A comparative analysis of community focused initiatives aimed at supporting Women, Children and Young People who have been the focus of violence, exploitation or trafficking in 3 regions of the UK, Germany and Romania. 2009 - 2010
This report is dedicated to:

Victims of violence, exploitation and trafficking

Daphne Project Team 2009 - 2011

Violence, Exploitation and Trafficking: Service User Perspectives

Published by: Children, Young People and Families Research Centre, Newman University College
ISBN: 978-0-9568268-1-7

EUROPEAN COMMISSION
DAPHNE III PROGRAMME 2007-2013

To prevent and combat violence against children, young people and women and to protect victims and groups at risk
The Daphne Project Research Team 2009 – 2011:

Stan Tucker
Madeline Martyn
Anca Bejenaru
Graham Brotherton
Silke Gahleitner
Connie Gunderson
Horatiu Rusu

Newman University College, Lucian Blaga University & Alice Salomon University
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Daphne Project research team thank all the women, young people and children who shared their experiences of violence, exploitation and trafficking and spoke about the services they have encountered.

We acknowledge funding from the European Commission’s Daphne III Programme and support from:

**Germany:**
- Bremische Zentralstelle für die Verwirklichung der Gleichberechtigung der Frau (ZGF), Bremen
- German Parliament: Parliamentary Representative / Parliamentary Forum for Sexual Health
- IN VIA Katholische Mädchensozialarbeit für das Erzbistum Berlin e. V.
- KOBRA, Hannover: Zentrale Koordinations- und Beratungsstelle für Opfer von Menschenhandel
- KOK, Berlin: Bundesweiter Koordinierungskreis gegen Frauenhandel und Gewalt an Frauen im Migrationsprozess e.V.
- Mädchenhaus Bremen, e.V.
- Missing Person's Families Support Center, Vilnius, Lithuania
- Nitribitt, e.V., Bremen
- Polizeiinspektion Braunschweig: Zentraler Kriminaldienst
- SOLWODI Deutschland e.V.
- Verein für Innere Mission in Bremen: Beratungsstelle für Opfer von Menschenhandel und Zwangsprostitution (BBMeZ)
- Wildwasser, e.V., Berlin
- Individuals: Ulrike Wendt, Sandra Koschel, Stefanie Hecht, and Michael Heikkinen.
- Staff at Alice Salomon University of Applied Social Science, Berlin

**Romania:**
- Department of Public Social Services of Sibiu
- Estera German Christian Women's House Association, Medias
- General Directorate for Social Assistance and Child Protection of Sibiu
- Ministry of Labor, Family and Social Protection
- NGO Federation on Child Protection
- UNICEF Romania
- Women's Association of Sibiu
- Staff at Lucian Blaga University, Sibiu

**United Kingdom:**
- Ashram Housing Association
- ASIRT Asylum Support and Immigration Resource Team
- Birmingham City Council: Services for Children, Young People & Families
- Children's Society: Safe in the City Project, Birmingham
- City United Ltd.
- Crown Prosecution Service: West Midlands
- David Kidney MP: Government Minister
- ECPAT UK
- Forced Marriage Unit: Foreign & Commonwealth Office
- Jan Foundation/Lantern Project
- Lye Community Project
- Murray Hall Community Trust
- NSPCC National Child Trafficking Advice & Information & Childline, Birmingham
- Poppy Project
- Safer Project, Heart of Birmingham PCT
- Safer Birmingham Partnership
- SOVA, Birmingham
- UK Human Trafficking Centre
- West Midlands Regional Anti Trafficking Network
- Women’s Aid: Birmingham & Solihull
- Staff at Newman University College, Birmingham
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BRGV</td>
<td>Birmingham Reducing Gang Violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BVAWB</td>
<td>Birmingham Violence Against Women Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DV</td>
<td>Domestic Violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Convention</td>
<td>European Convention on the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDASP</td>
<td>General Directorate for Social Assistance and Child Protection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEI</td>
<td>Higher Education Institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPV</td>
<td>Intimate Partner Violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LA</td>
<td>Local Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAATP</td>
<td>National Association Against Trafficking in Persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non Governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NRM</td>
<td>National Referral Mechanism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOLWODI</td>
<td>Solidarity with Women in Distress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UDHR</td>
<td>Universal Declaration of Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UKHTC</td>
<td>United Kingdom Human Trafficking Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNCRC</td>
<td>United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VAW</td>
<td>Violence Against Women</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION 7
  1.1. Project Aims 8
  1.2. European Context 8

2. PROJECT DEVELOPMENT 9
  2.1. Agreeing a Focus 9
  2.2. Involvement of Service Users 9
  2.3. Academic Context 9
  2.4. Research Themes 10

3. ACADEMIC CONTEXT OF RESEARCH THEMES 11
  3.1. Considerations on the Importance of Human Rights 11
  3.2. A European Dimension 12
  3.3. Children & Young People 13
  3.4. Women 14
  3.5. Key Literature relating to Research Themes 15

4. METHODOLOGY 26
  4.1. Approach 26
  4.2. Research Design 27
  4.3. Research Methods 29
  4.4. Project Management 30
  4.5. Ethical Considerations 31
  4.6. Approach to Data Analysis 32

5. RESEARCH FINDINGS 33
  5.1. Domestic Violence 33
  5.2. Human Trafficking 68
  5.3. Violence & Abuse Against Children & Young People 103

6. ANALYSIS & COMMENTARY 134
  6.1. Domestic Violence 134
  6.2. Human Trafficking 137
  6.3. Violence And Abuse Against Children & Young People 143

7. CONCLUSIONS 146

8. BIBLIOGRAPHY 151

9. PROJECT TEAM PROFILES 158
A Comparative Analysis of Community Focused Initiatives Aimed at Supporting Women, Children and Young People who Have Been the Focus of Violence, Exploitation or Trafficking in 3 Regions of Germany, Romania and the United Kingdom.

1. INTRODUCTION

It is recognised that women, children and young people who make use of victim support services based in the community do so for a variety of reasons. They can, for example, often be the victims of multiple forms of violence – physical, psychological, sexual, etc. (Unifem, 2003; Amnesty, 2005; Home Office UK, 2007). They may be under pressure to work in the 'sex trade'. They may need to seek out services that protect their identity and offer a high level of confidentiality. They may be at risk of being ‘trafficked’ or be the victims of trafficking (Joseph Rowntree Foundation, 2007). In order to respond to such a wide range of problems, victim support services need to be highly sensitised to the needs of potential service users. In turn, policy makers, managers and practitioners are required to recognise the difficulties that individuals face in matters such as ‘speaking out,’ ‘freeing themselves’ from oppressive situations and having their needs met in ways that do not endanger them further. Local community-based services are likely to attract individuals and groups who require both short and longer term forms of support and intervention.

As part of the process of understanding the needs of the women, children and young people who are the subject of this report, the intention was to further examine some of the key evaluation themes articulated through Daphne II (2004). The themes included the need for ‘assistance to victims’, ‘prevention of violence’ and ‘improved understanding’ of the circumstances that place individuals and groups ‘at risk’ of violence, exploitation and trafficking. The case was made, through Daphne II, for the need to radically improve the quality of services provided and in doing so increase the involvement of ‘target groups and key beneficiaries’ in the design of projects ‘as early as possible’ (Daphne II, 2004: 31-35).

In considering the issues raised by Daphne II it became apparent that only limited research work had been undertaken to increase understanding of victims’ views of the quality and relevance of the services they receive. Opportunities for self-advocacy on the part of service users also appeared to be limited despite the fact that such advocacy opportunities can provide an important way of improving current service provision and future policy and practice development (Atkinson, 1999; Forbat, 2005).

The primary intention of the research project was to generate data that explored the views of service users in an effort to improve understanding of the role of community-based support provision. Consideration is given within the report as to how women, children and young people can play a direct and active role in service development and evaluation issues. The influence of United Nations and European Union human rights conventions and legislation as it impacts on women, children and young people, is given careful consideration. Attention is paid to how the development of ‘good practice’ can assist in improving the health, social care, education and well-being of victims of violence, exploitation and trafficking. The effectiveness of interagency working (Parton, 2006; Glenny and Roaf, 2008) in meeting the needs of the target groups is considered.

In addition to interviewing the victims of violence, exploitation and trafficking, the views of policy makers, service managers and practitioners were also sought. Through this approach it proved possible to compare and contrast a range of views and thereby provide a rich contextual background on which to base the findings of the report.
1.1. Project Aims

The research aims of the project included:

- Directly responding to the general objectives of the Daphne III programme and its concern to interrogate and further develop existing policy and practice in order to improve community-focused protection systems for women, children and young people who have been the victims of violence, exploitation and trafficking.
- Reviewing, analysing and critically evaluating, through direct engagement with service users, the relevance and appropriateness of current policy and practice as it influences and impacts on community-based services.
- Offering a greater level of understanding as to why individuals make contact with, and choose to use, particular kinds of support services.
- Providing, through documentary analysis and a detailed literature review, an in-depth understanding of the social, economic and cultural factors that impact on the development of community support services.
- Consideration of the role of interagency work in the development of high quality support services for women, children and young people who have been the victims of violence, exploitation and trafficking.
- The evaluation of the effectiveness of existing human rights legislation in promoting equality and social justice.
- Exploring how the research evidence gained can be used to generate examples of good practice based on case study materials for dissemination and training purposes.

1.2. European Context

The Project Aims reflect the increasing need for Members States of the European Union to provide relevant support and protection at a community level as part of wider strategic policy and practice developments. The aims also support the exploration of key Daphne III themes and objectives. These include:

- The need to examine ‘victim support services’ (theme IV) – achieved through the mapping and analysis of the perspectives of service users, policy makers, service managers and practitioners and the evaluation of legislation, policies, practices and structures.
- The development of effective ‘multidisciplinary networks’ linking organisations in the field (objective e) – achieved through a range of dissemination activities that directly supported the identification and expansion of evidence-based information, knowledge and practice.
- The development of educational materials in the form of case studies to promote awareness-raising (objective g) – achieved through the generation of specific training materials developed from case studies.
- The identification of ‘good practice’ through research (objective f) – achieved through the utilisation of a shared and appropriate research methodology and range of mixed methods.
2. PROJECT DEVELOPMENT

2.1. Agreeing a Focus

The range of issues, concerns and theoretical concepts that significantly shaped the development of the project was generated through direct consultation with potential partners. Those involved had a significant history of collaboration in both work and research terms with socially, educationally, economically and politically disadvantaged communities. The range of partners recruited ultimately ensured that the necessary skills and expertise from Higher Education Institutions (HEIs), regional and national government bodies, NGOs and 'not for profit' organisations were brought together to further the aims of the project.

2.2. Involvement of Service Users

The project emerged out of a desire to improve the quality of services for women, children and young people who have been the victims of violence, trafficking and exploitation. At the heart of the project lay a philosophically driven concern to directly involve service users wherever possible, in the design, delivery and evaluation of services. Such an approach reflected wider academic, policy maker and practitioner concerns around the necessity for service users to be empowered through direct consideration of their views. This was essentially achieved through the promotion of advocacy opportunities created through a number of interview encounters.

2.3. Academic Context

The three HEIs involved in the project took the lead in developing the research data from which the outcomes of the project were ultimately evaluated. All had specific experience in developing socially-focused research projects that utilised both qualitative and quantitative approaches. The methodological approach employed throughout the project is outlined in Section 4 of the report. A multidisciplinary project team was constituted with expertise in the areas of sociology, psychology, social policy, economics and politics. Brief biographical details of the project team are provided in Section 9 of the report. Details of the HEIs involved are presented in Table 1 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Higher Education Institution</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alice Salomon Hochschule</td>
<td>Berlin, Germany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lucian Blaga University</td>
<td>Sibiu, Romania</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newman University College</td>
<td>Birmingham, United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Universities involved in project research
2.4. Research Themes

The design, development and analysis of the research were influenced by the identification of four key areas for investigation: the *research themes.* The areas focused specifically on:

- Domestic Violence
- Human Trafficking
- Violence & Abuse against Children and Young People
3. ACADEMIC CONTEXT OF RESEARCH THEMES

3.1. Considerations on the Importance of Human Rights

This particular project was designed to fulfil a specific purpose. Its major concern was to present a clearer understanding of the role, value and priorities that those who are the victims of violence, exploitation or trafficking ascribe to community-based support services. Such services variously deal with the immediate consequences and outcomes of various forms of abuse and/or offer ongoing support, care and education. The task for those charged with carrying out the research was to critically explore and evaluate the views of service users and compare and contrast those with the perceptions of policy makers and service providers. In adopting an advocacy approach through the research process that specifically attempted to capture the voice of service users, the intention was to influence policy development and practice in ways that would improve both matters of quality and outcome for various individuals and groups using community-based support services.

To understand the intentions that lie at the heart of the project however, it is necessary to explore its underlining philosophical and ethical drivers. The project is significantly influenced by a universal human rights perspective that positions the service user with their individual and collective needs, aspirations and ambitions, at the centre of matters concerned with service development and delivery. In adopting such a position a view of universal human rights is espoused that promotes the idea of:

- Expressing rights as ‘entitlements’ based on the values of ‘non-discrimination’ and the ‘provision of an adequate standard of living’
- The promotion of a level of ‘self-determination’ by individuals and groups
- Human rights being both ‘interdependent’ and ‘indivisible’
- Human rights being universally available with the responsibility for their implementation lying with individual nation states

(Adapted from Donnelly, 2003:23)

Such an analysis is shaped by the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) that was originally adopted by the United Nations General Assembly in 1948. With this and other covenants, such as the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights passed by the General Assembly in 1966, in mind, a range of specific themes and issues have been used to influence the scope and direction of the research project. These are presented briefly in Table 2 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Non-discrimination</th>
<th>Health</th>
<th>Women’s rights and protection</th>
<th>Protection and assistance to children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Liberty and security of person</td>
<td>Asylum</td>
<td>Protection against slavery</td>
<td>Humane treatment when deprived of liberty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protection and assistance of families</td>
<td>Minority culture</td>
<td>Promotion of equal rights</td>
<td>Self-determination</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Human Rights themes and issues influencing project development
Academic Context of Research Themes

A review of Table 2 reveals some of the wider key principles that have supported the development of human rights work. Discrimination based on sex, racial or ethnic origin, religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation is recognised through the legislation of the European Union. The human rights of women and girls are clarified in the Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action (1993), with race discrimination now ‘entrenched in international law’ (see Smith 2007:182).

3.2. A European Dimension

The focus for the development of human rights from a European Union perspective has been generated through the European Convention on the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (the European Convention) (1953). For as Ovey and White (2006:18) argue, the ‘principles’ of ‘solidarity’ and ‘subsidiarity’ as laid out in Section 1 of the European Convention work to promote and foster human rights across nation states. The principle of solidarity works to ensure that human rights are secured by ‘Contracting Parties’ while on the other hand the principle of subsidiarity allows the Court of Human Rights to adjudicate ‘on claims that rights have been violated’. Enshrined within the Convention is a range of ‘unqualified’ rights that have informed the development of the research project. These are presented in Table 3 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description of Right</th>
<th>Article Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Right to life</td>
<td>Article 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prohibition of torture, slavery, inhumane or degrading treatment</td>
<td>Article 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prohibition of slavery and forced labour</td>
<td>Article 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right to liberty and security</td>
<td>Article 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right to marry</td>
<td>Article 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prohibition of discrimination</td>
<td>Article 14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right to education</td>
<td>Protocol 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: Unqualified Rights – European Convention on Human Rights

The scope of the Convention has been considerably expanded through time. For example the passing of The European Social Charter (1961) brought with it a more detailed consideration of matters to do with equal opportunities, sex discrimination and protection from poverty and social exclusion.

The importance of rights promotion and protection is fundamentally recognised and reflected throughout the development of this research project. Matters of discrimination, exploitation, abuse and trafficking clearly have a human cost. At one level the promotion of a human rights agenda is vitally important to the well-being of a society. Yet at the same time it is also important to recognise that where there has been a violation of human rights, the victims of such a violation need to receive the help and support they require both immediately and in the longer term. Here, the focus is placed on gaining a greater understanding of the value community-based services can contribute towards providing that help and support.
3.3. Children & Young People

The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) (1989) stands as the most significant landmark in the promotion of rights for this particular group. As Donnelly (2003:150) notes, the speed with which ‘it came into force was stunning; it took less than a year to obtain the twenty required parties (in contrast to the two and a half years for the Convention against Torture)’. The important point to note in reviewing work within this area is that consideration has been given to the needs of children as being different to those of adults. Specific issues such as nutrition, health, wellbeing and education have featured strongly in rights-focused work. Matters of protection from harm, the need to provide services to meet the specific requirements and demands of the young, and the importance of seeing young people as participating in decision making, have all been highlighted. The implementation of the Convention has also given rise to elaborate reporting and monitoring systems that have gone beyond nation reporting schemes and require:

‘…detailed Non-Government Organisation’s (NGO) alternative reports on States and [the UN] works closely with UNICEF towards fulfilling its set plan of action.’

Table 4 below presents some of the key elements of the UNCRC that have specifically informed the research project.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description of Right</th>
<th>Article Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Protection against discrimination</td>
<td>Article 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protection against abduction</td>
<td>Article 35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protection against sexual exploitation including ‘sale of children’</td>
<td>Article 34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right to standard of living adequate for physical, mental, spiritual and social development</td>
<td>Article 27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need to act in best interest of the child in decision making</td>
<td>Article 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child recognised as having ‘evolving capacities’</td>
<td>Article 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freedom of expression</td>
<td>Article 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freedom of thought, conscience and religion</td>
<td>Article 16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4: Rights of the Child
3.4. Women

The promotion of the rights of women has also been a key feature in the development of human rights legislation. The roots of such work are to be found in the activities of the United Nations through the Charter of 1945 which specifically considered issues around the promotion of equality and social justice. As Smith (2007) notes, at particular points in time a range of issues and themes have emerged for attention. In 1952 specific consideration was given to political rights. In 1967 the Declaration on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women was introduced and 1979 saw the introduction of the Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women. Here, specific attention was paid to education, healthcare, employment and legal matters.

While at a general level all of the issues outlined above have informed the development of the project, matters of violence and abuse have taken centre stage in informing both priorities and outcomes. The Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women (1993) has been important in terms of offering a definition in terms of it being seen as:

> ‘any act of gender-based violence that results in, or is likely to result in, physical or psychological harm or suffering, including threats of such acts, coercion or arbitrary deprivation of liberty, whether occurring in public or private’ (Article 2) but also considering issues of rape, within marriage and genital mutilation (Article 2).

Crucially, the issue of the promotion of rights for women has extended and influenced the work of the European Union where consideration has been given to matters concerning violence against women, human trafficking and the greater involvement of women in decision-making. Chavkin and Chester (2005:27) usefully describe how work in the area of securing rights for women continues to inform both legislation and policy making priorities:

> The UN Millennium Development goals of 2000 identify gender equality and women’s empowerment as a third priority, after the eradication of poverty and hunger and the achievement of universal primary education.

Although it is only possible in the space available here to briefly review matters surrounding the development and promotion of human rights, the primary intention is to provide a backdrop against which aspects of the project can be evaluated. For as Watson and Wood (2007:190) point out, a ‘principle of legality’ exists that can be used to challenge activities at the level of the nation state where specific ‘interference does not have a basis in law, or where the powers given to a public authority are very broad or vague’. Indeed, Article 6 of the Human Rights Act (1998) in the United Kingdom specifically sets out, as one of the 6 principles that should govern consultation, the need to ‘provide people’ with the ‘ability to participate’.

- 14 -
3.5. Key Literature relating to Research Themes

3.5.1. Domestic Violence

Conceptualization

Domestic violence has been defined in a number of ways. There is a significant overlap between domestic violence and violence against women or violence against children (Barnish, 2004). Quite often the academic literature offers a blurred picture in this respect; many authors using these concepts in an interchangeable manner.

One way of conceptualizing this is through considering the space where the violent social action occurs in relation to the subject of it (see Figure 1).

![Figure 1: Space & Subject of Domestic Violence](image-url)

Domestic violence can be broadly defined as any form of aggression, abuse, intimidation against a family member, blood relative or any other person from the family environment (see also Rădulescu, 2001). A more restrictive definition of it would be ‘any violent or abusive behaviour, whether physical, sexual, psychological, emotional, verbal or financial which is used by one person to control and dominate another one with whom they have an intimate relationship’ (Salari & Nakhaee, 2008:49).

A useful overarching definition of the range of activity which can be considered as domestic violence is provided by the Women’s Aid Federation of England:

> *Domestic violence is physical, sexual, psychological or financial violence that takes place within an intimate or family-type relationship and that forms a pattern of coercive and controlling behaviour. This can include forced marriage and so-called ‘honour crimes’. Domestic violence may include a range of abusive behaviours, not all of which are in themselves inherently ‘violent’.*

*(Women’s Aid Federation, 2007)*

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concept</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Conceptual Overlap</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VAW</td>
<td>Public</td>
<td>Women</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPV</td>
<td>Private</td>
<td>Women</td>
<td>VAW; IPV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DV</td>
<td>Private</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>DV; IPV VAC IPV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VAC</td>
<td>Private</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>DV</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Nevertheless domestic violence (DV) is more often manifested as violence against women (VAW) in private relations than violence against children (VAC) or men (see also Johnson, 2008:2-5; Liiceanu, Saucan & Micle, 2004). Both literature and public discourse/policy distinguish between domestic violence and violence against women on a private-public axis; the concept of violence against women is used to designate violent or abusive behaviours against women in public settings whilst, domestic violence is characterised by violent or abusive behaviours against women in private settings - though there is of course overlap between the two.

As Harvey et al (2007) show, intimate partner violence (IPV) is the most widespread form of violence against women. The term intimate partner violence (IPV) is often used synonymously with DV; other synonym terms are wife beating, wife battering, man beating, husband battering, relationship violence, domestic abuse, spousal abuse, and family violence (see also Dienye & Gbeneol, 2008:1). IPV ‘has been defined as a pattern of coercive control, consisting of physical, sexual, or psychological assault against a former or current intimate partner’ (Houry et al, 2004:955). In this section therefore we have chosen to focus on domestic violence in the context of intimate partner violence.

**Causes and consequences of domestic violence**

**Causes**

Literature abounds in suggesting various causes of DV against women. As Heise (1994) points out, these causes can be cultural, legal, political or economic. Among the factors most often enumerated are:

- abuser’s emotional insecurity (including sexual frustration, stress of imminent parenthood, conscious or subconscious desire to terminate pregnancy)
- need to enforce power and control; social isolation; alcohol, drugs or other substances abuse
- patriarchal culture
- economic deprivation
- laws regarding divorce and inheritance
- low educational status and the under-representation of women in power, politics, the media and in the legal and medical professions etc.

(Heise et al, 1994; Barnish 2004)

One approach developed by Heise (1998), seeks to take an integrated ecological perspective in understanding the causes of DV. The model includes interactions of factors at four levels of the social environment: personal, relational, community and societal. These factors are:

- at the individual level - being abused as a child or witnessing marital violence in the home, having an absent or rejecting father, and use of alcohol
- at the relational level - male control of wealth and decision-making within the family and marital conflict; at the community level - women’s isolation and lack of social support and male peer groups that condone and legitimize men’s violence
• at the societal level: the rigid definition and enforcement of gender roles, the concept of masculinity linked to toughness, male honour, or dominance, tolerance of physical punishment of women and children, acceptance of violence as a means to settle interpersonal disputes, and the perception that men have ‘ownership’ of women.

Consequences

World Health Organisation (1996:11) considers two main types of consequences of Domestic Violence: fatal and non-fatal. The first category of outcomes include: suicide, homicide, maternal mortality, HIV/AIDS. The latter includes a list of recognised physical and mental health conditions. This is supported by other literature (see for example, Dienye & Gbeneol, 2008; Houry et al, 2004; Guterman, 2004, Burnish, 2004)

Service user involvement in domestic violence services

Wilcox (2006) argues that community has been a missing element in the debate around domestic violence in the UK at least. Whilst there has been positive change in terms of both policy frameworks and professional attitudes, it is less clear that this is reflected in communities at large. Furthermore, she argues that the construction of domestic violence as a private issue reinforces the notion that it is the responsibility of statutory agencies rather than community networks. The absence of women from leadership roles in many community groups also contributes to domestic violence not being seen as an issue at a community level.

Sokoloff and Dupont (2005) further add that a failure to acknowledge class, culture etc. leads to problems in providing services that meet the needs of particular individuals and groups. Stoevesand (2007) highlights the complex and contested nature of community work and community services in Hamburg where political changes have resulted in reduced services funded by the state.

Hague and Mullender (2006) suggest that although the voice of the service user has been increasingly heard in the evaluation of services, this voice is still patchy and uneven. Services have had to change to become more ‘professional’ and this has led to a diminution of the voice of the service user. A study in New Zealand by Fanslow and Robinson (2009) maintains that community outreach services have a key role in raising awareness and providing ongoing support. Unfortunately, examples of such services are very limited.
3.5.2. Human Trafficking

Scholars, international researchers, theorists, legal experts, human service professionals, historians, NGOs and human rights advocates have been working to try to comprehend the complexity of human trafficking and develop strategies to address the ‘global phenomenon’ of violence against women and children (United Nations, 2010). A brief summary of relevant literature is presented for consideration.

Human Rights

The idea of what constitutes human rights, and the legitimacy of developing international mandates to legislate are complex. According to Bales (2005), theoretically speaking, the emergence of what we call human rights has been a process of redefining certain acts as evil. To progress in abolishing human trafficking, he believes it is helpful to debate the fact that what some people experience as evil and a violation of human rights, others may see as ‘natural law’ and not harmful. A globalized system of human rights implies that a violation anywhere requires responses from everywhere. However, there must be a consensus on what constitutes wrong-doing and cultural relativism must be considered.

Few would question the unequal status of women today. A number of theoretical and empirical studies find that gender inequality plays a role in violence against women. Blackell summarizes that the unequal status of women in families and society, the feminization of poverty and harmful stereotypes of women as property, commodities, servants and sexual objects, are among some of the root causes of trafficking in women (2002, p.122).

The UN Special Rapporteur on Violence against Women (2001:20) adds:

‘The lack of rights afforded to women serves as the primary causative factor of both women’s migration and trafficking in women. While such rights find expression in constitutions, laws and policies, women nonetheless continue to be denied full citizenship because Governments fail to protect and promote the rights of women. In the home, in the community and in State structures, women are discriminated against on numerous, intersecting levels. By failing to protect and promote women’s civil, political, economic and social rights, Governments create situations in which trafficking flourishes. So, the failure of the State to guarantee women’s rights leads to sexual and economic exploitation of women in both the home and the community and within the local, national and global economies. Economic, political and social structures and the models of development that arise from such structures have failed women. They have failed in their attempts to provide basic economic and social rights to all people, particularly to women, and have further entrenched sex-based divisions of education, labour and migration.’
MacKinnon (2006:180-3) articulates further; Human rights have not been women's rights - not in theory or in reality, not legally or socially, not domestically or internationally. She argues, recognition that inequality with men is a women's global condition, must lead to new legal arrangements beyond the formal equality approaches of the classic neutral - sameness - difference model.

**Social, Economic & Cultural Factors**

There is a need to look comprehensively at social, economic and cultural factors in the origin and destination countries, since there are different schemas. On the basis of empirical evidence available, studies by Caritas Internationalis (2009) and Bales, Trodd, Kent (2009) summarize some of the conditions that contribute to human trafficking. They report that in countries where trafficking originates and exploitation begins, there is often instability and corruption. Abject poverty, especially among women, a lack of political, social and economical stability, a lack of reasonable and realistic prospects, situations of armed conflict and oppression, domestic violence and disintegration of the family structure, gender discrimination, and a lack of access to education and information, creates a supply of potential victims.

Empirical evidence shows that in countries that receive and exploit trafficked victims there is often greed and corruption. An increasing demand for cheap and exploitable labourers in the construction, agricultural and industrial sectors, an increasing demand for cheap and exploitable domestic labourers, a rise in the demand for sex workers, and a refusal by some businesses to cover official expenses for the social protection of regularly employed workers open windows of opportunity for illegal and unethical practices.

Kaufmann (2007:51) states:

'Because of the varied structures of and supports to a patriarchal society, comprising the state, religious and cultural institutions and traditions, family structures and practices, the structure of the economy and the gendered division of labour, individual psychologies, and the articulation of the structures of gender with other structures and ideologies, there is no magic programme. We need comprehensive and diverse responses.'

Research by Ferrari Occhionero and Nocenzithatlong (2009:156) concludes:

'That even formal recognition of political rights, considerable economic, social and cultural advancement and widespread goodwill about the issue [of Gender equality] do not result in acceptable rates of women's participation in important positions in the public space, at all levels. Women’s systematic exclusion from these positions implies negative consequences for societies'.
There is considerable theoretical and empirical support to conclude that when there are international economic policies that foster exclusion of marginalized people combined with obstacles to legal migration, and when there is a lack of public awareness of the dangers of trafficking, a high profit potential for those engaged in sophisticated organised criminal networks, a lack of effective anti-trafficking legislation or effective enforcement, disintegration of social protection networks and widespread corruption in countries of origin, of transit and of destination among the persons capable or responsible to combat this form of violence, human trafficking will continue to be a rampant epidemic harming individuals and societies.

**Interagency Cooperation**

Kara (2009:3) suggests reasons for the inadequate and often misdirected efforts to address the trafficking of women. He writes:

> ‘Despite increased media attention, human trafficking remains poorly understood. The organisations dedicated to combating trafficking are underfunded and uncoordinated internationally. The laws against trafficking are overwhelmingly inadequate and poorly enforced. Despite a number of studies and reports, a systemic business and economic analysis of the sex industry, conducted to identify strategic points of intervention, has not been undertaken.’

Organisations committed to tackle the issue of human trafficking have to strive toward better coordination. Not only must governmental agencies cooperate with each other, but government needs to cooperate with partners from unlikely or untapped sources. Non-governmental organisations (NGOs) have historically been strong partners. Cultivating new partnerships with the private sector can promote progress. Enlisting the support of the public is crucial.

An area where vigilance and action are required is with corruption. For example, Holmes (2009) has extensively investigated police-crime relationships in southern and eastern Europe. He shares empirical data to demonstrate how corrupt police can become directly involved in trafficking by helping create and shield a trafficking scheme, or by colluding with traffickers by alerting them to upcoming raids, or assisting gangs in regaining control of victims who have escaped. Indirectly, police and government officials can aid traffickers simply by refusing to investigate trafficking incidents. To remedy this, his suggestions include aggressive, zero-tolerance anti-corruption laws, and government investments to raise law enforcement capabilities, anchoring their support to firm timetables of progress in securing arrests and prosecutions.
Current Policies and Practice

Trafficked women face precarious realities and they have no voice when in captivity. Trafficked women often live day to day without legal documents, mastery of the local language, financial resources, health care, or relational support. They are often controlled twenty-four hours a day by their captors in unclean and unsafe living conditions. Najafi (2008:24) states that when they reach supportive services, there are often obscure distinctions that confuse service providers, especially in law enforcement between voluntary and legally accepted labour migration, prostitution migration, marriage migration, and the involuntary and illegal trafficking of women and children.

Global Focus

Theoretical and empirical data has been gathered for many years. Human trafficking has existed for hundreds of years. This is the fourth wave of combating human trafficking (Christopher, Pybus, Rediker, 2007). Parrot and Cummings (2008:99) have researched human trafficking worldwide. They agree that international, national and local legislative initiatives are well intentioned and appropriate. They also see that they are not entirely effective. This is partly because sexual slavery and human trafficking are highly lucrative and secretive businesses; the likelihood of perpetrators being caught is very small; the conditions that make women vulnerable are constantly being created; the cultural assumptions that minimize women's worth persist.

Migration

Corrin's research (2005) explores economic aspects of human trafficking and reminds the reader that 70% of the world's poor are women. She says it is no surprise that so many migrate or find themselves deceptively trafficked into the violent world of street and brothels with promises of marriage or legitimate work.

The role of immigration policies uphold conditions of vulnerability that undocumented migrant women face in the service and sex sectors. Although controversial, some scholars have remarked that border controls and visa regimes do not prevent people from moving from their countries of origin nor from reaching the EU (Andreas and Snyder, 2000; Mezzadra and Rigo, 2003). Rather, they increase undocumented modes of travel, the involvement of trafficking networks and profit for third parties (Koslowski, 2001; Andrijasevic, 2003).

Prostitution

The distinguishing of trafficking from prostitution raises an argument over what constitutes sexual oppression and sexual liberation. Siedman (2003) links the arguments to competing understandings of marriage, family and work along with what is described as the private and public spheres. Disagreements over the role of harm relate directly to debates over the relevance of consent in defining and responding to exploitation (Monro, 2008). Hudgins (2007:414) confronts the 'law and order' approach to sex work since it relies on a superficial understanding of sex workers, of brothel owners, and of the context in which the sex industry takes place.
Anthony (2007:418) challenges those who find comfort in seeing prostitution as a ‘career choice’. She believes that this kind of promotion may sentence other women to years of ‘dehumanization’ and ‘numbness’. Since countries legislate prostitution differently, it is important to research effective methods that support the fight against human trafficking. Evidence from Sweden, Germany and Holland is currently being gathered to assess the effectiveness of different approaches to the crime of human trafficking as it relates to prostitution (Bales, 2009:76).

Victim Services

Research shows overwhelmingly that trafficking has a profound impact on the health and well-being of women. The forms of abuse and risks that women experience include physical, sexual and psychological abuse, the forced or coerced use of drugs and alcohol, social restrictions and manipulation, economic exploitation and debt bondage, legal insecurity, abusive working and living conditions, and a range of risks associated with being a migrant and/or marginalized (Caritas Internationalis, 2009; Crawford and Kaufman, 2008; Sigmon, 2008; Moriarty, 2008; Black, 2007). Although some victims respond to, and recover from, trafficking experiences in different ways, it is unquestionable that victims of human trafficking deserve and need support and resources to recover and to reintegrate. However, the funding of victim assistance, victim service, victim compensation, mediation, and restorative justice programmes have been controversial and yet critically needed. Black (2007) proposes that, since decisions about how to approach victim services are often left to the criminal justice system, education and information about the effects of human trafficking for those working in the criminal justice system is decisive. Helping women regain and maintain safety and dignity, heal from traumatic experiences, and rejoin communities means that financial and professional resources need to be available immediately, consistently and effectively in the destination and origin countries.
3.5.3. Violence & Abuse Against Children

In this section a range of academic research-based literature is examined in an attempt to clarify the problems and challenges faced by children and young people when they attempt to access support services as victims of violence, exploitation or trafficking. Specific issues considered include:

- The impact of ‘problematizing’ discourse on service delivery
- The need to involve children and young people in obtaining their rights and entitlements as service users
- The failure to consult with children and young people as to the kind of services that will meet their specific needs
- The emergence of particular issues and problems that have served to influence the access of children and young people to services and support

The concept of ‘problematization’ has a long and influential history in terms of the development of services for children and young people. For it has been argued that over time children and young people have been variously depicted in research, policy and service delivery terms as ‘troubled’, ‘deficient’, ‘disaffected’, ‘delinquent’, ‘diseased’ and ‘perverted’ (Griffin, 1993:114-125). Indeed, as Griffin (1993:11) notes, it is maintained that the power of such representations has been so pervasive that they have assisted in shaping:

‘…. the contemporary Youth service, the education system, apprenticeship and training schemes, child-rearing conventions and practices, the juvenile justice system, the job market, as well as the priorities of contemporary research.’

In turn, the existence of particular forms of ‘problematizing’ discourse has, of itself, provided ‘permission’ for certain groups of young people to be isolated for specific attention in terms of how they are perceived and responded to by education, health and social welfare agencies. For it can be argued that too often a ‘deficit’ agenda is promoted in work with children and young people (Dudley-Marling, 2007). Bomer et al (2008) extend this analysis further in advocating that such a ‘deficit’ agenda is so powerful, that the actual structure and organisation of particular agencies and services actively prevents the young in articulating their needs, advocating for their rights, and becoming involved in the development and design of services. It is important to reflect on why such a view of the young continues to influence matters of policy and service development.

If we take, as an example, the issue of early intervention to prevent children and young people from becoming victims of violence, exploitation or trafficking, as Smith et al (2007:238) point out:

‘…. the fact remains that much of the discourse underpinning the need for early forms of intervention to reduce risk remains preoccupied with a deficit agenda that advocates various forms of ‘treatment’.

- 23 -
Despite the fact that the UNCRC (Sections 12 and 13) specifically argues for the participation rights of children and young people in helping to determine the shape and priorities for services that provide support, it remains the case that the development of genuine ‘participatory arrangements’ between children and adults are limited (Thomas, 2009). Yet, as Nayak (2003) points out, the development of genuine opportunities for participation has the potential to bring with it the use of young people’s intimate knowledge to help determine community needs; including ‘hot spots’ and ‘safe’ and ‘risky’ zones.

For many young people issues of exploitation and violence are played out against the culture of gang life. To be able to truly understand the challenges some young people face in trying to access services, the power of street gang culture has to be more fully understood. As Pitts (2008) argues, ‘street life’ and its associated cultures, together with its perceived constraints, challenges and attractions, draws young people into relationships that are perceived as valuable in terms of offering both respect and status. The impact of violence between young people as explored in this report (see Section 5, Findings) reflects the perspective presented by Wright et al (2006), that ‘disrespect’ for the culture of others often leads to manifestations of violence from gang warfare on the streets to bullying and intimidation. Commenting on the power of the peer group in generating deviant behaviour, Losel and Bender (2006:52) argue that gang activity can have a ‘.... reinforcing effect, leading to an increasing severity of offences’; thus leading to the deeper emersion of young people in particular forms of behaviour.

Violent and abusive behaviour within families by children and young people also serves to create specific problems in terms of them obtaining appropriate support from services. In an attempt to explain this phenomenon, the concept of a ‘cycle of violence’ has been used to link issues of abuse and neglect to the generation of risk factors that increase the potential for violence within families (Losel and Bender, 2005). Yet as Muncie (2006:27) argues although a range of factors such as family conflict, drug use, lack of parenting etc. are linked to violent behaviour within families ‘.... The problem, however, remains of deciphering which of these numerous variables has more pertinence with some people at some times.’

Muncie goes on to provide an important analysis of the link between victimization and offending. Drawing on the Crime and Justice Survey of 2003 in the United Kingdom, a link is made between the commission of offences, such as violent behaviour, and becoming a victim of crime. He points to the fact that ‘most crime is committed and suffered by the poorest and least resourced urban communities’ (ibid: 170). Such an argument has specific significance for this study, especially when a variety of crime surveys have reported that young people are more likely to be the victims of crime than older people (Burke, 2008). There is a need to consider policy priorities in the organisation and delivery of services and the access that children and young people have to them. In essence, when developing services it is vital that the voices of the young are understood and responded to positively.
Taking up the position presented by authors such as France (2004), the research is underpinned by the notion that young people can act as ‘reliable witnesses’ in commenting on and theorising about their own lives. The view is adopted that young people have important things to say in relation to the development of policies, processes and practices, and that outcomes can be ‘significantly influenced’ if their voices are heard and acted on (Hetherington & Cooper, 2001:104). Therefore, aspects of the study should be read as an attempt to provide ‘insider accounts’ of encounters, social interactions and events with a view to generating new theories and perspectives (Hitchcock and Hughes, 1989).

One key theme that emerges from literature is concerned with the need to understand how allegations of, for example abuse or violence are actually made by young people. For as Parton (2006:179) asserts young people will often develop ‘strategies which bypass adult-centric children’s services’ at the point of disclosure and instead search out those they trust who may well have little experience or training in handling such matters. Wattam’s (2002) work in this area reinforces the fact that levels of direct disclosure by young people to social services departments are extremely low (less that 5 per cent) and that referrals tend to come from other education, social care and health professionals. Connelly and others (2006:55) take this point further in presenting the idea that disclosure often follows a continuum of activity involving both ‘informal’ and ‘formal’ sources and that the use of ‘informal’ sources, such as family and friends, can lead to a level of confidence building that ultimately permits disclosure to professionals who young people have close connections with e.g. a teacher.

The issue of professional treatment and reaction and its potential outcomes also figure within existing literature. Aldridge and Wood (1998) point to how disclosure can become a protracted activity through the existence of complex referral processes and the fact that many professionals lack the experience and expertise to interview young people effectively. LaFontaine (1990) asserts that the dilemma for many professionals centres on the level of belief that they should assume in relation to the young person’s story especially when it is likely to be accompanied by denial on the part of the named adult. Faller (2007) points to the embarrassment and discomfort that many professionals experience when they encounter the graphic language that some young people may choose to use at the time of disclosure and the way in which that embarrassment can ‘block’ their understanding. The issue of non-disclosure and the fact that it can surface through bouts of depression, instances of self harm, non-school attendance and aggressive outbursts is also debated through literature (see for example Hallett and others, 2003).
4. METHODOLOGY

4.1. Approach

The intention of the research project was to generate a comparative study of community-based initiatives aimed at supporting women, children and young people who had been the focus of violence, exploitation or trafficking. As part of the research process consideration was given to the experiences of those living within three geographical regions of Germany, Romania and the United Kingdom. It was necessary then, in designing the project, to integrated specific aspects of work that would help to capture a range of appropriate data for analysis.

A key element of the research involved capturing what Cohen et al (2002:20) describe as ‘the direct experiences of people in specific contexts’. There was a need to explore the voice of groups of service users. At the same time the views of policy makers, service managers and practitioners were required to gain an understanding of how a range of policies are translated into practice and the challenges and priorities that are influential in shaping service development and delivery. As Beck (1979) argues, research of this nature has the potential to explain, clarify and demystify social process, relationships, methods of working and structural arrangements.

As part of the overall approach it was decided to use a critical events approach to capture the narrative of specific groups of service users. Individuals were encouraged to comment on particular ‘critical incidents’ in their lives and how they sought help and support from services in times of crisis. For as Webster and Mertova (2007:71) comment:

‘Narrative inquiry approaches to human experience and the construction and reconstruction of personal stories blend in such a way that they highlight issues of complexity and human centeredness... these are recalled in the form of critical events that are instrumental in changing or influencing understanding.’

Crucially, such critical events can be understood in terms of their traumatic implications or how they might put a person ‘at risk’. However, in exploring critical events, such as an incident of domestic violence, or being forced into a marriage against an individual’s will, the concern was to assess the impact it had on the person (or their dependents) recalling the incident, activity or encounter.

The researchers wanted the project to be significantly shaped by the human rights agenda previously described. Memories and descriptions of key events outlined in the personal interviews were intended to be ‘constructed and reconstructed’, and ‘blended’ in order to change and influence existing levels of understanding (Webster and Mertova, 2007:71). If then, as Heron and Reason (2008:372) advocate, such a process of inquiry requires ‘cycling between action and reflection’ there was a need to create a mechanism for processing interview stories that moved away from the ‘tendency to attribute one set of meanings to experience’. The intention, therefore, had to be to create opportunities for participation that ‘emphasized equality and mutuality’ with any data generated being available for collective scrutiny, debate and analysis.
Taking up the position presented by authors such as France (2004), the research was underpinned by the notion that service users can act as ‘reliable witnesses’ in commenting on and theorising about their own lives. The view is adopted that those women, children and young people involved in the study had important things to say and the development and evaluation of services could be ‘significantly influenced’ if their voices were heard and acted on (Hetherington & Cooper, 2001:104). Therefore, the study should be read as an attempt to provide ‘insider accounts’ of encounters, social interactions and events with a view to generating new theories and perspectives (Hitchcock and Hughes, 1989). Specific consideration was also given to the fact that, as Olafson (2007: 11-12) argues, such studies will inevitably contain examples of ‘explicit memory’ i.e. ‘consciously recalled events from the past’ and ‘implicit memory’ based on ‘emotions’, ‘perceptions’ and expressions of ‘trauma’.

In pursuing a largely qualitatively-driven interpretive paradigm in an attempt to make sense of complex social and personal situations and service responses to these, the intention was to provide ‘multi-faceted images of human behaviour as varied as the situations and contexts supporting them’ (Cohen et al, 2002:23). In order to achieve this cognisance had to be taken of the views of those providing services as well as those using them. In turn, the research team attempted to identify existing models of good practice to see if these could be generalised to provide overarching principles for the development of effective policy and practice. The innovative nature of the project lay in its ability to promote advocacy opportunities across three identified regions in order to directly influence policy and practice developments from a service user perspective. There was a need to take into account cultural, social, economic and gender factors when considering what was common and different in terms of experiences within the three regions.

4.2. Research Design

The design of the research project was based around a number of distinct developmental phases. Each of these phases is now explored in some detailed and the research methods utilised explained. The work undertaken by each partner was influenced by the range of provision offered in each region and the identification of the specific Daphne III objectives that relate to that work. The extent of the regional coverage was determined by the geographical and political boundaries already in existence. Each of the partners was responsible for carrying out the research and scoping activities in its own area. The areas explored by each partner are outlined in Table 5 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lucian Blaga University</th>
<th>Romania</th>
<th>Sibiu City &amp; County</th>
<th>Domestic Violence</th>
<th>Violence/Abuse Against Children &amp; Young People</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alicice Salomon University</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>Berlin, Bremen &amp; Lower Saxony</td>
<td>Domestic Violence</td>
<td>Human Trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newman University College</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Birmingham</td>
<td>Domestic Violence</td>
<td>Human Trafficking</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5: Areas explored by each partner organisation
4.2.1. **Phase 1: Scoping the Project & Building Contextual Background**
To begin with, it was necessary to design a common framework for collecting, collating and assessing the research data to be assembled during the life of the project. At this stage, the analysis was thematically-based and involved the interrogation of legislation, policies and practices, at both national and local levels, within the Member States involved in the project. Human rights legislation was considered from the United Nations, European Union and individual countries. Political, social and economic factors were examined in order to assess the potential impact they might have on the development and delivery of services. This phase of the work was supported by interviews with policy makers, service managers and practitioners. Work also commenced on the detailed analysis of academic literature. The aim in the first phase was to provide a detailed contextual background to the project that could then be used to inform later work with service users.

4.2.2. **Phase 2 – Interviews with Service Users**
The second phase of the project was concerned with the generation of interview materials produced through direct contact with women, children and young people. As part of the interview process attention was paid to the circumstances and events that act as triggers for individuals deciding to make use of specific victim support services within the community. Consideration was given to the quality and effectiveness of the support offered and how it contributed to fostering and supporting the human rights of victims of abuse, exploitation and trafficking. Matters relating to gender inequality, health and social exclusion were also examined.

4.2.3. **Phase 3 – Dissemination (Stage 1)**
The partners took direct responsibility for country-specific dissemination activities of the research findings arising out of the project. This included arranging seminars, attending meeting, conferences and workshops, publishing articles and papers, etc. Partners were also required to contribute towards the generation of the publication of a full report on the outcomes of the research.

4.2.4. **Phase 4 – Development of Training Materials**
The partners were jointly responsible for the production of case study materials to support inter-agency and inter-professional education and training. These were produced according to a commonly agreed format that facilitated the development of materials for on-line publication across all partner countries. The case studies were used to explore matters concerned with future policy development and the identification of good practice. Specific consideration was given to how the views of service users could be more effectively accommodated to support the development, management and evaluation of victim support schemes. Each partner was responsible for the generation of case study material related to their own experiences of analysing and evaluating the work of community-based victim support services.

4.2.5. **Phase 5 – Dissemination (Stage 2)**
The final phase of the project involved the organisation of a joint conference to showcase the case study materials and explore the outcomes of the work of the project. This phase also involved the production of the final project report.
4.3. Research Methods

The project made use of a range of research methods to support data gathering and collation. Each of the methods employed is outlined below.

4.3.1. Semi-structured Interviews
These were used with policy makers, service managers, practitioners and women, children and young people. As a key research method, the advantage of the interview approach was that interviewers could explore sensitive issues in a supportive way and at the same time probe responses and clarify ambiguities through more detailed questioning. They provided rich and quotable data that could be used to substantiate personal and collective experience. The semi-structured format offered the distinct advantage of examining a range of set questions together with the opportunity to follow up on emerging issues (Bowling, 2000). Interviews generated through the project provided important opportunities for women, children and young people to be involved in self-advocacy activities. In particular, the perceptions of service users could be used to inform debate about human rights, gender equality, protection and 'the fight against trafficking' (Daphne, 2007).

4.3.2. Review of Academic Literature
The production of a detailed review of academic literature was required to generate a systematic, explicit and synthesized overview of knowledge, practice and research activity within the area (Fink, 2005). It was important to capture current knowledge and understanding as well as the range and extent of research carried out across Member States. This assisted in informing the design of other research methods such as the semi-structured interviews. In addition, part of any review process focused on the need to interrogate concepts and theoretical perspectives ‘that can help to explain facts and the relationships between them’ (Verma and Beard 1981:10).

4.3.3. Case Studies
A number of case studies were generated out of the materials gathered. It was considered important to produce such materials as they were intended to inform the development of future policy and practice. They were also used to highlight examples of good practice. Case studies can be utilised to identify interactive processes, the implementation of systems and the effectiveness of organisational structures and practices. They are also important in terms of understanding how policy is turned into practice (Bassey, 2003), and provided important opportunities for the voices of victims to be captured.

4.3.4. Documentary Analysis
Documentary analysis formed an important aspect in the development of the research data. Its purpose was to provide an overview of existing documentation which in this case included policy, legislation, codes of practice and evaluation materials. The documents involved were used as ‘sources of evidence’ (Bell, 2005:123) in order to determine the social, economic, political and professional drivers that were directly influencing the development of community-based support services for victims of violence, exploitation and trafficking. As part of the process ‘primary’ and ‘secondary’ sources were interrogated.
Methodology

4.4. Project Management

Newman University College took responsibility for the management of the overall project. Each partner nominated a senior academic to ensure that all aspects of work associated with the project were met at the regional level. A project manager was appointed under the direction of a senior academic of professorial standing at Newman University College. All partners were provided with a half time research assistant to support the work of the project within a region.

The responsibilities of the partners were divided thus:

**Individual partner responsibilities:**
- Scoping current community provision in a designated area
- Undertaking detailed documentary analysis of policy and practice
- Undertaking all of the required interview work
- Contributing towards the production of case study materials
- Providing papers/seminar documents to support dissemination activities
- Hosting workshops/project meetings

**Collective responsibilities:**
- Contributing towards the production of reports, papers and seminar materials
- Contributing towards the design and production of on-line materials in relevant community languages
4.5. Ethical Considerations

The research project had attached to it a range of ethical issues that required consideration from the outset. There was a need to recognise that contributors to the research, particularly women, children and young people, would be exposing for scrutiny difficult, complex and potentially painful aspects of their lives. There was the possibility that involvement in the research, by for example a young trafficked woman, might increase their level of personal danger. Those interviewed in policy making, management and practitioner positions might find it necessary to critically comment on service development and delivery issue. In order to deal with the kind of situations outlined here, the principle of gaining 'informed consent' (Oliver, 2004) from all research participants was adopted. In adopting such a principle issues of confidentiality and anonymity, and the right to withdraw from the research process at any point, had to be taken into consideration. As Cohen et al (2002) argue, ethical considerations have to be taken into consideration from the research design stage onwards.

In Table 6 below some of the key ethical issues connected with the development and management of the research project are outlined, together with the specific response made:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethical considerations</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Location of interviews</strong></td>
<td>Offering the person to be interviewed a choice of location whenever possible&lt;br&gt;The creation of an interview climate that was respectful and non-judgemental</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Conduct of interviews</strong></td>
<td>Developing interview schedules that were sensitively worded so as not to increase the stress levels of participants&lt;br&gt;Agreeing final content of an interview with the participant&lt;br&gt;Clarifying statements in an attempt to reduce ambiguity and misreporting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Psychological considerations</strong></td>
<td>Ensuring the individual concerned was willing to take part in the interview – formally securing informed consent&lt;br&gt;Offering the right to withdraw from the interview process at any stage&lt;br&gt;Ensuring that appropriate additional support is offered if individuals become distressed as a result of taking part in the interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Presentation of data</strong></td>
<td>Protection of the identities of all participants&lt;br&gt;Presentation of data in a form that does not cause embarrassment or discomfort to participants in research</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.6. Approach to Data Analysis

The nature of the research project demanded that a clear, succinct and appropriate structure was developed to support data analysis. Using an approach to data analysis originally advocated by Cohen et al, (2002) a six step process was utilised. Table 7 below captures the activities undertaken within each step:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Creating units of analysis/research domains | Units of analysis/domains established at initial workshop meeting of partners. These included:  
- Domestic violence  
- Violence against children and young people  
- Human trafficking  
- Forced marriages |
| Establishing relationships and linkages across domains | Workshop based activities to sift and classify data gained from policy makers, service managers, practitioners and service users |
| Making early/speculative inferences | Sharing of data in group meetings and via Virtual Learning Environment (VLE) |
| Summarizing | Collaborative activity to construct a summary of each of the domains: involved identification of key factors, concepts, theories, key areas for further investigation and reflection |
| Looking for contradictory evidence | Looking for examples of data that contradicted and/or questioned summaries from each domain |
| Theory generation | Making use of the available summaries to generate theoretical concepts that explained approaches to service delivery and how services could be improved |

Table 7 Process of data analysis (adapted from Cohen et al 2002)

In order to facilitate the steps described above, all data collection processes were underpinned by the need to collect and classify such data in a consistent and rigorous way. For example, the interrogation of all interview materials required:

- Structured content analysis that allowed key issues, events, activities, perceptions, etc. to be captured
- Establishment of specific patterns from the data by highlighting recurrent themes and issues and connections within and across domains
- Development of ‘coding systems’ that can subsequently be used to support classification, ordering and explanation

Such approaches assisted in the development of robust ‘triangulation’ processes (Denzin 1978) through the combination of both the use of multiple investigators and research methods. The data collected was produced from different sources and in different Member States.
5. RESEARCH FINDINGS
Within this section a summary of key research findings is presented. The findings are assembled under the key themes of the report. Each section has a common structure and includes:

- Legislation and policy frameworks
- Policy maker perspectives
- Service managers and practitioner perspectives
- Service users perspectives

5.1. Domestic Violence
Data on the issue of domestic violence was collected by all of the partner countries. As a common issue that features across policy and practice agendas, it proved possible to obtain the views of service users, policy makers and service managers/ practitioners. A summary of the areas covered in the key findings is provided in the box below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>International Legislative Framework:</td>
<td>5.1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Nations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Union</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National/Regional Legislation and Policy:</td>
<td>5.1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Delivery Approaches:</td>
<td>5.1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy Makers: Summary of Interviews</td>
<td>5.1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Managers &amp; Practitioners: Summary of Interviews</td>
<td>5.1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Users: Summary of Interviews</td>
<td>5.1.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.1.1. International Legislative Framework (Domestic Violence)
Here, a brief overview is provided of the legislative frameworks that shape policy and practice developments in the three partner countries. The section is subdivided to reflect legislation at international, European and country levels. Specific focus is placed on the key aspects of human rights conventions that are pertinent.

United Nations

Summary of United Nations Human Rights Framework

- The United Nations Declaration on Elimination of Violence Against Women, adopted in 1993 – this includes a definition of domestic violence and specific consideration of psychological aspects of domestic violence;
- The Resolution of the UN Commission for Preventing Crime and Penal Justice Concerning Violence Against Women and Children - adopted in 1994;
- The Declaration of the Fourth Conference on Women’s Issues - adopted in 1995 considers violence against women as being one of the 12 obstacles in the way of respecting women’s rights;
- United Nations Millennium Declaration, 2000
Key Definitions

United Nations Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against Women 1993 - Article 1 states that:
 Violence against women means any act of gender-based violence that results in, or is likely to result in, physical, sexual or psychological harm or suffering to women, including threats of such acts, coercion or arbitrary deprivation of liberty, whether occurring in public or in private life


Article 2 states that:
 Violence against women shall be understood to encompass, but not be limited to, the following:

- Physical, sexual and psychological violence occurring in the family, including battering, sexual abuse of female children in the household, dowry-related violence, marital rape, female genital mutilation and other traditional practices harmful to women, non-spousal violence and violence related to exploitation;
- Physical, sexual and psychological violence occurring within the general community, including rape, sexual abuse, sexual harassment and intimidation at work, in educational institutions and elsewhere, trafficking in women and forced prostitution;
- Physical, sexual and psychological violence perpetrated or condoned by the State, wherever it occurs.

European Union

Violence against women is to be understood as any act of gender-based violence, which results in, or is likely to result in, physical, sexual or psychological harm or suffering to women, including threats of such acts, coercion, or arbitrary deprivation of liberty, whether occurring in public or private life. This includes, but is not limited to, the following:

- Violence occurring in the family or domestic unit, including physical and mental aggression, emotional and psychological abuse, rape and sexual abuse, incest, rape between spouses, regular or occasional partners and cohabitants, crimes committed in the name of honour, female genital and sexual mutilation and other traditional practices harmful to women, such as forced marriages;
- Violence occurring within the general community, including rape, sexual abuse, sexual harassment and intimidation at work, in institutions or elsewhere trafficking in women for the purposes of sexual exploitation and economic exploitation and sex tourism;
- Violence perpetrated or condoned by the state or its officials;
- Violation of the human rights of women in situations of armed conflict, in particular the taking of hostages, forced displacement, systematic rape, sexual slavery, forced pregnancy, and trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation and economic exploitation.

Council of Europe, Recommendations (2002)
5.1.2. National/Regional Legislation & Policy (Domestic Violence)

GERMANY: Legislation & Policy

National Legislative Framework

Germany is a federal parliamentary republic with 16 states. The German Basic Law (Das Deutsche Grundgesetz, GG) is enshrined in the Basic Law for the Federal Republic of Germany that was agreed on May 23, 1949. German criminal law, overseen by the Federal Ministry of Justice, is codified on the national level in the Strafgesetzbuch, StGB. Civil law is codified on the national level in one of central law documents, the Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch. Every state has its own constitutional court. The Amtsgerichte, Landgerichte and Oberlandesgerichte are state courts of general jurisdiction.

Relevant German domestic violence legislation includes:

- All people irrespective of their sex are guaranteed protection of the right to life and freedom from physical or mental harm, emphasising that the state is obliged to protect human dignity (German Basic Law, Article 1 and 2)
- The First Right to Marriage Reform Act (1976) - allowing a wife the right to decide freely on legal, employment, and social areas
- The Victim Compensation Act (1976) provides protection and compensation of private individuals who have suffered a criminal ‘act’
- Victim Compensation Act (1976) was complemented and amended by further statutory legislation, the Victims of Criminal Acts (1987)
- The German Criminal Code was amended in 1997 by means of the 33rd Amendment Act. Under the amendments to the Criminal Code, offences such as ‘sexual assault causing a person to engage in sexual activity without consent’ and ‘rape’ are now possible offences within marriage
- The Victim Protection Act (1998). This introduces statutory protection of victims, vulnerable persons, and witnesses under the age of 16 in criminal proceedings; these include taped and video evidence by such victims/witnesses. Child witnesses are entitled to an advocate (legal aid) while their evidence is broadcast
- Child Support Act (2000) abolished the statutory provision for parents to use ‘force’ against children
- The Protection from Violence Act 2000 is civil legislation serving as a means of protection for victims of violence, persecution, and other unreasonable acts (such as stalking) and for the easement of legislation regarding the allocation of the domestic and marital home during divorce proceedings. The Act provides for an exclusion order to remove or ban one (married) partner from the marital home in cases of domestic violence.
- The regulation concerning the right of residence of foreign spouses of 1997 was amended by the Aliens Act (2000) enabling a wife to obtain an independent right of residence after two years
- The Improvement of the Rights of Victims Act (in criminal proceedings), announced in BGB1 I 2004 No. 31). The Act states that, inter alia, victims of crime have a statutory right to legal aid and the assistance of an advocate; victims also have a right to victim protection schemes, victim support in court proceedings and subsequent compensation
Policy in Germany

National Level:

In 2007, the Federal Government adopted the Second Action Plan to combat violence against women. It provides a model for action which is applicable to the federal level for the 16 federal States (Länder) and offers possibilities for collaboration between the Federal Government, the States and non-governmental organisations. The main objectives of the Second Action Plan are to improve efficiency in combating violence against women and protecting victims better. Building on the First Action Plan (1999), the Second Plan combines:

- Prevention
- Law making by the Federal Government
- Aid systems to support and give advice for women affected by violence
- National network of systems of support
- Cooperation between governmental/non-governmental support agencies
- Work with perpetrators
- Qualification and increased awareness
- Research
- European and other international cooperation
- Measures to support women abroad

The Action Plan Against Domestic Violence has become a platform and a tool which can be used and developed to achieve improved policy and practice. The German Government expects that the 16 German Land governments will continue to combat violence against women and that the collaboration between public agencies, and nongovernmental organisations and/or associations, will effectively support the objectives. The German federal government is recommends and advocates for (structural) cooperation between the 16 German States and represented institutions, NGOs and projects. This allows for a greater level of consistency in service delivery, and the exchange of valuable resources to combat domestic violence and inter-state and interagency programmes operate in many German communities.

Regional and Local:

Berlin

Berlin is the Seat of the Federal Government and has special significance for combating domestic violence. In 1976, the first shelter for women in Germany was founded in Berlin by the state. Thereafter, additional shelters for women were founded in other cities and rural areas. There are currently over 400 shelters and flats providing refuge for women in Germany. In 1995, the first German cooperation and intervention project, the Domestic Violence Intervention Center – BIG e.V. opened in Berlin and a new concept of concerted action was established that included police, judiciary, youth assistance, and the health sector (BIG, 2010). The Berlin Action Plan to Combat Domestic Violence reviews and implements the Federal Action Plan II.
Bremen

In 2009, the Bremen Senate founded the Bremen Action Committee to Address Domestic Violence, reviewing and implementing policies of the Federal Action Plan II. The ZGF leads this committee and its members include representation from a wide range of government departments.

The primary issues addressed include:

- Early Intervention in kindergartens with staff training programmes and supportive parenting programmes;
- Intervention in Schools including staff trainings, counselling centres, and prevention programmes for students.

Many local organisations including the police, counselling centres, and youth institutions are involved; provision includes youth work shelters for girls and social services counselling programmes for boys and girls; Victim Services are offered by social services in cooperation with the police, justice system, counselling centres and women's shelters; Migrant Services are offered in cooperation with women’s shelters, the Family oriented Integration Training (FIT) designed to assist migrant families in the integration process, and provide information in 6 languages to address violence against women. Health Department Services are a major partner in preventing violence against women and children.

This includes:

- A focus on providing psychological services for mentally ill persons
- Trainings for nursing staff
- Information for patients and their families
- Home Care Services with staff trained in identifying domestic violence;
- A crisis line to help those caring for family members
- An organisation called Independent Patient Counselling Services that focuses on providing supportive services to patients and their families;
- The active involvement of the police in the criminal aspect of domestic violence by intervening and providing documentation necessary for social services.

Lower Saxony

National Legislative Framework

Main Law: Law no. 217/2003 for preventing and fighting domestic violence
Subsequent modifications: Governmental Decision no. 64/2003, approved by Law 194/2004; Governmental Decision no. 95/24 (2003); Law 329/2009 and Governmental Decision+ no.1385/2009

Other Laws: The Penal Code, approved through Law no. 286/2009 (The Official Gazette of Romania No. 510, 2009) articles 177, 199, 200, 231, 274, 37; and Law no.211/2004 on the protection of victims, access information on victims’ rights and psychological counselling, free legal assistance, and financial compensation.

Policy in Romania

National Level:

Decision no. 686 (2005) gave approval to the National Strategy in the field of preventing and fighting against the domestic violence phenomenon for the 2005-2007 period (Emitter: The Government of Romania; Published in: The Official Gazette of Romania No. 678 of the 28th July 2005).

The general objectives of the policy are:

- The improvement of the legislative framework necessary for the organisation and functioning of the system of specialised social services in the field of prevention
- The reinforcement of the institutional capacity of central and local public administration to implement and develop programmes and specialised social services for persons affected by domestic violence
- The facilitation of cultural partnership and social solidarity in developing policies to prevent and fight against domestic violence at a national level
- To make Romanian society aware of, and responsible for responding to, problems of domestic violence
- The participation and active involvement of the Romanian state in actions undertaken at an international level in the field of preventing and combating domestic violence

Regional and Local:

The national strategy is reflected in the development of the county strategy (Sibiu County) of social assistance. Law no. 217 passed in May 22, 2003, and its subsequent modifications, established an obligation for Ministries and other central specialised agencies to appoint specialist staff (Articles 5 & 6). The Law requires collaboration between local authorities and non-governmental organisations in order to involve local communities in supporting activities to help fight and prevent domestic violence (Article 7).
National Legislative Framework

The UK national policy and legislation context for domestic violence is aligned with a broader crime reduction agenda. The Domestic Violence Crime and Victims Act 2004 included a number of new powers and amendments to existing legislation and increased the protection available to victims in cases involving the Crown Prosecution Service. The Act’s measures include amendments to Part 4 of the Family Law Act 1996 to give better protection to victims of domestic violence and strengthen police powers. Section 1 of the Act has made the breach of a non-molestation order a criminal offence punishable by imprisonment of up to five years and Section 4 enabled non-cohabitating couples to be eligible for non-molestation and occupation orders.

Whilst there is no statutory offence of domestic violence, law enforcement guidance takes account of Domestic Violence Crime and Victims Act 2004, the Criminal Justice Act 2003, the Female Genital Mutilation Act 2003, the Sexual Offences Act 2003 and the implementation of Part II Youth Justice and Criminal Evidence Act 1999.

Policy in UK

National Level:

Domestic Violence: A National Report (2005) was published by the UK Government’s Home Office with the core objectives of prevention; protection and justice; and support for victims of domestic violence. The plan set out 5 Government targets:

- Reducing the prevalence of domestic violence particularly in high incidence areas and/communities
- Increasing the rate that domestic violence is reported, particularly in high incidence areas and/or communities
- Increasing the rate of reporting domestic violence incidents that are brought to justice particularly in high incidence areas and/communities
- Ensuring victims of domestic violence are adequately protected and supported nationwide
- Reducing the number of domestic violence related homicides.

Forced Marriage: The Forced Marriage (Civil Protection) Act, 2007 provides the ‘Forced Marriage Order’. On application, courts can make provisions to prevent forced marriage through powers of intervention including preventing access to victim and removal of passport. The UK Government’s Foreign and Commonwealth Office has a Forced Marriage Unit that specialises in information, advice and training for local and national organisations, including responsibilities and duties and multi-agency working. Specialist services include a telephone support service is available for victims and specialist training in forced marriage of those with learning disabilities.
Regional and Local:

At a local authority level, Birmingham City Council has statutory duties under:

- Crime and Disorder Act 1998: the local authority has a duty to prevent crime and disorder
- Local Government and Public Involvement in Health Act 2007: the local authority has a duty to provide for the well-being of citizens
- The Housing Act 1996 (Part V11): the local authority has a duty to assist persons fleeing domestic violence with finding suitable accommodation
- Human Rights Act 1998 and the Children Act 1989: the local authority maintains responsibilities to uphold the human rights of local citizens

Birmingham City Council concurs with domestic violence as being:

‘... any violence between current or former partners in an intimate relationship, wherever and whenever the violence occurs. The violence may include physical, sexual, emotional, psychological or financial abuse.’  
(HM Constabulary, 1999)

Birmingham City Council retains a role in promoting and defending the rights of women and children to live free from violence, intimidation and abuse. Advocating corporate and multi-agency approaches, the Corporate Domestic Violence Policy for the City Council (2000) sets out to:

- Provide direct support, advice and assistance to survivors;
- Ensure the welfare and safety of survivors and their children;
- Contribute to initiatives and activities designed to raise public awareness
- Raise awareness of domestic violence among Council employees

(Adapted from www.birmingham.gov.uk)

The Forced Marriage Unit promotes and monitors forced marriage at a local level, including:

- Awareness of forced marriage multi-agency guidelines:
- Responsibilities and obligations of different agencies working with victims
- Information on protecting, advising and supporting victims
- Information on making referrals to other agencies and where to turn to for help
- Advice and information for practitioners assisting both male and female victims of forced marriage

(Adapted from www.fco.gov.uk)
## Definitions

In the UK and Germany there are no statutory definitions of domestic violence. Domestic violence is defined in Germany in the broader context of violence against women. This approach is consistent with the objective according to which domestic violence is treated as a public problem and not a private one. Germany's approach is similar to the UN and EU. In UK the government has produced a common non-statutory definition, which defines domestic violence in terms of a relationship between adults. Romania has a legal definition of the phenomenon of domestic violence that defines violence between all family members, children, youths or adults, including marital cohabitation cases.

## Forms of Domestic Violence

In all three states domestic violence includes: psychological, physical, sexual, emotional or financial abuse. In the UK and Germany domestic violence includes specific forms of violence including female genital mutilation, forced marriage and ‘honour’ crimes.

## Context of Human Rights

In all three countries legislation and policies are influenced by Human Rights conventions and legislation.

## National Legislation

In none of the countries is domestic violence a statutory offence. But in all countries there are a number of possible criminal offences for which perpetrators could be prosecuted - murder, rape etc. UK and Germany do not have specific laws to prevent and combat domestic violence. In Romania there is a specific law. In Germany, domestic violence is covered by the general provisions of criminal law. UK legislation resides with Acts covering Domestic Violence Crime, Victims, Criminal Justice Female Genital Mutilation, Sexual Offences and Youth Justice and Criminal Evidence.

## Strategy / National Action Plans

All three countries have specific strategies or national action plans to prevent and combat domestic violence and / or violence against women.

## Local and County Level

Germany and UK has specific strategies and action plans at both regional and local level for preventing and combating domestic violence. In Romania, and specifically within Sibiu County, there is no strategy or action plan. Work in this area reflects national policies.
5.1.3. Service Delivery: Approaches (Domestic Violence)

This section explores the approaches to service delivery that is adopted in the three partner countries. Specific consideration is given to the range and approaches adopted. Examples are provided of where local authorities (LAs) act as providers, or commissioners, of services and the range, and types, of partnership that exist between NGOs, ‘not for profit’ organisations, church groups and private providers.

Approaches to Service Delivery in Germany: Berlin/Bremen/Lower Saxony

Contextual background

Berlin is an urban centre, Bremen is a middle sized city (500,000 persons), and Lower Saxony represents rural communities. This section provides an overview as to how Federal policy is being implemented with different populations and regions. There is evidence of cooperation between various responsible authorities and structures for the provision of aid, implementation of the provisions reflected in the Violence Protection Act, amendments to police laws, and amendments to the Social Code. Cooperation is continued on all levels (local, regional, and federal) with participation from federal and state representation, police and non-governmental agencies.

Services for victims of domestic violence

The Federal Ministry of Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth funds the national network of women’s shelters by way of the Women’s Shelters Coordination Association, the National Organisation of Women’s Counselling Agencies and Women’s Hotlines. The Ministry and its networks support and fund many research projects such as addressing special domestic violence issues among the disabled, risk and protective factors, and the need for help on the part of the women. The Ministry and inter-institutional agencies offer ongoing educational training to professionals in the judicial, social, medical and military fields.

The agencies providing family related counselling supported by the Federal Government, now work to make their counsellors more aware of the issue of violence against women within the framework of their additional and ongoing training programmes.

The Federal Ministry supports awareness raising campaigns and publishes material regarding domestic violence. Their web site contains an archive of information to assist those requesting information, services, etc. There is also an association of women’s counselling centres and Women’s emergency hotlines supplying information about the location of services throughout Germany.
Examples of community-based services

**Berlin**

**Central Referral Centre for Berlin: Domestic Violence Intervention Centre Berlin- BIG e.V.**
BIG is a Berlin-based non-profit organisation founded in 1995 by women and men working in projects against domestic violence in Berlin. It ran as a national model project until 2001 and was supported by the Federal Ministry for Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth as well as by the Berlin Department of Labour, Women and Social Affairs. Currently, BIG is supported by the Berlin Department of Economy and Women, various foundations such as Stiftung Deutsche Jugendmarke e. V., Stiftung Deutsche Klassenlotterie Berlin, and private individuals. The project’s aims include:

- Developing a framework of protection and support for women and children.
- Strengthening the rights and legal status of abused women.
- Ensuring that society outlaws violence and its perpetrators.
- Holding the perpetrators responsible for their deeds, e.g. through the police
- Providing information about violence against women and preventive work.
- Coordinating action on the part of all participating institutions

**Wildwasser e.V., Berlin Arbeitsgemeinschaft gegen sexuellen Missbrauch an Mädchen e.V.**
An intercultural team of women offer emergency shelter, 24 hour counselling, conflict resolution support services for girls between the ages of 12 and 18.

**Bremen/Bremerhaven**

Victim Care includes:

- Seven women’s shelters in the Bremen area, including a shelter for girls.
- 23 counselling centres for women.
- 19 state-run counselling centres for children, adolescents and their parents.

**Mädchenhaus e.V.**
Since 1989, Mädchenhaus e.V. has advocated for the gender specific interests of girls and women locally and nationally. The intercultural team offers shelter and counselling to girls who have experienced psychological, physical or sexual abuse. They provide information and training to professionals and cooperate with other state agencies to raise awareness of domestic abuse. An internet service enables girls to connect with staff or with other girls.

**Lower Saxony**
The region has also made a commitment to address domestic violence. Women and girls may access a range of services. There are also programmes to address perpetrators. Lower Saxony has:

- 40 women's shelters and 3 shelters for girls who have experienced abuse
- 34 Counselling centres for abused women and children
- Rural intervention centres to meet the needs of rural women
In Sibiu County there is no specific strategy for preventing and combating domestic violence. The County Social Assistance Strategy (2007-2010) however, offers a general level of strategic guidance that influences service development and delivery at the local level. Emphasis is placed on:

'Raising public awareness in Sibiu County regarding the phenomenon and the effects of domestic violence and child maltreatment and promoting within Sibiu local community the services offered to victims of maltreatment and domestic violence by GDSAPC.'

(General Directorate for Social Assistance and Child Protection Sibiu)

Institutional restructuring has brought with it specific challenges in providing and maintaining social support services for the victims of domestic violence. Emergency Ordinance no. 68/2010 regarding reorganising the Ministry of Labour, Family and Social Protection and the activities of the institutions subordinated to it or under its coordination or authority, aims to promote an integrated social policy on family protection issues, child rights, prevention and combating domestic violence. This policy will be implemented at the county level by the GDASPC. To this end, within GDASPC, a Domestic Violence Department has been created. The evaluation of social protection services for victims of domestic violence is carried out according to quality standards set by Order no. 383 (2004).

Nature of services

A range of services exist to support victims of domestic violence in Sibiu County, including:

- Social services: counselling, information
- Temporary housing
- Medical services
- Legal services
- Psychological services

A number of local public institutions/agencies have a direct responsibility for work in this area. These include:

- Domestic Violence Department: an emergency telephone service (2011)
- Department for Child Protection within the Social Assistance Public Service
- Health care facilities including emergency units at county hospitals, family doctors, Public Health Department Sibiu, County Legal Medicine Service
- County Police Department and Gendarmerie County Inspectorate
- County School Inspectorate
- NGOs involved in programmes fighting violence against women
The Domestic Violence Department in the GDASPC has the major responsibility for service delivery from 2011. The roles and responsibilities to be covered include the provision of immediate assistance and preventative work. Examples of the nature of the services to be provided are described below.

Victim support service work includes:

- Completion of a socio-economic evaluation covering the victim’s needs and resource requirements. The process helps to ensure adequate provision of information and services for the restoration and development of individual and family capacity
- Provision of appropriate assistance and support to facilitate advocacy
- Exploration of the victim’s legal situation and rights
- Provision of emergency protection for the victim together with information on the organisation and operation of specialised centres
- Development of an individual plan regarding social assistance measures available

Preventative work includes:

- Taking necessary steps for early detection of risk in situations that may cause the separation of a child from his/her parents
- Prevention of abusive behaviours by parents and the escalation of domestic violence via the identification and monitoring of individual and family social needs, information on rights and obligations and the provision of social, legal and psychological counselling

Other forms of preventative activity involve:

- Development of promotional materials (flyers, brochures)
- Telephone assistance to overcome the crises
- Telephone counselling to assess the immediate needs and risk potential
- Emergency intervention to perform immediate risk assessments
- The provision and management of an information database
- Organisation and updating of database containing details of domestic violence cases
Examples of community-based services

In addition to the services provided at the level of the local authority a range of community-based services are also offered to support the victims of domestic violence. These services are largely provided through a network of NGOs. Specific examples of such services are provided below.

The Sibiu Women’s Association

- Focus: Abuse (violence) and neglect; domestic violence;
- Types of services offered: Identification and evaluation; professional guidance; legal counselling; psychological counselling; social counselling; hosting for a definite period;
- Capacity: 7 places for adults plus any children

The ESTERA German Christian Women’s House Association - The Centre for the Prevention and the Fight against Family Violence

- Focus: Domestic violence
- Types of services offered: Hosting for a definite period; legal counselling; psychological counselling; social counselling; information; community reintegration.
- Capacity: 15 places for adults plus any children

Association for Freedom and Gender Equality (AFGE)

Established in 2004, the association runs a programme of counselling and therapy for the victims of domestic violence and sexual aggression, as well as a programme of information and awareness for violence prevention (educational sessions in schools, camps, public campaigns).

- Focus: Domestic violence; sexual exploitation; gender discrimination; sexual orientation discrimination
- Types of services offered: Information; psychological counselling; social counselling
Service Delivery: Approaches (Domestic Violence)

Approaches to Service Delivery in UK: Birmingham

Contextual background

The main statutory service responsibilities for domestic violence services are located in:
- Criminal justice system
- Health care
- Social services
- Housing
- Civil legal services

The Pan Birmingham Domestic Violence Strategy (2006-2009) set out the strategic priorities for Birmingham including Safety & Justice; Safety & Support; Prevention & Early Intervention; Children & Young People and Achieving Birmingham's Co-ordinated Inter-Agency Response.

Nature of services

Local domestic violence strategy and service provision focuses on women, young people and children as victims of violence and is overseen by the Birmingham Violence Against Women Board (BVWAB) which facilitates the development and implementation of a local Violence Against Women Strategy. BVWAB operates as a reference and resource point, co-ordinates local and national information and supports organisations and individuals working with domestic violence.

BVWAB highlights work on violence against women in relation to Prevention, Protection, Provision, Participation and Public Reassurance. A wider emphasis on violence against women now includes:
- Domestic violence and abuse
- Forced marriage
- Honour based violence
- Female genital mutilation
- Rape and sexual violence
- Women exploited through prostitution
- Impact of gendered violence upon children

The Government’s Best Value Performance Indicators (2005) are used to assess Local Authority services including:
- Directory of local domestic violence services
- 1 refuge space per 10000 population
- Domestic violence co-ordinator
- Multi-agency strategy & multi-agency forum
- Information sharing protocol between key statutory partners
- Enabling victim/survivors to remain in their own homes
- Tenancy conditions to enable eviction of perpetrators
- Domestic violence education packs for schools and youth groups
- Programme of multi-agency training
Examples of community-based services

**Birmingham & Solihull Women’s Aid (B&SWA):**
- Free telephone Helpline
- Safe refuge accommodation that is accessible both day and night and throughout the year
- Outreach and community-based support for women and children affected by domestic violence
- One-to-one and group support for victims
- Family Support Project: available to help and support women and children

**Ashram Housing Association:**
Through developing social housing and responding to local needs, Ashram has recently opened new purpose-built refuge accommodation that promotes key elements of previous work based on service user feedback, and includes:
- Secure building with managed entry systems
- High specification of health and safety and access requirements
- Self-contained family apartments with independent cooking and bathroom facilities
- Facilities and support services for children and young people
- Communal lounge and shared kitchen facilities
- Improved specialist staff roles, e.g. recent appointment of worker for young people and translation/advocacy roles
- Activities and services designed in response to needs of black and ethnic minority service users

**The Jan Foundation’s Lantern Project:**
As a mentoring project, Lantern recruits and trains women from the local community to provide one-to-one mentoring support for other women experiencing domestic abuse. Lantern promotes community-led responses and previous victims of domestic abuse are among the mentors. The purpose of the mentoring support is to enable mentees to take action at an early stage. The Project maintains that their work has been shown to have significant and effective results including:
- Permanent removal of the causes of violence
- Raised self-esteem of service users
- Restored self-respect
- Ability to live without fear
- Generation of aspirations
- Improved prospects for future employment and training
## Similarities & Differences in Service Delivery Approaches

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SERVICES</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Development strategies for services at regional level</strong></td>
<td>In Birmingham there is a specific strategy for preventing and combating domestic violence. Berlin/Bremen/Lower Saxony and Birmingham have policies at a regional level to prevent and combat domestic violence. Domestic violence policy in Sibiu is coordinated through the County General Directorate for Social Assistance and Child Protection.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The network of services and the collaboration between them</strong></td>
<td>Similar services are provided in the 3 regions. These include social, medical and legal support and the provision of shelters. The responsibility for preventing and combating domestic violence is divided between institutions and supported by cooperation agreements. The involvement of the police is seen as a key factor in preventing and combating domestic violence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The number and variety of public services</strong></td>
<td>A large number and a wide variety of services exist at the local level in Germany and England. In Sibiu, there are few networks of support available. Reorganisation at a national level is impacting on service provision at a local level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Beneficiaries of services</strong></td>
<td>In Berlin/Bremen/Lower Saxony and Birmingham there are services for both the victims and the aggressors, in Sibiu there are services only for victims.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Approach possible to delivery of public services</strong></td>
<td>In Birmingham, as well as in Berlin/Bremen/Lower Saxony, it proved possible to identify services for prevention and intervention. In Sibiu public services focus mainly on intervention.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.1.4. Policy Makers’ Perspectives (Domestic Violence)

Summary of Interviews with Policy Makers

In this section a detailed summary of policy maker interviews is provided. Table 8 below presents details of the number of interviews undertaken. The findings are divided under a number of headings that relate directly to the provision of community-based services and the policy perspectives that inform their development.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number of Interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8 Interviews for Domestic Violence (Policy Makers)

Specific consideration is given to policy maker perspectives from Germany and the United Kingdom.

Germany: Policy Makers - Summary of Interviews (Domestic Violence)

Human Rights

There continues to be a strong national and regional commitment to the promotion of women’s rights within German society. An outcome of this is demonstrated through a strong and robust legislative and policy agenda in the area of domestic violence. At the same time, it is recognised that constant political action is required to keep the issue of domestic violence in the public domain. It was also argued that more needs to be done to develop international cooperation – particularly with eastern European countries.

Policy Focus

It proved possible to identify a number of specific strands of activity influencing policy development and practice both locally and nationally. These include the fact that:

- Policy and practice has been constructed through the development of a strong research base
- NGOs play an important role in the delivery of the domestic policy strategy within local communities
- NGOs carry out an important lobbying function in terms of the development of policy at both national and regional levels
- There is evidence to suggest that the quality of multiprofessional and multi-agency working is improving within communities
Policy Makers’ Perspectives (Domestic Violence)

Current Challenges

Through the interviews a number of specific challenges were outlined in relation to the development of future policy and practice. These include:

- Need for greater cooperation between, and coordination of services across Germany
- Positive promotion of the importance and value of legal services in assisting women in obtaining their right to appropriate support
- The need to extend the range and nature of current community-based services being offered to women and their children
- The need to establish across political party support for work in this area so that changes in power do not bring with them substantial policy shifts

Romania: Policy Makers - Summary of Interviews (Domestic Violence)

Human Rights

The interview process revealed a number of substantial challenges faced by Romanian society at this time. It was acknowledged that the development and promotion of policy in the area of domestic violence is not a high priority. Frequent changes in government have not assisted in providing a sound platform from which policy can be developed. All of this has impacted on the promotion of a proactive human rights agenda.

Policy Focus

It proved possible to identify a number of specific strands of activity influencing policy development and practice both locally and nationally. These include the fact that:

- National and county level structures are being reorganised and this has caused major problems in the development of policy and practice;
- An attempt is being made, through a national working group, to develop a new integrated strategy. However, this work will not be completed for at least 2 years
- There is a need for a reorientation of the criminal justice system to provide ‘treatment’ for perpetrators
- There is a need for a greater diversification in the type of service that is Emphasis needs to be placed on the provision of support services for victims of domestic violence living in rural communities
Current Challenges

Through the interview process a number of specific challenges were outlined in relation to the development of future policy and practice. These include:

- The need to obtain a clearer statistically-based picture of the extent of domestic violence within communities
- The development of preventative programmes to combat domestic violence
- A significant improvement in the services available to women and children in rural communities;
- Greater levels of coordination, and financial support, to improve the quality and range of the services currently available.

United Kingdom: Policy Makers- Summary of Interviews (Domestic Violence)

Human Rights

It was argued at both national and local levels that respect for, and the promotion of, human rights underpins all forms of policy development in relation to domestic violence. Specific emphasis is placed on both ‘protection’ and ‘preventative’ work. The development of community-based services was seen as an important platform for the promotion and delivery of human rights. It was also noted, at a national level in particular, that voluntary organisations have an important role to play in lobbying for resources and bringing to the attention of ministers human rights’ violations.

At the time the research was undertaken there appeared to be strong support for the development of proactive policies that improved current services, outcomes and choices for women and their children. A clear connection between national and local policy development was acknowledged.

Policy Focus

It proved possible to identify a number of specific strands of activity influencing policy development and practice both locally and nationally. These include:

- Major improvements in gathering data that allows for detailed analysis of trends and community needs
- The development of community-based multiprofessional support involving public, voluntary and private sector organisations as appropriate
- The development of educational support programmes to raise awareness in schools, youth groups etc.
- Giving an increased role to third sector organisations to advocate for, and promote the voice of, service users
- Introduction of a Domestic Violence forum at the local level
Current Challenges

Through the interviews a number of specific challenges were outlined in relation to the development of future policy and practice. These include:

- The need to understand, and respond to, the growth in domestic violence between young people in families
- The ongoing difficulties in providing strong funding streams to support domestic violence work – community-based services are heavily reliant on grant-aid
- The recognition of domestic violence as a significant factor in ‘forced marriages’
- Need to raise professional awareness through training
- Lack of coordinated data on outcomes for victims once they have left temporary accommodation
5.1.5. Service Providers’ Perspectives (Domestic Violence)

Summary of Interviews with Service Managers and Practitioners

In this section a detailed summary of service manager and practitioner interviews is provided. Table 9 below details the number of interviews undertaken in each of the partner countries.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number of Interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9 Interviews for Domestic Violence (Service Providers)

Specific consideration is given to how community-based services for victims of domestic violence are organised and delivered and the challenges faced in managing those services in appropriate and sensitive ways. Examples are offered from each of the partner countries. The perspectives explored need to be understood in relation to the service delivery models previously examined (see Section 5.1.3.).

Interviews were conducted with managers and practitioners working in a range of different settings. These included:

- Emergency accommodation
- Resettlement work
- Advice and information
- Counselling and trauma therapy
- Local children’s centres
- Schools and youth groups

Germany: Service Providers - Summary of Interviews (Domestic Violence)

Human Rights

The commitment to the promotion of human rights espoused at a national level could be clearly identified through the work carried out in community-based provision. Those involved in the management and delivery of services recognised the importance of developing different forms of work that both respond to victims’ needs and widen knowledge and awareness through educational initiatives. Developing an increased level of political understanding at the local level was also seen to be an important factor in the development of responsive services that positively promote human rights.

Organisation of Services

In common with the experiences of other partner countries, community-based services are offered by a range of organisations. The growing number of migrants and refugees accessing services has significantly increased in recent times. Importance is attached to providing a good level of appropriate legal support for victims. This is particularly important as legal processes can take a long time to complete in Germany.
Service Providers’ Perspectives (Domestic Violence)

Domestic violence work is seen to involve a number of stages. These range from the provision of safe accommodation, through to counselling and trauma support, development of life and financial skills and the provision of appropriate ‘move on’ accommodation and other life choices.

Factors Influencing Service Delivery

It proved possible to gain, through the interviews carried out, an understanding of the factors that are currently shaping the development, delivery and practice focus of services at a community level. These include:

- The need to recognise the desire of victims of violence to feel safe and appropriately supported
- Ongoing availability of secure financial support to consolidate and further develop community-based services
- The importance of the development of a good level of cooperation between all agencies involved in the delivery of services at a community level
- Recognition of the fact that the needs of service users are multifaceted and must be responded to accordingly
- The need for the police to recognise the important role they play in supporting victims of domestic violence – more proactive use of the law to restrict access by perpetrators is required
- Challenging the stigmatization/stereotyping of victims of domestic violence and their family members

Challenges

Through the interviews a number of specific challenges were outlined in relation to the development of service management and practice. These include:

- Perceived lack of competence in Youth Welfare Services to support children and young people who are the victims of domestic violence effectively
- Lack of cooperation between universities and practitioners in developing practice based on research findings
- The need to develop appropriate data recording systems to facilitate a more accurate understanding of the levels of domestic violence in communities
- Lack of training in, and between, agencies in gender sensitivity, trauma sensitivity and cultural issues and perspectives
- Responding to the increased numbers of migrants and refugees who are experiencing domestic abuse
Human Rights

Provision for victims of domestic violence is not well developed in Romania. This fact is reinforced by the low level of support provided in Sibiu County. Current legislation offers only limited assistance for victims and in doing so gives only minimal protection and choice in terms of the promotion of human rights. The priority given to this area of work reflects the current political problems being experienced within the country.

Organisation of Services

The limited services available to victims of domestic violence are organised through both the public and private sectors. A private shelter, run by the Pentecostal church and funded through private funds from Germany, offers a variety of support services. These include: legal services, social support, counselling and medical services. A public shelter, run by the local authority, offers support for up to 60 days (can be subsequently reviewed). Medical support, psychological and counselling services are also provided by the GDASPC, but the extent and nature of the provision is limited. Complex bureaucratic systems exist that appear to restrict easy access to such resources.

Major difficulties exist for women and children living in rural communities to access community-based services. There is also a significant level of cultural resistance, both in families and communities, to accept the prevalence and impact of domestic violence on the lives of women and their children.

Factors Influencing Service Delivery

It proved possible to gain, through the interviews carried out, an understanding of the factors that are currently shaping the development, delivery and practice focus of services at a community level. These include:

- The limited availability of community-based services (especially in rural areas) that offer a good level of emergency and ongoing support to women and their children;
- Inability to secure the necessary financial support (by both public and private providers) to develop an effective support system;
- The need for the police to take a more proactive role in supporting the victims of domestic violence;
- The fact that victims can only use public services once;
- An acknowledgement of the importance of preventative work – now being reflected through the development of programmes within schools;
- The existence of high levels of frustration and feelings of risk experienced by those involved in domestic violence work.
Challenges

Through the interviews a number of specific challenges were outlined in relation to the development of service management and practice. These include:

- Increasing awareness of the nature and impact of domestic violence and the fact that women have very limited prospects if they leave the family home
- The fact that women have to ‘prove’ abuse (through a fee-based certification process) before they can gain access to support services
- The limitations of current legislation in providing appropriate and ongoing support to women and their children
- The need to create, at the local level, a specific department to assist in the development of policy and good practice in the area of domestic violence;
- The collection of appropriate and common statistical data to assist in gauging the extent of domestic violence within communities
- The need to clearly define the nature of domestic violence by service managers, practitioners, policy makers and politicians

UK: Service Providers - Summary of Interviews (Domestic Violence)

Human Rights

All of the service managers and practitioners interviewed saw the protection and promotion of the human rights of vulnerable women and their children as being of paramount importance. It was also argued that it can be difficult to develop a human rights perspective with women who have been the victims of physical and psychological trauma; they have great difficulty in asserting their rights. Individuals and groups often feel disempowered and can lack the knowledge, and sometimes understanding and skills, to gain access and effectively use different services. This makes work at the local community level that much more important.

Organisation of Services

Services are provided through a network of community-based organisations. Those interviewed stressed the importance of offering services that are non-judgmental and easily accessible. Many organisations offer a range of services. Managers and practitioners pointed to the fact that it is unhelpful to over-compartmentalise resources and responses, as individual and family needs can quickly change. However, all those interviewed maintained that the primary objective of a service must be to make service users feel safe and respected. The importance of maintaining a high level of confidentiality was consistently stressed.
Factors Influencing Service Delivery

It proved possible to gain, through the interviews carried out, an understanding of the factors that are currently shaping the development, delivery and practice focus of services at a community level. These include:

- The importance of offering a high level of legal support to victims of domestic abuse
- The requirement to build responsive services that adopt interdisciplinary approaches in meeting the social, health, financial and educational needs of service users
- The necessity of developing preventative practice approaches to domestic violence for example through school based and youth work
- The ongoing difficulty of securing a sound level of financial support that will ensure the building of appropriate expertise and retention of staff – a particular problem for NGOs and Third sector organisations

Challenges

Through the interviews a number of specific challenges were outlined in relation to the development of effective service management and practice. These include:

- Responding to new issues and problems for example the impact of violence between young people in families
- Providing ongoing support for victims as they move through various legal processes
- Encouraging appropriate multiprofessional and multiagency responses and the development of work that reflects the ‘perspective of victims’
- The foregrounding of women’s rights as a key element of all work in this area;
- Securing ongoing political support for work
5.1.6. Service Users’ Perspectives (Domestic Violence)

Summary of Interviews with Service Users

In this section a detailed summary of service user interviews is provided. Table 10 below presents details of the number of interviews undertaken. The findings are divided under a number of headings that relate directly to the provision of community-based services. Differences in experience, where appropriate, are provided at the end of the section.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number of Interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10 Interviews for Domestic Violence (Service Users)

Services used by victims of domestic violence differ across the three partner countries and the scope of the provision on offer reflects local community need, expectations and resource availability. A common interview format was adopted in order to make meaningful comparison possible.

Triggers for Seeking Support/ Help

The range of factors causing victims of domestic violence to seek out community-based support varies. As the interview data reveals, individual victims seek out different forms of community-based support at different times. Support needs consistently identified included access to legal, health or social services, police protection and the provision of emergency accommodation - often for a woman and her child/ren. Many women interviewed pointed to the fact that leaving the family home to seek support often only happened after enduring long periods of domestic violence. Some women involved in the research could only contemplate leaving a perpetrator once they were older or the children had grown up.

The interview data established the existence of a number of triggers that can lead to a victim of domestic violence leaving their partner. These include:

- The act of rape within marriage
- Prolonged and systematically repeated acts of violent aggression
- Exposure of children to violence or other forms of physical or sexual abuse, and neglect
- Other family members condoning the actions of the perpetrator (including becoming involved in violence and abuse themselves)
- Victims starting to self-harm, over-reliance on medication (often anti-depressants), excessive use of drugs and alcohol
- Where strong cultural and/or religious ties exist and the intervention of external agencies is unwelcome
- Situations where individuals are geographically and socially isolated.
- Difficulties experienced by women who ‘married into a family’ only to find themselves in a relationship based on domestic servitude.
Voices of Victims

The nasty words, the jealousy, the evil . . . if I walked in the street and a man greeted me he started quarrelling with him... Only threatening words...

That night he beat me bad, he pushed me into the bathroom and ... raped me. I was at my Mother’s for a week and then, because of threats from his family and all of the stress I was having with him I went to the Women’s Shelter and stayed there for four and a half months.

He slapped me and the kids on the head, on our faces, with kicks in the back to the boy... I was really afraid he had spina bifida. He kept pee ing on him until he was 7 years ... since 2 years old he beat him...

Nobody supported me. Not my family, anybody. Nobody. Absolutely nobody. I was really afraid that he would come home and do the same things . . .

Access and Availability of Services

Issues concerning access and availability of services featured significantly in the interviews undertaken. Service users outlined their concerns in relation to such matters as:

- Geographical location – this proved to be a particular issue for women living in rural communities and also proved a problem for women with children who had to travel a distance
- Choice – some women wanted to use services based in the area where they lived, others wanted to access services in another location. Frequently the availability of community-based services can be limited
- Gaining information as to the range of services available, their location and cost (particularly important in situations where women have no recourse to public funds)

Many of the women interviewed pointed to the fact that it was difficult to make coherent decisions at a time of significant crisis. On such occasions the availability of temporary respite facilities can be important. It was also noted that when a trigger point occurs (see section above) the role and attitude of a police officer can be important in ensuring the immediate safety of the victim and her family. Older women are not generally seen as a priority.
Voices of Victims

They (the police) said they can’t do anything until something happens. They look at you over there [like] My God, her again. Sure, they instruct you that you should do it, you should press charges, so that the files fill up, so that they see that this person is dangerous, but you feel really stupid...

The injunction at the time [was helpful] that he had to stay away. . . . That happened quite quickly. I thought that was really good. It was very quick, the appointment, we got it (the injunction/restraining order) really quickly, I was satisfied that I was able to stay in my apartment with my son.

First time I went to my mother’s place. I went to her and through my boss from work, on the internet, he told me about the centre. I went to the address founded on the internet... I didn’t find anything there and I went to the police and from there to the Town Hall. And there I arrived to the office of Child Protection and from there they took me here.

The quality and length of assessment procedures employed by community-based organisations seems to vary considerably. In specific instances demands are placed on women to produce ‘evidence’ to support their application e.g. medical certification. Some of those interviewed pointed to the fact that this can be difficult especially when there is a need to seek urgent support. Many of the questions asked as part of an assessment process can be of a very personal nature and it needs to be recognised that training and a level of sensitivity is required by those involved in delivering services – this did not always occur.

Voices of Victims

There should have been houses, some shelters of the victims of the domestic violence... just that there aren’t any in our county ... I said I’m willing to go wherever they are... I can adapt anywhere...

I did not think that there is such a thing (shelter). I’ve heard on TV, but I thought it did not exist in our country. Perhaps I have gone faster. I have gone with my daughters...
Service Users’ Perspectives (Domestic Violence)

Personal Safety and Safety of Children

The issue of personal safety, and safety of children, dominated many of the interviews. In exploring the experiences of domestic violence endured by victims it became apparent that fear of death, or severe physical or mental trauma, significantly influenced decisions that were ultimately taken. The need to ensure that both they and their family members were safe placed pressure on individuals to:

- Secure access to local legal services that could provide high quality advice and appropriate restraints against perpetrators
- Find secure accommodation where access for the perpetrator was prohibited
- Have available finance to meet immediate needs e.g. food, clothing etc.
- Have available access to health care and social support for self and dependants

Voices of Victims

If I see his car in the rear-view mirror, I'm scared. If I see an email in my inbox, I'm scared. I'm always scared, I am, because he's always creeping around somewhere and watching me.

My son didn't suffer physically at all, thank God. But of course psychologically - he heard everything and all of it, all of it. I couldn't prepare [him] for this kind of situation . . . . . . it was as if from one day to the next Papa was gone. But the way I see it now is that it's good for us both.

Understanding Needs

The interview evidence gathered supports the view that victims of domestic violence have complex and multi-layered needs. In general, such needs can be listed under the headings provided below. However, it was acknowledged that community-based services need to be built on simple structures that offer the opportunity to access agencies/services/organisations (actual or through referral) with limited bureaucratic requirements.

- Immediate needs – access to information/options, space to assess situation and make rational decisions, someone to act as counsellor/advisor (e.g. social worker, health worker), immediate access to secure situation
- Long term needs – advocacy, legal representation, financial advice/public aid, social work support, support to develop new personal and family goals, appropriate accommodation to move on to

Many of the women interviewed reported a need to be supported in dealing with feelings of sadness, regret and ‘failure’. They also hoped that the removal of the fear of domestic violence would bring with opportunities to rebuild confidence, trust and establish new relationships.
Voices of Victims

First material benefits because we came only with the clothes we were wearing. In the meanwhile the clothes became smaller. The kids grew up very well here. What to say. Everything... from clothes to shoes... everything.... hygiene products, everything... social counselling. I was at a psychologist too. And to the doctor as well. I was and they paid.

I will never forget the time in the women’s’ shelter, it was a huge help, it taught me a lot, I would say it kind of opened my eyes. I can do things that I didn't know about before, for instance managing your [bank] account . . . And in general sort of dealing with people, conversations, phone calls . . . I became more self-confident in the women's' shelter. The children made progress there too, their fear went away.

I received support for my girl: food, clothing, everything ... the girl went to the kindergarten. When I was at work and I couldn’t go to bring her home, someone from the shelter brought her, a lady who had the same problems as I did. Here we help each other.

Characteristics of Good Quality Community-based Provision

Through the interviews it proved possible to identify a range of common characteristics that contribute towards providing high quality community-based provision. These included:

- Respect for the rights of the individuals involved
- Acceptance of the veracity of the circumstances described by victims of domestic violence
- Availability and access to information that is accurate, relevant and simply written
- Staff who are supportive, sympathetic and appropriately trained
- Speedy access (through referral mechanisms as appropriate) to health, social care, education and legal services
- Support to provide a degree of continuity in lives of dependent children e.g. continuation of their education
- Advice, counselling and a ‘listening ear’ as necessary
- Provision of emergency food, clothing, etc.
- Provision that is geographically appropriately situated and offers a high level of personal security
Voices of Victims

I was in great need to talk to someone and to be listen... the social counselling was very helpful. I feel safe here. Now I no longer fear him. Before I was very scared. Shaking all over, but now I know can not hurt me. Better than here I couldn’t found anywhere. I’ve never believed that there can be such conditions. I didn’t believe. We were poor people.

Both the material conditions and their way of life, of the people here... more calm, more mature, more understanding... since we came from hell, from the madhouse, from screams, yells and nasty words... they all talk very calmly...

The shelter house where we are now is Christian and I am Christian and I would not have gone elsewhere. Maybe I would have stayed there forever, until a tragedy happened ...

Everyone’s from different (Asian) cultures but everybody’s respected the same so they’re all appreciated ...
I’ve had more support here than I did at 2 other refuges ... it’s been above and beyond their call of duty.

Other Issues

A number of other issues were raised by women in relation to the provision of community-based services. These included:

- The fact that living in shared accommodation with other women can serve to generate a sense of solidarity. However, it is important to note that some women found the provision of shared accommodation difficult to deal with in terms of their privacy and space for children to play
- A view was expressed that sometimes victims of domestic violence can be viewed as a homogeneous group – this can lead to their individual needs and requirements not being understood
- There was recognition that community-based provision is often poorly resourced and funded. The profile of such work needs to be significantly raised
- Service user involvement in service design and development – not generally seen as important as pressure too great at time to become directly involved. However, a role was identified for voluntary sector and NGOs to lobby for improvements in the quality of services
Supporting a Victim of Domestic Violence

Scenario:

I am tired. I just returned from the police station. I had to fill out the forms to extend the restriction order against my ex-husband, again. He will never leave me alone. I wonder if the police think it is my fault?

Today, I am in the shelter of my home, having left the women’s shelter nine months ago. I want to move on with my life and the lives of my children. Sometimes I wish Margareta was here to support me as I decide what to do next. She was always there when I needed someone to talk to at the shelter. She knew when I was crying silently in my room. The children felt safe at the shelter, and they enjoyed going out with the other children. I could stay back and have time for myself. That was really helpful. Maybe I will call her.

He was at our back window again. I always know when he has been there. Yesterday, the children said he shows up at school sometimes. I should have known. He has complained to the child welfare department that he wants to see his children. I think he just wants to get to me. It isn’t about them. The woman at the welfare office says that a father has the right to see his children. I guess he went to anger management courses. What can I do?

If we have to go to court again, I hope we have the same judge as last time. She really put him in his place. He tried to lie to her and she did not believe him. That was good. The police told me to stay in touch with my attorney. I will make another appointment. She knows me. She knows the law.

Does anyone know him?

I guess there are men who say, ‘All right, then I'll stop it’, or who give up at some point. And, there are men like mine, who don’t quit. At some point you just have to hope.

Commentary:

The case study raises the importance of providing a range of support services to those who have experienced abuse in the home. It is also a reminder that some women and children have to live with ongoing threats beyond the outcome of legal interventions.

What kind of ongoing services are available to this woman and her children?

How can service providers build trust?

How can communities help keep her safe?

The woman that services are available and this provides a level of security. However, she needs to feel reassured that she and her children are no longer at risk, and that they are able to move on with their lives.

What additional resources are necessary to support victims of domestic violence to become more confident and independent? What examples of community support are available to them?

The material used in the case study is based on original interview material. Any names used are fictitious and the case details have been substantially changed.
Scenario:

It was after four years of marriage when I first requested help. Somebody else told me that I will find a number of the General Directorate and they can help me. I looked into the phone book, I rang there and I spoke with a social worker, who told me to come the next day with what I can take. This happened after I was beaten again by my husband. He was drinking and he didn't mind his business and he beat me after I was doing all the work: cooking, child caring, cleaning and all the other household chores.

The social worker did all the necessary papers and I was sent to the first Centre, a public centre. There, I benefited of food, clothes, shelter, social, psychological and juridical counselling. During that period I didn't have a job. I was only taking care of my little girl. I stayed for a couple of months and then I went back home, but contrary to all his promises I found the same old story: beatings, curses, jealousy. I ran away.... I called the social worker to see if she can help me again ... and she spoke with someone and then I went into a different centre, a centre run by a charity. Here I also received support for my girl. I felt safer in the public centre. When I stayed here (charity centre) he came here. He found out from someone. And he kicked up a row. The Police came.

There was another attempt at reconciliation while I was here, (the staff of the centre decided I should try again) but it didn't work out. During my stay I found a job and then got divorced. After the divorce he blamed my family and acted violent with my parents. Now he is in jail because of this.

I would advise the women who go through similar experiences, not to stay and go through what I have been through because life isn't worth it. Not to stay and be beaten. To leave in a T-shirt (she cries), in winter on cold weather and to give everything she has to the child, if it were to be as it was in my case. My daughter came to get under the table in the living room every time she heard scandals, the police or the ambulance coming to us. No child deserves to suffer like this.

I would also do something so that more people know about the existence of the Centres, there are women who don’t know about this existence, and the houses I’ve stayed in are hidden, they don’t know about them; at least to advertise the service where you can ask how to get further.

Commentary:

The case study raises some important issues about the nature of violence in a family with children.

Getting severely and repeatedly beaten in front of the child served as a trigger for seeking community-based support. Referral through acquaintances, friends, and colleagues is not unusual in such cases.

The woman responds positively to the interventions made by practitioners. They attempt to deal with her immediate need first i.e. personal safety. She was satisfied with all the support she received. The conceptualization of the issue evolves during her stay in both centres. After repeated failed attempts of reconciliation the women becomes aware that she has to divorce. This is, rather, a story with a positive end where the victim succeeds to reintegrate herself and her daughter into a in a different community.

The material used in the case study is based on original interview material. Any names used are fictitious and the case details have been substantially changed.
Domestic Violence

Supporting a Victim of Forced Marriage

Scenario:
I was studying at home in a small village in India and was not looking to get married. I came to England on a sponsored visit for cultural and religious purposes. This was arranged through relatives and my family were told that I would be looked after. After 6 months in England my visa expired and I was forced to marry my Husband. There was pressure on my family back home to agree to the marriage. My mother was a widow and we are a poor family and my in-laws said they would cover all the costs of the marriage and of taking care of me. I know this was a forced marriage because I did not agree to this but I was far away from home and I was very scared for me and for my family back home.
I was beaten and raped by my in-laws and by my uncle and made to work in my in-laws’ shop from 7am until midnight each day. I knew I had to get out but I did not know who to ask for help.
One of the customers of the shop became my friend and told me I could tell the police and social services. But I was scared of the police and the authorities because after I married, I found out that my husband was an illegal immigrant and I did not know how much trouble I would be in. I needed more time to get ready to leave.
The police came anyway and took me away and found me a place in project for domestic violence victims. Here, I get really good help from the Support Workers and I get to share a house with women from other backgrounds and religions. The project helps us all to understand our different cultures and to share the facilities we have – we haven’t got everything but the staff really try and do their best for us. We try and respect the different cultures of each other.
I have to rely on funding for my place here because I cannot get money to pay for myself because I am not a legal citizen. I want to stay in England and to learn English, to study and get a job but I have to wait and see if I will be allowed. By the time the police looked for evidence that I had been kept against my will, this was hard to find. I cannot go home because of the trouble there will be to me and my family if I am there.
All the time there are problems about who will pay for my stay at the refuge. The support I have had from the staff has been above and beyond the call of duty but there is only so much they can do and I need to be able to support myself.

Commentary:
This case study highlights difficulties with appropriate intervention. Initially, the victim is unsure how to get help and is aware that she will need to have a credible story for the police and the authorities. However, her removal before she has made the decision to ask for help means that she has not been able to prepare necessary evidence.
The case also demonstrates how an individual’s systematic and complex abuse presents a challenge about what we call it. Here, it is initially presented as Forced Marriage but it also has aspects of Human Trafficking and Domestic Servitude.
How does a perception of the abuse affect the services and support this victim can access?
With the issue of immigration status as a challenge, how can someone be supported who has no recourse to public funds?
How can persons arriving in an EU country know their rights or who to ask for help?
In what ways can services meet a wide range of diverse and cultural needs among service users?
What are the implications for a country of origin outside of the UK/EU?

The material used in the case study is based on original interview material.
Any names used are fictitious and the case details have been substantially changed.
5.2. Human Trafficking

Data on the issue of Human Trafficking was mainly collected by partners in Germany and the United Kingdom. In addition, some interview data with victims of human trafficking and details of legislation and policy was provided by Romania. A summary of the areas covered in this section of the report is provided below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>International Legislative Framework:</strong></td>
<td>5.2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Nations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Union</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>National/Regional Legislation and Policy:</strong></td>
<td>5.2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Service Delivery Approaches:</strong></td>
<td>5.2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Policy Makers’ Perspectives</strong></td>
<td>5.2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Service Managers and Practitioners’ Perspectives</strong></td>
<td>5.2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Service Users’ Perspectives</strong></td>
<td>5.2.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.2.1. International Legislative Framework (Human Trafficking)

Here, a brief overview is provided of the main legislative frameworks that shape policy and practice developments in Germany and the UK. The section is subdivided to reflect legislation at international, European and country levels. Specific focus is placed on the key aspects of human rights conventions that are pertinent.

**United Nations**

The promotion of human rights as it impacts on slavery, and more recently human trafficking, has featured significantly within international legislation. For example, the League of Nations passed the Convention to Suppress the Slave Trade and Slavery in 1926. It is only possible to offer here, key examples of human rights legislation that has influenced policy and practice developments at a European and national level. The section should be read in conjunction with the wider discussion on human rights provided in Section 3 above.

**United Nations – Key Examples**

- Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery, The Slave Trade, and The Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery (1956)
- International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (1990)
National/Regional Legislation & Policy (Human Trafficking)

- The European Community signed this declaration on December 4, 2006 (Treaty, EC, Article 62, 63, 66, 179 and 181a).
- United Nations Global Plan of Action to Combat Trafficking in Persons – 2010
  This directive attempts to develop further legislation and penalties, ensure successful prosecution, better protection and assistance to victims, and prevention of trafficking. The directive seeks to ensure that standards are comparable across the EU for the prosecution of traffickers and the protection of victims within criminal proceedings.

European Union

The work of the European Union in this area has been significant. Examples of legislative activity are provided below. Work of the European Union has been shaped, in part, by the United Nations.

European Union – Key Examples

- Commission Communication to the Council and the European Parliament on trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation (1966)
- Commission Communication to the Council and the European Parliament proposing further action in the fight against trafficking in women (1998)
- European Parliament establishes Daphne III programme to prevent and combat violence against children, young people and women and to protect victims and groups at risk (2007)
- Commission Decision setting up the Group of Experts on Trafficking in Human Beings (2007)
5.2.2. National/Regional Legislation & Policy (Human Trafficking)

GERMANY: Legislation & Policy

National Legislative Framework

Recent legislative development includes:

- **2002**: Prostitution & Human Trafficking Act Regulating the Legal Situation of Prostitutes. Prostitution is legalized in Germany. Relevant for this study includes the fact that the profession is subject to legal protection against coercion and exploitation (Section 180), living off immoral earnings and trafficking in human beings (Section 180b and 181). Sexual exploitation and incitement of a person less than eighteen years of age is punishable by up to three years imprisonment or a fine.

- **2002**: The German Criminal Code, Section 181a states that whoever exploits another person who engages in prostitution; or for a material benefit supervises another person’s engagement in prostitution, determines the place, time, extent or other circumstances of the engagement in prostitution, or takes measures to prevent the person from giving up prostitution, and in that regard maintains a relationship with the person which goes beyond a particular case is guilty of an offence. Prosecution: The perpetrator(s) shall be punished with imprisonment from six months to five years, or a fine.


- **2004**: Child Trafficking Law involves the protection and promotion of the rights of the child and contains several provisions on child protection against trafficking.

- **2009**: The German Criminal Code, Sections 232/3 focus on human trafficking through exploitation and coercion including forced stay in another country. In addition, the legislation covers recruiting, promoting, passing on, harbouring, or picking up another person

- **June 2009**: The German Criminal Code, Section 236 states that whoever in gross neglect of his duties of care and upbringing, leaves his child, ward, or foster child under 18 years of age with another indefinitely for compensation or with the intent of enriching himself or a third person. Prosecution: The perpetrator(s) shall be punished with imprisonment from six months to ten years, or a fine.

- Forced marriage is illegal. Revision of Section 240 paragraph 1 No. 1 n.F. German Criminal Code (StGB) October 27, 2010: New proposal to strengthen the law against forced marriage agreed to in German Parliament. (BR-Drs.704/10, vgl. also BT-Plenarprotokoll 17/67, S. 7102 ff.) Section 237 StGB.
Policy in Germany

National Level:

In response to a growth in human trafficking, the Federal Ministry for Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth has produced The Germany Action Plan II to Combat Violence Against Women. Since 2005, human trafficking for the purpose of labour exploitation is recognised as a criminal offence in its own right. The International Labour Office (ILO) found evidence of labour exploitation in 2006. The existing network of counselling centres or supportive service options available is the concern of the Ministry for Labour and Social Affairs but lacks coordination.

In 1997, the Ministry for Family Affairs founded the Federal-State-Working Group to Combat Human Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation and Forced Prostitution. Members include Federal Ministries, the Federal Criminal Police Office, representatives from the 16 States (Länder) and nongovernmental organisations. The committee has been able to improve services for victims of human trafficking through improving cooperation between police and counselling centres.

Regional and Local Level:

Berlin

Human Trafficking for the purpose of labour exploitation: Partners have formed an alliance connecting state and non-state organisations to develop a model for Germany. The State of Berlin has the Berlin Alliance against Human Trafficking for the Purpose of Labour Exploitation. Members include: The International Organisation for Migration (IOM), the German Trade Union of Berlin-Brandenburg, International Labour Organisation (ILO) and Ministry for Labour and Social Affairs.

Human Trafficking for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation and Forced Prostitution: There are two boards that address this in the State of Berlin:

- Berlin Advisory Commission for Human Trafficking of Women includes representatives of Interior Ministry, Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, criminal police, Integration commissioner, counselling and refuge centres, anti-violence projects, and attorneys. Their goal is to coordinate discussion among state and nongovernmental organisations.

- The Working Group to Combat Human Trafficking is composed of nongovernmental organisations. Their goals are to start and implement initiatives to combat human trafficking, assure that the organisations in Berlin are equipped with staff and equipment, and lobby for the rights of victims.
Bremen

Bremen has two working groups who are responsible for the implementation of German legislation and the goals of the Germany Action Plan II to Combat Violence Against Women:

- The Working Group to Combat Human Trafficking is composed of The Central Office to Promote Equal Opportunities for Women (ZGF), the Ministry for Employment, Women, Youth and Social Services, the Police, the Foreigners Registration Office, the Ministry of Justice and the Health Department. Their goal is to implement national legislation to improve the situation for victims of human trafficking and forced prostitution.
- The Bremen Protestant Church (Bremische Ev. Kirche) Working Group to Combat Human Trafficking is composed of the Protestant Church working group, the Bremen Police Department, the Innere Mission, the Social Service Department, the Ministry of Interior and Sport. Their goals are to organise and implement victim services.

Romania: Legislation & Policy

National Legislative Framework


Definition: Human trafficking involves recruiting, transporting, moving, giving lodging or receiving a person, by threat, violence, or other forms of coercion, by abduction, deceit or deception, abuse of authority or by taking advantage of the person’s inability to defend himself/herself or to express their will, or by offering, giving, accepting or receiving monetary or other gain in order to obtain the consent of the person who has authority over another person, for the purpose of subjecting this person to exploitation, and carries a penalty of 3 to 12 years imprisonment and the interdiction of some rights. The law defines also the exploitation of a person (art. 2, align. 2) and child pornography (art. 18, align. 1).

Other important legal national instruments in human trafficking: Law 211/2004 concerning measures to ensure protection to victims of crime, amended and supplemented by O.U.G. nr.113/2007; GD no. 1584/2005 concerning the establishment, organisation and operation of the National Agency against Trafficking in Persons, subsequently amended and supplemented; GD no. 1238/2007 to approve the specific National Standards for Specialised Assistance Services. The new Criminal Code of July 17 2009, chapter VII (Trafficking and exploitation of vulnerable persons) is aimed at establishing crimes, particularly against minors, in accordance with European and international regulation. Therefore, any acts committed against minors that can be severely harmful to their life, freedom, health, physical and mental integrity are criminalised.
Policy in Romania

National Level:

The National Strategy against Trafficking in Persons 2006-2010 was approved in 2006. The strategy is implemented through the National Action Plan 2008-2010 approved by GD no. 982/2008. These documents set the following main objectives:

- To improve knowledge of the size, characteristics and trends
- To raise the institutional response in the fight against human trafficking,
- To reduce the proportions of human trafficking by strengthening the capacity of self-protection of citizens and society
- Implementing a national system to facilitate the reintegration of victims
- Strengthening institutional mechanism to combat human trafficking
- Strengthening Romania's status as a reliable partner in the global effort to reduce human trafficking

Child Trafficking:

Law no. 272/2004 on the protection and promotion of the rights of the child contains a number of provisions on child protection against trafficking. Several government decisions have been made drawing the strategic lines of the policies to combat child trafficking. The National Action Plan to prevent and combat child trafficking was enacted by GD 1295/2004. This plan proposes the evaluation, analysis and research of child trafficking, the prevention, protection, rehabilitation and social reintegration of victims, to improve the legislative framework; and to develop institutional capacity. The plan to prevent and combat child sexual abuse and commercial exploitation covers the repatriation of unaccompanied minors.

Regional and Local:

There are no county strategies for preventing and combating trafficking in human beings. The issue of human trafficking is not addressed in the county welfare strategy.

The National Agency against Trafficking in Persons (NAATP) was changed from an independent national agency, with the authority to administer federal funding for anti-trafficking initiatives, to a subordinate agency of the General Inspectorate of Romanian Police. The purpose of the National Agency against Trafficking in Persons is to coordinate, evaluate and monitor, at the national level, the implementation of policies in the field of trafficking in persons by the public institutions, as well as those in the field of protection and assistance provided to its victims.

The Agency cooperates with governmental and non-governmental organisations within the country and abroad, as well as with inter-governmental organisations with the view of raising the public awareness of the phenomenon and its consequences. The NAATP has departments in the 15 regions of the country.
At the national level an important FREE HELP-LINE (0800 800 678) has existed since 2007 with the remit of:

- Providing information about trafficking in persons
- Providing identification and referral of victims of trafficking
- Contributing towards an impact assessment of prevention campaigns

In Romania, the General Inspectorate of the Romanian Police (IGRP) and the General Inspectorate of the Border Police (IGBP) are in charge of investigations, while the Prosecutor’s Office conducts prosecutions for criminal offences. In 2004, a network of Judges was created who specialise in hearing trafficking cases.

In Sibiu County there are no specialised institutions for human trafficking. A Regional Department (situated in Alba Iulia County) is responsible for monitoring the anti-trafficking activities performed in the area of Sibiu County and two other neighbouring counties areas. The main functions of the Regional Department are to:

- Assess the impact at a local level
- Report on emerging trends
- Monitor the local implementation of provisions pursuant to National Plan Against Trafficking in Persons
- Identify difficulties and make recommendations as to the improvement of the national identification and referral mechanism
- Facilitate communication between local and regional structures engaged in combating human trafficking
- Support anti-trafficking initiatives at local level
- Notify competent authorities in order to resolve matters that victims are facing in the process of gaining assistance or reintegration
National Legislative Framework

A background to UK Human Trafficking legislation includes:

- The Nationality, Immigration and Asylum Act 2002: Made the trafficking of people for prostitution illegal (Section 145)
- The Proceeds of Crime Act 2002: Enabled the criminal assets of traffickers to be confiscated
- The Sexual Offences Act 2003: Introduced legislation making all forms of sexual exploitation illegal – including trafficking into, out of and within the UK (Sections 57–59) Cases of sex trafficking in England and Wales are dealt with under this Act.
- The Asylum and Immigration (Treatment of Claimants) Act 2004: Extended definitions of illegal offences of human trafficking, including forced labour and human organ transplants (Section 4)
- The Gangmasters Licensing Act 2004: Established the Gangmasters Licensing Authority and deals with forced labour
- The Nationality, Immigration and Asylum Act 2006: Brought in civil penalties and criminal sentencing for employers who employ illegal migrants
- The Coroners and Justice Act 2009 has, since 1st April 2010, made it a criminal offence for individuals to force others into forced labour, particularly highlighting aspects of slavery and servitude.

Policy in UK

National Level:

The UN Convention Against Transnational Organised Crime (2000) was signed by the United Kingdom Government in 2000 and ratified in 2006. The European Convention on Human Trafficking (2005) was signed by the UK in 2007, ratified in 2008 and entered into force on 1 April 2009. The UK Action Plan on Tackling Human Trafficking (October, 2009) updated the earlier plans of 2007 and 2008 in setting out the Government’s strategy to tackle human trafficking. Produced by the Home Office and the Scottish Office, the Action Plan introduced measures to protect victims of human trafficking. The National Referral Mechanism was introduced in 2009, creating a minimum 45-day reflection and recovery period for victims of human trafficking, during which time the legitimacy of the cases are considered.

The protection of victims and witnesses is a prevalent issue in recent UK policy. The UK Human Trafficking Centre (UKHTC) was created with responsibility for ensuring the UK’s adherence to obligations under the European Convention on Human Trafficking. The UKHTC focuses on: prevention; prosecution and enforcement; protection and provides a victim centred approach. UKHTC is now part of the national Serious Organised Crimes Agency, and working with a range of agencies including NGOs and also monitoring the National Referral Mechanism.
In 2010, the Crown Prosecution Service conducted a public consultation exercise about its Public Policy Statement on Prosecuting Cases of Human Trafficking. This policy maintains that trafficking has three constitutional elements: The Act, The Means and The Purpose. The types of exploitation identified of human trafficking are:

- Sexual
- Forced labour
- Domestic Servitude
- Enabling others to acquire benefit
- Organ harvesting
- Children

A UK-based Anti-Trafficking Monitoring Group monitors the obligations of the UK under the European Convention against Trafficking. This Group, comprised of nine NGOs, including human rights charities, has argued that recent anti-trafficking measures are 'not fit for purpose' and that the Government is breaching its obligations under the Council of Europe Convention.

The new UK Coalition Government (2010) has declined to sign a Directive on Trafficking in Human Beings – tabled by the European Commission on 29 March 2010 and intended to replace current EU legislation dating from 2002. This directive attempts to develop further legislation and penalties, ensure successful prosecution, better protection of, and assistance to, victims, and prevention of trafficking. The directive seeks to ensure that standards are comparable across the EU for the prosecution of traffickers and the protection of victims within criminal proceedings.

**Regional and Local:**

The UK’s Human Trafficking Centre brings a national role to a local context through working in partnership with local services, including police, social services and third sector organisations. Work is focused on victim care, prevention, research and education, learning and development and operations and intelligence.

This necessitates a need for developing regional and local policy in individual and multi-agency contexts. However, as human trafficking is still emerging as being evident in local communities and because of the nature and ever-changing manifestations of human trafficking, policy development is at an early stage in local organisations and agencies. The roles of community-based services and voluntary organisations are critical in responding to crisis situations of victims but there remains a need to develop awareness, training and services, particularly in respect of the National Referral Mechanism.
The National Referral Mechanism (NRM) enables front line professionals at a local community level to legitimately refer to a 'Competent Authority', individuals who they think may be victims of human trafficking. Adult victims must give their consent to this process by signing a referral form. An initial referrer is known as the 'First Responder’ and is likely to come from recognised organisations including local authorities, law enforcement and NGOs. The NRM requires the 'Competent Authority', i.e. the UK Human Trafficking Centre to lead the victim assessment process through working in partnership with other organisations. (The UK Border Agency also has a Competent Authority role where trafficking forms part of asylum and immigration cases.)

The National Referral Mechanism grants a recovery and reflection period of 45 days during which the case is investigated and assessed with a view to making a Conclusive Grounds (CG) Decision, but Poppy Project national case workers often apply for extensions to 90 days due to the level and nature of support necessary for victims to consider their options, including participation in investigations by law enforcement agencies. EU and non-EU immigration status is a key area in determining basic options, particularly in considering whether individuals have any choice about staying in the UK. The human rights of vulnerable persons is also a key area and some victims have been granted leave to remain on grounds of mental health, risks in country of origin, essential witnesses in criminal proceedings etc.

Two peer professional support organisations have emerged in response to the need for local service managers and practitioners to become more aware of the emerging issues of human trafficking in the local region:

1. The West Midlands Anti Trafficking Network has expanded to include members from a wide range of community-based services and serves to highlight the need for formal policy and service development at a local level. This organisation provides a context for discussion on:
   - Law enforcement – police, courts and UK Border Agency
   - Health issues – access to healthcare for victims
   - Conditions for local Sex Workers – safety and choice
   - Migration and Immigration policy – rights of, and opportunities for individuals
   - Availability of services – lack of safe accommodation for victims locally
   - Forced labour – lack of services to support

2. The West Midlands Regional Anti Trafficking Group was formed to explore local issues of child exploitation and has brought together representatives from public and voluntary services working with children and young people. This group has focused on the need to develop better children’s safeguarding policies and services in relation to Human Trafficking, particularly highlighting internal/domestic trafficking of children and young people.
## LEGISLATION & POLICY

| Forms of Human Trafficking | Data reveals the complex nature of human trafficking in the partner countries. Sexual exploitation and forced labour continues to increase. The issue of domestic servitude was cited as an emerging issue. Attention needs to be given to the extent and impact of internal trafficking. |
| Context of Human Rights | The importance of promoting human rights is clearly evident at European, national and local levels. The complexity of cases hinders the securing of human rights. The UK has still to resolve its position with regard to European legislation. |
| National Legislation | All partner countries have used specific and related legislation to provide an appropriate framework for prosecution of offenders. Such legislation also pays attention to the need to provide effective support to victims. |
| Strategy / National Action Plans | It is evident that attempts are being made to coordinate policy through national action plans. The plans place particular emphasis on the need for multiprofessional and multiagency responses. The resources available to support national action plans vary considerably. |
| Local and County Level | Whilst attempts are being made to coordinate work at the local level, the nature of the problem requires the development of community-based services that are proactively responsive. Romania is experiencing difficulties in relation to the development of policy at the local level. |
| Forms of Human Trafficking | Data reveals the complex nature of human trafficking in the partner countries. Sexual exploitation and forced labour continues to increase. The issue of domestic servitude was cited as an emerging issue. Attention needs to be given to the extent and impact of internal trafficking. |
5.2.3. Service Delivery: Approaches (Human Trafficking)

This section explores the approaches to service delivery in the three partner countries. Specific consideration is given to the range of services and approaches adopted. Examples are provided of community-based approaches to service delivery.

Approaches to Service Delivery in Germany: Berlin/Bremen/Lower Saxony

Contextual background

In 1997, the Federal Ministry for Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth coordinated a national committee to address human trafficking of women for sexual exploitation. This committee has been able to improve community-based services for victims of human trafficking. Improved cooperation between police and counselling centres to protect victims has been a primary focus in all 16 German states.

A commitment to the protection of victims defines the German strategy. There is ongoing training for the various service providers, a clearly defined legal basis to combat human trafficking, and the development of specialised counselling centres. The German government promotes a nationwide networking of services through the umbrella NGO organisation KOK in Berlin, a nationwide group combating trafficking in women and violence against women in the process of migration. This connects over 35 organisations and institutions to help lobby for policy and services nationally and internationally, and provides referrals to those in need throughout Germany.

Nature of services

To address the complexity of human trafficking, service responsibilities are found in the German criminal justice system, social services, health care systems, legal counselling organisations, and cooperation with international partners. The range of services includes prevention and intervention, prosecution of perpetrators, and rescue, rehabilitation and reintegration of victims. The delivery of services is largely organised through community-based resources.

Examples of community-based services

Along with the services offered by the KOK in Berlin, there is the Women’s Shelters Coordination Association and the Women’s Counselling Agencies & Women’s Hotlines who together, offer counselling and shelter victims. Other national resources include SOLWODI with 13 counselling centres in Germany and TERRE DES FEMMES, a non-profit human rights organisation based in Germany that supports girls and women through raising public awareness, international networking, campaigning, individual personal assistance and the promotion of self-help projects. The organisation has 2 offices (in Tübingen and Berlin) and 28 active volunteer groups in Germany.
Service Delivery: Approaches (Human Trafficking)

Berlin

**KOK, Berlin: Bundesweiter Koordinierungskreis gegen Frauenhandel und Gewalt an Frauen im Migrationsprozess e.V.**
KOK is a nonprofit organisation and a central organising body that brings together political and social resources to address human trafficking. KOK offers professional and public awareness campaigns and training, lobbies for legislation to enhance the human rights of victims, coordinates protection and psychosocial services for victims across 16 German federal states, and cooperates at international levels.

**Ban Ying e.V. Coordination Centre:**
This centre offers counselling and advocacy for trafficked victims and for domestic servants in diplomats’ homes. The services include social and legal counselling for women from Thailand and the Philippines.

**Terre Des Femmes:**
The counselling centre supports girls and women who have experienced violence such as forced marriage, domestic violence, human trafficking, and genital mutilation. Services include: nationwide telephone and email counselling, advocacy with community agencies and support to find safe shelter.

Bremen

**Verein für Innere Mission in Bremen: Beratungsstelle für Opfer von Menschenhandel und Zwangsprostitution (BBMeZ):**
In the 1990s, the Innere Mission took the lead in Bremen to initiate programmes to address human trafficking. The Mission provides advocacy and ongoing engagement to provide a low threshold approach to help women who have been trafficked.

Lower Saxony

**KOBRA: Zentrale Koordinations- und Beratungsstelle für Opfer von Menschenhandel**
Since 1997, KOBRA has been working with victims of human trafficking with funding and support from the State of Lower Saxony. They specialise in trauma counselling in clients’ languages and offer specialised trauma-training to professionals. KOBRA also works with young women threatened by forced marriage. There is a telephone crisis line and referrals are made to protection agencies and organisations. KOBRA also works with victims of forced labour services, offers protection and counselling resources and works to raise public awareness.

**SOLWODI Deutschland e.V.: (Solidarity With Women In Distress)**
SOLWODI works with other organisations in Africa, Asia, Latin America and East Europe to combat abuse and exploitation of women. A women’s initiative, they raise professional and public awareness and try to meet the needs of women and children who are victims of human trafficking through activities and publications worldwide, including founding SOLWODI Romania to provide safety and support to women and children who are being exploited in Romania.
Approaches to Service Delivery in Romania: Sibiu

At Sibiu County level there are a number of institutions with a mandate to prevent, control and intervene in situations of human trafficking. These include:

- County Employment Agency
- Department of Public Health
- County School Inspectorate
- The Territorial Authority for Public Order
- County Police Inspectorate
- General Department for Social Assistance and Child Protection
- General Department of Organised Crime
- Social Assistance Public Department
- Courts and Probation Service
- NGOs.

The National Strategy provides for the protection, assistance and social reintegration of the victims of human trafficking at a local level, with two forms of service:

1. Emergency residential services (shelters) to provide:
   - Provisional housing, accommodation and food for victims
   - Psychological interventions in crisis situations
   - Medical examination
   - Physical protection
   - Information regarding the rights of victims and witnesses
   - Contact with family members

2. Community focused support:
   When it is unnecessary for victims of trafficking to be admitted to a shelter, support services can be provided at her/his home, or the victim can go directly to a local service provider. From 2011, there will be a special department for interventions in situations of abuse, neglect, trafficking, migration and repatriation.

Joint project (Romania – UK)

In 2007, the Romanian National Agency against Trafficking in Persons, in partnership with United Kingdom Human Trafficking Centre and International Organisation for Migration developed an Information Campaign for Preventing Trafficking in Persons into the UK. The project has disseminated information for preventing trafficking into the UK by improving the Help Line administered by the Romanian National Agency and improved collaboration opportunities. A Help Line was developed offering legal information to those who wish to travel/immigrate into the UK. The project was supported by a substantial media campaign. Anticipated outcomes include:

- Reduction in the number of trafficked persons from Romania
- Significant improvement in the quality of information for potential victims
- Increase in the law enforcement capacity and expertise of both countries through an improved collaboration
- Greater public awareness about the dangers of trafficking and an increased level of information about trafficking activities
Approaches to Service Delivery in UK: Birmingham

Contextual background

The main service responsibilities for supporting victims of Human Trafficking are located through:
- UK Human Trafficking Centre: Strategic Level
- Criminal Justice agencies / UK HTC Law Enforcement
- National Referral Mechanism (NRM)
- Government funding for safe accommodation
- Community-based and voluntary services

Nature of services

Strategic Level
The UK’s Human Trafficking Centre provides multi-agency support for organisations working with individuals who are victims of transnational and domestic human trafficking.

Law Enforcement
The need to support victims and witnesses of Human Trafficking has been recognised at a local law enforcement level and is prominent in the work of:
- West Midlands Police’s Public Protection Unit
- The Serious Organised Crime Agency (Vulnerable Persons Unit)
- Crown Prosecution Service

National Referral Mechanism
Through the NRM, initial assessments are sought within 5 days to assess whether there are thought to be ‘reasonable grounds’ to believe that a person is a potential victim of human trafficking.

Government funding for safe accommodation
Recognised victims can be referred to ‘safe house’ accommodation, mainly to the Poppy Project that provides accommodation and support to women who have been trafficked into prostitution or domestic servitude. Although a national service with 54 bed spaces, the facilities are mainly in London and as of 2010, there was currently no accommodation located in Birmingham or the West Midlands region.

Community-based and voluntary services
Awareness of the changing nature and manifestations of Human Trafficking in local communities requires good local intelligence and awareness of the signs of trafficking. These factors require police and community organisations to work collaboratively. A range of projects are being developed at a community level in order to improve support for victims. Examples of such projects are offered below.
Examples of community-based services

The SAFE Project
Through a community health model, the SAFE Project supports women involved in the commercial sex industry in both indoor premises and street-based environments. The focus is on promoting health, well-being and personal choices, whilst seeking to reduce harm and risk. Services include:

- Listening and support
- Free telephone Helpline
- Safe, accessible refuge accommodation
- Support for women and children affected by domestic violence
- One-to-one and group support for victims of violence and exploitation
- Family Support Project for women and children

Children’s Society: Safe in the City
This project initially focused on looked after children and young people who had run away from children’s care homes. Recent developments include:

- Support for those who have run away from a family home
- Young people involved in Internal or Domestic Human Trafficking
- Young people at risk of sexual exploitation
- Development of informal educational support for young people

Hope Housing Project
A consortium of local agencies and organisations developed Hope Housing in 2007, to offer support homeless and destitute asylum seekers emergency short-term accommodation. The main aspects of the service include:

- Partnership and referral work with key local agencies: ASIRT (Asylum Support and Immigration Resource Team), Birmingham Law Centre, the Children's Society, Lifeline Options, the British Red Cross (West Midlands), the Refugee and Migrant Centre, Wolverhampton, Restore (Birmingham Churches Together for Asylum-Seekers and Refugees), and the Karis Neighbour Scheme, Birmingham.
- Access to several single-sex houses which have been made available at low rents to the Project
- Support for individuals with no recourse to public funds
- Working with referring agencies towards more permanent solutions
Examples of community-focused initiatives with a Birmingham impact have been gathered through this research project. These have been aligned with UKHTC’s 5 main national work streams to demonstrate the application of national services at a local level.

**Victim Care:**
Community-based health professionals in Birmingham working with female sex workers liaised with UKHTC to support 3 young women who had been charged with criminal offences including controlling prostitution, to be seen as victims of transnational human trafficking within the EU.

**Prevention:**
In addition to prevention and awareness campaigns in Romania and Bulgaria about transnational human trafficking, UKHTC has responded to issues of domestic trafficking of young people within UK. 2010 has seen the national release and promotion of ‘My Dangerous Loverboy’, a short film aimed at raising awareness amongst young people, with supporting materials for education and social work professionals. A local conference in Birmingham has brought this to the attention of senior managers of local services.

**Research and Education:**
The UKHTC undertakes research and works with a range of research organisations and has supported the work of this EC-funded research with Birmingham-based Newman University College, contributing to research aspects of policy, service, statistics and case study examples.

**Learning and Development:**
Through engaging with partnerships at a local level, UKHTC are able to develop understanding of the multi-faceted issues and experiences of human trafficking and help local service managers and practitioners to understand the nature, complexities and intervention opportunities of human trafficking. This has been particularly important for the peer professional West Midlands Anti Trafficking Network who held an awareness raising workshop at Newman University College in 2010. The Network has also raised the issue of lack of safe accommodation in Birmingham for both male and female victims of human trafficking.

**Operations and Intelligence:**
UKHTC is part of the Serious Organised Crime Agency, an executive non-departmental public body of the Government’s Home Office. A multi-agency forum that looks at improving good practice is the basis of the Operations and Intelligence working group. West Midlands Police work with local organisations to gather intelligence about the nature and patterns of human trafficking in Birmingham.
## Similarities & Differences in Service Delivery Approaches

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SERVICES</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Development strategies for services at regional level</strong></td>
<td>There is clear evidence available to support the view that a good level of regional policy development is essential in the generation of effective services. In Germany and the UK a clear connection can be made between the development of policy and the encouragement of institutional/agency collaboration. Strategy is less well developed in Romania. The value of transnational cooperation (in this case between Romania and UK) is demonstrated through the Information Campaign for Preventing Trafficking in Persons into the UK.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The network of services and the collaboration between them</strong></td>
<td>The creation of an appropriate legislative framework has been highly influential in supporting the development of a range of community-based services. The themes of ‘detection’, ‘prevention’ and ‘support’ for victims, reflected through legislation, have served to establish innovative responses to service delivery.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The number and variety of public services</strong></td>
<td>A wide variety of community-based services exist within Germany and the UK. The situation is different in Romania where service provision is limited – largely due to the lack of resources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Beneficiaries of services</strong></td>
<td>A clear emphasis is placed on supporting women who are victims of human trafficking. It appears from the research data available that a lower level of support is available to those engaged in unlawful working practices and domestic servitude.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Approach possible to delivery of public services</strong></td>
<td>Services have to respond to a variety of needs – legal, social, health-related, etc. The vulnerability of the victims makes open access to services more difficult to achieve. It is important that service providers ensure a high level of personal safety and confidentiality for service users.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.2.4. Policy Makers’ Perspectives (Human Trafficking)

Summary of Interviews with Policy Makers

In this section a summary of the data derived from interviews with policy makers is provided. Table 11 below presents details of the number of interviews undertaken. The findings are divided under a number of headings that relate directly to the provision of community-based services and the policy perspectives that inform their development.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number of Interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11 Interviews for Human Trafficking (Policy Makers)

Germany: Policy Makers - Summary of Interviews (Human Trafficking)

Human Rights

Work in the area of human trafficking is seen to be reflective of a wider German commitment to the promotion of human rights. However, it is argued that the development of human rights requires a significant level of political activity by those involved in promoting community-based services. Interview data points to the fact that NGOs play a vital role in advocating for the human rights of women who are the victims of human trafficking. It also supports the view that victims of human trafficking are severely marginalised within society and as such are largely unaware of, or reluctant to assert, their rights at any level i.e. individually or collectively.

It was acknowledged that human trafficking is largely a ‘spot check’ offence, or one that frequently surfaces following ‘raids’. It was also argued that there are too few police officers trained to work in this area. As a result, emphasis is frequently placed on prosecution of perpetrators, rather than the protection and promotion of the rights of victims.

Policy Focus

It proved possible to identify a number of specific strands of activity influencing policy development and practice both nationally and locally within Germany. These include the fact that:

- Much of the work in this area is undertaken by NGOs who, for the most part, are poorly financed and have to be highly selective when it comes to deciding on policy priorities
- It is recognised that policy must be proactively developed if it is to be responsive to the changing dynamics of human trafficking
- Policy continues to be influenced through research emphasising the importance of developing responsive community-based services
- There is a need to increase the level and range of advocacy services in order to offer more effective support to victims of human trafficking
Some of the policy makers interviewed questioned the effectiveness of policy approaches that emphasise the placing of victims of human trafficking in women’s shelters – this was variously viewed as insensitive, inappropriate and adding to the risks that some women faced.

More punitive legal powers are required if individuals are to be discouraged from engaging in human trafficking.

Current Challenges

The interview data reveals a number of major challenges facing policy makers. Key issues explored are summarised below:

- There needs to be a significant level of interagency and interprofessional cooperation if community-based services are to be improved.
- Policies need to be pursued at a community level that positively assist victims of human trafficking to seek appropriate legal support.
- There is still a great deal of work required to raise awareness of the scope and nature of human trafficking, including: the high profits available, difficulty in proving cases and the challenges faced in accessing victims.
- The failure, within current policy, to recognise that women require financial support, other than that provided through the asylum seeker benefit law, to obtain therapy and access resources – it was argued that uniform financial arrangements should exist for all women across EU countries.
- There needs to be an increase in specialist services, including criminal and psychosocial services.

United Kingdom: Policy Makers- Summary of Interviews (Human Trafficking)

Human Rights

It emerged from the interviews that human rights policy, as it impacts on children and young people, is largely centred around the Children Act (1989) and Children Act (2004). This assists in providing an appropriate legislative framework for promoting the rights and needs of the young in human trafficking cases.

As in Germany, a great deal of work in this area is undertaken through national and local NGOs, charities and ‘third sector’ organisations. A number of the organisations involved in the research reported on the major role they play in shaping policy through ‘Anti-trafficking groups’. The UK Human Trafficking Centre (UKHTC) has provided an important focus in establishing a multi-agency approach.

The work of ECPAT UK is worthy of specific note in terms of the promotion of human rights. Using the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) they have pursued a three year strategy, in collaboration with other national charities, aimed at ensuring that the UK government implements the Palermo Protocol.
Policy Makers - Summary of Interviews (Human Trafficking)

Policy Focus

It proved possible to identify a number of specific strands of activity influencing policy development and service delivery both nationally and locally within the UK. These include the fact that:

- It was recognised by key national agencies (particularly the UKHTC) that the development of effective policy requires a significant level of national coordination
- There remains a tension in policy terms between the need to prosecute offenders and support the victims of human trafficking
- There remains a major difficulty in terms of gaining convictions for human trafficking and/or domestic servitude
- National organisations, such as the NSPCC, are generating research in order to influence policy development
- Organisations, such as the SAFE project in Birmingham, are working with local government officers and elected councillors to assess the impact of policy and service development

Current Challenges

The interview data reveals a substantial number of major challenges facing policy makers. Key issues explored are summarised below:

- The securing of sufficient financial resources to enable the ongoing growth and development of community-based services for victims of human trafficking
- The creation and distribution of resources, via the development of appropriate policies, to facilitate awareness raising and training at national and local levels
- The development of appropriate policy making mechanisms at the local level to coordinate practice, training and research
- The development of legal and advocacy support services that meet the diverse needs of victims of human trafficking – it is recognised that many of the cases are extremely complex and time consuming
- The appropriateness of the National Referral Mechanism as a means of dealing with cases that involve children
- How offences such as rape are dealt with in cases of human trafficking
5.2.5. Service Providers’ Perspectives (Human Trafficking)

Summary of Interviews with Service Managers and Practitioners

In this section a detailed summary of service manager and practitioner interviews is provided. Table 12 below details the number of interviews undertaken in each of the partner countries.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number of Interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 12 Interviews for Human Trafficking (Service Providers)

Those interviewed are involved in managing and delivering services at a community level. Many experience, on a daily basis, common challenges and a high level of personal and collective risk and uncertainty. The range of work undertaken reflects the diverse needs of service users and includes:

- Counselling and psychological trauma support
- Legal assistance
- The provision of safe/emergency accommodation
- Interpreting and translating
- Encouragement of interagency cooperation
- Confidence building
- Awareness raising
- Advice and information

Germany: Service Providers - Summary of Interviews (Human Trafficking)

Human Rights

Exploration of the interview data reveal a range of tensions and challenges that confront those working with victims of human trafficking. Prejudice and racism (overt and covert) influence public, political and professional perceptions concerning what constitutes fair and appropriate treatment. It is also recognised that the legal status of many of the women and children increases their personal and collective vulnerability. This has a direct impact on their ability to secure their rights and entitlements.

It was specifically argued that the criminal climate that promotes and perpetuates human trafficking, effectively ‘seals off’ victims from access to support services. Criminal structures are complex and often extend back to a country of origin. Family members can be intimidated and as one interviewee reported ‘women are brought here to engage in prostitution by force... offenders collaborate in mafia-like structures’.
Service Providers - Summary of Interviews (Human Trafficking)

Organisation of services

Services for victims of human trafficking are generally located within local community settings. The development of a network of local counselling centres has been highly influential in meeting the complex needs of service users. Part of the motivation in developing service provision in this way, reflects the fact that victims of human trafficking are often deeply traumatised by their experiences. They are seen to need support that is sensitive, tailored to meet individual need and relevant to their particular circumstances. It was specifically argued that a well developed, and accessible, interpreting and translation service has to be made available to support victims of human trafficking.

Evidence also emerged through the interview process, to suggest that the level and quality of the liaison between community-based services and the police is growing. This reflects the fact that successful prosecutions are often reliant on appropriate social and physiological support. Emphasis was also placed on the need to provide support mechanisms, at the level of the community, that help to ‘stabilise’ the individual and the circumstances they find themselves in.

Factors Influencing Service Delivery

It proved possible to gain, through the interviews carried out, an understanding of the factors that are currently shaping the development, delivery and practice focus of services at a community level. These include:

- Having the necessary resources and expertise available to meet the specific needs of victims
- The need to create a network of ‘safe services’ that can significantly decrease personal risk and ongoing exploitation
- A recognition that the provision of community-based can only increase if a high level of political commitment is evident at national, regional and local levels;
- Fear of having to testify against perpetrators can be a serious impediment when it comes to women deciding whether to access services
- Service managers and practitioners have to guard against creating community-based services that threaten and re-traumatise users
- The need for the police to provide appropriate protective measures so that service users feel confident in accessing other forms of personal support
Challenges

A number of major challenges emerge from the data that directly impact on service managers and practitioners. These include:

- The difficulties that exist in providing a comprehensive service with limited resources
- A frequent failure to provide a significantly high enough level of victim protection and the impact this has on their willingness to use services and become involved in legal processes
- Recognition that human trafficking is a growing phenomenon and that practice needs to be extended or altered in response to experience, the outcomes of research, etc.
- The problems that are created where victims have ‘no recourse to public funds’ in terms of obtaining services that will meet their needs
- The need to undertake more street-based work in order to proactively connect with victims of human trafficking
- The bureaucratic difficulties that follow on from victims of violence not possessing appropriate documentation
**Human Rights**

A range of tensions, concerning the recognition of the human rights of victims of trafficking, emerged through the interviews. For example, it was argued that a ‘rhetoric of human rights’ exists that does not adequately reflect the experiences of victims. Many of those interviewed saw the impact of bureaucratic processes and demands for deportation and prosecution (at a political and public level) as outweighing the need to treat individuals and groups with respect, dignity and sensitivity. Reflecting similar experiences in Germany, it was also argued that racism/intolerance (often triggered via media interventions) made human rights promotion a difficult and frequently marginalised activity.

**Organisation of services**

The organisation of services appears to be highly influenced by a significant level of networking between national, regional and local organisations. For example, a number of national charities, such as the Children’s Society, are working with local organisations in the development of community based-provision. It also proved possible to demonstrate how a national charity, such as ECPAT UK, can have a major impact on service organisation through a national and local lobbying and research function. An examination of the work of the NSPCC also revealed how they, through their national child trafficking advice and information line, are offering advice and information to front line workers.

It is also worth noting the work of the Crown Prosecution Service in this area. They have recently embarked on a service evaluation process that directly involves local community members in reviewing case examples. In addition, they are attempting to support victims by meeting with them in order to explain court processes, answer questions and respond to expectations.

**Factors Influencing Service Delivery**

It proved possible to gain, through the interviews carried out, an understanding of the factors that are currently shaping the development, delivery and practice focus of services at a community level. These include:

- An increased level of understanding of the ‘push’ and ‘pull’ factors that shape human trafficking, why certain groups become victims and the cultural factors that prevent particular groups and individuals from speaking out
- A pressure on resources, as the extent of the problem grows, that surfaces in limited or inadequate provision at the level of the community
- Recognition of the growth of internal trafficking within the Birmingham area and the different level and type of support needed
Service Providers – Summary of Interviews (Human Trafficking)

- The need to recognise the power of the internet, mobile telephone, etc. and use resources to develop appropriate education programmes
- The availability of scare resources to offer the comprehensive interagency service required at a community level
- A growth in understanding that 'the extreme vulnerability of our client group is massive.' There is a need, therefore, to recognise that little progress can be made until this issue is tackled.

Challenges

A number of major challenges emerge from the data that directly impact on service managers and practitioners. These include:

- NGO and ‘third sector’ organisational capability to expand in order to meet the demand for community-based services is threatened by resource availability
- The provision of 'safe houses' needs to be extended in order to meet the growing needs of victims of human trafficking
- Extending the level of training and awareness raising activities among those professional/occupational groups, who do not have a direct responsibility for such work e.g. medical personnel, youth workers
- Challenging attitudes, stereotypes and prejudices of politicians and the public in an attempt to reduce racisms and increase understanding
- Recognising that young people at risk of trafficking often include: those with an abuse history, have lived in public care, have low self-esteem, can be alcohol and drug dependent
- Understanding that victims of human trafficking are likely to have multiple needs e.g. mental health problems, pregnancy, drug dependency, trauma etc.
5.2.6. Service Users’ Perspectives (Human Trafficking)

Summary of Interviews with Service Users

In this section a detailed summary of service user interviews is provided. Table 13 below presents details of the number of interviews undertaken. The findings are divided under a number of headings that relate directly to the provision of community-based services.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number of Interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 13 Interviews for Human Trafficking (Service Users)

Services used by victims of Human Trafficking differ across the three partner countries and the scope of the provision on offer reflects local community need, expectations and resource availability. A common interview format was adopted in order to make meaningful comparison possible.

Triggers for Seeking Support and Help

The interview data gathered presents a vivid and disturbing picture of the kind of situations that victims of human trafficking have to endure. It also offers a harrowing perspective on the ‘journeys travelled’ to arrive in the ‘host’ country. It is, however, not the purpose of this report to explore these issues in any depth. Our concern has been to examine how victims located appropriate community-based support services and the value they attached to them. The data also provided us with a level of understanding as to the range of triggers that might serve to stimulate initial contact. These are detailed below. It should be acknowledged that for some individuals more than one trigger was present. The triggers include:

- The urgent need to seek out safe and secure accommodation following a crisis situation e.g. contracting a sexually transmitted disease, physical punishment, malnutrition; in some cases a recognition that the accommodation would have to be in a different geographical location
- The provision of a good level of support and guidance from a police officer at the time of a ‘raid’ or investigation of human trafficking
- Becoming so brutalized through torture/rape/experience of prostitution/domestic servitude that the individual could not bear the situation any longer
- Following contact with a family member at home and advice to seek help from the authorities
- Encouragement from other victims of human trafficking

Voices of Victims

The decision to flee was spontaneous when there was an opportunity.
Voices of Victims

The police had previously picked me up after they were informed by a passerby who had found me at a bus stop in a completely dilapidated state, only lightly dressed, and who had been unable to communicate with me.

I was separated from the other girls... because he said (the trafficker) that because of me they didn’t work as they should... they took me to stay alone in a hotel... then I succeeded to call my brother who realized what was happening... and he told he will send someone to take me home... I wanted to send him a message to tell him exactly where I was... and instead of sending it to my brother I sent it to him (trafficker)... then I realized what I did and I was very afraid... I called my brother and he told me to call the police... and the people from the hotel called the police.

Disclosure, Access and the Availability of Services

The data gathered presents a complex and complicated picture concerning matters of disclosure, access and availability of services. Difficulties in accessing services are clearly apparent. Those ‘working’ in human trafficking situations point to the fact that they are often subjected to inhumane treatment and, as part of that treatment, find themselves cut off from the community and support services. Trying to ‘escape’ from a situation can bring with it dire consequences. Interviewees maintained that where individuals manage to escape, they must be able to access services quickly and in the simplest way possible. Information has to be made available, in appropriate languages, as to the kind of support that is available both in the short and longer term.

Voices of Victims

The police found me during a raid and they were very attentive and helpful . . . Personal protection was made available by the police

Disclosing their situation can be very difficult for victims of human trafficking. Often perpetrators attempt to ‘recapture’ victims even when they have succeeded in securing accommodation and support. One young woman pointed to the fact that having gained access to support she felt unsafe after hearing that the traffickers had been released from custody on bail. It was generally seen as important that police officers and others involved in investigations and ‘raids’, provide good quality information and guidance concerning access to, and the availability of, community-based services at the time of disclosure.
Examples of voluntary disclosure were also found, with one victim for example, describing how she first discussed her circumstances with a solicitor in prison. Another victim talked about initially revealing her situation to a sexual health worker.

Some victims argued for the provision of services outside of the geographical area where they had been ‘working’. They saw this as important as it took them away from the immediate environment and the dangers they faced. In particular instances it proved necessary to gain financial and social support in order to relocate.

It is clear from the interview data that in attempting to make a decision about whether to access a service or disclose their personal circumstances, individuals can find themselves in psychological turmoil. This may be produced by a variety of factors and include:

- Being an illegal entrant into the country
- Marital status and associated family commitments
- Need to send money back home
- Threats to family at home
- Poor communication/language skills
- Fear of being disbelieved and deported

Voices of Victims

I was afraid. I said what if the police didn’t believe me. I didn’t know what to do... I had no documents. They (the traffickers) took my documents on the way to Spain because they told me they have to do my papers so I can hire there... I didn’t even know the language...

Women have to be taken seriously and continue to be supported after the trial as well. It would be good if they immediately received a secure residency status.

I was consulted by the doctors... I went to the gynaecologist too... they took me blood... all the tests... for the diseases... because if I was ill they would have brought me to another centre... but I was fine... I also was at the psychological evaluation both in Spain and in Romania.

In the first centre in which I was nobody spoke Romanian and it was very difficult. Then I was moved to another centre where there was only a person who spoke a little bit Romanian. When I had to go to the police for statements they gave me a translator.
Voices of Victims

... (the policemen) they come for me, to check what I do... I didn’t receive protection because I had been trafficked... but probably they would offer me if I ask...... I would feel safer in a centre ... here he could find me...

Personal Safety

This was the major issue that dominated many of the interviews with victims of human trafficking. The need to remove, or at least reduce, psychological and physical danger preoccupied the thoughts of the interviewees.

The importance of rebuilding trust and self-confidence was seen as an important part of any potential ‘healing process’. It was also apparent that in order to ensure personal safety, those interviewed believed that a number of key resources had to be made available at a community level. These include:

- The provision of safe accommodation
- Access to legal services and expert advice
- Resources to meet immediate needs – food, clothing, etc.
- Access to health professionals
- The ability to speak confidentiality with support staff

Voices of Victims

In Spain I had good conditions... they gave me everything. As soon as I arrived at the police they gave me to eat and they let me talk... they brought a translator... they took me to the hospital and the centre...

No one feels safe . . . . . I still don't feel completely safe; even though I'm not in the vicinity of the crime scene and my personal data is still protected
I try to be careful everywhere and don't think about it.
Almost all of the offenders have been released from custody.

... (the policemen) they come for me, to check what I do... I didn’t receive protection because I had been trafficked... but probably they would offer me if I ask...... I would feel safer in a centre ... here he could find me...

I think it is important that the people at the courts take the women more seriously and are more sympathetic and believe what happened to them.
Service Users - Summary of Interviews (Human Trafficking)

Understanding needs

Those interviewed outlined a range of common and particular needs that required to be addressed once they had located appropriate community-based support services. The opportunity to receive counselling for various traumas was cited as being of major importance. Empathetic listening was seen as vital. The ability to contact relatives and friends ‘at home’ (if desired by the victim) was considered important.

Legal processes for many of those interviewed turned out to be extremely difficult and threatening. Victims talked about the value of having a support worker available throughout any legal proceedings, including police interviews and court appearances. A skilled translator, who understands the cultural background of victims, can play an important role in establishing positive channels for communication with legal, health and social care services. Positive police interventions, in terms of updating victims on developments where proceedings are pending and accompanying victims to a trail, were viewed as an important aspect of ongoing support work.

It was pointed out by some victims that those working with them may need support and training to really understand the circumstances they have been through. As one young person commented ‘this is why we need to be listened to and understood’.

Voices of Victims

The counselling centre helped me with everything, especially so that I was able to complete vocational training after the language course.

The collaboration, understanding and support between the police, witness protection programme, the staff at [NGO service] and my attorney was good.

I would recommend Video interrogation so that constant repetition of statements is not necessary; Female police officials during interrogation. I only had to do with men. Even though they gave me a feeling of safety and protection, particularly the questions regarding the forced sexual situation were very uncomfortable to have to answer to a man.

They didn’t force me to come in the country. They told me that I can stay there if I want to or I can go home. If I stayed there, they would have helped me to learn the language and a trade... and to find a job... as I sat there we went somewhere to make wattle and earrings and I loved it very much... now I’m sorry I came back... maybe I would have had a job there.
Characteristics of Good Quality Community-based Services

Through the interviews it proved possible to identify a range of common characteristics that directly contribute towards providing high quality community-based provision. These include:

- The need to understand the complex and brutalising circumstances that victims of human trafficking have faced
- The need to listen to victims’ stories in an empathetic way
- Providing a level of holistic assessment in respect of the individuals’ needs and developing appropriate programmes of support to meet such needs
- A significant level of coordination between the police, legal services, social and health care services in order to respond effectively
- Staff who are supportive, sympathetic and appropriately trained
- The provision of community-based services in appropriate geographical locations
- The availability of mentors who can offer ongoing support to individuals
- The creation of a community-based service that is founded on trust, respect and the valuing of human rights
- Speedy access to appropriate community-based services when a victim of human trafficking initially seeks help
Supporting a Victim of Human Trafficking

Scenario:
I was born in Lithuania. My parents left to find work when I was young so I was raised by my grandmother. My grandmother became ill and I was sent to the orphanage at the age of 8. School was boring. I did my chores, snuck alcohol and did girl things. Leaving the orphanage was hard. I did not know what to do. A guy I met said there were jobs in Germany. I could work as a waitress. He would get me an apartment above the restaurant with some other girls. It would be fun. He would pay to get me set up. I could pay him back later. Could I trust him? I heard some bad stories about girls leaving for Germany. But, it wouldn't happen to me.

I met the owner of the restaurant/bar. He said that he would pay me € 2 an hour and deduct my rent for the apartment. I worked until 2am every night. Guys at the bar liked me. The owner said I could earn more money if I danced, so I did. Then, I was told that I had to have sex with men, if I wanted to keep my job. I didn't want to, but what could I do? I didn't know how to get out. He watched me and the other girls all the time and said that if we did something stupid, we would be in trouble. One girl tried to run away. She came back with bruises. No money, no one to talk to, no chance to escape. A part of me died every night.

The police surprised us and took us to jail. When questioned: No, I am not a prostitute. No, I do not have any documents with me. No, I am not an illegal worker. No, I do not know what I am. Help me.

I was brought to a shelter and told that if I cooperated with the police to help put the owner in jail, I could stay there until the trial was over. If not, I would have to go back to Lithuania. They needed my help. I had a month to decide. I decided to stay. People helped me. My attorney listened to me. The staff understood and were kind to me. The shelter became my home. As I waited, I learned German, at least a little bit. I wanted to go to school. I wanted to go back to Lithuania. I wanted to stay in Germany. I was scared all the time. But, I was safe; Yes, I was scared and safe. Two years passed before I went in court to tell them what he did to me. I do not know how many times I had to tell my story, too many times. Then, the trial was over. He was found guilty. He hurt a lot of girls. But he will be back on the streets soon. What will happen then? And what about me?

A worker at the shelter has contacted an organisation in Lithuania who can help me when I go back. She has helped many girls who got in trouble. Where and what am I going back to? Maybe someday I will know. I am scared. I am always scared. Goodbye, Germany.

Commentary:
The study presents an overview of the kind of circumstances that can draw a young woman into being trafficked. Poverty, a low level of education and lack of information, all play a significant role. The recruitment procedure cited is not untypical.

The primary need for this young woman was to feel safe. The conditions faced were traumatic. The complexity of her situation is reflected through the level of support required.

What issues concerning reintegration does the case study raise? What kind of ongoing support might be needed?

The material used in the case study is based on original interview material. Any names used are fictitious and the case details have been substantially changed.
Supporting a Victim of Human Trafficking

Scenario:
I was in a disco when a bodyguard, who I knew, asked me if I wanted a job. I wasn’t going to school anymore and I really needed a job. Then he introduced me to a woman and her husband. I told the woman about my situation and she said she would help me to find a job in Spain, because she feels sorry for me. I was glad and believed her. Because I was a minor at the time I needed my parents’ agreement to leave the country. They agreed. They gave me their written authorisation to leave. They took my documents on the way to Spain because they told me they have to prepare my papers so I can be hired there. We were supposed to work at a gas station and a pizzeria to earn more money. We received false documents. When we arrived in Spain we all stayed in an apartment. There were other girls there. After two weeks they took us in the street and told us that that’s the place where we have to work, to earn more. Our money was taken from us. They treated us very badly. We only received what was strictly necessary. Once I miscalculated and he beat me. I was separated from the other girls because the trafficker said that because of me they didn’t work as they should. Then I managed to call my brother who realised what was happening and he told he would send someone to take me home. I tried to send a text with the address sent it to trafficker by accident, who called me immediately to stay put because he was coming to talk to me. Then I realised what I had done and I was very afraid. I called my brother and he told me to call the police. Because I couldn’t speak Spanish, the hotel called the police and my brother spoke to the police on the phone. I was afraid. I said what if the police didn’t believe me. I didn’t know what to do. I had no documents. I didn’t even know the language.

In the victim shelters in Spain I had good conditions. They gave me everything. As soon as I met with the police they gave me food to eat and they let me talk. They brought a translator. They believed me. They didn’t accuse me of anything. They took me to the hospital and then to the shelter. I was seen by medical doctors and had psychological evaluations both in Spain and in Romania. They didn’t force me to leave. They told me that if I wanted to stay there, they would have helped me to learn the language, a trade and find a job. We went somewhere to learn jewellery making and I loved it very much.

Now I’m sorry I came back maybe I would have had a job there. Since I came back to Romania I’m staying with my older sister. I can’t leave the house on my own. I’m afraid. I trust nobody. Here they [traffickers] can find me anytime. I would feel safer in a centre. They tried to contact me through a social internet site. They threatened me and asked me to withdraw my complaint or else they would find me and it would be bad. The Child Protection comes every month and I benefit from counselling.

Commentary:
This story presents a typical case of young women trafficked from Romania. The poverty, low level of education, lack of a job, the lack of information and the innocence transform an adolescent in a victim of human trafficking. The recruitment procedure and the traffickers’ behaviour in relation to the victim are also typical.

Urgent need of these adolescents is to feel safe. After long periods of time, victims of trafficking continue to suffer of threat and fear. Which services are most appropriate in this situation? The case presents a teenage who would give up living with family in favor of a shelter, in order to feel safer. In the centers she had felt protected. The family does not seem to be able to provide this safety. How can we conceive the social reintegration? Which should be the best approach?
Supporting a Victim of Human Trafficking

Scenario:
I am from a small village in Romania but now I am in a big city in England. My Uncle’s friend Daniel was very nice to me and told me he loved me. He said he had jobs for me and my best friend in England and that we could work in a hotel together. He paid for the travel and he got false passports for us. He said it was for us to look older so we could get the jobs. We were 16 at the time.
We all travelled together and came to England and then he said the jobs were not there anymore and ‘Now you have to pay me back for your travel because I spent a lot of money for your new life’. He still said he loved me but the only way I could get money quickly was to go with men and get money that way. He said I must get my friend to do it too. When I said No, he got very angry and I was scared. My friend was scared too. He made us be on the street to find this work.
Some ladies came to talk to us about if we were ok and to give us some condoms. We didn’t tell the ladies we were scared because it was hard for us to trust anyone. It was too late now. We couldn’t go home now because we were in too much trouble. Daniel said we couldn’t tell the police because we would go to prison for the false passport and for being prostitutes.
Then his friend brought 2 more girls from Romania and Daniel said we must get them to do what we were doing. But the girls complained that we made them do this and the police came and took us away. At first we were scared to tell about Daniel and then we went to prison. When we did try to tell the truth, the police did not believe us that we were only 17 now. We asked the solicitor to find the ladies who gave out condoms because they were the only people we knew and maybe they would to help us. The ladies helped us to tell our true story and for the police and courts to see we were made to do this and that we were not really adults yet.
Some more people got involved and they said it was Human Trafficking. We went to a housing project and then we had a place to feel safe, you know like we need support from people so they wouldn’t think ‘Oh She’s a prostitute’ or ‘she’s done that’. So we need people to treat us like a normal person and people to be there when we need them and to speak to us about it all. When you get out of that situation . . . you need somebody next to you so they can support you, so you can get through what’s happened to you, emotional stuff. We’ve got a flat now and some work but I don’t feel safe and we don’t get so much help now. We just go to work and come home. We don’t go out anywhere else. I walk to work even in the dark because the bus fare is expensive. I don’t feel safe yet.

Commentary:
This case study demonstrates how young people can be groomed. It examines issues of vulnerability and exploitation. When young women feel trapped, they often have difficulties in establishing trust. It can take time to develop good relationships and share experience with practitioners.
What are the challenges for services in this case?
How does the remit of the service determine the perception of the individual?
What are the tensions between law enforcement and victim care?
The case also highlights the need for ongoing support for victims who have to make new lives for themselves and shows how they can still remain lost and vulnerable.
What are the community-focused initiatives that help victims of human trafficking to build a new life?

The material used in the case study is based on original interview material.
Any names used are fictitious and the case details have been substantially changed.
5.3. Violence & Abuse Against Children & Young People

Data on the issue of violence against children and young people was collected by partners in Romania and the United Kingdom. A summary of the areas covered in this section of the report is provided below. Experiences of violence and community-focused support examined included: safeguarding practices, inter-family peer violence, responses to ‘guns and gangs’, and bullying. The use of telephone helpline services was also explored from a service provider perspective.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>International Legislative Framework:</td>
<td>5.3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Nations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Union</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National/Regional Legislation and Policy:</td>
<td>5.3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Delivery Approaches:</td>
<td>5.3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy Makers Perspectives</td>
<td>5.3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Managers and Practitioners</td>
<td>5.3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Users</td>
<td>5.3.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.3.1. International Legislative Framework (Violence & Abuse Against Children)

An overview is provided of the legislative frameworks that shape policy and practice developments in Romania and the United Kingdom. The section is subdivided to reflect legislation at international, European and country levels. Specific focus is placed on the key aspects of human rights conventions that are pertinent.

**United Nations**

The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) (1989) stands as the most significant landmark in the promotion of rights for children and young people. Specific coverage is given to the need to protect the young from harm, exploitation, discrimination and manifestations of violence. The UNCRC has been adopted globally and provides the backdrop against which specific European and national laws and policies have been developed. The key articles of the UNCRC relevant to this report include:

- Protection against discrimination (Article 2)
- Acting in the best interest of the child in decision making (Article 3)
- Freedom of thought, conscience and religion (Article 16)
- Right to a standard of living adequate for physical, mental, spiritual and social development (Article 27)
- Protection from different forms of abuse and trafficking (Article 32)
- Protection against sexual exploitation including the sale of children (Article 34)
- Protection against abduction (Article 35)
- Protection against torture, or other cruel or inhumane treatment (Article 37)
International Legislation & Policy (Violence & Abuse Against Children)

The UNCRC is supplemented by three protocols:

- Involvement of Children in Armed Conflict (2000)
- Palermo Protocol – trafficking in persons

Other United Nations instruments relevant to child abuse and neglect include:

- Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women (1993)
- ILO Convention 182 on Worst Forms of Child Labour (1999)
- Trafficking in Women and Girls (2001)
- Protection from corporal punishment and other cruel or degrading forms of punishment (2006)

European Union

The legislative and policy agenda of the European Union has been significantly influenced by a wider international human rights perspective and a determination to improve the protection of the young and safeguard them physically, mentally and emotionally. Key recent initiatives relevant to the report include:

- 1997 – European Parliament Zero Tolerance Decision
- 2004 – Combating sexual abuse, sexual exploitation of children and child pornography: includes child sex tourism, possessing and procuring child pornography, mechanisms to coordinate prosecution ‘in cases of multiple jurisdiction’, providing easier access to legal support for victims
- 2009 – Resolution on Combating Female Genital Mutilation in the EU
- 2007 - Three point plan to tackle gun crime
- 2009 – 14 European Economic Area (EEA) Grants for Children and Youth at Risk
- 2010 – Publication of Rights of Children Living Away from Home in Institutions
- 2010 – European Firearms (Amendment) Regulations
- 2011 – Youth Action Programme
5.3.2. National/Regional Legislation & Policy (Violence & Abuse Against Children)

ROMANIA: Legislation & Policy

National Legislative Framework

With the adoption of Law No. 272/2004 on the protection and promotion of children’s rights, Romania has prohibited all forms of abuse and neglect. Article 85 states that a child has the right to be protected against any forms of violence, neglect, abuse or maltreatment.

Abuse against children is defined as any voluntary action of a person who has a relation of responsibility, trust or authority towards a child, through which their life, normal physical, mental, spiritual, moral and social development, bodily integrity, and the physical and mental health of the child are endangered (art.89, align.1).

Child neglect means the omission, either voluntary or involuntary, of a person who is responsible for the upbringing, caring and education of a child which results in endangering the physical, mental, spiritual, moral and social development, bodily integrity of the child (art.89, align 2).

Policy in Romania

National Level

In 2008, Government Decision No. 860/2008 approved the National Strategy for the protection and promotion of children’s rights for 2008-2011 along with the Operational Plan for its implementation. These documents set the following main objectives:

- To increase awareness concerning the prevention and reporting of cases of child abuse, neglect and exploitation
- To develop and diversify interventions and networks for rehabilitation and social reintegration of children who have been victims of abuse, neglect and exploitation
- To ensure the development of a standard institutional frame for the prevention and combating of child abuse, neglect and exploitation

Other important national documents include:

- Order no. 89/2004 creating minimum standards for emergency reception centres for abused, neglect or exploited children
- Order No. 177/2003 creating mandatory minimum standards for the provision of a child telephone support line, counselling centres and community resource centres for children abused
Regional and local level

The Ministry of Labour, Family and Social Protection carries the major responsibility for the implementation of the national plan and supporting strategy.

The General Directorate for Social Assistance and Child Protection (GDSACP) is a public institution that operates at the County Council level. It is the responsibility of the GDSACP to operationalise social welfare policies and strategies set at the national level. The GDSACP has the direct responsibility for the provision of: public shelters for mothers and children, emergency reception centres for children, a department for intervention in cases of abuse, neglect, exploitation, together with street teams and a telephone support line for children.

At the local council level a Social Assistance Public Department provides primary prevention, identification and monitoring of cases of neglect and abuse in the family.

An important role is played by specialised NGOs in preventing and combating child abuse and neglect through the provision of community-based services.
UK: Legislation & Policy

National Legislative Framework

The impact of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) has been manifested through a range of programmes and initiatives. A key aspect of work in this area focuses on the delivery of the Every Child Matters (2004) policy agenda and its supporting legislative framework enacted via the Children Act (2004). The themes of the UNCRC of ‘protection’, ‘provision’ and ‘participation’ are reflected at a national legislative and policy level and can be seen as essential elements in the process of service design, delivery and evaluation. Aspects covered within the policy (and subsequently legally reinforced through the Children Act 2004) include matters of mental, physical and sexual abuse and violent and aggressive behaviour towards the young. Section 11 of the Act offers statutory guidance concerning the safeguarding and promotion of the welfare of children.

Within the Every Child Matters framework specific consideration is given to the nature of violence i.e. the factors that place children at increased levels of risk and the roles and responsibilities of education, social care and health services in mitigating that risk. It is acknowledged that community-based services have an important role to play in preventing violence and supporting victims. In part this is in recognition of the fact that those who have been abused, exploited or trafficked are more likely to avail themselves of those kinds of services that are the least threatening and non-judgemental.

Local Safeguarding Children Boards have been legally constituted throughout the country with a direct responsibility for implementing the national safeguarding strategy.

Policy in UK

National Level:

The election of a Labour government in 1997 brought with it a radical transformation in the organisation of services for children and young people. As part of that agenda a model for service development and delivery has been introduced that advocates the requirement to generate ‘joined up’ solutions to the educational, social, health and economic problems faced by the young in their everyday lives. As part of the policy intentions of government, specific attention has been given to the safeguarding and protection of children and young people who are experiencing, or ‘at risk’ of experiencing violence, abuse, neglect, maltreatment and exploitation.

A requirement to generate robust community-based services is reflected in the concept of developing multiagency and multiprofessional responses to service development and delivery at the local level. A range of political imperatives have served to generate a policy and legislative framework where the specific demand is made for those working in education, social care and health services to combine skills, resources, knowledge and expertise in an effort to respond to the holistic needs of individual and groups of children and young people.
Of relevance to this study is the policy role adopted by the Home Office in combating gang violence. This includes the development of a national Tackling Gang Action programme in 2007 and the publication of the ‘Saving lives, reducing harm, protecting the public: An action plan for tackling violence 2008-11’. In addition, other national bodies and organisations, such as the Youth Justice Board (2005), have examined ‘risk and protective factors’ and The Centre for Social Justice produced an in-depth analysis of street gangs in its report ‘Dying to Belong’ in 2009.

Regional and Local:

The Every Child Matters policy framework has had its most profound impact when it comes to determining how services for children and young people should be run and managed at the local level. The idea is pursued through the policy that more efficient and effective services will be developed when multiagency and multiprofessional approaches to service delivery are adopted. Specific recognition is given to the fact that the needs of children and young people are best met when they are considered from a holistic perspective. To respond to such a perspective it is argued that the skills, knowledge and expertise of specific professional groups have to be combined in such a way that the needs of the child or young person are more likely to be met. The research points to the development of such approaches across Birmingham.

However, evidence gained from the research points to the fact that there is a need for more community-based projects supporting children and young people who have been the victims of violence, exploitation or trafficking. In turn, it seems likely, from the views expressed by children and young people, that those seeking support will become increasingly reliant on the availability of front line, community-based, service that are easily accessible. The advocacy function performed by particular community-based projects will also need to be extended as marginalised young people attempt to make their voices heard.

Birmingham City Council undertook an extensive review of ‘partnership working to tackle gang violence’ in 2010. As part of the developing policy strategy, the Birmingham Reducing Gang Violence (BRGV) partnership committed itself to extending the focus of preventative work across the city. As part of the overall strategic response it was recommended that the Integrated Youth Service should take a lead role in the prevention agenda (recommendation 7). Together with this, a recommendation was made ‘that the Police and the City Council ensure that the community and in particular young people are involved in discussions to inform the planning and delivery of services through mechanisms such as BRGV3 and the Total Place agenda’ (recommendation 8). The partnership has also undertaken important work in attempting to identify ‘risk factors’ involved in encouraging gang membership. These include:

- A lack of role models
- Rejection of the educational experience
- Poverty and lack of employment
- Fear
Birmingham Local Safeguarding Children Board plays a key role in coordinating local policy. Safeguarding and Promoting the Welfare of Children and Young People has been defined as keeping children and young people:

- Safe from maltreatment, neglect, violence & sexual exploitation
- Safe from accidental injury & death
- Safe from bullying & discrimination
- Safe from crime & anti-social behaviour in and out of school
- Secure, stable and are cared for
- Provided with safe homes & stability

A consultation with young people identified being safe as:

- Feeling safe on the streets, especially at night
- Staying out of trouble
- Not being bullied or getting involved in fights

(Adapted from www.lscbbirmingham.gov.uk, 2010)

The important role played by NGOs, third sector organisations and national and local charities in developing and delivering community-based services across the Birmingham conurbation is recognised via the research data gathered for this project. The work of such organisations in supporting victims of violence is reflected through the views of service users explored in Section 3.5.6 below.

**Similarities & Differences in Legislation & Policy**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LEGISLATION &amp; POLICY</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Forms of violence</strong></td>
<td>The experience of violence is a constant feature in the lives of many young people. It can be especially problematic for those living on the ‘margins’ of society. Policy and legislative frameworks are being developed that reflect the importance of tackling different kinds of violence generated through abuse, neglect, bullying, being trafficked, gang membership, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Context of human rights</strong></td>
<td>Human rights legislation at European and national levels is heavily influenced by the UNCRC. Responses to violence need to be informed by matters of ‘prevention’, ‘protection’ and the ‘participation’ of young people in decision making.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>National legislation</strong></td>
<td>The impact and outcomes of violence are recognised through national legislation in both countries. Existing legislative frameworks appear to significantly shape services at the regional and local level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strategy/Action Plans</strong></td>
<td>Action plans and other forms of strategic activity necessarily reflect national priorities. Clearly, policy makers in Romania and the UK pursue specific goals. However, the safeguarding of children is high on the political and professional agendas of both countries.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Local and County Level</strong></td>
<td>Specialised services are promoted to meet the diverse needs of children and young people. Service development appears to be generally underpinned by multiprofessional and multiagency approaches. The development of effective partnership appears important in both countries.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This section explores the approaches to service delivery adopted within both Romania and the UK.

**Approaches to Service Delivery in Romania: Sibiu**

**Contextual background**

In the last 20 years, significant improvements have been made to child protection systems in Romania. These have been brought about through the harmonization of national legislation with international standards, recognition of the requirements of the UNCRC and the decentralization and diversification of services for children and families. An important contribution has been made in community-based service development by non-governmental organisations through their partnerships with government institutions. It should also be noted that significant progress has been made in the areas of drug abuse and child neglect. At a county level, after 2004, a number of departments were created within the GDSAPC and SPAS with specific responsibilities for supporting such work.

There remain weaknesses that need to be addressed. These include:

- the development of a comprehensive national and county strategy to prevent child abuse and neglect
- the development of a national system for recording abuse and neglect
- improvements in cooperation between governmental and nongovernmental departments
- an expansion in current provision to support physical and psychological recovery and social reintegration of victims

**Services for children and young people**

Within the General Directorate for Social Assistance and Child Protection there are two specific departments with a direct responsibility for preventing, combating and intervening in situations of child abuse and neglect. Major responsibilities include:

- the promotion of activities, information and services in order to support children exposed to situations of abuse, neglect, trafficking, migration and repatriation
- receiving information relating to situations of abuse, neglect, trafficking, migration and repatriation and promptly intervening in such cases
- implementation of urgent measures to protect children against all forms of abuse, neglect, exploitation, inhuman or degrading treatment
- collaboration with the Ambulance, Police or the Prosecutor’s Office in order to facilitate and coordinate interventions in emergency cases

A permanent telephone helpline exists for children and young people offering:

- emergency support
- information
- social counselling
- psychological counselling for children and families
- legal advice
Children contacting the helpline can have their individual cases referred to other departments within the Directorate.

Children and young people can also make use of services provided through the Department of Domestic Violence.

A community services complex called Prichindelul exists in Sibiu, which together with other centres provides:
- Reception and temporary accommodation
- Medical treatment and care
- Emotional support and, if necessary, psychological counselling
- Education
- Family and community reintegration

The centre has the capacity to receive up to 15 abused, neglected or exploited children, repatriated children, children who are the victims of trafficking, and street children aged between 2-18 years who are resident or have been identified in the administrative-territorial area of Sibiu County.

A counselling and support centre exists for parents and children providing:
- Social counselling
- Information
- Psychological counselling for children and parents
- Legal advice

This service has a preventative function in terms of avoiding family separation. It can support and assist children and parents, where the child is the subject of ‘special protective measures’. It can also provide assist to unaccompanied children with the status of refugee.

The Department for Child Protection within the Social Assistance Public Service offers:
- Identification and monitoring of individual and family social needs
- Information about rights and obligations
- Social, legal and psychological counselling

Other institutions with powers to prevent and combat child abuse and neglect include:
- County School Inspectorate
- Sibiu Public Health Department and Medical Establishments
- Sibiu County Police Inspectorate, Sibiu County Gendarmerie Headquarters and Police Community

NGOs play an important role in preventing and combating child abuse and neglect.
Examples of community-based services

The ESTERA German Christian Women's House Association - The Centre for the Prevention and the Fight against Family Violence - Medias
Focus: Domestic violence (adults and children)
Types of services offered:

- Hosting for a definite period
- Legal support
- Psychological and social counselling
- Information
- Community reintegration

SINERGII Association, Medias, Centre of Counselling and Support for parents and children in distress. Services offered include:

- Social counselling
- Legal advice
- Child and family psychological counselling

Diakonisches Werk Association of the Believers of Evangelical Church of Romania, Day Care Centre for prevention of child abuse, child neglect, and exploitation
Services offered:

- Hosting by day
- Education
- Psychological counselling
- Social counselling
- Legal advice for child and family
**Approaches to Service Delivery in UK: Birmingham**

**Contextual background**

Service delivery in Birmingham brings together a ‘mixed economy’ of providers. With Birmingham LA taking the lead in policy development, a network of services exists to provide community-based support for children and young people. Birmingham LA acts as both a commissioner and provider of services. Partnerships exist with charitable bodies, third sector organisations and the private sector, funded through a variety of sources. Every Child Matters continues to influence service development, delivery and evaluation.

**Services for children and young people**

A significant outcome of the *Every Child Matters* policy agenda has been to produce a major restructuring of services bringing together, at a local authority level, elements of education, social care and health. The diagram below shows the way services for children and young people are currently arranged within Birmingham LA.

---

**Figure 2: Birmingham C&YP Partnership Governance: September 2009**

- [Diagram of Birmingham C&YP Partnership Governance]
Relationships with other organisations and providers such as regionally-based health services, the West Midlands Police, Probation service etc. are formally expressed through appropriate partnership bodies. The Local Safeguarding Children Board coordinates safeguarding developments and leads on child protection issues. As part of the overall policy development process, voluntary community-based youth and children’s services are performing an increasingly important role in supporting victims of violence, exploitation and trafficking. City United Limited, based in the Aston area of Birmingham, provide an excellent example of such work. Major national voluntary organisations, such as the Children’s Society and Childline, are also adding their voice and resources at the local level to development of services.

Examples of community-based services

City United Limited
Based in the Aston area of Birmingham, City United offers educational and social support to young people. The range of services available includes:

- ‘Guns and knives’ support
- Gang support
- Mentoring
- Anger management
- Support to young people excluded from school
- Young men’s/young women’s groups

Childline
Childline West Midlands based in Birmingham provides important telephone advice services to children and young people. A significant aspect of their work involves supporting young people who are the victims of bullying (there has been a significant growth in cyber bullying). They also report an involvement in cases of forced marriage and abduction.

Murray Hall Community Trust
Murray Hall Community Trust, based in Sandwell, provides support services to young men who have been the victims of domestic violence. Opportunities are available to take part in group work, counselling and social activities.

SOVA (Supporting Others through Volunteer Action)
SOVA, Birmingham, provides a dedicated mentoring service for young people. As part of its work, it offers services to Unaccompanied Asylum Seeking Children who have no positive, significant adult in their lives – many have been the victims of violence. It also works with young people on community sentences, at the point of arrest, on remand, registered with Social Services and under local authority care.
Similarities & Differences in Service Delivery Approaches

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SERVICES</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Development strategies for services at regional level</td>
<td>Both countries are attempting to develop robust strategies that support the provision of community-based services. Violence towards children and young people is highlighted in a range of strategies concerned with safeguarding, street violence, gangs, bullying, responses to Unaccompanied Children, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The network of services and the collaboration between them</td>
<td>Service networks exist at the level of the community. The challenges facing Romania are noted in the report. There is still work to be done in both countries to improve coordination and multiagency working, although significant improvements are noted.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The number and variety of public services</td>
<td>Services generally have a specific focus or expertise availability. Partnerships between government and nongovernment organisations are prevalent in both countries. Telephone advice line work appears important in terms of providing relatively easy access to support provision.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.3.4. Policy Makers’ Perspectives (Violence Against Children)

Summary of Interviews with Policy Makers

In this section a detailed summary of policy maker interviews is provided. Table 14 below presents details of the number of interviews undertaken. The findings are divided under a number of headings that relate directly to the provision of community-based services and the policy perspectives that inform their development.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number of Interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 14 Interviews for Violence Against Children (Policy Makers)

Specific consideration is given to policy maker perspectives from each of the partner countries. It was considered important to present the data in this way as each country pursues a policy agenda that is reflective of its international and national commitments, priorities and is, to some extent, based on the availability of resources.

Romania: Policy Makers - Summary of Interviews (Violence Against Children)

Human Rights

It is evident from the interviews data that the implementation of a human rights agenda has met with a range of significant setbacks in recent years. Continued political instability, lack of resources and a diminution in political will, have combined to impact on the promotion of the rights of children and young people who are the victims of various manifestations of violence. Despite this, NGOs continue to play a major role as advocates for children, young people and their families.

Policy Focus

Policy development has covered a number of specific areas including: abuse and neglect, combating child exploitation through labour, drug misuse and support for victims of human trafficking. Importance has been placed on the development of cross-sector policies that respond to the complex and challenging situations that children and young people find themselves in. Implementation of effective policy at a regional level remains problematic due to insufficiently regulated decentralization, lack of research evidence to support the development of local strategies, and seeing violence, and protection from it, as a low priority in work with children and young people.

The importance of good quality policy development and long term political commitment was emphasised throughout the interviews.
Current Challenges

It proved possible to articulate a range of challenges that are currently impacting on the development of policy. These include:

- A lack of development of preventative strategies at local and national levels
- Insufficient resources to build a wider network of community-based services
- The need to support the development of policy and practice-related research that will allow for the introduction of more effective policies
- Increasing the access of NGOs to local public funds
- The development of a national system of services for abused children
- The need to introduce more rigorous and focused systems for the evaluation of services – including the involvement of service users
- A significant expansion in the training and education of professionals and the development of public awareness
- Improved focus on the needs of children and young people who live in isolated rural communities
Human Rights

At the time the interviews were carried out (prior to the General Election in the UK in 2010) it was maintained, at a ministerial level, that the promotion of human rights played a ‘very prominent’ role in the formulation of legislation and policy. In addition, it was asserted that all new legislation and policy was interrogated for its’ human rights implications. Policy makers in non-government organisations pointed to the use of the UNCRC as a mechanism for influencing the design of services for victims of violence. However, it was argued that more work has to be done to inform and explain to children and young people their rights.

Policy Focus

The focus of policy has integrated aspects of criminal and civil law. National and local government, it is claimed, have recognised the importance of tackling gang, gun and knife crime and resources have been made available to develop preventative programmes in these area. These programmes have had a clear community focus involving schools, youth services, social care services, etc. Under the policy banner of ‘anti-social behaviour’, attempts have been made to regulate the public behaviour of the young through the use of, for example, Anti Social Behaviour Orders (ASBOs).

NGOs, both at a local and national level, appear to play a major role in ‘interpreting policy into practice’. Safeguarding policies and those designed to reduce discrimination and exploitation are given the highest priority at an operational level. Community-based services are seen as an important aspect of service provision in delivering services to ‘where children and young people are’. Examples were cited of where national/regional/local awareness raising groups perform an important role in lobbying central government and commenting on policy proposals.

Current Challenges

It proved possible to highlight a number of challenges impacting on the development of policy. These include:

- The significant reduction of public expenditure to support the development of programmes in the future
- Securing the commitment of the new government in the UK to continue to prioritise work in this area
- The expansion of opportunities for children and young people to be directly involved in policy formulation and service delivery
- Ensuring that policy priorities reflect the need to engage with ‘hard to reach’ children and young people
5.3.5. Service Providers’ Perspectives (Violence Against Children)

Summary of Interviews with Service Managers and Practitioners

In this section a detailed summary of service manager and practitioner interviews is provided. Table 15 below details the number of interviews undertaken in each of the partner countries.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number of Interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 15 Interviews for Violence Against Children (Service Providers)

Specific consideration is given to how community-based services for victims of violence are organised and delivered, and the challenges faced in developing and delivering those services in appropriate and sensitive ways. Examples are offered from Romania and the UK. The perspectives explored need to be understood in relation to the service delivery models previously examined (see Section 5.3.3). In this section the views of service managers and practitioners are combined due to the fact that it only proved possible to obtain one interview in Sibiu, Romania. Interviews were conducted with managers and practitioners working in a range of different settings. These included:

- Emergency support for victims of abuse and neglect
- Educational/preventative programmes
- Advice and information
- Counselling
- Telephone advice services

Service Providers - Summary of Interviews (Violence Against Children)

Human Rights

The research data indicates a very clear commitment to the development of services that are influenced by human rights. Human rights are considered important as they help ‘legitimise’ service delivery approaches. Emphasis was placed on the work of the Children’s Commissioner for England in advocating the importance of pursuing a rights agenda in terms of both ‘preventative’ and ‘protection’ activities. However, it was maintained that there was still a great deal of work to be done in supporting children and young people to assert their rights.

Organisation of Services

With the exception of the provision of a telephone advice line in both Sibiu and Birmingham, all of the services reviewed were community-based. The services offered in Romania tend to complement those for women and are frequently delivered at the same location. Emphasis is placed on ‘rescue’ work and legal, social and psychological counselling. In Birmingham services are offered in a variety of ways and are influenced by patterns and manifestations of violence at the level of the local community. Particular services, such as City United Ltd, work with young people who are referred by other organisations and agencies such as the local Youth Offending Team.
Specialised support for victims of abuse and neglect is provided through Birmingham City Council Children’s Services. The Integrated Youth Service offers social education and mentoring work at a local level. The work of the Local Safeguarding Children Board was also acknowledged to be important in terms of influencing how services should be organised and delivered.

The data gathered presents a clear picture of how agencies are attempting to work together to shape service delivery within Birmingham. Examples cited focused on the importance of interagency work, and the existence of good quality channels of communication, at a local community level. From the interview data available, it would appear that the organisation of services is predicated on a number of key assumptions. These include:

- The need for both individual and group support to be available
- The importance of establishing a working climate that is respectful and confidential
- The need to understand and respond to the difficult and sometimes ‘chaotic’ conditions and circumstances that face some children and young people
- A requirement to acknowledge the pressure that can exist when an individual or group attempts to access services
- An understanding of the fact that the nature of violence, and the way that children and young people experience it, is subject to constant change – and services need to respond accordingly

The provision of telephone advice line services in Sibiu, Romania and Birmingham, England, appears to provide an important source of support to young people who are ‘at risk’, or victims of violence. The service offered in Birmingham, through Childline, also offers on-line chat facilities. At the time of the research, text and email services were being developed.

**Factors Influencing Service Delivery**

It is evident from the research data gathered, that community-based services in both countries are struggling to respond to the level and manifestations of violence they encounter on a daily basis. Resources are stretched to such a significant extent that, as one manager argued, ‘hard choices have to be made about priorities in the full knowledge that some young people will fall between the gaps’. The need for preventative work was seen as a high priority. However, demands to respond to ‘brutalised, alienated and severely traumatised young people’ took priority when it came to determining service priorities. The interview undertaken in Sibiu also pointed to the difficulties that managers and practitioners can face when they feel they have no power to influence policy, experience a lack of political will to engage in the development of effective services, are exposed to the danger of ‘retribution’ by the abuser, and have to work on the margins with limited resources.
Challenges

In developing community-based support for victims of violence a number of challenges appear to impact on service organisation and delivery. These include:

- The challenging and breaking down of cultural and social barriers/stereotypes that ‘conceal’ perpetrators, accept violence as a ‘normal’ part of childhood and foster discrimination and disrespect
- Acceptance of the fact that gang membership for some young people offers a sense of purpose, provides protection and a source of ‘family-based’ relationships
- Working in ways that acknowledge the complexity of children and young people’s lives through the provision of integrated social care, health and educational services
- Engaging with service, and potential service, users in ways that encourage them to explore their experiences and define their needs and expectations of community-based services
- The creation of a network of formal and informal services that will build ‘resilience’, offer access that is nonthreatening and can be used as a mechanism for immediate support and protection, and preventative work
- The managing of a reduced financial resource that will not add to the risks, uncertainties and challenges that many children and young people already face
5.3.6. Service Users’ Perspectives (Violence Against Children)

**Summary of Interviews with Service Users**

In this section a summary of interviews provided by children and young people is provided. Table 16 below presents details of the number of interviews undertaken. The findings are divided under a number of headings that relate directly to the provision of community-based services.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number of Interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 16 Interviews for Violence Against Children (Service Users)

Those interviewed were all receiving different forms of community-based support, often within the same project. The forms of support included:

- Emergency accommodation and support following disclosure of abuse
- Psychological and personal counselling
- Mentoring and befriending
- Advice on rights, benefits and services
- Behaviour management
- Social and personal skills
- Educational support
- ‘Guns and gangs’ – building resilience and self-confidence

**Triggers for Seeking Support and Help**

It appears that triggers for seeking support and help are directly influenced by specific circumstances and events. For the young people in Romania, the trigger was often the fact that their mother was fleeing from a violent family situation herself. Those interviewed point to the fact that in fleeing from the family home, they themselves are freed from the impact of violence inflicted by other family members – a father, brother, grandparent, etc. Those interviewed also reported the enduring nature of incidents of sexual abuse, aggressive outbursts fuelled by alcohol and drugs, and the pressures that can arise out of a lack of living space in an extended family home. Such factors act as direct triggers in seeking support.

For victims of violence in Birmingham who sought community-based support, the triggers are frequently connected to their personal, social and community situations. Sometimes a particular incident – bullying at home or in school, a violent act on the part of a carer, or exclusion from school, led to a reassessment of personal circumstances.
Voices of Victims

Just couldn’t take no more, had to get out.... asked around about somewhere local where could get help.
Chucked out of school ... Oh! Forget it you can leave now if you don’t want to be here.
When you need help you look for somewhere you can get to quickly, like on your doorstep, then people who listen and don’t judge...

Young people also pointed to the fact that people who seek help can sometimes be victims as well as perpetrators of violence – ‘different people look for help for different reasons, like you can stab and be stabbed’. It was also reported that violence can escalate over time or be influenced by particular geographical factors. For example, it can be difficult to avoid violent confrontations that are post code or ‘territory’ related.

Voices of Victims

You can get attacked for being outside your area.
I can’t do that man [visit another area]. It is too risky. I don’t want to die for people and people ain’t going to die for me.
Someone being upset like because it can be done by a mentally, verbally, could be done by assault, bullying, stabbings, shootings there’s a lot round here.

Individual circumstances based on loneliness, a lack of self-esteem and self-worth also appeared to play a major role in young people seeking out community-based forms of support. Through the interviews it proved possible to establish a strong link between the impact of particular triggers and the need to receive ‘urgent’ and locally available help.

Voices of Victims

I left with my mother because of my father. He was very mean to us... he was drinking a lot. We were away for a period, in another centre... but we came back and it was worse... my father’s children were beating me with a whip...

... the police didn’t help me at all... they told me that there’s no point in going to the Child Protection...
I have heard long time ago about the Child Protection, yes... he influenced us then and he told us that the women from the Child Protection are mean who come to take us to the orphanage and beat us
Voices of Victims

The Child Protection came with the police after what happened (sexual abuse by uncle)... after that the police registered us... and they called me for counselling.

Access, Approach and the Availability of Services

Matters of access, approach and service availability significantly featured in many of the interviews conducted with children and young people. Ideas of ‘personal territory’ and ‘space’ were linked to the importance of services being located in local communities. The difficulties associated with ‘travelling outside your area’ and the cost and potential risks attached (particularly on public transport) were seen as significant in accessing services.

Young people looked for services that they could relate to in terms of being nonthreatening, nonjudgmental and supportive. Representative interview comments are presented below.

Voices of Victims

It’s just like somewhere to come and chill sometimes... and talk to people ... You get things off your chest. It’s a place where you come and you know you are alright. It is like being at home and not... It is a safe place. ...very good gives the help we wanted and also needed, so I like this place. So like normally on the road if you see these people [other young people in the project] I couldn’t really talk to them. Now able to speak to other group members on the street.

... I knew about the Child Protection... I read in the newspaper and i also looked on the internet... My aunt helped me and I found the address and I came by myself...

... I live at home... things have not been changed much... but I have learned here (in the counselling centre) which are my rights... and I feel better, more confident...
Some of the young people interviewed talked about the need for support services to be available outside of ‘office hours’. A view expressed by one young person thus:

**Voices of Victims**

> Have to be there when you want help like at night and all that. Trouble happens all the time, fights and beatings and stuff so that’s when you need it the help.

Other young people reported how they used community-based services as ‘time out’ from difficult situations and a place you can go to ‘get your head together’. The issue of locality and ease of access was again raised in relation to these specific points.

For the young people interviewed in Romania access to community-based services was considered vital not only to get away from violence, but to also be able to return to school, find ‘joy, peace, good toys, good living conditions and security’. The threat of violence and intimidation appeared to dominate the lives of all the children and young people interviewed. They talked of having cultural and social needs that were not being met in the family. A major issue that emerges through the interviews is the mistrust the young people have of the police and social services staff (sometimes induced by a parent). They appear to be searching for a place that focuses on meeting their specific needs through the provision of advocacy, counselling and in-depth support.

The issue of hunger and the need to be able to obtain food proved to be an important one for many of the young people interviewed in both countries. The data provided by the young people and those working with them, points to the fact that in some instances those accessing services are literally ‘starving’; many haven’t eaten on a regular basis for a considerable length of time. The provision of food was seen as a vital element in service provision. The comments of a specific project manager highlight the significance of this issue.

> ‘You can’t do anything without food inside you. Lots of people who come here are starving. Well, their malnourished. They haven’t eaten regularly. You can’t work with them until you deal with that.’

**Voices of Victims**

> ...mostly I was glad that I can stay here, and it’s quiet... We have good food. Sometimes I did not have what to eat at home. ...I have toys here ...there [at home] I had no toys. Here I have a beautiful room...

> ...I feel good here... much better than there [at home]... they take care of us, they offer us medical care, food, a place to stay, clothes whenever we need... I was taught to play two instruments... I benefited of counselling...
Personal Safety

The need to provide community-based services that are safe and secure for children and young people featured in all of the interviews conducted in Sibiu, Romania and Birmingham, England. In many instances community-based services are approached as a ‘last resort’. Even when young people are ‘referred’ to, or choose to use, a particular service it is important to recognise that they are looking for staff within that service to offer personal protection and a safe environment. For young people fleeing from violent home or community situations, or looking for advice and information, they want a service to be responsive, caring and place them ‘in the centre’.

Data collected through the interviews suggests that young people are not simply looking for assurances with regard to their personal security, but that they also want to explore how they can become safer in their day-to-day lives. Personal safety in some projects is initially established through the development of specific ground rules drawn up by the young people themselves – ‘no guns, drugs, fighting, disrespect, spiting’. For others, personal safety was about them managing their own behaviour – ‘thinking about where you go, staying out of trouble, fights’. There were also young people whose personal safety was significantly enhanced through counselling, social group work and the availability of adults who were willing to listen to and ‘respect’ their views.

The threat of violence appears to permeate almost every aspect of the lives of some children and young people. The outcomes of such a threat can be significant – ‘they drain you’, ‘freak you’, ‘make you the same way’. It would appear from the data that the building of self-confidence, esteem and personal worth can only begin when individuals are able to establish a significant degree of personal safety in their lives. Community-based services, according to the young people involved in this project, have an important role to play in this respect.

Voices of Victims

Here I feel like I’m in a tolerant family... that educates you... I liked all the ladies from the beginning ... I like everybody... I can tell them anything ... I feel safe here... but my father is calls all the time ... the Child Protection told us we have to answer him because its his right as a father to keep in touch with us... but when he calls he ruins our day...

I miss my sisters and my grandmother... since I came here I rarely spoke on the phone.... ... I had friends there... I have friends here too... but there I know them since I was little... I like there more.
Service Users – Summary of Interviews (Violence & Abuse Against Children)

Understanding needs

Although a range of similar experiences and circumstances bring children and young people to community-based services, it is evident from the data gained that they have complex personal needs. The role of practitioners in helping them to understand and respond to such needs was considered to be important by those interviewed. A range of specific tasks and skills were identified as being vital if effective communication is to be established. These include:

- The ability to create non-threatening spaces where young people can be supported to begin to explore the specific issues and problems they face – ‘place where they don’t interrogate you, listen to what you want to say’
- Opportunities to share experiences with other children and young people where appropriate – ‘somewhere to come that is safe … who can share stories…’
- A good level of empathetic and non-judgemental listening; ‘…’ it’s about the person himself … want that person to listen to you.’
- The availability of, or access to, specialised services - counselling, therapeutic group work, personal advocate etc.

A significant issue raised through the interview process was the requirement for community-based services to respond in a variety of ways to meet the complex needs of young people. Those interviewed identified the fact that, where they become involved in violent situations they need various forms of support – both short and longer term. Support needs to cover a wide spectrum of needs including social care, personal safety, education, police protection, guidance and counselling, and information and support. Some young people talked about the fact that it was important ‘not to feel different’ when discussing their needs.

Voices of Victims

Everyone’s like the same, no-one’s different, like it doesn’t matter where you live, and it’s about the person itself, so it’s helped us with that as well, confidence.

Others had very specific expectations of what they want from a community-based service.

Voices of Victims

Looked for place to save you get getting permanently kicked out and ending on the street corner. Setting your own goals is really important. Right to be self-controlled... need of group services, the need of a shelter for emergency reception, socialising and leisure activities Feel safe in the shelter... they pushed us, motivated us as well, so this place is very good. Where you can find what you want easily not going to social workers, and then police, and then someone at school ...
Voices of Victims

... sometimes everything is like in school... I am asked and I answer... I would like to chat... or to do something together... for example to paint or I would like to speak to young people who have the same problem as me...
... I would like to talk more with the nurses...

The conversations with the lady psychologist helped me a lot... now I sleep at night... and I'm not afraid in the street...
... I'm all right here... much better than there ... they take care of us, they offer us medical care, food, a place to stay, clothes whenever we need... I was taught to play two instruments... I benefited of counselling... I talked with the ladies... these centres are very good... what I want to be different, is another boy to play with... (there are only girls in the centre)

It also proved possible, as part of the project, to interview a small group of Unaccompanied Asylum Seeking Children. All had experienced significant acts of violence in their lives e.g. trafficking and smuggling, and are now using a community-based service for support. They have particular and shared needs these include:

- Not being able to speak English making school and care home experiences difficult
- Missing their family in country of origin
- Uncertainty about the future
- Not being able to go out and socialize
- Lack of money
- Poor future employment prospects
- Difficulties in understanding and building relationships with professionals
- Bullying

The young people interviewed felt that mentors working in the community-based service had tried to meet their needs through:

- Supporting the development of their spoken English
- Helping them to travel around the community independently
- Assisting them with the development of literacy skills
- The provision of social activities
- Helping the young person to build their CV
- Advising on educational opportunities and future work possibilities
- Discussing aspects of racism and violence
- Exploration of the situation that brought them to the UK
It proved possible to identify a number of models of evaluation typically used to gauge young people’s views as to the quality of the services that are offered to them. Typically, young people are encouraged to complete various personal assessments, take part in group discussions and meet with practitioners on a one-to-one basis. In the box below, one young person talks about the value of being involved in giving feedback to staff and managers. Another points to the importance of a meeting with a local elected councillor (at Birmingham’s Council House) to provide feedback on the value of a specific project.

Voices of Victims

Makes staff aware of what they are doing right and what they can improve on. Group gets involved in outcomes of evaluations.
I said if this place did close down then what would we do? That’s what councillor’s don’t understand. If you get closed down because of funding what can we do like, go back sitting at home?

Big issues loss of the friends from childhood and moving me to another school
It helped me to speak more to stranger people that like I’d never speak to before.
It helped me to build up my confidence and made think that I am worth more.
Gave me a routine, someone to talk to and care for and be on my side. She’s just like a friend, she’ll sit there and listen to me.
Characteristics of a Good Service

It proved possible to identify from the interview data what young people consider to be the key characteristics of a good community-based support service. These include:

- Being situated in an appropriate geographical location with easy and ‘nonthreatening’ access – this includes keeping paperwork down to a minimum
- Knowing that the service will respect individual confidentiality and treat service users with respect
- Ensuring the safety of young people using a service
- Offering the opportunity for assessment ‘in the round’ through a recognition of the fact that young people will have complex needs and require multilayered forms of support
- Providing young people with support at a personal level and through direct engagement with their peers
- Offering a significant level of flexibility in terms of when services are available for young people
- Staff realising the consequences and potential risks for some young people in using community-based projects
- Being able to support young people who are dealing with matters of social isolation, loneliness and loss
- Ensuring that young people are provided with a range of opportunities to feedback on the quality of the service provided for them
Supporting a Victim of Gang Violence

Scenario:

I got myself involved. Dealing, like gangster stuff. Me, the little boy hanging round. Running errands and that. Got stabbed finished off in Intensive Care Unit in hospital. Scared shitless and needed an out. Back into community no way, big trouble and law is not to ‘grass’. Wanted help and my mate told me about this ‘guns and gangs’ project.

Turned up, first thing I asked is this a safe place? Rules on the walls respect, listening, no drugs, guns, fighting stuff like that. I asked Kenny the bloke who I saw, ‘Who wrote that stuff?’ He said it was the kids who come there. Big thing no violence, place was peaceful man. Talked about knives. No one has give me that talk ... saying forget it, it’s not worth it stay on this side. Sticks in my mind how calm the place was no shouting, brutalising.

Started by doing stuff about controlling my temper. ‘Anger Management’ they called it. Made sense when you are in trouble how to get out and stay out. It was hard ‘cos normally nobody thinks about what they are doing before they do it. Then they do it again. It’s a cycle.

After a bit they wanted me to think about other things. No qualifications, what I could do, courses and stuff. Started with something dead simple ‘on-line’ about English but it was great. You did a test and if you passed (I did!) you got a certificate. First certificate I’ve ever had for English. Got a great score and that boosted my confidence. We did discussion groups and that was great. We made the rules up, who could talk and when you had to listen. Did a health and safety certificate. Went on this residential and did some brilliant stuff canoeing, rock climbing. Started to feel different but would have liked a bit more help with coming to terms with that – it wasn’t easy to get along outside sometimes. The street was still violent even if I wasn’t!

Commentary:

The case study raises some important issues about the nature of violence and how easy it is for young people to get drawn into gangs. Getting stabbed clearly served as a trigger for seeking community-based support. Referral through peer networks is not unusual in such cases. He also realised that by going back into the community his problems would resurface.

The study reveals the complex needs of the young person concerned. It is interesting to note how the young man responds positively to the interventions made by practitioners. They attempt to deal with his immediate need first i.e. personal safety. He was clearly impressed by the level of participation encouraged through rule making, involvement in group work sessions, etc. He was given time to explore other needs once his self-confidence had increased. He notes the importance of the existence of a ‘calm’ atmosphere.

The young man needed to succeed and he was offered some relatively simple ways of doing that. You get a real sense that the practitioners were attempting to increase the level of challenge as he went along. Perhaps more could have been done to help him deal with his changing personal and social circumstances. He recognised the continuing violence that existed on the street and the difficulties that might cause.

The material used in the case study is based on original interview material. Any names used are fictitious and the case details have been substantially changed.
Violence Against Children and Young People

Unaccompanied Asylum Seeking Young Person

Scenario:

I was in a truck with my brother when they opened the door and they say England run away, and I run away from truck ... they took us to the police station and left us there. I was put in Children’s home, that time I couldn’t speak English, just ‘hello’. Problems, I just cry. My brother is somewhere else now staying in another place. I am 16 but they challenge my age, social worker and doctor don’t agree. They don’t know should they put me with children or adults. I miss people my own age.

I needed someone to support me. Someone to help me work out the problems of being here. They are asking in English, you know, they say words and they try to explain to me. I don't know these words. I don't know how to ask questions. I was asked did I want a mentor. I asked what is a mentor? And they said someone to talk to. I said yes, I'll try.

Meet with my mentor Frank once a week for an hour. We do different things. I don’t know this area before, but my mentor shows me how I can take the bus. I’ve been to the library and cinema. We read books together and sometimes we are going to the café. I enjoy myself. Sometimes I talk about myself and the terrible things that have happened. I want to know what will happen next; what decision the Home Office will make. It has been a very long time and my solicitor is trying to help me. Things happened that I didn’t like. People asking questions and recording your voice, and some doctor checking my body and saying this time you are fifteen. I talk about this with Frank. It is all very hard to understand.

Meeting with other young people is important. Having something to eat together is good. Someone is cooking food we can all eat. Not like in home. Someone to listen to like Frank. You can get good advice and you can ask questions like. Read books and tell stories. Would like to volunteer to help other young people.

Commentary:

This is a complex story that lays out some of the many difficulties faced by an Unaccompanied Asylum Seeking young person. Much of the anguish and despair encountered, on what would appear to be a daily basis, is captured in the words of the young person. At the heart of the study lies a desire to communicate effectively and actually understand what is going on and why. Support offered through a community-based mentoring service appears to be vital to the young person. The role of the mentor focuses on the provision of personal support in an attempt to respond to a range of complex needs, hopes and aspirations. The idea that the young person and their mentor work together on personal, social and educational needs comes across very strongly. A strong bond of trust seems to exist between the mentor and mentee and because of it, the young person is willing to disclose intimate details and problems. The project is also able to provide another valuable service for the young person – the opportunity to meet and socialize with peers.

The study raises important issues. From the perspective of the young person, dealings with ‘authority’ are underpinned by a strong element of suspicion. Does this have an impact on the provision of care? The mentoring service is provided by volunteers. Is this appropriate? What other resources/support might this young person require in the community?

The material used in the case study is based on original interview material. Any names used are fictitious and the case details have been substantially changed.
Supporting a Victim of Child Abuse

Scenario:

It happened in April, on the Good Friday of Easter... I had to accompany my uncle because I had to help him at something. He was drunk... we went together and only when we reached the edge of the village I realized we’re not going in the right direction... it was too late... he begun to give me back punches, and ask me to go before him... and so it happened (the sexual abuse). I came home and I told my father what happened. I was crying and describing. I was afraid to tell him.

That night the police came... my mother called them. The local police and the police from the city came and also an ambulance. A doctor consulted me in the ambulance and brought me to the city. Before, I was at the scene with the police. In the city, I was seen by a gynaecologist, and then I went to the prosecutor. The Child Protection came and accompanied us. But I didn't know then who they are. It all took long... I was sleepy. The police took us home, and the next day they came after me and my mother and took us to forensic. They behaved well with us.

We stayed three days there and we had to leave the village. We couldn't stay there. People were talking. I couldn't go to school. Grandma was constantly blaming us. That I am to blame... I came here, to my mother’s grandma, in another village. The walls are split, the conditions are bad, we don’t have where to go. And here we can stay only for a period.

We didn’t ask anyone for help. After a while we were looked by the Child Protection, by the lady psychologist. She came to see where we live and she filled in some documents. She gave us her details to contact her and to travel to psychological counselling once a week in the city. The lady agreed to see us on Sunday the only day my mother could accompany me. I began to talk more, to open up more. I was very upset, I was very introverted. I couldn’t talk to my mother. But the lady psychologist helped me a lot to open myself.

Now I rarely go to psychologist, sometimes we don’t have enough money for the road, but I would like to go more often. In the village there is a social worker, but I didn’t contact him. In school we don’t have a counsellor, or a psychologist. But now I can talk to my mother. He (the abuser) knows where we live. But we feel safe. He won't come up here and try to do something bad. However when I go to school I prefer to go with other children... I also go accompanied at the store. We don’t have a restriction order against him.

Commentary:

The case study presents a complex story that emphasises some of the difficulties faced by an abused child and her family face. These difficulties include psychological trauma, a lack of security, social stigma and victim-blaming.

The case was referred to social services by the police, using the standard procedure for intervention. The child faced many personal and family challenges that she had to overcome. The psychological counselling received contributed to increased resilience and social reintegration.

The material used in the case study is based on original interview material. Any names used are fictitious and the case details have been substantially changed.
6. ANALYSIS & COMMENTARY

This section of the report provides detailed analysis and commentary on the data presented in Section 5. In order to provide a consistent structure common headings are used throughout.

6.1. Domestic Violence

Human Rights

Clear evidence is presented to support the view that an understanding of Human Rights exists in the partner countries and the legal and policy frameworks developed reflect this. Within Germany and the UK, human rights issues are embedded in practice and feature prominently in the service provider interviews. This was less true of Romania for a variety of social and political reasons. The Service providers interviewed all stressed the centrality of a human rights framework in developing and delivering services. Service user accounts featured less of an emphasis on the notion of formal rights, but being respected as an individual, being able to access information in appropriate ways and being provided with appropriate access to services were all seen to be important. Service providers also highlighted the difficulty that women and children have in gaining meaningful access to their rights because of their personal circumstances. They also focus on aspects of structural disempowerment.

A tension appears to exist around the progress made in terms of legal and policy development and the ability of children, young people and women to secure their rights.

Legislative and Policy Perspectives

The main legal and policy frameworks appertaining in the three countries are summarised in section 5.1 and it can be seen that at national level they are broadly similar. However, there are much greater variations at the regional and local levels. A number of factors have emerged regarding legislation, policy and practice:

- Economic factors and the willingness of the state or NGOs to fund domestic violence services
- The differing constitutional roles of different tiers of Government in the three countries
- The influence of ‘third sector’ organisations including international NGOs and their role in policy implementation
- Existing community attitudes to domestic violence
- The differing priorities of the agencies involved with the inevitable tendency of the police to see things in criminal justice terms and the tendency of other agencies to focus on rights and support issues

There were also differences in the way in which the balance between interventionist and preventative services are constructed at both the policy and practice levels. Both practitioners and service users, referred to the often fragile and contingent nature of community services, a potentially difficult issue during a period in which most European countries are seeking to restrain public spending. There are a particular set of issues for women who have ‘no recourse to public funds’.
Service users proved themselves able to highlight a range of characteristics that were seen as essential in the development of good quality community-based services (see Section 5.1.6).

**Service Delivery**

The service users interviewed were from a range of cultural backgrounds and had complex histories. Overall, these women reported positive experiences of support services. However, there were a number of themes which emerge that are of policy and practice significance.

The issue of location of services, especially in rural communities, was considered to be important. Women wanted to use services near their home, or in more high risk situations move to another area. The issue of information about service cost was seen as significant. Another significant issue related to the notion of assessment. Whilst those interviewed understood the importance of assessment, it was argued that such a process could be intrusive and overly bureaucratic. On occasions, there was also a tendency not to accept the veracity of women’s accounts.

The provision of shared accommodation was raised by some women in terms of both its benefits in generating a sense of solidarity, but also the problems in terms of privacy and impact on children. Some women also spoke of the dangers of seeing women who experience domestic violence as a single group rather than recognising their complex and variable needs.

Inadequate funding and the low profile of community-based services was seen as an issue by both service users providers. Those interviewed did not express a wish to be involved in the development of services, as personal needs were more pressing. However, they pointed to the important role played by NGOs etc. in lobbying for better resources.

The term ‘community’ is itself a multi-faceted and contested term. There is a long history of community services being provided by women for women often as a form of resistance against dominant community attitudes. As Wilcox (2006) argues, there has been a move in policy terms, to see community in a positive way. However, much of the policy discussion remains undifferentiated and ill-defined.

The international move towards what Anderson (1993) called the ‘residualisation’ of state provided welfare is likely to lead to a greater emphasis on community responses in meeting local need. This is a potentially significant issue in terms of the political profile of domestic violence as an area for future policy development. As more is asked of community-based services, it will become that much more important to consult with service users.
Examples of Good Practice

Whilst it is difficult to remove practice from its local social, cultural and political context and much good practice is derived from developing a specific response to local need, the team identified a number of features of good practice in terms of service user involvement which were of note:

- A general commitment on the part of support services to seek to listen to the women that used them and to develop services in the light of this

- An recognition of the need to provide services which acknowledge the complex role of cultural (in a very broad sense) attitudes to domestic violence

- The need to develop services that can meet specialist needs through direct intervention or referral processes

- The importance of understanding that some service users will have specific cultural and religious needs
Human Trafficking

Human Rights

Human trafficking is an international reality that disproportionately affects women, young people and children. The International Labour Organisation released data (2008) stating that women and children make up 98% of the victims of human trafficking for sexual exploitation and 56% of the victims for human trafficking for the purpose of labour exploitation. In 2009, the US State Department estimated that 80% of transnational trafficking in humans are females. A 2007 report from the German Criminal Office indicated that 95% of the human trafficking victims for sexual exploitation and 61% for labour exploitation were women.

Under the influence of various methods of deception and control by criminal organisations and by persons within their social networks, children, women and men are enslaved for a number of exploitive and abusive purposes. The victims involved are taken from their social and cultural environment (within or outside of national borders), deceived and forced to work and live under slave conditions. Their right to self-determination is stolen. Human rights’ violations occur in the source countries as well as the transit and destination countries. Policy makers and service providers interviewed for this study confirmed that core causes for human trafficking include economic and social imbalances within and between countries, supply of workers and demand for services, low risk investments with high profit potential for traffickers, gender and racial discrimination and violence, cultural practices, corruption, war and restrictive migration policies.

From this study, progress in human rights is demonstrated through the advancement of legislation and policies that increasingly call for and address victims’ rights. The complexity of human trafficking creates political environments that attempt to address international criminality, migration policies, and human rights. Like many countries, Germany, Romania and the UK have focused their primary attention on criminal interventions. It is absolutely necessary to use resources to confront the criminality involved with human trafficking. Progress has been made to address the criminal process in all three countries. However, policies and services to deal with criminality is only one aspect. Access to legal migration, and addressing basic human rights for women and children need to remain prominent.

Service providers share the view that human trafficking and migration are intertwined. Historically and currently, migration is related. in part, to the need to find employment, and the need to leave oppressive or discriminatory regimes. It was recommended that revisiting and revising national policies to enhance legal migration could be seen as a preventative strategy. Additionally, persons from source countries need better access to information about the legalities of emigration and labour laws in the countries they wish to emigrate to.

The awareness and acceptance that the three countries have the obligation to use resources to address the ‘private’ aspects of human trafficking, supports the developing and broadening understanding of human rights. This study documents advancement in this area primarily in Germany and the UK where resources are used to implement comprehensive and coordinated victim based services. In step with a human rights viewpoint, this process must continue to move beyond an individualistic perspective to
the realization that specific groups of people (including women, children, ethnic populations) are more vulnerable to human rights violations because of structural discrimination and are more vulnerable to being trafficked.

Ongoing human rights challenges and difficulties include a lack of resources and services for human trafficking victims working in domestic servitude, irregular migrants involved in seasonal labour, or persons who have been forced to marry. Service providers reported that because state authorities do not have easy access to these groups of persons, they are not well identified, nor do they show up in reports and statistics. Since some victims do not have legal residency or employment status in a country, they may be falsely recognized as illegal migrants and deported without access to their rights.

The right to have secure residency status and support after a criminal trial was requested by some of the interviewees. Service providers from Germany and the UK stated that it can be frustrating to cooperate with foreign authorities and it can be difficult to find common strategies and solutions to safely return persons to their home environments. Policy makers agreed that prevention of the root causes of human trafficking and comprehensive political action must include programmes to fight poverty, promote gender equality, protect women and children from violence, and address social exclusion of vulnerable populations.

**Legislative and Policy Perspectives**

All three countries have policies, legal frameworks, and national action plans to combat human trafficking. Regardless of residency status or the willingness of a victim to be a witness for the State, most policy makers in the three countries agree that human trafficking victims should have access to: safe refuge, psychological support, medical care that goes beyond emergency care, translation services for those who do not speak the local language, legal assistance, access to education for their children, secured residency permits for an adequate length of time to address legal and psychosocial needs, education and training to enhance future work possibilities and legal recourse to receive, when applicable, financial restitution and compensation for damages including pain and suffering, along with psychological rehabilitation for trauma, if necessary. Policy makers and service providers are working together to provide and improve victim-centred services in all three countries, however it is difficult to secure resources, especially in Romania. Policy makers admit that it takes time, persistence, and priority setting to create or improve legislation and to implement action plans. Some service providers interviewed expressed frustration with this process.

International legal provisions and political mandates in the three countries demonstrate the need for multidimensional strategies to address human trafficking. Strategies must focus on prevention measures, protection of citizens, and prosecution of offenders along with the rescue, rehabilitation, and reintegration of victims. Cooperation with authorities and non-governmental organisations in the source, transit and destination countries is of special importance. Although progress is being made in this area, some service providers expressed frustration in aligning priorities and resources to work cooperatively. Since human trafficking is most commonly seen as a criminal case in these countries, successful prosecution of the offender(s) is the primary goal.
Along with this, persons identified as human trafficking victims receive State support only if they are willing to be a witness in a criminal case. Service providers and some policy makers would like to see this changed. For victims to be recognized as persons with interest in pursuing their own civil rights under due process (acquisition of back pay, compensation for pain and suffering, etc) or not, is only secondary and many have not been able to access this legal option because of restrictions in their legal status in the destination country or a lack of information.

**Service Delivery**

Policy makers and service providers understand that the criminal authorities and the nongovernmental organisations have different roles and goals. Since they are interdependent, a cooperative relationship between security authorities and non-governmental organisations is crucial. The primary focus of the criminal justice systems in Germany and the UK is for the successful prosecution of a crime, and evidence along with witness testimony is crucial. The primary focus of the nongovernmental organisations is to protect the personal welfare and social rights of the victim.

Many perpetrators operate and profit within well structured and well financed criminal organisations. However, it is important to recognize that perpetrators may also be members of victims’ personal and social networks. In all three countries, prosecution of human trafficking cases is difficult. Thus, service providers are concerned that there is still a low number of cases being prosecuted, it remains difficult to gain criminal convictions, achieve adequate sentencing, and retrieve compensation for harm done to the victims. Some service users stated that the legal proceedings lasted too long, they had fear to encounter their perpetrators once they were released from custody or prison, and there was a lack of ongoing support after the trials.

The ability to identify human trafficking victims remains problematic. For example, if the focus of the foreign authority is on illegal residency status or illegal work practices, actual victims may not be properly identified by German or UK authorities. In cases of domestic servitude, irregular migrant-based seasonal work, and forced marriage, victims are rarely identified and victim services are difficult to access, especially in the rural areas of Germany and the UK. According to various service providers, because of the dangerous and criminal nature of the milieu, rarely do persons come of their own accord and turn to the aid organisations for assistance. For example, all persons interviewed in Germany were rescued during police raids. Although lives are saved by police intervention, it was reported that too few police are trained to specialise in this field or they are transferred to other positions and cases due to lack of resources and changing priorities within their departments.

The persons interviewed faced many challenges once rescued. They brought complex issues that needed to be addressed in a safe atmosphere. Women reported the following: Some women had a lack of knowledge about the legal and social systems they are involved with once brought to safety. Some mistrusted legal authorities. Most had physical and psychological needs that required medical treatment. Some were unable to speak the language. Others had no documentation as to who they were or where they came from.
Analysis & Commentary (Human Trafficking)

Many were without financial or social resources. Some needed safe refuge for their children. Many of the women had to deal with the stigma and public misunderstandings of being a trafficked victim. Thus services and support by well trained authorities and non-governmental organisations has proved critical in the identification, rescue, rehabilitation and reintegration of victims. Most service users shared that their experiences in shelters, with their attorneys and with most police officers and judges were positive and empowering. They shared that they felt safe, understood, and supported.

One of the main concerns of non-governmental organisations interviewed was securing the financial resources from the governments to deal with the increased number of cases, and to address the ever-changing complexities of human trafficking. Victim service organisations said they need more staff, more beds, more counselling possibilities, more public awareness programmes, and more street workers. Since respect for victim rights and protection are of uppermost importance, policies and action plans written and signed by German, Romanian and UK legislatures need to provide concrete financial and personnel resources to implement and maintain programmes. Low threshold, easily accessible resources need to be distinct from the prosecution of criminal cases. No victim should be forced to testify as a condition to receive community-based services. Ongoing work needs to be done, so that victims are treated respectfully and have the possibility to exercise their full legal and human rights.

Service providers stated that it would be valuable to expand the perspective and explore the motivation of the traffickers and the persons engaged in acquiring services. This would provide helpful information to improve prevention, employment regulations, criminal prosecutions and protection. They also reported that challenging attitudes, stereotypes and prejudices among professionals, e.g. assuming girls from Eastern Europe are sexualized, and challenging views that children and young people can just go back home, and needing to point out that family may be involved in trafficking, is common. Although cooperation among organisations and institutions has helped change public attitude of seeing victims as foreign, illegal culprits to victims of a horrendous crime, professional trainings and public awareness campaigns need to be operating in communities in all three countries.

Service User Involvement

In human trafficking cases, the violation of the basic right of self determination, the traumatic and frightening working and living conditions, and the need for physical and psychological safety requires persons working in the field to have sensitivity and empathy with service users. Persons in organisations advocate for victims and support them to recover, rehabilitate and reintegrate back home, or in a new environment.

Service users have the right to privacy and safety, and it is important that their involvement and contributions to service programmes is based on their free choice and without further harm or additional trauma. When appropriate, some victims may wish to talk out about their experience(s), and survivor groups could be organised and strengthened to provide a supportive environment for survivors to share their stories.
Others choose to quietly move on with their lives. Still others remain vulnerable to the stresses their experiences have caused.

Since human trafficking is global, their voices and stories are shared in many languages. A unified effort is required to stop the violence by: continuing to raise awareness of human trafficking; taking steps to address local, national, and international systems to ensure coordinated and effective practices; providing victim services with adequate funding; and placing the human rights of all persons as the highest priority for all countries.

**Good Practice**

Although interviews with service users demonstrate the need to address both the criminal and the psychosocial aspects of care (counselling, psychotherapy, medical care, etc), services for women are still often delegated without assigning an advocate competent in dealing with the interaction between social and psychological factors to accompany service users throughout the whole process. This leaves individuals without sufficient support to deal with complex social, legal and cultural aspects, as well as experiencing a too limited focus on psychophysical symptoms of post traumatic stress, or an uncoordinated service system. Thus, professions need to have the qualifications and skills to combine these multiple aspects to be able to offer comprehensive service.

In assessing direct responses from service users, it proved possible to identify good practice qualities among providers. These good practice qualities include:

- The capability to provide physical and psychological safety for women and their children
- The capability to have a well trained professional (clinical social worker) to coordinate the physical and psychological needs of women and children including gynaecological issues, trauma / post traumatic stress disorder, etc
- The ability to understand the complex phenomenon of human trafficking and its consequences and address the social stigmata that victims of human trafficking face
- The ability to have empathy and respect for a service user’s individual experiences and needs
- The ability to understand and work with gender issues and intercultural differences.
- The ability to clearly differentiate the status and spheres affecting human trafficking victims from prostitutes, asylum seekers, and illegal immigrants
- The commitment to advocate for the human rights of the women and children. This includes addressing issues such as residency security, adequate social welfare services, support during and after criminal / civil court hearings, and international coordination of services between countries
- The awareness that victims seldom seek out services on their own. Service providers need to be skilled and available to actively reach victims. They need a safe place to be able to talk to police, outreach workers, etc.
- The awareness and sensitivity that some individuals are unable to speak the language or understand what is being said or what they read. It is important to
• be able to communicate (written and verbal) and counsel in the mother languages of the women receiving services
• The awareness of trust issues and respect for those who may wish to speak with and/or talk about details of their experiences with a specific staff member and to have adequate staffing to accommodate this request
6.3. Violence And Abuse Against Children & Young People

Human Rights

It is clear from the evidence generated that policy and practice developments are significantly influenced by both global and European human rights conventions and legislation. The focus of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) is particularly influential in terms of fostering the ‘protection’, ‘prevention’ and ‘participatory’ rights of the young. What comes through the data is that violence against the young takes many forms but its significance, in terms of impact on ‘physical, mental, spiritual and social development’ (UNCRC article 27), is profound and enduring.

Policy responses reflect the demands of the UNCRC and related legislation. We found examples of policy and practice approaches being used in an attempt to counter ‘sexual exploitation’ and ‘child sexual abuse’, and in the UK rights based work is being promoted that responds to the ‘illegal use of firearms’ and ‘gang related’ crime. Key legislative frameworks, such as Law No. 272/2004 in Romania and the Children Act (2004) in the UK, place the welfare of the child, and its safety, at the centre of policy at a national and local level. The development of responses to abuses of human rights in relation to Human Trafficking is significant.

Progress is far from uniform as might be expected. The promotion of human rights requires a high level of political commitment. It requires a consistent level of legislation and policy ‘testing’. It requires a level of philosophical commitment that is not diminished by political and resource challenges. For the young people featured in this research, their rights were considered to be important. They displayed a sophisticated level of understanding as to what they considered to be ‘right’ and ‘wrong’ and why. Matters of justice, fairness and trust mattered and were reflected both in an understanding of the problems they faced and what constituted a good level of support from a community-based service. Some young people wanted their rights more clearly explained and asserted by those working with them. They struggled to understand systems dominated by legal requirements that were intrusive and, on occasions, potentially degrading e.g. being subjected to a physical examination.

Legislation and Policy Perspectives

In both countries a level of action planning is revealed. Through the development of national and local action plans attempts are made to prioritize policy responses in a relatively concise way. However, it is difficult to obtain a clear view as to how the voice of service users is consistently captured through such processes. Networks made up of local and national charities, NGOs and third sector organisations play a vital role in lobbying political groups and parties. Their influence appears significant in helping to shape priorities (although not without challenge and resistance). However, much more needs to be done to secure the views of children and young people. Many of the young people featured in this research exist on the ‘margins’; as one commented ‘I am not used to anyone asking me my views and ideas’.

Changes in the political climate appear to have a major influence in shaping legislation and policy. Examples of what might be usefully termed as ‘policy disconnections’ are apparent in both countries. What happens at a national level in policy making terms, does not always translate into action at a local level. Issues of resistance, intransigence and ambiguity were revealed through the policy maker, and service manager and
practitioner interviews. Those running and delivering services expressed a sense of disappointment and disillusionment that they could not respond in a more holistic way to the desires, needs and ambitions of young people.

Policy development, from the perspective of service users, assumes a higher level of relevance and significance when efforts are made to explain potential outcomes and implications. The assumption cannot be made that because a particular policy, or approach, is deemed as relevant by policy makers, service managers and practitioners that view will be shared by the children and young people using a particular community-based service. The importance of establishing effective avenues for communication is important here.

Policy coordination at a local level remains a challenge. Clearly, in Romania, much still needs to be done to connect national and local policy strategies and priorities. Structures are being constructed to support this process. However, at the present time, bureaucratic, political and financial constraints are having a significant impact on such developments. Concerns about the range of interventions available, the expansion of networks for rehabilitation and the social reintegration of children are being prioritised as areas for future development. In the UK policy development is frequently shaped by the interventions, priorities and intentions of various government departments at a national and local level. Sometimes those policy ambitions are congruent and sometimes they are not. For example, matters of prosecution, surveillance, prevention and protection do not necessarily sit easily alongside each other.

Service Delivery

The young people interviewed as part of the research process, were able to articulate what they saw as the key characteristics in the development of a ‘good service’ (see section 5.3.6). A consistent connection was made between geographical/community location and the likelihood of them accessing the service. Such a response appears entirely understandable when consideration is given to the kind of challenges and problems service users are likely to be facing. The dangers of disclosure are multifarious. Young people see support from ‘adults like yourself who understand and better still come from your community’, as highly important. For victims of violence, the need to ensure personal safety seems to be extremely important, as is the fact that service users demand integrity and respect from those working with them.

The need to mitigate the impact of risk is important for young people. They saw the provision of support and guidance in decision making processes to be important. There was a realisation that in becoming involved in a community-based project you had to take risks by virtue of exposing particular problems and issues for scrutiny and examination by practitioners and, in some instances, peers. Such risks were weighed against potential outcomes and benefits as defined by themselves and others.

Young people also welcomed the opportunity to give and receive constructive feedback (although a number of those involved commented on how difficult this was in the beginning). Involvement in evaluation processes was seen as important in terms of developing and increasing levels of participation. Yet, it is fair to say, that in some instances evaluation processes were somewhat superficial in terms of both their design
and intentions. There was an over-reliance on written feedback in some projects (often to meet the demands of external funders/evaluators).

Age related competence, cultural background and educational attainment appeared to influence practitioner views of the ability of young people to be involved in evaluation systems. Some evidence of what might be best described as ‘tokenistic’ participation was also found.

**Good Practice**

Although the community-based projects examined offer services designed to meet the needs of specific groups of young people, it proved possible to identify some key areas of good practice that influence policy and practice development. These include:

- The need to adapt to the changing nature of young people’s experiences of violence and its specific manifestations e.g. the growth of cyber bullying
- The development of community-based provision that actively encourages the participation of young people in the design, development and evaluation of the services offered
- A strong emphasis being placed on safeguarding children and young people and acting as advocates (or encouraging opportunities for self-advocacy) where appropriate
- The realisation that supporting young people who are the victims of violence is likely to require multi-layered interventions in social care, health and education

Community-based service provision can be improved by viewing young people as capable and effective social actors when it comes to resolving their problems. The act of befriending and supporting young people can have positive outcomes. Respectful relationships are only likely to develop if grounded in mutual respect and trust. The young people interviewed for this project enjoyed the relationships they had with the adults who worked with them. For the most part, such feelings were reciprocated by service managers and practitioners.
7. CONCLUSIONS

The specific objective of the research project was to gain a clearer understanding of the ability of community-based support services to meet the needs of children, young people and women who have experienced abuse, exploitation or trafficking. In order to achieve this, the research team set out to capture the voices of service users in order to gain a clearer understanding of their problems, expectations and aspirations.

At the same time, it was considered important to explore policy maker, service manager and practitioner perceptions of the nature of the services they deliver and the challenges and dilemmas faced. It was also considered important to develop a robust contextual base through which the research data could be best understood by analysing the impact of various human rights conventions, legislation and policy initiatives at a global, European, country and regional level. In this section some concluding thoughts are offered on the outputs generated, methodological approach adopted and how the research project contributes to existing knowledge and understanding.

Research Participants

From the outset it was recognised that considerable effort would be needed to make contact with, and speak to, some of the most marginalised and isolated individuals and groups within society. Trafficked women and young people, victims of domestic abuse and forced marriages, and young people who are attempting to flee the outcomes of gang membership and exploitation, are often highly vulnerable, at risk and isolated. As the research evidence indicates, seeking access to community-based support services is often generated by a sense of personal desperation and triggered by an issue or event where ‘the end of the line’ is reached.

In recognition of such difficulties and dilemmas, it was necessary to approach potential participants in a sensitive way. Most introductions were directly facilitated by those managing and running services. Research participants had to be convinced of the value of the research and its aims. It was vitally important to guarantee absolute anonymity; to guarantee personal safety; to agree the content of particular conversations. For the research to provide opportunities for a high degree of self-advocacy on the part of service users, those involved had to understand its aims and the possible need to explore intimate and potentially distressing details where necessary.

The interviews with policy makers, service managers and practitioners served a number of important functions in developing the overall context of the research project. We wanted to capture the political, social and economic climate in the three partner countries. We needed to understand (from a range of perspectives) the drivers for policy change; the political climate that shaped and to a significant extent dominated actions; resource constraints and how these impacted on priorities at a national and local level.

All three countries had a different ‘tale to tell’ in terms of their ability to design and deliver effective networks of community-based services. It was evident that political differences, ideological commitments and policy choices and preferences, had a direct impact on what was actually delivered. In all of the three partner countries NGOs, ‘third
sector’ organisations and national and local charitable bodies played a significant role in developing and delivering services.

The finances for developing community-based services to victims of violence were, to a significant extent, shaped by resource availability at both national and local levels. The vast majority of the service providers featured in this research struggled to maintain a sound financial base for their activities. How much more difficult is this likely to be in the current global financial climate?

**Community-based Services**

The interviews conducted with service users, managers and practitioners assisted in the construction of a model for developing community-based service delivery. Taking into account the different priorities for service development articulated in the three partner countries, a number of common factors and issues emerged from discussions with service users. It was generally asserted that for a service to seen as effective and supportive, it needs to be:

- **Easily accessible with limited bureaucratic obstacles**: services users talked about the daunting prospect (real or imaginary) of completing assessment processes, providing ‘evidence’, etc. They raised issues of geographical location, staying near to ‘their roots’ and not becoming socially isolated.

- **Capable of offering a high degree of personal safety, confidentiality and anonymity**: these matters dominated many interviews with service users.

- **Able to understand and respond to the complex needs of potential users**: needs were generally expressed in terms of short and longer term requirements. Service users were able, with support, to voice and understand the complexity of the problems they face.

- **Able to offer a level of personal support and guidance at key points in time**: the provision of an advocate, mentor or ‘friend’ was seen to be particularly important.

- **Capable of providing specific forms of therapeutic, social and personal support**: service users spoke of the value of psychological and personal counselling, social group work and individual support.

- **Able to provide detailed information on how to access specialised services**: here, service users particularly focused on legal support, health related services, future educational opportunities.

- **Willing to explore options and risks in ‘moving on’ and prepare individuals for such a significant transition**: This was seen as a key aspect of the work of a community-based service. It was an issue that generally concerned service users.
CONCLUSIONS

It is evident from the research data gathered that the development of effective services requires a high level of trust on the part of service users as well as those working with them. In many of the examples of practice explored, individuals proved themselves to be willing to disclose aspects of their lives for examination and scrutiny once they believed that they were going to be treated with respect and dignity. For this to happen, strong lines of communication have to be established.

It is also evident from the study that the provision of high quality community-based services requires the provision of appropriate levels of staffing. The work can be demanding and time consuming. Service users expect to receive a level of support that is proportionate to the problems and difficulties they face – this can be intensive and costly.

Almost all of the projects explored rely on the provision of externally funded multidisciplinary, multiagency and multiprofessional support to deliver effective community-based provision. Strong links with the local police, legal support systems and social care, health and welfare agencies, were considered important if the complex needs of victims of violence are to be met. Specialised services, such as trauma counselling or group therapy, were also required by particular groups and individuals.

Advocacy and Human Rights

The promotion of advocacy opportunities and discussion of human rights, significantly contributed towards the construction of the framework around which the research project is based. The intention from the outset was to promote Daphne III aims concerning the need to encourage the ‘positive treatment’, ‘well-being’, equality and ‘self-fulfilment’ of those who are the victims of violence, exploitation and trafficking. Human rights criteria, enshrined in a variety of charters and legislation, provide some of the essential criteria for evaluating the nature and responsiveness of the services provided at a community level.

Whilst it is clear that there has been considerable progress made in developing policy and services which recognise the rights of service users, it is less clear how those who have experienced the various forms of violence discussed in this report assert their rights in a meaningful way, for a range of social, economic and political reasons. Much of the work involves a high level of crisis management with groups of people who believe their life experiences have ‘stripped’ them of their rights. A great deal more work is required before the development of appropriate advocacy opportunities, and the proactive fostering of human rights, is secured.

The Importance of Voice

As a comparative study, the intention from the outset was to capture the voice of service users in three countries – Germany, Romania and the United Kingdom. We wanted to compare and contrast what people had to say. We wanted to track similarities and differences in the views of participants. We wanted to ascertain if women, and children and young people, shared or had different perceptions of what constituted a ‘good’ community-based service. We also wanted to see how social, economic and community factors influence perception and need.
What emerged from the stories recounted was a greater understanding of why, and in what circumstances, victims of violence are likely to avail themselves of different forms of community-based service. Details of the violence suffered, its enduring nature and outcomes, featured across many of the interviews. We had to gain an understanding of these matters to really understand what kinds of services victims needed and wanted. We are aware that the challenges facing someone fleeing from a human trafficker, a violent spouse, someone who has sexually abused them, or stabbed them, may be different. Yet, in providing space for people to talk about these experiences a clearer picture is produced of their specific and shared needs and aspirations. To be beaten, oppressed or exploited by someone in Germany, Romania or the United Kingdom produces many similar feelings and emotions – anger, fear, social isolation etc. Not unsurprisingly, individual and collective expressions of need could be clearly related to such feelings and emotions. Women fear for themselves and their families; young people may experience alienation and ‘disrespect’.

We used the interview data generated to isolate specific themes and issues for examination and analysis. We are not in a position to comment on the effectiveness of legislation and policy across, or within, specific countries. That was not the intention of the report. However, it is clear that where particular legislative or policy approaches are adopted, they impact on community-based service development and implementation in very specific ways. We wanted to explore the views of service users in order to gauge that impact. We wanted the same service users to help us understand what constitutes a good service and, where appropriate, identify examples of practices that meet their needs.

We attempted to explore how far, and to what extent, victims of violence are directly involved in aspects of service development and evaluation. For the most part, this appears to depend on personal motivation and situation. We didn’t discover a significant number of examples of where service users are actually involved in management bodies or other forms of decision making. This is perhaps too much to ask for from a person who might be in the middle of a long legal battle, or working through psychological trauma. However, service managers and practitioners gave examples of where former service users are now participating in the day to day running of projects. Some have become trained practitioners and are now involved in aspects of service delivery. Service users also spoke of the ways in which group and individual opportunities are offered to evaluate the quality of service being offered. It proved more difficult to establish the frequency of such opportunities and the use that is made of the feedback.
CONCLUSIONS

Issues for the Future

The project has gone some considerable way towards meeting its original objectives in relation to the requirements of the European Commission’s Daphne III programme. We have attempted to reflect, through the research, the requirement for Member States to provide relevant ‘support’ and ‘protection’ at a community level as part of wider strategic policy and practice developments. At the heart of the research lies a philosophically driven aspiration to directly involve service users in the design, delivery and evaluation of services. Such an approach reflects wider academic and practitioner concerns about the necessity for service users to be empowered through direct consideration of their views and experiences.

Clearly, global financial forces are likely to have a significant influence on the level of financial resources made available to support work within this area. Yet, even where scare resources are available, it is imperative to gain the most reliable picture of the kind of services that should be offered within a community; the priorities that should be pursued; the needs and expectations of actual and potential consumers. The authors of this report have attempted to provide a framework through which it might prove possible to explore with service users their views on the kind of community-based services they would like to see in place. Without that VOICE, much of what is provided may well prove to be irrelevant, marginal and inappropriate.


Law no. 329 of 5 November 2009 on the reorganisation of certain public authorities and public institutions, on the rationalization of public spending, on the support of the business environment and on the abiding by the frame-agreements with the European Commission and with the International Monetary Fund published in the Official Gazette of Romania, Part I, no. 761 of November 9, 2009.


Law no. 217/2003 to prevent and fight against domestic violence (Published in the Official Gazette of Romania, Part I, no. 367/May 29, 2003)

Law no. 39/2003 regarding the preventing and combating of organised crime, published in the Romanian Official Gazette, Part One, No. 50, of January 29, 2003;


Order No. 177/2003 for the approval of the mandatory minimum standards for the children’s hotline, the mandatory minimum standards for the counselling centre for the abused, neglected and exploited child, as well as of the mandatory minimum standards for the community resource centre for the prevention of child abuse, neglect and exploitation published in the Romanian Official Gazette, Part I, No. 52, January 22, 2004;

Order no. 89/2004 for the approval of minimum standards for emergency reception centres for abused, neglect or exploited children, published in the Romanian Official Gazette, Part I, No. 759, August 19, 2004;


Penal Code, approved through Law no. 286/2009 (published in The Official Gazette of Romania No. 510 of July 2009)


The Daphne Project Team 2009 – 2011:
Newman University College, Lucian Blaga University & Alice Salomon University

Stan Tucker: Senior Academic Adviser
Emeritus Professor of Education and Social Policy at Newman University College. Research interests include safeguarding children and young people, pastoral care in education and understanding perceptions of risk. Substantial national and international publication profile.

Madeline Martyn: Project Manager/Researcher
Project Manager/Researcher for the Daphne Project Team 2009-11 at Newman University College. Management and learning consultant for a range of organisations in public, private and third sector contexts.

Graham Brotherton: Academic Adviser
Senior Lecturer and Programme Leader for Working with Children, Young People and Families at Newman University College. Currently researching how practitioners working with ‘vulnerable’ families construct their role and their perceptions of the families.

Horațiu Rusu: Academic Adviser
Associate Professor of Sociology/Head of Sociology and Social Work at Lucian Blaga University of Sibiu. Lecturing, research and publication profile includes identities construction, values and social change or the social effects of European integration in postcommunist countries.

Anca Bejenaru: Researcher
Lecturer in Social Work at Lucian Blaga University of Sibiu. Main field of study is social work with children and families. Current research interests include child adoption, violence against children, young people and women and social work in schools.

Silke Gahleitner: Academic Adviser
Professor for Clinical Psychology and Social Work at Alice Salomon University of Applied Sciences in Berlin. Lecturing, research and publication profile includes psychosocial diagnostic, psychotherapy and counselling, psychotraumatology and qualitative research.

Connie Gunderson: Researcher/Academic Adviser
Lecturer at Alice Salomon University of Applied Sciences in Berlin and HAWK Hochschule in Hildesheim. Lecturer and researcher in the field of social work, gender and diversity. Doctoral candidate in Intercultural Education at the University of Bremen, Germany.

Funded by the European Commission’s Daphne III Programme 2007 – 2013