Auctioning
German Auctioning of Emission Allowances
Content

German Auctioning of Emission Allowances ........................................................................................................... 4

1 Overview................................................................................................................................................................. 4
   1.1 April 2016 ....................................................................................................................................................... 4
   1.2 Overview of the entire year 2016.......................................................................................................................... 5

2 Bidder Participation .................................................................................................................................................. 6
   2.1 Participation ....................................................................................................................................................... 6
   2.2 Volume Demand .................................................................................................................................................. 6

3 Auctions and the Secondary Market ...................................................................................................................... 8
   3.1 Trading Volume EUA .......................................................................................................................................... 8
   3.2 Trading Volume EUAA ......................................................................................................................................... 9
   3.3 Clearing Prices and Price Development on the Secondary Market ........................................................................ 10

4 Implementation of Valid Regulations .................................................................................................................... 12
   4.1 Surveillance Report by HÜSt.............................................................................................................................. 12
   4.2 Fair and Open Access ........................................................................................................................................ 12
   4.3 Auction Result Publication ................................................................................................................................ 12
   4.4 Other Events ..................................................................................................................................................... 13
German Auctioning of Emission Allowances

The German auctions of the third trading period are held weekly on the European Energy Exchange (EEX) spot market. The German Emissions Trading Authority (DEHSt) at the German Environment Agency is the competent authority for the German auctions. Further updated information on the third trading period auctions can be downloaded from the EEX website. Reports on the second and third trading period auction results are available on the DEHSt auction website. The 2016 auction calendar is published on the EEX website.

The following tables summarise the key data of the German auctions on the EEX in 2016:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2016</th>
<th>Auction product</th>
<th>Third trading period EUA spot contracts</th>
<th>Third trading period EUAA spot contracts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Period</td>
<td>15/01/2016 to 16/12/2016</td>
<td>13/04/2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Auction volume entire year</td>
<td>160,770,500 EUA</td>
<td>857,500 EUAA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Auction volume per auction</td>
<td>3.495 million EUA</td>
<td>857,500 EUAA on 13/04/2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1.7475 million EUA in August)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Auction frequency</td>
<td>Weekly (Fridays, 09:00 to 11:00 a.m. CET)</td>
<td>On 13/04/2016 (09:00 to 11:00 a.m. CET)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bid volume</td>
<td>500 EUA/EUAA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Auction mode</td>
<td>Single-round, uniform-price procedure with a closed order book</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Overview

1.1 April 2016

In April, five auctions of emission allowances (EUA) of the third trading period and one auction of aviation allowances (EUAA) were carried out for Germany at the EEX.

In the five EUA-auctions 17,475,000 EUA with a total value of €97,790,100 were auctioned. This results in a volume-weighted average price per allowance of €5.60 (+14 percent compared to the previous month). The deviations of the clearing prices from the current prices on the lead market fluctuated between -0.96 and +1.41 percent (see also Section 3.3).

Overall, valid bids totalling about 35 million allowances were entered into trading system across the five EUA-auction dates. Thus the average cover ratio in the reporting period was 2.02 (see also Section 2.2). The average participation number of 17 bidders was well below the level of the previous month (22). The average number of successful bidders was however slightly above at the previous month level at 14 (13), (see also Section 2.1).

The following table gives an overview of the most important auction figures from the EUA-auctions performed during the reporting period.
Table 1: Overview of German EUA-auctions in April 2016

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Auction volume</th>
<th>Bid volume</th>
<th>Cover ratio</th>
<th>Bidders</th>
<th>Successful bidders</th>
<th>Price</th>
<th>Revenue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01/04/2016</td>
<td>3,495,000</td>
<td>5,528,000</td>
<td>1.58</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>€ 5.18</td>
<td>€ 18,104,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08/04/2016</td>
<td>3,495,000</td>
<td>7,788,000</td>
<td>2.23</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>€ 5.23</td>
<td>€ 18,278,850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15/04/2016</td>
<td>3,495,000</td>
<td>9,072,000</td>
<td>2.60</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>€ 5.54</td>
<td>€ 19,362,300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22/04/2016</td>
<td>3,495,000</td>
<td>7,130,000</td>
<td>2.04</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>€ 5.74</td>
<td>€ 20,061,300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29/04/2016</td>
<td>3,495,000</td>
<td>5,814,000</td>
<td>1.66</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>€ 6.29</td>
<td>€ 21,983,550</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April</td>
<td>17,475,000</td>
<td>35,332,000</td>
<td>*2.02</td>
<td>*17</td>
<td>*14</td>
<td>*€ 5.60</td>
<td>€ 97,790,100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: EEX, DEHSt
* Average

In addition, 857,500 aviation allowances (EUAA) with a total value of € 4,647,650 were auctioned for Germany on 13/04/2016. The auction price for the 6 successful bidders was € 5.42. Overall, 10 bidders with valid bids totaling about 3.4 million allowances participated in the auction.

1.2 Overview of the entire year 2016

In the first four month of the current year a total of 53,282,500 EUA and EUAA with a total value of € 293,474,450 were auctioned at the EEX for Germany. This results in a volume-weighted average price per allowance of € 5.51. These overall figures are subdivided into 52,425,000 EUA with a total value of € 288,826,800 (average price € 5.51) and 857,500 EUAA with a total value of € 4,647,650 (€ 5.42).

The amount of emission allowances to be auctioned by Germany in 2016 totals 160,770,500 EUA and 857,500 EUAA. Taking into account the total annual amount, around 33 percent of the EUA-auction budget and 100 percent of the EUAA-auction budget for 2016 has been auctioned to date.

The following table summarises the auction results on a monthly basis.

Table 2: Overview of the entire year 2016

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Month</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Auction volume</th>
<th>Bid volume</th>
<th>Cover ratio</th>
<th>Bidders</th>
<th>Successful bidders</th>
<th>Price</th>
<th>Revenue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>January</td>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>10,485,000</td>
<td>23,660,500</td>
<td>*2.26</td>
<td>*21</td>
<td>*15</td>
<td>*€ 6.37</td>
<td>€ 66,754,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February</td>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>13,980,000</td>
<td>30,818,500</td>
<td>*2.20</td>
<td>*22</td>
<td>*14</td>
<td>*€ 5.21</td>
<td>€ 72,800,850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March</td>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>10,485,000</td>
<td>25,693,000</td>
<td>*2.45</td>
<td>*22</td>
<td>*13</td>
<td>*€ 4.91</td>
<td>€ 51,481,350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April</td>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>17,475,000</td>
<td>35,332,000</td>
<td>*2.02</td>
<td>*17</td>
<td>*14</td>
<td>*€ 5.60</td>
<td>€ 97,790,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EUAA</td>
<td>857,500</td>
<td>3,362,500</td>
<td>3.92</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>€ 5.42</td>
<td>€ 4,647,650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>52,425,000</td>
<td>115,504,000</td>
<td>*2.20</td>
<td>*20</td>
<td>*14</td>
<td>*€ 5.51</td>
<td>€ 288,826,800</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EUAA</td>
<td>857,500</td>
<td>3,362,500</td>
<td>3.92</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>€ 5.42</td>
<td>€ 4,647,650</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>53,282,500</td>
<td>118,866,500</td>
<td>**2.23</td>
<td>**20</td>
<td>**13</td>
<td>**€ 5.51</td>
<td>€ 293,474,450</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: EEX, DEHSt
* Average
** Volume-weighted average
2 Bidder Participation

2.1 Participation

The number of participants in the German EUA-auctions in April averaged across all dates was 17 bidders. The average number of successful bidders was 14. Participation in the auctions fluctuated between 15 and 19 bidders during the reporting period. The number of successful participants ranged from 8 to 17. There was no such auction where all participating bidders were successful. The following figure illustrates EUA-auction participation over time.

![Graph showing number of bidders per auction date]

Figure 1: Number of participating and successful bidders per auction date (EUA)

With 10 bidders, the participation in the aviation allowances auction on 13/04/2016 was well below the average participation in the EUA-auctions. However, it has to be noted that the usability of EUAA for ETS compliance is limited to aircraft operators, whereas EUA can be used by all operators subject to emissions trading.

2.2 Volume Demand

During the reporting period, the aggregated bid volumes per EUA-auction date fluctuated from 5.5 to 9.1 million allowances. Overall, valid bids totalling about 35 million allowances were entered into trading system in April. The resulting cover ratios during the reporting period ranged between 1.58 and 2.60 (2.02 on average). The cover ratio in the EUAA auction on 13/04/2016 was 3.92, above the fluctuation range of the cover ratios in EUA auctions.

The figure below summarises the results of each EUA-auction date.
Thus, the average bid volume per EUA-auction participant in April was about 410,000 allowances. The average volume awarded to each successful bidder was about 260,000 allowances. In the EUAA auction on 13/04/2016 the average bid volume per auction participant was about 340,000 allowances. The average volume awarded to each successful bidder was about 140,000 allowances.

Awarding allowances at all auctions is based on the EU-wide applicable uniform price procedure with one prescribed round of bidding (also see Info box below).

**Info Box: Uniform Price Auction at the EEX**

The auctions at the EEX follow the uniform price procedure which is common practice throughout the European Union. It involves one round of bidding and a closed order book. This simple and robust procedure protects against market manipulation and was used already for German auctions during the second trading period. The uniform price procedure means that all successful bidders pay the same price. The auction clearing price is determined by ranking all eligible bids, beginning with the highest bid, according to the bidding price.

In the event of equal bids, the bids are sorted by a random process. The bid volumes are aggregated starting with the highest bid until the volume of emission allowances on offer (e.g. 3.495 million EUA) is reached. The bid price at which the aggregate volume of bids reaches or exceeds the offered volume of auctioned allowances determines the auction clearing price.

Bidders will thus be awarded their bid volume if their bidding price at least matches the auction clearing price. If a bid matches the clearing price exactly, the bidder may be awarded the remaining allowances which may be below the volume requested, depending on the bidding situation. If the bid from several participants matches the auction clearing price exactly, the above-mentioned random process applies.
3  Auctions and the Secondary Market

3.1  Trading Volume EUA

In April 2016, a total of about 17.5 million EUA were auctioned at the EEX for Germany. During the reporting period, the cumulative trading volume in the relevant total market was about 563 million EUA. Thus, the total market trading volume was 26 percent above the level of the previous month. This market volume was divided into approximately 80 million allowances which were completed as contracts for immediate delivery (spot) and about 483 million allowances for delivery in the future (futures). Thus, about 86 percent of the traded volume was handled on the dominant futures market. The figure below illustrates the trading volumes separately for spot and futures segments based on calendar weeks (CW).

![Figure 3: Trading volumes differentiated by spot and futures in April 2016 (EUA)](image)

In April 2016, a total of about 69 million allowances were auctioned by Member States on the primary market as spot contracts. On the spot secondary market about 11 million allowances were traded. This means that around 86 percent of traded spot contracts have been purchased in primary market auctions. With respect to the relevant total market for EUA, around 12 percent of the traded volume was related to auctions.

Figure 4 shows the trading volume in the spot secondary market and the auction volumes on the primary market per calendar week (CW). In addition to the German auctions, aggregated auction volumes of other EU Member States are also included in the figure.

---

1 All emission allowances (EUA) of the third trading period traded on the spot and futures markets on the ICE/ECX, CME/NYMEX, EEX and Nasdaq OMX exchanges are considered. Transactions completed directly on the stock exchange (screen traded) or those bilateral transactions that at least used the stock exchange clearing mechanism are included. The EUA spot contracts auctioned in April 2016 are also considered. Option contracts are not involved.
In April 2016, no aviation allowances (EUAA) were traded on the secondary market\(^2\). During the reporting period, a total of about 0.86 million EUAA were auctioned by Germany on the primary market as spot contracts.

Further information on the EUAA auction calendars is available on the website of the European Commission. Figure 5 shows the trading volume in the secondary market and the auction volumes on the primary market per calendar week (CW).

---

\(^2\) All aviation allowances (EUAA) of the third trading period traded on the spot and futures markets on the ICE/ECX and EEX exchanges are considered. Transactions completed directly on the stock exchange (screen traded) or those bilateral transactions that at least used the stock exchange clearing mechanism are included.
3.3 Clearing Prices and Price Development on the Secondary Market

Reference prices from the most liquid trading venues served as appropriate benchmarks for evaluating the auction clearing prices achieved on the EUA-spot auctions. The reference contract for the auctions is the daily future traded on the London ICE or the EEX EUA spot contract. The product specifications are comparable with the spot-product of the auctions. The trade price immediately before the end of the bidding period was used as a reference price. If no trades take place immediately before the end of the bidding period, the last best bid was used as a reference price (see also Info box below).

Info Box: Reference Prices

In regular exchange trading (secondary trading), participants enter their buying and selling requests (bids and asks) into an order book which is constantly updated. As in auctions, such buying bids in secondary trading include quantity and price limits. The price limit is the highest price a buyer is prepared to pay for the purchase of an allowance. Sellers can also put a price limit on their bid, i.e. a minimum price per allowance sold.

The order book is open to inspection by any participant. It shows the current highest purchase offer (best bid) and the lowest sales offer (best ask) with the relevant quantities. Trading occurs where best bid and best ask overlap. Trading price records finally show the price limits where supply equals demand.
Due to the very low liquidity on the benchmark secondary market for EUAA (see Section 3.2) no evaluation of the EUAA auction price on 13/04/2016 is made in this report.

Table 3 shows the relative deviations of the clearing price from the lead market. The deviation on each EUA-auction date just before the end of the bidding period (11 a.m. CET) varied over the reporting period between -€ 0.05 (-0.96 percent) and +€ 0.08 (+1.41 percent).

For a mean value analysis, the arithmetic mean of the absolute values of individual deviations over the reporting period is calculated. The average deviation from the last best bid was € 0.03 or 0.60 percent averaged over all dates.

Table 3: Auctions and deviations from secondary market prices in April 2016 (EUA)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Contract</th>
<th>Clearing price</th>
<th>Deviation from ICE Daily Future</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Absolute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01/04/2016</td>
<td>EUA Spot 3rd TP</td>
<td>€ 5.18</td>
<td>**€ -0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08/04/2016</td>
<td>EUA Spot 3rd TP</td>
<td>€ 5.23</td>
<td>*€ 0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15/04/2016</td>
<td>EUA Spot 3rd TP</td>
<td>€ 5.54</td>
<td>***€ 0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22/04/2016</td>
<td>EUA Spot 3rd TP</td>
<td>€ 5.74</td>
<td>*€ 0.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29/04/2016</td>
<td>EUA Spot 3rd TP</td>
<td>€ 6.29</td>
<td>*€ -0.03</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean absolute deviation € 0.03 0.60 %

Source: ICE, EEX, Thomson Reuters, DEHSt
* best bid ICE Daily Future
** last trade EEX Spot
*** best bid EEX Spot

The following figure shows an overview of the price development for emission allowances in the London lead market. In addition to the daily futures the development of futures for December delivery of the current year is also shown (so-called „front-december future“). Rather than following the common practice of considering only settlement prices, our analysis takes into account all trades completed at the exchanges during the reporting period.\(^3\) The following graphic is based on volume-weighted average trading prices (VWAP), which fluctuated in an interval between around € 5.10 to € 6.90\(^4\) in April 2016.

---

3 Settlement prices are determined by the exchanges at the end of the trading day. Hence, they only reflect trade activity immediately before closure of the exchange and are, thus, not always an adequate reflection of the prevailing intra-day prices in the secondary market.

4 The volume-weighted average price (VWAP) for the ICE EUA front-december futures is published on a daily basis by the ICE. The VWAP for the ICE daily future contract is based on the calculations of Thomson Reuters.
Figure 6: ICE secondary market prices and EEX auction clearing prices (EUA)

4 Implementation of Valid Regulations

4.1 Surveillance Report by HÜSt

In order to guarantee above-board market activities are free of manipulation on the EEX continuous surveillance is conducted by an independent Market Surveillance Office (Handelsüberwachungsstelle, HÜSt) as required under German law. HÜSt reports to the DEHSt on the results of its surveillance activities through regular internal reports. HÜSt reported on auctions in April 2016 as follows (excerpt):

"Within their surveillance for the auctioning of emission allowances on behalf of the German Environment Agency at the EEX in April 2016 the Market Surveillance Office of the EEX could not detect any irregularities and especially no behaviour of bidders that was targeted at manipulating the auction price."

4.2 Fair and Open Access

The implementation of the provisions of the EU Auctioning Regulation guarantees a fair and open access for all auction participants at EEX. Current access options can be found at EEX Website (Access).

More information about the auction process is also available on the EEX auction hotline. EEX can be reached by phone from Mondays to Fridays from 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. CET at +49 341 2156-331 or by e-mail at auctions@eex.com.

4.3 Auction Result Publication

All auction results and accompanying data were made publicly available during the reporting period within a 15-minute time window directly linked to the respective auction at EEX Website (2016 auction results).
4.4 Other Events

There are no matters relating to the implementation of the existing rules to be reported during the reporting period. The current regulations can be downloaded from EEX Website (Regulations).