A.1 Applications under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 Art. 4 or 13

Documents were distributed.

A.2 Applications under Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 Art. 9
Discussion on EFSA Scientific Opinions on:

A.2.1. safety and efficacy of fumaric acid as a feed preservative for all animal species. Annex

Following the discussion a new Annex will be presented at a future meeting.

A.2.2. safety and efficacy of Cylactin (Enterococcus faecium) as a feed additive for cats and dogs. Annex

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation of both opinions on Cylactin will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.

A.2.3. safety and efficacy of Cylactin (Enterococcus faecium) as a feed additive for calves, lambs and kids for rearing and for fattening. Annex

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation of both opinions on Cylactin will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.

A.2.4. Bonvital (Enterococcus faecium DSM 7134) for chickens reared for laying and minor avian species (EFSA-Q-2011-00203). Annex

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.

A.2.5. Lactobacillus brevis (IFA 92 - DSM 23231), L. buchneri (CCM 1819 - DSM 22501), L. buchneri (NCIMB 40788 - CNCM I-4323), L. buchneri (ATCC PTA-6138), L. buchneri (ATCC PTA-2494) for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00382). Annex
Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.

A.2.6. Probiotic Lactina (Lactobacillus acidophilus, Lactobacillus helveticus, Lactobacillus bulgaricus, Lactobacillus lactis, Streptococcus thermophilus, Enterococcus faecium) for chickens for fattening and pigs (piglets) (EFSA-Q-2010-00071)

Following the discussion an Annex for piglets only will be submitted to a future meeting.

A.2.7. AveMix XG 10 (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase and endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase) for pigs for fattening and minor porcine species (EFSA-Q-2012-00727). Annex

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.

A.2.8. AveMix XG 10 (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase and endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase) for turkeys for fattening (EFSA-Q-2012-00668). Annex

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.

A.2.9. Biosprint® (Saccharomyces cerevisiae MUCL 39885) for cattle for fattening (EFSA-Q-2012-00925). Annex

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.

A.2.10a Provita LE (Enterococcus faecium DSM 7134 and Lactobacillus rhamnosus DSM 7133) for calves for rearing (EFSA-Q-2012-00421). Annex

Following the discussion, a new Annex will be submitted to a future meeting.

A.2.10b Bacillus subtilis PB6 (Bacillus subtilis ATCC PTA-6737) for turkeys for fattening and turkeys reared for breeding (EFSA-Q-2011-01151) Annex.

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.

A.2.11. Lactobacillus kefiri BIO 94 IFA 94, DSM 19455 for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2012-00645). Annex

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.

A.2.12. Preparation of bentonite - montmorillonite and sepiolite (Toxfin® Dry) for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2011-00199)
Following the discussion, more data on characterization of the active substance will be requested for a further evaluation.

A.2.13. Vitamin C forms: ascorbic acid and sodium calcium ascorbyl phosphate as a feed additive for all animal species (based on a dossier submitted by VITAC EEIG) and ascorbic acid, sodium ascorbate, calcium ascorbate, ascorbyl palmitate, sodium calcium ascorbyl phosphate and sodium ascorbyl phosphate as a feed additive for all animal species (based on a dossier submitted by DSM Nutritional Products Ltd)

The conditions of re-authorisation of these five compounds: ascorbic acid, sodium calcium ascorbyl phosphate, sodium ascorbyl phosphate, the sodium and calcium salts of ascorbic acid and ascorbyl palmitate, including their category and functional group, their characterization and the limitations of use were discussed on the basis of the two EFSA opinions and taking into account the earlier discussions. A draft Regulation will be submitted at a future meeting.

A.2.14. Vitamin A (retinyl acetate, retinyl palmitate and retinyl propionate) as a feed additive for all animal species and categories

The details of the conditions of re-authorisation were discussed. There was progress regarding the specifications and identity, identification numbers, maximum limits for different animal categories, the methods of analysis, stability, and other issues. The discussions will continue at the next meeting.

A.2.15. beta carotene as a feed additive for all animal species

On the basis of the EFSA opinion and the earlier discussions the conditions of reauthorisation of beta carotene as a nutritional additive were reviewed. A Regulation will be submitted at a future meeting.

A.2.16. Iodine compounds (E2) as feed additives for all species: calcium iodate anhydrous (coated granulated preparation)

The opinion was discussed together with the other various forms of iodine recently received. EFSA recommends sizeable reduction in use of iodine in animal feed because of possible high iodine exposure of consumers, considering also their uptake via fortified food.

Several Member States expressed disagreement with the EFSA opinion, in particular that iodine levels in feed needed to be reduced for consumer protection. Some Member States stated that it was the opinion of their human nutrition advisory bodies that iodine levels in food were already too low and that the substantial reduction recommended by EFSA in animal feed would result in an important and undesirable reduction in iodine levels in milk and eggs. Other Member States will consult internally and give their opinions later. The Committee will come back on the issue once the opinions have been further scrutinised.

A.2.17. L-cystine for all animal species
The discussion of the EFSA opinion of this new application confirmed that safety and efficacy are demonstrated. An Annex entry will be prepared for a future Committee.

### A.3 Revision of Directive 2008/38/EC

Annex entries for high concentrate products under Article 32(2), modification of existing entries, new applications and deletion of existing entries were intensely discussed. For several high concentrate products the evaluation is almost finalised and an authorisation Regulation will be presented, including also the new particular nutritional purpose "Reduction of iodine levels in feed in case of hyperthyroidism", for possible vote in a future Committee.

### A.4 Discussion on legislation related to the establishment at EU level of criteria for decontamination processes.

The establishment at EU level of criteria for decontamination processes was discussed more than two years ago and got a wide support within the Committee but could not be proceeded with. Following the recent events of contamination of large quantities of maize with aflatoxins, there is a renewed interest to have a legal framework at EU level for the decontamination of feed materials. Therefore the Commission service has the intention to re-launch the discussion and asked the Committee if in the meantime major issues have been identified with the provisions as currently foreseen. The Member States welcomed the re-launch of the discussion on this topic and indicated that they had not identified major issues with the current text. It goes without saying that some (minor) issues need further clarification. The Commission representative indicated to initiate the discussions with the other concerned Commission services on the basis of the current foreseen provisions.

### A.5 Discussion on a guidance level for T-2 and HT-2 toxin for cat feed.

Taking into account the conclusions of the scientific opinion, investigations have to be undertaken in order to collect information on the factors resulting in relative high levels of T2 and HT-2 toxin in cereals and cereal products and on the effects of feed and food processing. Therefore, Commission Recommendation 2013/165/EU of 27 March 2013 on the presence of T-2 and HT-2 toxin in cereals and cereal products [1] has been adopted. Given the toxicity of T-2 and HT-2 toxin for cats it is appropriate to establish a guidance value for the sum of T-2 and HT-2 toxin in cat feed to be applied for judging the acceptability of cat feed as regards the presence of T-2 and HT-2 toxin. Commission Recommendation 2006/576/EC of 17 August 2006 on the presence of deoxynivalenol, zearalenone, ochratoxin A, T-2 and HT-2 and fumonisins in products intended for animal feeding [2] should therefore be amended. The suggested guidance level is 50 µg/kg for the sum of T-2 and HT-2 toxin in compound feed for cats. This level is considered to be protective enough for the health of cats. The Commission representative indicated that a draft Commission Recommendation amending Commission Recommendation 2006/576/EC would...
be submitted for possible endorsement.


A.6 Update and exchange of views on recent RASFF notifications.

Since the last meeting, there were 13 Rapid Alert System for Feed and Food (RASFF) notifications related to the presence of unacceptable levels of undesirable substances in feed.

- 2 notifications regarding a non-compliant level of aflatoxin B1 in maize from the Ukraine and 1 notification in maize from Romania and Bulgaria;
- 1 notification on a non-compliant level of aflatoxin B1 in feed for milking cows in Germany;
- 1 notification on an excessive level of free gossypol in cotton seeds from Togo;
- 1 notification on lead in pet food from the Netherlands with raw material from the United Kingdom;
- 1 notification on an excessive content of mineral oil in poultry fat from France destined for pet food. A possible source of the contamination by mineral oil of the fat, which is duck fat, is the use of paraffin wax to pluck the small feathers during processing;
- 1 notification on an excessive level of dioxins in marigold yellow pigment from Spain, possibly related to a bad drying process;
- 1 notification on an excessive level of dioxins in feed premixture (40 ng WHO-TEQ/kg) and feed additives manufactured in Belgium with raw material (tocopherol – vitamin E) from China. The tocopherol itself was found to contain 186 ng WHO-TEQ/kg. According to the available information the tocopherols are produced from soybean deodorizer distillate. A possible presence of high levels of dioxins in the soybean deodorizer distillate could be the source of contamination;
- 4 notifications by Slovenia on the presence of high level of hydroxymethylfurfural (HMF) in complementary feed (High Fructose Corn Syrup – HFCS) for bees, from Greece, Serbia and Bosnia-Herzegovina (2 notifications). HMF is a heat formed contaminant which is toxic for honeybees. The level of HMF increases also as the consequence of inappropriate storage conditions. The delegation of Belgium informed the Committee that they applied an action level of 40 mg/kg HMF in HFCS as complementary feed for bees, following the advice of their Scientific Committee of 15 October 2010. This is in line with the maximum level of HMF in honey established by Council Directive 2001/110/EC of 20 December 2001 relating to honey and the Codex Alimentarius level of HMF in honey (CODEX STAN 12-1981). According to the scientific information available, the level of 40 mg/kg HMF in HFCS used as complementary feed for bees does not result in adverse health effects in bees.


A.7.1 Outcome of the working group of 18 March 2013
A Commission representative presented the outcome of the working group of 18 March 2013 on the practical implementation of the dioxin legislation and dealing with additional issues. The outcome of the working group was discussed and some further implementation issues identified. The Commission services will consider these and report back at a future meeting.

A.7.2. Report of Italy on the investigation in the margins of RASFF notification 2013.0078

Information from Italy on their continuing investigation on dioxin contamination in feed oils sent to Austria. Italy gave a detailed report which identified several non-compliances; ie non-approval of premises, mislabelling of feed materials, industrial materials used for feed. The investigation on the incident is not yet complete so the Committee will come back to it at a future meeting.

A.8 Discussion on the situation as regards the presence of aflatoxin B1 in maize originating from South –East Europe and on the measures taken to avoid that non-compliant maize can enter the feed chain.

The Committee was informed by several delegations of the increased vigilance applied by the competent authorities and the feed business operators as regards the presence of aflatoxin B1 in maize from South East Europe. The delegation of Romania provided detailed information to the Committee on the actions undertaken by the Romanian competent authorities and feed business operators on the different RASFF notifications as regards the presence of aflatoxin B1 in maize in which Romania has been involved/affected.

B.1 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorisation of a preparation of orthophosphoric acid as a feed additive for all animal species.

The draft proposes to re-authorise, under the provisions of Article 10.2, the above additive as a preservative in feed. The Commission reiterated that the draft Regulation only concerns the re-authorisation of orthophosphoric acid for use in feed, and not in water. An application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) N° 1831/2003 for its new use in water is being considered but because of its exceptional complexity the Commission will return to this at a later date.

Vote taken: unanimous in favour.

B.2 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Implementing Regulation concerning the authorisation of a preparation of Bifidobacterium animalis ssp animalis DSM 16284, Lactobacillus salivarius ssp salivarius DSM 16351 and Enterococcus faecium DSM 21913 as a feed additive for chickens for fattening (holder of authorisation BIOMIN GmbH).

The draft proposes to authorise the above preparation as a new additive as gut flora stabilizer.
Vote taken: unanimous in favour.

B.3 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Regulation concerning the authorisation of cobalt(II) diacetate tetrahydrate, cobalt(II) carbonate, cobalt(II) carbonate hydroxide (2:3) monohydrate, cobalt(II) sulphate heptahydrate and coated granulated cobalt(II) carbonate hydroxide (2:3) monohydrate as feed additives.

The draft Regulation authorising the use of various forms of cobalt as a feed additive was discussed. It introduces restrictions, based on EFSA advice, compared to current practice. In particular, a recommendation to reduce the supplementation with cobalt, the maximum cobalt content in feed and restriction to species capable of using cobalt to manufacture vitamin B12. Special attention was given to the measures for worker safety.

Vote taken: unanimous in favour.


The proposed measures were already extensively presented at the last meeting of the Committee and were only briefly presented at this meeting with the focus on the changes introduced following the discussions at the last meeting. The Committee was informed that the draft will not be submitted for opinion given that the internal Commission consultation procedure was not yet finalised. Following comments received, it was acknowledged that for some of the proposed changes no extensive data were made available. It was highlighted that these changes are proposed to increase the consistency between the different provisions (volatile mustard oil, harmful botanical impurities) or that a very large margin of safety has been applied (complementary feed with high concentration of trace elements) or the same provisions are proposed for feed materials resulting from similar production processes (nitrites).

For the complementary feed with high concentration, it was suggested to use the same terminology as the terminology agreed for the amendment to Directive 2008/38/EC (feed for particular nutritional purposes) currently under discussion. One delegation mentioned that the proposal to apply the current maximum level of volatile mustard oil for rape seed cake also to feed materials derived from Camelina sativa, seems not to be appropriate as the consequence of specific glucosinolates present in Camelina sativa. The delegation undertook to provide the scientific advice of their national risk assessment body in time for next meeting.

The Commission representative committed to examine the comments in detail and indicated the intention to submit the draft Commission Regulation at a next meeting of the Committee for opinion.

M.1 Any Other Business
A representative of the Commission informed the members of the Committee on the legal status of Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) No 288/2013 concerning the suspension of the existing authorisations of the additive Toyocerin, further to the order of the President of the General Court of the E.U. of 15 April 2013. According to this order, the application of Regulation (EU) No 288/2013 is suspended until possible review based on Commission's observations or in any event pending a decision of the Court on the substance of the action of annulment submitted by the applicant for authorisation concerned. The Register of feed additives has been updated accordingly. Member States will be informed when there is any change in this status.

In response to a query from a delegation, the Commission confirmed that the definition in Regulation (EC) No 767/2009 for placing on the market was very broad and would also cover some practices such as the supply of feed in vertically integrated operations.