

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|--|-----------|
| EXECUTIVE SUMMARY | 1 |
| Introduction | 1 |
| Methodology and Geographical Scope of the Evaluation | 3 |
| Classification of LFAs | 4 |
| Eligibility | 5 |
| Implementation and Expenditure | 6 |
| Compensation Payments..... | 7 |
| Coverage of LFA Compensatory Allowances | 8 |
| Contribution to Farm Incomes..... | 9 |
| Farm Structures | 9 |
| Maintaining Agricultural Land Use | 10 |
| Environmental Impacts of LFA Payments..... | 11 |
| Impacts on Rural Communities | 12 |
| Conclusions | 13 |
| Relevance of Objectives | 13 |
| Impacts and Effectiveness | 13 |
| Efficiency | 14 |
| Future Role of the LFA | 14 |
| Recommendations | 15 |
| INTRODUCTION..... | 16 |
| Content of Report..... | 16 |
| Rationale for the Evaluation..... | 16 |
| History of the Measure..... | 18 |
| A Changing Emphasis in the Measure’s Objectives and Implementation..... | 23 |
| THE EVALUATION APPROACH..... | 25 |
| Introduction | 25 |
| Generic Model of Intervention Logic | 26 |
| Social needs underpinning the aid scheme | 26 |

| | |
|---|-----------|
| General Evaluation Framework | 28 |
| The general objectives and expected impacts of the measure | 30 |
| The specific objectives and expected results of the measure | 30 |
| The operational objectives and expected outputs of the measure..... | 31 |
| Setting for Policy Design and Implementation | 33 |
| Union level and national issues | 33 |
| Farm level issues | 34 |
| Concluding Comments..... | 36 |
| Differences in Implementation Approaches..... | 37 |
| The impact of exogenous factors on the application of the LFA measure | 39 |
| Differences in the application of the measure | 40 |
| Conclusions | 43 |
| DATA COLLECTION | 44 |
| Introduction | 44 |
| Semi-Structured Interviews..... | 45 |
| Case Studies | 46 |
| Data Limitations and Quality..... | 48 |
| THE EVALUATION THEMES | 49 |
| THEME 1: ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA..... | 52 |
| Introduction | 52 |
| Classification of Areas..... | 54 |
| Introduction | 54 |
| Classification of LFAs under the four Articles | 54 |
| Changes in the area classified as LFA over time..... | 56 |
| Conclusions | 59 |
| Correspondence of Classification Criteria to Severity of Handicap..... | 59 |
| Introduction | 59 |
| Classification criteria for each Article..... | 60 |
| Conclusions | 66 |
| Changes in Classification Criteria over Time..... | 67 |
| The Consistency of Criteria across Member States | 70 |
| Eligibility at the Farm Level..... | 72 |
| Introduction | 72 |
| The relationship between farm level criteria and the objectives of the scheme | 72 |
| Differences between current and previously applied criteria | 77 |
| Conclusions | 79 |
| Evidence of the Application of National Objectives | 79 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Farm Level Handicaps and their Reflection in Eligibility Criteria | 81 |
| Introduction | 81 |
| Measuring handicaps at the farm level | 82 |
| Conclusions | 84 |
| Overall Conclusions | 84 |
| | |
| THEME 2: LEVELS OF COMPENSATION | 86 |
| Introduction | 86 |
| Evaluation themes | 87 |
| Conceptual issues | 87 |
| Data Limitations | 90 |
| | |
| Correlation Between the Level of Payment and the Severity of Handicap | 90 |
| Introduction | 90 |
| Average rates of payment | 90 |
| Modulation of payments | 92 |
| Variation in payment levels between Member States | 93 |
| Variables which influence the level of payments in Member States | 94 |
| Relationship between degree of natural handicap and payment levels | 99 |
| Basis for the differentiation of LFA payment | 105 |
| Development of payment rates over time | 107 |
| Conclusions | 108 |
| | |
| The Process of Determining Payment Levels..... | 111 |
| | |
| Overall Conclusions | 118 |
| | |
| THEME 3: EFFECTS ON FARM INCOMES AND STRUCTURES..... | 128 |
| Introduction | 128 |
| | |
| Compensatory Allowances and Payment Regularity | 129 |
| Introduction | 129 |
| Not all LFA farms receive LFA payments | 129 |
| Few irregularities in LFA payments..... | 132 |
| | |
| Farm Payments and Incomes | 134 |
| Introduction | 134 |
| Data considerations | 135 |
| Analysis | 136 |
| Farm incomes inside and outside the LFA | 139 |
| Conclusions | 142 |
| Direct payments analysis..... | 142 |
| Conclusions | 148 |
| | |
| Impact of Payments on Land Purchase Prices and Rent Prices | 149 |
| | |
| Impact of LFA Payment Level and Modulation on Farm Structures | 152 |
| Introduction | 152 |
| Changes in farm numbers | 155 |
| Changes in Utilised Agricultural Area | 158 |
| Agricultural labour | 159 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| Conclusions | 160 |
| Overall Conclusions | 160 |
| THEME 4: IMPACTS ON LAND USE..... | 166 |
| Introduction | 166 |
| Effect of LFA Measure on Continued Land Use | 168 |
| Introduction | 168 |
| Analysis..... | 169 |
| The Efficiency of the LFA Measure in Ensuring Continued Agricultural Land Use ... | 181 |
| Introduction | 181 |
| Analysis..... | 182 |
| Conclusions | 188 |
| Synergy of the LFA Measure with other CAP Measures in Relation to Continued Land Use..... | 188 |
| Introduction | 188 |
| Analysis..... | 189 |
| Conclusions | 192 |
| Overall Conclusions | 193 |
| THEME 5: IMPACTS OF THE LFA MEASURE ON THE ENVIRONMENT .. | 195 |
| Introduction | 195 |
| Contribution of LFA Payments to Environmental Protection and/or Degradation | 196 |
| Introduction | 196 |
| Analysis..... | 197 |
| The influence of LFA payments..... | 202 |
| Eligibility conditions | 208 |
| Payments and payment conditions | 210 |
| Conclusions | 211 |
| Contribution of GFP to environmental protection or enhancement | 212 |
| Introduction | 212 |
| Analysis..... | 212 |
| Application of GFP standards | 213 |
| Thematic coverage of GFP standards..... | 214 |
| Enforcement of standards | 215 |
| Conclusions | 216 |
| Synergy of LFA Measure with other CAP Measures..... | 217 |
| Introduction | 217 |
| Analysis..... | 217 |
| Conclusions | 220 |
| Contribution of the LFA Measure to Land Use Management and Environmental Sensitivity | 221 |
| Introduction | 221 |
| Analysis..... | 221 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| Conclusions | 225 |
| Overall Conclusions | 226 |
| THEME 6: IMPACTS ON THE VIABILITY OF RURAL COMMUNITIES | 228 |
| Introduction | 228 |
| The Role of Agriculture in Contemporary Rural Communities and Economies | 229 |
| Demographic relevance of LFA intervention..... | 230 |
| Implementation of the LFA measure and the viability of rural communities | 231 |
| Scheme objectives | 232 |
| Eligibility criteria | 233 |
| Modulation of the compensatory allowance..... | 234 |
| Payment levels and area coverage | 235 |
| Impact on population trends | 236 |
| Policy coherence..... | 237 |
| Conclusions | 237 |
| CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS | 239 |
| Relevance of Objectives | 239 |
| Impacts and Effectiveness..... | 240 |
| Efficiency | 240 |
| Future Role of the LFA..... | 241 |
| Recommendations | 242 |
| REFERENCES | 244 |

Acronym List

| | |
|-------|---|
| AER | Areas with Environmental Restrictions |
| AWU | Annual Work Units |
| CAP | Common Agricultural Policy |
| DA | Disadvantaged Areas |
| ERS | Early Retirement Scheme |
| EAGGF | European Agricultural Guidance and Guarantee Fund |
| EEA | European Environment Agency |
| EU | European Union |
| FADN | Farm Accountancy Data Network |
| FFI | Family Farm Income |
| FNVA | Farm Net Value Added |
| FSS | Farm Structural Survey |
| FWU | Family Work Unit |
| GAEC | Good Agricultural and Environmental Condition |
| GFP | Good Farming Practice |
| HNV | High Nature Value |
| LFA | Less Favoured Area |
| LU | Livestock Units |
| LVZ | Landwirtschaftliche Vergleichszahl |
| MS | Member State |
| SDA | Severely Disadvantaged Areas |
| SPA | Special Protection Areas |
| UAA | Utilised Agricultural Area |

List of Figures

| | | |
|-------------|---|-----|
| Figure 2.1 | Social need as a basis for the LFA measure. | 28 |
| Figure 2.2 | The evaluation framework for the LFA measure..... | 29 |
| Figure 2.3 | The objectives and outcomes of the LFA aid scheme. | 32 |
| Figure 2.4 | Factors in the design of the LFA measure. | 36 |
| Figure 2.5 | The model of intervention logic..... | 38 |
| Figure 7.1 | Derivation of income indicators..... | 136 |
| Figure 8.1. | Planned allocation of RDR spending in Member States 2000-2006. ... | 191 |
| Figure 9.1 | Initial estimate of distribution of HNV farmland in Europe (EU-15). | 205 |
| Figure 9.2 | Less Favoured Areas in the EU-15, late 1990s..... | 206 |

List of Tables

| | | |
|------------|---|-----|
| Table 1.1 | Timeline showing the development of the LFA measure from 1975 | 21 |
| Table 3.1 | Interviews conducted and identity of interviewees..... | 45 |
| Table 3.2 | Case study regions and the focus of each study..... | 46 |
| Table 5.1 | Area classified under Articles 23, 24 and 25 of Regulation 950/97 and as a proportion of the total LFA..... | 58 |
| Table 5.2 | Minimum farm size eligible for LFA payments. | 73 |
| Table 6.1 | Average rate of LFA payment per hectare of participating farms. | 91 |
| Table 6.2 | Number, minimum and maximum payment rates per hectare applied in Member States in 2004. | 93 |
| Table 6.3 | Factors potentially explaining the differences in LFA payment rates between the Member States in 2004. | 98 |
| Table 6.4 | Aggregate Farm Net Value Added per hectare and subsidies per hectare of UAA in 2003, per Member State and per farm type. | 102 |
| Table 6.5 | Extent to which LFA payments correspond to the difference in FNVA per hectare between LFA and non-LFA farms (2003)..... | 103 |
| Table 6.6 | Criteria against which payments are differentiated in Member States. | 106 |
| Table 6.7 | Changes to total public expenditure on the LFA measure by EU-15 Member States, 1998 - 2004..... | 110 |
| Table 6.8 | General approach to determining the payment level in Member States. ... | 112 |
| Table 6.9 | Criteria used in determining the payment level in Member States..... | 115 |
| Table 6.10 | Differentiation of Payment Rates by Member States in 2004/2005 according to different criteria..... | 120 |
| Table 7.1 | Holdings in classified LFA areas estimated to have received LFA payments, 1985-2003..... | 133 |
| Table 7.2 | Annual LFA payments per FWU by Member State, 2003..... | 137 |
| Table 7.3 | Family Farm Income (FFI) per family work unit (FWU) in LFA and non-LFA in the EU, 2003. | 141 |
| Table 7.4 | Total subsidies and direct payments per family work unit (FWU) in LFA and non-LFA in the EU, 2003..... | 144 |
| Table 7.5 | Share of total subsidies and direct payments in family farm income (FFI) per family work unit (FWU) in LFA and non-LFA in the EU, 1990 - 2003 (%). | 147 |
| Table 7.6 | Share of grazing livestock farms in total number of farms in the EU-15, 2003 (%). | 148 |
| Table 7.7 | Average land price in selected EU countries, 2002. | 149 |
| Table 7.8 | Share of LFA in total Utilised Agricultural Area (UAA), of the EU-15 1980-2003 (%)..... | 153 |
| Table 7.9 | Number of farms in LFA and non-LFA regions 1990, 1995, 2000 and 2003..... | 156 |

| | | |
|------------|---|-----|
| Table 7.10 | Family farm income (FFI) per family work unit (FWU) including subsidies, direct payments and LFA allowances in LFA and non-LFA in the EU, 1990 – 2003. | 162 |
| Table 8.1 | Utilised Agricultural Area (UAA) in LFA and non-LFA regions 1990, 1995, 2000 and 2003 (in hectares)..... | 171 |
| Table 8.2 | Hectares of UAA in LFA receiving a compensatory allowance (CA), 2000 and 2004 data. | 179 |
| Table 8.3 | Synergies and conflicts in the objectives of rural development measures, Council Regulation 1257/99. | 189 |
| Table 8.4 | Rural Development Expenditure in the EU-15, 2000 – 2005. | 190 |
| Table 9.1 | The degree of coverage of different categories of farming practices by national codes of GFP (2005). | 214 |