

Nanoparticle toxicology Scientific state-of-the-art

Ken Donaldson, University of Edinburgh Edinburgh, Scotland





The current model for the hypothetical toxicokinetics and harmful effects of manufactured nanoparticles





Based on CDNP in PM10 in epi studies and a few bulkproduced manufactured NP in animals and intuition

Likely pathogenic processes in adverse effect of NP at portals of entry and target tissues







State of the art in:-

- 1. The oxidative stress hypothesis
- 2. Toxicokinetics and translocation
- 3. The large numbers of particles that require testing in vitro models and structure activity paradigms
- 4. The effects on the cv system
- 5. Long thin nanoparticles and the asbestos issue

The central role of inflammation in diseases especially those associated with particle exposure







State of the art:- The oxidative stress hypothesis



Table 2. NM effects as the basis for pathophysiology and toxicity. Effects supported by limited experimental evidence are marked with asterisks; effects supported by limited clinical evidence are marked with daggers.

Experimental NM effects	Possible pathophysiological outcomes		
ROS generation*	Protein, DNA and membrane injury,* oxidative stress†		
Oxidative stress*	Phase II enzyme induction, inflammation,† mitochondrial perturbation*		
Mitochondrial perturbation*	Inner membrane damage,* permeability transition (PT) pore opening,* energy failure,* apoptosis,* apo-necrosis, cytotoxicity		
Inflammation*	Tissue infiltration with inflammatory cells,† fibrosis,† granulomas,† atherogenesis,† acute phase protein expression (e.g., C-reactive protein)		
Uptake by reticulo-endothelial system*	Asymptomatic sequestration and storage in liver,* spleen, lymph nodes,† possible organ enlargement and dysfunction		
Protein denaturation, degradation*	Loss of enzyme activity,* auto-antigenicity		
Nuclear uptake*	DNA damage, nucleoprotein clumping,* autoantigens		
Uptake in neuronal tissue*	Brain and peripheral nervous system injury		
Perturbation of phagocytic function,* "particle overload," mediator release*	Chronic inflammation,† fibrosis,† granulomas,† interference in clearance of infectious agents†		
Endothelial dysfunction, effects on blood clotting*	Atherogenesis,* thrombosis,* stroke, myocardial infarction		
Generation of neoantigens, breakdown in immune tolerance	Autoimmunity, adjuvant effects		
Altered cell cycle regulation	Proliferation, cell cycle arrest, senescence		
DNA damage	Mutagenesis, metaplasia, carcinogenesis		

Nel, A., T. Xia, L. Madler, and N. Li. 2006. Toxic potential of materials at the nanolevel *Science* 311:622-627.

Key questions-

- 1. Is oxidative stress a generic mechanism for the adverse effects of nanoparticles- at Portals of Entry, at target sites?
- 2. Can it form a basis for predictive testing?







Is oxidative stress a generic mechanism for nanoparticles?

- •Oxidative stress is an attractive mechanism due to:-
- its ability to kick-off inflammation
- •To be caused by inflammation

 Its known role in the adverse effects of all previously identified pathogenic particles and in all the diseases associated with particle exposures

• Is oxidative stress a generic mechanism for the adverse effects of nanoparticles- at POE, at target sites?

• Piecemeal data still emerging that NP cause oxidative stress:-

C60, cerium oxide, TiO2, carbon black, carbon nanotubes, silica, etc.

•Other data suggests that NP are anti-oxidant:-

cerium oxide, C60, platinum

Contrasting findings for oxidant/antioxidant status of C60



C60 is an antioxidant and protects against CCI4 injury in rats

Gharbi, N., M. Pressac, M. Hadchouel, H. Szwarc, S. R. Wilson, and F. Moussa. 2005. [60] fullerene is a powerful antioxidant in vivo with no acute or subacute toxicity. *Nano Lett.* 5:2578-2585.





Can free radical generation by NP form the basis of a screening strategy for detecting pro-inflammatory particles

Nonmentiale	$C \Lambda (M ^{2}/r)$	Mass (mg)			
	SA(IVI /g) -	300 cm ²	1500cm ²	3000 cm ²	
CeO2	24	1250	6250	12500	
NiO	92	326	1630	3261	
TiO ₂ (Rutile)	28	1071	5357	10714	
TiO ₂ (Anatase)	259	116	579	1158	
SiO ₂	523	57	287	574	
MgO	42	714	3572	7143	
Co3O4	35	857	4285	8571	
ZnO	50	600	3000	6000	
Al ₂ O ³ (nanowhiskers)	250	120	600	1200	
Al ₂ O ₃ (Taimincron)	221	136	678	1357	
AI2O3(GE30)	25	1200	6000	12000	
Al ₂ O ₃ (A125)	103	291	1456	2913	
Carbon black	254	118	591	1182	
Fine Carbon black	7.9	3798	18940	37880	



Data courtesy of Dr Sen Lin Lu



Free radical generation by a panel of metal oxide nanoparticles at equal surface area dose



Free radical intensity is ameliorated by antioxidants





Selected NP tested for ability to cause inflammation in rat lungs at equal surface area dose



A larger inflammation study needs to be carried out for more particles.donaldson@ed.ac.uk



State of the art:-Toxicokinetics and dosimetry

Toxicokinetics





- •All of the translocation data is weak and piecemeal
- •No mass balance toxicokinetics for any nanoparticle
- •So no proper dosimetry for target organ toxicity

More good translocation data urgently required

Micro-toxicokinetics – size-related compartmentalisation?





Geiser, M., B. Rothen-Rutlshauser, N. Kapp, S. Schurch, W. Kreyling, H. Schulz, Semmler M, H. Im, V, J. Heyder, and P. Gehr. 2005. Ultrafine particles cross cellular membranes by non-phagocytic mechanisms in lungs and in cultured cells. *Environ Health Perspect*. 113:1555-1560

Li, N., C. Sioutas, A. Cho, D. Schmitz, C. Misra, J. Sempf, M. Wang, T. Oberley, J. Froines, and A. Nel. 2003. Ultrafine particulate pollutants induce oxidative stress and mitochondrial damage Environ Health Perspect. 111:455-460. Chen, M. and A. von Mikecz. 2005. Formation of nucleoplasmic protein aggregates impairs nuclear function in response to SiO2 nanoparticles. *Experimental Cell Research* 305:51-62.

Compartment-related toxicity?







State-of-the-art:- The problem of testing large numbers of particles - in vitro models and structure activity paradigms

A range of fine and nanoparticle-sized low toxicity, low solubility particles cause inflammation in relation to surface area dose, not mass dose





Duffin R, Clouter A, Brown DM, C. L. Tran, MacNee W, Stone V, and Donaldson K. 2002. The importance of surface area and specific reactivity in the acute pulmonary inflammatory response to particles. *Ann Occup. Hyg* 46 Suppl 1:242-245.



In vitro systems such as the A549 epithelial cell line can model the lung inflammatory response and detect differences in surface reactivity



Duffin, R., L. Tran, D. Brown, V. Stone, and K. Donaldson. 2007. Proinflammogenic effects of low-toxicity and metal nanoparticles in vivo and in vitro: highlighting the role of particle surface area and surface reactivity *Inhal. Toxicol.* 19:849-856.

3) State-of-the-art:- The problem of testing large numbers of particle - in vitro models and structure activity paradigms

Definition

Quantitative correlation of the biological (toxicological) activity to the structure of chemical compounds (particles)

Which structures?	Which activities?				
Size/Surface area	Oxidative stress				
Free radical generation	Pro-inflammatory Generic				
Charge	Translocation				
Adsorption	Genotoxicity				
Crystallinity	Neuronal action potential				
Coatings	Platelet aggregation				
Metals	Ftc				
Surface derivatisation					

etc.

We need a QSAR to deal with the huge numbers of NP types and their variants Everyone who carries out good characterisation could be adding to the QSAR model

		intensity, known as static light scattering (SLS) and of time dependent scattered intensity due to density or/and concentration flue*uations, often known photon correlation spectroscory (PCS) or dynamic light scattering (DLS).	[3]
	Acoustic spectroscopy	Utraiourd : pectros to by (alculates printible silve distribution) based on the alternia to not sound twaves when passing through the medium. It can measure particle size from a few nanometers to several hundred µm. No sample preparation is needed.	[4]
	Electron microscopy	Transmission Electron Microscopy (TEM) is often used for the direct examination of particles in the size range 0.001 to 5 μ m. The TEM produces an image on a fluorescent screen or a photographic plate by means of an electron beam. Analysis is often carried out on the images recorded photographically. Scanning Electro Microscopy (SEM) is caused to scan across the sample in a series of parallel tracks. The SEM is considerably faster and gives more 3-D details than the TEM. Resolutions of SEM are between 15 – 20 nm, while TEM can reach 0.13-0.5 nm. Sample preparation is very important for both SEM and TEM. SEM and TEM can provide individual particle size information as well as PSD.	[5]
Specific surface area	BET	The theory developed in 1938 by Brunauer, Emmett, and Teller (BET theory) about the physical adsorption of gas molecules on a solid surface can be used to estimate specific surface area based on experimental adsorption data.	[6] [3]
Shape/ Dimensions	Electron microscopy	It is widely accepted that size along often based on a volumetric equivalent diameter is not sufficient for describing the particle size and geometrical dimensions. Electron microscopic imaging and image analysis can be used to determine the shape of particles. Shape can be described by descriptors that have physical meanings such as maximum length and roundness. Such descriptors cannot reconstruct the original shape. Latent shape descriptors such as Fourier descriptors and principal component analysis can be used to reconstruct the original shape because they lose less original shape information.	[3] [7]
Surface chemistry Surface Elements	X-ray photon spectroscopy / / Raman/ potentiometric titrations/ Isoelectric point/ peryme adsorption /-Atonic Fyrce Nicroscop/-based scanning probe techniques	Surface chemistry / Surface elements can be characterised by X-ray photo spectroscopy [8] [9], Raman spectroscopy [10][11], potentiometric titrations, Isoelectric point and polymer adsorption [12] AFM can be used to observe the nucleation at surface.	^[8] [9] [10] [1] [1] [1] [1] [1] [1] [1] [1] [1] [1
Bulk chemical composition	energy dispersive X-ray spectroscopy / ICP-MS / SIMS	Chemical composition can be measured by energy dispersive X-ray spectroscopy [13,114,15], Inductively Coupled Plasma Mass Spectrometry (ICP-MS) [16] and secondary ion mass spectroscopy (SIMS) [17]	[13] [14] [15] [16] [17]
Surface porosity	N ₂ gas adsorption / Hg porosimetry	Mercury intrusion porosimetry can be used for determination of the average pore size, pore volume, pore size and void distribution and bulk density (pore diameter size range 8 nm – 15 μ m). N ₂ gas adsorption can also be used for the same purpose. (0,5 nm – 100 nm)	[18] [3]
Roughness	N ₂ gas adsorption / SEM/TEM/AFM	The roughness factor <i>r</i> is used as an index which shows the complexity of the solid surface, $r = S_{N2} / S_d$. is the surface area measured by the N ₂ adsorption, and is the apparent surface area estimated from particle diameter. When $r > 1$, it is presumed that roughness on a molecular order exists in the surface. More recently, fractal dimensions (i.e. descriptors) are used to describe roughness which can be estimated from SEM / TEM / AFM image analysis.	[3] [19] [20]

Morphology	Electron microscopy	For crystalline particles, for the same polymorph, there may have different morphology or shape. Electron microscopy imaging and image analysis can be used to determine the morphology.		
Agglomeration status	Electroacoustic spectrometry/Acoustic attenuation spectrometry/ Light microscopy/ ranulometry	Agglomeration is a mass-conserving, but number-reducing process that shifts the particle distribution towards larger sizes. Agglomeration can be characetrised by a variety of instruments e.g. dynamic light scateering , AFM, acoustic spectrometry and electroacoustic spectrometry.	[4] [21] [22] [23]	
Crystalinity (better called Crystal polymorph or crystalline form)	X-ray diffraction / Raman	Identical chemicals can exist in different polymorphs due to the varied molecular arrangements in the solid state phase. Different polymorphs can have very different physical and chemical properties such as melting point, solubility, density, stability, and bioavailability for drug molecules. X-ray diffraction (XRD) is the most widely accepted technique for determination of polymorphs of a compound, A polymorph has a unique three-dimensional internal structure arrangement (but regular), therefore provides a particular diffraction pattern. Other techniques such as Raman spectroscopy were also investigated for polymorph identification.	[24]	
Crystal structure				
Charge/ zeta potential	Light scattering / electro acoustic spectroscopy	Zeta potential refers to the electrostatic potential generated by the accumulation of ions at the surface of a colloidal particle that is key to define the stability of a colloid system. Zeta potential can be measured by dynamic light scattering and ultrasound	[24] [25][26] [4]	
Magnetic properties	photoelectron spectroscopy and x-ray absorption spectroscopy.	Electronic properties of magnetic nano-sized systems can be studied by photoelectron spectroscopy and x-ray absorption spectroscopy. [3, Cpater 3.4]	[3]	
Chemical stability /biopersistence	Dissolution rate measurement in vitro	Biopersistence / chemical stability can be assessed by measuring dissolution rate in vitro	[27,[28] [29]	
Acidity		Surface acidity of the oxide surface is predictable to some degree based on the chemical property of the atom composition [3, p71]. Surface acidity can me beasured using microcalorimeter [30]	[3] [30]	
Redox potential	Electrodes	Redox potential (also known as standard reduction /oxidation potential) indicates the tendency of a chemical species to acquire electrons and thereby be reduced. Each species has its own intrinsic reduction potential. Redox potential is measured in volts (V) or millivolts (mV), and is often defined relative to the standard hydrogen electrode (potential of 0.00 volts). In practice, Ag/AgCI and saturated calomel reference electrodes are commonly used. Redox potential measurement is inexpensive, straightforward and requires little maintenance.	[31]	donalds
Oxidative stress	Electron paramagnetic	Electron paramagnetic resonance (EPR, also named electron spin resonance, ESR) is a spectroscopic technique in which free	[32]	i.uorialusi





State of the art:- Cardiovascular effects of particles



4) State of the art Cardiovascular effects of particles -



The main target of concern if the PM10 data is telling us about combustion derived nanoparticle effects



Two pathways for the cv effects of inhaled nanoparticles







Studying atherothrombotic effects in toxicology studies

Human chamber studies Endothelial dysfunction Coagulability of the blood Cardiac blood flow/electrical activity Mediators/oxidative tress

Rodent models Atherogenesis Thrombogenesis Blood vessel function Mediators Forearm plethysmography Badimon chamber ECG Fibrinogen, tPA

ApoE mice Thrombosis models Blood vessel myography Fibrinogen etc

Endothelial dysfunction after diesel exhaust inhalation





Diesel exhaust nanoparticles (300ug/m³ for 1 hour)



Mills, N. L., H. Tornqvist, S. D. Robinson, M. Gonzalez, K. Darnley, W. MacNee, N. A. Boon, K. Donaldson, A. Blomberg, T. Sandstrom, and D. E. Newby. 2005. Diesel exhaust inhalation causes vascular dysfunction and impaired endogenous fibrinolysis *Circulation* 112:3930-3936.

The sequential electrical activation of the heart P-, QRS- and T-waves in the ECG.



•ST usually slanted slightly upward

•In coronary artery disease the blood flow to the heart is compromised.

- If oxygen delivery is not sufficient, ischemia results in the ventricular myocardium.
- •The ischemic tissue cannot maintain the membrane potential.
- •This is seen as displacement of ST segment downwards
- •The larger the ischemic area, the greater this deviation.

S-T segment depression in patients with stable Coronary Heart Disease exercising in air or dilute diesel exhaust





Inschaemic burden = Duration of exercise x change in ST segment depression

Mills, N. L., H. Tornqvist, M. C. Gonzalez, E. Vink, S. D. Robinson, S. Soderberg, N. A. Boon, K. Donaldson, T. Sandstrom, A. Blomberg, and D. E. Newby. 2007. Ischemic and thrombotic effects of dilute diesel-exhaust inhalation in men with coronary heart disease. *N. Engl. J Med* 357:1075-1082.

Studying thrombosis in humans after diesel exhaust inhalation The Badimon Chamber





Courtesy of Dr Andy Lucking



Effect of Diesel Exhaust on Thrombus Formation in the Badimon Chamber

Diesel exhaust nanoparticles (300ug/m³ for 1 hour)



Lucking et al. in press AJRCCM

Courtesy of Dr Andy Lucking

Data are mean + SEM (n=7)



Stat of the art:-Long thin nanoparticles and asbestos



Are nanotubes likely to cause adverse health effects on the statistical basis of being fibres: i.e. could they be the new asbestos?





Asbestos or nanotubes?

Are NTs biopersistent?

Nanotubes are essentially graphene and so likely to be highly biopersistent in the lungs

Are NTs Long?

How long is long?

Longer than about $15\mu m$ poses problems for alveolar macrophages that ingest and remove them

But only if the fibres are rigid – if they roll up into balls then they are less potentially harmful





Are carbon nanotubes the new asbestos?

Asbestos and the mesothelium



To determine if fibres act like asbestos it is necessary to assay for unique pathogenic effects of asbestos

Of the diseases that particles cause, the ones unique to asbestos are affects on the mesothelium - mesothelioma, pleural plaques etc

	Inflammation	Fibrosis	Bronchogenic carcinoma	Mesothelioma	Pleural plaques
Quartz	yes	yes	yes	no	no
PM10	yes	yes	yes	no	no
Asbestos	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes

A mesothelial exposure model for assessing the potential toxicity of MWCNT to the mesothelium





Inject particles and expose the peritoneal cavity and directly expose the mesothelium and assess the response

Not a new assay!



Ann. secup. Hyg., Vol. 32, pp. 299-306 Supplement 1, 1988, Printed in Great Britain Inhalted Paraceles VI

0003-4878.88 \$3.00 + 0.00 Pergamon Press pic © 1988 British Occupational Hygiene Society

INFLAMMATORY CELL RECRUITMENT AS A MEASURE OF MINERAL DUST TOXICITY

K. DONALDSON, R. E. BOLTON and D. BROWN

Pathology Branch, Institute of Occupational Medicine, Roxburgh Place, Edinburgh

Abstract—The cellular inflammatory response has been assessed following intra-perioneal injection of mineral dusts in mice. To calibrate the system, dusts of known pathogenicities were injected at 50, 500 or 2500 grainmal, and the inflammatory response assessed at 2, 4 and 8 days inflammation was measured as total cells recovered by perioneal lavage, differential cell count and macrophage activation status. The cellular response was found to be highly sensitive, since a transient response could be detected following injection of saline alone. Using standard dust preparations, itlaniann dioxide was found to be relatively inactive while quartz and chrystolic asbestos induced a marked inflammatory response. There was some evidence that the cell yield was influenced by macrophage adherence and possibly direct cytotoxicity, and the dose response was consequently not linear. Further work is planned to systematically examine this aspect. Two other particulates were examined in the test system — a respirable cool mine dust and an aramid fibre preparation. The response to the coal mine dust was small while aramid fibre induced a considerable sustained inflammatory reaction.

Ann. occup. Hyg., Vol. 32, pp. 299-306 Supplement 1, 1988.

THE INFLAMMATORY response is a concerted reaction of the host to tissue injury and is now well characterised (RYAN and MAINO, 1977). One of the earliest manifestations of inflammation is the accumulation at the site of injury of leukocytic inflammatory cells; in the case of a non-antigenic injurious agent such as mineral dust these comprise principally activated macrophages and neutrophils.

Recruitment of both neutrophils and macrophages has been demonstrated following experimental pulmonary deposition of several mineral dusts including quartz (SYKES et al., 1983) and asbestos (LEMATRE, 1985) and different aspects of dust induced inflammatory reactions have been described (HAMILTON, 1980; DONALDSON et al., 1982). The peritoneal cavity of experimental animals is a site which can be quickly and accurately dosed with known amounts of dust and this has led to its use in studies on the response to particulates. Using this approach it has been possible to obtain large numbers of inflammatory cells recruited in response to dust (HAMILTON, 1980; DONALDSON et al., 1982; MILLER, 1978) and to study the tumorigenicity of mineral dusts (BOLTON et al., 1982).

In the course of our studies into the inflammatory response we noted that a highly repeatable cellular reaction occurred in the peritoneal cavity and we set out to systematically examine this reaction in the hope that it might provide a means for accurately assessing the inflammatory potential of dust. We report here the preliminary results of these experiments on the magnitude and duration of the inflammatory response to two dusts of known pathogenic potential, quartz and chrysotile asbestos; and a relatively inactive control dust, titanium dioxide. We also





Demonstrating the sensitivity of the inflammatory response in the mouse peritoneal cavity to long fibres and insensitivity to particles

British Journal of Industrial Medicine 1989;46:271-276

Inflammation generating potential of long and short fibre amosite asbestos samples

K DONALDSON, G M BROWN, D M BROWN, B E BOLTON, J M G DAVIS From the Institute of Occupational Medicine, Edinburgh EH8 95U, UK

ABSTRACT Previous studies have shown that long thin asbestos fibres are more pathogenic in in vivo and more active in in vitro assays than short fibre samples. In the present study a long fibre amosite asbestos sample and a short fibre sample prepared from it were tested for ability to cause inflammation in the peritoneal cavity of the mouse; a UICC sample intermediate in fibre size and an inert compact dust, TiO,, were also tested. The ability of the dust samples to cause inflammation, as judged by macrophage and neutrophil recruitment, was ranked in the order long fibre > UICC > short fibre > TiO₂. Ability of amosite samples to cause inflammation was therefore related to the proportion of long fibres. The enhanced ability of long fibres to cause inflammation and cause macrophage activation is probably a key factor in the ability of long fibres to cause pulmonary fibrosis and may also be important in fibre carcinogenesis.

271

Inhalation of asbestos dust is associated with the tion in vivo' and differences in pathogenicity of long. development of interstitial pulmonary fibeosis and pulmonary neoplasia.1 Experimental studies have shown, however, that not all asbestos samples are imbued with the same potential to cause lung disease. The shape of the fibres is one factor of major importance in this phenomenon and has been extensively studied (see review2) showing that long thin fibres are more pathogenic than short fibres. Studies from our own laboratory have recently shown that long amosite asbestos fibres, administered by inhalation, are substantially more pathogenic than a short fibre sample prepared from the long fibres and having essentially the same crystallinity and elemental composition.7 The in vivo findings on the pathogenicity of long fires have been, in general, supported by in vitro studies showing that long fibres are most active in short term assays."

Inflammatory responses in the lung parenchyma, while an important defence mechanism in normal circumstances, is considered to be an important arbiter of tissue damage," leading to alveolar destruction or fibrosis if the inflammation persists." The inflammatory potential of mineral dusts is therefore likely to be an important correlate of their pathogenic potential.

Recent work from our laboratory has described an assay of the ability of mineral dust to cause inflamma-

Accepted 21 March 1988

and short fibre amosite samples.

The present study brings these together and seeks to examine the inflammation generating potential of the long and short fibre amosite samples to determine whether this correlates with the ability to cause damage to rat lungs as previously described.

Materials and methods

DUSTS The titanium dioxide was the rutile form supplied by Tioxide Limited (Stockton-on-Tees).

The long fibre amosite comprised a batch of commercially available, milled South African amosite This sample was generated as a cloud in an exposure chamber (for details see ref 3) and the airborne fibres were found to have a size distribution substantially longer than that of the standard UICC amosite which we have used previously." The long fibre sample used in the present study was collected from the chamber air on to filters. Details of preparation of the short fibre amosite samples have also been given previously. Briefly, a quantity of the bulk long fibre sample described above was ground in a ceramic ball mill and sedimented in water; comprehensive analysis of the final sample showed no loss of crystallinity and an elemental composition close to the parent long amosite sample. Details of preparation of the UICC amosite sample have been given previously.





Mesothelial cells in culture are exquisitely sensitive to the toxic effects of long fibres





Long fibre amosite

Short fibre amosite

The controls and the hypothesis and the test samples of MWCNT





The inflammatory response at 1 and 7 days





The foreign body giant cell response at 1 and 7 days







Harvesting diaphragms for histology







Diaphragm after LR-MWCNT

Granulomatous lesions on the diaphragm





Mechanism – frustrated phagocytosis of long fibres- complete phagocytosis of the short/tangled



Conclusion

- 1. Not all nanotubes are created equal
- 2. Some samples seem to act like asbestos and some don't
- 3. The more long ,rigid and fibre-like the CNT sample, the more likely it is to behave like asbestos -unsurprising when asbestos has its effects via its length and rigidity



FIGURE 5. SEM images of typical micrometer-sized aerosol particles collected during handling laser ablation nanotube material.

Ma Ca r dur dur J.T

FIGURE 4. SEM images of aerosol particles generated from handling HiPCO SWCNT. (a) Particles lager than ${\sim}100~\mu m$ in diameter. (b) Particles of the order of μm in diameter.

Maynard, A. D., P. A. Baron, M. Foley, A. A. Shvedova, E. R. Kisin, and V. Castranova. 2004. Exposure to carbon nanotube material: aerosol release during the handling of unrefined singlewalled carbon nanotube J.To*xicol.Environ.Health A* 67:87-107.



State of the art - summing up



• The oxidative stress hypothesis

Many NP appear to cause oxidative stress- some are antioxidant too- choice of assay-work in progress

• Toxicokinetics and the problem of hazard identification

Hardly any data in the last few years - difficult and expensive to do but badly needed

• The large numbers of particles that require testing – in vitro models and structure activity paradigms

Pro-inflammatory effects in the lungs - in vitro might be predictive - more work needed

Non-pulmonary targets - in the absence of toxicokinetic data there will be false positive data due to high dose effects

• The effects on the cv system

Atherothrombosis is a potential target for NP if the PM₁₀ literature (Combustion-derived nanoparticles) can be extrapolated to manufactured NP – models are available for the key effects (endothelial dysfunction, atherogenesis, thrombosis)

• Long thin nanoparticles and the asbestos paradigm

The more long and thin the CNT (by definition biopersistent) the more likely it is to behave like asbestos



Toxicologists study hazard

It doesn't make sense for a toxicologist to use a low dose, not get an effect, stop and go home

We increase the dose till we get an effect (dose response) and then that needs to be interpreted by risk assessors using data from exposure to contextualise the toxicology data to plausible doses

There is a desperate need for more exposure/dosimetry research to get from hazard to risk



A way forward for safe nanotechnology industry



Maynard, A. D., Aitken, R. J., Butz, T., Colvin, V., Donaldson, K., Oberdorster, G., Philbert, M. A., Ryan, J., Seaton, A., Stone, V., Tinkle, S. S., Tran, L., Walker, N. J., and Warheit, D. B. (2006). Safe handling of nanotechnology Nature 444 (7117), 267-269.

Maynard, A. D., R. J. Aitken, T. Butz, V. Colvin, K. Donaldson, G. Oberdorster, M. A. Philbert, J. Ryan, A. Seaton, V. Stone, S. S. Tinkle, L. Tran, N. J. Walker, and D. B. Warheit. 2006. Safe handling of nanotechnology. *Nature* 444:267-269.



Edinburgh University

Craig Poland Rodger Duffin Bill MacNee Nick Mills David Newby Paddy Hadoke Ian Megson Simon Robinson Nick Boon Keith Fox

IOM Anthony Seaton Lang Tran Rob Aitken

Napier University

Vicki Stone David Brown

RIVM Netherlands

Flemming Cassee Paul Fokkens Daan Leseman

International

Paul Borm Netherlands Wolfgang Kreyling Germany Andrew Maynard USA Gunter Oberdorster USA

University of Umea Sweden

Thomas Sandstrom Anders Blomberg

Sen Lin Lu China

Funding bodies: - MRC, Wellcome Trust, British Heart Foundation, Unilever.etc

THE COLT FOUNDATION

This paper was produced for a meeting organized by Health & Consumer Protection DG and represents the views of its author on the subject. These views have not been adopted or in any way approved by the Commission and should not be relied upon as a statement of the Commission's or Health & Consumer Protection DG's views. The European Commission does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this paper, nor does it accept responsibility for any use made thereof.