



EUROPEAN COMMISSION

HEALTH & CONSUMER PROTECTION DIRECTORATE-GENERAL

Directorate C - Scientific Opinions

**C2 - Management of scientific committees; scientific co-operation and networks
Scientific Committee on Toxicity, Ecotoxicity and the Environment**

CSTEE/GEN1/Minutes.17.12.2002 Final

<p style="text-align: center;">SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE ON TOXICITY, ECOTOXICITY AND THE ENVIRONMENT (CSTEE) 35TH PLENARY MEETING</p>

*Held on 17 December 2002
in Brussels*

DRAFT MINUTES

1. WELCOMING ADDRESS, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE, DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Prof. Dr. Greim, vice-chair of the Committee, opened the meeting and welcomed the participants. Prof. Bridges and Prof. Cantelli Forti sent their apologies.

Declaration of interest:

Prof. Dybing declared an interest in relation to the risk assessment of pentane and will therefore not be present during the discussion of this point. No other interests were declared.

2. ADOPTION OF THE DRAFT AGENDA

The draft agenda was adopted as written in Annex I.

3. APPROVAL OF THE DRAFT MINUTES OF THE 34TH PLENARY MEETING

The draft minutes of the 34th CSTEE plenary meeting were adopted with a few corrections and are available at:

http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/sct/out168_en.pdf

As a follow up of the agenda point 7, Prof. Calow agreed to briefly justify in written the relevance of addressing the issue relating to PBT analysis.

4. FEEDBACK FROM THE RELEVANT SERVICES OF THE COMMISSION ON THE FOLLOW-UP TO THE OPINIONS ADOPTED PREVIOUSLY BY THE CSTEE

No feed back was received on any recent opinions adopted.

5. REGULATION 793/93 ON EXISTING SUBSTANCES (ESR): STATUS REPORTS/ OPINIONS (HUMAN HEALTH AND/OR ENVIRONMENT)

Aniline and 3,4-Dichloroaniline

It was proposed to work separately on the results of the risk assessment of Aniline and 3,4-Dichloroaniline. A first draft of the carcinogenicity and genotoxicity of the two substances has already been prepared and will be completed. In addition, a working group will discuss the carcinogenicity and genotoxicity of aromatic amines in general, after the opinions on the risk assessment of the two specific substances considered are finalised. An external expert has been identified and will be invited to join the working group.

Chlorinated Alkanes

The draft opinion on the results of the risk assessment of Alkanes, C₁₄₋₁₇, Chloro was presented in details and adopted at the meeting. It is available at:
http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/sct/out170_en.pdf

Benzene

A draft opinion on the risk assessment report of Benzene was discussed. Some rephrasing of the text will help clarifying the position of the CSTEE, i.e. consistent and conservative use of uncertainty factors, some concern on how those are interpreted in the risk assessment report, the scientific rationale for exclusion of some data. Furthermore, the committee regretted that the human health risk assessment was missing and not provided together with the environmental data. The revised opinion will be discussed at the next plenary meeting.

n-Pentane

The draft opinions on the results of risk assessment of pentane (environment and human health) were adopted. They are available at:
http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/sct/out172_en.pdf (human health)
http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/sct/out171_en.pdf (environment)

Phenol

A new request for an opinion on the results of the risk assessment of phenol (environment) has been received. A draft opinion will be prepared for discussion at the next meeting.

Chromium Trioxide, Sodium Chromate, Sodium Dichromate, Ammonium Dichromate, Potassium Dichromate

A draft opinion on the carcinogenicity and genotoxicity aspects described in the risk assessment report was distributed to the committee members for review and completion.

6. REQUESTS FOR OPINION FROM THE CSTEER BY DG SANCO

Health effects of Radio Frequency and Electromagnetic fields – Appendix on Priorities for research

Following the adoption of the CSTEER opinion on the effects of electromagnetic fields on health on 24 September 2002, and further to the acknowledgement of a number of critical gaps in knowledge in this area, the CSTEER identified priorities for research in this area. These priorities and specific recommendations (e.g. need for reliable exposure assessments, dose-response relationship effects, identification of underlying biological mechanisms, harmonisation of risk assessment of chemical and physical agents) have been adopted as an appendix to the opinion expressed on 24 September 2002 and are available at:

http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/sct/out173_en.pdf

Safety and quality of drinking water

The CSTEER was asked to review the overall scientific quality of 2 large studies commissioned by DG SANCO with the aim to assess the safety and quality of drinking water (tap and bottled), when received by the consumers in selected European cities. The chairperson of the working group reported back that the information was very useful, although the studies are not representative of whole Europe. Furthermore, as the sampling occurs at the end of the water course, it is difficult to assess when and how contamination might have occurred. The working group will also identify health risks to consumers, if any (e.g. lead, nickel), and comment on the study design and parameters examined (microbiological, physical and chemical) in the light of future investigations and complementary studies. The working group may present a draft opinion at the next plenary meeting.

The Secretariat reassured the members of the committee, that they should only respond to the questions that are appropriate within the expertise of this committee, and indicate otherwise (i.e. quality aspects of the sampled water).

Potential human health risks of lead-containing candle-wicks

This specific request is one piece of an overall risk assessment of lead within DG ENTR. The emission of lead from lead-containing candle-wicks could contribute to high additional exposure and be particularly of high concern in specific risk groups like children. A revised draft opinion will be provided by the rapporteur, after a refined calculation of lead emission rates from such candles and subsequent indoor air concentrations.

7. REQUEST FOR OPINIONS FROM THE CSTEER BY OTHER COMMISSION SERVICES ON

Risks to health from asbestos (chrysotile)

Major scientific findings on chrysotile and organic substitutes reported during the last 4 years were reviewed by the working group, and lead to the reiteration from the CSTEE, that evidence for harmful potential is stronger for chrysotile than for its organic substitutes. Furthermore, the CSTEE reiterates its recommendation for a continuing environmental control of workplaces where substitute fibers are produced and used, as well as for expanded research in toxicology, epidemiology of substitutes fibers and in the development of new less respirable fibers. The opinion on risks to health from asbestos (chrysotile) was adopted at the meeting and is available at:

http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/sct/out169_en.pdf

Questions arising from a study on Risks to Health and the environment related to the Use of Lead in Products

The working group on risks to health and the environment related to the use of lead in products will convene the day after the plenary meeting.

Results of Risk assessment of Short-chain Chlorinated paraffins

Since the last opinion expressed by the CSTEE on November 1998, several new assessments have been done on short-chain chlorinated paraffins, especially on their presence in the environment. Although there is still a lack of information on the short-chain chlorinated paraffins levels in humans and their effects, the latest scientific data analysed do not call for a modification of the conclusions drawn in the previous risk assessment report. The opinion on the risk assessment of short-chain chlorinated paraffins was adopted with very minor corrections. It is available at:

http://europa.eu.int/comm/food/fs/sc/sct/out174_en.pdf

WRC report on phosphate in household detergents

The working group meeting planned had to be postponed. However, a draft opinion will be presented at the next plenary meeting. In a few countries, the reduction of phosphates in household detergents has been very effective, however, the impact of alternatives or substitutes may not be sufficiently known.

Risks to health and the environment posed by the use of Organostannic compounds

A working group will convene as soon as possible to discuss the scientific quality and results of a study launched by the Commission on possible risks to health and the environment posed by the use of organostannic compounds. The CSTEE is also asked to assess and quantify (if possible) the total exposures and risks of humans to organostannic materials. A member of the working group will liaise with the SCF working group assessing the risks posed by organotin compounds in foodstuffs, especially in fish and seafood or from food contact materials.

8. EMERGING ISSUES IDENTIFIED BY THE SSC AND FOR WHICH THE CSTEE IS THE LEADING COMMITTEE

Endocrine disruption (Human Health)

It is assumed that human semen quality has declined over the last decades, possibly due to environmental influences. A proposal was submitted to the appropriate

Commission services to support a systematic review of epidemiological evidence of temporal changes of sperm quality and associated risk factors. IPCS has expressed interest in co-funding a meta-analysis on the quality of sperm.

Indoor air quality

Notwithstanding the considerable attention that has been devoted to external air quality in the past few decades, relatively little efforts have been focused on the possible effects of indoor air quality on human health. The Secretariat asked the agreement of the Commission Services for the CSTEE to undertake a review of the current knowledge on the impact on health of indoor air quality and future trends, and to identify important gaps in knowledge.

9. PARTICIPATION OF THE CSTEE IN ACTIVITIES/WORKING GROUPS OF OTHER SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEES OF THE COMMISSION

The collaborative work between of a few members of the CSTEE and the SCAN on the environmental effects of some substances present in animal feed is likely to be finalised in February 2003.

10. UPDATE ON THE LATEST MEETINGS OF THE SSC ON MATTERS OF INTEREST TO THE CSTEE

Prof. Tarazona drew the attention of the committee members, that the report on the environmental part relating to the harmonisation of risk assessment is available on the Internet for comments by 5 January 2003.

11. ENVIRONMENT AND HEALTH RESEARCH IN THE 6TH FRAMEWORK

In the last plenary meeting, the committee expressed its concern that less prominence was given to the environment and health research in the 6th Framework programme than in the previous RDT programmes. However, there is a need for more sound scientific data and an improved understanding of the underlying mechanisms of toxicity and ecotoxicity to facilitate the identification and prevention of the environmental causes of human diseases and ecotoxicological harm (see annex III).

Mr. Searle (DG RDT) was, thus, invited to present and discuss the environment and health research programme in the 6th Framework with the committee members. Topics selected or indicated as priorities until 2006 were described. Furthermore, Mr. Searle clarified that any suggestions or input from the CSTEE would be welcomed and also proposed to participate to some of the CSTEE plenary meetings on a regular basis to exchange on the future shape and development of the 6th Framework programme in this area. The committee thanked Mr. Searle for all the explanations given.

12. ARRANGEMENTS FOR THE NEXT (XX) PLENARY MEETING OF THE CSTEE

The next meeting of the Committee was confirmed on 6 February 2003. In addition, a meeting was fixed on 1st April 2003.

13. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Following the adoption of the opinion on the results of the risk assessment of bis(pentabromophenyl)ether on 31 October 2002, the committee reviewed comments received from EBFRIIP. The CSTEЕ agreed that the information received should not lead to a revision of the CSTEЕ position.

The secretariat informed the committee of a project by TNO on the importance of local effects in the risk assessment procedure, as well as a possible work programme by CEN of the standardisation of analytical methods for important allergens in materials and products.

Last, Prof. Dr. Greim closed the meeting with thanking all the members of the committee for their contributions.

Annex I: Agenda.

Annex II: List of Participants.

Annex III: CSTEЕ views on the Environment and Health research in the context of the 6th Framework Programme

Annex I



EUROPEAN COMMISSION
HEALTH & CONSUMER PROTECTION DIRECTORATE-GENERAL

Directorate C - Scientific Opinions
C2 - Management of scientific committees; scientific co-operation and networks
Scientific Committee on Toxicity, Ecotoxicity and the Environment

CSTEE/00/Plen.age.17.12.2002 Final

<p style="text-align: center;">SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE ON TOXICITY, ECOTOXICITY AND THE ENVIRONMENT (CSTEE) 35TH PLENARY MEETING</p>

*Held on 17 December 2002, starting at 10h00
CCAB – Rue Froissart, 36
B – 1040 Brussels*

AGENDA

- (1) Welcoming address, apologies for absence, declarations of interest
- (2) Adoption of the draft agenda
- (3) Approval of the draft minutes of the 34th CSTEE plenary meeting
- (4) Feedback from the relevant services of the Commission on the follow up to the opinions adopted previously by the CSTEE
- (5) Regulation 793/93 on Existing substances (ESR): Status reports/opinions and new request (Human Health and/or Environment)
 - (a) *Aniline* (ENV, HH) – for discussion
 - (b) *3,4-Dichloroaniline* (ENV) – for discussion
 - (c) *Chlorinated Alkanes* (ENV) – for discussion
 - (d) *Benzene* (ENV) – for discussion
 - (e) *Pentane* (ENV, HH) – for discussion
 - (f) *Phenol* (ENV) – new request
 - (g) *Chromium trioxide* (ENV, HH) – new request
 - (h) *Sodium Chromate* (ENV, HH) – new request
 - (i) *Sodium Dichromate* (ENV, HH) – new request
 - (j) *Ammonium Dichromate* (ENV, HH) – new request
 - (k) *Potassium Dichromate* (ENV, HH) – new request
- (6) Requests for opinion from the CSTEE by DG SANCO on:
 - (a) Health effects of Radio Frequency and Electromagnetic fields – *Appendix on Priorities for research* – for adoption
 - (b) Safety and quality of *drinking water* – progress report
 - (c) Potential human health risks of *lead-containing candle-wicks* - progress report

- (7) Request for opinions from the CSTEE by other Commission services on:
 - (a) *Risks to health from asbestos (chrysotile)* – for opinion.
 - (b) Questions arising from a study on *Risks to Health and the environment related to the Use of Lead in Products* – progress report
 - (c) Results of Risk assessment of *Short-chain Chlorinated Paraffins* – for opinion
 - (d) WRC report on *phosphate in household detergents* – for discussion
 - (e) Risks to health and environment posed by the use of *Organostannic compounds* – for discussion
- (8) Emerging issues identified by the SSC and for which the CSTEE is the leading committee:
 - (a) *Endocrine disruption (Human Health)*
 - (b) *Indoor air quality*
- (9) Participation of the CSTEE in activities/working groups of other scientific committees of the Commission
- (10) Update on the latest meetings of the Scientific Steering Committee on matters of interest to the CSTEE
 - (a) *Harmonisation of Risk Assessment Task Force and Working groups*
 - (b) *Cross committee collaboration*
- (11) Environment and health research in the 6th Framework
- (12) Arrangements for the next plenary meetings of the CSTEE.
- (13) Any other business

Annex II

<p>SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE ON TOXICITY, ECOTOXICITY AND THE ENVIRONMENT (CSTEE) 35TH PLENARY MEETING</p>
--

*Held on 17 December 2002
in Brussels*

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

MEMBERS OF THE CSTEE:

Prof. Peter CALOW, Prof. Dr. Wolfgang DEKANT, Prof. Erik DYBING, Prof. Dr. Helmut GREIM, Prof. Colin JANSSEN (morning session), Prof. Bo JANSSEN, Prof. Soterios KYRTOPOULOS, Prof. Claude LAMBRE, Prof. Janneche Utne SKÅRE, Prof. Amadeu SOARES, Prof. José TARAZONA, Prof. Benedetto TERRACINI, Prof. Katarina VICTORIN, Prof. Marco VIGHI and Prof. Joseph VOS.

Apologies: Prof. Jim BRIDGES, Prof. Giorgio CANTELLI FORTI

EUROPEAN COMMISSION:

DG Health & Consumer Protection:

Dr. G. FONTANESI, Ms. V. ROLLAND, Dr. A. SANABRIA-TIENZA

DG Enterprise:

Mr. S. PICKERING, Mr. S. BRION, Mrs. C. KOENIGUER, Mr. D. HADRICH,
Mr. W. HEHN

DG Research:

Mr. C. SEARLE

DG Environment:

Mr. M. BLAINEY

**SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE ON TOXICITY, ECOTOXICITY AND THE ENVIRONMENT
(CSTEE)
35TH PLENARY MEETING**

*Held on 17 December 2002
in Brussels*

**CSTEE VIEWS ON THE ENVIRONMENT AND HEALTH RESEARCH IN THE CONTEXT OF
THE 6TH FRAMEWORK PROGRAMME**

Chemical and physical agents present in the environment can have adverse effects on human health and the ecosystem. Through its activities, the CSTEE is constantly being made aware that the identification of the environmental causes of human disease and ecotoxicological harm, the timely recognition of the toxic potential of existing and new substances, and the qualitative and quantitative assessment of the toxic risks imposed by exposure to environmental agents pose major challenges during the formulation of policies in such diverse areas as public health and environmental protection, technological innovation, sustainable development, and the operation of the single market.

Rational and cost-effective responses to these challenges must be grounded on sound scientific understanding of chemical toxicity and its underlying fundamental mechanisms, something which, in turn, requires a strong and consistent commitment to research in toxicology and environmental health. Past European Union RTD Programmes acknowledged the importance of such research by giving special priority to Environment and Health within the Life Sciences and Environment areas. The CSTEE notes with concern the reduced prominence given in the recently launched 6th Framework Programme (FP6) to Environment and Health research, which has been relegated to a sub-topic of priority area "Food Quality and Safety", where it appears to be partly restricted to food-linked environmental hazards. While recognising the importance of food or food contaminants as mediators or modulators of toxicity, the CSTEE considers that this relegation of commitment on non-food-mediated environmental health research, which may have been influenced by recent food quality scares, will have a serious long-term damaging effect on European efforts in an area of major public concern.

The one-sided emphasis of FP6 on food-mediated environmental risks ignores the importance for the health and the quality of life of European citizens, as well as for the long-term quality of the ecosystem, of adequate understanding of the adverse effects which substances present in the ambient or workplace environment (air, water, soil, industrial products etc.) can exert without the mediation of food. Examples of relevant problems which the CSTEE has been asked to address during recent years include, to mention but a few, the potential risks associated with exposure to electromagnetic fields, phthalate softeners in toys and medicinal products, different components of ambient air pollution, and a large number of industrial chemicals considered in the context of Risk Assessment Reports prepared under Regulation 793/93. In many such cases the CSTEE had the opportunity to note the high degree of uncertainty imposed by the current state of

knowledge and to emphasize the need for more scientific data and improved understanding of fundamental mechanisms of toxicity and ecotoxicity. Such improved understanding can only come through adequate commitment to long-term Environment and Health research and the mobilisation and co-ordination of the corresponding European research potential. It is the CSTEE's opinion that this aim is not adequately served through the current priorities of FP6, and it is hoped that measures to redress this weakness will be taken during the formulation of the Programme's specific priority topics.