A.1 Applications under Regulation (EC) Nº 1831/2003 Art. 4 or 13. New applications

The latest applications were circulated for possible comments.

A.2 Applications under Regulation (EC) Nº 1831/2003 Art. 9

A.2.1 Discussion on EFSA opinion: Scientific Opinion on the safety and efficacy of Ronozyme HiPhos GT (6-phytase) as feed additive for poultry and pigs.

This document was not discussed.

A.2.2. Discussion on EFSA opinion: Scientific Opinion on the safety and efficacy of 18 strains of Lactobacillus plantarum (DSM 23375, CNCM I-3235, DSM 19457, DSM 16568, LMG 21295, DSM 16565, VTT E-78076, CNCM MA 18/5U, NCIMB 30238, ATCC PTA-6139, DSM 18112, ATCC 55058, DSM 18113, DSM 18114, ATCC 55942, ATCC 55943, ATCC 55944 and NCIMB 30094) as silage additives for all species.

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.

A.2.3. Discussion on EFSA opinion: Scientific Opinion on the safety and efficacy of potassium sorbate for dogs and cats.

This document was not discussed.

A.2.4a. Discussion on EFSA opinion: Scientific Opinion on safety and efficacy of sodium benzoate, propionic acid and sodium propionate for pigs, poultry, bovines, sheep, goats, rabbits, horses.

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.

A.2.4b. Discussion on EFSA opinion: Scientific Opinion on safety and
efficacy of sodium benzoate, propionic acid and sodium propionate for pigs, poultry, bovines, sheep, goats, rabbits, horses (2011).

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.

A.2.5. Discussion on EFSA opinion: Scientific Opinion on safety and efficacy of cobalt carbonate as feed additive for ruminants, horses and rabbits, on safety and efficacy of cobalt compounds (E3) as feed additives for all animal species: Cobaltous acetate tetrahydrate, basic cobaltous carbonate monohydrate and cobaltous sulphate heptahydrate and on safety and efficacy of coated granulated cobaltous carbonate monohydrate as feed additive for all species.

As the latter two EFSA opinions had not yet been published, the discussion had to be postponed.

A.2.6. Discussion on EFSA opinion: Scientific Opinion on safety and efficacy of selenium in the form of organic compounds produced by the selenium-enriched yeast Saccharomyces cerevisiae YSC 11111 – R646 (Selemax 1000/2000) as feed additive for all species.

As the EFSA opinion had not yet been published, the discussion had to be postponed.

A.2.7. Discussion on EFSA opinion: Scientific Opinion on the safety and efficacy of tetra-basic zinc chloride for all animal species (Annex entry).

The Annex entry was discussed. A draft Regulation for authorisation will be elaborated for vote in one of the next meetings.

A.2.8. Discussion on EFSA opinion: Scientific Opinion: on the safety and efficacy of AveMix® XG 10 (endo-1,4-beta-xylanase and endo-1,3(4)-beta-glucanase) as feed additive for laying hens and minor poultry species

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.

A.2.9. Discussion on EFSA opinion: Scientific Opinion on the safety and efficacy of Danisco Xylanase 40000 G/L (endo-1,4,-beta-xylanase) for laying hens and poultry minor species.

Following the discussion, a draft Implementing Regulation will be proposed for possible vote at a future meeting.
A.3.1. Update the list with restricted or prohibited materials (Annex III).

• Consequently to the discussion on the update of the Catalogue of feed materials with respect to oil/fat derivatives, the Committee agreed to include them in Annex III. The Commission will reflect on what would be the appropriate, concrete way.

• Given that in the scientific opinion of the FEEDAP Panel on the safety of hemp (Cannabis genus) for use in animal feed, the presence of tetrahydrocannabinol (THC) in milk was identified to be the main issue of concern for human health, the Commission representative informed the Committee that it would be appropriate to request EFSA a scientific opinion on the risks for human health related to the presence of THC in milk before taking any decision as regards the use of hemp and hemp derived feed materials for animal feeding. The Committee agreed to this approach.

• In order to improve the enforcement of the prohibition of packaging residues in feed from the agri-food industry, the Commission representative asked the Member States to communicate the analytical methods they apply with respect to such residues including the limit of quantification that can be achieved.

A.3.2. State of play on applications for high concentrate products under Article 32(2).

The Committee discussed concrete applications for which the evaluations are very much advanced. Work will be continued in the next meeting.

A.3.3. Application to amend Annex I to Directive 2008/38/EC by introducing the new particular nutritional purpose Regulation of thyroid hormone metabolism in the case of hyperthyroidism.

The Member States were not yet in the position to comment whether the supplementary information received by the applicant is satisfactory.


The Member States were not yet in the position to comment whether the supplementary information received by the applicant is satisfactory.

A.4 Update and exchange of views on recent RASFF notifications related to undesirable substances in feed.

The Committee was informed of the following RASFF notifications since the last meeting

- too high level of aflatoxin B1 in corn from Madagascar, in groundnuts from Argentina and in groundnuts from India.

- too high level of arsenic in canned pet food from Thailand.
In relation to this last notification, the Commission representative informed the Committee that the amendment to Directive 2002/32/EC as regards, *inter alia*, arsenic in pet food is expected to be soon adopted by the Commission.

**A.5 T2 and HT-2 toxin in feed. Continuation of the discussion.**

The Committee was informed that the discussions as regards possible provisions on T2 and HT-2 toxin are still ongoing and that it is therefore premature to proceed with the discussions as regards the presence of T-2 and HT-2 in feed.

A Member State indicated that it would be appropriate to compile all the monitoring data on the presence of deoxynivalenol, fumonisins, zearalenone and ochratoxin A collected in the frame of Commission Recommendation (EC) 576/2006 and to have a report on this. The Commission representative confirmed that this would be appropriate and EFSA will be therefore contacted.

**A.6 Sampling provisions for the control of feed. Further discussion on the outcome of the working group "Sampling feed".**

No new issues were raised at the meeting. At the request of a delegation, the Commission representative confirmed that the draft will be sent to the stakeholders for consultation.

**A.7 Discussion on follow-up on recent EFSA opinions related to contaminants also of relevance for feed**
- *Alternaria-toxins*
- *Citrinin*
- *Phomopsins*
- *Pyrrolizidine alkaloids.*

**Alternaria toxins**

The Committee was informed that on 6 October 2011, the European Food Safety Authority (EFSA) Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain (CONTAM) adopted the Scientific Opinion on the risks for animal and public health related to the presence of Alternaria toxins in feed and food available at:


One of the recommendations is that representative occurrence data on Alternaria toxins in food and feed across the European countries are required.

Following the conclusions of the scientific opinion the following Alternaria toxins have been identified to be of relevance and recommended for monitoring.

Alternaria-toxins of possible toxicological relevance which should be analysed:
- Alternariol (AOH)
- Alternariol monomethyl ether (AME)

Alternaria-toxins of which the occurrence in feed and/or food is of relevance and for which the analysis is appropriate
- Tenuazonic acid (TeA)
- Tentoxin (TEN)
- Altenuene (ALT)

Other Alternaria toxins (such as Altertoxins (ATX), Alternaria alternate f sp lycopersici toxins (AAL toxin)) can also be analysed but are, based on the currently available information, of less relevance.

As regards the methods of analysis to be used, LC methods of analysis with SPE clean-up is the most appropriate method of analysis for the determination of Alternaria toxins in a wide range of matrices.

Within LC methods, LC-MS methods are to be preferred as the widest range of Alternaria toxins (all recommended Toxins –see above) can be reliably analysed. LC-UV (-DAD) or LC-FL can also be used but the range of analysed Alternaria toxins is more limited but includes at least the toxins which are of possible toxicological relevance and should be analysed.

The Committee raised no objections to this recommendation.

Citrinin


The Committee endorsed the following follow-up to be given to the conclusions and recommendations of the scientific opinion:

- Development of performance criteria for the analysis of citrinin in food and feed.

- Development of a CEN standard for the analysis of citrinin in feed and food.

- Monitoring on the presence of citrinin in food and feed.

Phomopsins


The Committee endorsed the following follow-up to be given to the conclusions
and recommendations of the scientific opinion:

- Development of a validated analytical method for the identification and quantification of the major toxic phomopsin congeners (A,B,C,D and E) in food and feed. Viable strategies include either detection by HPLC-MS/MS after adequate sample clean-up procedures or an ELISA-based testing program.

- Monitoring on the presence of phomopsins in lupin-based food and feed on the EU market.

**Pyrrolizidine alkaloids (PAs)**


The Committee endorsed the following follow-up to be given to the conclusions and recommendations of the scientific opinion:

- Active co-operation on the development of a Code of Practice for weed control to prevent and reduce pyrrolizidine alkaloid contamination in food and feed. (Code of Practice is developed under the lead of The Netherlands in the Codex Committee on Contaminants in Feed and Food (CCCF) within Codex Alimentarius)

- The CONTAM Panel identified the following PAs (including the tertiary amine as well as the corresponding N-oxide forms) of particular importance monitoring their presence in food and feed:

  Senecionine-type PAs: acetylerucifoline, erucifoline, integerrimine, jacobine, jacoline, jaconine, jacozone, retrorsine, senecionine, senecephylline. These PAs occur particularly in the Senecioneae (Asteraceae family), but are also found in Crotalaria spp. (Fabaceae family).

  • Lycopsamine-type PAs: acetylichechimidine and isomers, echimidine and isomers, echivulgarine, lycopsamine and isomers, vulgarine. These PAs occur in the Boraginaceae family and in the Eupatorieae (Asteraceae family).

  • Heliotrine-type PAs: europine, heliotrine, lasiocarpine. These PAs occur in Heliotropium spp. (Boraginaceae family).

  • Monocrotaline-type PAs: fulvine, monocrotaline, retusamine, trichodesmine. These Pas occur in Crotalaria spp. (Fabaceae family).

The Committee agreed with this recommendation from the CONTAM Panel in EFSA and was informed that:
- LC-MS/MS is the method of choice
- the relevant Limits of Quantification (LOQ) to be achieved for the individual pyrrolizidine alkaloids is
  - 1 ng/g for honey
  - 0.01 ng/g for milk and milk products
  - 0.1 ng/g or µg/kg for other food and feed
- analytical standards are only available for retrorsine, seneciphylline, senecionine, echimidine and isomers, lycopsamine and isomers, heliotrine, lasiocarpine, monocrotaline, trichodesmine, (integerrimine)
- a smart choice of MRM (Multiple Reaction Monitoring) transitions enables to obtain semi-quantitative results for those PAs for which no analytical standard is available (only for experienced laboratories).

A.8 Discussion on the borderline between biocides and feed concerning application in drinking water.

Based on the letters received from the Member States’ authorities and stakeholders, progress was made on how to find a pragmatic solution on the issue without creating unnecessary overlap between the biocide and feed regime. The Member State delegates asked the Commission representatives to further proceed the constructive cooperation with DG Environment in order to optimise the coexistence of drinking water disinfectants under biocide legislation and preservatives for water given to animals under the feed additive legislation.

B.1 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Regulation concerning the authorisation of a preparation of lanthanum carbonate as a feed additive for dogs (holder of authorisation Bayer Animal Health GmbH).

A discussion took place and the vote was taken.

The draft Implementing Regulation received a favourable opinion by unanimity.

Vote taken: 345 votes in favour.

B.2 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Regulation concerning the authorisation of the preparation of citric acid, sorbic acid, thymol and vanillin as a feed additive for chickens for fattening, chickens reared for laying, all minor avian species for fattening and for laying and all minor porcine species (weaned) (holder of the authorisation Vetagro S.p.A).

A discussion took place and the vote was taken.

The draft Implementing Regulation received a favourable opinion by unanimity.
Vote taken: 345 votes in favour.

B.3 Exchange of views and possible opinion of the Committee on a draft Commission Regulation concerning the authorisation of endo-1,4-beta-xylanase (EC 3.2.1.8) produced by Aspergillus niger (CBS 109.713) as a feed additive for chickens reared for laying, turkeys reared for breeding, minor avian species for fattening and reared for laying or breeding and ornamental birds (holder of authorisation BASF SE).

A discussion took place and the vote was taken.

The draft Implementing Regulation received a favourable opinion by unanimity.

Vote taken: 345 votes in favour.


A maximum level for melamine in feed has been established in Annex I to Directive 2002/32/EC to protect animal and public health and this based on the conclusions of the EFSA opinion [1]. The maximum level is the same as the maximum level established by the Codex Alimentarius Commission for melamine in feed. However the maximum level in Codex Alimentarius Commission is established for feed as sold, while the maximum levels established in Directive 2002/32/EC are relative to a feed with a moisture content of 12%.

Melamine is used in the coating of cans containing pet food and can migrate into the wet pet food. Commission Regulation (EU) No 10/2011 of 14 January 2011 on plastic materials and articles intended to come into contact with food [2], as amended by Regulation (EU) 1282/2011 [3], establishes a specific migration limit (SML) of 2.5 mg/kg for melamine in food.

Therefore the draft Regulation proposes to change for canned wet pet food the current maximum level of 2.5 mg/kg for melamine relative to a feed with a moisture content of 12%, into an "as sold" basis and this in line with what is foreseen for food.

The Committee did not raise any objections to this proposed change.

On request of a delegation, the Commission confirmed that a compound feed containing urea or biuret has to comply with the maximum level of 2.5 mg/kg feed.

As the internal procedure within the Commission was not finalised, the vote on this draft Regulation was postponed to the next meeting of the Committee.

[1] EFSA Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain (CONTAM) and EFSA Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF);

A discussion took place and the vote was taken on the text with minor amendments. The Committee expressed a favourable opinion by qualified majority.

The Commission representative committed that the Commission will refer without delay a request to EFSA to assess the risks for animal health, public health and the environment of the presence of nickel in feed (feed materials and compound feed). Once the EFSA scientific opinion on the presence of nickel in feed is available, the Commission shall immediately initiate the discussions in the Committee on possible regulatory measures on the presence of nickel in feed in the frame of Directive 2002/32/EC on undesirable substances in feed.

Furthermore, the Committee invited the feed business operators to reflect the approach concerning residues of chemical impurities and processing aids in their guides for good manufacturing practice. Finally, the Commission Services will reflect on how to handle the non-exhaustive list of substances that might fall under the 0,1% threshold for residues of chemical impurities and processing aids as transmitted by the Feed Chain Task Force.

Vote taken: 297 votes in favour, 48 votes abstained.


The point was dealt together with point B.5.

Both documents have now been combined.