European Community comments to
Codex Circular Letter 2007/36-PR
REQUEST FOR COMMENTS ON THE PROPOSALS FOR BULB VEGETABLES AND FRUITING VEGETABLES

The European Community wishes to submit the following comments:

I. Proposal for the revised CODEX Crop Group 009 “Bulb Vegetables”

The proposed revision of the “Bulb Vegetables Group” seems to be feasible particularly with regard to splitting this group in the two subgroups “Bulb onions” (mature bulbs, dry) and “Green onions” (immature bulbs including stems and flowers). Furthermore, the commodities proposed to be added to the “Bulb Vegetables Group” appear plausible except Elegans hosta (see below). The classification of fennel commodities to the “Stem Vegetables Group” is correct.

In contrast the proposed definition of the “Bulb Vegetables Group” is incorrect (restriction on genus Allium, old classification of the genus Allium to lily family). The Lily family was formerly a so-called "catch-all" group that included a great number of genera that are now included in other families, and some in other orders, such as Alliaceae and Agavaceae. Therefore, the definition for bulb vegetables should be replaced through the following version:

“Bulb vegetables are pungent highly flavoured foods derived from fleshy scale bulbs (in some commodities including stem and leaves), of the genera Allium of the familia Alliaceae and Lilium of the familia Liliaceae. …”.

The commodity Elegans hosta belongs to the botanical genus Hosta of the familia Agavaceae. Species of this plant family are without bulbs. Therefore, Elegans hosta should be removed from the proposed “Bulb Vegetables Group”.

The proposed extrapolation from “Onion, bulb” to the whole subgroup “Bulb onions” (garlic, shallots etc.) is acceptable, also the extrapolation from “Onion, green” (spring onion) to the whole subgroup “Green onions” (Welsh onions, tree onions, chives etc.).

In contrast to the before mentioned extrapolations the suggested extrapolation of “Onion, bulb” and “Onion, green” on the whole group of "Bulb vegetables" appears to be questionable. Due to different matrices same MRL in both groups may occur by chance.
II. Proposal for the revised CODEX Crop Group 012 “Fruiting vegetables, other than Cucurbits”

The proposed revision of the Group “Fruiting vegetables, other than Cucurbits” seems to be acceptable, in particular the removing of Sweet corn varieties from this group. The classification of Sweet corn to the same botanical group with cereal grains and maize (“Cereal Grains Group”) is better. The commodities proposed to add to the revised crop group of “Fruiting vegetables, other than Cucurbits” (Bush tomato, Cherry tomato, Cocona, Currant tomato, Garden huckleberry, Sunberry, Martynia, African egg plant, Pea egg plant, Scarlet egg plant and Thai egg plant) are plausible. Furthermore, the proposed subgrouping of the commodities of the group “Fruiting vegetables, other than Cucurbits” into the subgroups “Tomatoes”, “Peppers” and “Egg plants” are correct.

The proposed extrapolations from Tomato (representative commodity) to the whole subgroup “Tomatoes”, from Bell pepper and one cultivar of non-bell pepper (representative commodities) to the whole subgroup of “Peppers” as well as from one cultivar of non-bell pepper or one cultivar of small variety eggplant or tomato (representative commodity) to the whole subgroup “Egg plants” seems to be acceptable, also the proposed extrapolation from Tomato, Bell pepper and one cultivar of small variety egg plant to the whole group “Fruiting vegetables, other than Cucurbits”.

In addition, it is to be pointed out that the consideration of smaller varieties of tomatoes with respect to extrapolation within the subgroup “Tomatoes” would be favourable, also the inclusion of smaller varieties of tomatoes and peppers besides a small variety of egg plants with respect to an extrapolation to the whole group “Fruiting vegetables, other than Cucurbits”. If data were available for the greater and smaller varieties of tomatoes, peppers and egg plants then there would be sufficient information to support uses on all other crops in the whole group “Fruiting vegetables, other than Cucurbits”.