.5.2 Expert meeting

On Thursday May the 28th an expert meeting was organized by the Research Team at the offices of Research voor Beleid, led by Professor Rinus Penninx (University of Amsterdam), Chairman of IMISCOE. The meeting served as an opportunity for the core team and the country-responsible research partners to discuss and analyse the proceedings and results of the study. This meeting thus formed the occasion for discussing the insights and conclusions reached as a result of the gathering of country-specific information and the identification of the main barriers in a specific country. Moreover, in discussion with the country experts, the preliminary selection of innovative approaches that could be subject of the in-depth investigations was considered and determined. For the method used on the selection of cases, we refer to the next section.

Experts gave a 10 minute presentation on the outcomes of his or her country study, shortly addressing the policy context, the labour market situation of (groups) of third country migrants, the barriers they face and the identified innovative approaches. After each presentation the other group members could provide a short reflection on the presentation. After that, each group came up with a preliminary selection of approaches, which was discussed during a plenary discussion.

A4.5.3 Selection of case studies

Since on average 3 approaches per country were examined, the interim phase resulted in 47 examples of innovative or practical ways to improve the integration of third country migrants into the labour market. During the expert meeting we introduced the following criteria for the final selection of 15 approaches.

- It aims specifically at third country migrants or a target group third country migrants are part of;
- It contributes to surmounting third country migrants’ barriers in seeking, finding and keeping a job;
- It carries out a clear or renewing vision on the topic;
- The conditions under which the approach operates are specified;
- The processes and procedures that are followed are carefully registered;
- Its success is proven: the approach is evaluated at least once;
- The approach is transferable to other contexts: mainstreaming;
- The approach is applicable in times of economic crisis;

After analyzing all the cases we came up with a proposal for the selection of 15 innovative approaches that could be subject to in-depth investigation during the final phase of the study. To reach this selection different methods or criteria were used, to finally guarantee that we capture a wide variety of approaches. All the approaches that we received were labelled according to three dimensions: target group(s), the barriers the approach aims to overcome and the elements of the approach. A table with the clustering of all the approaches and an overview of the approaches in terms of target groups, barriers and elements is presented in annex 7. The final selection of approaches was, after discussion and some alterations, mutually agreed on with the Commission.
A4.6 In-depth phase

Research model
To be able to mark the investigated innovative approaches on the above mentioned criteria, all in-depth case studies must provide the core team with relevant and comparable information. Therefore, we provided the country experts with a grounded research model\(^1\) in which the information needed to decide whether an approach is a good practice is incorporated. This model could be used for drawing up project reports that allow others (e.g. policy makers, project leaders) to determine the value of the specific project or policy and the possibilities for successfully transferring the approach to other combinations of target groups and circumstances. The model consists of five elements as is visually presented in figure A4.2.

**Figure A4.2** Research model for case studies

These five elements are the problem definition, the approach, the contextual factors, the results and the important lessons. The accompanying questions that had to be answered for each of these elements can be found in the format for the in-depth case studies in annex 6.

Methods used for the case studies
As a result of the diversity of cases and the availability of information each case needed a different approach for collecting data. Therefore, each country expert decided for him or herself how to collect their data, taking into account that they use as much factual information as possible by doing a literature study and using secondary data (policy documents,

---

\(^1\) Research voor Beleid developed this model based on the ideas of Pawson, R. & N. Tilley, 1997, *Realistic Evaluations*. 
evaluation studies, statistics, reports etc.). In addition the experts needed to carry out minimal one interview with the person responsible for implementing the measure. However, in cases there was less secondary information available on the approach some of the experts carried out more interviews in order to answer the questions.

**Result of the case studies**

By using the research model, the national experts fully reviewed the (innovative) approach and showed what works, for whom, under what circumstances. The research team then combined the findings of the case studies and analysed these. What type of approach appears to be successful in combating the barriers that third-country migrants face when integrating into the labour market of their host country?

The result of the in-depth case studies is an overview of fifteen innovative and/or practical approaches towards successful labour market integration of third country migrants in Europe.
Annex 5 Format for the country studies carried out in the interim phase

Innovative approaches towards successful integration of third country migrants in the labour market

Format country report

Background information
Name country:
Name country expert:
INTRODUCTION

- **Policy context** - Immigration and in particular the integration of third country migrants into the labour market is increasingly gaining political importance on the European and Member States' agendas. Against the background of ageing European societies and of growing labour market needs, Europe looks likely to rely more on immigration and at the same time integration of third country migrants into the labour market to balance supply and demand in labour markets, and more generally to fuel economic growth. However, statistics show that third country migrants’ labour market situation is worse than that of non third country migrants in many Member States - they tend to have much lower employment rates than the EU nationals and are often more exposed to being employed in jobs for which they are over-qualified. Labour market participation is very important for the integration of third country migrants in a host society. Active participation in the labour market entails contact with nationals and a more independent position for the third country national. However, to access the labour market, third country migrants have to overcome certain barriers that put them at a disadvantage compared to natives.

- **Study on innovative approaches** - Research voor Beleid (private company) is carrying out a study on innovative approaches towards successful integration of third country migrants in the labour market (assigned by DG Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities). Research voor Beleid (together with correspondents on country level – hereafter named country experts) will, by means of this study, provide a deeper understanding of the labour market situation of third country migrants in Europe and the most important barriers they face and examine innovative and practical ways to improve the integration of third country migrants into the labour market, from an economic and social point of view.

- **Third country migrants** - The total population resident in the EU can be divided into three basic groups based on place of birth:
  - Native-born – those born in the Member State of residence;
  - Other EU-born – those born in another EU Member State;
  - Non-EU-born – those born outside of the EU (third countries).

The latter two groups – although both ‘foreign-born’ – may have different residence and labour market rights, and differ in terms of labour market outcomes. In this study we focus on immigrants from non EU countries (hereafter referred to as ‘non-EU born’ or ‘third country migrants’). Within this broad group of third country migrants, special attention will be given to the following subgroups: (1) the most recent third country migrants who have resided in a EU-27 country since 2000 but for a period longer than six months; (2) the more established third country migrants, residing in a EU-27 country from before 2000; and (3) to the specific challenges of certain sub-groups, based on gender, age, country of origin, socio-economic, religious or ethnic background, and reasons for migrating. Secondarily, when relevant and possible, attention will be given to the labour market situation and barriers of descendants of third country migrants (the 2nd and 3rd generation).

- **Labour market integration** - By integration into the labour market we mean achieving a situation whereby labour force outcomes for third country migrants are similar to those of corresponding native born. With this definition we concur with the point of view the European Commission adopts in its communication on ‘Migration and development’. The Commission finds that the positions third country migrants occupy entering a national labour market should reflect their qualifications, skills level and experience. As a consequence, successful labour market integration should entail the following:
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country national workers in employment;
  - putting third country national workers’ human capital to good use;
  - the integration of third country national workers into high-quality employment;
  - the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country national workers in
the labour market.

DATA COLLECTION

- **Data collection in 15 countries** - By using a representative selection of 15 countries of the EU27, the study covers the entire European Union. A total of 15 countries ensures proper coverage of all the geographical regions of Europe while at the same time offers the most cost-efficient research approach. The provisional selection of the 15 countries was based on three criteria: (1) state of flexicurity of EU countries; (2) Labour market position of third country migrants; and (3) geographical coverage. Each country study will be executed by an expert of the IMISCOE Network of Excellence (IMISCOE). This provides the Research Team with access to relevant expertise and background documentation on country level.

- **Your role as country expert:** The country experts will draw up a country report, based on the format provided below, that includes information on the labour market situation of third country migrants in your country, barriers they face on the labour market, and an inventory of practical and innovative approaches to overcome these barriers.

METHODS USED

- The following activities need to be carried out:
  - Collect specific national information on the characteristics of third country migrants and their position in the labour market.
  - Investigate the main barriers that (different groups of) third country migrants encounter in gaining access to employment.
  - Investigate three to five innovative approaches.
  - We would like to ask you, as national expert, to complete the format, by doing a literature study, using secondary data (policy documents, studies, statistics, reports etc.). If you face problems in answering some of the questions, by using secondary data, you are free to organise some additional interviews. However, please take into account that you have a limited number of days to organise the country study (6.5 days per country).
  - If you are using literature or data sources, please specify them in the text.

PLANNING

- The country experts need to finish the country studies before **Friday 15th May 2009**.
- During the expert meeting in Zoetermeer, that will take place on 28th of May, we will discuss the outcomes of country studies. For this meeting we like to ask you to prepare a short presentation about your findings in your country. During this meeting we will make a final selection of 15 cases for the in-depth phase that will take place from June 2009 till the end of September 2009. Besides, we will discuss the formats for the in-depth phase of this study.

HELPDESK / CONTACT POINT

- In case you experience any problems with using the format or carrying out the country study, please do not hesitate to contact Suzanne de Visser of Research voor Beleid during working days on the following number and e-mail address: +31(0)79 322 2678 / s.de.visser@research.nl
Format with questions for the country report

This format for data collection consists of three parts:
- **PART A** – Immigration policies, third country migrants characteristics, and labour market developments;
- **PART B** – Barriers to integration in the labour market;
- **PART C** – Existing and innovative measures for integration of third country migrants in the labour market;

### PART A. IMMIGRATION POLICY, THIRD COUNTRY MIGRANTS CHARACTERISTICS, AND LABOUR MARKET DEVELOPMENTS

1. **A short inventory of current legislation and immigration policies in your country, that could impact the labour market integration of third country migrants.**

Please take into account the following:
- Legal status
- Access to social rights and welfare systems
- Residence permit
- Working permit
- Access to training opportunities and employment services
- Employment rights (Contractual arrangements)
- Civic citizenship / naturalisation (political rights on local level)
- Introduction programmes for newly arrived immigrants

2. **The volume, composition, and employment characteristics of third country migrants residing in your country**

We would like to ask you to provide as much statistical information as possible on third country migrants residing in your country (see definitions in the introduction box), completed by more qualitative information. This information should reflect the current situation of third country migrants in your country (static) and developments since 2000 (dynamic). Much of this information has already been made available in the Commission publication: Employment in Europe 2008 (chapter 2: the labour market situation and impact of recent third country migrants): [http://ec.europa.eu/social/main.jsp?catId=119&langId=en](http://ec.europa.eu/social/main.jsp?catId=119&langId=en). Where possible we would like to ask you to include information on (1) the most recent third country migrants who have resided in a EU-27 country since 2000; (2) the more established third country migrants, residing in a EU-27 country from before 2000; and (3) to the specific challenges of certain sub-groups, based on their gender, age, country of origin, socio-economic, religious or ethnic background, and reasons for migrating. Secondly, when relevant and possible, attention will be given to the labour market situation and barriers of
descendants of third country migrants (the 2nd and 3rd generation). In some cases we ask you to compare the group of third country migrants with those native born.

Please address the following items:

**A Volume of third country migrants (most recent data and developments since 2000)**
- Total number of third country migrants
- Total number of third country migrants arrived since 2000
- Total number of native born
- Total number of EU born

**B Composition of third country migrants (most recent data and developments since 2000)**
- Composition of third country migrants by country / region of origin: please use the following regions: North America, Central America, Caribbean and South America, North Africa, Sub-Saharan Africa, Near and Middle East, Turkey, East Asia, South and South-East Asia, Oceania, EEA and other Europe, Eastern Europe, Balkans or write down country names in full.
- Composition of third country migrants by gender (in comparison with Native born)
- Composition of third country migrants by age (in comparison with Native born) – 5 year interval
- Composition of third country migrants by educational level (in comparison with Native born): please hold on to the standard ISCED definitions by UNESCO (pre-primary, primary, lower secondary, secondary, post-secondary first stage tertiary and second stage tertiary education).
- Composition of third country migrants by reasons for migration (work; accompanying family or workers; family formation and reunification; humanitarian; other)

**C Labour market situation of third country migrants (most recent data and developments since 2000)**
- Contribution of third country migrants to the total labour force (as percentage of total labour force)
- Employment rate of third country migrants (in comparison with Native born)
- Unemployment rate of third country migrants ((in comparison with Native born)
D Quality aspect of employment

- Types of employment of third country national (in comparison with native born) – part time / temporary contract
- Sector of employment of third country migrants (in comparison with native born)
- Occupational distribution of third country migrants (in comparison with native born)
- Level of over-qualification of third country migrants (in comparison with native born): An over-qualified individual is one who holds a job that requires lesser qualifications than would theoretically be available to him at his education level. The ISCO occupational classification system devised by ILO can be used to establish linkages between occupation and educational levels as designated by the International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED).
- Wages of third country migrants (in comparison with native born)
- Working conditions of third country migrants (in comparison with native born)- night work / supervisory responsibilities

Add text

E Differences in labour market situation (see C) and quality aspects of employment (see D) between different groups of third country migrants, based on:

- Gender
- Country of origin
- Reasons for migration
- Age
- Educational level
- Recent versus the more established third country migrants
- Descendants of third country migrants (the 2nd and 3rd generation)
- Other

Add text

3. A short inventory of relevant labour market developments in your country since 2000 which impacted the demand for third country migrants in the national labour market.

We would like to ask you to outline the most important labour market developments in your country that took place since 2000 which impact the demand for third country migrants in the national labour market (please include latest developments as far as possible, such as the impact of the financial / economic crisis).

Please take into account the following aspects:

- Demographic developments
- Economic developments
- (Un)employment rate
- Sectoral changes
- Labour market and skills shortages

Add text
PART B. BARRIERS FOR GAINING ACCESS TO EMPLOYMENT

4. Barriers third country migrants encounter in gaining access to employment

We would like to ask you to provide an overview of recent research / data on barriers that third country migrants face in your country, that prevent them from successfully integrating in the labour market. We define barriers as “bottlenecks that hamper third country migrants from seeking, finding or keeping a suitable job, assuming that the concerned individuals, their immediate surrounding or the local, national or sub national government can change the given situation”. The following barriers might give you some guidance:

Intrinsic barriers
- Minor knowledge of host country language
- Lack of professional / educational skills
- Limited knowledge of labour market
- Limited knowledge of job application procedures and channels to enter the labour market
- Limited understanding social codes
- Limited understanding working culture
- Limited relevant social network / contacts

External barriers
- Limited availability of language trainings
- Limited availability of professional training
- Failure to recognise diplomas
- Limited guidance in job seeking
- Bureaucratic and procedural inflexibility
- Failure to capture different types of skills and qualities in assessment tests
- Lack of experience among employers in working with foreign employees
- Discrimination (direct, indirect, institutional, and Legal)

Contextual barriers
- Legislation (concerning working permit, social right etc.)
- Immigration policies
- Integration policies
- Labour market situation

5. Vulnerable target groups especially hampered by barriers

We would like to ask you to indicate whether certain barriers are specially relevant for some target groups in your country and why this is. Please include target groups in your answer in relation to the following variables:
- Gender (women)
- Country of origin
- Age (Young third country migrants)
• Number of years residing in your country (recent versus established third country migrants)
• Educational level (Low, middle and high skilled)
• Second and third generation
• Other

Add text

6. Considering the findings under the points 4 and 5 above, what are the major challenges third country migrants face when trying to overcome certain barriers?

Add text

PART C. CURRENT MEASURES AND INTERESTING INITIATIVES FOR INTEGRATING THIRD COUNTRY MIGRANTS IN THE LABOUR MARKET

7. Current measures for integrating third country migrants in the labour market
We would like to ask you to specify what kind of measures that have been put into place in your country to help integrating third country migrants in the labour market. Please, colour the box of the measures that have been applied in your country and further on describe more details on these measures (content, stakeholders involved, target groups etc) in the box below.

**Existing measures aimed at overcoming intrinsic barriers in your country:**
- Pre-arrival training;
- Training courses for third country migrants aimed at learning skills in sectors with a lack of supply;
- Job-seeking courses;
- Labour cost subsidies to employers;
- Other:

Add text

**Existing measures aimed at overcoming institutional barriers in your country:**
- Easing visa procedures for job seeking third country migrants;
- Offering support to third country national entrepreneurs;
- Other:

Add text
8. Selection of three to five approaches that are innovative in your country that deserve further analysis in the in-depth phase of the study

We would like to ask you to identify a minimum of three and a maximum of five innovative approaches (any project, policy or solution) that are truly helpful to third country migrants trying to integrate in the labour market.

The innovative approaches to be selected need to meet a number of criteria:

- It aims specifically at third country migrants or a target group third country migrants are part of;
- It contributes to surmounting third country migrants’ barriers in seeking, finding and keeping a job;
- It carries out a clear or renewing vision on the topic;
- The conditions under which the approach operates are specified;
- The processes and procedures that are followed are carefully registered;

In order to assure that we collect a wide variety of approaches, we would like to ask you to describe distinct approaches (based on specific target groups, types of barriers addressed, and type of approach). We would also like to ask you to describe minimally one “exotic” approach that is relatively new yet promising.

We would like to ask you to provide a short description of these approaches of the following topics:

- Problem definition (policy problem and target groups)
- Approach (description of the method / instrument / policy etc.)
- Results / achievements / evaluation
Case 1
Add text

Case 2
Add text

Case 3
Add text

Case 4
Add text

Case 5
Add text

9. Overview literature (sources used)
Add text
Annex 6 Format in-depth case studies

Innovative approaches towards successful integration of migrants in the labour market

Format in-depth case studies

Background information
Name case study:
Name country expert:
INTRODUCTION

- **Policy context** - Immigration and in particular the integration of third country migrants into the labour market is increasingly gaining political importance on the European and Member States’ agendas. Against the background of ageing European societies and of growing labour market needs, Europe looks likely to rely more on immigration and at the same time integration of third country migrants into the labour market to balance supply and demand in labour markets, and more generally to fuel economic growth. However, statistics show that third country migrants’ labour market situation is worse than that of non third country migrants in many Member States - they tend to have much lower employment rates than the EU nationals and are often more exposed to being employed in jobs for which they are over-qualified. Labour market participation is very important for the integration of third country migrants in a host society. Active participation in the labour market entails contact with nationals and a more independent position for the third country migrant. However, to access the labour market, third country migrants have to overcome certain barriers that put them at a disadvantage compared to natives.

- **Study on innovative approaches** - Research voor Beleid (private company) is carrying out a study on innovative approaches towards successful integration of third country migrants in the labour market (assigned by DG Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities). Research voor Beleid (together with correspondents on country level – hereafter named country experts) will, by means of this study, provide a deeper understanding of the labour market situation of third country migrants in Europe and the most important barriers they face and examine innovative and practical ways to improve the integration of third country migrants into the labour market, from an economic and social point of view.

- **Third country migrants** - The total population resident in the EU can be divided into three basic groups based on place of birth:
  - Native-born – those born in the Member State of residence;
  - Other EU-born – those born in another EU Member State;
  - Non-EU-born – those born outside of the EU (third countries).

The latter two groups – although both ‘foreign-born’ – may have different residence and labour market rights, and differ in terms of labour market outcomes. In this study we focus on immigrants from non EU countries (hereafter referred to as ‘non-EU born’ or ‘third country migrants’). Within this broad group of third country migrants, special attention will be given to the following subgroups: (1) the most recent third-country migrants who have resided in a EU-27 country since 2000 but for a period longer than six months; (2) the more established third country migrants, residing in a EU-27 country from before 2000; and (3) to the specific challenges of certain sub-groups, based on gender, age, country of origin, socio-economic, religious or ethnic background, and reasons for migrating. Secondarily, when relevant and possible, attention will be given to the labour market situation and barriers of descendants of third country migrants (the 2nd and 3rd generation).

- **Labour market integration** - By integration into the labour market we mean achieving a situation whereby labour force outcomes for third country migrants are similar to those of corresponding native born. With this definition we concur with the point of view the European Commission adopts in its communication on ‘Migration and development’. The Commission finds that the positions third country migrants occupy entering a national labour market should reflect their qualifications, skills level and experience. As a consequence, successful labour market integration should entail the following:
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
- putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
- the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
- the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market.

In the interim phase of this study, all country experts drew up a country report, that included information on the labour market situation of third country migrants in their country, barriers they face on the labour market, and an inventory of practical and innovative approaches to overcome these barriers. One of these innovative approaches was selected for the in-depth case study (see your individual email), for which the instructions are provided below.

DATA COLLECTION
- **Case study** - Based on the ideas of Pawson & Tilley, Research voor Beleid developed a model for drawing up project reports that allow others (e.g. policy makers, project leaders) to determine the value of the specific project or policy and the possibilities for successfully transferring the approach to other combinations of target groups and circumstances. Useful project reports consist of the following elements:
  1. Problem definition
  2. Description of the approach
  3. Description of contextual factors
  4. Results
  5. Important lessons

**Your role as country expert:** The country experts will draw up a case report, based on the format provided below.

METHODS USED
- We would like to ask you, as national expert, to complete the format, by using as much factual information as possible by doing a literature study and using secondary data (policy documents, evaluation studies, statistics, reports etc.). In addition we like to ask you to carry out **minimal one interview** with the person responsible for implementing the measure. However, please take into account that you have a limited number of days to organize the country study (3 days per case). For describing the results we would like you to use **as much quantitative information as possible** (e.g. the number of third country migrants successfully employed).
- If you are using literature or data sources, please specify them in the text.

PLANNING
- The country experts need to finish the case studies before **Friday 18th September 2009**.

HELPDESK / CONTACT POINT
- In case you experience any problems with using the format or carrying out the country study, please do not hesitate to contact Bram Frouws of Research voor Beleid during working days on the following number and e-mail address: +31(0)79 322 2679 / b.frouws@research.nl
Format with questions for the in-depth case study

Please make sure to describe the full cycle of elements used in the approach. However, we are not only interested in the output of the approach (e.g. number of trainings provided or internships followed) but we are especially interested in the outcomes/results of the approach based on facts and figures (e.g. did the approach work, how many migrants found a (sustainable) job as a result of the approach). Moreover, please describe how these results correspond to what is known in international literature and policy studies about this or similar approaches. Thus, please put this case in a broader perspective.

1. Problem definition
Projects are generally initiated because of a problem that needs to be resolved. Some of the problems could be described as “the low employment rate of third-country migrants” or more specifically “the poor-language skills of newcomers”. The first thing policy and project developers usually do is to see if a similar problem has been addressed before and, if so, if it is possible to use the same approach again to resolve the problem. For project developers to fully determine this, they need to know why and for whom projects have been devised as well as what problem the project addresses.

Questions for the problem definition:
- What was the immediate cause for starting up the project?
- What problem does the project address (labour market situation and barriers)?
- What is the scope of the problem?
- What supposedly caused this problem?
- Which target group(s) is the approach devised for?
- Is this problem specific for the above described target group or more generic?

Add text

2. Approach
After the question of the problem has been established, the next step is to discover how to solve the problem. The chosen approach constitutes the essence of the project. It tells us what activities have been performed and what line of reasoning underlies this approach. When disseminating best practices this is very important information.
3. Contextual factors

No two situations are equal. The changing context in which a project operates can lead to failure when transferring approaches to a different situation without taking contextual factors into account. The new context may not offer the right set of conditions for the approach to have an effect. This is why it is important to also focus on the contextual factors when writing a project report. This may concern the characteristics of the project organisation (e.g. budget and people) but also uncontrollable outside influences that have to be recorded. Contextual factors can have a positive or a negative influence. Both types are relevant for dissemination purposes.

Questions for the contextual factors:

- What conditions have influenced the project?
- What factors improved the success of the project?
- What factor put a check on the success of the project?
- Are these factors specific for this case or generic compared to other cases described in the literature?
Questions for the results:
- What (labour market integration) goals have been set out for the project?:
  - high employment rates, and low unemployment rates, for third country migrants;
  - retention of third country migrant workers in employment;
  - putting third country migrant workers’ human capital to good use;
  - the integration of third country migrant workers into high-quality employment;
  - the provision of equal rights and opportunities for third country migrant workers in the labour market;
  - ..... 
- To what extent have these goals been achieved?
- To what extent has the defined problem been resolved?
- How many migrants (participants) found a job after completing the trajectory (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- How many of them have a sustainable job (employed longer than half year) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- If participants were already having a job, how many migrants (participants) found a better job after completing the trajectory (upwards mobility) (absolute and relative compared to the total number of participants)?
- Please specify whether the results described above are the result of the approach (direct / indirect)?
- Are there any differences in results among different target groups?
- How do these outcomes compare to what is known about the effectiveness of this or similar approaches in the international literature and policy studies?

5. Important lessons
A project report is an important way to share knowledge gained by executing the project with others. Elements one to four focus mainly on the collection of data necessary to construct a complete image of the project and its success. However, it does not leave much room for those who executed the project to share their “lessons”. The last element of the project report should therefore focus on the valuable lessons learnt during the course of the project that can influence development decisions for new projects.

Questions for important lessons:
- What are the success and fail factors of this approach (e.g. measure; financial, human and organisational resources; target groups; implementation; stakeholders involved; contextual)?
- What can others learn from this particular project?
- To what extent is the approach transferable to other situations (i.e. for other barriers/problems, for other target groups, with other organisations or in other countries)? What helps and what does not?
- What should project executors bear in mind when applying the approach in their own project?
6. Overview literature (sources used)

Add text
Annex 7 Overview and long-list of approaches

In this annex we present an overview of the 47 approaches that were identified in the country studies. We start with a graphic representation of the most occurring target groups, barriers or elements of approaches within the set of 47 approaches. As noted earlier, it might be the case that the expert did not describe each target group, barrier or element of the approaches when providing an overall description. However, it could be assumed that for each topic, those aspects on which the focus lies most, are highlighted. In this way, it becomes visible whether the described approaches are targeted towards the most frequently occurring barriers and target groups and whether the elements of the approaches deal with these barriers.

**Target groups**

Below we present an overview of the target groups the approaches aim at and the number of times these were mentioned. Because one approach might be targeted towards multiple target groups, the total number of target groups exceeds the total number of approaches (47).

**Figure A6.1** Target groups the innovative approaches aim at
Barriers
Below the barriers the described approaches aim at are presented visually. In clustering the approaches according to the barriers, the classification of barriers used in the previous section is followed. As one approach may focus on several barriers, again the total number of barriers in the figure below exceeds the total number of approaches.

Figure A6.2  Barriers the innovative approaches aim at

Elements of the approach
The figure below provides an overview of the different elements of the approaches. Obviously most approaches, if not all, consist of a combination of elements. Therefore, again the total number of elements of the approach in this figure far exceeds the total number of approaches.

Figure A6.3  Elements of the approaches
## Innovative approaches (country, name, barrier, target group, elements of the approach, innovative aspects)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nr.</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Approach</th>
<th>Barrier</th>
<th>Target Group</th>
<th>Elements of the Approach</th>
<th>Innovative aspects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>Free courses on Estonian Constitution and Law</td>
<td>Lack of language skills</td>
<td>Third country citizens and people without citizenship (often Russians)</td>
<td>Courses on Estonian Constitution and Law, to help passing the Estonian Language examination for becoming an Estonian citizen</td>
<td>Government shows interest in segregated group of people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>Reducing the risk of unemployment among young people who speak languages other than Estonian</td>
<td>Lack of language skills</td>
<td>Non-Estonian speaking people between 16-35</td>
<td>Job searching training, Career advice, Language training, Professional training, Acquiring work experience.</td>
<td>Government shows interest in segregated group of people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>In-service and language training for non-Estonian speaking unemployed people</td>
<td>Lack of language skills, Limited knowledge of the labour market (access)</td>
<td>Non-Estonian speaking unemployed people</td>
<td>In-service (practical) training, Language training, Job-seeking training, Professional training</td>
<td>Targeting specific risk groups. This group is often neglected and not accepted as an integral part of Estonian society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Job Centre Plus Refugee Operational Framework</td>
<td>Lack of language skills, Recognition of qualifications, Lack of professional and educational skills</td>
<td>Refugees</td>
<td>Strengthening partnership working between employment services and the voluntary and community sectors, Client centered individualized approach, Support and advice, Assistance to obtain the recognition of qualifications, Assistance in job-seeking, Local community based approach, Working together with refugees</td>
<td>Working together with refugees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>Strengthened partnership working in refugee and migrant integration in employment in London</td>
<td>Lack of coordination between organisations working on issues relating to refugees, Limited knowledge of the labour market (access)</td>
<td>Refugees</td>
<td>Establishment of a Meta-network, a forum for organisations with an interest in supporting refugees into employment, training and enterprise, to ensure better cooperation between the organisations responsible for the integration of migrants, Employment, training and business support directory, which lists service providers for refugees and asylum seekers, Business case for Employing London's Refugees</td>
<td>A Network that can act as a single voice and connects a wide range of organisations (refugee community organisations, training and further education providers, employers, funding bodies, unions, and professional bodies, within the public sector, community and voluntary organisations), The development of a business case</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>The journey to citizenship</td>
<td>Lack of educational and professional skills, Lack of language skills</td>
<td>Immigrants and refugees (not further specified)</td>
<td>Voluntary work, Training, Contract between immigrant and the UK society in which good behavior (for example engaging in the voluntary sector) is rewarded by and bad behavior punished by expediting or slowing down the citizenship acquisition process respectively</td>
<td>Shift from a policy framework that is designed simply to determine who can and cannot come to the UK, to a policy that actively promotes shared values and mutual benefit in accordance with the concept of earned citizenship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nr.</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Approach</td>
<td>Barrier</td>
<td>Target Group</td>
<td>Elements of the Approach</td>
<td>Innovative aspects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>UNIVA Network</td>
<td>Limited knowledge of the labour market (access)</td>
<td>Immigrants</td>
<td>A network of job-seeking help services, working in cooperation with job centers to facilitate access to employment</td>
<td>First specific service that targets immigrants who have difficulties accessing the labour market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Training and courses (job searching, application etc.)</td>
<td>Network is placed within organisations such as NGO’s and associations instead of general public institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Working with employers to promote immigrants employability</td>
<td>Network is located in areas with high immigrant concentration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Working with employers to promote immigrants employability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td>Program for the professional integration of immigrant doctors</td>
<td>Recognition of qualifications</td>
<td>Immigrants (refugees) with qualifications and professional experience as medical doctors who are currently residing and working in Portugal in other activities.</td>
<td>Attribution of scholarship (doctors)</td>
<td>Only office that caters towards the needs of immigrant entrepreneurs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Reimbursement administrative expenses related to the process of recognition of qualifications</td>
<td>Creates alternatives for immigrant while at the same time contributing to the generation of further employment and new businesses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Voluntary work and traineeships</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td>Office for the support of immigrant entrepreneurship:</td>
<td>Barriers in setting up own business: (limited knowledge on necessary bureaucratic procedures, lack of language skills, difficulties in accessing funding)</td>
<td>Immigrants who wish to set up their own business</td>
<td>Support in specifying the business project</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Small scale funding (microcredit)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td>Novas Oportunidades</td>
<td>Lack of professional and educational skills</td>
<td>Adult, both native born and foreign born (immigrants proportion of applicants has been low).</td>
<td>Training and education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Validation of previous skills/professional experiences (mostly obtained on the job).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>First time that newcomers are really welcomed and taken care of at the beginning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>Competence Centre for New Immigrants</td>
<td>Recognition of qualifications</td>
<td>New immigrants who have been in Austria for less than five years (also new immigrants from the EU)</td>
<td>Helping immigrants to get recognition of qualifications</td>
<td>Very close and personal contact between an experienced mentor and a migrant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Training (and finding financial support)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td>Mentoring for migrants</td>
<td>Limited knowledge of the labour market (access)</td>
<td>Not targeted exclusively towards third country migrants but the majority of participants are from outside the EU-27</td>
<td>Mentor system (experienced managers provide targeted support in the job search to migrants, through very close and direct contact).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td>OIF Jobcenter</td>
<td>Limited knowledge of the labour market (access)</td>
<td>Recognized refugees and persons who are granted subsidiary protection</td>
<td>Coaches at a Job Center</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Job orientation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Advice about further education and qualification</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Job searching skills (concrete help while looking for a job)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Making employers aware of the competences of the applicants</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ongoing application training</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td>Networking for and with girls with a migration background</td>
<td>Limited social and professional network</td>
<td>Girls and young women with a migration background (second or third generation)</td>
<td>Mentoring</td>
<td>Difficult to reach target group (girls, young women)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Individual coaching</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Group work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Workshops on labour market issues</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Creating a network</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nr.</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Approach</td>
<td>Barrier</td>
<td>Target Group</td>
<td>Elements of the Approach</td>
<td>Innovative aspects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>Intercultural Centre of Occupational Adaptation</td>
<td>Discrimination</td>
<td>Immigrants, including refugees and repatriates</td>
<td>Training courses and studies, Centre for Professional Advice, Assistance and intervention in crisis situations regarding discrimination, Publication of manuals, Seminars and conferences</td>
<td>Also focused at social work officers who have to cope with the problems encountered by migrants in Poland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>HELP</td>
<td>Limited knowledge of the labour market (access)</td>
<td>Third country migrants</td>
<td>Psychological counseling legal assistance, Training courses, Community program with volunteers, Assistance in accessing information</td>
<td>No similar service in national service system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td>On migrant children for teachers</td>
<td>Limited social integration</td>
<td>Teachers that deal with immigrant children</td>
<td>Teacher training (developed by themselves), Seminar</td>
<td>Train the trainer method</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td>Promoting the integration of migrants by reducing discrimination</td>
<td>Discrimination</td>
<td>Migrants living in Hungary</td>
<td>Provide legal representation to victims of discrimination, Monitoring network of organisations, dealing with discriminations, Campaign</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td>Individually – with equal chances</td>
<td>Lack of professional and educational skills, Limited knowledge of the labour market (advancement)</td>
<td>Asylum seekers</td>
<td>Professional training, Entrepreneurial training, Intercultural training</td>
<td>Special emphasis made on the entrepreneurship module, The intercultural training motivates the participants to perceive the cultural patterns more consciously and to acquire such skills that assist them to cooperate with the local employers, colleagues and clients</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>Raising the number of migrants working in the public service in Bremen</td>
<td>Limited knowledge of the labour market (access), Lack of language skills, Discrimination</td>
<td>Immigrants (both first and second generation, also naturalized ones) and late repatriates</td>
<td>Language classes, Seminars devoted to practical skills (job seeking, applying for job etc.), Courses that extended theoretical and general knowledge required in the public sector, Use of role models (persons with migration background employed in the public sector), Internship</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td></td>
<td>Credit Campaign for Migrant Entrepreneurs</td>
<td>Limited credit availability, Difficulties related to establishment and long-term sustainability of business (intercultural competences in business negotiations)</td>
<td>Women with migration background</td>
<td>Lobbying at banks, Publication and distribution of materials presenting successful immigrant entrepreneurs, Stakeholder meetings (local entrepreneurs and banks), Individualized support of immigrants establishing a business or applying for credit, Distribution of small credits, Organisation of seminars teaching intercultural competences in business negotiations</td>
<td>Making use of success stories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nr.</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Approach</td>
<td>Barrier</td>
<td>Target Group</td>
<td>Elements of the Approach</td>
<td>Innovative aspects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Recognition of qualifications acquired abroad:</td>
<td>■ Recognition of qualifications</td>
<td>Not specified</td>
<td>■ Liberalizing the existing law and harmonizing some of the procedures on the national and EU level, regarding the recognition of qualifications</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>4-part labour market agreement</td>
<td>■ Limited cooperation between stakeholders ■ Lack of qualifications ■ Lack of professional and educational skills ■ Lack of language skills</td>
<td>Immigrants and refugees</td>
<td>■ Agreement between the government, employers in the municipalities, the private sector, the regional level and labour unions ■ Combination of different instruments, such as guidance, upgrading of skills, practical training, wage subsidy etc. ■ Job-packages for different sectors ■ Mentorship ■ Network for immigrant women</td>
<td>Cooperation between stakeholders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Project Shaq</td>
<td>Employers’ negative impression of Somali immigrants (discrimination) ■ Limited knowledge of the labour market (access)</td>
<td>Unemployed immigrants from Somalia</td>
<td>■ Immigrants from Somalia help other Somali immigrants ■ Mouth-to-mouth method: contact to the labour market is established through informal channels ■ Practical, spontaneous and informal approach, based on voluntary participation ■ Education courses</td>
<td></td>
<td>■ Practical, spontaneous and informal approach, based on voluntary participation ■ Exploiting informal mechanisms can be very promising for certain groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Labour market oriented bridge building courses</td>
<td>■ Lack of language skills (Danish language relevant for the labour market) ■ Limited knowledge of the labour market (advancement)</td>
<td>Newly arrived immigrants with poor language skills</td>
<td>■ Learning the Danish language during practical experience on the labour market ■ Language training ■ Practical training ■ Participants meet to discuss their experiences</td>
<td></td>
<td>■ Labour market training and language training are combined</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>The Netherlands</td>
<td>Working in the Netherlands (WIN)</td>
<td>■ Limited knowledge of the labour market (access) ■ Lack of language skills ■ Limited cooperation between stakeholders</td>
<td>New migrants and migrants already living in the Netherlands</td>
<td>■ Language training ■ Internship ■ Job orientation ■ Individual courses (e.g. job application) ■ Job mediation, job placement and follow up care ■ Involving businesses</td>
<td>■ Simultaneously combines language training, vocational education and job-searching capabilities ■ Job market (speed-dating between employers and participants)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Showing what you can</td>
<td>■ Lack of social and professional network ■ Lack of language skills ■ Limited knowledge of the labour market (both access and advancement)</td>
<td>Highly educated migrants (also born in the Netherlands with at least one parent born abroad).</td>
<td>■ Monthly meetings between candidates and employers ■ network structure in which mentors from businesses provide individual guidance and language training. ■ Network training</td>
<td></td>
<td>■ Network with mentors from businesses ■ Cultural differences course (focus on business culture and application behavior)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Working together in color</td>
<td>■ Lack of educational and professional skills ■ Non-stimulating home environment ■ Limited knowledge of the labour market (access)</td>
<td>Black, migrant and refugee women not entitled to social benefit</td>
<td>■ Family, individual and group coaching, successful role models ■ mediation ■ Coaches have an immigrant background the-themselves (role models) ■ Education ■ Job searching training ■ Internship</td>
<td></td>
<td>■ Cooperation with local organisations, mosques and community centers ■ Immigrant coaches ■ Employers sign intention agreement that the immigrant women can apply as internal candidate after the internship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nr.</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Approach</td>
<td>Barrier</td>
<td>Target Group</td>
<td>Elements of the Approach</td>
<td>Innovative aspects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
<td>Crown on employment</td>
<td>Lack of language skills, Limited knowledge of the labour market, Limited social and professional network, Limited cooperation between stakeholders, Negative impression of migrants by employers</td>
<td>Refugees and migrants</td>
<td>Mentors (social support and labour market knowledge), Interculturalisation courses for employers</td>
<td>Also focus on employers through interculturalisation course, with emphasis on added value of diversity at work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>We can Together</td>
<td>Working conditions</td>
<td>Immigrant women working in care services</td>
<td>Legal qualification of the family care work (often done by immigrant women), City register of family care workers, Call centre to match supply and demand of the now official immigrant family care workers, Training, Paying part of social security contributions</td>
<td>Training of immigrant women, Not only providing benefits to the families but to the immigrant family care workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td></td>
<td>Employment and services to persons</td>
<td>Working conditions</td>
<td>Disadvantaged workers, including immigrant workers</td>
<td>Desks in order to assist families in taking care of their elderly and to assist foreign care worker in search of job, thereby matching care work demand and supply</td>
<td>The legal transition of an irregular market in which many immigrant women were working (family care work) to a regular work market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chain-based employment model</td>
<td>Seasonal work, Limited cooperation between stakeholders</td>
<td>Immigrants</td>
<td>Partnerships between local bodies, associations of entrepreneurs, and non-profit organisations, Training participants as experts who can work throughout the products life cycle</td>
<td>Training immigrant working as seasonal workers so that they are able to work throughout the products life cycle, and not lose their job once the season is over</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>Integration Centre of the State Agency for Refugees</td>
<td>Lack of language skills, Recognition of qualifications, Limited knowledge of the labour market (both access and advancement)</td>
<td>Refugees</td>
<td>Provision of benefits, Assistance with labour market registration, Training courses</td>
<td>One of the first programs targeting at refugees and migrants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td></td>
<td>Legal Clinic University of Sofia</td>
<td>Lack of educational and professional skills, Legislations (unsettled legal status)</td>
<td>Refugees, asylum seekers, legal migrants, semi-legal and undocumented migrants</td>
<td>Free legal assistance</td>
<td>First project that provides free legal assistance regardless of their immigration status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>Developing entrepreneurial initiatives among immigrants</td>
<td>Not specified</td>
<td>Immigrants</td>
<td>Access to low-cost long-term financing, Counseling, Supervision of entrepreneurial projects</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td></td>
<td>Socio-Labor Insertion of the Immigrant Community</td>
<td>Limited knowledge of the labour market (access), Lack of professional and educational skills</td>
<td>Immigrants seeking employment</td>
<td>Providing information on the labour market, training and conditions access, support immigrants in the creation of self employment, Training, Personalized tutoring</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td></td>
<td>On the Web, for Employment</td>
<td>Limited knowledge of the labour market (access)</td>
<td>Immigrants (mainly women)</td>
<td>Information on various training possibilities and job search, individualized and group follow-up attention</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nr.</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Approach</td>
<td>Barrier</td>
<td>Target Group</td>
<td>Elements of the Approach</td>
<td>Innovative aspects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>France</td>
<td>ZUS</td>
<td>Cheap housing conditions, accumulation of poverty and marginality</td>
<td>People living in sensitive urban zones; newly arrived immigrants</td>
<td>Fiscal exonerations for inhabitants and employers within ZUS</td>
<td>Working on economic dimensions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Fiscal exonerations and administrative facilitations for new activities for newly established companies in ZUS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Employers outside ZUS can be exonerated their social security when employing people under 25 from ZUS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td></td>
<td>Selective use of the integration contract</td>
<td>Lack of language skills, Limited civic knowledge</td>
<td>Third country migrants</td>
<td>Language training, Civic integration courses, Integration contracts (with the possibility to not renew the residence permit if the migrant does not invest in his/her problems)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
<td>Co-development – &quot;cartes talents et compétences&quot;</td>
<td>Not specified</td>
<td>Students from Congo and labour migrants from the Philippines</td>
<td>Easing visa procedures to attract specific skilled young migrants</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>Qualification+</td>
<td>Recognition of qualifications</td>
<td>People living and working in Switzerland with diplomas that are not recognized. Not only migrants, but they represent half of the participants</td>
<td>Service to evaluate and certificate professional experience, Initiating processes for recognition of qualifications</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td></td>
<td>Selective use of the integration contract</td>
<td>Integrations problems (e.g. language)</td>
<td>Third country migrants</td>
<td>Individual programs, Integration contracts (with the possibility to not renew the residence permit if the migrant does not invest in his/her problems)</td>
<td>Development of specific individual programs to overcome integration problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td></td>
<td>Camarada</td>
<td>Discrimination</td>
<td>Immigrant women (in particular from Africa)</td>
<td>Teachings and exchanges in a discrimination free space</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>Legitimation.nu</td>
<td>Lack of language skills, Limited knowledge of the labour market (advancement), Recognition of qualifications</td>
<td>Refugees or relatives of refugees with a non-European degree in the health sector</td>
<td>Language training, Vocational training, Practical training, Shortening the road to Swedish certification for doctors and nurses with foreign degrees</td>
<td>Combination of education/training and recognition of qualifications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td></td>
<td>Integrationsmentor</td>
<td>Limited social integration</td>
<td>Employees who work with customers/client from different ethnic and cultural backgrounds</td>
<td>In service training (for employees who work with people from different ethnic backgrounds)</td>
<td>Improving integration indirectly through training for native employees who deal with immigrants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td></td>
<td>SPIRA project</td>
<td>Lack of language skills, Lack of diversity within the police force</td>
<td>Unemployed persons with a foreign background (with interest in police work)</td>
<td>Preparatory course for admission to the police academy (for people with a foreign background)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td></td>
<td>New-start Jobs</td>
<td>Large distance to the labour market</td>
<td>People who had received unemployment benefit, sickness benefit, disability pension or social assistance for more than a year. Foreign born constitute about one third of the beneficiaries of the scheme</td>
<td>Employer contributions rebate (labour cost subsidy)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annex 8 Literature

General literature


COM (2001) 386
COM (2003) 336
COM (2005) 0123
COM (2005) 390
COM (2005) 391
COM (2005) 669
COM (2006) 735
COM (2007) 247
COM (2007) 248
COM (2007) 780
COM (2008) 69
COM (2008) 359
COM (2008) 420
COM (2008) 868/3
COM (2009)647 Consultation on the future “EU2020” strategy

Council Document 10504/07 of 7 June 2007


Jean, S., Causa, O., Jimenez, M., Wanner, I., MIGRATION IN OECD COUNTRIES: LABOUR MARKET IMPACT AND INTEGRATION ISSUES ECONOMICS DEPARTMENT WORKING PAPERS No. 562 (OECD, 2007)


MEMO/07/06, Funding opportunities in the Justice, Freedom and Security Policy Areas (2007-2013)


Penninx, R. Evaluation of the on-stop-shop project. February 2009.


SEC(2008) 2626
15251/08 MIGR 108 SOC 668


Internet sources

http://www.eurofound.europa.eu/areas/populationandsociety/clip.htm


http://internationalezaken.szw.nl/index.cfm?fuseaction=dsp_document&link_id=66722&rubriek_id=13002&lijstk=0


Literature used for the 15 country studies

AUSTRIA


---

1 Literature used to carry out the in-depth case studies could be found in the individual case study reports in annex 2.
BULGARIA

Centre for Study of Democracy (2003) The Informal Economy in the EU Accession Countries, Sofia: CSD (in Bulgarian)
IMIR (2007) Bulgaria Country Report, WP2, Undocumented Workers Transition project, 6th EU FP
Krasteva, A. (ed.) (2005a) Immigration in Bulgaria, Sofia: IMIR (in Bulgarian only)


DENMARK


Hansen, H (2006). From asylum seeker to refugee to family reunification: Welfare payments in these situations in various Western Countries, Copenhagen: The Rockwool Foundation Research Unit.


Ugebrevet A4: 4.5.2009: *Indvandrere klarer krisen bedst*

**Internet sources Denmark**

www.statistikbanken.dk
http://www.vip2.dk

**ESTONIA**

Eestlaste ja mitte-eestlaste lõimumine ja positsioon tööturul. Siim Krusell, Eesti Statistika 2007


Estonian Human Development Report 2008” Publisher: Eesti Ekspressi Kirjastuse AS Copyright: Authors, Estonian Cooperation Assembly, 2009 Printing house


Integratsioon tööterul, Vajadus ja teostatavusuruingu lõpparuanne Sten Anspal, Praxis 2008, Tartu Ülikool, Balti Uuringute Instituut, Geomeedia, Hill and Knowlton

Miks venelased teenivad nii vähe? Eesti Päevaleht: (http://www.epl.ee/arvamus/396892)

Mitte-eestlaste perspektiivid, elanikkonna küsitlus kevad 2006, Saar Poll

Muulaste olukord Eesti tööturul, võrdlevaid aspekte Lätiga. Urmas Piik, Riigiteaduste Instituut, Bakalaureusetöö 2008

Tallinna Kodurahu Programm, Rahuliku Kooselamise Programm 2008-2013 (www.kodurahu.eu)


Vene Naised Eesti Tööturul. Natalia Karotam, Tallinna Tehnikaülikool 2006

**Internet sources Estonia**

Estonian Citizenship and Migration Board (http://www.mig.ee/index.php/mg/eng)
Estonica: http://www.estonica.org


Integration Foundation of Estonia (http://www.meis.ee/eng/)


**Other sources Estonia (e.g. interviews)**

- Jaan Urvet – Advisor on Integration at the Tallinn City Government
- Harri Taliga – Head of Confederation of Estonian Trade Unions
- Eva-Maria Asari – Concellor on Integration to the Minister of Population and Ethnic Affairs
- Iris Pettai - Head researcher at Estonian Open Society Institute
- Vadim Polištšuk – Researcher at the Legal Information Centre For Human Rights

**FRANCE**


GERMANY

Bevölkerung und Erwerbstätigkeit: Ausländische Bevölkerung/ Ergebnisse des Ausländerzentralregisters, Statistisches Bundesamt, Fachserie 1, Reihe 2, Wiesbaden 2009 (Population and Employment: Foreigners. Results of Immigrants' Register)

Bildung in Deutschland 2008, Deutsche Institut für Internationale Pädagogische Forschung, 2008 (Education in Germany, an annual report of the German Institute for International Research in Pedagogy).

Der Nationale Integrationsplan – Neue Wege, Neue Chancen, July 2007 (The National Integration Plan – New Ways, New Challenges)

Gesemann, F and Roth, R 'Lokale Integrationspolitik in der Einwanderungsgesellschaft', Vs Verlag, 2009 (Local Integration Politics in Immigrant Society).

National census 2005.

Rockwool Migration Survey for Germany and Denmark 2005, quoted from the report "Zuwanderungsmotive und Erwerbseinkommen von Migranten" (Reasons for migration and income among migrants), K. Brenke, A. Constant and K. Zimmermann, Deutsches Institut für Wirtschaftsforschung, Nr. 46/2005.


Zuwanderungsmotive und Erwerbseinkommen von Migranten, K. Brenke, A. Constant, K. Zimmermann, Deutsches Institut für Wirtschaftsforschung, Nr. 46/2005 (Reasons for Migration and Income Among Migrants).

**Internetsources Germany**

www.intqua.de

**Other sources Germany**


Staatsangehörigkeitsgesetz, StAG 1/1/2005 (National Citizenship Act)

**HUNGARY**

Annual Report FRA 2008


From Improvisation towards Awareness? Contemporary Migration Politics in Hungary. Fullerton, Maryellen, Endre Sik, Judit Tóth (eds.), HAS PTI, Budapest


ITALY


**THE NETHERLANDS**


CBS (2007), Jaarrapport Integratie, Centraal Bureau voor de Statistiek, Den Haag / Heerlen


**POLAND**


Gmaj, K. (2008) Discrimination in the Workplace and the Challenge of Migration: the Case of Poland (EMILIE project), Warsaw: Center for International Relations, unpublished manuscript


Grzymała-Kazłowska, A. (ed.) (2008a), Między jednością a wielością. Integracja omdniennych grup i kategorii imigrantów w Polsce [Between unity and multiplicity. Integration of different groups and categories of immigrants in Poland]. Warszawa: Ośrodek Badań nad Migracjami UW.


Kaczmarczyk, P. & M. Okólski (2006), Rozszerzenie UE a mobilność zagraniczna obywateli Bułgarii i Rumunii [The EU Enlargement and the external mobility of the citizens of Bulgaria and Romania], Analysis for the Office of the Committee of the European Integration (unpublished manuscript).


Kaczmarczyk, P. & M. Okólski (eds.) (2008b), Polityka migracyjna jako instrument promocji zatrudnienia i ograniczania bezrobocia [Migration policy as an instrument of employment promotion and unemployment reduction]. Warszawa: Ośrodek Badań nad Migracjami UW.


PORTUGAL

ACIDI, IP (High Commissioner for Immigrants and Intercultural Dialogue) – url: www.acidi.gov.pt

SEF (Foreign National and Borders Control Service) – url: www.sef.pt

INE (National Statistics Institute) – url: www.ine.pt

Foundation Calouste Gulbenkian – url: www.gulbenkian.pt


Employment in Europe 2008


Padilla 2005 – integration of Brazilian immigrants in Portuguese society: problems and possibilities, socius working paper no. 01/05, Lisbon.


**SPAIN**

BOJA, Andalucía, Spain

BOE, Spain

BOA, Aragón, Spain

DOG, Galicia, Spain

BORM, Murcia, Spain

DOCV, Valencia, Spain

DOCM, Castilla La Mancha, Spain

BOCM, Madrid, Spain

Guidelines for Population, INE, Spain

Survey of Active Population, INE, Spain

Annual Statistical Report on Immigration, MTIN, Spain

National Survey of Immigrants, INE, Spain

Annual Statistical Report, MTIN, Spain

Survey of Salary Structure, INE, Spain

Survey on labor conditions for immigrants in Spain

Catalogue of difficult-to-fill occupations, MTIN, Spain
SWITZERLAND


IMES, Bundesamt für Zuwanderung, Integration und Auswanderung (2004). Bericht zur illegalen Migration. [Bern]: [s.n.].


SECO, Staatssekretariat für Wirtschaft, Bundesamt für Migration BFM et Bundesamt für Statistik BFS (2007). Auswirkungen der Personenfreizügigkeit auf den Schweizer


SWEDEN


DO, Ombudsman of ethnic discrimination (www.do.se).
DS 2007:04 Arbetsutbud och sysselsättning bland personer med utländsk bakgrund.


European Commission, The "Employment in Europe 2008" was prepared by Directorate-General for Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities; Employment Analysis Unit.

Ekberg, Jan & Ohlsson, M (2000), 'Flyktingars arbetsmarknad är inte alltid nattsvart', Ekonomisk Debatt, vol. 28, nr. 5.

Ekberg, J. (1997) Hur är arbetsmarknaden för den andra generationens invandrare? (How is the labor market situation among the second-generation immigrants?), Arbetsmarknad och Arbetsliv, 3, pp. 5–16.


LO (2007b), LO Platform (LOs platform-In Swedish), 2007


Statistics Sweden (SCB), 2008, Educational attainment of immigrants compared to the total of the population by gender at: http://www.ssd.scb.se/databaser/makro/Produkt.asp?produktid=UF0506

Migrant Integration Policy Index (www.integrationindex.eu)


Sydsvenskan, Granath, Claus, Daily newspaper, article on the project “operation" 30-04-2008.


**UNITED KINGDOM**


ONS. (2007a). Total International Migration (TIM).


