IMPROVING GOVERNANCE OF TENURE

FAO AND WORLD BANK EXPERIENCE IN EUROPE AND CENTRAL ASIA

Rumyana Tonchovska, Senior Land Administration Officer - IT, FAO of the UN
Kathrine Kelm, Senior Land Administration Specialist, World Bank
The world today faces many complex challenges...

Many of these challenges have clear land dimension.

Responding to these challenges is difficult when the governance of tenure is weak!
Governance is the way in which access to and control over natural resources is managed in a society. It includes how competing priorities and interests of different groups are reconciled. Responsible Governance is about doing the right thing and doing it well.

Tenure: How people get access to natural resources - Who can use what resources, for how long, and under what conditions

Tenure Systems define and regulate how people, communities and others gain access to natural resources.
PROBLEMS OF WEAK GOVERNANCE

-Inequitable access
-Discrimination
-State capture

Tenure rights not recognized
Forced eviction
Limited capacity
Bribery

Increasing competition for natural resources:
- Population growth
- Urbanization
- Changing diets
- Demand for energy

Governing institutions have not adapted to growing intensity of competition

Expensive and difficult procedures
No accountability or transparency
Contradictory laws and policies
AN UNPRECEDENTED INTERNATIONAL AGREEMENT ON GOVERNANCE OF TENURE – AND UNPRECEDENTED RECOGNITION

- Endorsed by CFS May 2012
- Implementation encouraged by G8, G20, Rio+20, Francophone Parliamentary Assembly, UN General Assemblies and Berlin Agriculture Ministers’ Summits
- Major civil society activities on governance of tenure: Oxfam ‘Behind the Brands’
- High profile private sector endorsements: CocaCola Corp; PepsiCo
- Endorsed by World Bank
- FAO priority and mainstreaming
The first global soft law instrument on tenure

Negotiated by governments; participation of civil society and private sector

Consensus on “internationally accepted practices” that already exist.

A reference for improving the governance of land, fisheries and forest tenure
Part 6: Responses to climate change and emergencies

- Climate change.
- Natural disasters.
- Conflicts.

Part 7: Promotion, implementation, monitoring and evaluation
### INFORMATION SHARING

#### A taste of the language of the VG

**VG para 6.5.** “States should establish policies and laws to promote the sharing, as appropriate, of spatial and other information on tenure rights for the effective use by the State and implementing agencies, indigenous peoples and other communities, civil society, the private sector, academia and the general public...”

**VG, par. 17.4.** “...As part of broader public information sharing, records of tenure rights should be available to State agencies and local governments to improve their services. Information should be shared in accordance with national standards, and include disaggregated data on tenure rights.”
Implementation Programme - 5 Pillars

- Awareness raising
- Capacity development
- Support to countries
- Partnerships
- Monitoring
Building on the consensus
AWARENESS RAISING AROUND THE GLOBE

So far:

- 10 Awareness raising workshops in progress around the globe
- 17 Country-level workshops requested
- 53 Briefings in 33 countries completed
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Available/Forthcoming</th>
<th>Underway</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Gender (e/s/f)</td>
<td>6. Legal implications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Governance of forest tenure</td>
<td>7. Pastoralism &amp; Rangelands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. FPIC</td>
<td>8. Tenure of commons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Governance of small scale fisheries tenure</td>
<td>9. Enabling technologies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Agricultural Investments</td>
<td>10. Private sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11. Registration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
E-learning

- Introduction to the responsible governance of tenure
- Addressing disputes and conflicts over the tenure of natural resources
- Addressing corruption in the tenure of land, fisheries and forests
- Tenure issues in the context of natural disasters
- Making tenure rights more secure
- Planning and administering for better governance of tenure
- Markets and investments
- Assessing country situation with respect to the VGGT
- Monitoring and promoting policy change
- Gender and land

Available in English, French and Spanish

www.fao.org/nr/tenure/e-learning
Support to Countries

Donor Land Governance Programmes Map

Donors:
- Austria
- Belgium
- Canada
- Denmark
- European Union
- FAO
- Finland
- France
- Germany
- IFAD
- Japan
- Netherlands
- Sweden
- Switzerland
- United Kingdom
- United States
- World Bank

Total amount of investments:
2.8 billion dollars
(445 projects in 119 countries)

See the map at: http://landgov.donorplatform.org/
Partnerships

Plus
Partnerships with stakeholders developed through the FAO Office for Partnerships (OPC)
Monitoring

CFS
Committee on World Food Security

LGAF (testing)

GDWGL

Land Tenure Working Paper 22

MONITORING THE VOLUNTARY GUIDELINES ON THE RESPONSIBLE GOVERNANCE OF TENURE OF LAND FISHERIES AND FORESTS

A CIVIL SOCIETY PERSPECTIVE
WORLD BANK AND FAO
Land Tenure is recognised as the leading example of collaboration between the FAO and the World Bank through the CP.

It accounts for about 30% of the work delivered by FAO for the World Bank’s European and Central Asia (ECA) region.
World Bank – FAO partnership in the field of land tenure

Geographic scope of FAO inputs:
  36 countries

- **Africa:**
  Angola, Burkina Faso, Ethiopia, Ghana, Uganda, Malawi, Mozambique; Tanzania

- **East Asia and the Pacific:**
  Cambodia, Indonesia, Lao PDR, Philippines; China; Thailand

- **South Asia:**
  India, Sri Lanka

- **Europe and Central Asia:**
  Albania, Azerbaijan, Bulgaria, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, Kyrgyzstan, Moldova, Montenegro, Romania, Russian Federation, Serbia, Tajikistan, FYR Macedonia, Turkey, Ukraine, Kosovo;

- **Latin America and the Caribbean:**
  Honduras, Mexico, Nicaragua, Panama
1. Joint webinar series - 2014:
1.1. Using UAS for fast and low cost spatial data capturing – in English
1.2. Gender and Land – FAO/WB/Landesa – in English
1.3. Monitoring VG implementation at country level – in Russian and in English (sharing best practices: Ukraine, Georgia and Moldova) – participants from UNECE region and Africa

2. Joint Sessions at international conferences - 2014
2.1. EU INSPIRE 2014 – FAO/WB/Russian Federation/Ukraine and Macedonia
2.2. WB Land and Poverty conference - 2014

3. Joint Innovation work - 2014
UAS and Gender, new Property taxation

4. Joint Capacity Building materials
4.1. UAS – 3 videos – for decision makers, technical experts and project managers
4.2. Gender and Land – 1 video will be launched during the UN General Assembly side event on Sept. 23rd, plus 17 interviews are taken and will be posted on the social media in Nov.

5. Joint Workshops 2014 – Gender and Land, VG Awareness raising, Benchmarking Land Administration – Nov. 22-23, 2014 (WB/UNECE and FAO), SDI and Open Data (Nov. 3-5 - FAO/WB/EU JRC)

6. Joint Articles 2014 – Geo Spatial World magazine, GIS professional, VG Newsletter, WB Land and Poverty conference (3 joint articles)

7. Participation in the Bank Retreat 2014
Hard Talk Difficult issues in Land and Experts on Call - ICT
The World Bank/FAO Support to Land Administration in ECA Region

- 43 Land Administration Projects
- US$ 1.6 billion in loans and grants
- 30 Countries covered
- 15 ongoing projects - US$635.22 million
- 3 New projects in the pipeline
- 15 Research and Knowledge

- 56% utilized for ICT

Land area: 27,381,299 sq km
Population: 893,314,335
Properties registered: 300-400 million

Green and blue the support started before 2000, Brown and red – after 2000

New project will start in Uzbekistan
Doing Business 2015 Report

Where is easy to register property?

10 countries from Eastern Europe and Central Asia ranked in the top 20 economies

Ukraine - 158 in 2013; 98 in 2014 and 59 in 2015
Russia – 46 in 2013; 17 in 2014 and 12 in 2015 with a the goal to get to 5th by 2018

1. Georgia
3. Belarus
5. Norway
6. Kyrgyzstan
7. Armenia
8. Denmark
9. Lithuania
10. Azerbaijan
11. Slovakia
12. Russia (2013-46)
13. Estonia
15. Switzerland
16. Sweden
22. Moldova –19 in 2014

In the early 1990’s many of ECA countries did not have basic laws, institutions, trained personnel or even a vision of what they wanted to achieve in Land Management
IMPROVED GOVERNANCE OF TENURE
TRANSPERCNY & ACCESS TO INFORMATION
ALL ECA COUNTRIES HAVE PROPERTY REGISTRATION ICT SYSTEMS (except 2 countries)
MOST OF ECA COUNTRIES PROVIDE E-SERVICES

e-services: Albania, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Croatia, Estonia, Georgia, Kyrgyzstan, Latvia, Lithuania, Macedonia, Montenegro, Moldova, Serbia, Slovenia, Russia, Turkey, Ukraine

Services are the key- Technology is just the tool!
Land Sector is one of the most plagued by service-level bribery!

Only police and judiciary have higher level of bribery.

69 countries surveyed – 1 out of 10 responded that paid bribe to land authorities
The rate of briberies paid exceed tax, school, health, public utility
Corruption in land sector is a serious issue:
1 out of 2 in high income countries
4 out of 5 in low income countries

GLOBALY 34% of people consider corruption in the land sector serious.
Public access to information cuts the roads of corruption

- On-line records tracking system: Albania, Russian Federation, Ukraine;

- Minimized clients’ interaction with local offices through introduced simplified procedures and e-services: Albania, Bulgaria, Croatia, Georgia, Macedonia, Russia, Ukraine, Moldova, others.

- Tariffs, procedures and deadlines published on the Internet – in most of ECA countries

- Using Standardized Forms – Russia

- Random Case distribution – Russia

- Staff and Offices Performance Monitoring – Croatia, Russia, Ukraine, Albania

LAND is a diamond
INFORMATION is a power
CONTRIBUTION TO SOCIAL EQUITY
Main objectives: Streamline gender equality. Generate gender disaggregated data from the Land Administration IT systems and use them for evidence based policy making.
What disaggregated data show?

In ECA the legal base provides equal access to land for women and men. However the data shows that the laws are in contradiction with custom in some of the areas.

% of property registered to females as owners or co-owners

National level:
- Albania 29%,
- Bosnia and Herzegovina - Federation – 25%,
- Bosnia and Herzegovina - Republika Srpska – 30%,
- FYR Macedonia – 17%,
- Kosovo – 15%,
- Montenegro – 26%,
- Republic of Serbia – 36%,

Local/municipal level: Starts from 3% and goes to 48%.

Voluntary Guidelines, para 9.7: “Where constitutional or legal reforms strengthen the rights of women and place them in conflict with custom, all parties should cooperate to accommodate such changes in the customary tenure systems.”
IMPROVED SERVICES
Russia – New Cadastr and Registration System in operation since 2012

- **Extracts issued on-line** with digital signature or from any office for the entire territory of Russia in several minutes.

- **e-services represent 34%** of overall services and the plan is to reach 70% by 2018.

- **Reduced steps from 4 to 1 or 2**

- **Standard forms introduced** for all transactions. Cost and time reduced, in case of used standardized forms

- **Citizens do not need to bring documents, issued by Government or Municipal authorities**

Over 140 thousand applications have been installed with App Store;
Over 60 thousand applications have been installed for Android.
Ukraine - New Cadastre System in operation - January 2013

**Simplified procedure** for registering new property decreased steps from 5 to 2

**Decreased Time for registration**
reduced from several weeks to average 21 min

**Decreased waiting time**
from several hours to average 10 min

**Decreased Cost**
for extracts by 50%
for registration by 30%

**Data sharing** with Registration System and Notaries

Public Cadastre Map available on the WEB since January 1, 2013

Secrecy of coordinate system till 2012
1460 local coordinate systems till 2012
AZERBAIJAN
Multifunctional centers
and
Mobile Services for Remote Locations

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=av78W2sekIY
LINKING LAND ADMINISTRATION, GEOINFORMATION, SDI and INSPIRE...

Information produced and distributed by Cadastre and Land Registry organisations is an integral part of NSDI

**INSPIRE, ANNEX I THEMES**
- Coordinate reference systems
- Geographical grid systems
- Geographical names
- Administrative units
- Addresses
- Cadastral parcels

**INSPIRE, ANNEX II THEMES**
- Elevation,
- Orthoimagery

**ANNEX III THEMES**
- Buildings,
- Soil (in Ukraine)
- Land use,

The computerized multi-purpose cadastre is one tool for the efficient handling of land and property-related data that has potential to provide many benefits across all sections of the community by adding value through the combining of data sets and making these widely available.
SPATIAL DATA INFRASTRUCTURE (SDI) IN SUPPORT OF GOVERNANCE OF TENURE in ECA

- **SDI legal/regulatory base** - Croatia, Macedonia, Moldova, Serbia and Turkey, planned in Kosovo, Montenegro, Ukraine and Russian Federation.

- **SDI coordination mechanisms** - Albania, Croatia, Moldova, Serbia and Turkey, and are planned in Montenegro, Macedonia and Kosovo.

- **SDI strategies** - Croatia, Macedonia, Serbia and Turkey, Russia, planned in Montenegro and Ukraine. NSDI Concept prepared in Azerbaijan.

- **Geo-portals** are implemented in Bosnia and Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Croatia, Latvia, Lithuania, Macedonia, Montenegro, Moldova, Serbia, Slovenia, Russian Federation, Turkey, Ukraine, ready in Kosovo.

**Natural disasters have no borders:**

Western Balkans Regional SDI Initiative
KEY ISSUES:

DATA QUALITY & COMPLETENESS
- Crowd sourcing - online service for reporting errors

**During the first month:**
- 11,000 errors reported
- 8,000 corrected.

- 16.8 mil ownership documents (35 mil pages) scanned, indexed, data entered, verified, uploaded to a secure DB in 5 months.

- Created Unified Cadastre Map – 1,460 local coordinate systems transformed in unified system in 2013. Many errors identified and in process of correction

- Automatic tools for error identification, classification and correction created and piloted

**In Kiev:**
- Out of 88 reported errors, 56 were found to be similar.

The correction of 56 errors led to automatic correction of more than 2000 errors
The Challenge in Albania
INNOVATION WORK
Albania: Fast and Inexpensive Spatial Data Capture and Quality Improvement – Funds has been granted on May 30, 2013

Objective: To pioneer a scalable approach for use a small unmanned vehicle (UAV) to improve spatial data quality and completeness at a very high resolution, accuracy and low cost for multi-purpose use:

urban planning, infrastructure projects, taxation, resolving informal settlement tenure, monitoring climate change impacts, natural resource management.

Themes covered:
1. Peri-urban (Fushmanot municipality)
2. Intense-Urban (Farka municipality)
3. Environmental - Protected ecological zone (Tirana lake)
4. Infrastructure – road corridor (Tirana) and area of planed water supply

Coming soon: videos for decision makers, technical staff and Project Managers.
New opportunities for fast data quality improvement, new e-services and innovation
ALBANIA
PROPERTY REGISTRATION SYSTEM

Based on ISO 19152:2012
(Land Administration Domain Model)

Ready for integration with the Government e-Gateway
ONLINE searching, inquiring and receiving real estate property information

IMPROVING Data Quality and Completeness

New EU/World Bank financed pilot project for data quality improvement - 2014
NEW REQUESTS FOR SUPPORT

- **Enabling cross-sectoral policy** to promote good governance in land and natural resources
- **Support to natural resources management** to adopt and mitigate climate change and to ensure food security;
- **Improve local government revenues** through establishing property taxation and appraisal systems;
- **Improving the use and management of State owned land**;
- **Improve planning systems and coping with informal settlements**;
- **Establishing systems needed for European integration** to support the funds absorption under the **Common Agricultural Policy** and to implement the **INSPIRE and PSI directives**;
- **E-governance and evidence based policy making**
- **Spatial data infrastructure (SDI)**. This is required for all activities;
- **Data Quality Improvement**. This is required for all activities;
INNOVATION

DATA QUALITY & COMPLETENESS
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>World Bank Land Administration Projects in ECA</th>
<th>Project Timeframe (calendar years)</th>
<th>Project has NSDI Activities</th>
<th>Project does not have NSDI but client is interested to participate in NSDI activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>Land Administration Data Imporvement TA</td>
<td>NEW 2014-2016</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>Integrated Land Management Project</td>
<td>NEW 2016-2021</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>Real Estate Registration</td>
<td>closes 2015</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosnia</td>
<td>Real Estate Registration</td>
<td>2013-2018</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatia</td>
<td>Integrated Land Administration Project</td>
<td>2011-2015</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>Irrigation and Land Market Development</td>
<td>2014-2019</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kosovo</td>
<td>Real Estate Cadastre</td>
<td>2012-2015</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macedonia</td>
<td>Real Estate Cadastre and Registration</td>
<td>closes 2015</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montenegro</td>
<td>Land Administration and Management</td>
<td>closes 2015</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>Real Estate - Basis for National and EU Policies</td>
<td>2013-2015</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>Registration</td>
<td>closes 2015</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>Real Estate Management</td>
<td>NEW 2015-2020</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Land Registration and Cadastre Systems for Sust Agr</td>
<td>2012-2015</td>
<td>?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>Land Registration and Cadastre Modernization</td>
<td>closes 2015</td>
<td>?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ukraine</td>
<td>Capacity Development in Agriculture and Land</td>
<td>Not started</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uzbekistan</td>
<td>Modernization of Real Property Registration and Cadastre</td>
<td>NEW 2016-2021</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
IMPULS Project- SIDA funding implemented by Swedish Lantmateriet

4 years (2014-2018) for Euro 4 million

Western Balkans: Albania, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, Kosovo, Macedonia, Montenegro, Serbia

Objective: Support cadastre/registration agencies in implementation of INSPIRE directive

6 Working Packages
- Project management (Sept 2014)
- Data sharing
- Harmonization
- Metadata and quality
- Dissemination
- Benefits and pilots
Thank you for your attention

Newsletter on the Responsible Governance of Tenure
Subscribe at: VG-tenure@fao.org

Websites
www.fao.org/nr/tenure
www.worldbank.org