How do inflation expectations impact consumer behaviour?

Ioana Duca  
European Central Bank

Geoff Kenny  
European Central Bank

Andreas Reuter  
European Commission

Workshop on Business and Consumer Surveys  
European Commission DG ECFIN  
14-15 November 2016

The views expressed in this paper belong to the authors and are not necessarily the views of either the European Central Bank or the European Commission.
**Context**

- recent low and declining inflation and inflation expectations central to concerns about the recovery: low inflation expectations boosting real rates and weakening aggregate demand

- at Effective Lower Bound (ELB) the change in inflation expectations transmits fully to ex ante real rates; negative impact on demand may be stronger

- re-anchoring channel: monetary policy is constrained due to ELB, non-standard monetary policies signalling the central bank commitment to raising future inflation, lowering ex ante real interest rates
**Standard macroeconomic theory**

- higher inflation expectations decrease real interest rates (Fisher equation)
- lower interest rates reduce savings and stimulate consumption (Euler equation)
- **but**: offsetting income effect, durables/non durables, inflation uncertainty (reduce consumption via a precautionary savings channel)
Open empirical question

For an increase in inflation expectations

- Bachman et al. (2015) on US: the effect on consumer readiness to spend is close to zero and statistically not significant during normal times; negative when ELB is binding
- Burke and Ozdagli (2013) on US: consumers do not increase their spending on large home appliances and electronics, but they increase it for non-durables
- D’Acunto et al. (2016) on Germany: a 6 to 9% increase in the probability that consumers are ready to spend
- Ichiue and Nishiguchi (2015) on Japan: increase in current consumption relative to future spending
The macroeconomic approach

- small sample
- endogeneity
- very short ELB period

Figure 1: Consumer Inflation Expectations, Readiness to spend, Real total consumption. 2003Q4 - 2015Q3.
Alternative: rich (but confidential) micro-dataset providing individual consumer level information

European Commission Consumer Survey

- multi-country EU/EA survey: 25,440 monthly interviews, whereas NY Fed SCE (1200) or Michigan Survey (500)
- quantitative questions on subjective inflation perceptions and expectations
- matched replies to other questions on financial/economic situation, saving/spending behaviour
- rich demographic classification: gender, educational attainment, occupation, income
- sample: May 2003 to July 2015
Survey questions

- **Inflation perceptions**
  Q51: By how many per cent do you think that consumer prices have gone up/down over the past 12 months?
  A: Consumer prices have increased/decreased by __,__%.

- **Inflation expectations**
  Q61: By how many per cent do you expect consumer prices to go up/down in the next 12 months?
  A: Consumer prices will increase/decrease by __,__%.

- **Readiness to spend**
  Q8: In view of the general economic situation, do you think it is the right moment for people to make major purchases?
  A: (1) No (2) Neither right, nor wrong (3) Yes
Expected change in inflation

\[ \Delta \pi^e_{it} = \pi^e_{it} - \pi^p_{it} \]

where \( \pi^e_{it} \) inflation expectations and \( \pi^p_{it} \) inflation perceptions

- controls for the strong variation in the level of perceived inflation across consumers
- when changing their spending intentions, consumers are likely to consider their expected future inflation rate relative to their perceptions about current inflation
- both expectations and perceptions of inflation have an upward bias when compared to official statistics such as the HICP (the difference may reduce any distortion due to extreme pessimism/optimism about inflation)
EA consumer readiness to spend and inflation expectations

**Figure 2:** Scatterplot readiness to spend vs inflation expectations.

**Figure 3:** Scatterplot readiness to spend vs expected change in inflation.
Heterogeneity

Figure 4: Scatterplots of expected change in inflation vs readiness to spend differentiating by consumer education, income, expected financial situation and employment status. One dot represents a simple average of a particular category of consumers at one moment in time (identified by month and year).
2 steps approach

**Step1: Micro**
- estimate the relationship between expected change in inflation and consumer readiness to spend
- monthly consumer level survey data
- discrete choice model

**Step2: Linking micro to macro**
- estimate the relationship between readiness to spend and actual consumption
- quarterly macro data
- bi-variate VAR
Discrete choice model: ordered logit

Define a latent variable (continuous measure of readiness to spend):

\[ y_{it}^* = X_{it}\beta + \varepsilon_{it} \]

Then:

\[ y_{it} = \begin{cases} 
1 & \text{if } y_{it}^* < \alpha_1 \\
2 & \text{if } \alpha_1 \leq y_{it}^* < \alpha_2 \\
3 & \text{if } y_{it}^* \geq \alpha_2 
\end{cases} \]

Each alternative has a probability \( Pr \) attached, e.g., the probability of being ready to spend:

\[
Pr (y_{it} = 3) = Pr (y_{it}^* \geq \alpha_2) = Pr (X_{it}\beta + \varepsilon_{it} \geq \alpha_2) = \\
= Pr (\varepsilon_{it} \geq \alpha_2 - X_{it}\beta) = F (X_{it}\beta - \alpha_2)
\]

Maximum likelihood estimation
Latent variable specification

\[ y^*_it = \beta_0 + \beta_1 ELB + \beta_2 \Delta \pi^e_{it} + \beta_3 \Delta \pi^e_{it} ELB + X_{it}\gamma + \varepsilon_{it} \]

where \( ELB \) dummy variable taking 1 from June 2014 to July 2015 and \( X_{it} \) vector of controls:

- **Demographics**: age, gender, education, employment, income
- **Expectations and financial status**: expectations of individual financial situation, general economic and unemployment situation and current financial status
- **Interactions**: pairwise, expected change in inflation with expected financial situation, debt and employment status, income, education
- **Time dummies, Country dummies**
- **Macro aggregates**: SPF GDP uncertainty, lending rates, log disposable income
## Euro Area results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ELB=0</th>
<th>ELB=1</th>
<th>Demographics</th>
<th>Expectations and financial status</th>
<th>Interactions</th>
<th>Time dummies</th>
<th>Country dummies</th>
<th>Macro aggregates</th>
<th>No outliers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ELB=0</td>
<td>0.00260***</td>
<td>0.00302***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000600)</td>
<td>(0.000597)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELB=1</td>
<td>0.00250***</td>
<td>0.00269***</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000587)</td>
<td>(0.000590)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELB=0</td>
<td>0.00268***</td>
<td>0.00280***</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000537)</td>
<td>(0.000590)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELB=1</td>
<td>0.00293***</td>
<td>0.00305***</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000541)</td>
<td>(0.000627)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELB=0</td>
<td>0.00290***</td>
<td>0.00325***</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000559)</td>
<td>(0.000608)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELB=1</td>
<td>0.00166***</td>
<td>0.00239***</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000236)</td>
<td>(0.000380)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELB=0</td>
<td>0.00163***</td>
<td>0.00241***</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000239)</td>
<td>(0.000382)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELB=1</td>
<td>0.00224***</td>
<td>0.00341***</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000361)</td>
<td>(0.000584)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

|            | (0.000537) | (0.000590) |              |                                   |              | X            |                 |                  |             |
|            | (0.000541) | (0.000627) |              |                                   |              |              |                 |                  |             |
| ELB=0      | 0.00290*** | 0.00325*** | X            | X                                 |              | X            |                 |                  |             |
|            | (0.000559) | (0.000608) |              |                                   |              |              |                 |                  |             |
| ELB=1      | 0.00166*** | 0.00239*** | X            | X                                 |              | X            |                 |                  |             |
|            | (0.000236) | (0.000380) |              |                                   |              |              |                 |                  |             |
| ELB=0      | 0.00163*** | 0.00241*** | X            | X                                 |              | X            |                 |                  |             |
|            | (0.000239) | (0.000382) |              |                                   |              |              |                 |                  |             |
| ELB=1      | 0.00224*** | 0.00341*** | X            | X                                 |              | X            |                 |                  |             |
|            | (0.000361) | (0.000584) |              |                                   |              |              |                 |                  |             |

Table 1: Propensity to spend: average marginal effects, Euro Area. Clustered standard errors (at country level) in parentheses, *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1. The table shows the average marginal effect of a unit increase in the expected change in inflation on the probability that consumers are ready to spend.
Figure 5: Average marginal effects by country. Based on the ordered logit specification which includes all control groups. All average marginal effects are statistically significant at 1% or 5% level, except average marginal effects at the ELB for Greece and Portugal.
### Results

**Other average marginal effects on the propensity to spend**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>ELB=0</th>
<th>ELB=1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expected financial situation (a lot better)</td>
<td>0.117***</td>
<td>0.121***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0148)</td>
<td>(0.0154)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expected general economic situation (a lot better)</td>
<td>0.136***</td>
<td>0.140***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0153)</td>
<td>(0.0158)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expected general unemployment situation (increase sharply)</td>
<td>-0.0905***</td>
<td>-0.0936***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0197)</td>
<td>(0.0208)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td>1,793,108</td>
<td>1,793,108</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 2:** Average marginal effects of expectations about individual financial situation, general economic and unemployment situation on the propensity to spend, based on the full specification. Clustered (at country level) standard errors in parentheses, *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1.
Linking consumption to inflation expectations through the probability of spending

- 2 variable quarterly VAR: consumer aggregate propensity to spend $\overline{Pr_t}$ and log real total consumption $C_t$
- $\overline{Pr_t}$: weighted average of individual propensities to spend using individual and country weights, transformed to quarterly frequency by taking the 1st month of each quarter
- VAR(1): Schwarz and Hannan-Quinn information criteria
- identification: Choleski, with $\overline{Pr_t}$ ordered first
Impulse responses

Figure 6: Bivariate VAR: Impulse response functions.
Conditional forecast

- Two scenarios: cumulative 2.0pp rise in consumer inflation expectations i) under ELB and ii) away from ELB
- Calibrated as four consecutive shocks to the spending probability equivalent to a 0.5pp rise in inflation expectations

**Figure 7:** Impact on real consumption of a gradual increase in consumer inflation expectations compared to a scenario of constant consumer inflation expectations
How do inflation expectations impact consumer behaviour?

- rich granular consumer level information: EC Consumer Survey
- positive link between consumer inflation expectations and readiness to spend: under several model specifications; stronger at the ELB; holds also at country level
- gradual 2.0pp rise in expected inflation boosts real spending by 0.4% in cumulative terms over 3 years (lower away from ELB)
- a drop in inflation expectations has potential to weaken aggregate demand by reducing consumers' readiness to spend: ECB non-standard monetary policy (re-anchoring channel)
- other expectations over individual financial, general economic and unemployment situation have a bigger impact on the spending decision
How do inflation expectations impact consumer behaviour?

Ioana Duca  
European Central Bank

Geoff Kenny  
European Central Bank

Andreas Reuter  
European Commission

Workshop on Business and Consumer Surveys  
European Commission DG ECFIN  
14-15 November 2016

The views expressed in this paper belong to the authors and are not necessarily the views of either the European Central Bank or the European Commission.
Consumer inflation expectations and perceptions vs HICP

Figure 8: Average consumer inflation expectations and perceptions (individual and country weights were used for aggregation) vs HICP
Aggregated propensity to spend and real consumption (ln)

Figure 9: Aggregated propensity to spend and real consumption (ln)