#### Members of the Peer review team:

Geert Bruinooge, Statistics Netherlands Daniel Defays, Eurostat Paloma Seoane Spiegelberg, INE, Spain

# Peer review on the implementation of the European Statistics Code of Practice

**Country visited: Germany** 

Date: 3-5 December 2007

10 March 2008

| 1. | Executive Summary  | .3 |
|----|--|----|
| 2. | Introduction   | .5 |
| 3. | Findings per Principle                                   | .6 |
|    | Principle 1: Professional Independence                   | .6 |
|    | Principle 2: Mandate for Data Collection                 | .8 |
|    | Principle 3: Adequacy of Resources                       | .9 |
|    | Principle 4: Quality commitment                          | 10 |
|    | Principle 5: Statistical confidentiality                 | 11 |
|    | Principle 6: Impartiality and objectivity                | 14 |
|    | Principle 15: Accessibility and clarity                  | 16 |
| 4. | Co-ordination role of the National Statistical Institute | 19 |
| 5. | Good practices to be highlighted                         | 19 |
| 6. | Recommendations of the peer review team                  | 20 |
| 7. | List of improvement actions by principle of the Code     | 21 |
| 8. | Annex A: Programme of the visit                          | 23 |
| 9. | Annex B: List of participants                            | 25 |

#### 1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

**Main findings** (including an assessment of the co-ordination role of the National Statistical Institute):

Pursuant to Art. 73 no. 11 of the Basic Law, the Federation shall have exclusive power to legislate with respect to statistics for federal purposes (federal statistics). The areas where federal purposes are pursued are specified in the list of legislative powers of the Federation. Pursuant to Art. 83 of the Basic law, the Länder shall execute federal laws in their own right. In line with that provision, the statistical offices of the Länder are responsible for collecting and processing federal statistics. However, Art 87 (3) of the Basic Law stipulates that autonomous federal higher authorities may be established for matters on which the Federation has legislative power. Based on that provision, the Federal Statistical Office was set up in 1950 as an autonomous federal higher authority in the sphere of competence of the Federal Minister of the Interior.

As the Federal Statistical Office is under the administrative supervision of the Federal Ministry of the Interior it needs the prior consent of the Ministry to take any major organisational, personnel of financial decisions. In respect of subject related matters, the various federal ministries exercise their specialist supervision. The production of each set of statistics is under the specialist supervision of the competent federal ministry which sees to the proper and timely compilation of the federal statistics ordered by legislation. The Federal Statistical Office is however independent and not bound by instructions regarding the specific matters of statistical work, the methodological and technical preparation and compilation of statistics.

The total of organisational and procedural rules of federal statistics is laid down in the Federal Statistics Law (BStatG).

The credibility of German federal statistics depends on the principles mentioned in Art. 1 of the Federal Statistics Law:

- Neutrality;
- Objectivity;
- Scientific independence.

The following organisational principles apply to the system of official statistics in Germany:

- Legality (no survey without legal basis);
- Functional concentration (statistics from one institution);
- Regional decentralisation (federalism).

Following the principle of legality, federal statistics are as a rule ordained by the legislator. The compilation of statistical results is hence commissioned by the federal legislator who at the same time authorises the execution of the relevant order. All relevant parameters (with a few exceptions) of a survey (in particular the variables, group of respondent and periodicity) are specified by law in Germany.

Due to the lengthy legislative procedures, however, the introduction of new statistics often takes a long time. Besides, it becomes more difficult to promptly adjust the statistical programme to changed social, economic or ecological conditions.

Following the principle of functional concentration, statistical work is generally done by specialised public authorities, namely the statistical offices, in the Federal Republic of Germany. Only in exceptional areas have other bodies been entrusted with the production of federal statistics. Thus, for instance, the Deutsche Bundesbank compiles monetary, currency and balance of payment statistics and the Federal Employment Agency provides several statistics on the labour market.

The principle of regional decentralisation follows from the federal structure of the Federal Republic of Germany. Even in areas like federal statistics where the federation has legislative power, the Länder are responsible for implementing the relevant laws. For this reason, the statistical offices of the Länder are as a rule responsible for conducting statistical surveys stipulated by law. In terms of public servants' law and finance, the statistical offices of the Länder are Land authorities which are independent from the federation. They are not bound by instructions of the Federal Statistical Office or federal ministries.

The statistical offices of the Länder are responsible for collecting and processing data in due time. There are only a few cases in which the Federal Statistical Office collects and processes data at the central level, e.g. foreign trade and cost structure statistics. As regards the vast majority of statistics, however, the core processes of statistical production take place at the statistical offices of the Länder.

The Masterplan for a Reform of German Official Statistics is a strategic programme for the further development of official statistics in Germany. It controls the joint modernisation activities of the Federal Statistical Office and the statistical offices of the Länder. It envisages a new division of tasks over the present players, which will result in a higher efficiency, a reduction of the burden on respondents, an improvement of quality of statistics and a greater flexibility to encounter the fast developments in the society and the economy. The ongoing reform of the Statistical System will require a new organization with different profiles of its employees. The new organisation will need a higher proportion of highly qualified employees.

Although the Federal Statistical Office has made progress in the introduction of quality management, the Masterplan might offer opportunities to introduce quality management over the whole chain of source statistics compiled by the statistical offices of the Länder, the Ministries, the Bundesbank, the Federal Statistical Offices up to National Accounts compiled by the Federal Statistical Office.

The Federal Statistical Office is in charge of producing and disseminating federal results. Providing the scientific community with anonymized microdata and supplying results of integrated statistical systems, like National Accounts, are areas of federal statistics with growing importance. Considerable progress has been made with the foundation of the Data Research Centres, which provide microdata sets to scientific community. However the immediate future of these centres is unsure due to budgetary questions.

The Federal Statistical Office faces problems to appoint new employees on a permanent basis. New employees can only be employed on the basis of short term contracts (varying from one to three years) which may be renewed. This procedure leads to a high turnover of new staff. This makes it very questionable whether the Federal Statistical Office will be able to attract the necessary enforcement of the present workforce with highly qualified statisticians.

In the present legal setup of the system of official statistics there is nobody with a strong mandate to take the lead in the coordination and harmonisation of the official statistics in Germany. It is recommended that in the further development of the system of official statistics as foreseen in the Masterplan such a mandate should be given.

#### 2. Introduction

With the adoption of the European Statistics Code of Practice, the Statistical Programme (SPC) committed itself to adhering to its principles. At its meeting on 25 May 2005, the SPC endorsed a stepwise monitoring procedure for the implementation of the Code over three years during which countries' self-assessments should be combined with elements of peer review, benchmarking and monitoring on the basis of the explanatory indicators added to each principle of the Code.

During December 2005 / January 2006 the National Statistical Institutes and Eurostat have completed their self-assessments, the results have been summarised by Eurostat in a report submitted to the Economic and Financial Committee in May 2006 which has been published on the Eurostat website.

As a next step towards implementation of the Code, the European Statistical System is organising peer reviews to complement the self-assessments starting with 2006. They are considered a vital element for the implementation of the Code of Practice given their capacity to encourage the sharing of best practice and to contribute to transparency in what is, essentially, a self-regulatory approach. This approach is designed to enhance accountability and to help building trust in the integrity of the European Statistical System, its processes and outputs.

The Code of Practice peer reviews follow a common methodology focusing on the institutional environment and dissemination part of the Code comprising the following principles: (1) Professional independence, (2) Mandate for data collection, (3) Adequacy of resources, (4) Quality commitment, (5) Statistical confidentiality, (6) Impartiality and Objectivity and (15) Accessibility and Clarity. In principle, the peer review is limited to the National Statistical Institute and its co-ordination role within a dispersed national statistical system. A short document provided by the National Statistical Institute which summarises key aspects of the functioning of the national statistical system is published together with this report.

During a three days visit on-site and on the basis of information material provided by the National Statistical Institute and Eurostat prior to the review, peer reviews yield a report asssessing compliance with the Code of Practice at indicator level and by principle following a four point assessment scale. The report includes a refined set of improvement actions covering all principles of the Code which are being used to feed the monitoring process of the implementation of the Code in the European Statistical System.

While the peer reviewers will undertake to base their assessment to the extent possible on factual information, it is worth noting some of the limitations of the peer review process. For example, peer reviewers are dependent upon the resources made available to them (though experienced reviewers can be expected to identify where appropriate information is not forthcoming). In addition these reviews are conducted on a strategic, organisation-wide and system wide basis. Accordingly it is not straightforward to ascertain that certain practices or behaviours or systems operate in all statistical domains.

#### 3. FINDINGS PER PRINCIPLE

#### **Principle 1: Professional Independence**

The professional independence of statistical authorities from other policy, regulatory or administrative departments and bodies, as well as from private sector operators, ensures the credibility of European Statistics.

Overall assessment: The statistical authority in Germany, the Federal Statistical Office, is regarded by all (producers, users, ministries and media) to be politically and professional independent in producing and disseminating official statistics. As all official statistics need a legal basis and the initiative to legislation is to be taken by the compentent federal ministers there might be external influences in the development and content of new statistics. The influence of the Federal Statistical Office regarding the type of statistics to be developped is limited.

Indicator 1.1: The independence of the statistical authority from political and other external interference in producing and disseminating official statistics is specified in law.

#### Largely met

#### Comments:

The Law on Statistics for Federal Purposes (Bundesstatistikgesetz BStatG) of 22 January 1987 states in Art. 2 that the Federal Statistical Office is an independent superior federal authority in the sphere of competence of the Federal Minister of the Interior. In Art. 1 it states that Federal Statistics should be subject to the principles of neutrality, objectivity and scientific independence. It also states (Art. 1 (3)) that the Federal Statistical Office shall carry out it duties in accordance with the requirements of the competent federal ministers within the scope of a work programme. The Federal Statistical Office should be responsible for all press releases for the statistics it compiles but it is not completely. The Ministry of Economics and Technology composes and publishes the press releases for the production index and the index of new orders.

The fairly modest score in the recent users' survey on the perception of political independence (66% of the users regard "political independence" as fully or largely applicable to the Federal Statistical Office) is, according to the Federal Statistical Office, in line with the general attitude of the public towards public administration.

Indicator 1.2: The head of the statistical authority has sufficiently high hierarchical standing to ensure senior level access to policy authorities and administrative public bodies. He/She should be of the highest professional calibre.

#### **Fully met**

#### Comments:

The President of the Federal Statistical Office is appointed by the Federal President on proposal of the Federal Government. The President is not appointed for a specified term. The president of the Federal Statistical Office is in the hierarchical level comparable with the highest non political public servant. No presidents have left the Federal Statistical Office involuntarily. The Federal Statistical office is advised to appoint future presidents for a fixed term and to increase the transparency of the procedure of selection and appointment of its presidents.

Indicator 1.3: The head of the statistical authority and, where appropriate, the heads of its statistical bodies have responsibility for ensuring that European Statistics are produced and disseminated in an independent manner.

#### **Fully met**

Comments: All official requirements regarding European Statistics are incorporated in the annual plans of the Federal Statistical Office. The Federal Statistical Office is responsible for the dissemination of European Statistics.

Indicator 1.4: The head of the statistical authority and, where appropriate, the heads of its statistical bodies have the sole responsibility for deciding on statistical methods, standards and procedures, and on the content and timing of statistical releases.

#### Largely met

Comments: Following the principle of legality of the system of offical statistics in Germany, federal statistics are as a rule ordered by the legislator. The compilation of statistical results is hence commissioned by the federal legislator who at the same time authorises the execution of the relevant order. In practise this means that all esssential parameters of a survey are specified by law in Germany. In this process there may be external influences on the development, content, standards and procedures of these statistics.

Indicator 1.5: The statistical work programmes are published and periodic reports describe progress made.

#### **Fully met**

Comments: The statistical work programmes are published. The Strategy and Programme Plan gives an overview of the current programme of the Federal Statistical Office and the developments planned. The plan describes the activities carried out in the area of producing and disseminating statistics and outlines the operations and activities in the fields of administration and information technology. The Annual Report gives an overview of the milestones of the statistical work in various areas. It documents major aspects in the state and the services of the services provided by the Federal Statistical Office.

Indicator 1.6: Statistical releases are clearly distinguished and issued separately from political/policy statements.

#### Largely met

Comments: Almost all statistical releases of the Federal Statistical Office are clearly distinguished and are always issued separately from political-policy statements. The exceptions are the index of new orders and the production index. These indices are compiled by the Federal Statistical Office, but results and press releases are published by the Ministry of Economics and Technology.

Indicator 1.7: The statistical authority, when appropriate, comments publicly on statistical issues, including criticisms and misuses of official statistics.

#### Fully met

Comments: The Federal Statistical Office has the following policy regarding criticisms and misuses of official statistics. In the case of inappropriate reporting by the media, the FSO, depending on the circumstances, may: 1) contact the journalists or the editors-in-chief, 2) write a letter to the editor, 3) publish a press release and 4) in extreme cases, complain to the German Press Council (Deutscher Presserat). At the time of the introduction of the Euro the

Federal Statistical Office carried out an active press campaign to inform the public about the developments of the inflation.

#### **Principle 2: Mandate for Data Collection**

Statistical authorities must have a clear legal mandate to collect information for European statistical purposes. Administrations, enterprises and households, and the public at large may be compelled by law to allow access to or deliver data for European statistical purposes at the request of statistical authorities.

Overall assessment: The Federal Statistical Office has a strong mandate for the collection of data with the help of surveys. The mandate to use administrative and register data is still limited.

Indicator 2.1: The mandate to collect information for the production and dissemination of official statistics is specified in law.

#### **Fully met**

Comments: The German Constitution (Basic Law) and the Law on Statistics for Federal Purposes (BStatG) of 22 January 1987 provide the legal basis for the data collection. According to this legislation each survey must have a legal basis. Therefore, legislature decides in the course of the democratic process which data have to be collected. All federal statistics require a special federal law or European Union legal basis. The initiative for new legislation is taken by the competent ministry in terms of subject matter. For example, the Ministry of Transport is the responsible authority to take the initiative for new legislation for the transport statistics. The competent ministry in terms of subject matters cooperates with the Federal Statistical Office on this.

Indicator 2.2: The statistical authority is allowed by national legislation to use administrative records for statistical purposes.

#### Partly met

Comments: The Law on the use of administrative data (VwDVG) of 32 October 2003 created the legal basis for data supplies and studies for the suitability of administrative data for short term economics statistics and for other purposes laid down in the Law (turnover tax registers, statistical registers, Intra Community Trade Statistics). The Federal Statistical Office now examines opportunities to use administrative data in the areas of business statistics. The new Law on service statistics provides for a mixture of primary and administrative data. The relevant provisions in the area of Agricultural Statistics were extended in 2006. In other areas there is still a need for legislation for further use of administrative data.

Indicator 2.3: On the basis of a legal act, the statistical authority may compel response to statistical surveys.

#### **Fully met**

Comments: The Law on Statistics for Federal Purposes creates the legal basis for the obligation to provide information. The legal provisions ordering federal statistics must determine whether and to what extend the survey is to be conducted with or without an obligation to provide information. If an obligation has been stipulated, then all natural and legal persons, associations of persons, public authorities as well as communities and local authorities have to comply. Art. 23 of the Law on Statistics for Federal Purposes provides the legal basis for

provisions on fines. Not complying with the obligation to provide information may be punishable with a substantial fine.

#### Principle 3: Adequacy of Resources

The resources available to statistical authorities must be sufficient to meet European Statistics requirements.

Overall assessment: While the resources of the Federal Statistical Office are in general considered as satisfactory, it is worth noting that the Office faces problems with regard to recruiting statistical skilled staff and to filling vacancies for upper management. Limited contracts for new staff lead to a situation of high turnover. In addition the share of personnel with a scientific qualification should be higher as the Office is increasingly faced with tasks of a scientific nature.

Indicator 3.1: Staff, financial, and computing resources, adequate both in magnitude and in quality, are available to meet current European Statistics needs.

#### Largely met

Comments: At upper management level, the Federal Statistical Office does not have the optimal opportunity to fill vacancies considering only statistical expertise and the preferences of the management of the Federal Statistical Office. Instead, vacancies are advertised publicly and there is a selection board with external board members from the Federal Ministry of the Interior in addition to the internal board members, the former giving higher priority to abilities in the fields of human resources management and strategic thinking than to statistical expertise.

Due to the general scarcity of resources in all public spheres and the high demands placed on respondents by statistics, not everything desirable can be fully realised when selecting statistical methods and in practical work. This means that in addition to professional aspects determining for instance the scope and frequency of surveys, the budget and the rights of respondents must always be considered, too.

Like all other state institutions, the Federal Statistical Office has to observe the framework conditions of public service, budget and tendering regulations. Therefore, operational human resources management and control instruments cannot be transferred to statistics without modification. For example at all levels 100% of the new staff gets limited contracts, which last one to three years. To all apprentices a limited contract is offered after finishing the apprenticeship. Apprentices with an extraordinary high performance can stay for two more years. To the others a one year contract is offered. This results in a high turnover of new staff. Due to this and the developments on the labour market the Federal Statistical Office will find it probably more difficult to fill vacancies.

The staff structure at the Federal Statistical Office is not optimal. The Federal Statistical Office is increasingly faced with tasks of a scientific nature due to this and the developments foreseen in the Masterplan. The share of personnel with a scientific qualification should be higher.

Indicator 3.2: The scope, detail and cost of European Statistics are commensurate with needs.

For European level reply

Indicator 3.3: Procedures exist to assess and justify demands for new European Statistics against their cost.

For European level reply

Indicator 3.4: Procedures exist to assess the continuing need for all European Statistics, to see if any can be discontinued or curtailed to free up resources.

For European level reply

#### **Principle 4: Quality commitment**

All ESS members commit themselves to work and co-operate according to the principles fixed in the Quality Declaration of the European Statistical System.

Overall assessment: Assessments based on the Excellence Model of the EFQM take place regularly (1999, 2003 and 2006). The Federal Statistical Office carries out quality controls of outputs by the production of quality reports and internal expert groups meetings. There is no fixed model of evaluation to monitor the quality of the stages in the statistical production process but the system is currently being re-engineered and an overall assessment system for the quality of processes and products is conceptualised at present. Quality Standards are documented, spelled out in writing and made known to the public. The staff is well trained on quality. There is no regular or systematic review of key statistics outputs using external experts, but statistical outputs are regularly discussed in several advisory and expert bodies of the official system of statistics in Germany.

Indicator 4.1 Product quality is regularly monitored according to the ESS quality components.

#### Largely met

Comments: The Federal Statistical Office has established since some years a quality management system based on the framework of the European Foundation for Quality Management. Assessments based on the Excellence Model of the EFQM took place in the years of 1999, 2003 and 2006. While in 1999 only selected criteria were assessed on the criteria level, in 2003 and 2006 there were self-assessments as well as external assessments by EFQM-certified assessors (not from the Federal Statistical Office) on the full range of the EFQM-criteria and sub-criteria level.

The Federal Statistical Office carries out quality controls of outputs by the production of quality reports and internal expert group meetings. For the quality dimension punctuality a monitoring system has been established (an early alert dimension). Quality reports are currently being assessed. The reports are not really fully harmonised.

Indicator 4.2 Processes are in place to monitor the quality of the collection, processing and dissemination of statistics.

#### Partly met

Comments: Procedures are in place to monitor the quality of dissemination for most of statistics but although there are a number of guidelines for the quality of collection and processing, there is no fixed model of evaluation. Assessments are not applied for all or more statistics. The Federal Statistical Office justifies this by the current re-engineering of the statistical production processes.

The Mathematical Statistical Methods Group and the Institute for Research and Development advise on survey processes to be followed.

There is no system to monitor systematically the quality of the statistics over the whole chain of source statistics up to National Accounts.

Indicator 4.3 Processes are in place to deal with quality considerations, including trade-offs within quality, and to guide planning for existing and emerging surveys.

#### Partly met

Comments: There is not a clear instrument to deal with quality considerations, neither systematical procedures are applied for the trade off of Existing surveys. For the quality dimensions punctuality, a monitoring system has been established.

Pilot studies and testing of the questionnaire are carried out before the implementation of a new survey.

Indicator 4.4 Quality guidelines are documented and staff are well trained. These guidelines are spelled out in writing and made known to the public.

#### **Fully met**

Comments: Quality Standards are documented, spelled out in writing and made known to the public. The Federal Statistical Office and the Statistical Offices of the Länder agreed upon these joint quality standards.

Junior staff received training courses in quality and further training is systematically conducted.

Expert meeting and meetings of specialist committees on quality are systematically held.

Indicator 4.5 There is a regular and thorough review of the key statistical outputs using external experts where appropriate.

#### Partly met

Comments: There is no regular or systematic review of the key statistics outputs using external experts. Some areas like National Accounts, Producer Price Index, Government Finance Statistics, and Balance of Payment Statistics have recently been subject to a Data Review of Standards and Codes (ROSC) by the IMF.

Also at a regular basis statistical outputs are discussed in several advisory and expert bodies of the official system of statistics in Germany.

#### **Principle 5: Statistical confidentiality**

The privacy of data providers (households, enterprises, administrations and other respondents), the confidentiality of the information they provide and its use only for statistical purposes must be absolutely guaranteed.

Overall assessment: Statistical confidentiality is guaranteed in law.

The staff of the Federal Statistical Office has to sign a legal confidentiality commitment on appointment and breaches of statistical confidentiality are punishable by law.

Instructions and guidelines exist on the protection of statistical confidentiality in the production and dissemination processes (data in tables and microdata). These instructions are partially made known to the public.

The Federal Statistical Office places decisive importance on data security. The IT security guidelines have been designed by the Federal Statistical Office and the statistical offices of the

Länder to substantiate and document their common interest in an IT security process and security objectives.

Internal and external audits are made to check the implementation and the effectiveness of the IT security measures.

Strict protocols apply to external users accessing statistical anonymised microdata for research purposes.

#### Indicator 5.1 Statistical confidentiality is guaranteed in law.

#### **Fully met**

Comments: Confidentiality in Germany is regulated by the Federal Data Protection Act. Section 5 of the Law states that persons employed in data processing shall not collect, process or use personal data without authorization (confidentiality). On taking up their duties such persons, in so far as they work for private bodies, shall be required to give an undertaking to maintain such confidentiality. This undertaking shall continue to be valid after termination of their activity.

Statistics for Federal Purposes Act of 22 January 1987 protects confidentiality stricter than Federal Data Protection Law. Article 16 of the Law states that individual data on personal circumstances or the material situation provided for federal statistics shall not be disclosed by the incumbents and the person specially sworn in for public services who are entrusted with the operation of federal statistics unless otherwise stipulated by special legal provision. The obligation to confidentiality applies also to those persons who are recipients of individual data pursuant to a special legal provision or for the purpose of scientific projects.

Article 16 also regulates the transmission of the individual data between persons and agencies entrusted with the operation of federal statistics, the transmission of individual data to the Länder statistical offices, to agencies of communities and local authorities and the transmission for the purposes of scientific projects.

The respondents will be notified in writing or electronically about the rules governing statistical confidentiality (Article 17 of the Law).

Interview findings indicate that nobody has tried to identify an individual from data or statistical output.

#### Indicator 5.2 Statistical authority staff sign legal confidentiality commitments on appointment.

#### **Fully met**

Comments: The staff of the Federal Statistical Office must sign a legal confidentiality commitment on appointment.

Professional secrecy is also guaranteed by Law. Article 14 of the Law on Statistics for Federal Purposes of 22 January 1987 states that persons entrusted with the execution of a survey will be obliged in writing to safeguard statistical secrecy according to Article 16 and to keep confidential also any information which they have gained during their activity. This obligation also applies after the termination of their activity.

According to the interviewees, no breaches of statistical confidentiality are known.

Indicator 5.3 Substantial penalties are prescribed for any wilful breaches of statistical confidentiality.

#### **Fully met**

Comments: Breaches of statistical confidentiality are punishable.

The unauthorized disclosure of individual statistical data by the statistical staff entrusted with the operation of federal statistics, or by the persons specially sworn in for the public service is a punishable act. Article 203 of the Penal Code states that a violation of confidentiality is liable to a fine or imprisonment for no more than one year. Staff members of the Federal Statistical Office will also have to face disciplinary or labour law consequences if they violate their vote of secrecy and fidelity.

The Federal Statistics Law (Article 22) states that a term of imprisonment not exceeding one year or a fine will be imposed in the case of violation of the prohibition of matching individual data from federal statistics or combining such individual data with other information for establishing a reference to persons, enterprises, establishments or local units for other than statistical purposes under the Law or of a legal provision setting out the needs for federal statistics.

Indicator 5.4 Instructions and guidelines are provided on the protection of statistical confidentiality in the production and dissemination processes. These guidelines are spelled out in writing and made known to the public.

#### **Fully met**

Comments: Instructions and guidelines exist on the protection of statistical confidentiality in the production and dissemination processes (data in tables and microdata). These instructions are set out in writing and are well-known to the staff, who are aware of the risk (disclosure) they can accept in making statistics available. However, the public are only made partially aware in order to protect the data from attacks.

Indicator 5.5 Physical and technological provisions are in place to protect the security and integrity of statistical databases

#### **Fully met**

Comments: The Federal Statistical Office places decisive importance on data security. It has established several physical and technological provisions to protect the security and integrity of statistical databases.

The IT security manual has been made by the Federal Statistical Office and the statistical offices of the Länder in accordance with standard manuals on security to substantiate and document their common interest in an IT security process and security objectives.

The Federal Statistical Office makes use of common systems and mechanisms such as firewalls, restricted access, tracing access and antivirus programs to protect statistical confidentiality. PCs do not have USB ports, and CD-DVD is only available for reading.

A system of central data storage with selective access operates at the Federal Statistical Office. The secure deletion of files, the separation and cancellation of the auxiliary

characteristics are guaranteed in accordance with data protection rules (secure access storage until collection).

Internal and external audits are made to check the implementation and the effectiveness of the IT security measures.

Microdata available for research purposes are anonymised to avoid identification of respondents, and are only available in a secure environment.

The responsibility and the function of IT security management are distributed between the management level and the IT Security officer who, is responsible for attending to the needs of IT security within the organisation and externally. The IT Security officer immediately conveys any security-relevant information to the management. He has the right to contact directly the IT Director, the relevant Head of Division and the President. The IT Security Officer has the right to access all areas of operation to fulfill his tasks. He regularly and in case of need informs the Heads of Divisions and the IT Director on the current states of IT security at the Federal Statistical Office.

Indicator 5.6 Strict protocols apply to external users accessing statistical microdata for research purposes.

#### **Fully met**

Comments: To allow the scientific community to have access to the entire range of information from official statistics, the Research Data Centre of the Federal Statistical Office and of the Statistical Offices of the Länder have established various ways to access their microdata. These ways are the result of different combinations of data anonymisation and access control.

- Absolutely anonymised microdata sets available for free download at the Research Data Centre web and for all of kind of users.
- De Facto anonymised microdata sets. They can be transmitted for external use in scientific institutions.
- Project-related de facto anonymisation for on-site use. These data can only be analysed on the premises of the Research Data Centres of the Federation and the Länder, using the so-called safe scientific workstations.

The Research Data Centre now allows controlled remote data processing for project-related de facto anonymisation.

According to the interviewees, users evaluate positively the availability of microdata and they agree with the confidentiality rules applied to the data.

#### Principle 6: Impartiality and objectivity

Statistical authorities must produce and disseminate European Statistics respecting scientific independence and in an objective, professional and transparent manner in which all users are treated equitably.

Overall assessment: The impartiality and objectivity of the Federal Statistical Office is largely recognised. As most data collections are regionalised by law, the visibility given to the

statistical requirements, the techniques and the sources which are used, is high. The website is fairly complete and improvements, asked for by users, are currently being implemented.

Indicator 6.1: Statistics are compiled on an objective basis determined by statistical considerations.

#### Fully met

Comments: This principle is laid down in Article 1 of the Law on Statistics for Federal Purposes ("Federal Statistics shall be subject to the principles of neutrality, objectivity and independence") and the Federal Statistics Office is perceived by 82% of the users, interrogated in the 2006 satisfaction survey, as neutral and as objective. This is also confirmed by the interviews carried out during the visit of the peer review.

Indicator 6.2: Choices of sources and statistical techniques are informed by statistical considerations.

#### Largely met

Comments: Again, the Law on Statistics for Federal Purposes prescribes the use of scientific findings and of appropriate methods and informational techniques. It has also to be underlined that as the Federal Statistical Office is highly dependent on the statistical offices of the Länder, the quality and the comparability of the data they provide are guaranteed by very comprehensive legal acts and by high quality commitment of the Statistical offices of the Länder.

The choices of the sources could also depend on other actors of the German Statistical System. There is no systematic check of the quality of administrative sources but a more case by case analysis. A more standardized way to assess available sources is currently being considered.

As the compilation of statistics is commissioned by the Federal legislator, the freedom of the Federal Statistical Office in the definition of the appropriate statistical methodology may be limited.

Indicator 6.3: Errors discovered in published statistics are corrected at the earliest possible date and publicised.

#### **Fully met**

Comments: Correction of errors is ruled by internal procedures. The press is daily checked and clarifications or corrections are made where necessary. The interviews have shown that the appropriate clarifications have been made when necessary.

According to representatives of the media, revisions should be more highlighted in the press releases.

Indicator 6.4: Information on the methods and procedures used by the statistical authority are publicly available.

#### Largely met

Comments: For the vast majority of the statistical output, information on the methods and procedures is available on the web site and most of the users met during the peer review have expressed their satisfaction with the current situation.

However, it seems, from the user survey, that the information could be presented in a more telling way (better comprehensibility and more clarity (e.g. to statistical laymen). Some simple explanations of complicated concepts like GDP deflators would be welcomed by some of the media.

Indicator 6.5: Statistical release dates and times are pre -announced.

#### **Fully met**

Comments: A release calendar is published and a procedure is in place to revise it. This is strictly followed and appreciated by the press.

Indicator 6.6: All users have equal access to statistical releases at the same time and any privileged pre-release access to any outside user is limited, controlled and publicised. In the event that leaks occur, pre-release arrangements should be revised so as to ensure impartiality.

#### Largely met

Comments: Ministries concerned by specific statistical releases which could be expected to make a statement for the media, are informed slightly in advance (the afternoon before publication). Ministries seem to be satisfied with this practise. The pre-release access for the Ministries is not yet published on the website.

Leak of information (GDP figures) have been observed on a few occasions over the past years. After the latest leak in the 3rd quarter of 2007 an ad-hoc enquiry has been launched by the President of the Federal Statistical Office to identify the source of the problem.

Indicator 6.7: Statistical releases and statements made in Press Conferences are objective and non-partisan.

#### Largely met

Comments: No subjective political statements are included in the statistical releases and the user survey quotes neutrality as one of the most important characteristics of the image of the Federal Statistical Office (82%). In addition, not a single case where the independence of the Federal Statistical offices has been seriously doubted has been observed so far. This is confirmed by the representatives of the media. However, the fairly modest score on the perception of political independence (66% of the users regard "political independence" as fully or largely applicable to the Federal Statistical Office) could be a source of concern. According to the Federal Statistical Office, this translates a general attitude towards public administration.

#### **Principle 15: Accessibility and clarity**

European Statistics should be presented in a clear and understandable form, disseminated in a suitable and convenient manner, available and accessible on an impartial basis with supporting metadata and guidance.

Overall assessment: There is an overall satisfaction with the publications and the services provided by the Federal Statistical Office. Access to micro data has greatly improved recently through the creation of the highly appreciated research data centres. Further standardization and harmonization of metadata is ongoing or planned.

Indicator 15.1: Statistics are presented in a form that facilitates proper interpretation and meaningful comparisons.

#### Largely met

Comments: In spite of the fact that the usability of the website has been tested for different groups of users, the opinion of the users expressed in the user satisfaction survey of end 2006 regarding the clarity of the web pages is fairly reserved: 29 % have expressed their disappointment. But the website has evolved since the last user survey. The users met during the interviews have underlined the progress achieved recently: availability of data online and free of charge, better timeliness, possibility to download Excel files, access to micro data.

In some cases, the data are not consistent with those published in the press releases. Links between time series (or survey data) and the data published in the press releases would also be desirable for some specialised media.

The Federal Statistical Office recognises the need to extend the English-language information available. This work is currently on-going.

In general, there is an overall satisfaction with the publications and services provided by the Federal Statistical office: 92% of the users are convinced or satisfied. Compared to other organisations in Germany, the Federal Statistical Office would range, according to the society which carried out the user survey, in the good mid-range.

All press-releases are published in both German and English.

Indicator 15.2: Dissemination services use modern information and communication technology and, if appropriate, traditional hard copy.

#### Largely met

Comments: The Federal Statistical Office offers different ways to access the information: the website facilities are broadly used and a majority of statistics are available through them but the users also particularly appreciate the telephone services (97% are satisfied with the service). A new remote access facility has been developed for researchers. The search facility of the Genesis–Online needs improvement. In spite of recent considerable efforts to improve accessibility of data through the website, the user survey shows that there is still room for improvement (14% of disappointed clients of the website).

The majority of the clients are also aware of the main traditional hard copy publication (Statistical Yearbook).

Indicator 15.3: Custom-designed analyses are provided when feasible and are made public.

#### Largely met

Comments: Tailor made analyses are provided and users are very satisfied with individual services provided by the Federal Statistical Office. The results of the analysis become sometimes generally available.

The Federal Statistical Office has also intensified its relations with schools and universities: regular meetings for students, courses on national accounts currently being developed for the staff of institutions of higher education and teachers.

Indicator 15.4: Access to microdata can be allowed for research purposes. This access is subject to strict protocols.

#### **Fully met**

#### Comments:

The situation has evolved in the last years and now a broad range of microdata are put at the disposal of researchers through research data centres. To respond to a pressing demand from the scientific community, different kinds of anonymisations and accesses have been considered and implemented (absolute, de facto, or project related de facto anonymisations plus remote access). The establishment of research data centres in the Länder and at federal level is perceived as a great success.

The permanent funding of those centres is currently a subject of discussion in Germany.

Access to individual data is strongly controlled and the statistical law requires a record to be taken of the different transmissions.

Indicator 15.5: Metadata are documented according to standardised metadata systems.

#### Largely met

Comments: The Federal Statistical Office has designed a standard metadata format for its statistical output and has signed up to the SDDS since 1996. The IMF has underlined that it met its specifications for all data categories (conclusion of the IMF Data ROSC of January 2006). Progress is still possible to make the metadata and the comments issued through different channels (paper publications, press releases, internet,...) more consistent.

Indicator 15.6: Users are kept informed on the methodology of statistical processes and the quality of statistical outputs with respect to the ESS quality criteria.

#### Largely met

Comments: Quality reports are available for all sets of statistics. Their evaluation has started recently and there seems to be room for some improvement.

Most of the users met during the interviews expressed a high level of satisfaction with the way they are informed on quality by the Federal Statistical Office. They feel informed of methodological developments and are associated to the changes, among others through participation in the thematic working groups of the Statistical Advisory Committee.

According to the IMF Data ROSC report (January 2006), there is however still scope to improve methodological metadata for some data sets (PPI, government finance statistics) for specialised users. This has been done.

#### 4. CO-ORDINATION ROLE OF THE NATIONAL STATISTICAL INSTITUTE

The individual tasks of statistical production and the related division among various institutions, like the Federal Statistical Office, the statistical offices of the Länder, the Deutsche Bundesbak and the Federal Employment Agency require coordination which is ensured in a number of bodies

The Conferences and Meeting of Heads of Statistical offices discuss matters of principle regarding cooperation between the statistical offices of the Länder and the Federal Statistical Office. Upon completion of programme planning by the Conference of Heads of the Statistical offices, the Committee on Optimised Cooperation set up for the new optimised cooperation model will determine the tasks to be accomplished in line with this model. The functions of the Committees on Strategy and Marketing and on Organisation and Implementation are to prepare, in terms of content, the conferences and meetings of the Heads of the Statistical offices and to perform the necessary follow up work. The Committee on Strategy and Marketing serves as a platform for discussing relevant issues and proposals for the further development of official statistics. Experts of the statistical offices of the Federation and the Länder come together at special meeting designed to discuss questions of relevant working areas of statistics.

According to Art. 4 of the Federal Statistics Law, the task of the Statistical Advisory Committee is to give advice to the Federal Statistical Office in fundamental matters. It represents various user groups (such as associations, trade unions, and respondents), which use that body to contact the producers of federal statistics. The Committee also represents the interest of official statistics towards politicians, for example by submitting recommendations on the further development of official statistics to the Federal Government at the beginning of any parliamentary term. The Statistical Advisory Committee has set up specific bodies, the so called Specialist committees, for the discussion of subject related issues. The structure of these bodies is in line with Expert meeting attended by the experts of the Federal Statistical Office and the statistical offices of the Länder. This ensures consideration of the needs and interest of the Advisory Committee at the working level, too.

In the present legal setup of the system of official statistics there is nobody with a strong mandate to take the lead in the coordination and harmonisation of the official statistics in Germany. It is recommended that in the further development of the system of official statistics, as foreseen in the Masterplan, such a mandate should be given.

#### 5. GOOD PRACTICES TO BE HIGHLIGHTED

The Research Data Centre. The Statistical Offices of the Länder and the Federal Statistical Offices have set up a wide range of services for the scientific community of Germany. An extensive range of micro data of official statistics has been made available to the scientific community. Furthermore, for providing also comfortable access to these statistics, various ways of data use were established. These services are highly appreciated by the scientific community.

Scientific Use Files. The Federal Statistical Office grants scientists privileged access on a legal basis to official microdata.

Campus file. A special offer to students is a campus file of 1998 wage and income tax statistics which is made available free of charge for download.

CENEX. The Federal Statistical Office participates in the CENEX on the issue of data confidentiality. This CENEX might solve the high costs of guaranteeing the confidentialty with the publication of data by the statistical offices of the Länder and the Federal Statistical Office. This problem is identical to the one which faces Eurostat and the member states.

#### 6. RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PEER REVIEW TEAM

#### Principle 1

The Federal Statistical Office should compose and publish all press releases for all the statistics it produces, without interference of other parties.

The Federal Statistical Office should make transparent the differences between the original technical and methodological proposal for new statistics and the resulting one after the legislation process.

#### Principle 2

The Federal Statistical Office should investigate further use of administrations and registers and develop a long term plan to implement the use of registers and administrative data. This plan accommodates the preparation of the necessary legislation. This may be a part of the Masterplan.

#### Principle 3

The Federal Statistical Office should carry out on a regular basis exit interviews with outgoing personnel. This may facilitate the Federal Statistical Office to increase its attractiveness as an employer.

The Federal Statistical Office should look into possibilities to attract new highly qualified employees on a permanent employment basis. This will help to increase the fraction of highly qualified employees, needed to carry out the task of a more scientific nature and the reform of the system of official statistics.

The Federal Statistical Office should improve planning facilities to balance resources and needs for new programmes. This may create resources for the reform of the system of official statistics. This may be part of the Masterplan.

#### Principle 4

The Federal Statistical Office should systematically calculate Standard quality indicators for the main dimensions and subdimensions of quality.

The Federal Statistical Office should develop a systematic approach to monitor and improve the quality of the statistical production processes and the statistical product. Statistical audits by internal and external experts should be a part of this approach.

Together with the other producers of statistics (e.g. Ministries, Statistical Offices of the Länder, Deutsche Bundesbank), the Federal Statistical Office should develop a system of quality management over de whole chain of source statistics up to National Accounts.

#### Principle 15

The Federal Statistical Office should play a more active role in the coordination of the publication of the figures issued by national statistical authorities.

The Federal Statistical Office should improve the clarity and completeness of the website. It should invest in simple presentation of concepts and in the publication of tailor - made analyses. It should also conduct on a regular basis usability test of the website.

The Federal Statistical Office should evaluate its quality reports on a regular basis.

The Federal Statistical Office should develop a framework to assess the quality of administrative sources and be involved in the design of new administrative files which could be used for statistical purposes.

The Federal Statistical Office should investigate the possibilities to permanently fund the Research Data Centres.

#### Coordination

In the present legal set-up of the system of official statistics there is nobody with a strong mandate to take the lead in the coordination and harmonisation of the official statistics in Germany. It is recommended that in the further development of the system of official statistics, as foreseen in the Masterplan, such a mandate should be given.

#### 7. LIST OF IMPROVEMENT ACTIONS BY PRINCIPLE OF THE CODE

| 2. Elot of this Rovement Actions by Figure 1.  |                       |
|--|-----------------------|
| Principle 1: Professional Independence Improvement actions   | Timetable             |
| Principle 2: Mandate for Data Collection Improvement actions  ★ Regular monitoring of amendment clauses (authorisation to issue statutory instruments) in national statistics legislation in order to enhance the flexibility of official statistics.  | Timetable 2008        |
| Principle 3: Adequacy of Resources Improvement actions  ★Increased linkage of programme and resource planing regarding a balanced priority-setting on the national level taking into account the European statistical programme.   | Timetable end of 2009 |
| Principle 4: Quality commitment Improvement actions  Depending on the resources available and taking into consideration the costsbenefit-ratio, an internal data quality network should be established to improve internal quality control and to increase the transparency and comparability of | Timetable end of 2008 |
| statistics  *Development of a pilot project on a self-assessment programme according to DESAP and internal audits in selected statistics   | 2010                  |

### Principle 5: Statistical Confidentiality Improvement actions

★The methods to ensure confidentiality need to be developed further on a continuous basis, e.g. regarding procedures concerning the confidentiality of several tables and against the backdrop of an increasing number of ad hoc analyses. In this context, the work of the CENEX/ESSnets on statistical confidentiality will be taken into account

**≠**Evaluate the possibilities to link the results of external audits (conducted in different statistics) with the Destatis webpage, especially for national accounts.

**Timetable** 

2010

| Principle 6: Impartiality and objectivity   | Timetable              |
|---|------------------------|
| Improvement actions  ★ Check the possibilities of harmonising the practise of informing several users in advance. Furthermore, the agreed mode of this practise should be implemented and made transparent  | 2008                   |
| Principle 7: Sound Methodology Improvement actions  | Timetable              |
| ★ The transparency regarding the application of methodology and procedures in the statistical offices should be improved through suitable documentation measures (e.g. in the context of SteP - standardistaion of production processes).   | 2010                   |
| <ul> <li>★The staffing structure should be adjusted by increasing the share of university graduates to 20% of the total staff.</li> </ul>   | 2010                   |
| <ul> <li>★ Implementation of a systematic internal post-graduate training programme.</li> <li>★ Further participation in the future European Statistical Training Programme (as provider and user)</li> </ul>   | 2008<br>2010           |
| Principle 8: Appropriate Statistical Procedures Improvement actions   | Timetable              |
| ★ Step-wise implementation of a documentation system according to the PCDA (Plan, Do, Check, Act) Cycle in the course of re-engineering of statistical processes, starting e.g. with external trade statistics as best practice.  | starting in 2008       |
| ★A protocol for carrying out pre-test for different types of questionnaires should<br>be developed and implemented step by step   | 2009 / ongoing process |
| Principle 9: Non-Excessive burden on respondents Improvement actions  | Timetable              |
| ★ Monitoring of statistical respons burden for enterprises based on the SKM (Standard Cost Model) database  | 2008                   |
| ★ Monitoring od statistical respons burden for citizens and government based<br>on the SKM (Standard Cost Model) database.  | 2009                   |
| <b>★</b> Re-desing of business statistics and increased utilization of administrative data.   | 2011                   |
| Principle 10: Cost Effectiveness  | Timetable              |
| Improvement actions  ★ The e.STATISTIK.core system for transfering data from enterprises' business accounts will further be increased in those statistics with the highest potential for reducing cost (and burden). It is planned to cover most of the business statistics. Furthermore, possibilities to transfer the system toother fields will be explored by 2010. | 2009/2010              |
| ★ launching an initiative to amend the Federal Statistical Law (BStatG9) with a provision to make online reporting obligatory.  | 2009                   |
| Principle 11: Relevance Improvement actions   | Timetable              |
| <b>★</b> Implementation of regular customer satisfaction surveys  | starting in 2009       |
| Principle 12: Accuracy and Reliability Improvement actions  | Timetable              |
| ★ Development of a concept for measurement of errors and error sources from administrative sources  | 2010                   |
| Principle 13: Timeliness and Punctuality Improvement actions  | Timetable              |
| Principle 14: Coherence and Comparability   | Timetable              |
| Improvement actions  ★A uniform economic identification number should be introduced.  | 2011                   |

# Principle 15: Accessibility and clarity Improvement actions The English-language information offered on the Internet should be extended to 90% of the German web content (excluding the GENESIS database and standard publications). Quality reports should be systematically evaluated and standardised with regard to their informational value. Evaluation of possibilities to change the practice of producing and publishing tailor-made analyses especially with regard to customer-paid analysis.

#### 8. ANNEX A: PROGRAMME OF THE VISIT

| 1st day – 3rd December 2007 – WIESBADEN |  |  |  |  |
|---|--|--|--|--|
| 09:00 – 09:30 Welcome and introduction, | Participants   |  |  |  |
| organisational matters                  | Mrs Schaff (Division IA),                                  |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Ehling (Div IB – Quality Manager)                       |  |  |  |
| 09:30 – 10:00 Introductory meeting with | Participants   |  |  |  |
| President and Vice-President            | President Radermacher,                                     |  |  |  |
|   | Vice-President Weigl,                                      |  |  |  |
|   | Mrs Schaff,  |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Ehling  |  |  |  |
| 10:00 – 11:30 Principles 1-3            | Participants   |  |  |  |
|   | President Radermacher,                                     |  |  |  |
|   | Vice-President Weigl,                                      |  |  |  |
|   | senior staff:  |  |  |  |
|   | Mrs Gühnen (Div ZC)  |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Sommer (Div ZD)   |  |  |  |
|   | Mrs Schaff (Div IA)  |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Ehling,   |  |  |  |
|   | Mrs Stärk (Div IC)   |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Riede, Mr Riege-Wcislo (Div ID)                         |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Sarreither (Head of Department II)                      |  |  |  |
|   | Mrs Glitza (Div IID)<br>Mr Strohm (Head of Department III) |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Gnoss (Head of Department IV)                           |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Herbel (Div IVB)  |  |  |  |
|   | Mrs Beuerlein (Div VA)                                     |  |  |  |
| 11:30 – 12:00 Principle 5               | Participants   |  |  |  |
| 11.50 – 12.60 1 molphe 5                | President Radermacher,                                     |  |  |  |
|   | senior staff:  |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Sommer (Div ZD)   |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Ehling (Div IB)   |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Sarreither (Head of Department II)                      |  |  |  |
|   | Mrs Gießing (Div IIA)                                      |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Scholz (Div IIB)  |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Lorenz (Dive IIA)                                       |  |  |  |
| 13:30 – 14:30 Principles 6 and 15       | Participants   |  |  |  |
|   | President Radermacher,                                     |  |  |  |
|   | senior staff:  |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Sommer (Div ZD)   |  |  |  |
|   | Mrs Heiderich-Weingarten (Div ZA)                          |  |  |  |
|   | Mrs Schaff (Div IA)  |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Ehling (Div IB)   |  |  |  |
|   | Mrs Stärk (Div IC)   |  |  |  |
|   | Mrs Brunner (Berlin Information Point)                     |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Riede, Mr Riege-Wcislo (Div ID)                         |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Strohm (Head of Department III)                         |  |  |  |
|   | Mrs Brand (Div VIIA)                                       |  |  |  |
|   | Mr Seewald (Div VIIB)                                      |  |  |  |
| 14:30 – 15:15 Principle 4               | Participants   |  |  |  |
|   | President Radermacher                                      |  |  |  |
|   | Senior staff:  |  |  |  |

|  | Mrs Heiderich Weingarten (Div 7A)                                      |
|--|--|
|  | Mrs Heiderich-Weingarten (Div ZA)                                      |
|  | Mr Ehling (Div IB)   |
| 15:15 – 16:15 Interview with junior staff            | Mr Lorenz (Div IIA)  |
| 15:15 – 16:15 Interview with junior staff            | Participants   |
|  | Mrs Gühnen (Div ZC)  |
|  | Mr Wöll (Div IA)   |
|  | Mr Lorentz (Div IIA)   |
|  | Mr Blöcker (Div IIB)   |
|  | Mrs Kuschel, Mr Meißmer (Div IIIB)                                     |
|  | Mr Tümmler (Div IVA)   |
|  | Mr Feuerhake (Div IVC)   |
|  | Mr Behrmann (Div VA)   |
|  | Mr Droßard (Div VD)  |
|  | Mr Eisenmenger (Div VIA)   |
|  | Mr Bauer (Div VIIC)  |
|  | Mrs Spindler (Div VIIIA)   |
| 16:15 – 17:00 Interview with representatives of      | Participants   |
| the statistical offices of the Länder and Research   | Mr Hohmann, President of the statistical office of Hessen              |
| Data Centre  | Mr Padberg, (Research Data Centre Hessen)                              |
| -  | Mr Zwick (Research Data Centre of the Länder)                          |
| Best practices (Masterplan, Research Data Centre)    | Senior staff:  |
| 255. practices (masterplan, recodard) Data Centre)   | Mrs Schaff (Div IA)  |
|  | Mr Ehling (Div IB)   |
|  | Mr Sarreither (Head of Department II)                                  |
| 17:00 – 18:00 Meeting with media                     | Participants   |
| 17:00 – 18:00 Meeting with media representatives     | Participants<br>  Mr Kuls (Börsen-Zeitung)                             |
| representatives                                      |  |
|  | Mr Paul (Stuttgarter Zeitung)  |
|  | Mr Trautmann (Dow Jones News)  |
|  | Mrs Trimborn (dpa)   |
|  | December 2007 – BERLIN   |
| 10:00 – 12:00 Meeting with representatives from      | Participants   |
| Federal Ministries and other official data producers | Mrs Schaff (Div IA)  |
| and users  | Mr Ehling (Div IB)   |
|  | Mrs Brunner (Dep I i-Punkt)  |
|  | Ministry:  |
|  | Mr Schmidt (Agriculture)   |
|  | Mr Busch, Mr Klinkhammer (Health)                                      |
|  | Mr Streuff (Environment)   |
|  | Mr Lietmeyer, Mr Amsler-Blankenfeld, Mrs Lathan, Mr Bach               |
|  | (Finance)  |
|  | Mr Kesting, Mr Bruch, Mr Würzburg (Economics)                          |
|  | Mr Klitsch (Interior)  |
|  | Mr Warnken, Mrs Maschke (Labour)                                       |
|  | Others   |
|  | Mr Siebert (Kraftfahrt-Bundesamt)                                      |
|  | Mr Leifer (Deutsche Bundesbank)  |
|  | Mr Ross (Federal Empoyment Agency)                                     |
|  | Mr. Spitznagel (IAB-Institute for Employment Research)                 |
|  | Mr. Strate (Research Deutscher Bundestag)                              |
| 12:20 14:20  |  |
| 13:30 – 14:30  | Participants  Mrs. Schoff (Div. IA)                                    |
| Meeting with representatives of businesses and       | Mrs Schaff (Div IA)  |
| federations as users of statistical data             | Mr Ehling (Div IB)   |
|  | Mrs Brunner (Dep I-i Punkt)  |
|  | Mr Buttenböck (German Insurance Association)                           |
|  | Mr Hemmerling (German Farmers' Association)                            |
|  | Mr Rohde (Coal Industry)   |
| 14:30 – 15:30  | Participants   |
| Interview with members of the scientific community   | Mrs Schaff (Div IA)  |
| •  |  |
|  | Mr Ehling (Div IB)   |
|  | Mr Ehling (Div IB) Mrs Brunners (Dep I i-Punkt)                        |
|  |  |
|  | Mrs Brunners (Dep I i-Punkt) Prof. Stäglin (Free University of Berlin) |
|  | Mrs Brunners (Dep I i-Punkt)   |
|  | Mrs Brunners (Dep I i-Punkt) Prof. Stäglin (Free University of Berlin) |

| 3rd day – 5th December 2007 – WIESBADEN   |   |  |
|---|---|--|
| 11:00 - 12.00                             | Participants                              |  |
| Concluding meeting with management on the | Mrs Schaff (Div IA)                       |  |
| improvement actions                       | Mr Ehling (Div IB)                        |  |
|   | senior management:                        |  |
|   | Mr Stede (Deputy Head of Department Z)    |  |
|   | Mr Sarreither (Head of Department II)     |  |
|   | Mr Strohm (Head of Department III)        |  |
|   | Mr Reimann (Deputy Head of Department IV) |  |
|   | Mrs von Oppeln (Head of Department V)     |  |
|   | Mrs Bechtold (Head of Department VI)      |  |
|   | Mr Müller (Head of Department VIII)       |  |
| 12:30 - 14:00 Concluding meeting with top | President Radermacher,                    |  |
| management on the improvement actions,    | Vice-President Weigl,                     |  |
| recommendations and follow up             | Mrs Schaff (Div IA)                       |  |
| ·   | Mr Ehling (Div IB)                        |  |

#### 9. ANNEX B: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

#### The Federal Statistical Office:

President W. Radermacher,

Vice-President P. Weigl,

Senior staff:

Mrs Gühnen (Div ZC)

Mr Sommer (Div ZD)

Mrs Schaff (Div IA)

Mr Ehling (Div IB)

Mrs Stärk (Div IC)

Mr Riede, Mr Riege-Wcislo (Div ID)

Mr Sarreither (Head of Department II)

Mrs Glitza (Div IID)

Mr Strohm (Head of Department III)

Mr Gnoss (Head of Department IV)

Mr Herbel (Div IVB)

Mrs Beuerlein (Div VA)

Mrs Gießing (Div IIA)

Mr Scholz (Div IIB)

Mr Lorenz (Div IIA)

Mrs Brunner (Dep I i-Punkt)

Mrs Heiderich-Weingarter (Div ZA)

Mr Seewald (Div VIIB)

Mrs Brand (Div VIIa)

Mr Stede (Deputy head of Department Z)

Mr Reimann (Deputy head of Department IV)

Mrs von Oppeln (Head of Department V)

Mrs Bechtold (Head of Department VI)

Mr Müller (Head of Department VIII)

#### Junior staff:

Mrs Gühnen (Div ZC)

Mr Wöll (Div IA)

Mr Lorentz (Div IIA)

Mr Blöcker (Div IIB)

Mrs Kuschel, Mr Meißmer (Div IIIB)

Mr Tümmler (Div IVA)

Mr Feuerhake (Div IVC)

Mr Behrmann (Div VA)

Mr Droßard (Div VD)

Mr Eisenmenger (Div VIA)

Mr Bauer (Div VIIC)

Mrs Spindler (Div VIIIA)

#### Supporting staff:

Mrs Köhler, Mr Bartsch (Div IA), Mrs Kahle, Mrs Kron (Div IB)

Representatives of the Statistical Offices of the Länder and Research Data Centre:

Mr Hohmann, President of the Statistical Office of Hessen

Mr Padberg, (Research Data Centre Hessen)

Mr Zwick (Research Data Centre)

#### Representatives of the media:

Mr Kuls (Börsen-Zeitung)

Mr Paul (Stuttgarter Zeitung)

Mr Trautmann (Dow Jones News)

Mrs Trimborn (dpa)

## Representatives from Federal Ministries and other official data producers and users Ministry:

Mr Schmidt (Agriculture)

Mr Busch, Mr Klinkhammer (Health)

Mr Streuff (Environment)

Mr Lietmeyer, Mr Amsler-Blankenfeld, Mrs Lathan, Mr Bach (Finance)

Mr Kesting, Mr Bruch, Mr Würzburg (Economics)

Mr Klitsch (Interior)

Mr Warnken, Mrs Maschke (Labour)

#### Others:

Mr Siebert (Kraftfahrt-Bundesamt)

Mr Leifer (Deutsche Bundesbank)

Mr Ross (Federal Empoyment Agency)

Mr. Spitznagel (IAB-Institute for Employment Research)

Mr. Strate (Research Deutscher Bundestag)

#### Representatives of businesses and federations as users of statistical data:

Mr Buttenböck (German Insurance Association)

Mr Hemmerling (German Farmers' Association)

Mr Rohde (Coal Industry)

#### Representatives of the scientific community:

Prof. Stäglin (Free University of Berlin)

Prof. Bauer (RWI Essen)