A.01 Feed Additives - Applications under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 Art. 4 or 13.
Documents were distributed.

A.2.1. Pediococcus pentosaceus (NCIMB 30044) as a silage additive for all animal species
The discussion was taken and a draft Regulation to deny the authorization will be submitted in a future meeting.

A.2.2. Pediococcus pentosaceus (NCIMB 30068) as a silage additive for all animal species
The discussion was taken and a draft Regulation to deny the authorization will be submitted in a future meeting.

A.2.3. Lactobacillus paracasei (NCIMB 30151) as a silage additive for all animal species - Annex
The discussion was taken and new annex be submitted in a future meeting.

A.2.4. Lactobacillus plantarum (DSMZ 16627) as a silage additive for all animal species - Annex
The discussion was taken and new annex be submitted in a future meeting.

A.2.5. Pediococcus acidilactici (NCIMB 30005) as a silage additive for all animal species - Annex
The discussion was taken and new annex be submitted in a future meeting.
A.2.6. Oralin® (Enterococcus faecium) when used as a feed additive for cats

Not discussed.

A.2.7. Miya-Gold® (Clostridium butyricum) for turkeys for fattening and turkeys reared for breeding - Annex

The discussion was taken and a draft Regulation will be submitted in a future meeting.

A.2.8. Bonvital (Enterococcus faecium) as a feed additive for sows - Annex

The discussion was taken and a draft Regulation will be submitted in a future meeting.

A.2.9. Malic acid and a mixture of sodium and calcium malate when used as technological additives for all animal species - Annex

The discussion was taken and a draft Regulation will be submitted in a future meeting. The discussion on salts of malic will be hold in a future meeting.

A.2.10. Bentonite-and sepiolite (Toxfin® Dry) as feed additive for all species

Not discussed.

A.2.11. Ronozyme® Rumistar (alpha-amylase) as a feed additive for dairy cows

Not discussed.

A.2.12. Pantothenic acid and its forms for all animal species - Annex

A representative of the Commission informed about small changes introduced in the last version.

A.2.13. Vitamin C and its forms for all animal species - Annex

Following the discussion, a new annex will be submitted once the discussion on the preparations and some aspects related to the name and labelling of the additive in compound feed will be concluded.


Following the discussion a new annex will be submitted once the discussion on the preparations will be concluded.

A.2.15. Tocopherol extracts of natural origin for all animal species - Annex

Following the discussion, a new Annex will be submitted.
A.2.16. Biotin for all animal species - Annex

Following the discussion, a new annex will be submitted to a next meeting. The Commission informed that the company is willing to provide the method of analysis in water.

A.2.17. Vitamin A for all animal species and categories - Annex and working paper on the use in water

A majority of delegations expressed their concerns on the use in water either on vitamin A or other additives for which maximum levels are established, even if the authorisations are granted with accompanying management measures such as strict labelling requirements.

A representative of the Commission, upon request from one delegation, clarified that, in any case, if an additive is not specifically authorised for its use in water for drinking it can continue to be used in liquid feedingstuffs.

Following the discussion a new annex will be submitted to a next meeting.

A.2.18. Beta-carotene for all animal species and categories - Annex

Following the discussion, a new Annex will be submitted once the discussion on the preparations will be concluded.

A.2.19. Canthaxanthin as feed additive for poultry and for ornamental birds and ornamental fish - Annex

Following the discussion, a new annex will be submitted to a next meeting.

A.2.20. Scansmoke SEF7525 for cats and dogs - Annex

Following the discussion, a new Annex will be submitted once the discussion on the preparations will be concluded.

A.2.21. Vitamin D for all animal species and categories - Annex and working paper on the use in water

A majority of delegations expressed their concerns on the use in water either on vitamin D or other additives for which maximum levels are established, even if the authorisations are granted with accompanying management measures such as strict labelling requirements.

A.2.22. Quinoline Yellow (E104)

Following the discussion, it was agreed to follow the opinion of the Scientific Committee (Panel on Additives and Products or Substances used in Animal Feed) as regards the maximum level proposed. If the applicant wants to increase the maximum level new data must be provided.
A.2.23. Disodium 5'-ribonucleotides, disodium 5'-guanylate, disodium 5'-inosinate for all animal species and categories

It was agreed to request the applicant information about the manufacturing process, in particular, the microbial strains and substrates used for the production of these additives.

A.2.24. Astaxanthin for salmon and trout, other fish, crustaceans, ornamental fish, ornamental birds

This point was not discussed.

A.2.25. Astaxanthin for salmonids and ornamental fish (Carophyll Pink)

This point was not discussed.

A.2.26. Iron compounds (E1) as feed additives for all species - Ferrous sulphate heptahydrate based on a dossier submitted by Kronos International, Inc.

The full EFSA opinion will be discussed once all pending opinions on iron compounds for re-authorisation are available.

A.2.27. Iron compounds (E1) as feed additives for all species - Ferrous sulphate monohydrate based on a dossier submitted by Kronos International, Inc.

The full EFSA opinion will be discussed once all pending opinions on iron compounds for re-authorisation are available.

A.2.28. L-valine produced by Corynebacterium glutamicum (KCCM 80058) for all animal species, based on a dossier submitted by CJ Europe GmbH - Annex

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.

A.2.29. L-methionine produced by Escherichia coli (KCCM 11252P) and Escherichia coli (KCCM 11340P) for all animal species based on a dossier submitted by CJ Europe GmbH - Annex

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.

A.2.30. DL-selenomethionine as a feed additive for all animal species - Annex entry

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.

A.2.31. Potential reduction of the currently authorised maximum zinc content in complete feed.

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed for
possible vote at a future meeting.

A.03  Feed Additives - preparations (working paper).
The Commission forwarded in advance a revised version of the working paper after the comments submitted by the delegations. After a short discussion it was agreed to request future comments and to discuss the proposed changes in the next meeting.

The Commission also sent in advance a very preliminary draft regulation amending Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 of the European Parliament and of the Council as regards requirements for additives placed on the market as preparations that was shortly discussed. A majority of delegations were in favour to adopt the Regulations with few changes.

1. Revised COPA-COGECA / FEFAC Code of Good labelling practices for compound feed for food producing animals

A short discussion took place. Several Member States announced to deliver comments. The point will be discussed in the next meeting.

2. Register of feed materials according to Article 24(6)

The point was postponed to the next meeting.

3. State of play on applications for amending Directive 2008/38/EC by modifying the list of intended uses as particular nutritional purposes

A Commission representative informed the Committee that the French applicant for two high concentrate products based on Article 32(2) introduced revised dossiers as a response to the comments forwarded to him. The Member States were invited to evaluate the new information.

Comments have been received for the application “reduction of overweight” of horses. The Commission services will discuss the comments with the applicant.

A.05  Integration of former foodstuff into the feed chain.
Based on the findings of the FVO in France, France asked to put this point on the agenda. Therefore a discussion took place whether food business operators shall be also considered feed business operators if they place former foodstuff for future use in feed on the market. Considering the requirements of Article 5(6) of Regulation (EC) No 183/2005, the issue of the starting point of the feed chain was tackled. Some Member States informed about a pragmatic approach: in case the food business operator delivers the former food to a specialised food recycler, only this latter is
considered as a feed business operator. The interventions of the Members States showed that the interpretation the relevant EU legislation on the issue differs within the EU. The Commission Services will internally consult about this issue, particularly addressing the definition of “feed business operator”. With respect to the safety and integrity of the food chain it was concluded, that former foodstuff placed on the market as waste should be excluded from entering the food chain.

A.06 Discussion on definition of some products: additives/feed materials.
Not discussed.

A.07 Discussion on classification of some additives.
Not discussed.

A.08 Update and exchange of views on recent RASFF notifications.
The Commission representative informed the Committee on the following recent Rapid Alert System for Feed and Food (RASFF) notifications as regards the presence of undesirable substances in feed:

- 2 notifications on high levels of aflatoxin B1 in maize from India;
- 1 notification on high level of aflatoxin B1 in in rice gluten meal from India;
- 1 notification on the presence of chloramphenicol in riboflavin (vitamin B2, 80 %) from China. Investigations indicate that it probably concerns a cross-contamination whereby the big bags in which the riboflavin is transported would have been contaminated with chloramphenicol as the consequence of a previous use of the big bags;
- 1 notification on a high level (55 mg/kg) of melamine in inactive yeast from Poland via Lithuania. The source of contamination is unclear: cross-contamination, fraudulent addition, mistake in the production process, …
The Polish authorities are requested via the RASFF to perform the necessary investigations to find out the source of contamination and, if appropriate, to take the necessary measures to avoid that such contamination can occur again;
- 2 notifications of presence of meadow saffron (Colchicum autumnale) in hay from Germany. The high levels of colchicine have resulted in adverse health effects with horses;
- 1 notification a high content of fluorine in mineral feed from the Ireland;
- 1 notification on a non-compliant level of dioxins in molassed sugar beet pellets from Poland and another notification on a non-compliant level of dioxins in dried apple pomace pellets from Poland. The congener pattern of both contaminations indicates that the source of contamination is related to the (direct) drying process. The Commission representative stressed that the direct drying process remains a crucial process for possible dioxin contamination and for which extra vigilance is needed. The Polish authorities were requested to appropriately follow up these two contamination events and in particular verify the drying process and if appropriate and necessary, require the necessary improvements;
- 1 notification on dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in fish oil from Germany. It concerned a fish oil which was not purified;
- 1 notification on the presence of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in mixed bile acids from New Zealand;
- 1 notification as regards abnormal smell of sunflower meal from Ukraine. The Commission representative informs the Committee of the intention from the Commission to repeal Commission Regulation (EC) N0 1151/2009 of 27 November 2009 imposing special conditions governing the import of sunflower oil originating in or consigned from Ukraine due to contamination risks by mineral oil and repealing Decision 2008/433/EC because there has been no findings of unacceptable presence of mineral oil in sunflower oil from Ukraine since more than 4 years;
- 1 notification related to the presence of DDT in complete feed for horses from India;
- 1 notification related to a too high content of ragweed (Ambrosia sp.) seeds in maize from Russia. In relation to this notification, the need to strengthen the conditions under which such consignments can be transported not cleaned to a crushing or milling plant was discussed;
- 1 notification related to severe adverse health effects with dogs caused by dry dog food from Spain. This notification is linked to another notification 2014.0284 with the same adverse animal health effects and involving the same Spanish company.

On the request of a delegation, the Commission representative provided information on the current situation as regards possible measures on the presence of unauthorised genetically modified (Bt63) rice in choline chloride from China. The Committee was informed that the issue will be further discussed and concluded in the section Genetically Modified Food and Feed and Environmental risk of the Committee.

A.09 Undesirable substances in feed.

Certain delegations expressed the need to have more time to examine the issue in more detail. Therefore it was agreed to postpone the discussion in detail on this issue tot the meeting of the Committee in September 2014.

- Clarification of the term "trace amounts not quantitatively determinable".

The discussion on this point was postponed to the next meeting of the Committee.


A revised guidance document, taking into account the comments from the stakeholder organisations, was presented. Several comments were made as regards the submission of the occurrence data to EFSA and the format to be used to submit these data was considered to be an impediment for the submission of data, not only for the data collected by stakeholder organisations but also for the data from authorities. The Commission representative indicated to continue the discussions with EFSA to agree on a simple format for submitting the data requiring a minimum of fields to be mandatory completed (to what is absolutely needed to keep the data useful for the purpose).
No further comments were made.

One delegation indicated to have a general reservation to the document and no further objections were noted. The Commission representative concluded that the large majority of the delegations in the Committee had no objections to the guidance.

A.11 **Aflatoxins in maize : finalisation of a guidance document to ensure more consistent control results along the cereal chain (SANCO/10838/2014).**

A revised document taking into account the comments made at the last meeting was presented. Also a letter received from COCERAL was discussed. In this letter COCERAL commits to strengthen the “European Guide to Good Hygiene Practices for the collection, storage, trading and transport of cereals, oilseeds, protein crops, other plant products and products derived thereof”, in order to take into account the concerns emerged and which have triggered the development of the guidelines. The proposed changes were proposed by COCERAL as alternative to the guidelines.

After assessing the proposed changes, the Committee agreed with the Commission representative that the proposed changes do not provide for sufficient concrete guidelines to address the issues which have arisen last year in the trade of maize and maize products and can therefore not be considered as an alternative for the guidance document under discussion.

No major comments and no objections have been raised as regards the content of the revised document and therefore the discussion on this guidance document to ensure more consistent control results along the cereal chain is considered to be finalised. The document will be made publicly available for use as guidance to improve the transparency in the production and trade chain and in order to improve the consistency of analytical results following sampling at different stages of the trade.

A.12 **Regulation (EU) 691/2013 on sampling : finalisation of the guidance document (SANCO/10837/2014).**

A revised document, taking into account the comments made by stakeholder organisations, was presented. The Committee agreed that the nature of the comments did not necessitate a specific meeting of the working group “sampling of feed” to discuss the comments and agreed to discuss the revised document at the next meeting of the Standing Committee for finalisation.

The Commission representative confirmed that at the next meeting a draft Regulation will be presented for discussion.

B.01 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorisation of calcium D-pantothenate and D-panthenol as feed additives for all animal species.

The draft proposes to authorise sources of pantothenic acid (calcium D-pantothenate and D-panthenol) in feed for all animal species. A discussion took place.

Vote taken: favourable opinion.

B.02 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Regulation amending Directive 2008/38/EC by modifying the list of intended uses as particular nutritional purposes.

The draft concerns the new introduction and revision of several particular nutritional purposes of animal feed.

The french delegation made the following declaration:

"Les autorités françaises reconnaissent que le texte proposé au vote représente globalement une avancée en terme d’information apportée au consommateur et d’opérabilité des contrôles sur les aliments diététiques. Néanmoins, dans son avis en date du 9 décembre 2013, l’Anses a rendu un avis négatif sur les caractéristiques nutritionnelles proposées pour répondre à l’objectif nutritionnel particulier « Soutien de la fonction rénale en cas d’insuffisance rénale chronique ».

Les recommandations de l’Anses n’ont pas été reprises par la Commission Européenne, qui a choisi de conserver les caractéristiques nutritionnelles particulières proposées par le syndicat des fabricants d’aliments pour animaux familiers, alors que la seule évaluation scientifique indépendante disponible était celle de l’Anses.

Les autorités françaises rappellent que, conformément aux dispositions des points 2 et 4 de l’article 10 du règlement (CE) n°767/2009, la demande de modification d’un objectif nutritionnel particulier doit comporter un dossier démontrant que la composition spécifique de l’aliment pour animaux répond à l’objectif nutritionnel particulier, et, qu’en cas de doute sur ce point, il est prévu la possibilité pour la Commission de saisir l’AESA pour avis.

La délégation française considère donc que ce projet de règlement ne permet pas, pour l’objectif nutritionnel particulier « Soutien de la fonction rénale en cas d’insuffisance rénale chronique », de satisfaire à l’ensemble des exigences du règlement (CE) n°767/2009 et de garantir un niveau élevé de protection et
B.03 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorization of canthaxanthin as feed additive for breeder hens (holder of the authorization DSM Nutritional product Ltd).

The draft proposes to authorise the above substance as zootechnical additive. A discussion took place.

Vote taken: favourable opinion.


Following changes are proposed for the provisions as regards arsenic, lead and fluorine in calcareous marine shells following information recently provided by the French authorities: 15 mg/kg of arsenic, 15 mg/kg of lead and 500 mg/kg of fluorine.

The proposed amendments as regards the provisions on endosulfan have not been changed compared to what has been discussed at previous meeting.

As regards the maximum level of mercury in fish, other aquatic animals and products derived thereof, following the information provided by FEFANA, a footnote providing for the maximum level to be applicable on wet weight basis to fish, other aquatic animals and products derived thereof intended for the production of compound feed for dogs, cats and fur animals, was proposed.

Finally the footnote providing for the possibility of transporting non-complaint feed materials to a crushing or milling plant to be crushed or milled without the necessity for cleaning or sorting is proposed to be modified in view of strengthening the conditions for allowing such transport.

No objections were raised at this stage as regards the proposed changes but several delegations indicated to need more time to scrutinise the proposed changes before being able to agree on them.

It was agreed to discuss again the proposed changes at the next meeting in June before submitting the draft Regulation for possible opinion at the meeting in July 2014.