A.01 Feed Additives - Applications under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 Art. 4 or 13.
Following the discussion, the application was considered falling in the scope of feed additive legislation.

A.02.1. Lactobacillus fermentum NCIMB 41636, Lactobacillus plantarum NCIMB 41638 and Lactobacillus rhamnosus NCIMB 41640 as a technological feed additive for dogs – Annex
A discussion was taken. A draft Regulation will be presented in a future meeting.

A.02.2. Biostrong® 510 (essential oil of thyme and star anise) for chickens and minor avian species for fattening and rearing to point of lay – Annex
A discussion was taken. A draft Regulation will be presented in a future meeting.

A.02.3. Kemzyme® Plus Dry (endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase, endo-1,4-beta- glucanase, alpha-amylase, bacillolysin and endo-1,4-beta-xylanase) for poultry, ornamental birds and piglets (weaned) - Kemzyme® Plus Liquid (endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase, endo-1,4-beta-glucanase, alpha-amylase and endo-1,4-beta-xylanase) as a feed additive for poultry species and ornamental birds – Annex
No discussion took place.

A.02.4. Lecithins (Lipidol) for all animal species – Annex
A discussion was taken. A draft Regulation will be presented in a future meeting.
A.02.5. Lavipan® (Lactococcus lactis B/00039, Carnobacterium divergens KKP 2012p, Lactobacillus casei B/00080, Lactobacillus plantarum B/00081 and Saccharomyces cerevisiae KKP 2059p) for weaned piglets, chickens for fattening and turkeys for fattening – Annex

A discussion was taken. A new Annex will be presented in a future meeting.

A.02.6. Bactocell PA (Pediococcus acidilactici CNCM MA 18/5M) for pigs for fattening, minor porcine species, chickens for fattening and minor avian species – Annex

A discussion was taken. A draft Regulation will be presented in a future meeting.

A.02.7. Feedlyve AXC (endo-1,4-b-xylanase) as a feed additive for chickens for fattening

The application has been withdrawn by the applicant.

A.02.8. Feedlyve AGL (endo-1,3(4)-b-glucanase) as a feed additive for chickens for fattening

The application has been withdrawn by the applicant.

A.02.9. Lactobacillus brevis NCIMB 42149 as a silage additive for all animal species

Following the discussion, it was decided to deny the authorization for this additive, due to the safety concerns on AMR of this microorganism as from EFSA opinion.

A.02.10. Enviva PRO 202 GT (Bacillus amyloliquefaciens PTA-6507, Bacillus amyloliquefaciens NRRL B-50013 and Bacillus amyloliquefaciens NRRL B-50104) for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying and minor poultry species for fattening and to point of lay – Annex

A discussion was taken. A draft Regulation will be presented in a future meeting.

A.02.11. a preparation of algae interspaced bentonite as a feed additive for all animal species

A discussion was taken. New information will be requested to the company.

A.02.12. Natugrain TS/TS L (endo-1,4-b- xylanase and endo-1,4-b-glucanase) as a feed additive for chickens reared for laying and minor poultry species for laying – Annex

A discussion was taken. A draft Regulation will be presented in a future meeting.

A.02.13. Fumonisin esterase (FUMzyme) as a technological feed additive for all avian species – Annex

A discussion was taken. A draft Regulation will be presented in a future meeting.
A.02.14. Axtra PHY 20000 TPT2 (6-phytase) as a feed additive for poultry and porcine specie – Annex

A discussion was taken. A draft Regulation will be presented in a future meeting.

A.02.15. 3-phytase FLF100 as a feed additive for chickens for fattening and laying hens – Annex

A discussion was taken. A draft Regulation will be presented in a future meeting.

A.02.16. Tartrazine (E 102) for cats and dogs, ornamental fish, grain-eating ornamental birds and small rodents - Annex Entry

The Annex entry was discussed but for the moment the regulation cannot be adopted until the method of analysis in premixtures and compound feedingstuffs will be available and will be validated. The applicant has been requested to provide that information.

A.02.17. Iron compounds (E1) as feed additives for all animal species: ferric oxide; ferrous carbonate; ferric chloride, hexahydrate; ferrous fumarate; ferrous sulphate, heptahydrate; ferrous sulphate, monohydrate; ferrous/iron chelate of amino acids, hydrate; ferrous chelate of glycine, hydrate - Annex entry

The point was postponed due to time constraints.

A.02.18. the currently authorised maximum copper content in complete feed and on the copper compounds (E4) for all animal species: Copper(II) diacetate monohydrate, Copper(II) carbonate dihydroxy monohydrate, Copper(II) chloride dehydrate, Copper(II) oxide, Copper(II) sulphate pentahydrate, Cupric chelate of amino acids, hydrate, Cupric chelate of glycine, hydrate (solid), Cupric chelate of glycine, hydrate (liquid).

The Commission's representative recalled the Committee about the recommendations in the EFSA opinion. Furthermore, he informed the Committee about a recent recommendation of EMA’s CVMP to withdraw the marketing authorisations of veterinary medicinal products containing zinc oxide used orally because of potential repercussions on the discussion on copper. Several Member States expressed some reluctance to fully follow the EFSA recommendations concerning the copper content in feed. One Member State declared that they would endorse the copper contents as recommended by EFSA. It was concluded to further investigate in the duration of feeding piglets with high copper levels. The Committee will come back on the issue.

A.03  RASFF.

- Update and exchange of views on recent RASFF notifications.
The Commission's representative informed the Committee on the following RASFF notifications related to undesirable substances in animal feed, issued since the meeting of the Committee in November 2016:

- narasin in feed for pheasants from Belgium, exceeding the maximum level for unavoidable cross-contamination;
- too high level of aflatoxins in maize from Russia;
- too high content of ragweed (Ambrosia spp.) in birdfeed from Germany.

A.04 Undesirable substances.

A.04.1 Exchange of views on a draft Recommendation on nitrites and nitrates in feed

The discussion on this point was postponed to the next meeting.

A.04.2 Exchange of views on a draft amendment to Directive 2002/32/EC on undesirable substances in feed (melamine, dioxins and PCBs, mercury, lead in dicopper oxide, unavoidable carry-over)

Following amendments to the Annex of Directive 2002/32/EC are proposed:

- maximum level for lead of 200 mg/kg in dicopper oxide

- maximum level for mercury of 1.0 mg/kg on wet weight basis for fish, other aquatic animals and products derived thereof intended for the production of compound feed for dogs, cats, ornamental fish and fur animals

As there is apparently some confusion as regards the current provisions, it was clarified that the maximum level for mercury in fish, other aquatic animals and products derived thereof intended for the production of compound feed for food producing animals is 0.5 mg/kg relative to a feed with a moisture content of 12%

- maximum level of 20 mg/kg of melamine in guanidino acetic acid

- application of the exemption of the maximum levels for dioxins and PCBs for fresh fish for the direct feeding of pet animals, zoo and circus animals or used as feed material for the production of pet food to fresh fish used as fishing bait

- deletion of the maximum level of 0.4 mg/kg for decoquinate for unavoidable cross-contamination in withdrawal feed for chickens for fattening, given that following recent changes in conditions of authorisation, there is no longer a withdrawal period for the use of decoquinate in feed for chickens for fattening

No comments were raised at this stage as regards the proposed amendments.

A.04.3 Exchange of views on the different topics for possible future amendment of the annexes of Directive 2002/32/EC (arsenic in peat and leonardite, nitrites, gossypol)
Following issues were raised but further discussions/information is needed before proposing an amendment to the annex of Directive 2002/32/EC

- arsenic in peat (request to increase current maximum level)

- arsenic in leonardite (request to increase current maximum level)

- maximum levels for nitrites: possible deletion is related to the finalisation of the Recommendation on nitrites and nitrates in feed (see point A.04.1)

- gossypol in whole cotton seed and complete feed for dairy cows (EFSA opinion/statement awaited)

- clarification of the term "trace amounts not quantitatively determinable".

A.04.4 Discussion on possible follow-up to the EFSA scientific opinion on erucic acid in feed and food

The EFSA opinion on erucic acid in feed and food was presented as regards the risk for animal health and also the aspect of carry-over of feed into food of animal origin was addressed. The overall conclusion as regards the risks for animal health related to the presence of erucic acid in feed is "In pigs, levels of erucic acid are unlikely to represent a health concern. However, for poultry, the small margin between the lowest observed adverse effect level (LOAEL) and the estimated exposure may indicate a health risk where maximum inclusion rates are applied. Due to the absence of adequate data, the risk for ruminants, horses, fish and rabbits could not be assessed." Although there is carry over from feed to food of animal origin, the presence of erucic acid in food of animal origin contributes only to a minor extent to the human exposure.

Following the outcome of the EFSA opinion, the Committee agreed that there was at this stage no need for a regulatory follow-up as regards the presence of erucic acid in feed.

A.04.5 Other issues

No issues were raised under this agenda item.

A.05 Discussion on proposal for new functional groups of feed additives.

After an exchange of views, the proposal will be presented for discussion in a future meeting.

A.06 Discussion on withdrawal from the market of certain feed additives for which no applications for authorisation were submitted before the deadline provided for in Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003.

A discussion was taken. A full check of the Annex has been required to the Member States. A proposal of the Regulation will be submitted in a future meeting.
A discussion was taken. The examination of the document will continue in a future meeting.

A.08 Discussion on application of Regulation (EC) No 1272/2008 (CLP) to feed sector - updating.
A document provided from DG ENV was discussed and distributed for comments to the Member States by 11 January 2017.

The Commission referred to the Committee the discussion which took place on the issue at the last meeting of the PAFF Committee - section "Pesticide Residues", on 28-29 November 2016.

Two different documents have been drafted by the Commission and presented to Member States for comments:

- one document regarding a series of proposed amendments to the Annex I to Regulation N° 396/2005 (list of commodities to which pesticides MRLs applies);
- a second document specifically focused on the amendment of the footnote (1) of that Annex.

In order to clarify to which products the exemption set by the footnote (1) applies, the second document proposes a general division of the imported feed products in three broad categories. Commission further clarified that the document is meant to support exchange of views between Member States and to set out some general principles, but it won’t set any legally binding classification. It will remain up to the Member States enforcement authorities to make the ultimate decision on each single consignment.

Delegates have been invited to liaise with their colleagues of the PAFF Committee - section "Pesticide Residues" and to send their comments to the Commission by 3rd January 2017.

A.10 Discussion on the declaration of botanical flavourings.
The discussion was postponed in order to examine new information.

- Exchange of views on measures for non-authorised additives intended for export
The Commission's representative presented for discussion a new version of the document. It was agreed on sending written comments.

- Commission working document - Guidance document on the implementation of certain provisions of Regulation (EC) No 183/2005 on the hygiene of feedstuffs

The Commission's representative presented for discussion a new version of the document. It was agreed on sending written comments.

- Register of national guidelines – Feed sector

The list of national guidelines in the feed sector has been updated with the last information received from Member States. The feed and food database for the guidelines will be modified according to the new drafted data dictionary taking into account the feed sector. It was agreed on sending the national contact points for the management of the database as soon as possible in order to transmit all the related information. It was agreed to create a reduced working group for the endorsement of Community guides to good practice. The Commission's representative asked Member States, volunteers for participation in the reduced Working Group.


Two Member States summarized their evaluations on several applications. The Commission's representative raised the attention to the conclusion of one Member State assessment body that the respective intended use should be deleted because the dossier did not substantiate the functionality of the characteristics of the feed. Member States are asked to reflect whether they share this principle; as a matter of consistency, the deletion would also be appropriate for intended uses with vague or meaningless essential nutritional characteristics for which no application to improve the description has been made.

A.12.2. Labelling provisions - revision of Annex IV, VI and VII - Annex entry

Two Member States requested that, in paragraph 3(b) of Annex II, the respective expressions in their language are listed.

Concerning Annex IV, further fine tuning was done as a consequence of Member States comments. The new wording for feed additives with recommended maximum contents in Annexes VI and VII was broadly welcomed.

The Committee will come back on the draft Annexes and in parallel a draft Regulation will be prepared.

A.12.3. Code of Good Labelling Practice for pet food - discussion of the draft revision of the F.E.D.I.A.F. - code
The discussion was postponed to a future meeting.

**B.01 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation amending Regulation (EC) No 1292/2008 and Implementing Regulation (EU) No 887/2011, as regards the name of the holder of the authorisation of Bacillus amyloliquefaciens CECT 5940 and Enterococcus faecium CECT 4515.**

A discussion took place on the draft Regulation to change the name of the authorisation holder. Following a request from the two companies, the Commission proposed a draft Regulation to implement the change in the owner of two feed additives. Norel SA has transferred the marketing rights for two feed additives to the company Evonik, who is now the new holder of the authorisation for these additives.

**B.02 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorisation of the preparation of Bacillus subtilis DSM 29343 as feed additives for chickens d for fattening.**

The draft Regulation refers to an authorisation as silage additive.

**Vote taken:** Unanimity.

**B.03 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) concerning the authorisation of the preparation of Lactobacillus diolivorans DSM 32074 as feed additive for all animal species.**

The draft Regulation refers to an authorisation as silage additive. A discussion took place.

**Vote taken:** Unanimity.

**B.04 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) concerning the authorisation of a preparation of endo-1,4-beta-xylanase and endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase produced by Talaromyces versatilis sp. nov. IMI CC 378536 and Talaromyces versatilis sp. nov DSM 26702 as a feed additive for laying hens (holder of the authorisation Adisseo France S.A.S.).**

The draft Regulation refers to an authorisation as zootechnical additive. A discussion took place.

**Vote taken:** Unanimity.

The draft Regulation refers to an authorisation as zootechnical additive. A discussion took place.

Vote taken: Unanimity.

B.06 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorisation of a preparation of Bacillus subtilis (DSM 27273) as a feed additive for weaned piglets and weaned minor porcine species (holder of authorisation Chr.Hansen A/S).

The draft Regulation refers to an authorisation as zootechnical additive. A discussion took place.

Vote taken: Unanimity.


Vote postponed


The draft Regulation aims to modernize the existing Catalogue of feed materials. With respect to the entries concerning insects, a Commission representative informed the Committee that on the 13th December 2016 the respective section of the PAFF Committee voted and adopted Regulations to authorize processed insect protein for aquaculture species. A discussion took place. The paragraph about fermented feed materials was revised.

A Member State voted against and made the following declaration:

"The lack of any restrictions on the marketing of feed materials derived from fermentation creates basically unlimited possibilities of entering the feed chain of
animals microorganisms and enzymes that are not authorized as feed additives and feed materials potentially harmful."

Vote taken: Favourable opinion.

B.09 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorisation of L-tryptophan produced by Escherichia coli as a feed additive for all animal species.

Vote postponed

B.10 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorisation of L-lysine sulphate produced by Escherichia coli as a feed additive for all animal species.

Vote postponed

C.01 Exchange of views of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the suspension of the authorisation of ethoxyquin as a feed additive for all animal species and categories.

A representative of the Commission presented the new version of the working document transmitted to the Committee concerning a draft measure suspending the existing authorisation of ethoxyquin as a feed additive.

A discussion took place.

A final version of the document should be ready for the next meeting of the Committee and will be subject to a notification under the SPS Agreement before submission for a formal opinion of the Committee.

M.01 A.O.B.

No issues raised under this agenda item.